THE 2nd INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE
ON GOVERNANCE AND SERVICE DELIVERY IN DEVELOPING ECONOMIES

CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

October 22-26, 2019
Hotel Africana, Kampala

Copyright

Copyright © 2019 Uganda Management Institute.

All rights reserved. No part of the material protected by this copyright may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, without the prior written permission of the copyright owners, unless the use is a fair dealing for the purpose of private study, research or review. The authors and editors reserve the right that their material can be used for purely educational, scientific and research purposes. All papers have been peerreviewed. All scientific, technical, linguistic and ethical responsibilities are belongs to author/authors, hence, this publication does not constitute an endorsement by the Uganda Management Institute of the opinions so expressed in them.

Official website of the Institute:

www.umi.ac.ug

Preface

The Uganda Management Institute (UMI) successfully organised the Second International Conferences on Governance and Service Delivery in Developing Economies between 22\textsuperscript{nd} and 26\textsuperscript{th} October 2019, at Hotel Africana, Kampala, Uganda. The Conference was graced by General Yoweri Kaguta Museveni as a Chief Guest and H.E Thabo Mbeki as the Keynote Speaker. The 2019 conference was organised under the theme “Accountability, Innovations and Quality Public Service Delivery” with seven (7) sub-themes: (a) Public Sector Reforms; (b) Governance and Sustainable Development Agenda; (c) Performance Management, Monitoring and Evaluation; (d) E-Governance; (e) Addressing Persistent Corruption; and (f) Education Leadership and Management and a special theme on UN-Women- Gender Young Researchers. The conference was organized with the aim of sustaining debate on management challenges that perennially contribute to failure of African countries and other developing economies to meet their development targets. This conference deliberated on new and emerging emerging issues that did not feature in the 2016 conference such as; youth employment, education, food and agriculture, tourism, migration and a specific focus on Sustainable Development Agenda, Agenda 2063, regional and countries specific development strategies.

This years’ conference was very competitive and attracted 195 abstracts and full papers from researchers, practitioners and experts from different fields across the world. Of all submissions, only 168 papers were accepted for the conference giving acceptance rate of 86.2\% and 140 papers were actually presented at the conference. The Conference was attended by 495 delegates from over 26 countries.

The conference bridged the gap between theory and practice and explored new approaches to governance and management of nations especially in Africa and developing countries. Unresolved management policy issues were identified and practical strategies for improving governance processes, curbing corruption and improving service delivery were generated for action; hence the conference produced output relevant for accumulation of academic knowledge and enhancement of operations in public, private and third sector organisations. More details about the conference can be sourced from; book of abstract; conference proceedings and conference report which are available on www.umi.ac.ug.

We are thankful to substantial number of sponsors provided financial, moral and technical support to the success of this conference. Key among the sponsors were the Government of Uganda through the the State House, Ministry of Education and Sports, Ministry of Public Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Local Government, Ministry of Gender, Labour and Social Development, Ministry of Transport and Works, Uganda Police Force, Parliament of Uganda, office of the Prime Minster, Cabinet Secretariat, and our development partners especially the South African High Commission in Uganda, UN Women, Inter-University Council for East Africa (IUCEA), Centenary Bank, UMEME, Uganda Registration Services Bureau (URSB), International Association of Schools and Institutes of
Administration (IASIA), United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA), Amsterdam University and Tampere University among others. We are profoundly grateful to the sponsors, the Chief Guest, H.E General Yoweri Kaguta Museveni, Keynote Speaker, H.E President Thabo Mbeki, Plenary Speakers, Session Chairs, Organizing Committee, Scientific Committee and all other standing committees including; Marketing and Publicity, Transport, Protocol, Hotel and Welfare, Entertainment, Health, and all authors who submitted their work and delegates for being part of this historical event.
## CONFERENCE COMMITTEES

### CENTRAL ORGANISING COMMITTEE
1. Dr. Saturninus Kasozi-Mulindwa - **Chairperson**
2. Mr. John Nakabago
3. Assoc. Prof. Rose B. Namara
4. Assoc. Prof. Gerald K. Karyeija
5. Dr. Sylvester Kugonza
6. Dr. Wilberforce Turyasingura
7. Ms. Resty Kamya
8. Dr. David Ssekatamatte
9. Dr. Rose Kwatampora Oguttu
10. Mr. Jude Rwemisisi

### MARKETING AND PUBLICITY COMMITTEE
1. Dr. Rose Kwatampora Oguttu - **Chairperson**
2. Mr. Peter Kibazo
3. Mr. Geoffrey Nsamba
4. Mr. Hannington Busingye
5. Mr. Fred Alinda

### SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE
1. Assoc. Prof. Gerald K. Karyeija - **Chairperson**
2. Prof. Betty Mubangizi
3. Prof. Mohamed Salih
4. Prof. Paul Jackson
5. Prof. Juraj Nemec
6. Prof. Patrick Ngulube
7. Prof. Tsepho
8. Assoc. Prof. Rose B. Namara
9. Assoc. Prof. Maria K. Barifaijo
10. Dr. Sylvester Kugonza
11. Dr. Edgar Mwesigye
12. Dr. Betty Lwanga
13. Dr. Mary Muhenda
14. Dr. Jennifer Rose Aduwo
15. Dr. Lazarus Nabaho
16. Dr. Wilberforce Turyasingura
17. Dr. Sebastian Bigabwenkya
18. Dr. Stella Kyohairwe
19. Dr. Michael Kiwanuka
20. Dr. Bruce Kisitu
21. Dr. David Ssekatamatte
22. Dr. Prossy N. Oluka
23. Dr. Paul Malunda
24. Dr. Fred Wahitu
25. Dr. Margaret Kemigisa (Coordinator)
26. Mr. Jude T. Rwemisisi
27. Mr. Fred Alinda
28. Mr. Robert Agwot Komakech
29. M/s. Harriet Mpakubi

### FINANCE COMMITTEE
1. Mr. John Nakabago - **Chairperson**
2. Assoc. Prof. Rose Namara
3. Mr. John Paul Senyondo
4. Mr. Paul Lobe
5. Dr. Alex Nduhura
6. Dr. Ben Mugerwa
7. Dr. Paddy Mugambe
8. Ms. Harriet Mpakubi

### SECRETARIAT
1. Assoc Prof. Rose B. Namara
2. Mr. Jude T. Rwemisisi
3. M/s. Harriet Mpakubi
4. M/s. Joan Nakanjako

### MEDICAL TEAM
1. Mr. Veronica Katende
2. Dr. Prossy N. Oluka
5. M/s. Jackie Natukunda
6. Mr. Robert Agwot Komakech

PRE-CONFERENCE WORKSHOPS
1. Dr. Florence Sajjabi Bakibinga (Mrs)
2. Mr. Robert Agwot Komakech
3. M/s. Martha Olwenyi
4. Dr. David Ssekatte
5. Mr. Fred Alinda
7. Dr. Alex Nduhura
8. Mr. Jude T. Rwemisisi

TRANSPORT
1. Mr. Adrian Beinebyabo
2. M/s. Mary Namugga
3. Mr. Taibu Tabuza

PROTOCOL, INVITATION AND SITTING ARRANGEMENT
1. Mr. Adrian Beinebyabo - Chairperson
2. Mr. Peter Kibazo
3. Mr. James Luzige
4. Mr. Jude T. Rwemisisi
5. M/s. Phiona Kintu
6. M/s. Gertrude Nabbale
7. M/s. Harriet Adakun
8. M/s. Harriet Mpakubi

VENUE, HOTEL AND CATERING COMMITTEE
1. Dr. Rose Kwatampora Oguttu - Chairperson
2. Dr. Juliet Atwebembeire
3. M/s. Specioza Mukalukundo
4. M/s. Margret Asirim
5. M/s. Robert Agwot Komakech
6. M/s. Christine Kawasiima
7. Dr. Aida Lubwama

REGISTRATION AND CONFERENCE MATERIALS
1. Dr. Paddy Mugambe – Chairperson
2. M/s. Sarah Ndema
3. M/s. Margret Nakasaka
4. M/s. Harriet Mpakubi
5. M/s. Patience Karungi
6. M/s. Jackie Natukunda
7. Mr. Fred Alinda
8. M/s. Joan Nakanjako

ICT AND SECURITY
1. Mr. John Balikuddembe – Chairperson
2. Mr. Edgar Kirya
3. Mr. Ronald Ssempebwa
4. Mr. Edmond Rukandema
5. Mr. Bashir Golooba
6. Mr. Javuru Felix

OVERALL COORDINATION
1. Dr. Kasozi Mulindwa – Chairperson
2. Mr. John Nakabago
3. Assoc Prof. Rose B. Namara
4. Dr. Margaret Kemigisa

MASTER OF CEREMONIES
1. Dr. Rose Kwatampora Oguttu – Chairperson
2. Mr. Adrian Beinebyabo
3. Mr. Peter Kibazo

CONFERENCE MANAGER
1. Dr. Mary Muhenda – Chairperson
2. Dr. Rose Kwatampora Oguttu

ENTRAINMENT, CULTURAL GALA AND EXCURSION
1. Mr. Alex Ngobi – Chairperson
2. Mr. Nicholas Kizza
3. Mr. Moses Ssozi

COMMITTEE IN CHARGE OF EXHIBITION
1. M/s. Marriete Nansubuga – Chairperson
2. Mr. Tadeo Sempagama

COMMITTEE IN CHARGE OF H.E. MBeki’s VISIT
1. Mr. Peter Kibazo – Chairperson
2. M/s. Patience Karungi
CHIEF GUEST
H.E General Yoweri Kaguta Museveni,
The President of the Republic of Uganda / Visitor to UMI

CONFERENCE KEYNOTE SPEAKER
H.E President Thabo Mvuyelwa Mbeki

CONFERENCE PRELIMINARY SPEAKERS
1. Dr. John-Mary Kauzya, (PhD), UN- Department of Economics and Social Affairs (UNDESA)
2. Prof. Juraj Nemec, University in Banska Bystrica, Slovakia
3. Prof. Christine Dranzoa, Muni University, Uganda
4. Mr. George Nathan Bamugemereire, Inspector General of Government of Uganda
5. Prof. Emmanuel B. Kasimbazi, Makerere University, Kampala
6. Prof. Wilson Muyinda Mande, Nkumba University, Kampala
7. Dr. Fred Amony
8. Prof. Patrick Ngulube (PhD), University of South Africa (UNISA)
9. Mr. Andrew Mwenda, The Independent
10. Mr. Godfrey Ssemagoma, Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development-Uganda
11. Dr. Gerald Werikhe, Africa Leadership Institute (AFLI)
12. Mr. Selestino Babungi, UMEME
13. Prof. Mohamed Salih, Chairperson, Governance and Sustainable Development Agenda
14. Professor Seppo Hölttä, Chairperson, Education Leadership and Management- Tampere University

PRELINERY CHAIRS
1. Prof. Betty Mubangizi, University of Kwazulu Natal
2. Prof. Mohamed Salih, University of Leiden, Netherlands
3. Prof. Godfrey Asiimwe, Makerere University
4. Prof. Juraj Nemec, University in Banska Bystrica, Slovakia
5. Prof Patrick Ngulube, University of South Africa (UNISA)
6. Prof. Grace Bantebya, Makerere University
7. Dr. Hajat Amaal Kinene N. Nserek, Islamic University in Uganda
8. Dr. Sylvester Kugonza, Uganda Management Institute
9. Dr. Wilberforce Turyasingura, Uganda Management Institute
# Table Of Content

## PART A: PUBLIC SERVICE REFORMS

Assessing the Suitability of the Build Operate and Transfer Option to Botswana’s Public Private Partnership Programme  
*Baakile Motshegwa & Thekiso. Molokwane*  
1  

The Role of Public Service on the Socio-Economic Development of Bauchi State  
*Jafa’ar Ibrahim Dass & Lumi Musa*  
11  

*Micahel Galukande-Kiganda & Anthony Guloba*  
20  

Elucidation of Principal Agency Relationship in the Road Transport Sector: Implication of PPP adoption for Uganda National Roads Authority (UNRA)  
*Innocent Nuwagaba, Lukamba Tshombe Luhuya, Alex Nduhura, Bruce Kisitu & Rose Kwatampora*  
35  

The Political Economy of Health in Uganda; with particular reference to HIV/AIDS, Malaria, Tuberculosis and Non-Communicable Diseases: A Synthesis Paper  
*Robert Basaza, Elizabeth Kyasiimire & H. Ramadhan*  
48  

Local Governments and the Implementation of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework in Uganda  
*Kalanzi William*  
61  

The Role of Civil Society Matter in Good Governance and Democracy in African Countries: A Case of Uganda  
*Simon Ross Euku& Christopher S. Mayanja*  
69  

Truncating through the Crevasses of Customer Experience in Ugandan Retail Pharmaceutical Companies: Synthesizing the intermeshing of Service Quality & Customer Satisfaction at Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited in Kampala District  
*Innocent Nuwagaba & Edith Namakula*  
78  

An Evaluation of the effects of Tax Administration Reforms on Revenue Performance: The case of Uganda Revenue Authority  
*Joel Emojong, Joseph Oonyu & Maria K. Barifaijo*  
89  

Procurement Contracts management and Service Delivery in Higher Education Institutions in Uganda: Experience of Makerere University  
*Stella-Maaris Kamanzi*  
105  

A Comparative Analysis Of Quality Of Health Care Delivered In Low And High Task Shifting Environments In Uganda. Implications for Policy  
*Kanyesigye Rullonga Monica, Maria Kaguhangire Balifaijo & Mohammed S. Bayat*  
109
A Study on the Barriers Affecting Participation in Public Procurement in Uganda

*Faith Mbabazi & Saharu Nassazi* ................................................................. 136

Increasing Unspent Balances Returned to Consolidated Fund in Uganda’s Local Governments: A Factor of Local Government Accountability

*Nyenje Aida Lubwama*, Peter Michael Owiny & Baker Lyadda......................................................... 145

Decentralisation and Local Government Performance in Mbale Municipal Council

*Peter Simon Wakwale* .................................................................................. 166

State Feminism in Botswana

*Keneilwe Sadie Mooketsane* ................................................................. 193

Leveraging Public Private Partnerships for Infrastructure Development in Uganda

*Vincent Operemo & Tasha Balunywa* ..................................................... 204

Financial inclusion and Local Economic Development in Developing Economies: Evidences from Kampala Capital City Authority, Uganda

*Michael Kiwanuka* .................................................................................. 215

Linking the Technology and Human Resource Competences with Productivity of the Petroleum Industry in Uganda: The Situation in Buliisa District

*Paul Buhenga Masiko, Pross Nagitta Oluka, Maria K. Barifaiko & George William Kajumba* …… 222

PART B: GOVERNANCE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT ........................................... 234

Health Services and the Footpath to achieving SDGs in the East African Region

*David Baguma* .................................................................................. 234

Advancing Climate Change Adaptation in Uganda’s Agricultural Programming for Sustainable Development: Key Milestones and Constraints

*Alinda Fred, Kisambira Ezekel & Kagoro Anthony* ..................................................... 248

Public Participation and Community Development in Uganda: A case study of Kawempe Division

*Mohamed Yusuf Damei* .................................................................................. 260

Addressing Health Inequity through Community Based Education Students’ Projects

*Ndaruhutse, G.R., Nkata, J.L., & Nestel, D.* ............................................................. 269

A Critic of the Policy Frameworks that Nurture Sustainable Urban Housing Development among low and Middle Income Urban Households in Kampala

*Andrew Amara* .................................................................................. 281

Public and Private Sectors in Co-production of Public Services: Slovak Experience

*Juraj Nemec & Mária Murray Svidroňová* ................................................................. 292

Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices towards Cancer Prevention in Uganda: A Review of Literature
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the implementation of Public Private Partnership in Universal Secondary Education and its Critical Success Factors: Insights from Stakeholders’ Experiences in Uganda</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Doldrums of Development Projects in Uganda: Gauging the role of PRDP Health Project on Antenatal Care Attendance in Lira District, Uganda</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feasibility of the Sustainable Development Goals Localisation: Evidence from the Community Based Monitoring System</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Analysis of Staff Indiscipline in the Malawi Civil Service</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable Local Economic Development for Developing Economies: The New strategies for the Future Local Governments in Uganda</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Analysis of Regulatory Mechanisms for Governance of Community Health Insurance Schemes: The Uganda Perspective</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Governance in Developing Economies</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressing Indigenous People’s Rights in the Contexts of Foreign Investment Law in and amongst the EAC-P'States</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Effect of Credit Reference Bureau Information Sharing On Credit Assessment in Financial Institutions in Uganda</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resource Capacity Building and Environmental Conservation in Hamurwa Sub County, Rubanda District, Uganda</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhancing evidence in Program Evaluation using Participatory Research Methodologies</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PART C: PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT, MONITORING AND EVALUATION

Enhancing evidence in Program Evaluation using Participatory Research Methodologies | 456  |
Integrating International and Regional Agenda in Uganda’s Planning, Implementation and Reporting Frameworks

*Tasha Balunywa & Vincent Operemo* ................................................................. 463

An Analysis of the Effects of Strategic Planning Practices on Disaster Management in Kenya (A Case of State Corporations)

*Linah Chepkoech Boit, John Bii, Njenga Gitahi & John Tanui* ....................................... 477

Organisational Knowledge Sustainability Concept: The Nexus between Knowledge Management and Organisational Learning

*Wilberforce Turyasingura* ......................................................................................... 493

An assessment of Participants’ Perception of Public Private Partnerships in Uganda: A Conceptual Analysis of PPPs and Value for Money for Uganda National Roads Authority

*Innocent Nuwagaba* ................................................................................................. 501

Monitoring and Evaluation Processes Critical to Service Provision in South Africa’s Rural-Based Municipalities

*Betty C. Mubangizi* ................................................................................................. 516

Factors Affecting Development of Gender-Sensitive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems in Humanitarian NGOs in Uganda. A case of IRC Uganda

*Grace William Maiso, David Ssekamatte, & Rose B. Namara* ...................................... 530

The Mediating role of Planned Behaviour on Deterrence Initiatives aimed at Managing Local Government Workplace Compliance-Replace Musuya

*Lungisa S & Nzewi O.I.* .......................................................................................... 550

Student’s perspectives on Postgraduate Training in Monitoring and Evaluation: A case of Post Graduate Diploma in M&E participants at Uganda Management Institute

*David Ssekamatte, Mary Gorret Wanyese, Florence Abesigye, Emily Florence Akia Oteeni & Hilda Syahuka* ................................................................................................. 567

An Evaluation of Critical Success Factors in a Multi-International Partnership

*Maria Kaguhangire-Barifaijo, James L. Nkata & Seppo Holta* ........................................ 582

Factors Affecting Development of Gender-sensitive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems in Humanitarian NGOs in Uganda. A case of IRC Uganda

*Grace William Maiso, David Ssekamatte, & Rose B. Namara* ...................................... 594

The Role of Leadership in Establishment of Results Based Monitoring and Evaluation Systems in Humanitarian Organisations in Uganda: A Case of Action Africa Help-Uganda (AAH-U)

*Norbert Amuli Anyidi & Rose B. Namara* .................................................................. 613

The Conundrum of Decentralised Public Service Delivery and the Human Rights perspective in Uganda
Factors Influencing the Coherent Digitization of Government Processes across all Policy Areas and Levels of Government to Enhance an Efficient Public Service Delivery in Kenya

Jim Gitonga Kauma & Willy Nyaga Ireri

The Citizen Support Portal

Bilkiss Rajahbalee-Cader & Suraj Ramgolam

E-Learning for Personalized Learning in Tertiary Institutions

Rodnie Mafa

Health Remedy Fallacies Strike the Social Media as Medical Practitioners just watch: What is the role of Development Education? A Critical-Analytical Paper

Maria Kaguhangire-Barifajo & Peter Kibazo

E-Government and Public Administration- initiatives and challenges facing Malawi’s Public Sector

Mustafa Kennedy Hussein

E-Governance and Service Delivery in Uganda: Lessons from Selected Districts in Northern Uganda

Etuka Isaac Joakino, Stella Kyohairwe & Godfrey Mbabazi

Towards Social Media Ethical Standards for Information Professionals in Kenya

Lucy Kibe & Tom Kwanya

Determinants of E-Marketing Adoption by Small and Medium Enterprises in African Countries: A Literature Review

Margareth Amon Mapunda

The Prospects and Challenges of e-Classroom as a tool to improve Students Assessment and Comprehension in Higher Education Institutions

Abdul Ddumba Yawe & Yusuf Nsanja

Assessing The Anti-Corruption Strategies: The Case of Malawi’s Public Service

Mustafa Kennedy Hussein

Corruption in Public Procurement in Uganda: What to Do?

Robert Agwot Komakech

Corruption and Nigeria’s Development Conundrum: The Need for a Benevolent Dictator

Akamere F.A.C & Osuagwu Cajetan

Mainstreaming a Multifaceted Approach to the War against Corruption in Africa

Ifeolu John Koni
Effectiveness of Anti-corruption Measures in Uganda

*Pius Gumisiriza & Robert Mukobi* ................................................................. 800

When the Guards are Vultures: The case of DIPF and CSOs in Uganda

*Jane Ayeko- Küemmeth* ................................................................. 812

Competition in Public Procurement: Barriers Hindering Participation in Bidding for Government Contracts in Uganda

*Faith Mbabazi* ................................................................. 823

PART F: EDUCATION LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT ........................................ 837

Factors behind Consistent Decline in UCE Performance: A Comparison of Secondary Schools in Eastern Regions in Uganda

*Nyenje Aida Lubwama, Peter Michael Owiny & Lyadda Baker* ........................................ 837

External Quality Assurance Mechanisms and the Quality of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education: A Systematic Review of Literature

*Bonny Magezi, David Onen & Joseph Kimoga* ........................................ 851

Assessment of the Working Environment on Teachers’ Performance in Uganda

*George Mukose & Proscovia Namubiru Ssentamu* ........................................ 860

Role of Universities in Human Capital Development, Policy Development and Management

*Gabriel Juma Okumu & Simmy M. Marwa* ........................................ 873

Regulatory and Policy Contradictions and how they Debase Educational Attainment; an investigation into the Experiences from Universal Primary Education implementation in Uganda

*Higenyi Wahitu* ................................................................. 890

When Teachers’ Behaviours Fail Pupils: The Tragedy of the Innocents in UPE Schools in Uganda

*Michael Galukande Kiganda & Willington Guma-Baguma* ........................................ 902

Teacher Support Systems and Quality of Pedagogical Practices in Public Secondary Schools in Uganda

*Paul Netalisile Malunda* ................................................................. 913

The effects of Guided Play using the 6 Brick Duplo Block on the development of aspects of Visual Perception in Pre-literate 5-7year old children in selected Schools in Kenya and South Africa

*Sarah Jemutai* ................................................................. 927

An Analysis of Educational Standards, Quality and Equity in Uganda

*Vincent Operemo* ................................................................. 940

An Investigation into the Teachers Perceptions of Performance Appraisal Systems in Public Secondary Schools: A Case Study of Schools in Lilongwe City, Malawi

*Alexander Kazombo-Mwale* ................................................................. 957
Developing and Testing the Validity and Reliability of an Instrument on the Predictors in Leech's (2012) Model on Becoming a Knowledgeable and Skilled Researcher in the Context of Makerere University

*Olive Lunyolo, Fred E. K. Bakkabulindi, Hilary M. Tusiime* .. ................................................................. 969

Directional Leadership Style and Staff Motivation in Private Universities in Uganda: a case of Kampala International University

*Chrisostom Oketch & Gerald K. Karyeija* ................................................................. 994

Curriculum and the Human Capital Gap in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Comparison of North-South Approaches between Uganda and Finland

*Wabwire Julius* .. ................................................................. 1006

Rewards Management Strategies for Academic Staff to address strikes in Public Universities in Uganda

*Acomo E., Okello R., Seninde R., Namukasa J.F, Nshakira A. & Maria K. Baiifaio* .............. 1017

Plagiarism in Master of Education Studies at Selected East African Universities

*Zainabu Ramadhan* .. ................................................................. 1031

Active Teaching and Learning Practices: Enhancing Students Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in Arua District

*Acidri Emmanuel Bileti* .. ................................................................. 1042

Professionalization in Higher Education through Entrepreneurship Teaching

*Lema Catherine Forje* .. ................................................................. 1057

Accelerating Commercialization of Higher Learning Institutions in Tanzania by Establishment of the University of Dar Es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centre (UDIEC)

*Bavo B. Nyichomba & Cuthbert Kimambo* .. ................................................................. 1068
Assessing the Suitability of the Build Operate and Transfer Option to Botswana’s Public Private Partnership Programme

Baakile Motshegwa & Thekiso. Molokwane

Corresponding E-Mails: motshegwa@mopipi.ub.bw / thekiso.Molokwane@mopipi.ub.bw

University of Botswana, Botswana

Abstract

The advent of Public Private Partnerships triggered confidence to ailing economies particularly those of the developing countries. Applied appositely, the Build Operate and Transfer (BOT) option of PPPs would facilitate the procurement of funds and technical expertise ultimately providing the much requisite infrastructure for the economies of the developing countries. The adoption of PPPs in Botswana is practically moving at a snail pace. With a legal and regulatory framework, a comparatively sound economy coupled with a stable socio-political environment, the country would, other things constant, be ahead of majority of the Sub Sahara African countries in terms of economic and infrastructure development through the implementation of PPPs. This paper explores the possibility of exploiting BOT as a driving force towards infrastructure and service provision in Botswana. The paper is desktop based, applies literature survey and adopts a qualitative approach for both data collection and analysis of content. In addition, the paper adopted the interpretivist research paradigm. The findings of the study indicate that despite limited constraints in sight, Botswana has in place, legal and institutional frameworks and capacity to implement PPP including, through the BOT option. The findings also indicate that the BOT option has potential to unlock the stagnant PPP programme in Botswana.

Key words: Build, Operate and Transfer, Botswana, Public Private Partnerships

Introduction

Projects undertaken though the Build-operate-transfer (BOT) model of Public Private Partnerships (PPP) continue to attract increasing interest with the growing thrust towards privatizing infrastructure projects in both developing and developed countries (Nasirzadeh, Khanzadi & Alipour. 2014: p. 438). The BOT model aims at increasing the contribution share of the private sector in infrastructure investment, to relieve the burden of public finance, increase efficiency in the presentation of service while giving firms, who invest in developing countries, the opportunity to transfer their technological infrastructure and experience (Acar, 2019: p.15-16).

BOT schemes are discernible in various infrastructure projects of large magnitude such as roads, expressways, railways, bridges, dams, ports, and power plants. There are constructed and operated by private firms under the PPP procurement system (Liou & Huang, 2008: p. 18). Typically, a BOT is a private sector participation model in which a project company is established to finance, design, construct and operate a facility for a concession period before it is transferred to the government (Ozdoganm, & Birgonul. 2000: p. 343).
The PPP environment in Botswana is still at its nascent stages. Progress towards adopting the model as a vehicle to providing public infrastructure and improving public services is slow hence the need to dissect the concept and explore its variants that may be more viable than others. These PPP options have to satisfy various PPP mechanism including value for money and affordability. According to the World Bank (2011: p. 1). Botswana made significant progress toward improving its infrastructure in recent years. The country posted a strong investment record in the: road; water and sanitation sectors and; has successfully increased rural access to power. Botswana has also made strides in expanding mobile telephony, with the number of cellular subscriptions exceeding the number of inhabitants for the first time in 2010.

By 2011, the country still faced a number of important challenges with one of the most evident being timely completion of the critical 600 MW Morupule power generation project, meant to restore supply-demand balance in the country following the 2008 power supply crisis (World Bank, 2011:1). Other challenges include implementing the ambitious institutional reforms in the water sector (Molokwane & Tshombe, 2017: pp. 158-159, 161), and balancing investment and maintenance spending in the transport sector.

Following government’s 2010 decision to promote economic diversification through the Economic Diversification Drive (EDD) P17.2 billion (53 percent of the total cumulative amount of P32.5 billion) worth of goods and services have been purchased by Government from local manufacturers and service providers since the inception of the programme. The EDD is based on the approach of Government using its purchasing power to support local production of goods and services (Republic of Botswana, 2019: p. 5).

Annually, the Government of Botswana commits to using PPPs as a means of providing public infrastructure, procuring certain state assets and provides services. This is in addition to the recurrent commitments by government to work with and create an enabling environment for the private sector to flourish. For instance, in 2017, the Minister of Finance and Economic Development (MFED) stated that the MFED thought the PPP Unit would engage the private sector to augment and accelerate land servicing (Republic of Botswana, 2017: p. 7). Botswana’s economic performance demonstrates that the country has ample potential to provide goods and services through the BOT model of PPP.

**The Nature of BOT**

Build-Operate-Transfer (BOT) schemes are a collective term for BOT. These schemes which include the: build, operate and own (BOO); Build, Operate, Own, and Transfer (BOOT); build, transfer, and operate (BTO); Build and Transfer (BT); Design–Build–Operate (DBO); reconstruction, operate, and transfer (ROT) and; operate and transfer (OT) are subject to concession agreement (Kumaraswamy & Morris, 2002; Asian Development Bank, 2008, p. 39). When governments undertake BOT projects, they do so to transfer the risk to the private partner, but occasionally governments and the private sector share the risk (Tshombe & Molokwane, 2016, p. 314). This type of PPP contract has also led to cost-effectiveness, timelier delivery, and a better performance and quality of the project. This is also due to the fact that the project management is more efficient in private businesses in comparison with the governmental ones (Nasirzadeh, Khanzadi & Alipour, 2014, p. 438).

In BOT contracts, the public projects will be financed, designed, and constructed by the project company, set up by private investors. After the construction time, in the concession period, the corporation operates the projects to repay loans, recover the investment and receive profit (Nasirzadeh, Khanzadi & Alipour,
BOT schemes have been visible in many large infrastructure projects such as roads, expressways, railways, bridges, dams, ports, and power plants constructed and operated by private firms under a procurement system (Liou & Huang, 2008). The BOT method has been used for a long time. The first important BOT contract project was the Suez Canal project that was constructed in 1854. In this contract, the private company obtained a 99-year concession from the Egyptian government for the construction and operation of the canal connecting the Mediterranean and Red Seas (Levy, 1996; Shen & Wu, 2005).

A BOT project is typically used to develop a discrete asset rather than a whole network and is generally entirely new or greenfield in nature (although refurbishment may be involved). In a BOT project, the project company or operator generally obtains its revenues through a fee charged to the public partner rather than tariffs charged to consumers. In common law countries, a number of projects are called concessions, such as toll road projects, which are newly built and have a number of similarities to BOTs (World Bank, 2018). BOTs have been widely used to attract private financing to the construction or renovation of infrastructure.

BOT agreements tend to reduce commercial risk for the private partner because there is often only one customer, the government (Asian Development Bank, 2008). An advantage to DBFO type of BOT projects is that they are financed partly or completely by debt, which leverages revenue streams dedicated to the project (Asian Development Bank, pp. 40-41). The undertaking by the concessionaire of all the risks associated with the project during the concession period is a major issue of concern for all parties involved, that is, the contractors, the sponsors, and the government. The success of a BOT project lies in the appropriate initial risk assessment by the potential concessionaire, which provides the reasoning for a “go or no go” decision (Yiannis & Demos, 2005, p. 438).

**BOT as a Procurement Method**

Public procurement according to Quinot and Arrowsmith (2013: p. 1) refers to the process through which the state acquires goods, works and services needed to fulfill its public functions. Some of the functions and processes include the identification of the goods or services needed, through the course of identifying a supplier, to the maintenance (performance, administration, cancellation) of the contract concluded between the contracting authority and the supplier (Arrowsmith, 2005, p. 1; Arrowsmith, Linarelli, & Wallace, 2000, pp. 1-2).

PPPs as a method of public procurement can be used in various ways in order to bring about the much-needed development in some of the less developed countries. There is a general consensus that BOTs...
procurement starts with government (Akbiyikli & Eaton, 2005; Farlam, 2005). As demonstrated earlier, there are many PPP procurement options but this paper focuses only on the BOT model.

The BOT model is not as smooth as collaborators would want to imagine. Bashiri, Ebrahimi, Fazlali, Hosseini, Jamal, & Salehvand, (2011, p. 2) postulate that a BOT ‘approach is an option for the government to outsource public projects to the private sector’. According to Farlam (2005: p. 1) PPPs ‘partnerships involves locking in long-term collaboration between both parties to share the costs, rewards and risks of projects — all the possibilities that things could go wrong — unlike the once-off transaction involved in public procurement’. Arimonro (2008) posits that in the South African PPP model, a private consortium bidding for a project should demonstrate that it possesses the capacity and skills to deliver the project, and to do so more efficiently than other parties First, this is to ensure that projects are not abandoned because a private sector consortium lacks the ability to continue with it. Secondly, the public entity sponsoring the project must have the budget required for that entity to fulfil its obligations under the agreement and thirdly, it would not make economic sense to adopt a PPP for a project if it would be cheaper to adopt traditional procurement (p. 8).

Methodology
This study adopted the interpretivist research paradigm. The data method used is the secondary data collection (Brynard, Hanekom, & Bryard, 2014; Quilain, 2011; Quinlan, Babin, Carr, Griffin, & Zikmund, 2015). Secondary data are data that have already been collected for purposes other than the problem at hand (Cavanna, Delahaye, & Sekaran, 2001; Malhotra & Birks, 2007). Data for this paper came from published and unpublished documents, reports, newspaper articles and others (Brynard et al., 2014). The use of secondary data has advantages which include no financial resources for data collection, it is time saving, cost effective and convenient and is from reputable sources, (Juneja, (n.d.), Smith, 2008, Johnston, 2014; Malhotra & Birks, 2007). According to Malhotra & Birks, (2007) “secondary data are easily accessible, relatively inexpensive and quickly obtained” (p. 86). There are also disadvantages that include but not limited to accuracy of data is not known, data were collected for other purposes and that no follow ups can be made if needed and that data may be old. (Obasi, 1999; Cavanna et al., 2001; Malhotra & Birks, 2007).

Botswana’s PPP Experience
The government of Botswana currently relies on the Public-Private Partnerships Policy and Implementation Framework of 2009, as is legal instrument for implementing PPPs. The government consider, PPPs an alternative means of financing public infrastructure projects to accelerate and improve infrastructure development, and create a conducive environment for stronger public and private sector partnerships. Despite a slow start, the implementation of the PPP has since picked up, with a number of projects so far identified and registered for implementation using the PPP approach (Republic of Botswana, 2019, p. 7; Republic of Botswana, 2018, p. 7-8).

The Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, is the coordinating agency for the implementation of PPP and works closely with the respective Ministries to provide guidance on the planning and procurement of services required to execute the projects (Republic of Botswana, 2019, p. 7). Several PPP projects have to date been implemented through PPP arrangement in Botswana. By 2012, these projects included the office accommodation for the Ombudsman and Land Tribunal, the SADC headquarters and 827 kilometres of roads under the Output and Performance Based Road Contract (Tshombe & Molokwane, 2016, p. 310).
These projects also include Mongala and Mahube malls in Kanye Village. Mongala mall is a joint venture project between Time Projects and Southern District Council. The shopping mall covers 6500 m² and hosts 40 and 30 shops and kiosks. The project is a Build, Operate and Transfer (BOT) project and will run for 45-years. Another project is the Rail Park mall in the Capital city Gaborone. The mall cost P350 million and is a PPP project between Botswana Railways Properties, Botswana Insurance Fund Management (BIFM), Eris Property and Treddinick (Sunday Standard, p. 2011).

Challenges to the implementation of PPP in Botswana include absence of standardised approaches and processes guidelines to deal with the structure of PPP projects and uniform framework to guide treatment of tendered and unsolicited proposals. Furthermore, there is no clear role of government agencies and departments such as PEEPA, MFDP, and Ministry of Works and Transport, etcetera (Republic of Botswana, 2009, p. 2; Molokwane, 2018, p. 706). This challenge calls for a reform in Botswana’s PPP Legal Framework in general.

**Factors Affecting the Implementation of BOT in Botswana**

The implementation of PPPs in Botswana has been moving at a snail’s pace. Various distinct factors are attributable to this state of affairs. These factors include weak legal, regulatory and institutional frameworks; weak infrastructure planning and project preparation; ineffective governance; and corruption, one of the consequences being limited private-sector involvement (Botswana Guardian, 2019). For purposes of this study, four factors are discernible. These are: Availability of Supportive Infrastructure; Legislation deficiencies; Project implementation issues: and Capacity issues.

**Availability of Supportive Infrastructure**

Infrastructure in critical sectors such as water and energy is a determining factor in the successful implementation of BOTs. A number of projects are in progress in various sectors of Botswana’s economy. These projects are not necessarily PPP projects however, their existence demonstrates that there is supportive infrastructure in Botswana for implementation of BOT projects. According to Republic of Botswana (2019: p. 8-9), in the energy sector, among the major ongoing energy projects is the extension of the power transmission grid to provide power in the North West part of the country, where mining and other investments are suppressed due to lack of electricity. Three (3) contracts for extension of the high voltage transmission grid from Morupule 600MW power station to Maun, Toteng, Samochima and Ghanzi were awarded at the end of 2017, and construction work is ongoing. The commissioning of the grid extension is scheduled for December, 2019. Furthermore, the construction of Rakola and Gaphatshwa Power substations were completed in 2017 and 2018, respectively, and the refurbishment of Morupule A is expected to be completed in 2019. These projects are expected to impact positively on Botswana’s security of electricity supply, which currently stands at 79 percent against a target of 85 percent (Republic of Botswana, 2019: p. 8-9).

In the water sector, among the major water projects underway are the implementation of the North South Carrier 2 and the Botswana Emergency Water Security and Efficiency projects. These projects will include: construction of strategic reservoirs; bulk water transfer pipelines; groundwater resource development and water supply distribution networks including treatment facilities. Other water projects are the: Selebi Phikwe-Serule Water Transfer Scheme; Boteti Southern and Central Cluster Villages Water Supply Scheme; North East and Tutume Sub District Water Reticulation Scheme; and Lobatse Wastewater
Treatment Works. All these projects will require substantial resources to sustain their continued implementation and maintenance (Republic of Botswana, 2019: p. 9).

**Legislation Deficiencies**

The PPP legal framework in Botswana remains deficient. This however, does not mean that there have been no efforts towards developing legal instruments to facilitate implementation of PPPs. Two main instruments utilized at present in the procurement of public works through PPP include the ‘Public Private Partnership Policy and Implementation Framework of 2009’ and the Procurement legislation namely ‘Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Act’ Cap 42:08 of 2001. The Public Procurement and Asset Disposal (PPAD) Act (2002) provides for the possibility of utilizing to PPPs in order to procure works. As provided for in the Republic of Botswana (2002), “Procurement” refers to the acquisition in the public interest by any means, including by purchase, rental, lease, hire-purchase, licenses, tenancies, franchises among others, of any type of works, services or supplies or any combination thereof, however classified, and shall include management, maintenance and commissioning.

**Project Implementation Issues**

Poor project implementation is synonymous with multiple projects in Botswana. Some of the poorly executed projects that led to huge financial losses include: Serowe sports complex (Botlhale & Siku, 2010), the National Stadium in Gaborone, Sir Seretse Khama International Airport, Francistown Stadium and Morupule B Power Plant in Palapye (Botlhale, 2017: p. 4). Poor implementation is a huge impediment to implementation BOT projects across the globe and Botswana is no exception.

**Capacity Issues**

The PPP Unit located in the MFED still lack capacity to effectively deal with PPP projects. The MFED has nonetheless, been undertaking capacity building for the implementation of PPP projects throughout Government, with more than 250 senior Government officials having participated in training workshops since 2016 (Republic of Botswana, 2019: p. 7). Parliament passed several pieces of legislation on doing business reform during 2018. These include: Companies Registration Act; Companies Amendment Act; Registration of Business Names Amendment Act; and Re-Registration of Business Names Act. These pieces of legislation will enable integration of the online business registration systems at the; Companies and Intellectual Property Authority, BURS and PPADB, thereby facilitating information exchange between these institutions and limiting unnecessary physical interactions with the institutions. All these efforts by Government are aimed at promoting domestic investment and attracting foreign direct investment and thus, enhance economic growth and employment creation (Republic of Botswana, 2019: p. 8).

Several benefits can accrue to Botswana if they implement the Build Operate and Transfer (BOT) model in their PPP transactions. Some of the benefits that have been identified by Askar & Gab-Allah, (2002: p. 174) and (Cartlidge, 2006: p. 31) include the following: Technology transfer, training of local personnel and the development of national capital markets; the utilization of private financing provides new sources of capital, reduces loans from the World Bank and IMF and improves the host government’s credit rating; project risk and the financial burden are transferred to the private sector; in contrast to privatization, the government keeps its strategic control over the project; project design can be tailored to construction equipment and materials; long term income stream for private consortia; tailored maintenance, attention to whole life costs and smoother operations.
Policy Lessons for Botswana
An analysis of literature on PPP illustrates that researchers spend most of their time researching on PPP transactions. This has created a gap on research specific to policy dimensions of PPPs. This observation is true for Botswana’s context. Research should as such, exert more focus to providing analyses from public policy dimension. Based on the aforementioned debates on BOT in Botswana, a number of policy lessons become apparent.

Literature demonstrates that the Botswana’s PPP Policy and Implementation Framework lacks certain components hence the need to revise the policy. The Policy document for instance does not make reference of the other PPP selection procedures which could mean that such procedures may be limited to those used in the public procurement. Ultimately, such an omission ejects the application of other selection procedures that is - two-stage tendering, competitive dialogue, and direct negotiation for the selection of qualified concessionaires. This is in contrast to the requirement of adopting PPP contract provisions drawn up on the basis of international best practices. In essence, this would eventually limit the application of wider options in the implementation of the PPP system in Botswana.

This study observes that socio-economic development through PPPs and in particular, the BOT model the SSA is inescapable. It is incumbent upon individual governments in the SSA region and at the level of regional blocks such as SADC to develop BOT friendly policies that facilitate easy implementation of public projects through PPPs. Research also demonstrates that political will facilitates the implementation of PPPs, leading to economic development. In this regard, policies favourable to PPP implementation guarding against political resistance are requisite. Lastly PPPs have been beneficial particularly for the emerging economies where infrastructure facilities and the disposition of public services are at their nascent stages. By implementing PPPs, Government is relieved from financial stress. Government as such, gets relief from over-taxation of citizens and external public sector borrowing.

Conclusion
The government of Botswana has been involved in public procurement of goods from as early as independence. During its early years, the government of Botswana depended on the traditional procurement system and involved neither the private sector nor other non-governmental organisations. There were instances where Botswana borrowed money from the Bretton Woods Institutions for its infrastructural developments. The PPP concept is a comparatively recent phenomenon in the country. There are several PPP projects that have been undertaken by government through the involvement of the private sector. The Ministry of Finance and Economic Development has recently worked with other ministries to identify projects that can be resourced through the PPP model. In its endeavour to implement the PPP model, Botswana continues to face some challenges such as availability of supportive infrastructure in the forms of water and energy, legislation deficiencies, poor project implementation and capacity issues. This paper identified the BOT from the other several schemes as the most suitable for implementation in the country several. The model will allow for training and transfer of skill to the locals so that they can have capacity to carry out projects of high magnitudes without having to depend of skills from outside.

References


The Role of Public Service on the Socio-Economic Development of Bauchi State

Jafa’ar Ibrahim Dass & Lumi Musa

Corresponding E-mail: jafman201@gmail.com / lumidinkis@gmail.com
Tel: +2348 067 033 605

1,2 Public Administration Department, School of Business Studies
Federal Polytechnic Bauchi, Nigeria

Abstract
The role of Public Service in promoting socio-economic development cannot be overemphasised especially amongst the developing countries like Nigeria. The Public Service in Bauchi State has been plagued with challenges that tend to undermine its performance in promoting socio-economic development. Bauchi State is among the state where over 80% of its population lives below poverty line of less than $1 a day. 85% of the populations are in rural areas with low literacy level and more than 65% classified as very poor. The study aims at exploring the role of public bureaucracy in promoting development in Bauchi State. Data were collected through administering of questionnaires to the worker of Bauchi State Civil Service: Office of the Head of Civil Service. The finding reveals that the impact bureaucracy has not been felt both at the rural and urban areas this shows that the role of the bureaucracy has not been efficient and the inadequate training of the personnel has affected the performance of the bureaucracy in Bauchi State. The studies recommend that the bureaucracy need to be reshaped and reorganized to be able to discharge it function effectively and efficiently. The training and development of the bureaucrats should be given priority.

Keywords: Public Service, Development, Role, Training and Development.

Background to the Study
Public Service is designed to accomplish large scale administrative tasks by coordinating the work of large number of persons in a systematic manner. It has been developed in the modern state. According to Aluku and Adesopo (2004) “in Bureaucracy or Public Service people are brought together in formal and complex settings runned by professionals and experts”. The organization is called bureaucracy or Public Service while the professional and experts that runs the organization are called bureaucrats. The industrial revolution of the 19th century marks the evolution of modern bureaucracy. It was during and after this period that large number of people became employees of complex organizations.

According to Sapru (2009) the term ‘Bureaucracy’ was coined by a French scholar name de Gournay. Marx Weber a German Sociologist, Historian and Economist is accredited with having made the most thorough analysis of Bureaucracy (Mullin 1999). Applebaum and Chambis (1995) argued that Bureaucracy start from birth (health bureaucracy) to family upbringing (social welfare) to school (education) to work (civil service, military, commercial, industrial) to worship and death (religion). Man is increasingly dominated by bureaucracy. Bureaucracy has become a central in the development of world. There is no country that does not have bureaucracy. Be it public or private.

The role of Public Service in promoting socio-economic development cannot be overemphasised especially amongst the developing countries like Nigeria. In developed societies like U.S.A. Britain etc the Public Service is charge with the responsibilities of maintaining law and order. While in developing countries like India, South Africa, Nigeria etc the challenge to Public Service is not only to maintain law and order but to promote socio-economic development of the State. As Anyeb (2010) puts it “.....that the traditional model of Public Administration would be inadequate in providing guidelines for building a nation-state out of the traditional society. Thus a system of administration termed development administration( Bureaucracy), a
specially within the broader field of Public Administration was adopted in the new nations to modernize their economic, accelerating development to be equivalent eventually, to the advanced countries of the west”. There was a need for technological bureaucracy to overcome tribal authority superstitious beliefs. Bureaucracy was developed to promote socio-economic development of the nation of the developing countries.

The role of Public Service is primarily to offer professional and transparent service, playing a pivotal role in the formulation and implementation of programs and projects for the sustainable development of the country especially among the developing countries like Nigeria and Bauchi State in particular. Bauchi State too is not left out for the need to promote and attain economic growth and development. The State established the Public Service not only to maintain law and order but to promote development of the State by participating in policy formulation and implementation through providing social service, education, health, human capital development, employment opportunities, infrastructure, public utilities, micro loans etc. This shows that Bureaucracy is paramount in promoting socio-economic development of the state.

**Statement of the Problem**

All over the world Public Service has been threatened with lot of factors such as complexity of modern technology, growth in size, rapid and unexpected changes and psychological threat springing from a change in managerial behaviour. Nigeria Bureaucracy too is not exceptional especially Bauchi State in particular; the bureaucracy has been plagued with corrupt officials, inefficient, and over staffed. Complementing this is the Udoji Report of 1974 which charge the Bureaucracy with nepotism, ethnic loyalties, elitisms, unreliability of junior staff in executing delegated tasks, failure to apply specialized knowledge and having skills in the management of the public services and failure to appreciate importance of timelines or efficiency in the performance of tasks.

The Public Service in Bauchi State has been plagued with challenges that tend to undermine its performance in promoting socio-economic development. Bauchi State is among the state where over 80% of its population lives below poverty line of less than $1 a day. 85% of the populations are in rural areas with low literacy level and more than 65% classified as very poor (United Nation Development Programme Report 2005). This point to the direction that much is needed to be done by the Bauchi State Government through the Civil Service to implement policies and programmes that will improve the socio-economic lives of the people. In addition to this, inadequate personnel that will manage the Public Service, process and procedures are not followed in discharging responsibility which may be due to poor training that undermines the role of the Public Service in promoting socio-economic development. That is why the study is raising the following questions:

a) How does the Public Service promote socio-economic development in Bauchi State?
b) To what extent, poor training and development undermines the process of socio-economic development in Bauchi State?
c) The study aims at exploring the role of Public Service in promoting socio-economic development in Bauchi State.

The research is built to achieve the following specific objectives:

a) To examine the role of Public Service in promoting socio-economic development in Bauchi State.
b) To examine how poor training and development affect Public Service in Bauchi State.
Research Assumptions

The research is built on the following Assumptions:

a) Public Service does not enhance socio-economic development in Bauchi State.

b) Poor training and development does not undermine socio-economic development of Public Service in Bauchi State.

Literature Review

The Concept of Bureaucracy/Public Service

Bureaucracy or Public Service has no accepted conceptual definition. Karl Max developed his concept of Bureaucracy within the general frame work of the theory of class conflict. Bureaucracy according to Karl Max is “an instrument by which the dominant class exercises its domination over the other classes” (Muozelis 1967:9). Karl Max sees Bureaucracy as office holders of the state whose aim is to manage public affairs in opposition to the masses of the nation. According to Karl Max, Bureaucracy like the state itself is an instrument by which the dominant class exercises its domination over the other social classes. This is the interest of the Bureaucracy are closely linked to these of the dominant class and the state. Bureaucracy is that apparatus of government designed to implement the division of the political leaders. Political leaders make policy while the public Bureaucracy executes it. But that is not always the true, though looking at the type of our Bureaucracy where there are mostly controlled by the political office holders.

Olsen (2005) viewed Bureaucracy in three ways “first, Bureaucracy is a distinct organizational setting, the bureau or office: formalized, hierarchical, specialized with a clear functional division of labour and demarcation of jurisdiction, standardized, rule based and impersonal. Second, Bureaucracy refers to a professional full-time administrative staff with lifelong employment, organized careers, salaries, and pensions, appointed to office and rewarded based on formal education, merits and tenure. Third, Bureaucracy implies a large organizational and normative structure where government is founded on authority that is, the belief in a legitimate rational – legal political order and the right of the state to define and enforce the legal order”. Binding authority is claimed through a fourfold rule bound hierarchical relation between citizens and elected representatives between democratic legislation and administration, within administration and between administration and citizen as subjects (as well as authors of law). This viewed Bureaucracy from the office, to the person that will occupy the office and his attributes and what he needs (power and authority) to discharge his responsibilities. The definition did consider the environment that the Bureaucracy would operate.

Kamernea (1989), viewed bureaucracy “as a descriptive core” means a centrally directed systematically organized and hierarchically structured staff devoted to the regular, routine, and efficient carrying out of large scale administrative tasks according to polices dictated by rulers or directors standing outside and above the bureaucracy. To Jay etal (2007) bureaucracy have four meanings to include:

a) All government officers: First bureaucracy “is the totality of government officers or bureaus (a French word meaning office) that constitute the permanent government of a state - that is the public functions that continue irrespective of changes in political leadership” This view bureaucracy as a personnel organization established to carry out programmes.

b) Public officials: Secondly, the bureaucracy refers to “all of the public officials of a government - both high and low, elected and appointed”. This includes the police officers, military officers, teachers, scientist etc.

c) A General invective: Bureaucracy is “often used as a general invective to refer to any inefficient organization encumbered by red tape”
d) Fourth, structural Arrangement: Bureaucracy refers to a specific set of structural arrangement”

Egonmuan (2007) bureaucracy refers to “all organizations depend primarily on formulation of behaviour to achieve coordination” According to him, Formulation can be achieved in the following ways:

a) By job in which behaviour specification are attached to the job itself, typically documenting it in the formal job description. Steps to be taken, how and when are vividly described.

b) By work flow establishing e.g. docket are printing press operators with instructions each order, for NITEL technicians before they go out for work.

c) By rules instating rules now for all jobs all works flows, all workers in policy manual like the civil service rules, financial memoranda, financial Regulations, civil service commission regulations and Establishment circulars in government and in various manuals in private organization/business.

Oguma (1999) summaries the various conceptualization (meaning) of bureaucracy under the following:

- Bureaucracy as a form of government designating the rules by officials
- Bureaucracy as an associational term designating a body of permanent paid officials (civil servants)
- Bureaucracy as an institutional Concept designating a complex system of administration by officials
- Bureaucracy as a concept which means efficiency in organization and
- Bureaucracy as a term, which means inefficiency in organization.

According to Max Weber bureaucracy, the features of ideal bureaucracy are:

i. **Hierarchy**: Each officials has a clearly define competence within a hierarchical division of labour and is answerable for its performance to a superior. That is every lower official is under the supervision of the senior ones.

ii. **Continuity**: The office constitutes a full-time salaried occupation, with a career structure, which offers the prospect of regular advancements.

iii. **Expertise**: Officials are selected according to merit, best on specialization and professionalization. Are trained for their function and control access to the knowledge stored in the files

iv. **Impersonality**: The work is conducted according to prescribe rules, without arbitrariness or favoritism and a written record is kept of each transaction.

v. **Division of Labour**: There is usually a clear cut division of labour based on specialization; hence, individuals become experts in the respective functional areas.

vi. **Clear define responsibility and humility**: The duties of each official are clearly spelt out and lines of authority and accountability are clear. Span of command and responsibility are identifiable and limited.

vii. **Discipline**: There is an acceptable system of discipline where officials are subject to strict control and discipline in discharging their duties.

viii. **Security of job**: The official work constitutes a career and is protected against arbitrary dismissal. That is an official enjoys security of tenure, provide that he/she did not commit an offence contrary to laid down procedures.

ix. **Filing system**: All official transactions and communications are documented for reference and to preserve uniformity of action. All decisions are worded in writing. The extensive filling system constitutes the memory bank of the organization.

x. The officials do not have properly right to their office or any personal claim to the resources that go with it.
According to Max Weber, bureaucracy is the most efficient, most rational, superior to any other form, indispensable and permanent. The factors that are responsible for the rise of bureaucracy according to him are: Creation of money economy, emergency of capitalist economy, growth of democratic institutions, emergence of complex administrative problems, development of modern means of communication, growth of rationalism and growth of population (Laxmikanth, 2005). Furthermore, Aluko and Adesopo (2004) discuss extensively on the need or need for bureaucracy. According to them, “there are four historical conditions which have help to promote the development of bureaucracy in the contemporary society.” These are: money economy, capitalism, protestant, and large size.

Public bureaucracy has been considered a veritable instrument in the developing process of any society. This is more so in developing countries where the government has been confronted with series of challenges. Therefore, it is through public bureaucracy and their efficient and effective functioning, that developing countries can translate their political will into concrete policy measures and put them into operation for the achievement of national goals. However, the role of the Public Service as agent of social change and development has been fought with controversies especially in developing countries. According to some scholars, it development means mental or physical development of structure as some liberals contend; bureaucracy could say to have made considerable impact in national development. Development is about man and the qualitative improvement and transformation in his socio – economic life.

The Public Service is part of the machinery of the executive branch of the government and exists, to put into effect government policies. The effectiveness of government, especially in relation to national development therefore depends on the efficiency of public bureaucracy and its ability to respond in practical terms to its policy decisions. It is for these reason that the public bureaucracy is often described as the custodian of the government reputation for it is the unable to carry out the polices faithfully and efficiently, it does not only frustrate government, but it might seriously undermine the government’s position and stability in power. Public bureaucracy is often link to public administration. Public administration is often referred to as the action part of government. Civil servants are often referred to as public Administrators and they are identified by several functions they perform. These functions are regarded as role of public bureaucracy in national development as they represent the relationship between the Public Service and national development (Eme. and Eke 2012). These roles are as follows:

Assisting in policy formulation: Policy formulation is the exclusive preserve of politicians, and political office holders. However, they may not be able to do this without the assistance of bureaucrats who usually provide the necessary data and information which would guide policy choice by the political masters. Bureaucrats go to the field to collect data, analyze them and provide policy alternative with supportive arguments on each. The final policy choice and decision are not the responsibilities of public bureaucrats but they reserve administrative discretions on certain matter of public policy agency, especially at the implementation stage.

Policy Execution: The primary function of bureaucrats is to carry out government order and directives without complaints officials polices are practically implemented by the public bureaucrats. They are expected to perform such function to the best of their administrative and technical ability. When the particular function is performed religiously, national development is ensured, as they are nothing but policy decision taken which awaits implementation by the bureaucrats. This is the role of public bureaucracy in achieving national development.

Assisting in law making: The executive under a democratic rule, present bills to the parliament for legislation. Conventionally, it is the duty of the bureaucrats to draft the bill and fleshed it up with the necessary details before presentation to parliament for debate.
Rule/Law implementation: In modern democratic political nations, bureaucracy is entrusted with the function to implement the rules and policies made by the legislation. Therefore the bureaucrats are inexonarable in law making and implementation, little wonder the saying that public Administration is the administration of “law”, simply put, law in application.

Provision of social amenities and service bureaucrats engage in the provision of some social service as their official assignment. Therefore, whoever has as his official assignment, the provision of social amenities has the sole responsibility of ensuring national development. Therefore, the public bureaucracy has the responsibility of providing social services to the national populace.

Promote private sector development through facilitation in the firm of capital, technical expertise, markets, protection, contracts, infrastructure, and energy and enhance discipline. The aim is to realize national development defined as: Expanded investments, employment creation, Higher and equitable income and development of social infrastructure it is only the public bureaucrats that can promote private partnership.

Continuity of government: public bureaucrats in the past especially during the numerous military regimes Nigeria has witnessed had always played permanent roles in maintaining the continuity of government. Public bureaucrats often provide continuity in government by ensuring provision of social service in all its ramifications. The responsibility leads them to playing a major role in national development because government exist to provide development and so whoever keeps the government going, keeps development going.

Production: Public Bureaucracy exists to perform service in the broadest sense of term. Its primary purpose is production. Things produced may be tangible object such as fertilizer, construction of roads, petroleum products intangible goods such as cases of legal disputes, educational service, health services, etc. Public bureaucracy facilitates the production of goods and services.

Administrative adjudicatory power: This is another power which has been entrusted to the executive indirectly to the public bureaucracy due to the rapid technological development and emergence of the welfare concept of the state. Administrative Adjudication means vesting judicial and quasi – judicial powers to an administrative department or agency, administrative tribunals like the public complaint commission, Independent corrupt practices commission, ICPC etc. are established to performed this function.

Furthermore, to Naidu (2005) in the developing countries, Public Bureaucracy is view as a major instrument for promoting economic development and social change “since the developing countries are engaged in rapid social – economic transformation under the leadership of government.

Public bureaucracy has very crucial role to play”. It has act as locomotive of development. Public bureaucracy is the process by which objectives are defined, plans and policies formulated, institutions created and managed, human energies mobilized, resources utilized and change effected.

Thus, in the developing countries the people especially in Nigeria, the poor look to public bureaucracy to improve them lot and alleviate misery. Public bureaucracy has therefore, deal with such problems as poverty, illiteracy, unemployment, malnutrition, growing population, housing for the weaker sectors, low productivity in agriculture and industry on account rising needs of the people, the public bureaucracy has to provide welfare services such as minimum level of education, health services, water, housing, social security etc. The public bureaucracy has also catered to basic living of the poor by regulating the equitable distribution of essential commodities like rice, wheat, sugar etc. The bureaucracy plays an important role in the scheme of ordering social activities and in promoting social justice and equity.
Naidu (2005) buttress that, the governments of developing countries have also undertaken a variety of programmes for the development of agriculture and industry. In order to encourage the development of industries; Public bureaucracy provides infrastructural facilities like electricity, roads, communication and marketing center. The public Bureaucracy manages government business and industrial enterprises and public utility services. The various developmental activities are undertaken by the government in order to reduce, if not eliminate poverty and unemployment and to bring about improvement in the lives of the people.

Majority of the people in the developing societies are most dependent on Public Bureaucracy for protection of life and survival. Development activities are also dependent upon proper revenue administration because effective collective of revenue to government will generate funds for socio-economic developmental tasks. Thus, the functions of law and order and revenue collection are important to the extent to which they support developmental programmes.

The Public Bureaucracy of developing nations are engaging themselves in the different task of developing a sense of nationhood and an awareness of separate national identity. The bureaucrats have to resolve the sub-national and sub-cultural differences among the people in order to create social cohesion. The bureaucrats have to manage crises resulting from social upheavals created by the various separatist forces.

The adoption of planning as a method of socio-economic development has led to the assumption of many new responsibilities by bureaucracy. These relate to setting right developmental priorities and goals, formulation and implementation of development plans, policies, programmes and projects. Mobilizing of material and human resources to secure the necessary managerial skills and technical competence utilization of the advances in service and technology in order to raise productivity in industry and agriculture creations of new administrative organizations and improving the capacity to the existing ones for development purposes. Moreover, the support of the people for developmental activities by involving them in the process of developing and by creating in them appropriate attitudes towards the socio-economic changes that are taking place.

The controversy has been that what would Public Service play in privatize economy. The policy of privatization signifies a decrease in the scope of the functions of the state. It results in the minimum of state interference in the lives of the individuals. Nevertheless, state withdrawal is not total or indiscriminate. The state can still increase the influence of the market without giving up its direct role in key economic sectors. Further, the state is called upon to oversee the operational side of the enterprise. The need for regulating the market forces gives the state the new role of regulator. In private enterprises system, the unscrupulous and antisocial elements do resort to illegal means to earn more and more profit. Hence, it is the duty of the state to prevent such practices in the large interests of the society as a whole. The role of the state as a regulator requires the existence of a regulatory mechanism to protect and promote public interest by imposing regulations upon the private economic enterprises.

In conclusion, the above discussion shows that functionally the scope of Public Service in the developing countries like Nigeria has greatly increased. It embraces both the traditional regulatory functions and the new developmental and promotional activities. In addition, it covers the administrative machinery created for formulating and implementing the various development plans, policies, and programmes. All these new functions and responsibilities have expanded the activities of public administration in scope, volume and range and added to its significance.

**Methodology**
The researchers used primary source as a means of data collection. The instrument of primary data used was questionnaire. The questionnaire is administered to the staff Bauchi State Civil Service. The
questionnaire was designed using both the open and closed ended styles. The population size of the study is Bauchi Civil Service, with the workforce of 29,596. The sample of 395. To get the sample size, we used Yamane’s (1967) formula as found in the work of Isreal (1992) was used 395. 315 questionnaires was retrieved. Data was analysed using simple percentage.

Data Presentation and Analysis

Data were presented and analyzed using table and percentage as indicated below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Role of Public Service in socio-economic development of the state</td>
<td></td>
<td>56</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Impact of the Public Service in both rural and urban areas</td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Public Service in provision of social service (water, roads, water, education, health, electricity etc)</td>
<td></td>
<td>41</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Promotion of economic activities</td>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Poor training and development affect the performance of Public Service in Bauchi State</td>
<td></td>
<td>178</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Inadequate training affects Public Service in the development process of Bauchi State</td>
<td></td>
<td>128</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Survey, 2018

The above data indicate that Public Service enhances socio-economic development because 60% agree, seconded by strongly agree with 17%. So Public Service is strategic and instrument of development if properly position to suit the needs of the immediate society. The research indicates that every corner of Bauchi State with 41% agreeing to it has felt the impact public service. However, 34% objected that not every corner of the society has felt the impact. This shows that there are some areas within the Bauchi State, despite the fact that, the State has been for the past 40 years and 17 years of consistent civilian rule. Until date, they have not seen the impact of public service that touched every corner of the State.

From the surveyed, it demonstrated that public service has succeeded in provision of social amenities like roads, education, water, electricity etc. With 58% and 12% agreeing to it; 23% and 7% objecting it, this show case that there some areas of the State that some of those infrastructures are invisible. This reveals that public service has succeeded in providing social amenities within the State but not everywhere across the State. The table above indicates that public service has facilitated the promotion of economic activities within the State with 59% and 14% of the respondents agreeing to it. This may be in the area of increase salaries and wages that shows in the purchase of goods and service thereby boosting commercial activities, in addition to job creations and income distribution. 22% and 5% kick against the fact that public bureaucracy has not facilitated the economic activities within the State, may be because inadequate industries and firm within the state and government industries or public enterprises has been mismanage and closed down and become bankrupt. From the above data the table, it indicate that poor training and development affect the performance of Public bureaucrats in the State with 57% and 25% respondents agreeing to it. This is because, when a civil servant is not well train and retrain on what to do, this would sabotage the effort of the organization. While 10% and 8% objecting that poor training does not affect the performance of civil servant they are entitle to their opinion.
Conclusion and Recommendation
Therefore the study concludes that, public service remain the major instrument that can brings development. The public service needs general restructuring and reshaping to make it result oriented and efficient in service delivery. However, numerous criticisms against the public bureaucracy, but none of the critics has succeeded in recommending a better system of administration than the public service. The Bauchi State public service has to be driven by the needs of the environment rather than rules and procedures that are counterproductive to the needs of the people. This call for the theory of New Public of Management has to be put in place to make the public bureaucracy viable and more efficient. The studies recommend that, the impact of the public service should be extended to the grass root, so that people at the rural areas will feel the impact of public service. This calls for decentralization and devolution of this ministries, departments and agencies of the government to different parts of the state to facilitate quick administration. And adequate training of the personnel is very essential for the efficiency of the in the state to discharge its responsibilities effectively.

References
Anyeba, A.A. (2012). Development Administration Perspective on the Challenge in Nigeria, Shereef Salam
Nig. Ltd, Zaria, Kaduna
Mouzelis, N.P (1969). Organization and Bureaucracy, Routledg and Kegan Paul Limited,
Bauchi State Government: Report of the Task Force Committee to Verify and Authenticate the Productive and Unproductive workforce in Bauchi State, Submitted to his Excellency Mal. Dr. Isa Yuguda, November 2011

Michael Galukande-Kiganda & Anthony Guloba

1Consultant Public Policy and Governance
1,2 Uganda Management Institute
Corresponding E-mail: mgalukande@umi.ac.ug / kigandamichael2000@gmail.com

Abstract
This paper presents findings from the study that investigated contract management and urban government services provisioning based on Tororo Municipal Council, Eastern Uganda, as a case study. Existing research focused on public private partnerships and contracting out as part of the New Public Management (NPM) reforms without highlighting the unique aspects of urban governments contracts management phenomena. This particular study was guided by three specific objectives of examining how contract planning, contract monitoring and contract administration affected urban services provisioning in urban local governments. The study used a mixed cross-sectional survey design adopting explanatory sequencing of quantitative with qualitative data. The research was based on 59 questionnaires, 16 interviews and a review of procurement and annual performance reports for the period of financial years 2014-2018. The outcome of the study established a strong positive correlation between contract planning, contract monitoring and contract administration on urban governments services provisioning. This was relevant because urban local governments (unlike rural local governments), to a larger extent depend on outsourcing for the provisioning of their delegated services where effective management of the contracts is a necessary prerequisite for enhance services delivery. This paper hence recommends that for better service provisioning, urban local governments should pay attention to contract administration, contract monitoring and contract planning.

Key words: Contract Management, Urban Service Delivery

Introduction
The quest for public sector efficiency and effectiveness has forced many governments to look for a magical formula of involving the private sector in financing, developing and provisioning of public services (Bouckaert & Halachmi, 2001; Pietroforte and Miller, 2002). Indeed, Gormley (2006) urges that contracting out has been a dominant and sweeping public sector reform combined with the emerging theory of contract efficiency that has created faith in contracting out services with private organizations in the anticipation of superior results efficiently, effectively, accountably, and with a wide variety of citizen choice. Globally, governments contract out aiming to secure higher value for money by promoting improved contestability and variety of goods and services (Zheng, & Walker, 2006). Nowhere in the public sector has the practice of contracting out been so highly adored than in urban local governments where almost all public goods and services are being outsourced. Indeed, it is now taken for granted by many local governments that contracting private service providers is a superior approach to in house urban authorities’ services delivery.

This study investigated contract management and contract performance in urban councils in Uganda. Contract management was defined and conceptualized as by Sherman, (1987) in terms of contract planning, monitoring, and administration. In this study, contract planning constituted all the processes followed in the management of the contract by the user departments involved in the contracted out goods or services so as to achieve value for money. Contract monitoring as observed by Klein, Crawford, and Alchian (1978), involved the processes of contract quality management that involved performance reporting, and conflict management. Lastly, contract administration was investigated in agreement with Williamson (1981, 1985)
as the task of achieving deliverables and the acceptance of contract payments and the eventual contract closing out. Overall, contract performance was assessed in agreement with Coase (1960) as being concerned with the timeliness, the quality of goods and services, cost effectiveness and customer satisfaction.

For many countries, the state, its agencies and authorities have been the major provider of public services (Grimsay, 2002; Harries 2003). However, overtime, several countries started to engage private organisations in the provisioning of public goods. In Latin America, for example, this practice started as early as the 1920s. In Asian countries like China, India and Japan, contracting out began as early as the 1950s. For the case of East African states (Uganda, Tanzania, Rwanda, Burundi, the Sudan and Kenya) contract management was colonially managed by agents who were appointed by the colonialists.

In Uganda, the Regulations operationalizing the Central Tender Board were enacted and instituted as the first formal guidelines on public procurement and contract management in the country. Responsibilities of the Central Tender Board were further enhanced in 1990 and it was now in charge of central government contract awards, and monitoring and evaluation of contracts (Tumutegyereize, 2013). The 2003 Public Procurement and Disposal of Assets Act (PPDA) and the Local Governments’ PPDA Regulations of 2006 enhanced contract management in the public sector. The PPDA introduced legal aspects pertaining to contract management, roles and responsibilities of user departments, contracts committees, procurement unit, and evaluation committees. Despite the anticipated successes associated with the PPDA, several studies have identified failures to complete several projects on time and within the budget frameworks. For instance, the Mukono–Kyetume–Katasi–Nyenga Road Project that was originally expected to be completed in three years, took more than (UBOS (27 August 2014)). Similarly, several road projects in Tororo Municipal Council delayed beyond the planned completion time. These included the Bazaar, Tagora West, Tagora East, Oguti, and Market Street roads. The aim of this study, thus was to evaluate contract management for the improved public service provisioning in Tororo Municipal Council. The specific objectives of the study were to examine contract planning, monitoring and administration in the overall contracts performance in Tororo Municipal Councils.

Related Literature
The study was guided by the “Theory of Transactions Cost Economics”, as developed by Ronald Coase (1937) and modified by Oliver Williamson (1975). Under this theory, the role of organizations in contracting is highly advanced. Because organizations aim to reduce operating costs, resource exchange with the external providers in monitoring the bureaucratic tendencies becomes important. In the same way, when organizations operate at low costs, it has high expansion potential and sustainability and will eventually end up in organisational downsizing. The transactions cost economics theory further asserts that as long as organizations produce goods or services at low costs than its competitors it is more likely to expand and provide sustainable services compared to those that do not participate in contracting out. Accordingly, Williamson (1981), affirms that transactions that exist when contracts are performed in supplying contract deliverables, they take place in the transaction contract cycle and results in contractual obligations. Thus the purpose of governments entering into contractual arrangements with private service providers, is to seek effectiveness, efficiency and minimizing contractual costs in the provision of services. Further, the theory of transactions cost economics asserts that the as the organisation contracts from the external environment it should undertake contract management so as to be in position to deliver the expected services.
Contract Planning and Contract Performance

Contract planning deals with the identification and execution of the structures, formats and contents of the contracting mechanisms the organisations expect from their suppliers. Good contract planning involves formalization of relations between both parties within a legal framework, and defines the arrangements that encompass every aspect of the outcomes expected from the supplier and how to manage the relationship. Thus Jones, (2007) urges that the public entity should put in place approaches to manage this relationship. Indeed, Basheka (2004) further argues that contract planning is a primary function of contract management with a prospective to contribute to the attainment of local government operations that are undertaken through contract performance. This is because contract planning sets in motion the acquisition process of acquiring services and services in local governments.

Several authors have attempted to define and explain the concept of contract planning in different ways. For example, Agaba and Shipman, (2007), explained contract planning is thus as the process used by public institutions to design the modes outsourced activities for defined and specific periods of time that are usually undertaken during the budgeting process. In Tororo Municipal Council, this period corresponds to the financial year that runs between 1st July to 30th June. The Economic commission of Africa (2003) defines contract planning as a form acquisition through which organizations obtain products and services from external suppliers. Several steps are involved in contract planning and a good contract plan should go one step further by describing these process that normally end up applying to all institutions. First, the organisation defines the items or services needed to be contracted out. Secondly, the organisation defines the processes for contracting out these items or services. Finally, the organisation schedules the timeframes for delivery (contract execution). Contract planning is thus one part of the commissioning process of the entire contract management.

Several advantages are attributed to contract planning. Mullins (2003) asserts that the contribution of contract planning in enabling efficient and effective contract performance in public sector organizations is undisputed. In his study, Mullins (2003) revealed significant positive relationships between contract planning and contract performance in local government systems of Uganda. The outcomes of contract planning are: the reduction in the number of contract awards, appreciating the total cost of ownership, providing more purchasing options, evidence based decision making, improved risk mitigation before contract award, more solicitation of opportunities with added suppliers value, and improved relationships with suppliers. These, according to Mawhood (1983), lead to improved contract performance and creates an important route to securing the right goods and services that are eventually offered to the public. Similarly, contract planning also maximizes the levels of service provision which can be achieved with support from the local people. Lastly, contract planning helps contracting entities achieve maximum value for money on expenditures on goods and services delivered to local governments and enables these entities to identify and address relevant issues pertaining to particular contracts before publicizing contracts to potential suppliers.

As Nkinga, (2003), claims local and international organisations are increasingly interested in public contracting hence necessitating vivid and more effective approaches to manage it. There is thus need for developing better contract management skills that focus on flexibility and enhanced freedom that ignites innovation and enables contract stakeholders to have a bigger impact on contract performance. Guaranteeing good contract management is essential to the provision of effective public services. Thus poor contract management funds ineffective contract performance as well as low value for money in public service delivery. In this way, all governments should put priority to the effective and efficient contract
performance. There is a common belief, that for Tororo Municipality, the abuse of contractual relationships stems from the high levels of greed among both politicians and civil servants.

Langseth et al (1997), pointed out that one of the objectives of contracting is to ensure steady service provision in government institutions that may have resulted in poor contract performance. Thus contract planning drives the public sector contract performance at lower governments and other government Ministries, departments and agencies. Contract planning thus focuses on sound budgeting, the effective implementation of procurement plans, accountability and participation. Contrary to this idea, there is a limited research that has been conducted in local governments in Uganda to assess the extent of contract planning and how it affects contract.

**Contract Monitoring and Contract Performance**

Brown and Potoski, (2006) poised that effective monitoring of contracts allows government to benefit better from contracting out. Throughout the evaluation phase of contracting, government agencies require evaluation capacity to monitor and evaluate the contractor’s performance to determine if its contract responsibilities are met. “Building contract management capacity includes acquiring and nurturing physical infrastructure, financial resources, and perhaps most important, human capital” (Brown & Potoski, 2006). Gormley (1994:16) also urged that: “Accountability continues to be the achilles heel of many contracts”. However, contract management is dependent on performance management which was defined by Romzek and Johnston (2005:25) as a critical element of effective contract accountability, and “that state is; able to design, implement, manage, and achieve accountability for its contract”. They further urged that for proper contract accountability, measures have to be stated boldly for the benefit of information to facilitate contract assessment. Thus efficient monitoring results into realization of contract deliverables when government agency participation by warrantees contract compliance to set contract standards. Similarly, identifying performance measures and effectively monitoring them allows objective assessment of outcomes. Fernandez (2007) further asserts that in order to have quality project monitoring the channels of information exchange have to be known to all, the schedule of duties and responsibilities of every category of stakeholder in the contract, areas of capacity building identified and communicated, regulations printed, and terms and conditions availed to contract all stakeholders.

Yang, Hsieh, and Li (2009:34) defined evaluation capacity as:

1. having an accredited monitoring mechanism that aid in assessing whether the provider has meant the terms and conditions of the contract;
2. utilizing monitoring methods for such as; site inspections, periodic assessments, and payment audits;
3. requiring regular, formal performance reporting; and
4. monitoring the utility under contract continuously to ascertain progress and adherence to the specifications.”

Lack of proper coordination among key players of the contract in contract monitoring has resulted into contract failures (Fernandez, 2007).

Quality monitoring is thus a key component of the perceived value to both clients and contractors. The International Federation of Consulting Engineers (FIDIC) as cited in Ngosong, (2015:56) noted that: “lack of quality in construction is manifested in poor or non-sustainable workmanship, and unsafe structures; and in delays, cost overruns and disputes in construction contracts”. Thus value and quality construction
are of concern to both public and private sector clients therefore monitoring the performance of the contractor regularly is a very important part of contract management. There variations in monitoring systems among the urban local authorities. Whatever the case, a monitoring system is necessary to maintain the quality of work and to record the data for future references. When contract monitoring considerably takes shape in ensuring efficient contract execution, the role of the private players does change from simple execution of works to the management and conservation of assets such that in order to be eligible to the monthly payments for any maintenance services, contractors must ensure that the contract projects comply with the specified service quality levels in the bidding document. This is in agreement with Queiroz (2005), who suggested five steps that can be followed to ensure quality monitoring. These include; contractor’s self-control systems; formal monthly inspections; supervisors’ inspections; project managers’ inspections; and maintaining record books used to follow comments or complaints of stakeholders.

Oluka and Basheka (2013) contend that proper and effective contract monitoring helps to improve quality of goods and services and reduces procurement cost, thereby achieving three broad goals: (1) quality works and services, (2) timely delivery of works, goods and services, and (3) cost effectiveness. Davison and Sebastian (2009) further established the likelihood of contract problems for a given type of contract, and the type of contract that is likely to encounter the most problems. Monitoring thus has the potential to promote transparency and good governance in provision of works, goods and services (Liautaud, 2001; Zietlow, 2004). In the same direction, Tineo (2007) argues that limited experience in the output-based approach to public procurement monitoring in many developing countries has prevented a comprehensive examination of its effects on lowering corruption.

**Contract Administration and Contract Performance**

Cavendish and Martin (1982) asserted that the contract administration cycle begins when the contract has been signed by the buyer and seller. Contract administration thus constitutes all the activities performed to offer deliverables up-to contract termination. The aim of the contract administration cycle is to make sure the contractor delivers as per contract terms and condition. It is nowadays conventionally believed that he absence of systemic contract administration is one of the core reasons for contracting failures (Hodge, 2000; Sclar, 2000; Brudney et al., 2005; Kamerman and Kahn, 2012; Stejskal and Charbusky, 2004; Štrangfeldová & Hronec, 2008). Several factors have been pointed out by several scholars as contributing to the quality of contract management. For example, Savas, (2010); Kettl, (2009); Greene, (2002); Hodge, (2000); and Pavel and Beblavá, (2008) all point to the degree of competition in bidding for the contract. Rehfuss, (2013); Marlin, (1984); and Romzek and Johnston, (2002) believe that it is due to the quality of evaluation on the contractors. On the other hand, Rehfuss, (1989); and Marlin, (1984) contend that it is due to absence of a clear definition of the contract specification. On the other hand, Rehfuss, (1989); Marlin, (2013); Prager, (2014); Seidenstat, (2008); Brown and Potoski, (2003a); Hefetz and Warner, (2004); and Šebová, (2016) believe that it is due to the quality of contract monitoring. While DeHoog, (2009); MacNeil, (2014) contend that it is due to sanctions. Lastly, Romzek and Johnston, (2012) urge that it is due to the experience of the government body that is responsible for contract management; and the technical knowledge of the contracted service providers. (Kettl, 2013).

More recent approaches to contracting thus continue to advocate for relational contracting as a more flexible and cooperative approach to managing contractual relationships based on mutual trust, shared norms and values, and standards of behavior. Such new approaches also treat communication and joint problem solving between client and contractors as determinants of contracting performance (DeHoog,
Contract administration thus exists to guide contractors and the clients to fulfill their contractual obligations. These two parties are charged with the role of contract administration during execution of the contract. In this way, Haugan (2006) contends that contract administration entails putting in place provisions for internal, quality assurance and controls, inspection and verification criteria.

**Methodology**

In this study was carried out based on a quantitative cross sectional survey design to investigate the effect of contract management on contract performance in Tororo Municipality. The purpose was to guide the researchers to validate the opinion of the respondents on contract management in and contract performance. The study was conducted in Tororo Municipal Council and engaged members of the municipal Technical Planning Committee (TPC), the municipal Contracts Committee, the municipal Executive Committee, the Municipal Development Forum (MDF), Town Clerks of municipal divisions, Chairpersons of municipal division and selected contracted firms and service providers. Summary of the sample size selected and research techniques used is represented in Table 1.

**Table 1: Sample Size Selection and Techniques**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Sampling Technique</th>
<th>Sampling Tool</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technical Planning Committee</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contracts Committee Members</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Council IV Executive</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Development Forum (MDF)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division Town Clerks (ATC)</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Council III Executive Committee</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contracted firms (Pre-qualified firms)</td>
<td>09</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>User Department representatives</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Random Sampling</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>70</strong></td>
<td><strong>67</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Researcher, 2018*

**Findings**

**Contract Planning and Contract Performance**

Objective one of the study was built on the hypothesis that: Contract Planning positively affects Contract Performance in Tororo Municipal Council. To investigate this statement, Pearson’s correlation coefficient (r) was used to test and validate the hypotheses. Correlation findings are presented in Table 2.

**Table 2: Correlation matrix for Contract Planning and Contract Performance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Contract Planning</th>
<th>Contract Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contract Planning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.396**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract Performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.396**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)**
From Table 2 findings reveal the correlation coefficient (r = 0.396), and its significance level of (p = 0.002) which p-value is less than the critical significance of (p = 0.01), this implies that contract planning had a significant positive effect on contract performance thus validating the hypothesis that:

Contract planning affects contract performance positively. Further regression analysis was carried out to ascertain the extent to which contract planning affected contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council. Findings are presented in Table 3.

**Table 3: Regression analysis of the effect of contract planning on contract performance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.396a</td>
<td>.156</td>
<td>.142</td>
<td>.593</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Contract planning

The coefficient of determination (R Squared) was equal to 0.156, this implied that 15.6% of variability in contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council was as a attributed of contract planning and that the remaining 84.4% of variability in contract performance in TMC was as a result of other factors which this study did not consider. 15.6% was assumed to be a relatively high positive figure, therefore it was further confirmed that indeed contract performance did positively affect contract performance.

**Contract Monitoring and Contract Performance**

Objective two of the study was to establish how contract performance affected contract performance. This objective was investigated using the hypothesis that: Contract monitoring positively affects contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council. Again Pearson’s Correlation (r) was used to test the hypothesis. Findings are presented in Table 4.

**Table 4: Pearson’s Correlation Coefficient for Contract Monitoring and Contract Performance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.488**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.488**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)**

Results indicated that the correlation coefficient (r) that was equal to 0.488), and its significance level of (p = 0.000) which p-value is less than the critical significance of (p = 0.01). This implied that contract monitoring had a significant strong positive effect on contract performance thus these results validated the hypothesis that contract monitoring positively affects Contract Performance. Further regression analysis was carried out to ascertain the extent to which contract monitoring contributed to contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council. Findings are presented in Table 5.
The coefficient of determination (R Squared) was equal to 0.238. This means that up to 23.8% of variability in contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council was attributed to contract monitoring and that the remaining 76.2% of variability in contract performance was attributed to other factors that this study did not investigate.

**Contract Administration and Contract Performance**

Objective three of the study was to establish whether contract administration had an effect on contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council. To investigate this statement, a hypothesis was developed that: Contract administration positively affected contract performance. To verify this claim, Pearson’s correlation coefficient (r) was used to test and validate the hypothesis. Findings are presented in Table 6.

**Table 6: Correlation Matrix for Contract Administration and Contract Performance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contract Administration</th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Contract Performance</th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contract Administration</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.472**</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>Contract Performance</td>
<td>.472**</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

*Source: Researcher, 2018*

Results show the correlation coefficient (r) as equal to 0.472 and its significance level of (p = 0.000) which p-value is less than the conventional significance of (p = 0.01), the findings imply that contract administration had a significant strong positive effect on contract performance. These results validated the hypothesis that contract administration positively affects Contract Performance. Further regression analysis was carried out to ascertain the degree to which contract administration affected contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council. Findings are presented in Table 7.

**Table 7: Regression Analysis of Contract Administration on Contract Performance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.472</td>
<td>.223</td>
<td>.209</td>
<td>.569</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Contract Administration

*Source: Researcher, 2018*
Table 8 shows that the coefficient of determination (R Squared) was equal to 0.223. This is interpreted to mean that up-to 22.3% of variability in contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council was attributed to contract administration and that the remaining 77.7% of variability in was as a result of other factors which this study did not investigate.

**Discussion**

The study findings revealed that there was a significant positive correlation between contract planning and contract performance, this was because the correlation coefficient $r = 0.396 (**). The findings were further tested for significance (p-value), it was established that the significance of correlation ($p = .002$) was less than the critical significance level of 0.01, as a result, the hypothesis one; “contract planning positively affects contract performance” was accepted. The R Square was .156 this meant that 15.6% variability in contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council was a result of procurement planning. This study therefore was in agreement with arear studies conducted by Jones, (2007) and Basheka (2004).

Further studies by other scholars; Caldwell, Roehrich &Davies, (2009), Tsang (2002), and Al-Turki (2011), found out that contract planning is one of the factors to be considered for better Contract Performance. Caldwell, Roehrich &Davies, (2009), in their study carried out on procurement process at “Blissfulminds Nigeria Limited” in 2015, they advised that when an entity is planning to carry out contract activities, it’s prudent to observe the process, and added that skipping some stage it is the beginning of procurement failures and litigation issues.

These revelation further confirmed that for contract performance to improve, there should be significant improvement in contract planning and vice versa. Findings further confirmed that challenges of contract planning in Tororo Municipal council were highly attributed to poor contract planning. Accordingly, to improve contract planning, the municipal authorities should put a lot of emphasis on improving all the processes that lead to effective contract planning.

As far as contract monitoring and contract performance were concerned, the study findings revealed that there was a strong significant positive correlation between contract monitoring and Contract Performance, this was because the correlation coefficient $r = 0.488 (**). The findings were further tested for significance (p-value), it was established that the significance of correlation ($p = .000$) was less than the critical significance at 0.01, as a result, the hypothesis two; “contract monitoring positively affects contract performance” was accepted. The R Square was .238 this meant that 23.8% variability in Contract Performance in TMC was a result of contract monitoring. Similarly, these findings were in agreement with earlier studies conducted by Davison and Sebastian (2009) and those of Fernandez, (2007). Other literature reviewed seemed to have general consensus that contract monitoring was vital to successful contract performance. Study findings thus revealed that there were again significant challenged in contract monitoring in Tororo Municipal council that were evidenced in declining contract performance. Therefore, to improve on contract performance, management of Tororo Municipal Council had to intensify management efforts aimed at improving the scale of contract monitoring.

In the same way, Brown and Postoski (2006), in their study carried out on “contracting out by urban governments in United States, they asserted that effective monitoring of contracts allows government to get better benefits from contracts and these better benefits are translated through the Contract Performance. Romzek and Johnston (2005), in their study carried out on “the effectiveness of contract accountability in social service contracts on five case studies of Kansas contracts for selected welfare, Medicaid, and foster
care and adoption services, they concluded that proper performance reporting on the activities and progress status of a contract, the act is self brings confidence in the stakeholder that the contract will yield quality results that will benefit them all and by reporting on the general performance of the contract creates a monitoring synergy among the contract stakeholders. Yang, Hsieh and Li (2009) they asserted that having accreted monitoring mechanism that aid in assessing whether the provider/contractor has meant the terms and conditions of the contract, requiring regular, formal performance reporting and monitoring the utility under contract continuously to ascertain progress and adherence to specifications. 

Lastly, as far as contract administration and contract performance, the study findings revealed that there was a strong significant positive correlation between contract administration and contract performance, this was because the correlation coefficient  \( r = 0.472 \) (**). The findings were further tested for significance (p-value), it was established that the significance of correlation (\( p = .000 \)) was less than the critical significance at 0.01, as a result, the hypothesis two; “contract administration positively affects Contract Performance” was accepted. The R Square was .223 this meant that 22.3% variability in Contract Performance in TMC was a result of contract administration. Again, the study findings were in agreement with several studies reviewed in literature particularly those of Hodge, (2000); Sclar, (2000); Brudney et al., (2005); Kamerman and Kahn, (2012); Stejskal and Charbusky, (2004); Štrang feldová & Hronec, (2008).

In the same way, Cavendish and Martin (1982) noted that once the contract has been signed by the client and contractor, performance marks the beginning of the contract administration cycle, Contract administration constitutes the activities performed to offer the deliverables and contract termination. The aim of this cycle is to make sure the contractor/provider delivers as per contract guide lines/terms and condition so by ensuring contract administration, it’s a grantee for better contract performance.

As this overwhelming literature was confirmed by findings from this study, management of Tororo Municipal Council needs to improve on contract administration as another way to improve on contract performance. The study that attributes poor contract performance in Tororo Municipal Council to among others, poor contract administration.

**Recommendations**

The study makes the following recommendations:

1. In the area of contract planning, the paper recommends that adequate and effective contract planning should be a priority for Tororo Municipal Council if it is to offer better and sustainable services to the stakeholders in. The paper further recommends that contract planning should be participatory by all the concerned stakeholders other leaving it to specific individual. In the same way, the paper recommends that municipal accounting officers should ensure that heads of departments, and appointed contract managers conceptualize the contract details by particularly paying attention to contract specifications, clauses and other terms and conditions of the contract.

2. For contract monitoring the study recommends that the municipal accounting officers should institute additional independent contract monitoring committee s and to always verify the progress of the contract implementation. They should also ensure that there are administrative checks and balance on the activities of the contract manager to ensure adequate contract performance monitoring and timely generation of contract monitoring reports. The findings showed that contract monitoring had a strong
positive effect on Contract Performance so if an organization is to benefit it has to make contract monitoring a priority.

3. As far as contract administration constituted; deliveries and acceptance, contract payment, and contract close out, the study recommends that the municipal accounting officers should ensure prompt payments to contractors, and to critically follow contract closure guidelines to avoid litigation issues and bad publicity.

References

Agaba E & Shipman, N. (2007). Advancing Public Procurement(ED). *Public Procurement Reform in Developing countries, the Uganda Experience.*


Amin, M. (2005). Social Science Research Concepts, Methodology & Analysis; Makerere University Kampala


Hill, C.A. (2001, Why Contracts are Written in Legalese, Kent College of Law, Chicago, IL.


PPDA Act and Regulations, 2003

PPDA, Authority Compliance Audit Report, 2008


Thai, K.V. (2004), Introduction to Public Procurement First Edition Florida Atlantic University


Elucidation of Principal Agency Relationship in the Road Transport Sector: Implication of PPP adoption for Uganda National Roads Authority (UNRA)

Innocent Nuwagaba¹, Lukamba Tshombe Luhia², Alex Nduhura ³, Bruce Kisitu⁴ & Rose Kwatampora⁵

¹,³,⁴,⁵ Uganda Management Institute
² Professor, Public Administration & Management, North West University Vaal Campus, South Africa
Corresponding E-mail: innocentnuwagaba@gmail.com

Abstract
This study was conducted to assess principal-agency relationship in the road transport sector and its implication on adoption of PPPs by the Uganda National Roads Authority (UNRA). Globally, PPPs provide avenues for financing projects in the roads sector by the principal and her agents. In 2015, UNRA as an agent adopted a policy to partner with some private sector players as agents to construct and maintain some national roads in a PPPs arrangement. Despite the adoption of a policy to use PPPs, there were a number of concerns on the use of the contracting out model by the principal and agents in the road sector. The main objective of the study was to examine the implication of principal agency relationship on the adoption of PPPs by Uganda National Roads Authority. The research study was guided by the principal-agent theory. The study adopted the qualitative approach under a case study and exploratory design using documents review method. A healthy relationship between the principal and the agents is required if PPPs are to be effectively used to deliver high quality services in the roads sector. The study came up with a model that can be used by UNRA to ensure a better working relationship with private partners as agents when adopting PPPs in the roads transport sector.

Key words: Principal, Agent, Partnership, Roads, Transport, PPP Policy

Introduction

The study aimed at conducting an assessment of principal agency relationship in the road transport sector to ascertain its implication on adoption of different PPP models by the Uganda National Roads Authority (UNRA) (Chauhana & Marisetty, 2018:1). Typically, a private firm as an agent designs, builds, finances and operates a significant capital asset such as a road, a hospital, a school or a prison, and must ensure these assets are available for providing related services to an acceptable standard (Chunga & Hensherb, 2018:2). The public partner as an a principal, in turn, engages primarily in coordination and enforcement functions to ensure the behaviour of the private firm and the output of the PPP are aligned with public policy objectives (Chunga & Hensherb, 2018:2). PPPs have got different public and private sector stakeholders. Public partner as a principal has got stakeholders that are typically composed of national and regional governments, governmental agencies and state-owned enterprises, whereas private partner as an agent has got stakeholders that are typically private contractors, investors, sponsors and insurers (Yu, Chen & Sun, 2018:1). Therefore such various stakeholders for both the principal and agent are brought together by the special purpose vehicle (SPV), which is basically the legal and organisational framework for PPPs (Yu, Chen & Sun, 2018:1). Presently, there are a number of debates as to whether the use of PPP projects in infrastructure development especially in the roads sector can be supported globally by all the stakeholders of both the principal and agent than ever before (Leigland, 2018:1). Within such PPP arrangements, there are several options that include public guarantees and other potential liabilities. Since PPPs involve various stakeholders for both the principal and agent, they must always be devised and managed realistically and carefully (Martin, Mark & Siddharth 2018:14). The key stakeholders of UNRA as the principal involved in the use of PPPs in the roads sector include board of governors, senior managers, contracts committee, procurement and disposal unit, user departments, district officers and private firms they partner with to
implement PPP projects (Dentons, 2014:7). According to Solomon et al, (2014: 143), there are various concession, Leasing and contracting PPP models such as contracting out, management contract and Service contract PPP models (Matti, 2013: 5). The Ugandan Government views the use of such PPP models as an important tool in its plan to bridge the infrastructure financing gap in the next five years. For effective adoption of such PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda, there is need to understand the nature of the relationship that exists between of UNRA as the principal and private organisations as agents to work together to deliver services to the citizens through use of principal-agency theory (Holland, 1984:1). This theory is based on the fact that the success of such PPPs in the roads sector in Uganda depends on the nature of the relationship between public partners as principals and private partners as agents (McQuaid, 2000:3). From these contextual assumptions of PPPs and how they can be influenced by the relationships between partners, it is possible to understand how the principal-agency theory applies to this study on the use of PPPs in the road sector in Uganda (McQuaid, 2000: 2).

Problem Statement

After the passing of PPP policy in 2015, UNRA as a principal is currently planning to work with a number of private firms as agents to implement a number of construction and maintenance projects in Uganda using PPP models such as concession, Leasing and contracting PPPs (Dentons, 2014: 1). Despite the plan to use such PPP models, the plan is not fully being supported by a number of key stakeholders for both UNRA as a principal and Private partners as agents (Abdul, et al., 2015: 1). Some do not support the plan to adopt such PPP models in the roads sector because they believe that since the use of such PPP models is a new experience in Uganda, UNRA as a principal is likely to fail to use the best suitable PPP models in the roads sector (Mutabazi, 2012:3, 4). This reveals some information gaps in the adoption PPPs in the road sector, and it also indicates that the use of such PPPs is less known in Uganda.

Purpose of the Study

The main purpose of the study was to assess the adoption of concession, leasing and contracting PPP models in the roads sector based on principal agency relationship

Research Objectives

a) To establish whether UNRA has adopted concession models based on the principal-agency relationship
b) To examine whether UNRA has adopted leasing PPP models based on the principal-agency relationship.
c) To analyse whether UNRA has adopted the contracting models based on principal-agency relationship.

Research Questions

a) What concession PPP models has UNRA adopted based on the principal-agency relationship?
b) What leasing PPP models has UNRA adopted based on the principal-agency relationship?
c) What contracting PPP models has UNRA adopted based on the principal-agency relationship?

Literature Review

The Principal-Agent Theory emerged in the early 1970s from the integrated aspects of economics and institutional theory. The principal-agency theory tries to describe the relationship between two parties, where one is a principal in charge of a certain business and the other is an agent who represents the principal in transactions with a third party (Barry, 2006:1). Agency relationships exist when the principal employs the agent to do some tasks on his behalf. (Jensen & Meckling, 1976:1). Ross is believed to be the one that initially explained the dilemma of the principal-agency theory in terms of someone choosing a flavour of ice cream for another person whose tastes he does not understand (Barry, 2006:1). The main quoted reference to the principal-agent theory, however, comes from experts such as William Meckling and Michael Jensen (Barry, 2006:2). Agency theory contends that an organisation is made up of a nexus of
contracts between the owners of economic resources (the principals) and managers (the agents) who are given the responsibility of using such resources to execute certain tasks in order to achieve the intended objectives (Jensen & Meckling, 1976:308). The theory is based on the premise that agents are more informed than principals and that such information disequilibrium results in certain unethical practices which negatively impacts the principals’ capacity to effectively monitor and evaluate whether their interests are being well catered for by agents (Adams 1994:19). Since agents make such decisions with third parties that eventually affect the principal, agency problems are bound to occur (Jensen & Meckling, 1976:2). The theory is concerned with the contradicting purposes between the principal and agent in realising each of their specific objectives and is hinged on strategies aimed at getting facts about their potential customers, acquisition of goods, service and works or getting the right contractor (Rendon, 2009:1). The agency theory provides realities, which are relevant to this study on PPP contracts, and the management structures that are essential for influencing agents to do certain things that are in line with the expectation and specifications of the principal. (Rendon, 2009:2). To manage the risk of loss of confidence that stems from a loose ownership control structure in the public management process, government may be more inclined to employ internal monitoring mechanisms to ensure effective implementation of PPP projects in the roads sector (Adams, 1994:20). The agency theory also encourages regulations and guidelines to ensure that business managers behave in line with what business owners expect (Hawley & Williams, 1996:31). Watts (1988:16) suggests that implementation of PPP projects in the roads sector is a bonding cost borne by agents to satisfy the principals’ demands for accountability. Therefore, adoption and implementation of PPPs in the roads sector requires the principals to always monitor how such PPP projects are being managed by the private sector agencies. This is because private officials who are agents may not look out for the specific interests of the citizens (Iossa & Martimort, 2015:2). In addition, the public sector principal should always make recommendations on improvement of the risk management, control and governance systems pertaining to PPP projects being implemented in the roads sector by the private sector agents (Javed et al., 2013:615). Agency theory, therefore, guides the principal to check whether the agent is effectively implementing the road sector PPP projects in line with agreed terms, conditions, parameters, specifications and standards (Van Den Hurk & Verhooest, 2016:275). In addition, the principal agency theory suggests a variety of reasons why traditionally procured public infrastructure projects exhibit higher costs of construction in the roads sector compared to PPP projects (APMG, 2017:5). This is because in most cases the bundling of construction and operation contracts in a PPP gives the private partner greater incentives to make investments in the construction phase to lower subsequent operation and maintenance costs (Blanc, Hugh & Timo, 2006:2). Scholars like Shankman (1999:332) suggests inclusion of other key stakeholders in a principal-agent relationship since they also play an important role in shaping the work of the agent to ensure that the principal’s objectives are achieved in an efficient manner (Iossa & Martimort, 2015:5). Such engagement of the agents in PPPs is part of a mechanism for improving productivity and driving effectiveness, efficiency and economy in the roads sectors by the principals worldwide (Farquharson & Yescombe, 2011:14). According to Solomon et al, (2014: 143), there are various models of PPPs used in the roads sector which include: concession, Leasing and contracting PPP models which include contracting out, management contract and service contract PPP models (Matti, 2013: 5). Concession is where a public entity gives the private entity the right to construct for an agreed period of time, which may range 20 to 30 years (Mouraviev et al., 2016). Lease is where the private sector is responsible for the service in its entirety and undertakes obligations relating to quality and service standards (Obayelu, 2018). A management contract is usually where a private agency carries out maintenance of a facility on behalf of the public entity for a fee (Kwak et al., 2009). Service contract is where the public sector hires a private company or entity to carry out one or more specified tasks or services for a period, typically 1 to 3 years (Obayelu, 2018). Contracting out refers to a situation where private entities receive a budget to provide certain services and manage a government facility (Department of Health & Family Welfare, 2012). The Ugandan Government views the use of such PPP models as an important tool in its plan to bridge the infrastructure financing gap in the next five years. Thus, in the context of UNRA, the principal-agency theory argues that to be effective in the adoption and implementation of such different PPP models in the roads sector, UNRA as the principal needs to work well with private partners who are her agents (poulton & Macartney, 2012:97). The theory,
therefore, can be used by UNRA to explore the challenges of agency problems in contract arrangements it has with few private entities in the implementation of some PPP projects (Babayian & Kadlecíková, 2016:315; Roach, 2016:29) which Hlavaeek and Hlavaeek (2006:18) refer to as a principal striking a bargain with an agent. This culminates into an agency relationship where an agent acts for or as a representative of the principal (Babayian & Kadlecíikova, 2016:316; Shankman, 1999:321; Turner, 2004:75; Muller & Turner, 2005:398).

Methodology
The researcher used the mixed approach under the case study design (Creswell, 2013). The study population consisted of 120 key stakeholders of UNRA (Shari, 2012). A sample size of 91 respondents was used (Krejcie & Morgan, 1970). Simple random sampling technique was used. Data was collected using self-administered questionnaires and documents review check list (Joubish, Kharram, Ahmed, Fatima & Haider, 2011). Primary data was analysed using descriptive statistics and secondary data was analysed using documents analysis (Sekaran, 2007).

Study Findings
Response Rate
Table 1: Response Rate for Study Participants from UNRA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Planned Questionnaires</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
<th>Short fall (%)</th>
<th>Total (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>91</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018)  
Table 1 shows that out of 91 respondents, only 62 responded to the study reflecting a response rate of 68%. Therefore the above response rate results are in line with Amin (2005:7) who argues that a response rate \( \geq 50 \) is good enough as the representative of a survey population.

Demographic Characteristics of the Survey Study
Gender of the Researcher’s Respondents
The descriptive statistics for the gender of the respondents are presented in the Table 2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Respondents’ Gender</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid Male</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>70.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018)  
As illustrated in Table 2, the majority of the respondents were male representing 70.1% and the rest were female representing 29.9%. This implies that the biggest number of respondents were males since there are a few females in Uganda that qualify to work with UNRA as technical professionals in the areas of engineering and surveying, which are the dominant disciplines as far as the target participants from user departments were concerned.

Age Group of the Respondents
Table 3: Respondents by Age Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Respondents’ Age Group</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

38
As illustrated in Table 3 respectively, the most predominant age group that responded to the researcher’s questionnaires was 30-39 representing 43.3%, followed by 20-29 representing 37.8% and 40-49 representing 8.9%. This implies that a big number of respondents were between the age of 30-39. These are the majority of staff who are still physically and mentally competent whom UNRA employs to do land surveying, designing roads, procurement, road construction and maintenance.

### Respondents’ Terms of Employment with UNRA

**Table 4: Respondents’ Terms of Employment with UNRA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Respondents’ Terms of Employment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid 20-29</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>43.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: Primary data (2018) n=62**

As illustrated in Table 4, the majority of respondents were permanent staff representing 67%, followed by contract staff representing 22%, temporary staff representing 9%, while staff employed by UNRA on other terms constituted 2%. This implies that the biggest number of respondents were permanent staff because technical work by UNRA requires employing staff with conceptual and technical skills to ensure effective project implementation.

### Respondents’ Level of Education

The descriptive statistics for the respondents’ level of education are presented in Table 4.6 below.

**Table 5: Respondents’ Level of Education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valid Bachelor’s degree</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduate diploma</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>35.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master’s degree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctorate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: Primary data (2018) n=62**
As illustrated in Table 5, the majority of respondents were Bachelor’s degree holders representing 48.4%, followed by those with post-graduate diplomas representing 35.5%, Master’s degree holders representing 14.5% and those with a Doctorate represented 1.6%.

The majority of employees were degree level graduates, implying that most respondents were academically qualified and were in position to give a reasonable and well-balanced view on the issues in the study.

Respondents’ Working Experience with UNRA

Table 6: Respondents’ Working Experience with UNRA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Respondents’ Experience</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid Less than 2 years</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>12.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 – 6 years</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 – 10 years</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 years and more</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>46.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary Data (2018)  
n=62

Table 6 shows that the majority of respondents had working experience of 11 years and above (46.8%), followed by those of 3-6 years (29%), less than 2 years (12.9%) and 7-10 years (11.3%). This implies that the respondents had adequate past experience and up-to-date information which this study needed for a thorough assessment of PPPs and VFM in Uganda’s roads sector.

Empirical Findings

The items on PPP models being used by UNRA were derived from research objective 1. The items that were cross examined in this objective catered for short, intermediate and long-term PPP models being used by UNRA as shown in Table 1 below.

Table 7: PPP models used by UNRA to ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PPP Models to be used by UNRA</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNRA uses Private Finance Initiative, Concession and Joint Venture PPP Models to ensure VFM</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.40</td>
<td>.896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(11.3%)</td>
<td>(54.8%)</td>
<td>(19.4%)</td>
<td>(12.9%)</td>
<td>(1.6%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRA uses Leasing and affermage PPP Models to ensure VFM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>.821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.6%)</td>
<td>(50.0%)</td>
<td>(27.4%)</td>
<td>(11.3%)</td>
<td>(9.7%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRA uses Contracting out, Management contract and Service contract PPP Models to ensure VFM</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>1.114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(3.2%)</td>
<td>(4.8%)</td>
<td>(16.1%)</td>
<td>(30.6%)</td>
<td>(45.2%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018)  
n=62

SA = Strongly Agree, A = Agree, N = Neutral, D = Disagree, SD = Strongly Disagree, S.Dev = Standard deviation. In line with the statistical computations in Table 7 above, the details hereunder interrogate the empirical results through advanced statistical tests to demonstrate the views of the respondents on the different PPP models used by UNRA in the roads sector.
Findings on UNRA’s adoption of PPP Models based on Principal Agency Relationship

UNRA’s adoption of the Concession PPP Models

As to whether UNRA adopted concession PPP models, Table 7 above shows that 41 respondents representing a larger percentage of 66.1% disagreed with the statement compared to a smaller number of 9 respondents representing 14.5 % that agreed with the statement. However, only 12 respondents that represent 19.4% were not sure about the statement. The mean of 2.40 shows that the majority of respondents disagreed with the item implying that UNRA has not yet adopted concession models. It is not in line with what the researcher intended to measure as shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1: Bar Graph for Concession PPP Models

Source: Primary data (2018)

Figure 1 is in agreement with the descriptive statistics of Table 7 above. Cumulatively, 41 respondents representing 66.1% disagreed with the statement compared to a smaller number of 9 respondents representing 14.5 % that agreed with it. 12 respondents that represent 19.4% were not sure. This confirms that UNRA is currently not using concession PPP models and so it is not in line with what the researcher intended to measure.

UNRA’s Adoption of Leasing PPP Models

As to whether UNRA adopted Leasing PPP models, Table 7 above shows that 32 respondents representing 51.6 % disagreed with the statement compared to 13 respondents representing 21.0% that agreed with it. However, 17 respondents that represent 27.4% were not sure about this statement. The average rating is confirmed by a fair mean of 3.08 and standard deviation of 0.821, implying that currently, UNRA has not yet adopted Leasing PPP models and so it is not in line with what the researcher intended to measure as shown in Figure 4.2 below:

Figure 2: Bar Chart Showing UNRA’s intention to use Leasing and aftermage PPP Models

Source: Primary data (2018)

As presented in Figure 2, cumulatively 32 respondents representing 51.6 % disagreed with the statement compared to 13 respondents representing 21.0% that agreed with the statement. However, a total of 17 that
represent 27.4% were not sure about this statement. This confirms that at present, UNRA is not currently using leasing PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda and so it is not in line with what the researcher intended to measure.

**UNRA’s Adoption of Contracting PPPs Models**

As to whether UNRA adopted contracting PPP models, Table 7 above shows that cumulatively 47 respondents representing 75.8% agreed with the statement compared to a smaller number of 10 respondents representing 16.1% that disagreed with the statement. However, only 10 representing 16.1% were not sure about the statement. The mean of 3.34 and standard deviation of 0.1.14 implies that UNRA is mainly using contracting PPP models and this finding is in line with what the researcher intended to measure. As illustrated above, the scale was intended to measure whether UNRA is currently using the above PPP models. These findings are illustrated in Table 7 above and in Figure 1 below.

**Figure 3: Contracting Out, Contract Management and Service Contract by UNRA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>45.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>30.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>16.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018) n=62

Figure 3 above shows that 47 respondents representing 75.8% agreed with the statement compared to a smaller number of 10 respondents representing 16.1% that disagreed with it. However, only 10 that represent 16.1 were not sure about the statement. This confirms that generally, UNRA is currently using mainly the contracting PPP models such as management contract. This is in line with what the researcher intended to measure.

**Discussion of the Study Findings**

The findings revealed that 66.1% disagreed with the statement that UNRA uses Concession PPP models compared to 14.5% that agreed with it. The mean of 2.40 showed that the majority of respondents disagreed with the item implying that UNRA may currently not be using Concession PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda. This implies that that UNRA may not even be planning to use such PPP models in the near future. Therefore, this finding of the study does not reflect the reviewed debates by scholars such as Krol (2018:3), Chunga and Hensher (2018:2), Yan, Chong, Zhou, Sheng and Xu (2018:2), Obayelu (2018:255), Jinbo, Yunpeng, Lulu and Yan (2018:2), Kwak et al. (2009:53), Delmon (2011:118), Yescombe (2007:5) and Mouraviev et al. (2016:164) who assert that a concession is a PPP structure where the public sector grants a concession or a series of rights to the private contractor to construct or renovate and operate an asset for a pre-determined period (usually 20 and 30 years) referred to as a concession period. It was also discovered that 51.6% disagreed with the statement that UNRA uses leasing PPP models to ensure VFM in the roads sector compared to 21.0% that agreed with the statement. The average rating was confirmed by a fair mean of 3.08 and standard deviation of 0.821 which implies that there no such PPP model used by UNRA in the roads sector in Uganda. Therefore, this finding does not reflect the reviewed debates by scholars and development partners such as Obayelu (2018:255), Warner et al. (2008:53), Delmon (2010:12) Farquharson and Yescombe (2011:10) WB, (2017:1), Bouman et al. (2013:18) and ADB.
(2008:33) who note that leasing is a longer term arrangement where a private entity can design, build, refurbish, operate and maintain a service delivered directly to consumers. The financial risk for operation and maintenance is borne entirely by the private sector operator. In addition, it was revealed that 75.8% agreed with the statement that UNRA uses Contracting out, Management contract and Service contract PPP models in the roads sector compared to 10% that disagreed with the statement. The mean of 3.34 and standard deviation of 0.1.14 implies that UNRA may be using such PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda. This finding reflects the reviewed debates by scholars and development partners such as Obayelu, (2018:255), Kwak et al. (2009:54), Gwary et al. (2016:52), Delmon (2011:135), Bouman et al. (2013:18) and ADB (2008:31) who believe that contracting out, management or operation and maintenance (O&M) contract are PPP arrangements where a private entity provides some operation and maintenance services for a fee, usually based on delivering satisfactory services. This finding also agrees with debates by scholars and development agencies such as Obayelu (2018:254), Abdel Aziz (2007:918), Renda and Schrefler (2006:8), Warner et al. (2008:12) and ADB (2008:29) who contend that a service contract is a PPP model where the public sector hires a private company to carry out certain specified tasks or services for a period, typically 1–3 years, which is aimed at exploiting private sector skills, innovation and management competencies to boost time and cost efficiencies in delivery of public services. This finding is again in line with scholars and development agencies such as Nepal Health Sector Reform (2014:1-3), Department of Health & Family Welfare (2012:33) and India department of Health and Family Welfare (2012:33) who contend that Contracting out can be viewed as a form of PPP based on principal-agency models, where the public sector acts as the contracting agency (the principal), mandating a private company (the agent) to deliver specific services based on a contract between the parties. These scholars go ahead to say that contracting out refers to a situation where private entities receive a budget to provide certain services and manage a government facility. The two parties usually agree on the quantity, quality and the duration of the contract.

Conclusion
The findings revealed that UNRA has not yet adopted the use of concession PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda. It was also discovered UNRA has not yet adopted the use of leasing PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda. In addition, it was revealed that UNRA has adopted the use contracting models of contracting out, management contract and service contract PPPs in the roads in Uganda.

Recommendations
From study findings, majority of the UNRA stakeholders were of the view that UNRA uses contracting out, management contract and service contract models based on good principal agency relations. Based on this finding, UNRA as a principal should not only use the contracting PPP models but also should endeavor to use other PPP models of concession and leasing PPPs through ensuring a health working relationship with her private partners as agents when adopting, planning, designing, financing, implementing, maintaining, monitoring, sustaining and managing such PPP models in the roads sector in Uganda.

References
Amin, E. 2005. Social Science Research, Makerere University Printry, Kampala, Uganda.
Andrew, B. 2013. The Public Private Partnership model in the UK: PFI in the UK and PPP in Europe
Braun, V. & Clarke, V. 2006. Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology
Charles, L., Hugh, M. & Joseph, B. 2013. Using PPP to Improve Transportation Infrastructure in Canada
Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC), 1996. Structural Funds and Cohesion Funds 1994-99:
Commission of inquiry, 2016. Alleged corruption, mismanagement and abuse of office at UNRA
Creswell, W. J. 2007. Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Approaches
Creswell, J. W. & Plano, C. 2011. Sequential exploratory mixed methods research design
David, L. 2011. Professor Fisher and the Quantity theory of value for money: Research Report Series, Social Science Centre, Department of Economics, the University of Ontario, Canada


Freeman, R.E. 2004 Strategic management in PPP: A stakeholder approach. Pitman Publishing

Freeman, R. E., Harrison, J. S., Wicks, A. C. & De Colle, S. 2010. Stakeholder theory.


Goldkuhl, G. 2012. Pragmatism vs interpretivism in qualitative information systems

Guofeng, M., Qingjuan, D. & Kedi, W. 2018. A Concession Period for PPP Projects:


Hans, G. 2016. The Role of Institutional Investors in Financing Development in Asia and the Pacific:

Henry, A. & Robert, A. 2013. Success Factors for the Implementation of PPPs


Harris, R. 2004. Setting PPP prices as a factor for managing costs” by governments for efficiency


International Road Federation (IRF), 2015. Public-Private Partnerships Executive Seminar:


Jamali, D. 2004. Success and failures mechanisms of PPPs in Developing countries:

Jean, S., Anne, S., Pam, s. & Peter, M. D. 2008. Financing black holes: Roads in the UK.


Matti, S. 2013. Is there a Distinctive Canadian PPP Model? Reflections on 20 years of Practice


McQuaid, R.W. 2000. The Theory of Partnerships - Why have Partnerships”, in: S.P. Osborne


New Vision, 2016. Reported cases of alleged corruption among UNRA officials

Nite, T. 2003. Integrating Gender Into World Bank Financed Transport Programs. Case Study


OECD, 2014. Official support for private investment in developing country infrastructure”


Obilade, S.O. 1989. Applying the general systems theory to students’ conflict management

Pansiri, J. 2005. Pragmatism: A methodological Approach to researching Strategic Alliance


Patrinos, H. A., Osorio, F.B. & Guuqeta, J. 2009. The Role and Impact of PPPs


Roehrich, J. K., Michael A. L. & Gerard, G., 2014. Are PPPs a Healthy Option?


Ssebugwawo, A. 2012. Investigation of variations in paved road construction unit rates
Tashakkori, A., Onwuegbuzie, H. & Teddlie, C. 2008. Introduction to research Methods., CA:
Teddlie, C. & Tashakkori, A. 2009. Overview of contemporary issues in mixed methods research. Tony,
Wannop, U. 1990. The GEAR Project: A Perspective on the Management of Urban Regeneration,
Weaver, C. and M. Dennert (1987). Economic Development and the Public-Private Partnership,
The Political Economy of Health in Uganda; with particular reference to HIV/AIDS, Malaria, Tuberculosis and Non-Communicable Diseases: A Synthesis Paper

Prof. Robert Basaza, Elizabeth Kyasiimire & H. Ramadhan

School of Public Health, St. Augustine International University, Uganda

Corresponding E-mail: rbasaza@saiu.ac.ug

Abstract

Political economy of health is an organic structure of analysis and a view on health policy seeking to realize circumstances which form population health and health service improvement. There are limited political economy analyses that have been carried out in Uganda. This paper provides a synthesis of the political economy of health in Uganda with particular reference to HIV/AIDS, Malaria, Tuberculosis and Non-Communicable Diseases. The methodology employed was a review of key literature on the merging key headings and subsequent “snow-ball” based on related literature identified from retried articles and analyses in Uganda. The prevalence of HIV is estimated at 6.2%. The gross domestic product would grow at an average rate of 6.5% per year between 2005 and 2025 if there was no AIDS. The costs of malaria treatment are between USD 0.41 and USD 3.88 per person per month (USD 1.88 - USD 26 per household). On average Ugandans may experience up to 6 episodes of malaria per year per person. Workers suffering from malaria may be unable to work for an estimated 5-20 days per episode. The prevalence of TB is 159/100,000 population; TB-related mortality at 12/100,000 population and the HIV/TB co-infection is reported as 45%. In regard to NCDS, 61% of deaths occur below the age of 70 years. Each 10% rise in NCDs leads to 0.5% loss in annual economic growth. The political economy analysis can be achieved through proper policy formulation and improved service delivery. Importantly, it can lead to increased health sector funding and catalyze political agenda and policy making, improve leadership and governance. Teaching political economic analyses could enhance use and application of the discipline.

Key words: Political Economy of Health, Communicable Diseases and Non-Communicable Diseases, Uganda.

Introduction

Political economy refers to interdisciplinary studies drawing upon economics, political science, law, history, sociology and other disciplines in informing the pivotal role of political factors in determining economic outcomes. Since time memorial, there have been numerous reasons for adopting a typical political economy perspective in analysis of local and global change (WHO, 2016). The political economy of health is an organic structure of analysis and a view on health policy seeking to realize the circumstances which form population health and health service improvement within the wider macro-economic and political context. However, the relationship between economic development and health development is complex and can be analyzed in terms of a range of diverse linkages (Harris 2013& World Bank, 2011). The purpose of this paper is to provide a synthesis of the political economy of health in Uganda with particular reference to HIV/AIDS, Malaria, tuberculosis, maternal neonatal and child health, injuries and Non-Communicable Diseases. This paper covers the political economy of health in Uganda and progress against HIV/AIDS, Malaria, tuberculosis and Non-Communicable Diseases. Also, included is how analysis of the political economy of health can improve service delivery and what can be done to support the political economy of health analyses in Uganda.

Methodology

The methodology employed in this paper is a review of key literature on the merging key headings and subsequent “snow-ball” based on related literature identified from retried articles.
The Social Demographic Profile including Economy

Uganda’s total population in 2018 was 39,570 million people with 48% below the age of 14 years, 17% of the population urban and the population growth rate at 3.0%. The total fertility rate stood at 6.2% whereas the average life expectancy at birth (years) was 63.3%. The maternal mortality ratio (MMR) per 100,000 live births in 2014 was 438 and 336 in 2016 while the Infant mortality rate per 1000 live births in 2016 was 43. The country working-age population employed was 47.8%. The average literacy rate in 2014 (for persons aged 10 years or more) was 73.5% with male higher (77.5%) compared to females at 69.9%. In regard to the economy, the current GDP Per Capita prices is 724 (US$), and GDP and the Growth Rate (%) at 6.1. The GDP - composition by sector of origin is: agriculture: 25.4%, industry: 22.7% and services 51.9%. During the period 2012/13 and 2016/17, the proportion of the population living in poverty (living on less than US$ 1.2 per day) increased from 20 percent to 27 percent which translates into about 10 million people. The increase in poverty was more evident in the Eastern than Northern regions of Uganda which traditionally has been the poorest. This was attributed to drought throughout the country and invasion of army worms which destroyed crops. The overall income inequality as measured by the Gini coefficient stood at 0.42 in 2016/17. This is an increase from 0.40 registered in 2012/13. (UBOS, 2019 & CIA, 2019).

Public Health Services including Health Care

Health facilities in Uganda include hospitals and health centres (IV, III and II). The number of functional healthcare facilities in 2015/16 was 5,117 down from 5,205 that were registered in 2012/13. In 2016, the government owned facilities were 2,932 (57%), Private not for Profit or NGO were 983 (19%) and private for profit was 1202 (24%). However, staffing in public health facilities was a challenge at 70 percent in 2016. The leading cause of death is Malaria (35%), Respiratory infections 25% and Intestinal worms (6%). Uganda experiences nutrition challenges and in 2016 underweight among the under 5-years was at 13.8%, stunting at 28.9% while safe water coverage in urban and rural areas was at 85% and 67% respectively (UBOS, 2017).

Uganda and Politics

Uganda is a presidential republic, in which the President is both the head of State and head of Government. Uganda has a multi-party system and currently National Resistance Movement (NRM) is the ruling party. Executive power is exercised by the government and Legislative power is vested in both the government and the National Assembly. The system is based on a democratic unicameral parliamentary system with universal adult suffrage for all citizens over 18 years of age. General elections are held every five years (GOU, 2018). This sub-section sets a stage for Uganda’s political economy and political economy of health that is presented in the subsequent sections.

Uganda's Political Economy and Political Economy of Health

The economy of Uganda has great potential, and self-contained for rapid economic growth and development. However, the chronic political instability and erratic economic management since independence has led to lasting economic decrease leaving Uganda among the world's poorest and least-developed countries. Uganda's HDI value for 2015 was 0.493— which puts the country in the low human development category—at 163 out of 188 countries and territories (UNDP Uganda, 2018).

For five years, actual GDP growth in Uganda has averaged at 4.5%, which is significantly below the other three countries in the East African Community (Kenya 5.8, Tanzania 7.0, and Rwanda 5.9). The two remaining counties with civil strife are below Uganda’s GDP (Burundi -0.6 and South Sudan at -4.9). The
main influence to this development has been associated to information and communication services, agriculture and the construction sectors. There was a decline in the manufacturing sector due to the slowdown in growth of credit within the private sector and increase in the cost of borrowing. This negatively affected private consumption and effective demand. Demand for manufactured output was also greatly affected by the conflict in South Sudan which is Uganda’s main export market (World Bank. 2017, Uganda Economic Update, and January 2017).

Uganda’s politics indicate major hiccups within the political system, its process, and a weak democratic practice. This underpins the NRM’s continued political success due to the fact that it is a dominant group where the majority of the country’s political elite are established, hence political reforms are viewed as having the potential to produce more losers. However, changing this mindset can never come in a fortnight. The opposition and civil society need to reorganize and build a wider support base in order to become credible competitors to the NRM (Mugisha et al 2016).

Despite the social and economic disruption built up under colonialism (Uganda got Independence from UK in 1962), Uganda had favorable economic prospects at independence which the government could have used for the country’s profit. Instead successive governments promoted ethnic and religious divisions and conflicts up to 1986. The social conditions that led to violence in Uganda included social inequality which was generated by unequal trading relationships and local, regional ethnic, religious and gender disparities. The existence of sub-states, ethnic and religious factionalism, poor conflict resolution mechanisms, absence of an indigenous property-owning class; the post-independence decrease in national production, parochial, weak and poorly educated leaders and the language problem (Harris, 2013).

**Political Economy of Health**

Health is a right, we need health not health care, hence everybody is entitled to access health care services without difficulty or discrimination in order to sustain their health. However, this is not practical because it is the political wing that determines what is to be done where, when, and how, due to the power of the funds they control hence health care is not exceptional (WHO 2006). This leaves the poor at risk because better health services are always allocated near those who have the power to speak and these are the politicians who determine the amount of funds to health. This in turn has led to slowed production and development since the sick are never working and family members too are affected because they must provide care. This has a number of impacts, because high production leads to economic growth and increased resources for health (improved living conditions and better health services). The questions on the rise now are: under what political conditions does economic growth contribute to improved living conditions and better health care? (Acemoglu et al, 2012 and DFID, 2009).

The sharing of constrained resources by all sectors health inclusive: The population growth has led to depletion of the available irreplaceable resources such that even the health sector which deserves the first priority is not accorded the necessary attention due to other pressing needs. While all sectors deserve attention, the health sector takes an upper hand, yet this has remained unrealistic. It is highly determined by the level of political economy analysis and awareness of policy makers on the vital role health plays in society. This is even worst in developing countries such as Uganda where the budget is crippled and are laboring to carry on with the activities despite the insufficient funds. This calls for proper political analysis so that proper choices are made in order to maintain quality health service delivery (World Investment Report, 2014).
Political economy has led to the promotion of economics at the expense of human health (Risa 2016). This is evident with the rising deforestation and industrialization which makes the environment unfit for habitation. This is occurring because the authorities are only looking at the monetary benefits without envisioning the short and long-term effects these activities pose to the environment. While we need economic growth, we need health first. Therefore, the decisions affecting the health of the population should not be taken up by the monetary benefits and the health impact not put into consideration while decisions are taken (Kazibwe 2014).

It’s very unfortunate to realize that health workers may use less efficacious treatment so that recovery is delayed, sickness is prolonged as more money is made. This has all risen due to the money in politics, and politics in money. Decision makers are looking at how to get more money than ensuring quality health care services delivery to the citizens. This is governments’ sole responsibility to ensure that quality health services are delivered but presently this is far from true (Harris 2013).

The political economy has promoted implementation and sparring of harmful laws. For example, the government of Uganda has often planned to ban the use of non-biodegradable polythene bags (locally referred as kaverras) in the country but, the policy makers have always failed to implement it due to the money in politics, yet the effects that the nylon industry causes to the environment is far more dangerous compared to the benefits that the government gets, kaveras have negative effects on the soil considering that agriculture is the back bone of Uganda. Surprisingly, the government has failed to close this industry because of the monetary benefits a few politically connected individuals are enjoying at the expense of people’s health globally, this is absolute selfishness that has been so real in Uganda. On the contrary, a neighboring country, the Republic of Rwanda has successfully prohibited the use of non-biodegradable polythene bags with not even a traveler successfully carrying in a single bag (How Stuff Works 2015, Down to Earth 2015, The Delicious Day 2012)).

If proper political economy analysis is done, then the health of people is protected from such effects. (Acemoglu, et al, 2012 and World Bank, 2011). Recycling a ton of plastics aids to preserve 7.4 cubic yards of landfill space that can be used for other waste. This also conserves natural resources, specifically oil which is a nonrenewable natural resource in limited supply. Recycling approximately one ton of plastic preserves an estimate of 3.8 barrels of crude oil. In 2008, 2.12 million of plastic were recovered for recycling, the equivalent of roughly 7.6 million barrels of oil. Creating new materials from existing materials uses significantly less energy than using raw materials, recycling one pound of polyethylene terephthalate (PET), the plastic most commonly used in water bottles, conserves approximately 12,000 BTUs (British thermal units) of heat energy (Lake, 2017). Furthermore, the plastic manufacturing procedure results in the creation of greenhouse gases, including carbon dioxide, which is thought to contribute significantly to the global warming effect. Therefore, since recycling of plastics requires less energy and fossil fuels, it also results in less greenhouse gas emissions. It is estimated that the average family can reduce their carbon dioxide emissions by up to 340 pounds yearly simply by recycling their plastic waste. In addition to reducing greenhouse gas emissions, recycling plastics also assist to reduce air and water pollution (Williams 2016).

The World Bank (2011) asserts that, consumption of unhealthy foods has led to the rise and aggravation of non-communicable diseases such as obesity, diabetes, respiratory tract infections and cardiac diseases which are lately a global threat. While these diseases are now ranked among the leading causes of morbidity
and mortality globally causing up to 60% death, political economy due prioritization of money over health has failed to cab this down and still exposes poor eating habits such as fast foods. This has caused loss of funds as countries struggle to treat the effects other than preventing the cause. This is a typical situation where people's health is exchanged for economic benefits for a few not for all (Kazibwe 2016). Healthcare is the most visible function of any health system, both to the users and the general public (WHO, 2017) i.e. all services dealing with the diagnosis and treatment of disease or the promotion, maintenance and restoration of health.

**The Influence of Political Economy of Health on Health Care with Reference to Malaria, HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Non-Communicable Diseases**

HIV/AIDS, malaria and tuberculosis diseases are more concentrated in the developing counties as compared to the developed world (citation). HIV/AIDS epidemic undermines the economics and social basis and is therefore a security threat to different regions of the world. The official estimations of the United Nations, countries indicate that the level of HIV spreading at higher than 20% leads to a GDP decrease of 1-2 % per year. This is due to the association of HIV infections with life time morbidity. This renders HIV infected persons to inadequate treatment and incapacitated to work thus the loss in GDP. HIV/AIDS has no known cure yet and is also associated with tuberculosis co-infection which worsens the outcomes of the disease if not treated (Gorlinsky, 2007).

The economics of HIV/AIDS has received more attention than the politics of AIDS. During the 1990s, the emphasis on economic analysis tended to deal with macro impacts (changes in Gross Domestic Product) which missed vast segments of the “complexity and full significance of the epidemic thus, the political economy of HIV/AIDS has had little to do with looking at forces driving the epidemic or shaping national responses (Collins et al, 2005). By the late 1990s a growing number of studies reported on the economic impacts of HIV/AIDS, primarily on households and businesses. Reference was occasionally made on how the epidemic intensified or deepened “poverty”, but little was said about how and why the epidemic interacted with pre-existing socioeconomic structures Hence, the global community has dedicated funds to the fight against the HIV pandemic. Bodies such as the U.S. President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) were formed with the sole purpose of fighting the HIV and AIDS. Notably, aid from foreign countries to developing countries has made the developing world shift their attention to other illnesses and in some circumstances the funds have been embezzled by those in power, a thing that undermines the progress attained so far.

The impact of the HIV/AIDS epidemic on the Uganda economy and human development index remains high also affecting the Country’s Gross Domestic Product. The 2016 Uganda HIV Impact Assessment (UPHIA) established the HIV prevalence estimated at 6.0% down from 7.3 % in 2011. According to UPHIA, the number of people in the country living with HIV was estimated at 1,300,000. The trend of new HIV infections (incidence) has continued to decline. New infections fell to an all-time low of approximately 60,000 in 2016, indicating that the target of 40% reduction of new HIV infections by 2015 relative to 2010 has been met. The number of children born with HIV infection in Uganda declined by 86% between 2011 and 2015 (MOH, 2017) The impact of HIV and AIDS epidemic on the country’s economy and human development index is felt in many ways: on Gross Domestic Product, labor supply, productivity and savings/investment. Economic projections state that Uganda’s Gross Domestic Product would grow at an average rate of 6.5% per year between 2005 and 2025 if there was no AIDS, but this would be reduced to
under the AIDS-without-ART” scenario, and by 2025 the economy will be 39% smaller than it would have been without AIDS. (MOH, 2015).

Strategic and feasible interventions have been clearly articulated in the ten-year HIV Investment case and the five-year National HIV strategy which are in harmony with the global targets for fast tracking HIV response: There has been a 90% reduction in new adult HIV infections, zero new infections among children, 90% reduction in stigma and discrimination faced by PLHIV, and 90% reduction in AIDS related deaths (The Uganda HIV/AIDS progress Report, 2014). The collaboration and integration of TB/HIV services has been realized from planning, resource mobilization to service delivery resulting into about 81% of HIV-positive TB patients on antiretroviral therapy (ART) in 2014. The National AIDs Spending Assessment report (NASA 2012) shows that, the government of Uganda contributed 12%, Development partners contributed 68% and 20% was financed from private sources including out of pocket, thus HIV/AIDS funding in Uganda remains predominantly donor funded. (The Uganda HIV/AIDS progress Report, 2014).

Uganda has continued to mitigate the effects of the epidemic through psychosocial support, protection and empowerment particularly for the youth. The country also passed key laws; the HIV prevention and Control Act with provision of establishment of an HIV Trust Fund as a mechanism for increased sustainable domestic financing. It has been suggested to introduce a 2% tax on alcoholic beverages such as beer with all the collections made to support the AIDS fund and people with HIV. It is such political moves that will affect the fight against HIV/AIDS in Uganda (MoH, 2016)

Malaria

In 2010 the Global Malaria Programme initiated an extensive review of WHO’s policy making process for malaria control and elimination. The aim was to establish a more rigorous, efficient and transparent process that would allow for timely responses to the ongoing challenges faced by national malaria programs (WHO, 2017).

The landscape for Malaria in Uganda and world over has greatly changed since the launch of the World Health Organization (WHO) manual on elimination of malaria in 2007. The framework for countries that are highly affected by Malaria has been changed to adopt a country specific approach so as to address a country specific burden. However, a lot of effort is still required to eliminate malaria for good. The WHO global technical strategy for malaria 2016-2030 was adopted at the World Health Assembly in May 2015. This aims at reducing Malaria incidences and mortality globally to at least 90% by 2030 and eliminating it in 35 new countries.

Malaria is the leading cause of death among Ugandans accounting for over 27% of lives, (MOH, 2016) the highest reported malaria transmission rates in the world were approximately 212 million new cases reported in 2015 and over 429 000 deaths annually (WHO, 2016). In addition, malaria has a indirect impact on the economy and development in general. The socio-economic impact of malaria includes out-of-pocket expenditure for consultation fees, drugs, transport and subsistence at a distant health facility. These costs are estimated to be between USD 0.41 and USD 3.88 per person per month (equivalent to USD 1.88 and USD 26 per household). A single episode of malaria costs a family on average 9 US dollars, or 3% of their annual income. Workers suffering from malaria may be unable to work for an estimated 5-20 days per episode. The poor family in a malaria endemic area may spend up to 25% of the household income on malaria prevention and treatment. Industries and agriculture also suffer due to loss of person-hours and decreased worker productivity. Investors are generally wary of investing in countries where malaria rates
are high, leading to a loss in investment opportunities. Severe malaria impairs children’s learning and cognitive ability by as much as 60%, consequently affecting the performance of Uganda’s universal primary and secondary education programmes (MOH, 2014) Malaria is endemic in 95% of Uganda and the remaining 5% are epidemic prone areas in the highlands of South West and East. There are estimated 70-100,000 deaths per year among children under five years of age due to malaria, and between ten and twelve million clinical cases are treated in to the public healthcare system (Akello, 2015).

Four of the five known malaria parasites exist in Uganda the reason it is still struggling with the disease which contributes 40% of outpatients in public Health facilities. More efforts are needed for the elimination of malaria. The Ministry of Health has been working with Development Partners such as Malaria Consortium, the Presidential Malaria Initiative, Global Fund, UNICEF, DFID and other agencies in scaling malaria down. Uganda is undertaking its second phase of distributing of long lasting insect treated mosquito nets (LLIN) and indoor residual spraying (IRS) (MOH, 2017) Following the recommendation of an external advisory group, the Malaria Policy Advisory Committee (MPAC) was established in 2011 to provide independent advice to WHO on all policy areas relating to malaria control and elimination. The MPAC meets annually and is comprised of 15 leading malaria experts (WHO, 2017).

The guidelines established by WHO for malaria control (i.e., for prevention and treatment) are difficult to implement by resource poor populations in settings like Uganda and yet these populations are the ones who bear the greatest brunt of malaria. The poor rarely engage in preventive and control measures, including case management with efficacious Artemisinin-based Combination Therapy (including Coartem), intermittent preventive treatment during pregnancy, vector control and epidemiology preventive preparedness responses (Akello, 2015).

The main obstacles are grounded in socio-economic and political inequalities, as well as strained healthcare systems in resource poor settings. That makes it difficult for global policies to be meaningful in these contexts. Furthermore, because a substantial proportion of Uganda’s population cannot easily afford Coartem, the country recently had to revisit its malaria policy, shifting in 2009 from exclusively recommending Coartem as first-line treatment to recommending Fansidar to high risk populations like pregnant women and children below five years of age (Akello, 2015).

**Tuberculosis**

Tuberculosis (TB) is a main cause of illness and death globally, accounting for an estimated 8.8 million new cases and 1.6 million deaths each year. TB prevalence at 159/100,000 population; incidence at 161/100,000 population; and TB-related mortality at 12/100,000 population and the HIV/TB co-infection is reported as 45% (MOH, 2015). In Uganda the Ministry of Health has promoted new smear-positive case detection and subsequent treatment of the patients. The TB case detection rate in 2016 was 80 percent. This was a sharp increase in the detection rate down from 45 percent observed in 2015. The treatment success rate has stagnated at about 80 percent since 2014.

**Non-Communicable Diseases**

Non communicable diseases (NCDs), also known as chronic diseases, tend to be of long duration and are the result of a combination of genetic, physiological, environmental and behavioral factors. The main types of NCDs are cardiovascular diseases (heart attacks and stroke), cancers, chronic respiratory diseases (such as chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and asthma) and diabetes. Non-communicable diseases (NCDs)
kill 40 million people each year, equivalent to 70% of all deaths globally (WHO, 2017). NCDs disproportionately affect people in low- and middle-income countries where more than three quarters of global NCD deaths – 31 million – occur. People of all age groups, regions and countries are affected by NCDs. These conditions are often associated with older age groups, but evidence shows that 17 million of all deaths attributed to NCDs occur before the age of 70. Children, adults and the elderly are all vulnerable to the risk factors contributing to NCDs (WHO, 2017). These diseases are driven by forces that include rapid unplanned urbanization, globalization of unhealthy lifestyles and population aging.

Uganda had a total death of 297,000 out of a total population 41,488,000 in 2016. The NCDs are estimated to account for 34% of all deaths of which 10% is due to Cardiovascular diseases, 9% due to Cancers, 2% due to chronic respiratory diseases, 2% due to diabetes. Other NCDs account for 11% of the deaths. Other causes of death, beside NCDs are communicable, maternal, perinatal and nutritional conditions which account for 54% and injuries which account for 13% of deaths. Of the 97,600 deaths, 49,700 were males and 47,800 females. The main risk factors associated with NCDs were alcohol consumption, physical inactivity, Salt/Sodium intake, Tobacco use and raised blood pressure. According to the Government of Uganda, the Ministry of Health Ministerial Policy Statement 2014/2015, the NCD Programme is allocated 0.01 percent of the total MoH budget, representing three percent of the Departmental budget, or approximately 27,000USD per annum. The Programme budget was supplemented by a five-year grant from the World Diabetes Federation (WDF) that expired at the end of 2017 and bringing the total budget to approximately 270,000USD.

**How analysis of the political economy of health can improve service delivery in Uganda**

**Strengthening of social and economic development processes:** While the development of the social and economic processes involves technocratic approaches, the political economy component usually determines the fate of the reforms. More specifically, knowledge on how and why governments make and implement decisions, prioritize the allocation of scarce financial and human resources, resolve trade-offs, regulate the private sector, achieve accountability, and interact with civil society and development partners is essential to understanding the process of socio-economic development. Knowing how governments use or do not use evidence to shape policies and prioritize the use of their own scarce resources is increasingly important (World Bank, 2011).

**Security promotion in the country and impact on health service delivery:** The effect of political economy analysis is especially important to understand in post conflict situations like Uganda. This is vital because conflict affects health outcomes both directly by disrupting basic services and indirectly by hindering economic growth. So political economy analysis could be enhanced for peace promotion thus quality services in the affected areas of northern Uganda. This is very evident because governments that effectively and visibly deliver essential social services have stronger political legitimacy (Harris, 2013).

**Promotion of maternal neonatal and child health:** The decline in maternal mortality ratio and child mortality rate have been slow. Political economy analysis of health in Uganda could improve the maternal, neonatal and child health, since there is still a large but preventable burden to be tangled. This can be demonstrated through the use of proven, affordable, interventions that dramatically improve maternal, neonatal and child health outcomes. These strategies have been in existence for decades now but have never been implemented in Uganda. Worth noting is that other low-income countries in Asia have successfully
implemented them due to evidence on cost effectiveness and affordability of improving health for so long. The reason Uganda has not invested in them despite apparent political commitment is due to inadequate political economy analysis. Political economy analysis therefore, can provide insights into these issues for the benefit of government, citizens and other development partners (World Investment Report, 2014). Therefore, application of political economy analysis in Uganda can lead to the achievement of remarkable and sustained reductions in maternal and child mortality despite low income, and the civil war. Uganda now has a growing life expectancy of 62.3 years from 58 years in the last two years (WB 2016). It also has a low fertility rate, and is among the countries that has registered a reduced infant mortality rates from 122 per 1000 live births in 1990 to 43 per 1000 live births in 2016 and under-5 mortality rates in sub-Saharan Africa, despite spending less on health care than several neighboring countries (Acemoglu et al, 2012 and World Bank 2016). However, Uganda never achieved the fourth millennium development goal, therefore proper analysis of political economy can easily give the country its way to achieving the sustainable development goals.

Guide government on its true priorities: Baten (2016) mentioned that strong political economy analysis of leadership in Uganda can be able to guide the government on making its right priorities. This can lead to increased funding to the health sector as people’s health is valued above other needs. This will enhance the free health care services with proper staffing and availability of equipment and drugs. Much as the increased funding to the health sector is appreciated, the recommended Abuja declaration target of 15% government expenditure as enshrined by WHO has never been achieved and so the health sector is still characterized by drug stock outs, poor pay and chronic under staffing. There is evidence of other sectors taking funds meant for medicines as the health sector is ignored. The government obtained $200m from Preferential Trade Area (PTA) Bank meant for purchase of medicines and was diverted to the Ministry for Finance (URN, 2018) the observer Newspaper between the parliament, still unable to generate additional finances to fund its efforts that affect Universal Health Coverage, at the same time reducing the leading cause of non-communicable diseases. There should be more critical analysis of the budgets which will provide an insight of the true priorities of the government, given the political environment in which they operate (World Investment Report, 2014).

Placing health issues to the political agenda and successful policy making: World Bank (2011) states that political economy analysis is a strong weapon that facilitates the ability of health issues to the political agenda for discussion. However, without its help, the issue may never be considered a problem, therefore, the analysis of political economy in Uganda will aid in identification and solving of health problems either directly or indirectly through lobbying for funds to the health sector thus improvement health service delivery. Analysis of political economy in Uganda could lead to relevant, successful policy making. Harris (2013) argues that political economy analysis guides proper formation of relevant policies that will promote health care, through the right process to ensure sustainability and prevent failure. For example, with the use of political economy analysis, the parliament of Uganda would make and implement decisions such as agreement on the taxation of tobacco and alcohol to fund some of the activities in the health sector, by so doing this will reduce the consumption of these products hence promoting health as well as rising funds for health services (WHO 2008).

This account demonstrates the great relevance of how political economy analysis in Uganda can contribute to the improvement of health services delivery. Whereas these are the impacts of political economy analysis,
its adoption, implementation and sustainability are yet to be seen. Never the less, there are still numerous challenges to be enclosed especially in this country (Uganda Economic outlook 2016).

**Improvement of leadership and governance:** Issues arising from political economy analysis will lead to marked improvement in the quality of health services because politics determines how much money is allocated to the health sector. A study done in Nepal evidenced that political economy analysis results into increased utilization of modern family planning and increased funding to the health sector. Political economy analysis could be performed with high levels of patronage and scant attention to sub-national levels taking on pragmatic relationships with non-government organizations (World Bank, 2011).

**What can be done to Support the Political Economy of Health Analysis in Uganda**

Uganda being a developing country is faced with a number of circumstances and challenges coupled with a volatile political and economic history since independence. Some of them include, communicable diseases and under-nutrition as well as the growing need to address rising technical and financial burden of non-communicable diseases (World Investment Report, 2014). We do underscore some of the possible interventions that can aid this analysis:

**Liberal democracy and adaption of its approach to economic decentralization:** Democracy and decentralization could be combined to increase the political economy of health as a public-sector responsibility. While decentralization has been implemented in Uganda, it is never complete without the funds which are still controlled at the national level hindering the ability of the districts to plan and make decisions independently. This has a high effect to the health care service delivery. Whereas health services have been made free in Uganda, there is still limited evidence of financial commitment to sustainably improve health outcomes, especially at sub-national level where there is frequent drug stock outs and chronic under staffing (Acemoglu et al 2012). The Country experiences high levels of Out-of-Pocket expenditure at 40% which does not protect households from catastrophic spending. WHO recommended level of household out of pocket spending on health is 15%. This is in line with World Health Assembly resolution of 2005 on universal coverage and sustainable health financing and as well as revisiting the Paris Declaration that calls for greater Investments in the Health Sector. The five-year Health Sector Development Plan (HSDP) recommended a minimum of $73 per capita in the year 2015/16. The recommended per capita health expenditure is a minimum of $84 per capita for low income countries if a country is to increase access to health care and improve quality of services. With the current Ugandan epidemiological profile, relative to our desired level of health status, the per capita expenditure of US$ 56 may not move the country towards achieving the sustainable development goals (SDGs). The government Health financing accounted for 17% ($10 per capita) of the Current Health Expenditure (CHE). This CHE as a percentage of GDP was 1.3% against the minimum recommended level of 4% in the HSDP (11 & 16) compared to 6.15% in the African countries. (MOH, 2016).

**Adequate financing for research on political economy and the health sector:** Baten (2016), World Bank (2011) points out that in the recent years, Uganda’s economy has grown at a slower pace in reducing its effect on poverty. Average annual growth was 4.5% in the five years to 2015/16, compared to the 7% achieved during the 1990s and early 2000s. The economic slowdown was mainly driven by adverse weather, unrest in South Sudan, private sector credit constraints, and the poor execution of public sector projects. Amidst these, and as a reflection of an unrealized fiscal stimulus, growth slowed further to 3.5%
in 2016/17. Therefore, availability of resources to promote research will help in identification of the gaps in the health sector thus early detection and resolution of challenges. However, without political analyses, Uganda still has serious questions about its capacity to sustain free health care especially for the poor. Lately health expenditure has been increasing in the country due to emerging and re-emerging diseases like communicable diseases. Government expenditure on health can be effectively achieved by health insurance forms for example community health financing which reduces barriers to health care access. The poor should be exempted so that health services do not act as a source of impoverishment for them. This is an opportunity for pooling of risks and health finances (World Bank, 2016). All this requires adequate research to make informed decisions.

Encourage and carry out research in the field of political economy: Baten (2016) state research is very vital in the health sector, putting in mind that whatever is done deals directly with human life where there is no second chance. Thus, research should be encouraged so that whatever is done is backed up with evidence. There should also be willingness to accept change according to the outcome of the results of the studies done. This will facilitate quality health services and promote health in the country thus development because health is wealth.

Inclusion of political economy analysis as a course unit at higher levels of education: Whereas political economy analysis is evident with positive impacts, dealing with an unknowing population is more difficult. Therefore, making the people informed and knowledgeable of its benefits is of paramount importance. Thus, the need to include this as a course unit so that the public-sector is informed and appreciate the need for political economy analysis in health care including policy makers. Furthermore, the availability of knowledgeable decision makers will always screen any issue that come up in health and assess its benefit and effects to society. This will lead to relevant policy formation in the country which will uphold and promote quality service delivery (World Bank, 2011).

Conclusion

We did find limited application of political economy analysis tools in Uganda. Indeed, a scoping review of the East African Countries and low and middle income countries revealed a similar situation. Political economy analysis is a vital instrument that can be applied to assess and improve the health service delivery in Uganda and worldwide. This could provide a case for funding and other interventions to the health sectors in the framework of supporting the overall global and national economies and thus attainment of SDGs. This can be achieved through proper policy formulation and sustainability. However, its presence alone without proper knowledge and implementation may not achieve its intended goals in society. Political economy analysis has often times failed to realize its objectives due to ignorance of the key persons, hence for the enjoyment of political economy analysis, decision makers must be knowledgeable so that informed choices are made in order to promote quality health care delivery and development at large.

References


Local Governments and the Implementation of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework in Uganda

Kalanzi William

Uganda Management Institute / Wakiso District Local Government

E-mail: williamkalanzi@yahoo.com

Abstract

This paper examined the achievements of Wakiso District Local Government in the implementation of the objectives of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework. This was an exploratory research that used qualitative approaches to data collection and analysis. The paper was based on the Carrot and Stick theory. It was established that Wakiso District follows a multi-phased approach in the application of rewards and sanctions so as to ensure transparency and objectivity. A survey is conducted by the Rewards and Sanctions Committee to nominate the best performers. The results of the survey are compared with the findings from other assessments to select the best. Reputational and operational rewards are offered to the best performers at the Rewards and Recognition Ceremony. However, there are no financial rewards given to them. Absenteeism or irregular attendance to duty was identified as the most common form of misconduct. The sanctions applied include reputation sanctions, operational and financial sanctions such as interdiction from duty with half pay. Such sanctions depend on cases of misconduct and they greatly have promoted better performance. Despite the application of the above rewards and sanctions, there is need to introduce financial rewards in order to attain the third objective of this framework. Digital attendance registers and routine enforcement of duty rosters are required in order to curb absenteeism. Funds for the committee should also be increased for effective execution of its roles.

Key words: Local Governments, Rewards and Sanctions Framework

Introduction

The Government of Uganda has enacted a number of rules, regulations and guidelines in a bid to improve the performance of Public Officers so that they can achieve individual, team and organization goals. These are spelt out in the Public Service Act (2008), Public Service Commission Regulations (2009), The Code of Conduct and Ethics for the Uganda Public; the Public Service Standing Orders (2010) among others. However, the enforcement of the above rules and regulations was not uniform and could not greatly improve the performance of public officers hence the need for the establishment of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework in 2011 (Ministry of Public Service, 2011).

The Rewards and Sanctions Framework was therefore set up to address the weaknesses of the then existing system. The overall objective of this Framework is to create a competitive work environment that supports a culture of continuous search for improvement in performance, productivity, innovation and service delivery. The specific objective of this Framework are: to enhance consistence, transparency and objectivity in the application of rewards and sanctions in the Uganda Public Service; to introduce sanctions to promote better performance, to introduce financial rewards in addition to the already existing non-financial rewards and to increase the value of rewards and the intensity of the consequences of the sanctions.

It has however, been observed that since the establishment of this framework, some cases of misconduct or indiscline and poor performance have persisted in Local Governments in Uganda. A case in point is teachers’ absenteeism in schools which is an importunate issue even where resources and other facilities are available (Ministry of Education and Sports, 2017:18) Similarly attendance to duty in health centres by health workers is still irregular (Ministry of Health, 2018; Ministry of Health, 2017 ). Other cases of misconduct still prevalent include alcoholism, lateness to duty, requests for kickbacks, misconduct related
to management of funds and refusal to comply with posting instructions. On the other hand, rewarding and recognition of excellent performance is rarely done in Local Governments. It is against this background that this paper seeks to examine the achievements of Wakiso District Local Government in the implementation of the objectives of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework. The

**Literature Review**

**Theoretical Review**

The theoretical framework for this study was derived from the Carrot and Stick theory (Instrumentality theory) which assumes that employees will be motivated to perform better if rewards and penalties (carrots and sticks) are tied directly to their performance; therefore rewards depend upon effective performance (Armstrong, 2006). According to Marciano (2010: 3) carrots and sticks refer to using rewards and punishments to motivate others. This system is based on the principle of operant conditioning. Operant Conditioning is specific behavioral strategy developed by B.F Skinner to change behavior. These include positive reinforcement and punishment (Cole, 2008:313). However, Leavilt and Pondy (2010) disagree with the instrumentality theory. They contend that the carrot and stick theory may not be applicable once an employee has reached an adequate subsistence level and is motivated primarily by higher needs. They argue that there are some needs that management cannot provide for example the need for self respect, the gratification of needs for self- fulfillment. The objective of this paper therefore, is to establish whether rewards and sanctions have promoted better performance in Wakiso District or not.

**Categories of Rewards and Sanctions**

According to the Uganda Public Service Rewards and Sanctions Framework (2011), there are various categories of rewards and sanctions. These include reputational, financial and operational rewards and sanctions. Reputation rewards are non-financial rewards that boost ones ego by exposing excellent performance. They include certificates, letters of Recognition/Commendation, plaques, trophies, public applause, publishing names and photographs of best performers. On the other hand reputational sanctions are those sanctions that are a source of shame for example public naming and shaming. The second categories are the financial rewards and sanctions. These include increased budget allocations, cash bonuses, coupons, shopping vouchers and cash. On the other hand, the non financial sanctions include reduced budget allocation, imposition of fines and penalties, interdiction with half pay, refund or surcharge, stoppage of increment and other sanctions spelt out in the Public Finance and Accountability Act(2003). The third categories are the Operational rewards and sanctions. Operational rewards refer to interventions that provide operation flexibility and comfort in the management of financial and non financial resources while operational sanctions are interventions that withhold or deny operation flexibility and comfort in the management of financial and non financial resources. This paper therefore seeks to ascertain which of the above rewards and sanctions have been applied by Wakiso District Local Government.

Ackeman (2010) supports the idea of tying rewards and punishments to the bureaucrats’ level of performance. She contends that they encourage efficiency in performance and can effectively control the rate of corruption in Public Service. The carrot and stick theory is consistent with Douglas Mc Gregor’s theory X which assumes that employees must be coerced, controlled and threatened with punishment to ensure better performance(Cole,2008:70).
Amstrong and Tina (2012) however, stress that organizations need to adopt a total reward approach in a bid to improve the performance of their workers. They contend that such approach combines financial and non-financial rewards which are designed to attain motivation, commitment and development of workers.

Methodology

This was an exploratory research using qualitative approaches to data collection and analysis. Key informant interviews were conducted with members of the Wakiso District Rewards and Sanctions Committee, Human Resource Officers, District Health Officer, Inspector of Schools, Head teachers, In-charge of health centres, Town Clerks and Senior Assistant Secretaries (now referred to as Senior Assistant Chief Administrative Officer). A total of 50 key informants were selected to participate in the study. Members of the Rewards and Sanctions Committee were selected using purposive sampling while head teachers and in-charges of health centres were selected using systematic sampling. The researcher applied a non-static approach to determine the above sample size. In this regard representativeness was related to the quality of information provided by the key informants rather than the number of respondents. Data was thematically analyzed whereby all relevant data to each theme was identified and examined using the process of constant comparison in which each item was checked and compared with the rest of the data to establish analytical categories.

Findings

Implementation of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework by Wakiso District Local Government

It is imperative to note that every ministry, department or local government has a Rewards and Sanctions Committee and the overseer of the implementation of this framework is the Ministry of Public Service. At the Local Government Level the framework provides for the establishment of a District Rewards and Sanctions Committee that is composed of five members. These are the Chairperson who is appointed by the Chief Administrative Officer (CAO), the Head of Human Resource who performs duties of a Secretary and any other three technocrats appointed by the CAO based on the principle of fairness and representativeness (Amendments to Circular Standing Instruction No. 1 of 2011).

The functions of the Rewards and Sanctions Committee include; developing guidelines for scoring and ranking of teams and individuals against performance indicators; considering submission from heads of departments regarding rewards and sanctions; reviewing performance of individuals and teams to identify the best and worst, preparing and publishing annual performance scores and rankings for all teams, receiving, assessing and reviewing nominations for rewarding and sanctioning, recommending appropriate rewards and sanction to be applied and submitting to the CAO the nominees for considerations for annual rewards and recognition or sanctions.

Best Performance Identification Processes to Enhance Transparency and Objectivity

The process of identifying and selecting best performers in Wakiso District Local Government is a multi-phased process. For each category of best performers, more than one process is followed to select the best. This was adopted to achieve the first objective of this framework which is to enhance transparency, consistence and objectivity in the applications of rewards and sanctions.

As one of the strategies to achieve the above objective, the Rewards and Sanctions Committee conducts a survey in which employees nominate fellow employees to be considered as the best performers. The committee designs a questionnaire that is used in the nomination of the best performing technical staff, Town Council, Sub-county, departments and units of the district. The questionnaire is distributed to staff at the district headquarters and in the lower local government by the Human Resource officers. In these questionnaires, parameters to be based on to determine the best performers are set. However, prior to their distribution to the respondents, they are piloted and pre-tested to establish their validity and reliability. For example, to determine the overall best performing technical staff of the district, the following parameters
are set. The selected candidates must have met performance targets and outputs of his or her job, be very innovative and creative, have customer care, promote team work, demonstrate credible leadership skills; has no track record of indiscipline in the year of nomination, must be a good time manager, appears descent and respectable and listens and complies to lawful instructions. Employees are given the opportunity to nominate only two fellow employees that they believe qualify for the above award.

It was found out that after nominations have been made in the survey, the Rewards and Sanctions Committee reviews the questionnaire to identify 5 candidates with the highest number of nominations. Thereafter, the committee reviews the personal files and appraisal forms of the nominated employees to select the best candidate. The selected candidate is put on the Rewards and Recognition List for that particular year. The other category rewarded following the same process is that of the best performing support (junior) staff.

The committee also follows the principle of transparency and objectivity in the selection of the best performing Town council or Sub-county. Using the same survey, the parameters below are used to determine the best performing lower local government. It must have a very good truck record of financial management and accountability as evidenced from the Audit reports of that financial year, a very good record of revenue collection and management effective and efficient human resource management practices. The selected lower local government should also have set up new development projects and there should exist cordial relations between the political leadership and the technocrats. Lastly, innovativeness and creativity should be exhibited in the delivery of services. The committee therefore relies on the nominations made by the employees and the Audit reports of that financial year to select the best performing Town councils or Sub-county council. Similar to the first selection; employees are allowed to nominate only two Sub-counties that they believe qualify for the set parameters.

It was also found out that the committee selects the best performing department/unit basing on the survey results and Annual National Assessment results obtained by the Office of the Prime Minister. In the survey, the following parameters are set for choosing the best department. Timely submission of departmental work plans and reports; innovativeness and creativity, timely submission of Performance Budgeting System (PBS) reports, regular holding of departmental meetings, and accountability to its clients and team work.

As earlier noted, the committee also bases its selection for the best performing department on the Local Government National Assessment. The Local Government Performance Assessment System aims at promoting effective behavior systems and procedures in order to improve Local Governments administration and service delivery (Ministry of Local Government, 2017:1). The assessment system has three dimensions which include budget and accountability requirements, cross-cutting and sector functional processes and systems and service delivery results (Ministry of Local Government, 2017:2). The results of the survey and the National Assessment are compared to establish the best performing department or unit.

The committee also rewards the best performing primary and secondary schools in the district. Based on the Inspection reports submitted by the education department, the district education office identifies 5 best performing primary and secondary schools which are thereafter subjected to the following parameters so as to have the winner. The parameters considered in this regard are; performance of pupils/students in National examinations, the functionality of school management committees or Board of Governors for primary and secondary schools respectively, staff attendance to duty, cleanliness at school, waste management, transparency and accountability in the use of government funds and functionality of the library. The committee makes field visits to the 5 identified primary and 5 secondary schools in order to award scores as per the set parameters.

The last category that is rewarded is the best health facility. In order to ensure transparency and objectivity, the committee bases its selection on the results obtained from the National Assessment conducted under Result-Based Financing (RBF). Result-Based Financing is a national program that aims at reducing
morbidity and mortality by improving access to affordable and quality package of essential health care services to the people of Uganda with equal rights and opportunities (Ministry of Health, 2018:16).

RBF Assessment is a strategy applied to evaluate health facilities on specific parameters so as to determine the amount of funds each facility would be allocated by the Ministry. RBF assessment focuses on leadership and governance in health facilities, management of human resource for health at facility level, health financing, health information collection, storage and retrieval. It also considers management of medicines, health supplies and vaccines, medical equipment and diagnostics, status of health infrastructure, reproductive health services and patient-centered care and safety. In order to select the best performing health facility, the committee directs the District Health Office to provide a list of five health centres that excellently performed in RBF assessment. After obtaining the list, a fact finding visit is made by the committee to establish the facility to be considered as the overall best performing health centre basing on the parameters set.

The Rewards and Recognition Ceremony

One of the most important events organized by the committee is the Rewards and Recognition Ceremony. This ceremony is organized every year in December and it also doubles as the Staff End of Year Party. This ceremony is presided over by the District Chairperson and all members of the District Council attend. The ceremony is also attended by all traditional staff of Wakiso district, In-charge of health centers, head teachers of primary and secondary schools and officers from security organs of the district.

The first Rewards and Recognition Ceremony for this Local Government was organized on 14th December 2018 at Buloba Forest Park. This function was attended by over 500 employees of the district. It was financially supported by the District and its Lower Local Governments. At this ceremony, plaques and certificates of Recognition were awarded to the best performers. Special recognition was also given to employees and departments that were not ranked as the best but their performance was impressive.

Other rewards offered to exemplary performing employees in Wakiso District Local Government include but are not limited to promotions, study opportunities, assignment of extra challenging duties and invitation to high level meetings or functions. These rewards have positively impacted on the performance of workers. The Committee also displays the photograph of the overall best performer on the Administration block as a sign of recognition and appreciation. It publishes the names of the best performers in the State of District Affairs and in the Annual District Magazine called ‘Wakiso on Focus’ (Wakiso District Local Government, 2018). However, there are no financial rewards offered to the best employees. This is attributed to the limited funds allocated to the committee and the traditional belief that financial rewards do not have a long lasting effect on employee motivation.

Application of Sanctions to Promote Better Performance

Although the Rewards and Sanctions Framework was developed in 2011 and issued under Circular Standing Instruction 1 of 2011, its full implementation in Wakiso District Local Government commenced in 2015. However, prior to its implementation, Disciplinary committees would sanction errant employees. The nomenclature was that the Disciplinary committee would only sanction poorly performing employees but would not reward excellent performers. The Education and Health Disciplinary Committees were the most active in this respect. The disciplinary cases that emerged in Wakiso District in 2015 and the concern of staff over lack of a system of appreciation necessitated the constitution of the Rewards and Sanctions Committee by the Chief Administrative Officer.

According to the Principal Human Resource Officer, the common cases of misconduct or indiscipline handled by the Rewards and Sanctions Committee are those related to attendance to duty. These include absenteeism or irregular attendance, abandonment of duty, failure to teach and allocated classes. The above vices are common among teachers and health workers. These cases of misconduct are attributed to the practice of moon lighting by teachers in private schools and health workers in private clinics. Additionally,
some employees are hired by non government organization to provide technical backstopping in the implementation of their projects.

Absenteeism is also caused by the acquisition of multiple loans especially by teachers. Some teachers obtain loans from more than one financial institution so as to bolster their income and those who fail to service the loans resort to absenteeism as a strategy to avoid “financial stress” that would be caused by the loan officers or money lenders.

Relatedly, it was revealed that failure to comply with posting instructions or order was another form of misconduct prevalent in Wakiso particularly in schools and health facilities. Some primary teachers and health workers abscond from duty when they are posted in what they refer to as the hard to reach or hard to serve areas such as Bussi and Zzinga Islands. Some report to the new station for one day while others stay at the old duty station till when reports are submitted by their immediate supervisors. Other cases of misconduct include illegal collection of license and fees, mismanagement of funds among others. Such acts are contrary to the core values of the District Clients’ Charter (2017:4).

Since absenteeism or abandonment of duty is the most common form of misconduct in the district, the following strategic actions have been undertaken to reduce it. First, all head teachers, In-charge of health centres, Senior Assistant Secretaries (Sub-county Chiefs) and Town Clerks are required to submit monthly attendance registers to the office of the Chief Administrative Officer. The registers are reviewed by a designated officer in each department to determine which employees have not been attending to their duties as stipulated in the Uganda Public Service Standing Orders (2010). The monthly attendance registers are used as tools for verifying the payroll and determining the employees to be paid in that month.

According to the Establishment Notice No.4 of 2009 regarding the application of sanctions in cases of absenteeism in Uganda Public Service, a Public Officer who is absent from duty between 6-10 days, does not receive salary until satisfactory reason for absence is established. However, if there are more than 10 days in a month, his salary is stopped by the Human Resource Office on recommendation of his immediate supervisor and the case is submitted to the Rewards and Sanctions Committee for disciplinary action. This is what is happening in Wakiso District.

For proper record keeping, officers designated to analyze the monthly attendance register are required to generate a payroll exceptions report indicating employees who should not be paid. A payroll exception report is report that summarizes the details of employees whose salaries have been withheld or suspended for any of the following reasons; abandonment of duty, irregular attendance, resignation, interdiction in order to pay half basic salary among others. This report is generated every month to avoid payment of salaries to employees who fall under the above mentioned categories.

Reputational sanctions such as warning letters and denial of promotion have been instituted against errant officers and this has forced many to positively change their behavior and to improve on their performance. Additionally, the Education Department publicizes results of poor performance as a way of encouraging the poor performing school to improve.

Financial sanctions have also been applied to enhance performance and also to ensure behavioral change. These include interdiction from duty with half pay, refund of the mismanaged funds, delayed release of Universal Primary or Universal Secondary Education funds until accountability reports are submitted to the concerned officers. There has therefore been a great reduction in committing of offences whose sanctions fall in the above category.

Operational sanctions such as withdrawal of assignments and withdrawal of powers to execute some duties have been used as punishments to poorly performing staff. Such withdrawals aim at making the public servant more committed to his work and also to realize that redundancy is likely to affect his opportunities for promotion and career development. Refund of government funds for those who misappropriate has also been made through direct payment to government recovery accounts.
The key informants suggested that apart from rewarding and sanctioning, government should provide the following to improve performance: medical insurance to all civil servants, free staff housing especially for those officers stationed in hard to reach areas, enhance and harmonize salaries for all government employees.

Discussion

The overall objective of this paper was to examine the achievements of Wakiso District Local Government in the implementation of the objectives of the Rewards and Sanctions Framework (2011). Data analysis and interpretation revealed the following findings: There are several processes involved in the identification of the best performers and such processes depend on the category of the award to be offered. The rewards are given to the best performers at the Rewards and Recognition Ceremony which is organized annually. The aforesaid a multi-phase approach to identification of best performers has enabled the district to achieve the first objective of this Framework which focuses on ensuring transparency and objectivity in the issuance of rewards.

Additionally, the findings indicated that Wakiso District Local Government only offers reputational and operational rewards to the best performers. It has not yet started giving out financial rewards to the best performers. This finding is contrary to the total reward approach which combines financial and non-financial rewards as suggested by Armstrong and Tina (2012). In addition to that under the Kenyan Rewards and Sanctions Framework (2016:24) when public officer attains more than 100% of the agreed performance targets, his reward is the 13th month salary which is based on the score for excellent performance. There is therefore need for Wakiso District Local Government to introduce financial rewards for improved performance and attainment of the third objective of this framework.

The findings revealed that the most common form of misconduct is absenteeism or irregular attendance to duty. This finding is consistent with the Health Sector Performance Report (Ministry of Health 2017:4) and also rhymes well with the findings in the Annual Performance Report of the Ministry of Education and Sports (2017:18). The sanctions applied to cases of absenteeism such as suspension or stoppage of salary have been instrumental in improving attendance to duty by offenders. It has also acted as a deterring factor to the would-be offenders. This finding is in consonance with the Establishment Notice No.4 of 2009 regarding the application of sanctions in cases of absenteeism. Despite the existing sanctions, there is also need to introduce digital attendance registers, routine enforcement of duty rosters and weekly inspections of schools and health facilities. Since over borrowing is one of the causes of absenteeism, there is need to provide financial literacy training to public servants especially primary teachers.

It was also found out that a number of financial and operational sanctions are implemented by Wakiso District Local Government. They focus on both poor performance and discipline. These have greatly positively changed the behavior of public officers and promoted better performance in service. However, according to the Kenyan Rewards and Sanctions Framework, the sanctions are purely for poor performance. These are divided into agency and employee sanctions.

Conclusion

In a nutshell, Wakiso District Local Government has to a greater extent managed to attain the objectives of the Uganda Public Service Rewards and Sanctions Framework. There is however, need to prioritize the activities of the Rewards and Sanctions committee in the planning and budgeting process by increasing funds to cater for financial rewards and also to enable the committee effectively execute its mandate.

References


The Role of Civil Society Matter in Good Governance and Democracy in African Countries: A Case of Uganda

Simon Ross Euku & Christopher S. Mayanja

Accounting and Management Consultants, Ross and Company-Kampala

Abstract

This paper examines the role civil society plays as a voice of the voiceless on good governance and agents of democracy in Uganda. The paper argues that the role of civil society matter in good governance and does in democracy; which role ensures governments to build accountable governance and democratic governments, though it also questions whether the Civil Societies (CSs) can theoretically as well as in reality influence governments in building democratic expectations and good governance in African countries. This paper examines the role of civil society using a case evidence of Uganda and attempts to bridge the gap between the theory and reality of CSs role by presenting a fair assessment on the capacity of the CS to influence African governments to embrace good governance and true democracy; using a case of Uganda. Often times the CSs in Uganda have not comprehensively embraced political activism and political advocacy because of the political history of this country. The hostile political environments that the Civil Society experience in most African governments has created lack of interest and enthusiasm in their part and too, wariness makes them (the CS) pronounce that they are not political. Needless to say, the CSs have failed to establish a difference and distance from the National Resistance Movement (NRM) government to the extent that they do not seem autonomous and independent in their operations from government agencies. This therefore has ultimately undermined the culture of the CS and as such cramped and enclosed the CSOs to matters that do not call for challenge of the status quo or affect the status of the government’s position on critical matters, leaving the voiceless at bay.

Key words: Civil Society, Governance, Democracy, African Countries

Introduction

The concept of civil society is traced back to many centuries with its roots in Ancient Greece and is as old as mankind started settling together in society, and was first penned down in about 13th Century (Adam, 1767). The modern idea of civil society emerged in the 18th Century, influenced by political theorists: Thomas Paine and George Hegel, who developed the notion of civil society as a domain parallel to but separate from the states (Cerethers, 1999). The 1990s brought about renewed interest in civil society, as the trend towards democracy opened up space for civil-society and the need to cover increasing gaps in social services created by structural adjustment and other reforms in developing countries.

Civil Society (CS) definition is varied as scholars have not come up with one common meaning. More often than not, Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) are meant to refer to part of the Society or groups formed for collective purposes, except the State and market (van Rooy, 1998). The State is precisely “The three Arms of Government (The executive, Legislature and Judiciary)” of a country. CS comprise of both unorganized and organized groups like Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs), social collectives, religious groups, think tanks, universities, mass media, etc. In short, the traditional 'subjects', beneficiaries, “the ruled” in a democracy and good governance constitute civil society. CS is also meant to refer to the "aggregate of non-governmental organizations and institutions that manifest interests and will of citizens”. Civil society includes the family and the private sphere, called the "third or voluntary sector", distinct from government and business. In this paper, a State is a nation or territory considered as an organised political community under one government. The mandate of the civil society is defined by their expertise or affiliation - and is usually related to specific causes (Lewis, 2002). For example, a civil society serving nutritional foods in emergency areas such as in Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) Camps is focussed on
public health and health education. Indeed, despite their limited mandate as regulated by the obtaining legislations, they are still able to thoroughly work on pro-needy aspects and provide insights that can easily go into policy formulation, implementation and evaluation.

Governance is defined as the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country’s economic and social resources for development (Work Bank, 1998; 2000). Good governance is synonymous with sound development management. The World Bank's experience has shown that the programs and projects it helps finance may be technically sound, but fail to deliver anticipated results for reasons connected to the quality of government actions in governance. The role of civil society in good governance is centred on public sector management, accountability, the institutional framework for development, and information and transparency.

This paper comes in to fill the gap where civil society is being engaged with government, business and international organizations, civil society actors to provide the resilient dynamism the world urgently needs in good governance and democracy. More often than not, the power and influence of civil society are growing and harnesses opportunities to create trust and enable action across sectors, where in which case the civil society is undergoing changes that strongly suggest that it is no longer viewed as a “third sector”; rather, it’s the glue that binds public and private sectors together in such a way as to strengthen the common good.

Methodologically, the authors mostly relied on existing current literature and complemented by data gathered through informal discussions with relevant civil society actors in Uganda.

The role of Civil Society in Governance
The aim of civil society is to ensure that governments effectively respond to the needs of the people, be it socially, economically or politically. CSs include organisations such as Transparency International Uganda, DANIDA, Action Aid, Universities and name them. Civil society plays a vital role in promoting good governance and influences Governance which is the process by which we collectively solve our problems and meet society’s needs (Torney & Amadeo, 2004).

Civil Society upholds Governance, democratic policies and legislations that aim at strengthening and nurturing stakeholder engagement to advocate for a democracy that serves all citizens in a country, which programs work for social, economic and political accountability of local and national levels of leadership. However, the limiting factor for the activities of CS in Uganda is that there is no enabling law apart from the NGO Act, 2016 and the NGO registration Act, 2003 (and attendant Amendments), the only law applicable for all types of NGOs in Uganda, but as shown with its name, it implies a rather narrow definition of an NGO by mainly focusing on the (apolitical) service-delivery role (Derrer, 2010). That is the reason why the coalition is also called the NGO coalition, not the CSs Coalition.

The capability of civil society in influencing the state and residents' lives is starting to be perceived everywhere throughout Africa. It is increasingly being understood that good governance and democracy isn't the sole obligation of the civil society. Subsequently, in the advancement of "good governance and democracy" civil society can assume a critical part in changing the state in the severely administered nations and through cross examination and cooperation can help advance majority rule government, rule of law and social equity. It is in this interest that this study “the Role of Civil Society Matter in Good Governance and Democracy in African Countries: A Case of Uganda,” is attempting to trace the interface between civil society and the State.
Civil society is an important means to keep proper checks and balances on the “State” who exercises power with public resources at its disposal. In many cases, CS has forced government to backtrack on its hastily conceived legislations like the recent Age Limit Bill of 2017. Though it was passed to law as an Act of Parliament, the Land bill of 2017 is still pending debate; while other controversial legislations, such as the taxation bills during the budgeting periods, which tend to outrageously increase taxes and thus affecting even the poorest of the poor are also pending debate. Relatedly, when politicians try to misuse the electoral provisions, CSs such as Action Aid, HURINET, The Church Association, and The Uganda Association of Lawyers have tried to utilize other democratic means and judiciary route to control them. Because of these efforts by the CS, elected leaders have to disclose their assets, educational qualifications, past convictions (if any) and thus helping voters make an informed choice. Elections being the start of a democratic cycle have been slightly reformed through strident efforts of CSs, though with a lot of resistance from the ruling governments (Oloka & Barya, 1996).

The Civil Society also play the role of ensuring that the way of limiting usurpation of power by individuals, the military, or otherwise is to put people in-charge, though with obtaining challenges in attempting to play this role (Emre, 2007). CS presently exhibits the changing roles of civil society as facilitators, conveners, innovators and additionally performs as service providers, such as reshaping the economic and social activities in handling community challenges. Besides, this contextual setting for CSs changing: financial and geopolitical power is no longer flowing from funding and development partners in Europe and North America; technology is disrupting traditional funding models and significantly moving social commitment; and political weights are limiting the space for civil society exercises in many nations. These movements pose challenges, create chances and require quicker adjustment with respect to civil society actors to adopt positive engagement to influence governments.

Civil society plays a role as an enabler and catalyst for cross-sector change, creating for governments the political and policy “space” difficult to make the otherwise unpopular decisions or legislations. For international organizations, civil society representatives possess significant experience and expertise, particularly at grassroots level, that helps them formulate policy and strategies effectively. By virtue of being closer to the end-beneficiaries to the country’s policy and programmes, civil society adds credibility to international organization activities in the country by performing the restricted activities as planned in their proposals when applying for funding. By involving civil society as implementing partners, interventions are more likely to be effective on the ground and reach those who are in need and planned to benefit. In the new approaches to implementing government projects, codenamed “public-private partnerships”, civil society also plays a fundamental role by providing oversight as a watchdog to ensure outcomes are socially and environmentally enhanced to ensure sustainable development.

Civil society is a vibrant, diverse and evolving space, which is increasingly innovative in its attempts to solve societal challenges and support local, national and global governance in their interventions to ensure services are delivered to the target beneficiaries in a manner to promote accountability and good governance. It is on this note therefore, that the civil society leaders need to understand how shifting external contexts will shape their opportunities to achieve impact, and, in particular, what this evolution means for their relationships with businesses, governments and international organizations (Oloka & Barya, 1996; Nora, 2010). In a turbulent and uncertain environment, actors both in public and private sector can no longer work well in isolation, as new and more effective ways of tackling societal challenges inevitably transcend traditional sector boundaries by bringing in more stakeholder engagements. This means civil
society actors need to look to unusual sources for inspiration and relevance in order to adapt successfully in their performances (Nora, 2010).

The civil society forces have the ability to establish collaborative interchange with the political, society and governments, which enhances its impact capability. For example, civil society may involve in mutual assignments in which organizations pool resources with governmental bodies, or some form of partnership to develop projects for the needy populace such as those affected by emergency circumstances in the Bududa landslides; in Bulambuli District. In acting as a counterpart, civil society brings in confidence to political scene not only by acting as a counsellor but also by cooperating with state agencies for proficient policy development and implementation. Additionally, acting out of the scope of state bureaucracy, civil society habitually operates in a more effective and efficient manner when compared to the state. Therefore, by supplying policy proposals and assistance to the state activity, civil society and government collaboration could increase government’s performance.

After 2001, when Uganda became a multi-party state once again, the strength of civil society continued to grow and is reflected in their success in campaigning for electoral reforms and opening the political space for all registered political parties to have equal opportunities to converse support for political elective positions at different levels.

Civil society role matters in governance because it attempts to limit and influence state power by providing checks and balances and ensuring that resources are channelled in the right direction. For example, in 2015, the CSs were involved in different ways in enacting the NGO ACT, 2015 that leads to transparency and accountability in the performance of government tasks. The civil society for this matter, the Uganda National NGO Forum had asked government to include their concerns on the gazetted NGO Bill, 2015 contained in their “Position Paper1”. In this Clause by Clause Analysis of the NGO Bill, 2015, they indicated; “on Sad to note however, is that the draft Bill is littered with problematic clauses that undermine the very essence of some of the stated positive objectives of the proposed law, with the following highlighted concerns:

In its current form, the NGO Sector cannot support the bill. The analysis that informed this position is collated from consultations with representatives from NGOs and networks across the country that met for two days in a retreat and went through the bill clause by clause. It is also informed by work done on the NGO legislative reform undertaken over the last 15 years as well as written submissions made by some NGOs on this current bill. Using a colour code to determine all key provisions in the proposed law, we conclude that the bill requires ‘major surgery’ if it is to support the nurturing of a publically accountable NGO sector as envisaged in the NGO Policy. From our analysis 47% of the provisions in the bill fall in the RED category which means, they should either be deleted or completely overhauled. 27% of the provisions fall in the ORANGE category which means that with some amendment, they can be retained and finally 26% of the provisions of the bill in its current form are in the GREEN category meaning they are ok and can be passed as they are. Some specific analyses have also been done by NGOs working in various human rights fields and their conclusions are similar and in some cases even farther reaching.
Uganda National NGO Forum sums up by saying: Human Rights Watch said “Bill Threatens Rights, Independent Groups”; the Foundation for Human Rights Initiative (FHRI) Memorandum on the NGO Bill, Human Rights Awareness and Promotion Forum (HRAPF) and Human Dignity Trust, UK commented “the Bill would impose overwhelming governmental control”. Indeed, with limitations, these concerns were addressed by government, where it considered possible.

From 1990s, the CSOs in Uganda were involved in different ways, from the Uganda constitutional making of 1995, constitutional amendment of 2002 and other legislative Acts of Parliament that followed. Civil society also guards against possible manipulation by acting as a shield against exploiting behaviour and by monitoring public performance on human rights abuse and corruption. The role of civil society matter in this area as can be seen when Foundation for Human Rights Initiative (FHRI) took the lead and petitioned the constitutional court on matters of human rights and freedoms in 2008: Foundation for Human Rights Initiatives Vs Attorney General (Constitutional Petition No. 20 of 2006)) [2008] UGCC 1 (26 March 2008); The matter before hand was in Conformity with the Constitution on legislation dealing with detention before trial and mainly centred on two issues:

1. Interpretation (Constitution to be read as a whole, generous and purposive interpretation, 21, 22)

2. Personal liberty and security (discretion on court to grant bail, 30, 31, 34, 36, 39, 43, 49; purpose of bail, 37, 38; protection of society from lawlessness, 42; right to appear before court, 48)

This petition objective included protection, promotion and observance of human rights. The ruling concurred with the petitioner and Numbers 1 and 2 above were granted.

More often than not, civil society has become complementing partners for government in the provision of services such as clean water, health care and educational facilities. For example, the effort of establishing quite a number of hospitals and health centres that partner with government, such Uganda Martyrs Lubaga hospital in Kampala, and others like Lwala hospital in Kaberamaido district, Kalongo hospital in Kitgum district.

The Role of Civil Society in Democracy

Democracy is a government in which the supreme power is vested in the people and exercised by them directly or indirectly through a system of representation usually involving periodically held free and fair elections. A democracy is often said to be the most challenging form of government, as input from those representing citizens determines the direction of the country. In Uganda, the Liberal democracy, also known as constitutional democracy, built on the principles of free and fair elections, a competitive political process and universal suffrage prevails with the political head being the executive president and the principle of the leaders takes all. This type of democracy gives the executive president more powers, often time referred to as executive powers resulting into authoritarian leadership.

Often times, civil society actors participation in the affairs of the state (Uganda), particularly on matters of policy and good governance influence government actors, the elites and masses to demonstrate a broad consent on the legitimacy of the constitutional system rather than promoting the authoritarian solutions (Linz & Stepan, 1996; O'Donnell, 1992; and Gunther, Puhle & Diamandouros, 1995). Diamond (1999: 65) asserts; “in total this process refers to a shift in political culture and this shift is dominated by a number of actors within the society”.
Indeed, the longer civil society is suppressed and denied active participation in democracy so long will African governments lose their vital habit of thinking creatively, democratically and solving social-economic and political problems accordingly. There will then come a time when unaccountable leaders who suppress the civil society will leave power, as invariably they must, civil society will begin from the scratch to imbed democracy.

As part of the “social basis for democracy”, civil society represents a fundamental part of the democratic system and highlights issues of importance that benefit the society on equal basis. This is possible because the civil society has the ability to express controversial views; represent those who are voice less in matters of inherent inalienable rights; mobilize citizens into movements; build support across stakeholders; and brings credibility to the political system by promoting transparency and accountability. In policy formulation, civil society is a valuable partner in providing deep subject-matter expertise based on first-hand experience, trialling and scaling up innovations in social services and facilitating citizen engagement as stakeholders.

Civil society representatives often act in the public interest as whistle-blowers, holding institutions and individuals to account – for example in environmental pollution and tax avoidance. This is a valuable service, which complements government regulation and oversight, but one that can be under-valued. Similarly, CSs both alone and in public-private partnerships, often complement and supplement government assistance by providing a wide range of services to populations.

The civil society exhibits an energetic voice in promoting democratic principles of fair and equitable economic development, gender equality and human rights practices. The Civil Society in Africa however faces ever-tightening restrictions on this role via strict media oversight or burdensome regulatory hurdles for their operations. Indeed, as noted, governments in numerous countries and Uganda as a case study are restricting the space for civil society; particularly in the arena of advancing human rights or democratic principles of governance. The evidence in Ugandan political environment exhibits the steps to suppress or curb civil society freedoms that include limiting access to national and foreign funding, erecting barriers to mobile communications, and applying onerous, arbitrary or poorly administrated registration processes. Though such limitations exist, the civil society has exhibited restrain and play fantastic roles in attempts to influence the Governments to give space for democratic rule and the rule of law. For example, this was exhibited when they voiced their concern on the suppression of opposition and their views in the recently concluded Age Limit Bill debate of 2017.

The potential democratization role of CS and on their participation in the public policy processes in Uganda, confirmed the current developments, of a civil society that exhibits a rather low potential for strengthening democratization and for fostering national ownership in Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS), seems mostly to be reinforced, but not exclusively (Nora, 2010). This rise of civil society as key actors in Uganda and international development fora is closely related to the methodology change of international development policy, which required good governance and democracy from development partners (World Bank, 1992).

The civil society in Africa is a player as a “third-wave-democratization arm”, which is intended to reverse several authoritarian regimes in Sub-Saharan Africa, where such democratic governance is still exhibited – such as the current events of “The Sudan and Algeria”. The manifestation of this role is closely linked with a perceived failure of the, Structural Adjustment Programmes’ of the late 1980s and early 1990s, the brain child of the World Bank and other international financial institutions like the International Monetary Fund.
in an attempt to enhance democratic principles of governance (Abrahamsen, 1999). These were the defining feature of international development policy towards the countries in Sub-Saharan, which programs were inspired by neo-liberal economists and designed by the IMF and the World Bank, and devised to deal with Africa’s unsustainable debt and economic decline (Abrahamsen, 1999).

Notwithstanding, the philosophy of authoritarianism, democracy cannot be defined solely as a system where elites compete and acquire power through elections; democratic regimes must be responsive to the interests of the public and to that end, democratic political systems should function in setting the rule of law that protects the rights to speak, publish, organize, lobby and demonstrate for their citizens (Nora, 2007). Nora (2007) further holds that the civil society too, plays a role in promoting the importance of mass public for democratic governance that rests on the assumption that the mass public, through organizing itself, always has the chance to improve upon the democratic regimes by questioning and challenging any undemocratic practices and values. Also the mass public, through their organizations matter as they play part in democratic governance by contributing to the social and political programs in trying to bring to the public agenda the topics that are salient to them.

The Civil society through vocalizing the problems and needs of the populace produces warnings for the elected officials and pinpoint the problems related to democratic shortages. On the occasions when the governing elites do not take action for solving problems related to the democratic deficits, civil society is the only tool for identifying these problems and championing the course to have them addressed. For example in Uganda, the Civil Society championed the lead on the dismantling of the torture detention centre code named “Nalufenya” on the foot of and source of River Nile; now transformed into a Central Police Station.

The Civil Society organisations by intercommunicating through mass medium or by directly drawing attention of the elected officials and utilizing different tools like campaigns may elevate and pinpoint the issues of democracy into the political agenda and ask the leadership of a government to heed to the principles of democratic governance. For example, the Civil Society attempts to influence government to improve/reform policies on areas like public administration or human rights issues that elites seem reluctant to act upon. The civil society in this context engages in filling the gap and putting up the issues in the public circles. All these examples refer to the fact that democracy as a political system necessitates a public that is organized for democracy digest its values and norms and committed to its common —civic ends (Diamond, 1999).

As part of the “social basis for democracy”, Civil Society represents a fundamental part of the democratic system and highlights issues of importance, because it has the ability to express controversial views; represent those without a voice; mobilize citizens into movements; build support across stakeholders; and bring credibility to the political system by promoting transparency and accountability (The World Economic Forum, 2013). For example, in terms of policy formulation in Uganda, Civil Society is a valuable partner in providing deep subject-matter expertise based on first-hand experience, in providing and scaling up innovations in social services and facilitating citizen engagement. Civil Society representatives often act in the public interest as whistle-blowers, holding institutions and individuals to account, examples are seen in environmental pollution and erratic tax policies. CS provides valuable service that complements government regulation and oversight, but one that can be under-valued or undermined. Similarly, CS activities, both individually and in public-private partnerships, often complement government assistance in providing a wide range of services to the populace.
In as much as the Civil Society contributes to good governance they also face some challenges which make them not to perform up to their standards (Katusiimeh, 2006). Civil Society Organisations are registered by government, so when they criticize government, at times they might threaten to de-register them. The other problem is lack of resources which hinder them from reaching out to everyone especially the people in remote areas, and the other problem is lack of cooperation among the organizations due to discrimination (Katusiimeh, 2006). For example some organizations are highly funded and end up discriminating those at lower levels.

One of the reasons for the slow development of Civil Society in Africa has been lack of a strong private economic sector. Vast swaths of the working and middle classes are still tied to government through employment, and the private sector is still acutely dependent on government for contracts, subsidised credit, foreign exchange, and protection from foreign competition. As a result, key social groups and their organisations are ultimately dependent on government and vulnerable to governmental arm-twisting. Private businessmen, fearing the loss of profitable government contracts, may not place advertisements in private newspapers that the government sees as insubordinate. Therefore, business groups in Uganda are also not in the best position to support democratic consolidation. This is because some of the business groups tend to avoid confrontation with the state or involvement in politics, as they are state-funded or state-created. They find themselves confined to behind-the-scenes lobbying on behalf of their own, and narrowly defined interests.

The development of the Civil Society in Africa has been very slow, and reason being the staggering private sector economy and lack of independent private and voluntary sectors. The truth is, a majority of the working and middle class stakeholders are still relying on government for employment, while the private sector is still acutely dependent on government for contracts, subsidised credit, foreign exchange, and protection from foreign competition and the Civil Society (voluntary sector) threatened by authoritarianism and unpopular Legislations. As a result, key social groups and their organisations are ultimately dependent on government and vulnerable to governmental arm-twisting. Private businessmen, fearing the loss of profitable government contracts, may not place advertisements in private newspapers that the government sees as insubordinate. Therefore, business groups in Africa are also not in the best position to support good governance and democratic consolidation because they keep mum on issues that affect them and the voiceless citizens. This is because some of the business groups tend to avoid confrontation with the state or involvement in politics, as they are state-funded or state-created. They find themselves confined behind-the-scenes lobbying on behalf of their own narrowly defined interests.

In conclusion, there is evidence that Civil Society matter in good governance and democracy in African countries, using a case of Uganda. Civil Society Organisations have a vital role that matters in as far as limiting and controlling the power of the state, protect citizens from abuse of their inherent inalienable human rights, and sensitize citizens on their rights and obligations. They also help the government implement sound policies that help sustain the rule of law, stability and lives of people.
References


Truncating through the Crevasses of Customer Experience in Ugandan Retail Pharmaceutical Companies: Synthesizing the intermeshing of Service Quality & Customer Satisfaction at Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited in Kampala District

Innocent Nuwagaba1 & Edith Namakula2

1 Consultants, School of Business
2 Management Uganda Management Institute
Corresponding E-mail: innocentnuwagaba@gmail.com

Abstract

The study aimed at truncating through the crevasses of customer experience in Ugandan retail pharmaceutical companies through synthesizing the intermeshing of service quality and customer satisfaction at Ecopharm pharmaceuticals limited in Kampala district. The study was guided by the SERVQUAL theory of quality of service measurement and the expectancy disconfirmation model of satisfaction of customers. It has been noted that Ecopharm pharmaceuticals limited experiences continuous decrease in the quality of services offered to customers. The main objective of the study was to examine the relationship between service quality and customer satisfaction. The study adopted both qualitative and quantitative approaches under a cross-sectional design using questionnaire, interviewing and documents review methods. The data obtained was analyzed and the study findings revealed that tangibles had no relationship with satisfaction of customers whereas both reliability and employee responsiveness had a moderate positive relationship with customer satisfaction. It was concluded that management of the pharmacy should endeavor to develop employees in the different aspects of reliability and responsiveness as well as identify any other gaps and bridge them with any possible means so as to improve satisfaction of customers. It was recommended that management should provide enough uniforms for all employees to improve on the customer waiting area and ensure availability of packaging materials. Furthermore, management should remunerate employees on time to ensure motivation and support procurement to make timely deliveries of medicine orders to the different branches.

Key words: Customer Experience, Pharmacy, Intermeshing, Service, Quality, Satisfaction

Introduction

The research investigated how service quality relates to customer satisfaction in Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited (EPL) in Kampala district. This study was guided by SERVQUAL theory of Quality of service measurement. Quality of service means the overall impression of the customer of how inferior/superior an organisation and its service is (Bitner, Booms and Mohr, 1994). Cronin and Taylor, 1994 view quality of service as a form of attitude representing a long-run overall evaluation. Parasuraman, Zeithaml and Berry, (1985), defined quality of service as a function of the differences between expectation and performance along the quality dimensions. This is consistent with Roest and Pieters (1997) definition who say that quality of service is a relativistic and cognitive discrepancy between experience-based norms and performances concerning service benefits. Quality of service is how well the tangibles, responsiveness and reliability of a company conforms to customers’ expectations. Several researchers including Oliver, 1981; Brady & Robertson, view customer satisfaction as an attribute to either delightment or displeasure due to comparison of the performance perception of the product in regards to customer expectation. Satisfaction of a customer means the extent to which the service or product the organisation gives measures to or exceeds what the customer expects in terms of number of referrals, reduced number of complaints and customer repurchase intention. Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited (EPL). Started operations in 2005 as the brain child of a Pharmacist, Idd Iwumbwe and his wife Sophie K. Iwumbwe, an economist and chartered accountant (ACCA). Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited has a branch network with outlets at Imperial Mall, Entebbe; Capital Shoppers Supermarket, Stretchser Road; Ntinda on Kira road; Luwum Street at the
Problem Statement
Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited was established with a mission of providing the best quality of service possible to her customers. Despite the good business environment created by the company, customers still complain of poor service quality, product quality, high prices, access and timeliness of service. The company is increasingly getting more complaints and reduced referrals which in turn reduces sales which if not addressed there will be more reduced sales and hence the possibility of running out of business. (Sales Reports, 2016).

Purpose of Study
The study purpose was to examine how quality of service relates to satisfaction of customers in EPL.

Specific Objectives of Study
i. To find out how tangibles relate to customer satisfaction in EPL.
ii. To find out how reliability relates to customer satisfaction in EPL.
iii. To find out how responsiveness relates to customer satisfaction in EPL.

Literature Review
The SERVQUAL model was adopted to ascertain how quality of service relates to satisfaction of customers. Theory views service quality as how customer expects service to be offered and how he perceives the service that he receives. Since it is the perception of the service compared to the actual service that the customer receives that matters, this model becomes an attitude measure which relates to customer satisfaction although not the same as customer satisfaction (Parasuraman, 1998). Customer satisfaction means the extent to which products or services offered by an organisation measure to or exceed the expectations of a customer in form of referrals, complaints and retention rate (Kotler, 2015). Service Quality means the degree to which the perceptions of the customer of service were met and/or the degree to which his expectations were surpassed (Zeithaml et al., 1990). Tangibles were categorized into appearance of facility, communication and security which has been supported by a number of scholars for example, (Delgado and Ballester, 2004) who contend that the tangibility means how the surrounding areas, the facility, the machines and staff appear and how the communication is done. Tangibles mean the physical quality like facilities, equipment and personnel appearance (Parasuraman et al., 1988). Parasuraman et al., 1991 later improved the tangible definition to include quality of packaging materials and the statements there on. Reliability was categorized as dependability, providing right product at right time, Products delivered as promised and Quality (Cronin & Taylor, 1992). The reliability Service Quality means how companies carry out and complete the service they promise, quality and accuracy in a certain requirement between an organisation and the consumer. It is how a company delivers expected standard every time, handles consumer service problems and maintains an error free record. Each consumer needs to find out if their company is dependable enough and can fulfill the set requirements with satisfaction (Delgado & Ballester, 2004). Responsiveness was categorized as; willingness to help, promptness of service, competency of staff and confidentiality. Responsiveness means how willing the organisation is to assist its consumers in giving them service which is high quality and very fast. Each consumer feels more valued if he obtains the highest service quality available (Delgado and Ballester, 2004). Siew-Phaik et al., (2011)
discovered a highly positive relationship between responsiveness and satisfaction of customers. Niveen and Demyana (2013) also concur with the above. Satisfaction is usually dependent on value (ratio of perceived quality relative to price, Zeithaml, 1988) hence satisfaction is dependent on price while quality of service is not. Cumulative satisfaction of customers generally bases on the experience which is either current, past or anticipated for the future while quality of service is related to current perception of product or service of a customer. Lastly, quality is an antecedent of satisfaction of a customer (Fornell, 1992; Cronin and Taylor, 1992; Churchill and Suprenant, 1982). Valdani (2009) states that companies are in business for the reason of having customers to sell to. Competitive advantage can only be achieved by providing service which gives high quality which in the end will result into customers who are satisfied (Shem W.et al, 1998).

Available literature centers on banking and Hotel industries with limited information on the pharmaceutical industry more specifically the retail sector. This is mainly due to the fact that this is a new industry especially in Uganda and considering it is just spreading in different parts of the country, very few researchers have taken interest in it. (Valdani, 2009) This, however still seems to be a big gap as most management teams concentrate on how they perceive the expectations of the customer themselves and assume that this will satisfy the customers without knowing how the customer perceives the offered service (Churchill & Suprenant, 1982).

Research Methodology
The researcher used a cross-sectional design (Baxter, 2008; Yin, 2009; Creswell, 2013). The study population consisted of 196 Stakeholders of EPL (EPL-Marketing report, 2015). A sample size of 152 respondents was targeted in the study and issued with a questionnaire using statistical tables of Krejcie, and Morgan (1970). Simple random sampling was used. Data was collected using questionnaires (Joubish, Kharram, Ahmed, Fatima & Haider, 2011). Data was analysed qualitatively using narratives and quantitatively using descriptive statistics (Ashatu, 2009).

Presentation of Results
Response Rate
Table 1: Response Rate of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent Category</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employees</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>67.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External customers</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>80.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Branch managers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top management</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>77.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data
From table 4.1 above, it is shown that out of 152 respondents who were expected to be included in the study, only 118 representing 77.6% were able to. Since Amin (2005) asserts that 70% of the respondents give enough information for the study and this research had an overall response rate of 77.6% which is enough for the research.

Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

Gender of the Customers
Figure 1: The Sex Characteristics of the External Customers

Figure 1 above shows that 56.9% of the customers were female and 43.1% were male.

Marital Status of the Customers

Figure 2: The Marital Status of the Customers

Figure 2 above indicates that 40.8% of the customers are single, 57.7% are married and 1.4% are widowed.

Education Level of the Customers

Figure 3: The Education Level of the Customers

From figure 3 above, it was found that 61.4% had degree level of education, 21.4% and 8.6% were diploma and certificate holders respectively.

Period of being a Customer to Ecopharm

Figure 4: The Period of being a Customer at the Pharmacy

Period have been a customer
Figure 4 above indicates that 41.67% of the customers had been with the pharmacy for less than one year, 31.9% had been with the pharmacy for a period between 2-3 years. Also, 23.6% of the customers have been with the pharmacy for a period of 4-6 years and 2.78% had been with the pharmacy for more than 6 years.

**Age Group of Customers**

**Figure 5: The Age Bracket of Customers**

Figure 4.5 indicates that 18.1% were in the age bracket of 16-25 years, 40.3% of the customers were in the age bracket of 26 – 35 years, 23.6% were in the bracket of 36 – 45 years, 9.7% of customers were in the bracket of 46-55 years and those above the age of 55 years old were 8.3%.

**Empirical Findings on Service Quality and Customer Satisfaction**

**1.9.1 Tangibles and Customer Satisfaction at Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited**

**Table 2: Descriptive Statistics on Tangibles and Customer Satisfaction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not Sure</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Mean (standard Deviation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical facilities are visually appealing which attract customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>3 (4.3%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>24 (34.3%)</td>
<td>41 (58.6%)</td>
<td>4.44 (0.84)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees are always welcoming which retains more customers</td>
<td>2 (2.9%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>2 (2.9%)</td>
<td>30 (42.9%)</td>
<td>35 (50%)</td>
<td>4.36 (0.85)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees are smartly dressed which attracts customers</td>
<td>3 (4.3%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>1 (1.7%)</td>
<td>27 (38.6%)</td>
<td>38 (54.3%)</td>
<td>4.37 (0.93)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is clear signage which attracts customers</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3 (4.3%)</td>
<td>10 (14.3%)</td>
<td>15 (21.4%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>4.37 (0.89)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical location is convenient which helps retain customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>5 (7.1%)</td>
<td>2 (2.9%)</td>
<td>19 (27.1%)</td>
<td>43 (60%)</td>
<td>4.44 (1.045)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Packaging material used is attractive which attracts customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>2 (2.9%)</td>
<td>3 (4.3%)</td>
<td>26 (37.1%)</td>
<td>38 (52.9%)</td>
<td>4.443 (0.926)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am satisfied with tangibles of services</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>2 (2.8%)</td>
<td>2 (2.8%)</td>
<td>32 (45.1%)</td>
<td>34 (47.9%)</td>
<td>4.35 (0.795)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the table 2 above, it was found that only 7.1% were not in agreement with the statement that physical facilities are visually appealing while majority (92.9%) agreed with the statement. The mean score of the same response was at 4.4 which indicates that the customers were in agreement with the statement. It was further reported by majority (92.9%) that employees are always welcoming. Of these, 42.9% and 50% agreed and strongly agreed with the statement, respectively. 2.9% strongly disagreed, 1.4% disagreed while 2.9% were not sure. The mean of the response was 4.36 meaning majority of customers agreed with the statement. Concerning the dressing, 38.6% and 54.3% agreed and strongly agreed, respectively with the statement that employees are smartly dressed. However, 7.4% were not in agreement that employees are smartly dressed while 1.7% were not sure. The mean of 4.37 was obtained which means that majority of customers agreed with the statement. The result shows that 81.4% were in agreement with the same statement with 60% strongly agreeing that the signage is clear while 18.6% were not in agreement that the signage of the pharmacy is clear whereas 14.3% were not sure. The mean of the response was 4.37 which means customers agreed with the statement. Further still on the physical location, 52.9% strongly agreed and 37.1% agreed with the statement that the physical location of the pharmacy is convenient. However, 7.1% disagreed with the same statement and 2.9% were not sure. The mean of the response was 4.44 which shows a positive response to the statement. The result still shows that 52.9% strongly agreed and 37.1% agreed with the statement that packaging materials used are attractive, while 10% did not agree with the statement and 2.8% were not sure. A mean response of 4.44 was obtained hence a positive response to the statement. Majority (45.1% and 47.9%) agreed and strongly agreed, respectively that they are satisfied with the tangible services offered at the pharmacy while 4.2% disagreed and 2.8% were not sure.

Service Reliability and Customer Satisfaction at Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Limited

Table 3: Descriptive Statistics on Reliability and Customer Satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reliability Variable</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not Sure</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Mean (S.D)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Services are provided right the first time which retains customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>6 (8.6%)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>4.40 (0.823)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drugs promised are always delivered on time which retains customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>4.21 (0.899)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dispensing standard is dependable which retains customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>3 (4.5%)</td>
<td>8 (12.1%)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>4.24 (0.946)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees keep information confidential which retains customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>2 (2.8%)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4.18 (0.899)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees are honest and trustworthy which retains customers</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>4.21 (0.88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees follow through to see whether you got what you wanted which retains customers</td>
<td>2 (2.9%)</td>
<td>3 (4.3%)</td>
<td>8 (11.6%)</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4.15 (0.994)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From table 3 above, the results show that 32.9% and 55.7% agreed and strongly agreed, respectively that services are provided right the first time while 2.8% disagreed and 8.6% were not sure. The mean of the response was 4.40 which implies positive agreement with the statement. Furthermore the result shows that 31.4% and 47.1% agreed and strongly agreed, respectively that drugs promised and always delivered on time. On the other hand 18.6% were not sure and 2.8% did not agree that drugs promised are always delivered on time. The mean of 4.21 was obtained. The results show that 31.8% and 50% agreed and strongly agreed, respectively that dispensing standard is dependable. On the other hand 5.9% did not agree and those who were not sure are 12.1%. The mean of the overall response was 4.24. On confidentiality of information, 43.7% strongly agreed and 36.6% agreed that employees keep information confidential while 15.5% were not sure, 4.2% disagreed. The mean of the overall response was 4.18. Regarding honesty and trustworthiness of the employees, the results show that 45.7% and 34.3% strongly agreed and agreed, respectively that employees are honest and trustworthy. However, 17.1% were not sure while 2.8% did not agree with the same statement. The mean of the overall response was 4.21. It was further reported by the majority (81.1%) that employees follow through to see whether customers got what they want. Of these, 44.9% and 36.2% strongly agree and agreed, respectively with this statement while 11.6% were not sure and 4.3% disagreed. The mean of 4.15 was obtained. The result also showed that 52.3% agreed that pharmacy is stocked to meet their needs while 32.3% strongly agreed, 7.7% did not agree while 7.7% were not sure. The mean of the response was 4.077. Most of the customers reported to be satisfied with the reliability of the services offered. Of these, 42.3% and 46.5% composed those who strongly agreed and agreed respectively to be satisfied while 5.6% were not satisfied with the reliability of services at the pharmacy and 7% were not sure. A mean score of 4.25 (0.823) was obtained.

### Employee Responsiveness & Customer Satisfaction at Ecopharm Pharmaceuticals Descriptive Statistics on Employee Responsiveness and Customer Satisfaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Not Sure</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employees show sincere interest in solving my problems which retains customers</td>
<td>2 (2.9%)</td>
<td>3 (4.3%)</td>
<td>8 (11.4%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>27 (38.6%)</td>
<td>4.14 (0.98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responses are fulfilled as promised which retains customers</td>
<td>2 (2.8%)</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>11 (15.5%)</td>
<td>24 (33.8%)</td>
<td>33 (46.5%)</td>
<td>4.19 (0.95)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees are willing to help customers which retains customers</td>
<td>11 (15.6%)</td>
<td>10 (13.3%)</td>
<td>5 (6.7%)</td>
<td>17 (24.4%)</td>
<td>29 (40%)</td>
<td>3.60 (1.51)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees are too busy to respond to request for</td>
<td>22 (32.4%)</td>
<td>11 (16.2%)</td>
<td>7 (10.3%)</td>
<td>13 (19.1%)</td>
<td>15 (22.1%)</td>
<td>2.82 (1.59)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From table 4.15 above, the result shows that 38.6% and 42.9% of the customers were in agreement that employees show sincere interest in solving their problems. On the other hand 7.2% did not agree and 11.4% were not sure that employees show sincere interest in solving their problems. The mean of the response was 4.14 (0.98). Furthermore 46.5% and 33.8% strongly agreed and agreed respectively, that responses are fulfilled as promised while 15.5% were not sure and 4.2% did not agree with the statement. The mean of 4.19 (0.95) was obtained. Concerning employee willingness to help customer, the result shows that 40% and 24.4% strongly and agreed that employees are willing to help while 15.6% and 13.3% strongly disagreed and disagreed respectively, that employees are willing to help customers. A mean of 3.60 (1.51) was obtained from this response. The result still shows that 32.4% and 16.2% did not agree that employees are too busy to help while 22.1% and 19.1% agreed that employees are too busy to help customers while 7% were not sure. The mean of the response was 2.82 (S.D 1.59). Furthermore the result shows that 69% agreed (38% agreed and 31% strongly agreed) that customers are provided with feedback while 23.9% were not sure and 1.4% strongly disagreed that customers are provided with feedback. A mean response of 4.19 (0.95) was recorded. It was also found that 45.7% strongly agreed that they take less time while waiting to be served and 38.6% agreed with the same statement and 7.2% did not agree with the same statement and 8.7% were not sure. The mean of the response was 4.20 (S.D 0.97). The result shows that 52.2% strongly agreed and 37.7% agreed to be satisfied with the responsiveness of the service. On the other hand, 5.8% were not satisfied with the responsiveness in service delivery at the pharmacy whereas 4.3% were not sure. The overall mean of the response was 4.33 (0.92).

**Discussion of Findings**

The results show that there is no relationship between tangibles and satisfaction of customers. This is in line with scholars such as Prachyyapon & Khanchitpol (2014) that stated that the politeness and neatness usually exhibited by the uniform improved satisfaction. As stated by Delgado and Ballester (2004) the surrounding areas is a key factor to customer satisfaction. The result shows a moderate positive relationship between reliability and satisfaction of customers in EPL. These results are consistent with claims of other researchers such as Delgado & Ballester, (2004) who state that reliability is how a company delivers expected standard every time, handles consumer service problems and maintains an error-free record. They are also in line with Sharma & Stafford (2000), further stresses the dependence of consumers on employees to solve their concerns. Frei et al., 1999 further adds that quality of service must involve uniformity of service output around an ideal target value determined by customers. The above result is consistent with the findings of Harmed et al. (2015) which state that reliability has a positive effect on perceived service quality and hence satisfaction of customers. The result shows a moderate positive relationship between employee responsiveness and satisfaction of customers in EPL. These findings are in line with scholars such as Delgado & Ballester (2004) who state that responsiveness is how willing the company is willing to
assist its consumers in giving them service which is of high quality and very fast. Each consumer feels more valued if he obtains the highest service quality available. The above result is also supported by Siew Phaik et al. (1999) who discovered a positive relationship between responsiveness and satisfaction of customers. Niveen & demyana(2013) also concur. The degree of how willing or ready the staff are to give the service that the consumer requires without inconveniencing them at a certain period shall highly affect the degree of satisfaction of customers (Parasuraman et al., 1988).

Conclusion
First and foremost, tangibles have a no relationship with satisfaction of customers. Secondly the research found a positive relationship between service reliability and satisfaction of customers in EPL. Finally employee responsiveness has a positive relationship with satisfaction of customers.

Recommendations
It was recommended that EPL top management must provide enough uniforms with name tags to all its employees as soon as possible to avoid confusion of customers. Secondly, there should be restructuring of some branches by the proprietors to increase on the customer waiting area such that most of the customers can easily be comfortable in all branches as they wait to be served. Packaging materials should always be ordered on time by the accounts department and have a well calculated buffer stock and lead time to avoid their stock outs. Procurement should always make deliveries to branches in time to avoid customer disappointment. There should also be clear job descriptions given to procurement and store staff to ensure proper execution of duties by the responsible personnel. Communication systems should be put in place to enable branches share information on the available drugs so as to help in managing stock outs through sharing the stock available in different pharmacy branches and hence increase customer satisfaction. Top management must ensure that branch managers understand the different aspects of responsiveness by training them in the aspects so that they can easily mentor their teams in the same. More staff should be recruited by top management to reduce on the workload and waiting time and this will lead to both customers and employees, satisfaction. In addition, the newly recruited staff should be trained on customer care by top management identifying customer care experts to do in order to improve the level of customer care. The company should also recruit customer care managers so as to enable the few technical employees to concentrate on their work while the issues related to customer complaints are handled by the customer relations manager.

References


An Evaluation of the effects of Tax Administration Reforms on Revenue Performance: The case of Uganda Revenue Authority

1Joel Emojong, 2Joseph Oonyu & 3Maria K. Barifaijo
1,2Uganda Management Institute
2Makerere University
Corresponding E-mail: jjemojong@yahoo.com / Tel. 256-772-590-557

Abstract
The literature and conventional wisdom expects that tax administrations reforms will affect the revenue performance, but little is known about the rationale of these tax administration reforms how they were instituted and how they affect revenue performance. This paper therefore examines the effects of tax administration reforms on revenue performance. Literature review and documentary analysis were used to elicit information about tax administration reforms, and especially their cascading to the Uganda Revenue Authority (URA). The paper established that URA is the main product of tax administration reforms in Uganda and was created to collect the much needed government revenues which the traditional Ministry of Finance had failed to do. With the support of government and the adherence to its legal mandate, the URA have used the allotted resources to empower the human resources, improved on its structure, infrastructure, processes, systems and have cultivated the confidence of taxpayers whose compliance has increased revenue performance but not to the extent of fully financing the government budgets. The article builds on the systems approach where the URA as a sub system of government tailors its goals towards achieving the government’s goal of fully finding its budget. In this regard the article recommends the URA and government to continue adopting changes that will further enhance revenue performance to meet the ever expanding government budgets.

Key words: Tax Administration Reforms, Revenue Performance, Compliance, Uganda Revenue Authority

Introduction
The need for improved tax administrations to increase the contribution of tax revenue to Gross Domestic Product (GDP) has been an issue of concern by scholars, governments, economists and international organizations for the last two decades or so. Whereas developed countries have greatly benefited from efficient tax administrations due to tax administration reforms, developing countries like Uganda have been bedeviled by enormous administrative constraints in human resources, and increasing tax evasion, and tax avoidance among others. Notwithstanding the prevalence of the socio economic and political downturns of the 1970’ and 1980’ these factors are believed to have greatly contributed to the poor revenue collections that plunged the country into a viscous cycle of economic dependence. Having recourse to tax administration reforms policies of the developed countries could be a recipe to overcoming these challenges (Kangave, 2005).

Aside of the various reforms Uganda government has implemented with the aim of transforming the economy and enhancing economic growth and development, the notable one was the establishment of Uganda Revenue Authority in 1991. The ethos of creating a tax authority-URA- like it was the case earlier in Ghana, was to improve tax administration and guarantee efficiency in revenue collections that would fully finance government development and recurrent budgets (Kwagala, 2015; Gill, 2003: Fjeldstad and Moore, 2009). The creation of URA would result into positive changes in tax collections as was the case with the pioneer countries that had reformed their tax administrations. This is apparently justified by the OECD data which posits that tax to GDP ratios in sub Saharan countries where tax reforms were implemented increased to a substantially high ratio of 16.8% of GDP (OECD, 2011).
However in spite of this drastic and bold legislative decision of the government of Uganda to create the URA, little is known about whether this reform in tax administration has impacted on the revenue performance. This paper therefore evaluates the effects of tax administration reforms on the revenue performance using URA as a case study. Premised on the post positivistic research paradigm and qualitative research methodology, a literature search coupled with document analysis was used to obtain the information and facts about tax administration reforms, URA and revenue performance in Uganda. The first part of this paper discusses the theoretical overview, conceptual background, the statement of the problem, research questions and the methodology adopted to elicit information on the subject. The next and last part is the literature review followed by a discussion of the findings, conclusion and recommendations.

**Theoretical Overview**

The thinking in this paper is guided by the systems approach which is considered to be the most appropriate in managing changes (Brown, 2006) and it is relevant in this case because tax administration is viewed as a system changing from being managed under traditional bureaucratic civil service administration to the models and principles of new public management (NPM) (Hood, 1991). This paper portrays that entities like the URA are systems because they contain an assembly of small and distinct parts, such as departments which can be fitted largely for analysis and studied in isolation. It is therefore possible to abstract knowledge of the URA being a smaller and distinct entity of the government of Uganda than to abstract it from the entire system of Uganda. By using the systems approach the paper intends to view the country in terms of irreducibly integrated systems. It focuses attention on the understanding of revenue performance in Uganda through the complex interrelationship among the URA and its constituent parts.

The change that culminated into the URA juxtaposes that unlike in the traditional tax administration under Ministry of Finance (MOF), the chief executive of the URA should view the organization in its totality and as part of the wider external environment which includes the tax payers, the government, partners of government and other stake holders. This could imply that the chief executive of the URA has to shift from functioning within the organization chart of the traditional tax administration under the then MOF to an integrated system of administration where the various units and departments align their goals to the overall goal of the entire organization which should be in tandem with the government goal of generating central government revenue that fully finances its budgets.

**Conceptual Background**

This paper conceptualizes tax administration to mean the technocratic structure of the URA that is mandated and involves itself in the planning, budgeting, organizing, coordinating and making decisions on all the URA resources and activities to achieve the goal for which it was created. It is purposed to be a tool of collecting enough revenue to fully finance the government’s budget, and also a means of increasing the tax to GDP ratio and check on the disparities between the rich and the poor (Gill, 2003). It is a system whose interrelated parts and pillars are constituted by URA management, departments, staff, tax policies, systems, processes and infrastructure. Reforms in tax administration therefore should be viewed in terms of changes in these sub parts that should lead to improvements in the management of the allotted financial resources for the generation of more revenue.

This paper conceives revenue performance to mean the increase or decline in revenue collections across all tax heads as a consequence of tax registration and assessment. This conceptualization is derived from the Uganda tax laws which allude to corporate income tax, Pay as You Earn (PAYE), Value Added Tax (VAT),
and Customs duties and fees, which are the sources of domestic and international taxation that is administered by URA (Tax Acts caps. 348 and 349; East African Management Act 2004). In this regard improved revenue performance would be a result of improved tax compliance where the tax administration has put in place a conducive environment with which the tax payers comply with their tax obligations.

**Contextual Background**

Uganda’s poor tax administration under the then traditional public service MOF was a big concern to the government of Uganda because it was perceived to be the main reason for the meager revenue collections that impacted negatively on economic growth and development (Kangave, 2005). While it could be argued that the political and economic instability that engulfed the country from the 1970’s to the mid 1980’s could not give an environment for the promotion of institutional growth and development, the liberalized economic environment and the freezing of political strife by the National Resistance Movement (NRM) government in 1986, seem not to have provided the immediate remedy to poor revenue performance. This is because the productivity challenges in the MOF continued to manifest since the revenue collections were only 4.8% tax to GDP in 1986, and stood at a paltry 5% tax to GDP up to 1990 (Chen and Reinkka, 1999; Kayiwa, 2016).

The creation of the URA by an act of parliament in 1991 was the main tax administration reform in Uganda which gave the agency semi autonomy and mandate to collect central tax revenue (URA Code, 1991; Bahemuka, 2012). Although the euphoria in the government and people of Uganda was evident because of the hope that this agency was going to be the solution and measure to forestall efficiency in revenue collections, not so much seem to have been realized in the early years of its operations. This is because collections from 1996 to 2002 were on average 5% below the URA target as shown in appendix 1, in addition to the high corruption and mismanagement which necessitated an inquiry in which Justice Ssebutinde Commission reported the existence of major administrative deficiencies which needed streamlining (URA, 2007; Emojong, 2018; Bahemuka, 2012).

It is apparent from the subsequent government legislations that government was proactive enough and absolved the institution from its early constraints by making other reforms to foster its ability to meet its legal mandate. VAT was introduced in 1996 replacing Sales Tax (ST) and Commercial Transaction Levy (CTL) in order to remove rigidities and double taxation on consumption of goods and services. In addition a new Income Tax Act was also enacted in 1997 to streamline the payment of direct taxes (Kayiwa, 2016). According to Emojong (2018) restructuring of the URA was also implemented in 2004 as a reform within the major tax administration reform in order to reinvigorate the institution’s’ capacity to increase on its productivity. This suggests that there has been a continued interplay between the government of Uganda, the URA and its stakeholders to ensure that the URA is given a favorable environment to deliver on its mandate of improving on the collection of central government revenue.

Much as the governments’ continued initiatives to provide the URA with the necessary hygiene factors to enable it promote efficiency, literature and URA data do not suggest a commensurate improvement in revenue performance. Just as Fjelstad and Moore (2009) argue that the reforms that gave birth to tax agencies in the Sub-Saharan African countries have not made a substantial impact on revenue performance, the URA data shows that much as revenue was growing, the revenue targets were not being consistently met, arrears portfolios were on the rise up to 9% of target collection in 2015/16; the tax to GDP ratios was stagnating at 13%, and there was high budget deficiting (Tumuhimbishi, 2000; URA, 2015; Agaba and
This suggests that not much is known about how the tax administration reforms that led into the creation of URA have affected revenue performance. It is critical to fill this gap in the knowledge of tax administration reforms and revenue performance in order to avoid the pitfalls of inefficient tax administrations which are presumed to have been responsible for meager tax collections and poor service delivery, apprehensive citizens and collapse of governments (Bird and Milka, 1992; Savic, et al, 2015).

**Problem Statement**

Many developing countries have reformed tax administrations with a view of improving revenue performance (Bird and Milka, 1992; Kangave, 2005; Fjeldstad and Moore, 2009). It is believed that divesting revenue administration to semi autonomous revenue authorities like URA would remove the cancer of inefficiency, ineffectiveness and corruption of employees that had bedeviled the then traditional Ministry of Finance that used to collect tax revenues in Uganda (Bahemuka, 2012; Wiegratz, 2009). There were high hopes within URA that Uganda government would be enabled to fully finance her recurrent and development budget when the revenue collections improve to the tune of a tax to GDP ratio of 16% by 2012 (URA, 2010). Over twenty five years after its inception, URA has so far achieved the highest tax to GDP ratio of 14% which is much lower than the 20% average achieved by other East Africa and sub Saharan countries, (Tumuhimbise, 2000; URA, 2015). Although the performance has changed from a paltry tax to GDP ratio of 5% in the early 1990s to 14% in 2018, it is still not sufficient to finance the government’s budgets and suggests that not much is known about the performance journey of the URA to date. As a result it is presumed that sufficient revenue cannot be generated by the tax administration and so government is prompted to continue relying on external support to finance her budget which is detrimental to the country’s economic and political independence (Bird and Milka, 1992; Savic et al, 2015; Wiegratz, 2009).

**Research Questions**

The authors of this paper therefore sought to find answers to the following questions- 1-why was it necessary to initiate tax administration reforms in Uganda? 2. What were the main tax administration reforms in Uganda? 3.How have the tax administration reforms impacted on employee performance? 4. How have the reforms impacted on revenue collections?

**Methodology**

This paper premised on the post positivistic paradigms and was majorly based on literature review and is qualitative in nature. Literature review was done with a view of establishing what is available that is related to tax administration reforms and revenue performance issues. A documentary analysis was also used to complement and corroborate with the literature review sourced data. It was adopted because it is relevant to this case study and it exposed the researchers to a variety of documents such as tables, written reports, newspapers and artifacts. These were used to corroborate arguments raised by other scholars in the literature reviewed since they are considered a valuable method of collecting information (Yin, 2009; Bowen, 2009). The literature review and documents analyses were carried out along the thematic areas derived from the specific questions of the study.

**Literature Review**

**Need for Tax Administration Reforms**
Throughout the 1980s and 1990s, there has been a grappling need among developing countries to raise tax revenues that can fully finance their capital and recurrent budgets (Wiegratz, 2009; Ricciuti and Sen, 2019). This in turn has underscored the importance of having very efficient and effective tax administrations whose mandate is to implement the ever changing fiscal policies of governments (Sanjay et al, 2007; Mugume, 2014). Just as Drucker (1974) a renowned management consultant considers them to be the key agencies of government in the enhancement of revenue collection, their efficiency can be actualized when the constituent parts of these agencies involve the administrations of both domestic and international taxes, as well as the government and taxpayers in the enhancement of its functions (Gill, 2003). This implies that the success of an efficient tax administration as the URA was purposed to be, lies in a system of interrelationship of the various departments and stakeholders who ought to hold onto the one goal for which that tax administration was set up.

The need for efficient tax administrations has been a topic of concern to scholars, economists, policy makers and the general public for a long time (Bird and Milka, 1992; World Bank, 2018). This was in view of the ever growing population, technological innovations, and industrialization, and multilateral and multinational trade which continuously triggered increases in governments’ budgets. This suggests that tax institutions that are charged with the task of collecting government revenue must reflect the highest levels of skills among their workforce, should have the legal authority to manage and implement tax policies, besides prioritizing the structure, placement of systems, processes and infrastructure that make it conducive for tax payers to voluntarily comply. This could be the litmus test of efficiency in tax administration through which a country can generate the sufficient tax revenue.

A country that fails to generate enough tax revenue will likely have to depend on donor support and bear the consequences of dependence on foreign aid and low quality governance among others (Tahseem and Eatzzaz, 2010; Bahemuka, 2012; Mugume, 2014). Scholars have cautioned that such aid reduces a country’s incentives to extract domestic revenue (Moore, 1998) because such donors always attach economic and political strings on every financial aid that they give. This therefore makes the fostering of efficiency in tax administration an undeniable need for the independence of any country.

Unfortunately, most tax administrations in developing countries were inefficient because of the poor and rigid tax administration in which the planning, and implementation of the tax laws disregarded the principles of equity in tax assessments and collection. (Mujtaba and Mick, 2016; Wiegratz, 2009). This means that their administration techniques were incongruent with the changing environment in which modern business was being carried out. One would wonder how an ever increasing population would learn about their tax obligations, let alone being able to make distinctions of one taxpayer from another and making timely accountabilities. Worst still documents from government of Uganda data suggest that the low staff skills levels coupled with political interference had crippled tax administration system in the MOF (GOU, 2010). This state of affairs perilously destroyed the tax administration system to the extent that the revenue collected in 1986 was only 4.8% of GDP and still at a paltry 5% tax to GDP ratio by 1990 (Chen and Reinkka, 1999). This was an intolerable state of affairs which was a demonstration of near to total failure to collect enough revenue for the growth and development of the country hence plunging it into the doom of economic dependence (Bahemuka, 2012).

The failed tax administrations and their inherent inefficiencies were not privy to Uganda alone. According to Bird and Milka, (1992), the Bolivias situation was worse because their President Hernan Siles Suazo had to resign in 1985 due to the hard economic and political pressure resulting from the meager revenue
performance valued at 1% of GDP. It is believed that these factors among others prompted tax administration reforms which the government of Uganda also pursued through the legislation which created the URA in 1991 (OECD, 2011; Fjeldstad and Rakna, 2003). Whereas it may be presumed that this government shift in tax administration was meant to forestall economic and political stability, its trickledown effect would without doubt foster accountability and responsibility in the country.

There is a plethora of literature to justify the need for tax administration reforms in Uganda and other African countries because they have been regarded for some time now as pillars of efficiency and effectiveness in tax administrations as well as economic and political independence of countries. Drucker, (1974) and Fjeldstad and Rakna (2003) argue that effectiveness of governments is achievable through tax administration reforms because it gives autonomy and accountability to managers of tax organizations so that they can serve the interest of the economy and society better. Dwivedi (1998) also vouches for tax administration reforms because they can minimize the bottlenecks caused by the tax avoidance and evasion schemes of multinational corporations. Besides these, other scholars have professed that the need for tax administration reforms has more than ever been dictated by globalization and the internet age which have compelled all types of organizations to change their ways of doing business (Brown, 2006). It can be inferred from this literature that tax administration reforms have positive effects to performance of businesses and are presumed the underlying rationale for the transformation of the administration of public service institutions geared towards better service delivery.

**URA as the main Tax Administration Reform in Uganda**

There is a consensus in the literature that the creation of URA in 1991 by the URA Statute, number 6, 1991 was the main tax administration reform made by the government of Uganda (Magumba, 2015; Mugume, 2014; Bahemukaa, 2012). URA data concurs with scholars who have affirmed that URA was established as a body corporate with an independent management board, under the general supervision of the Ministry of Finance (URA, 2005; URA, 2005, 2012). These documents suggest that it was purposed to function as an agency of the government for the collection of and accounting for all government tax revenue. Furthermore it was to provide operational autonomy in revenue collection and enable the evolution of a more modern, flexible, and adaptable and integrated revenue collection agency. According to URA (1997, 2005b, 2007a, 2010) URA’s first mission was to maximize central tax revenue while optimizing resources utilization by ensuring a fair and equitable tax administration with a highly motivated and professional staff; and attaining a tax to GDP ratio of 16%. The institution’s bulletin, URA (2005a), and Kenya Revenue Authority (2010) affirm that revenue authorities were created as a modern model of governance which is semi autonomous and has a high degree of flexibility to manage revenue collection effectively and efficiently (Mutambi, 2004). This suggests that the essence of the reform was to provide managers of the new institution with the financial resources and empower them to hire and develop a caliber of human resource to deliver the required standards of performance to yield the revenue required by government.

According to Kayiwa (2016) the government of Uganda initiated other reforms to engender the revenue performance of the URA. This was done through the introduction of VAT in 1996 to replace ST and CTL that were a source of double taxation in the consumption of goods and services. A new income tax Act was also enacted in 1997 to streamline the assessment and collection of corporate income taxes, PAYE and other fees. According to URA documents, these reforms created a conducive environment for the URA management which recruited, developed and sustained a caliber of staff who catapulted the organization performance from a tax to GDP ratio of 4.8% in 1986 to 11.9% in 1999/00 (URA, 2005,2007). Whereas
these positive changes in revenue performance cannot directly be attributed solely to improved administration due to insufficient research in this area, the case of Argentina could be used as a benchmark because there is empirical evidence to show that a portion of the rise of tax to GDP ratio from 13% to 20% between 1989 and 1990 was attributed to improved tax administration (Kangave, 2005).

That notwithstanding, because every institution has leaps and bounds, it is not a surprise that the existing data reveals that the URA management became a subject of concern in the early 2000 due to poor revenue performance (URA, 2007a). According to URA data, (URA, 2007a), URA had issues of low productivity between 1996 and 2002 since her revenue collections were on average 5% below target in addition to the worrying reports of corruption, and mismanagement. These factors were responsible for the next major reform in tax administration in 2004/5. According to Emojong (2004), the government of Uganda decided to do a major restructuring of the institution in 2004. Emojong (2018) also opines that the restructuring was meant to reinvigorate the institution, redeem its image and put it back on course so that the needed revenue was collected to meet the increasing demands of the citizenry. URA documentary data explains that the new reform involved overhaul of the entire management from the board of directors to the top management as well as the operations staff (URA, 2007b, 2010). These changes would unequivocally and undoubtedly require the new board of directors, management and their teams to initiate new strategies that would result into the anticipated changes of the government and tax payers.

The research done by Kagambirrwe (2014) on Uganda tax policy reforms affirms that due to the restructuring of the URA, the institution realized a steady growth in revenue performance. These findings are in agreement with the past literature in which Gill, (2003) had suggested that any serious efforts to reduce corruption and malpractices in management of tax collections in all likelihood has to deal with reforms in tax administration (Tahseem and Eatzaz, 2010). This suggests that the main tax administration reform that gave birth to URA and the subsequent reforms initiated by government and the URA were expected inter alia to enhance revenue performance and stop corruption.

It goes without saying that the success of any government program should be likened to journeys involving both good and bad experiences from which to learn. This implies that the URA journey towards meeting its legal mandate may not just be understood in terms of a litany or even a profile of what it has come to be at a particular time. From the time the revenue performance improved to 11.9% in 1999/00 and later stagnating at 13% up to 2015/16, it signifies that the understanding of and achieving revenue performance is a process involving the various aspects of the reforms.

Kayiwa (2016) corroborates the URA data by providing an illustration of the URA journey in terms of tax administration reforms which have led into positive profile of the revenue performance journey from 2005. Kayiwa narrates that the URA implemented various initiatives including a focus on administrative efficiency to ensure better compliance; rationalization of the tax structure and rates, widening of the tax base, reducing tax exemptions and simplifying tax procedures to reduce tax burden and improve on compliance. This intimates the URA documented data positing that the URA reforms included the introduction of tax identification number (TIN) as a single identifier of tax payers, and the automation of systems and processes in VAT, income tax and customs which were implemented in order to make it easy for tax payers to comply. These URA initiatives which include the recently completed 23 storied offices building meant to improve on service delivery, are likened to those of the similar tax authorities studied by the World Bank (World Bank, 2018a; Larubi, 2018)). One can deciphered from these initiatives that the tax administration reforms leading into the creation of the URA in 1991 were not a means to an end, but
just the beginning of the process. This could explain why URA seems to have kept on creating and recreating itself with a view of developing its human and other resources in order to fulfil its widening mandate.

**Tax Administration Reforms and Employee Performance in the URA**

There is evidence from the literature to suggest that the contemporary increasing demands of the ever growing population world over has orchestrated the need for increased productivity of employees in all sectors (Emojong, 2018). This has subsequently pressured public institutions world over to maintain an efficient workforce at all times in order to guarantee increased productivity (Armstrong, 2005; Ghosh, 2011). Nevertheless, it is a hazardous and expensive task for the managers of public institutions in Africa like the URA to have the right caliber of employees with the right competences needed to propel the needed high productivity. This is because of the mismatch between the output from the current formal education system from where employees are sought and the competence requirements of the workplaces (Ssemwogerere, 2000; Wiegratz, 2009). It suggests that most of the employees in such public institutions are products of the traditional formal education system which does not prepare graduates with the competences needed at the workplaces.

Whereas, the United Nations advises the public sector organizations to always have employees who reflect the level of skills in order to meet the growing demands of the citizenry, this would only be possible with managers who have the resources to hire, train, retain, and fire their workforce (Rosenbaum, 2015). Human resources experts have advised managers to rout for various methods of retaining employees as a means of sustaining the productivity as well as the life of the institutions (Hearthfield, 2019). In the case of URA, the management seem to have been foresighted by opting for the training of staff as a major strategy to provide employees with the requisite competences at the workplaces (URA, 2007b). This should have been done in pursuance of the requirement of the human resource management manual which, provides for and obliges all employees to undertake training for their individual as well as organizational development (URA, 2007b). The excerpts from the URA records, portray that good human resource practices were initiated to enhance the efficiency of the available human resources (URA, 2012). This must have been done in order to obtain the benefits of training and development that existing literature has reckoned to be a preferred determinant of efficiency of the human resources (Armstrong, 2014).

In its quest to improve on the efficiency of the human resources, Magumba (2015) has affirmed that the URA initiated and implemented a number of human resources development transformation drives through which employee’s abilities were enhanced to manage the business automation systems of e tax, Ascuyda, World, Raddex, Electronic tracking system (ECTS), intranet, HRMS, and infrastructural development. There is also empirical data from a research on in service training at the URA in which Emojong (2004) established that the training programs offered by the URA for the staff development have a significantly positive relationship with the employee productivity. In a recent study on competence based education and workers’ productivity in the URA Emojong (2018) further established a positive relationship between competence based education-the approach used during the training- and employee productivity. Emojong specifically found out that the URA has a human resource development and training policy which is implemented through competence based education for all employees. The training that uses such approach has been reckoned for producing graduates with the competences that match the needs of the work places, and no wonder the study findings confirmed that the competences the graduates obtained were related to their job roles. Emojong therefore concluded that the employees were able to optimize the use of the
available resources and increased revenue collections, reduced costs of collections and improved on the quality of registrations, assessments and collections. This suggests that the tax administration reforms that led into the URA provided the management of the new institution with the authority to use the financial resources provided by the MOF for among others employee development which in turn impacts positively on their performance in terms of registrations, assessments and collections.

How Tax Administration Reforms have impacted on Revenue Performance

The challenges in conceptualizing revenue performance as a quantitative or qualitative phenomena (Hale, 2004), administrative efficiency (Schwella, 1996) or measure of tax to GDP ratio (Gill, 2003) are as challenging in the understanding of how the revenue performance accruing from tax reforms or any other initiatives can specifically be measured. This paper adopts all the forms of conceptualization in order to provide a holistic description of how tax administration reforms have impacted on revenue performance in Uganda.

Literature suggests that the performance of tax collecting institutions prior to the 1990’s was astonishingly low (Wiegratz, 2009). The MOF in whose docket the revenue collections were administered in Uganda managed to collect only up to 5% of GDP by 1990 (Chen and Reinkka, 1999; URA 2005a; Bahemuka, 2012). Much as the political strife and economic instability that had engulfed the country in the 1970’s and 80’s could explain these meager collections, the hopes of Ugandans that the new government of NRM would provide better services were thwarted and would inevitably drive the government into external borrowing and thus spiraling economic dependence. The government’s initiatives to reform the economy in the 1990’s with the enactment of the URA Statute number 6 of 1991 could have been a response to the poor revenue performance.

There is evidence from the literature to suggest that reforming tax administration has positively impacted on revenue performance. According to Drucker (1974) the focus of these reforms was to simplify tax procedures, enhance flexibility, address incidences of corruption and enhance the integrity of tax systems and processes. As conventional wisdom would have it, the creation of URA in Uganda, Kenya Revenue Authority (KRA) in Kenya, Tanzania Revenue Authority (TRA) in Tanzania, and Rwanda Revenue Authority (RRA) in Rwanda at different times were meant to transform the tax administrations that would cultivate the confidence of the tax payers who would voluntarily comply. There is literature and data to suggest that the URA has made significant improvements in revenue collections (KRA, 2010). URA data posits that revenue performance increased to 6.9% tax to GDP in 1992, then steadily grew to 11.9% in 1999/00 and to 13% in 2006/07 (Tumusiime, 2000; URA, 2010). Kagambirwe (2014) also affirms that URA made steady growth in revenue after restructuring in 2004/05 because in 2014/15 Financial Year it posted a record of 101.5% revenue collection making it the highest revenue surplus of 139.01 billion Uganda shillings in the lifetime of the institution. Ladu (2018) further acknowledges the positive changes in the URA collections by affirming that the revenue performance in the URA picked up over the four years from 2014/15 with an average collection of 1 trillion Uganda shillings per month and tax to GDP ratio improving from 12% to 14% by the end of 2017/18.

In as much as increases in revenue collections would suggest improvements in revenue performance, it may be misleading to assume that such increases were solely attributable to tax administration, or even to think the increases are absolute in qualitative and quantitative terms. In the first instance, these revenue increases are not sufficient enough to support the country’s development (World Bank, 2018b; Sserunjogi, 2018;
According to Fjelstad and Moore (2009), tax reforms have not made significant effects on revenue performance in the Sub Saharan countries. In the case of Uganda, Sserunjogi has also argued that whereas the tax body has recorded persistent growth in its net collections over the last decade, it has also consistently fallen short of its ambitious revenue targets in the financial years 2013/14 to 2016/17 thereby creating a significant impact on the financing of public services. The World Bank report 2018, further notes that inefficiencies in tax administration in the URA is still a bottleneck to tax compliance. It can be subsumed from these findings that the URA has not yet achieved the efficiency and effectiveness envisioned in the major and other tax administration reforms.

Secondly, the subsumed increases in revenue collections may also be a consequence of macro-economic factors and discoveries like the oil discovery in Uganda where URA collected over 1 trillion Uganda shillings in capital gains tax in the financial year 2012/13 (Mubiru, 2017). Moreover, scholars have adduced evidence of the interplay of such factors as changes in business activity, restrictions to trade that have been proven to impact positively or negatively on economic reforms and subsequently revenue performance (Ssonko, 2010; Wiegratz, 2009; Shaikh, 2010; Kolter, and Armstrong, 2004). In the absence of empirical data, these factors would appear to significantly contribute to changes in economic growth and also revenue performance.

However, the quagmire in understanding the extent to which tax administration and other factors influence revenue performance can be deciphered from research findings. The tax authority of Argentina is a case in point providing empirical evidence to show that a portion of the rise of tax to GDP ratio from 13% to 20% between 1989 and 1990 was attributed to tax administration reforms. This therefore provides an undoubtable evidence that where reforms are effected in tax administration like it was done in the creation of the URA, revenue performance would inevitably improve. The quantum leaps in the revenue of the URA could also be explained by the work outputs of well trained workers. This is because it is argued that trained workers can optimize production which is not only measured by the amounts of revenues collected but also through their accurate identification of increasing number of eligible taxpayers, raising more tax assessments, making more optimal and timely collections as well as optimizing resource usage (Klu, 2004; Collins, 2007; Bird, 2004; Deeks, 2007; Moore, 2004). Whereas Emojong (2018) research findings specify productivity outputs measures of the URA in terms of quantities and quality of registrations, assessments and collections, others have analyzed them in terms of input output ratios of labor and amounts collected (EACE, 2012). This composite analysis of the revenue performance is more vivid in the reviewed literature. The literature has pointed out that even when the URA had a thin staff in the field with a staff to population ratio of 0.06, the lowest in the East African Community countries from 2008/09 to 2011/12, the revenue to staff ratio it achieved was high in the same period as it increased at 1.3% compared to other revenue authorities that increased at 1.0%. (Emojong, 2018; EACE, 2012; Magumba, 2015). This confirms that the understanding of revenue performance should take into account a number of measures that should not be limited to either tax to GDP ratio, or amounts of money, but include numbers of registrations, assessments as well as reductions in resource utilization for it to be comprehensive enough. Likewise, the effects of tax administration reforms should not be limited to changes in the tax to GDP ratios or even amounts of tax collected, instead it should cover all the outputs of the employees of the tax body.
Summary of the Literature and Conclusion:

The need for Tax Administration Reforms has been dictated by:

1. Developing countries had failed to raise enough revenues to finance their budgets for most of the 1970’s and 80’s because of inefficient tax administrations.

2. The poor and insufficient revenue collections had plunged the governments into the crisis and doom of economic dependence and political disrespect.

3. Globalization and technological explosion dictated all organizations including tax administrations to change their ways of doing business by changing structure, the human resources, the systems and processes to enhance revenue collections.

4. Tax administration reforms were thus regarded a panacea for the problems of efficiency in tax administration and economic development.

Uganda Revenue Authority

1. URA constitutes the major tax administration reform in Uganda by an act of parliament in 1991.

2. URA appears to operate under the auspices of new public management in which the managers are given the resources to manage and deliver the results.

3. URA seems to have used this semi-autonomous authority to plan, organize, coordinate, budget and make decisions geared towards achieving its mandate of collecting central government revenue to finance government budgets.

4. Government has facilitated the URA through the enactment of the VAT act 1996, the Income Tax 1997, and amended the Customs laws to enhance flexibility and ease the administration of tax by the URA.

5. Restructuring of URA was done in 2004/5 in order to forestall its image after a trail of issues of corruption and mismanagement. This restructuring reinvigorated the institution.

6. The URA has provided operational autonomy in revenue collection and enabled the evolution of a more modern, flexible, and adaptable and integrated revenue collection functionality.

7. Consequently modern systems and processes were developed in addition to the human resources and infrastructural developments that have been continuous. These appear to have in turn led to increasing revenue performance from a paltry 5% in the early 1990s to 13% of GDP in 2016/17.

Tax Reforms and Employee Performance

1. In order to obtain, maintain and sustain a workforce with relevant competences the URA reformed its Human Resources (HR) by initiating and implementing training programs and human resource practices to equip their employees with requisite competences.
2. Research done in the URA indicates that the human resource practices such as in service training, and competence based education have a significantly positive relationship with employee productivity.

Tax Administration Reforms and Revenue Performance

1. Revenue performance was astonishingly low to the tune of 4.8% of GDP in 1986 and was too meager to finance government budget and plunged the country into economic dependence.

2. Following the creation of URA in 1991, revenue performance started making progress with collections of 6.9% of GDP in 1992, and rose further to 11.9 in 1999/00 and catapulted further to 13% of GDP for most of 2001/2 to 2015/16 and finally to its highest so far of 14 in 2018/19.

3. Performance improvements have also been recorded in registrations, assessments, and cost reductions implying that revenue performance should be understood not merely as changes in amounts of money collected and tax to GDP ratios but also in terms of the registrations, tax assessments and cost reductions employees make in their day to day activities.

4. However the revenue collections of the URA are still not sufficient in fully financing the government budget.

Discussion

The post independent governments of Uganda depended on the traditional public service MOF to collect its central government revenue from the 1960’s to the 1980’s. Much as the prevalence of civil strife and economic down turns in the 1970’s and 1980’s is perceived not have buttressed a big source of revenue (Stewart, 2001), the amounts that were collected by this ministry were too meager to finance the existing budgets. With the emerging technological advancements, internationalization of trade, and explosion of populations it became obvious that the traditional bureaucratic revenue administration techniques became void, and inadequate and needed urgent change. Therefore the need for reforms in tax administration was a consequence of internal and external factors.

Internally, there was the traditional tax administration of the MOF which based on the bureaucratic red tape to collect tax from a society that had become sophisticated with increasing tax evasion and avoidance. This was coupled with increasing government budgets prompted by an ever increasing population. Externally, there was also the technological advancement and the internet evolution which reduced turnaround time in business as well as making communications and payments fast and simple. The interplay among these factors would without doubt require a change in the administration of tax in terms of its structure, infrastructure, human resources, systems and processes.

It was therefore inescapable that the tax administration reforms were the long awaited solution to the decayed traditional rigid tax administration. Since old habits take long to cease, a blend between old administration practices with those of modern management under the auspices of NPM would suffice. Achieving this transition would require new legislation to provide the mandate to an agency which would operate as a system with many constituent parts handling different functions all of which gearing towards achieving the common goal of revenue collection. This is keeping with the reviewed literature on efficiency of tax administrations in which Gill (2003) argues that an efficient tax administration should have departments for direct, indirect and international taxes and have mutual working relationship with all
stakeholders for the common goal of achieving the mandate of the tax collecting institution. This argument concurs with empirical findings from the researches on URA structure in which Emojong (2018) found that the URA top executive, works without any inflexibility with different commissioners and staff from different departments to execute the URA functions of registration, assessment and collection. Through this mutual working relationships the various teams would create a synergy of personnel that would collect all the taxes that should be collected.

However the URA having been a product of political legislation, it could not avoid the infiltration and influence of political interests from within and outside. This could explain why it is argued that corruption skyrocketed and management malpractices also boomeranged in the institution to the extent that government instituted a commission of enquiry to establish their ferocity and recommended remedies (URA, 2007a, 2010). The major restructuring of the URA in 2004/5 should have been a timely response to the rot and is considered to have reinvigorated the institution whose performance took a positive direction from then to 2017/18 where the revenue performance improved to a tax to GDP ratio of 14%. That notwithstanding protests against some tax legislations like the VAT Act in 1996, the controversial social media tax introduced in the 2017/18 financial year as well as the political skirmishes in the neighboring countries of the Democratic Republic of Congo and Southern Sudan have somehow halted and delayed or caused a decline in revenue collection (Kulabako, 2019; Sserunjogi, 2018). This suggests that the good system of tax administration that was envisioned in the URA Statue of 1991 would be realized when the institution always cushions itself against such shortcomings in its bid to achieve its goal. Be that as it may, the policy makers may inadvertently or without remorse pursue contradictory goals and actions so long as the consequences of these actions cushion them and maintain them in their political positions.

Notwithstanding the likelihoods of these political misnomer the URA data affirms that internal and external pressures and hindrances did not distract the institution from its course of providing efficiency in revenue collections. The data analysis of Ladu (2018) adjudges that URA’s efficiency is unquestionable at least in terms of positive changes in revenue collection. He provides profiles of revenue performance statistics which indicate that revenue increased from 6% of GDP in 1992 to 11.9% in 1999/00 and to 14% in 2017/18. This performance could superficially be understood to mean that there is positive linear relationship between changes in tax administration and revenue performance. This is however far from concluding that there is a cause and effect relationship between tax administration reforms and revenue performance because recent literature suggests that other than engendering methods of tax assessments and collection, it has by far not caused a significant impact on revenue performance (Fjeldstad and Moore, 2004; OCD, 2011).

The likelihood of a probable cause and effect relationship occurring between tax administration reforms and revenue performance as adduced from the Argentina case lie on how the human resources are managed by tax authorities. It is imperative that organizations such as tax authorities that operate in the contemporary socio economic environment influenced by technological and population explosions, focus attention on obtaining, developing and maintaining the right human resources in order to remain competitive (Ghosh, 2011). It appears from the documentary analysis that the URA initiated viable human resource practices that have been responsible for molding and harnessing efficiency and effectiveness of the human resource. This in keeping with the consensus among scholars that the human resources are the critical assets whose development leads to individual worker as well as institutional productivity (Armstrong, 2007; Maicibi, 2013). This therefore juxtaposes not only a linear but a cause and effect relationship between the good human resource practices implemented by the URA and the revenue performance.
The positive linear and cause and effect relationships between the URA human resource practices and revenue performance suffice in affirming that the creation of URA in 1991 as the major tax administration reform appears to have been a worthy legislation that provided authority and autonomy to the institution managers to manage the financial resources and other resources for purposes of collecting tax revenues that would fully finance the government budgets. The reviewed literature suggests that the URA administration focused attention on continuous staff development through relevant training in order to match the employee competences with the requirements of their job roles (Dubois, et al, 2010; Ghosh, 2011; Drucker, 2007; Maicibi, 2013). This positive administrative measure is in congruence with the human resource experts who advocate for human resource development as a means of enabling employees handle the changing tasks of their job roles in the ever changing work environment (Armstrong, 2014; Ghosh, 2011). Although the measures may help to keep the institution afloat and motivate their employees to improve on productivity as well as stick to their organization, the individual idiosyncratic behavioral characteristics influenced by the work environment and employee needs will always be a hindrance in the face of shrinking government budgetary allocation to such government institutions.

In addition if these human resource development practices are anything to go by, then the aggressive collection methods, corruption, informalities, and tax exemptions would not be a concern in the contemporary tax administration literature (World Bank, 2018; Mujtaba and Mick, 2014). Therefore attaining sanity and progress in tax administration in developing countries and indeed Uganda, still has to overcome these hurdles before it reaches the ultimate levels of providing efficient and effective tax administration that ensures healthy business environment, economic growth and voluntary compliance that directly and positively contributes to revenue performance.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

URA appears to be a success story of public institutions operating under NPM in which its managers have used the authority and resources bestowed upon them to plan, budget, organize and make decisions that enable it to meet its core mandate of collecting central government revenue to finance the government budget. The human resources have been developed and motivated to increase on their productivity. As a consequence, revenue performance has been on the rise since 1992 although not sufficient to fully finance the government budgets. Therefore there is a positive relationship between tax administration reforms and revenue performance. Cracks in the administration of public institutions like the URA are unavoidable and dangerous because they affect revenue performance which is pivotal to the financing of government budgets. It is therefore recommended that government in conjunction with the URA should continue making further reforms within the tax administration with a view of proactively avoiding and sealing the ever emerging internal and external hindrances to efficiency in tax administration.

**References**


EACE (2012). *Post-graduate diploma in customs administration: management training materials (level 11)*. Directorate of Customs, East African Community.


Fjeldstad, O and Rakna (2003). Taxation and tax reforms in developing countries; illustration from sub-Saharan Africa. *Journal of modern Africa studies*, Bergen;Chr .Michelsen Institute.

Fjeldstad, O and Moore, M.(2009). Revenue Authorities and Public authority in Sub-Saharan Africa, The Journal of Modern African Studies, volume 47, no. 1pp.1-18 accessed online https://www.jstor.org/stable/30224921(((Todate),there is little sign tht the creation of revenue agencies has actually increased public revenues. It has however, facilitated a range of reforms in the ways in which taxes are assessed and collected and deflected pressures tht might otherwise have emerged for substantial privatization of tax collection.


Moore, M. (2004). Taxation and the political agenda, north and south. *Forum for development studies* 37(1); 1-23


URA (2005b). The taxman: a publication from public and corporate affairs management division. Kampala; URA


URA (2011) Human capital management. URA newsletter, Nakawa; URA

Procurement Contracts management and Service Delivery in Higher Education Institutions in Uganda: Experience of Makerere University

Stella-Maaris Kamanzi
PhD Student - Makerere University
Corresponding E-Mail: kamanzistellamaris@gmail.com

Abstract
This paper investigated the procurement Contracts management and how it influences service delivery in Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in Uganda with specific reference to Makerere University in Uganda. The study looked at three objectives of the study which were; to assess how procurement contract management influences service delivery, to examine how working relationships in contract management influences service delivery and assess how delivery management in procurement contract management influences service delivery at Makerere University in Uganda. The study adopted desk research with document review methodology, because it provides confluence of evidence that breeds credibility to the study. The major sources were; a review of the relevant literature regarding Procurement and contract management, and analysis of Makerere University documents with information related to the study. Analyzed documents included; Makerere University annual procurement reports, auditor general’s report and fact books from 2014-2017. The research found out that the procurement contract management and service delivery system at Makerere University has inadequacies. These include; improper signing of contracts, lack of important procurement contract management information, weak procurement contract management rules which lead to awarding contracts to incompetent contractors; lack of a strong internal monitoring and evaluation mechanism at the University, inadequate procurement contract management appraisal system, a lapse in following procurement rules and regulations and failure to respect time lines. These inadequacies significantly affect service delivery at the Makerere University. The research therefore recommends further study on factors responsible for procurement contracts management inadequacies in higher education institutions and how they can be mitigated.

Key words: Procurement, Contracts Management, Service Delivery, Relationship Management

Introduction

Procurement represents one of the most critical functions in public institutions that ensure efficiency in utilization of public resources as well as efficiency in service delivery. It performs the fiduciary duty of ensuring efficient delivery of goods and services to the public (Martemyanova, 2018; Ngetich, 2018; Dzuke, & Naude, 2017; Komakech, 2016; Oluka, & Basheka, 2014; Naude, Ambe & Kling, 2013 and World Bank Institute (WBI, 2011). The Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets (PPDA) Act, (2003) as amended in 2014 define procurement as ‘a means of acquisition by purchase, rental, lease, hire purchase, license, tenancy, franchise, or any type of works, services or supplies or any combination’ up to the time a user consumes or utilises the goods, works or services’. Procurement includes the identification of requirements, specification, assessment of risks, management of tendering processes, ordering, contract award and management and the monitoring of suppliers’ performance. The procurement process takes into account factors such as the cost over the whole life of the good or service, and the quality necessary to meet users’ requirements. Public sector procurement is a regulated process defined and controlled by numerous laws, rules and regulations, judicial and administrative decisions, policies and procedures (Eyaa, & Oluka, 2011; Oluka, & Basheka, 2014).

In Uganda, public procurement is governed by the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets (PPDA) Act, (2003) as amended in 2014 and PPDA Regulations, 2014 which largely guide government entities with key steps, procurement rules and regulations. The stipulated rules and regulations must be
followed in the procurement process of goods, works and services to value for money and effective service delivery. Based on the Uganda PPDA, (2003) rules and regulations, Makerere University is also guided by the ‘Makerere Procurement & Disposal Manual for Supplies, Works and Services as amended in 2014 (Makerere University, 2014). With the fore mentioned regulatory Acts and management bodies, there should be effectiveness and efficiency in procurement contracts management and service delivery in HEIs and Makerere University. However, in the analysis of successive [Uganda] Auditor Generals (AG) reports (see, AG, 2014; 2015; 2016 & 2017), established various inadequacies in procurement contract management and service delivery system at Makerere University. The inadequacies include; improper signing of contracts, lack of important procurement contract management information, weak procurement contract management rules which lead to awarding contracts to incompetent contractors; lack of a strong internal monitoring and evaluation mechanism at the University, inadequate procurement contract management appraisal system, a lapse in following procurement rules and regulations and failure to respect time lines. If these inadequacies are not mitigated, they significantly affect service delivery at the Makerere University.

It is against this backdrop that the author found it necessary to understand how procurement contract management systems influences service in Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in Uganda with a focus at Makerere University. Makerere University was chosen because it typifies other HEIs in the region, it is a flagship university. It is the largest in terms of size, students’ enrolment and infrastructure development. The expansion is accompanied by big volume procurements of teaching learning materials, goods, construction works and other services. This requires efficiency and effectiveness in procurement contract management and services delivery. The paper provides useful insights for policymaking and managerial practices for improving procurement contracts management and service delivery in Higher Education Institutions. The rest of the paper is structured as follows; objectives of the study, methodology, literature review, study findings and discussions, conclusions and recommendations.

**Objectives of the Study.**

The objectives of the study were to:

i. Assess how procurement contract management influences service delivery at Makerere University.

ii. Examine how working relationships in contract management influences service delivery at Makerere University.

iii. Assess how service and delivery management in procurement contract management influences service delivery.

**Methodology**

The study adopted desk research with document review methodology, because it provides confluence of evidence that breeds credibility to the study. The major sources were; a review of the relevant literature regarding Procurement and contract management, and analysis of Makerere University documents with information related to the study. Analyzed documents included; Makerere University annual procurement reports, auditor general’s report and fact books from 2014-2017. The study was carried out on higher education institutions with a focus on Makerere University. Makerere University was chosen because it typifies other HEIs in the region. Makerere University as a public institution is a procuring and disposal entity. It derives its mandate from the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Act PPDA 2003 (as amended) in 2014. It is the largest in terms of size, students’ enrolment and infrastructure development.
The expansion is accompanied by big volume of procurements of goods, construction works and other services. This requires a proactive procurement contract management system for effective and efficient services delivery. It was therefore, necessary to understand how procurement contract management influences service delivery at Makerere University.

Purposive sampling was used to select documents with relevant literature basing on their relevancy to understanding how procurement contract management influences service delivery. The search selection used code names; contract management, service delivery, delivery management and relationship management. The search yielded over 500 results but only those that involved contract management, service delivery, contract administration, delivery management, relationship management were considered. This then yielded 60 results but those with relevant content was 25 and it’s these which were thoroughly analyzed to fetch this document. This gave an overview of how procurement contract management influences service delivery in public entities which include Makerere University.

**Literature Review**

**Procurement Contract Management Influenes Service Delivery**

Effective procurement contract management is necessary so as to reduce costs and improve financial and operational performance. Sanderson, Lonsdale, Mannion, and Matharu, (2015) define contract management as the decision to award a contract to a provider or supplier, to the process of agreeing contractual terms and conditions, and to efforts to ensure that those terms and conditions are honored either through monitoring and enforcement or, where necessary, dispute resolution. Contract management is therefore an important activity in public procurement which covers all the activities performed by the Procuring Entity (Trepte, 2011) and has significant implications for service delivery (Oluka, & Basheka, 2012).

According to CIPS (2012) the key elements of contract management include: contract communication; contract administration; managing performance; relationship management; and contract renewal or termination. Hence effective contract management refers excellence in these elements. Scholars (i.e. Alouzioni, Oluka, & Nduhura, 2016; Awidi, 2008) indicate that contract management consists of a range of activities that are carried out together to keep the arrangement between customer and provider running smoothly. Hotterbeekx (2013) explains that contract management processes are undertaken to maintain the integrity of the contract, and ensure that the roles and responsibilities contractually demarcated are fully understood and carried out to the contracted standard. Contract management is therefore an important activity in public procurement which covers all the activities performed by the Procuring Entity (Trepte, 2011) and has significant implications for service delivery (Oluka, & Basheka, 2012). Effectiveness in contract managements’ services delivery is envisaged in active management of the relationship between the client and the contractor over contract terms for the provision of goods and services to the agreed standards (Yegon, 2018).

According to Oluka & Basheka (2012) and Mitambo (2009) contract management is not given much of the deserved attention as it happens that some of the contracts end without proper approval or endorsement of the relevant authorities. The approach for management is also associated with unapproved variation of works, poor quality of products together with late deliveries, unclear understanding to who is responsible for management of procurement contracts and inadequate post-implementation evaluation of completed contracts (Snider and Rendon, (2011). The outcome of the observed poor contract management practices is
the non-achievement of value for money (Mchopa, 2015) and loss of public funds (Mshana, 2007) and poor service delivery.

Mshana (2007) postulates, absence of capable staff is considered the major reason behind loss of public funds. However, Mitambo (2009) revealed that the presence of adequate and capable staffs for contract management does not necessarily warrant effective management of contracts. Therefore, proper monitoring system and positive staff attitudes are crucial for the success of the contract (Handy, 2013). Ongoing and post contract award activities have to be closely monitored and controlled to enhance procurement contract management especially during defect liability period where by defects identified by the consultants or engineers or users have to be rectified by contractors and liquidated damaged be charged for late deliveries as agreed in the contract (Mitambo, 2009). Procurement contract management is indispensable for effective and efficient service delivery. This study further underlies the importance of managing relationships in the procurement process

**Working Relationships in Contract Management Influences Service Delivery**

Every business whether in the public or private sector – is dependent on materials and services supplied by other businesses. As no business is self-sufficient, it can be deduced that sound relationships in the procurement contract management are vital (Naude, Ambe, & Kling, 2013). According to Bailey, Farmer, Jessop and Jones (2005), mutual supplier-buyer relationships provide benefits in terms of sharing and exchanging information, with the emphasis on building a ‘satisfactory outcome together’ in a range of areas and ensuring service delivery. This suggests that relationship management is important in procurement contract management for efficient and effective service delivery.

Relationship management as defined by (Akamp and Müller, 2013) is the practice of planning, implementing, developing and monitoring company relationship with the current and potential supplier. In their contribution, (Wieteska Grażyna, 2016) described how companies should develop relationships with suppliers while facing high market volatility. Higher education institutions like any other corporate organizations have a variety of many suppliers, ranging from multinationals to local sole suppliers. Therefore, maintaining positive relationships with suppliers is a critical factor in sustaining a competitive advantage (Stevenson 2009).

Most businesses view their suppliers as partners; in other words, they seek a stable relationship with comparatively few suppliers that are able to provide high-quality supplies, sustain delivery schedules and remain flexible in relation to changes in specifications and delivery schedules. In separate studies by Kandall, (2013) and Wieteska Grażyna, (2016), it was established that cordial relationships with suppliers is an important aspect of procurement process. Cordial relationships help the organization to achieve efficient services as well as concentrating on other aspects such as, price, quality, delivery or contract terms and conditions (Wieteska Grażyna, 2016). Vahrmeijer, (2007) posits out that, nature of the procurement will help to determine the relationship you want to develop with the supplier. Therefore, relationship spectrum explains differing degrees of closeness that can exist between buyers and suppliers depending on the nature of the contract and volume of goods and services (Vahrmeijer, 2007).

Naude, etal (2013) found out that, public sector is recognised as being one of the most important customer groups for many suppliers and service providers because of the volume of public expenditure. Hence supplier relationship management is a necessary tool on which businesses in the public and private sectors rely. Naude, etal however noted that, despite the intention to boost service delivery through efficient and
effective supplier-management processes, the development of sound supplier relationships in public sector is a challenge (Naude, et al., 2013). Public sector has an inherent problem with relationship management as it often sees a negative correlation between building relationships with suppliers and maintaining ethics. This is based on a perception that in order for public procurement officials to form relationships with suppliers, a compromise must be made in relation to their ethics. Although the importance of sound supplier relationships is vital and relationships with suppliers and should be viewed as a key strategic activity in the public procurement sector (Naude, et al., 2013). However, Rendon & Garrett, (2015) opine that managing supplier relationship is not often recognized as an important aspect of procurement function and it is not an easy task.

The agency has an obligation to communicate any concerns about the supplier’s performance after all, the supplier can only fix a problem if they know about it. Failing to notify the supplier of a problem could result in a series of small problems building up to become material performance issues, which is unfair on the supplier (Snider & Rendon, 2012). Whatever the nature of the problem, it’s vital to notify the supplier immediately, but must choose the most appropriate notification channel, depending on the problem’s severity (Lysons & Farrington, 2016). The problem should however be recorded as part of tracking overall performance, both parties act in good faith to negotiate a mutually acceptable resolution, the problem-solving approaches are practical, clear, achievable and effective and you follow escalation procedures if the initial approaches are unsuccessful (Lysons & Farrington, 2016). This suggests that delivery management in procurement contract management is pertinent in enhancing service delivery as explained in next subsection.

4.3 Delivery Management in Procurement Contract Management Influences Service Delivery

Service Delivery

According to Oboth, (2001) there is no definition of the phrase (service delivery) either deliberately or ignorantly. However, Oboth, said, Service is a system or arrangement that supplies public needs, whereas delivery is periodic performance of a service. Therefore, service delivery is a system or arrangement of periodical performance of supplying public needs. Helmsing (1995) in his study defines service delivery as a deliberate obligatory decision by the elected or appointed officials to serve or deliver goods and services to the recipients. Heskett (1987) defines service delivery as an attitudinal or dispositional sense, referring to the internationalization of even service values and norms. Ramseook-Munhurrun, Lukea-Bhiwajee (2010), on the other hand, Naidoo, (2010) looks at service delivery as service output. Eccles (1999) explained that service delivery entails effectiveness which refers to the meeting the objectives at lowest possible costs with the market at particular time and efficiency means meeting the objectives at lowest possible costs with highest possible benefits. This implies that the effectiveness of services delivery is measured in terms of quality services that satisfy customers thus attaining the goals of the organization. Ramseook-Munhurrun etal., (2010) asserts that delivering quality service is considered to be an important strategy for success in today’s competitive environment. According to Ramseook-Munhurrun etal., (2010), quality of service indicators includes; having up-to-date equipment, providing services at the time promised, customers feeling safe in their transactions and employees having customers best interests at heart.

Managing service delivery ensures that a contract is being delivered as agreed, to the required levels of performance and quality (Kendall, 2013). According to CIPS (2012), Service delivery looks at whether measures of contract management have been met in terms of the specific objectives set. It relates to services
which are delivered in conformance of contractor or supplier with contract terms, specifications, service level agreements and other elements of the commercial agreement (CIPS, 2012). Performance key outcome priority costs include; transaction costs, contracting costs, coordination costs, and search costs. It is worthwhile noting that contract management is successful if, the arrangements for service delivery continue to be satisfactory to both parties (Bhardwaj, 2011). More so, the expected business benefits and value for money are to be realized by the purchaser and supplier (Gregg et al, 2015). Gregg et al, asserts that, if the supplier is co-operative and responsive, the organization understands its obligations under the contract, there are no disputes and no surprises. However, in all transactions, procurement values which include; effective competition, ethics and fairness, accountability, transparency and equity which encompasses the core principles for value for money are expected to be followed by those entrusted with procurement responsibilities (Mchopa, 2015; Mchopa, etal, 2014; PPDA, 2014).

Accordingly, value for money is an essential test against which Procuring Entities must justify their procurement transactions while spending public funds (Mchopa, Njau, Rujoja, & Huka, 2014; Waigwa, & Njeru, 2016). In order to achieve value for money in public procurement a number of factors have to be considered effectively. For example, Individual contract amendments must not increase the original contract value by more than 15%. Where more than one amendment is issued, the cumulative value of all amendments must not increase the contract value by more than 25% (Part III, Section 29(a) of the Act; PPDA (Contracts) Regulations, 2014, Regulation 55(5). On the contrary, the pursuit for value for money in public spending remains to be a big challenge to government institutions across most developing countries of Sub-Saharan Africa which include Uganda (Oluka, &Basheka, 2012; 2014), hence hurting service delivery.

In literature, scholars (see, Dzuke, & Naude, 2017; Licenji, 2015; Mamiro, 2010 and Waigwa, & Njeru, 2016) identified procurement contract management challenges that affect service delivery to include; incompetent public procurement staff with inadequate procurement knowledge and skills, lack of accountability and transparency, embedded fraud and corruption and rigid rules regulating public procurement systems. These shortfalls render the achievement of value for money a distant goal (Mamiro, 2010; Mchopa, 2015; Ramadhan, 2012; Waigwa, & Njeru, 2016).

Mchopa (2015) recommended that, the entire procurement team should train in procurement contract management skills, be engaged in managing the contracting activities. Hotterbeekx, (2013) commended contract management processes and activities such as monitoring and measuring contractor performance, managing contract change process, and managing contractor payment process to be integrated with other departmental core processes such as customer service, financial management, risk management, schedule management, and performance management. With established Organizations, mature contract management processes are able to generate a great deal in additional savings and have a distinct competitive advantage over their competitors (Rendon, 2007). On the other hand, Nguyen (2013) observes that inefficient management of contracts will lead to poor operational control, low customer satisfaction, high risks and unwanted costs (Nguyen, 2013). This necessitates assessment of post-award performance and enhancement of delivery Management for effective service delivery as explained in next sub-section.

**Delivery Management**

Assessing post-award performance entails several activities to ensure that the delivery of services meets the terms of the contract. These include identifying performance criteria, such as key performance indicators
(KPIs), at the time of contract formulation, and providing adequate monitoring resources and a capable workforce for overseeing contractor activities (Elsey, 2007).

A major weakness in most organizations is the lack of well-thought-out KPIs in the development stages of a contract that would allow for effective delivery management and monitoring of performance during the contract execution (Global, 2013). Unless specific monitoring strategies are set up front, there could be no effective way of measuring progress, and no feasible way of keeping staff and contractors accountable for their actions.

The development of a contract strategy is designed to establish the form of the procurement and provide assistance in determining the formulation and award of the contract and the style and type of management to be adopted for the subsequent service delivery, relationship management and contract administration (Salim, 2013). The latter aims can be characterized by the need to address understanding, measurement and communication post contract award. A successful contract management strategy should achieve benefits by managing the organization’s own responsibilities during the contract, ensuring the supplier meets the minimum performance criteria, such as compliance, allowing the achievement of both short- and long-term supplier performance improvement through developing effective supplier relationships (Shiwa, 2014).

The main aim of contract management is to ensure that goods or services are delivered on time, at the agreed cost and to the specified requirements. Effective contract management relies on 3 separate, but interrelated factors namely; service delivery management, relationship management and contract administration management (Kendall, 2013). All three factors must be managed effectively and consistently if the contract is to succeed. Kendall explains further, that managing service delivery ensures that a contract is being delivered as agreed, to the required levels of performance and quality; managing relationships keeps the relationship between the two parties open and constructive, aiming to resolve problems early and focus on continual improvement; while managing contract, management provides governance, performance management and accountability through tracking and recording deliveries (Kandall, 2013). However, it is a main duty for operating company to make sure contractors perform their duties safely and timely through appropriate contract management (CM) procedures for effective service delivery.

Findings and Discussions

Procurement Contract Management Influences Service Delivery At Makerere University

This sub-section presents study findings and discussion on procurement contract management how it influences service delivery at Makerere University. Study findings revealed that procurement process at Makerere University is governed by the PPDA rules and regulations specifically the PPDA act 2003 as amended in 2014 and Makerere University Procurement & Disposal Manual for Supplies, Works and Services as at November 2014 (Makerere, 2014). Adherence to rules and regulations is an antecedent to efficient and effective procurement contract management and service delivery system, ensures functioning and performance of a public entity (PPDA,2003) referred to the study was Makerere University. However, in the analysis of successive [Uganda] Auditor Generals (AG) reports (see, AG, 2014; 2015; 2016 & 2017), it was established that implementing the PPDA laws and regulations, and the inherent PPDA principles of transparency, efficiency, value for money and service delivery had inadequacies with implied effects on service delivery at Makerere University.
The AG Report, (2015) revealed contract delays at Makerere without due follow up by contracts committee. Contracts cited include; stalling works at the Makerere Printery which totaling to UGX.248,200,507 (equivalent to 87,734USD), pending procurement orders for more than UGX. 10,291,575 (equivalent to 3,431USD) for academic registrar’s office and Maxwell stamp PLS, 233,563,449 (equivalent to 77874USD). The AG Report, 2015: 7.15.2(C) also observed that Makerere Printery had redundant machinery with a net book value of UGX.240, 385,256 (equivalent to 80,128 USD); as reported in the financial statements for 2016/17. This machinery remained redundant for more than two years. Prolonged retention of idle assets can lead to the assets becoming obsolete. There is also a risk of loss of assets through pilferage, disposing all idle assets may prevent further loss in value. This casts doubt on contract management and compliance which may hamper service delivery.

According to Section 87(1c) of the PPDA, a procuring and disposing entity shall not dispose of any strategic asset, without the prior approval of the Minister and implied approval of contracts committee contrary to this provision. The Auditor General's (AG) report for the Financial Year 2014/ 2015 established that the University leased out land located on Plots 34-36a on Prince Charles Drive, Kololo, to a private investor at a cost of UGX.1,500,000,000 (equivalent to 500,000 USD) without the full knowledge of the committees. It was further noted that this transaction was not disclosed and reported in the financial statements under the memorandum statement of disposal of physical assets. In absence of proper disclosure and respective reporting of the transaction, there is a risk that the proceeds from the transaction may not have been put to proper use, hence no value for money.

According to section 119 (1) of the PPDA Regulations 2014, a procurement process under direct procurement shall follow the procurement rules and processes set out in the regulations. The Auditor Generals, Report (2015) established that the University Management leased out land located on Plots 34-36a on Prince Charles Drive, Kololo, to a private investor at a cost of about 500,000 USD without the full knowledge of the contracts and evaluation committees. This is contrary to section 87(1c) of the PPDA, (2003) which states, ‘the procuring and disposing entity shall not dispose off any strategic asset, without the prior approval of the Minister and implied approval of contracts committee’. Contrary to this provision, it was further noted that this transaction was not disclosed and reported in the financial statements under the memorandum statement of disposal of physical assets. This casts doubt on operationalization of contract management and service delivery at the institution.

Subsection 260. (1) A contract manager shall-(a) manage the obligations and duties of the procuring and disposing entity specified in the contract; and (b) ensure that the provider performs the contract in accordance with the terms and conditions specified in the contract and a procuring and disposing entity's requirements. Whereas the regulations clearly stipulate guidelines for procurement contract management (PPDA, 2003), contract mismanagement at Makerere. For example, Mbanga in the East Africa regional Newsletter (Observer July 22, 2009) reported saga of an attempt to block National Insurance Corporation (NIC) from selling Makerere shares to the public, Musitwa (2007) reported collapse of 2billion UGX perimeter wall fence at the institution September 2007. The Perimeter wall collapsed amidst accusations of corruption and shoddy Work. The NIC saga and collapse of the perimeter wall ensued from procurement contract mismanagement and the university lost a lot of money.

**Working Relationships in Contract Management Influences Service Delivery at Makerere University**

In Uganda, the PPDA Audit Report (2008) revealed that lack of professionalism and working relationship among user departments and suppliers was the largest contributor of poor service delivery amongst public
procurement officers. This position is further confirmed by Basheka (2008) who state that the level of professionalism in public procurement in Uganda was low. The low level of professionalism among some procurement officers was reported in national newsletter (Daily Monitor Tuesday April 25, 2017) that the manager of two PDU officers at Makerere were suspended over what they termed as gross misconduct and abuse of procurement office (Mukhaye, 2017). The two allegedly approved the procurement of more chairs that were to be used during the graduation ceremony without the approval of the contract committee. This did not only indicate low level of professionalism but also implies no value for money. In regard to the above, since the contracts were awarded someone should have been pointed to follow the process and ensure effective working relationship so that contracts management is effectively carried out for efficient service delivery. This relates to Hotterbeekx, (2013) who explain that in most organizations’ contracts are signed by procurement officers, but the subsequent management of the contracts is left to requisitioners to handle delivery management, and sometimes to project managers or other parties, with limited involvement by procurement officers or other contract management experts. In most cases roles and responsibilities related to post-award contract-management are not clearly defined or properly delegated. Yet, clear delegation of authority and responsibility to persons managing contracts after award is key to having a well-functioning contract management system, especially when procurement is decentralized. When such delegation is not provided effectively, there are inefficiencies and lack of accountability (King & Elliot, 2009).

5.3 Delivery Management in Procurement Contract Management Influences Service Delivery

Subsection 259 of the act explain that (1) A user department shall nominate an existing member of staff with appropriate skills and experience, or who is supervised by a member of staff with appropriate skills and experience, as a contract manager to manage deliveries and ensure that all all goods or services are managed professionally. (2) A user department may nominate a member of staff of another user department as contract manager, where appropriate. (3) A contract of high value or which is complex or forms part of a larger project may be assigned to a contract management team, which shall have the same responsibilities as a contract manager. (4) A contract may be managed by a body or person external to a procuring and disposing entity, provided the user department supervises the external contract manager. However, there is weak contract supervision and monitoring where government agencies fail to appoint the supervisors (Ahimbishibwe & Muhwezi, 2015). Where supervisors have been appointed, some fail to perform their role. This has led to poor contract performance and increased project costs. Also, in contract management there is internal and external capacity gaps of low experience, financial and technical competencies, which have become a major hindrance to quality output and value for money of government expenditures (Byaruhanaga & Basheka, 2017; Ahimbishibwe & Muhwezi, 2015).

The PPDA Regulation 169(9) provides for every member of the evaluation committee to sign the code of ethical conduct in business using PP form 211 in the ninth schedule, declaring that he or she does not have a conflict of interest in the procurement requirement. However, it was noted that a number of procurement evaluations at Makerere were undertaken without members of the evaluation committees signing the ethical code of conduct forms. These include; China Nanjing International Limited for Renovation of laboratories at Makerere University at Contract Price of UGX. Shs.214, 755,398 and Renovation of Pathology laboratory and animal house at Makerere University Faculty of Veterinary Medicine at Contract Price of UGX. Shs.48,156,944; Labomedifam Supplies and Technical Services for Supply of Cryostat at contract Price of Euro 21,726; Jos Hansen & Soehne GmbH for Supply and Installation of laboratory equipment-molecular Biology at Euro 82,679.30 and Performance Furnishings Limited for Supply and installation of
office furniture at US$161,278.19. This undermines the principle of transparency while under taking the evaluation of submitted bids (PPDA, 2003). Procurements contracts and evaluation committee need to always ensure compliance with the requirement in all the procurements.

The fore mentioned findings imply that key problems manifested in contracts management are reflected in; delays, unplanned procurements, use of non-prequalified suppliers, un-accomplished procurements, unauthorized direct procurements, non-delivery and insufficient procurement records. This is in agreement with observations made by Byaruhanga &Basheka, (2017) and Ahimbishibwe & Muhwezi, (2015) that procurement challenges emanate from weak procurement rules which lead to awarding bids to incompetent contractors; contract performance and monitoring being handled by unqualified, incompetent and inexperienced professionals; lack of contractors and contract supervisors appraisal system; delay of contractors payments which affects timelines in services delivery and lack of a strong internal contract management and evaluation mechanisms.

Whereas other phases of procurement had challenges, the contracts administration and delivery management could have had a problem in executing its mandate of overseeing the process of contracts execution there by leading to failure to effectively execute the contract. The line user department in this case which should have been the estates department should have effectively selected a contract manager to lead the process of ensuring that contract administration and delivery management are well handled and managed. This is in line with views of Rendon, (2007) and Nguyen, (2013) that inefficient management of contracts will lead to poor operational control, low customer satisfaction, high risks and unwanted costs and poor service delivery.

Purchases by the public sector represent a substantial amount of public resources spend and it is therefore policy that procurement contract management in higher education institutions and at Makerere should be used as a tool to achieve socioeconomic upliftment and effective service delivery. As such, in all institutions must work within a legislative framework based on the norms and standards that create uniformity as prescribed in PPDA (2003) and PPDA regulations 2014. This is to put into consideration the fact that developing and managing relationships are crucial to the procurement of goods and services for any organisation, in this regard procurement at Makerere university is no different. There is no need for procurement officials to fear the relationship; there is simply a need for transparency and a higher standard of ethical behaviour on the part of procurement officials.

Conclusions

Public procurement is a regulated, open process defined and controlled by numerous laws, rules and regulations. In Uganda, PPDA, (2003) and PPDA Regulations, (2014) spell out clearly the required procedures and regulatory framework for managing contracts and enhancement of service delivery for public sector including public universities. Makerere University like any other public institution is a procuring and disposal entity, it derives its mandate from PPDA (2003) as amended in 2014. Despite Makerere University being a procuring and disposal entity, the procurement processes at this University plus the majority of other universities in Uganda face a number of contract management challenges including failure to follow procurement rules and regulations, failure to respect timelines and procurement delays or no deliveries, hence insufficient service delivery as alluded in (AG, 2014; 2015 & 2016).
**Recommendations**

Government departments and institutions should thus manage contracts in such a manner that their successful execution in accordance with the agreed terms of time, cost and performance are ensured for effective service delivery. Government departments are also expected to “establish governance structures and measures of accountability to ensure efficient and effective management of contracts and minimize the risk of fraud, corruption and mismanagement of resources. There is need for law enforcement, diligent monitoring and supervision of contract activities and holding defaulters accountable for their actions.

The PPDA authorities and the public entities should work together to improve on the familiarity of staff with public procurement procedures. This can be done through taking procurement skills assessment and training staff through refresher courses, workshops, seminars and conferences where staff meet and share experiences. Thus, there is need to recruit staff with relevant skills and training existing procurement officers at the University to address skills gaps.

There is need for Makerere University procurement officers to establish procurement contract management plans, ensure all procurement staff understand their responsibilities in relation to contract performance management; establish and maintain a sound relationship with the contractors; hold regular meetings with the contractors to discuss progress. This enables identification of procurement contract management problems to be alleviated early enough thus improving service delivery. Future direction provided by the study is to establish factors responsible for procurement contracts management lapses in higher education institutions and how they can be mitigated.

**References**


A Comparative Analysis Of Quality Of Health Care Delivered In Low And High Task Shifting Environments In Uganda. Implications for Policy

Kanyesigye Rullonga Monica, Maria Kaguhangire Balifaijo & Mohammed S Bayat

1,2Uganda Management Institute
3University of Fort Hare and University of Lusaka

Abstract
With the increasing global health workers shortage, developing countries like Uganda are embracing task shifting as a form of availing health care amidst the growing population and increasing disease burden. This study examined the quality of healthcare delivered under task shifting in low and high task shifting environments from patients’ perspective in Kalangala and Bukomansimbi Districts respectively. An exploratory design was employed with both qualitative and quantitative approaches guided by Banduras theories of social learning and social cognitive. Bivariate analysis was carried out through cross-tabulations on associations between task shifting and quality of healthcare indicators to generate chi-square and p-values. Quality of care was assessed as generally good but much better in high task shifting environments because of the availability of simulations, supervision and mentorship programs which facilitate the health workers to learn even when they possess lower qualifications. The study asserts that good quality healthcare can be provided by virtually any person who is conditioned through training, supervision and mentoring. This has a huge implication for HRH planning, forecasting and development in the epoch of healthy worker shortage. The study designed and recommended a task shifting model that would facilitate the development of policy framework for task shifting implementation.

Key Words: Human Resource for Health, Quality of healthcare, Task shifting

Introduction
The Global scarcity of health workers estimated at 4.3 million health workers has affected health care delivery in most developing countries. A number of reforms and practices have been considered effective and efficient in order not to interrupt continued service delivery for the growing population (WHO, 2013). The World Health Organisation (WHO) estimated health worker shortage in Uganda at 80% in 2006 with a doctor patient ration standing at 1:22,000, and more than a quarter of the world countries having human resource for health shortage challenges. Among the reforms undertaken is the task shifting model; where tasks of highly qualified health workers are shifted and delegated to health workers with lower qualifications (WHO, 2007; 2004).

This paper presents study finding on a comparative analysis of the quality of care delivered in two task shifting environments one considered high because of the low staffing numbers (Bukomansimbi) and the other as low task shifting because of the high staffing numbers (Kalangala). The paper makes recommendations for human resource planning and development functions based on empirical evidence from patients and how they evaluate the quality of health care they receive based on Bandura’s social learning and social cognitive theories (Bandura, 1977). Bandura submitted that individuals can learn and perform as expected if they are conditioned to observation, mentoring, support supervisison and have models to show them how things are done. He asserts that in order for this learning to happen, people must have the ability to learn and retain what is being observed, an opportunity to reproduce what has been learnt and of course motivated in form of rewards and punishments. These theoretical assumptions insunuate what task shifting would require in order to deliver qualityhealth care in a human resource for health limited environment. The study interolgated the presence of these theoreticil assumption and resulting quality delivered in these environements.
Task shifting dates way back in the 19th century in France when after the French revolution left many institutions in a porous state. The French government legitimately acknowledged and frequently employed a class of non-physicians called *officiers de santé*, who worked in army and navy where there was dire need for medical care services. In China, barefoot doctors were used in rural settings where qualified medical officers were not willing to work; with basic health care training to treat non-complicated case such as wound dressing and carrying out (Heller, 1978; Sidel, 1972; Xu & Hu, 2017). In 1918, the Uganda Health Service (UHS) introduced a cadre between the medical officer and a nurse called medical assistants now referred to as clinical officers and later in 2004, a publication by WHO gave strategies for potential of task shifting, recommending that nurses and clinical officers be trained to deliver primary care for HIV. Eventually, in 2006 WHO picked interest in task shifting as a response to the high shortage of human resource for health critical cadres, coupled with a high burden of infectious diseases, migration of specialists, poor working environments and stumpy motivation specifically in sub Saharan Africa (WHO, 2004).

With a health worker population ration of 1:1298 in Uganda and the staffing situation in the national public sector standing at 68% for Local government level and 69% for the national level facilities, the need to increase the number of health workers to match the growing population is evident (WHO, 2004: Ministry of Health, 2014: 2012. Quality of health care is defined as the degree to which health services for individuals and populations increase the likelihood of desired health outcomes, are consistent with current professional knowledge and can be divided into different dimensions according to the aspects of care being assessed. It is the extent to which processes, products, services and relationships are free from defects, constraints and items which do not add value for the customer. Quality of health care is looked at in terms of its safety, patient centered, reliable, timely and equitable to those who receive (Mainz, 2003: Mildred, et al, 2013: Shumbusho, et al, 2008). Reliable health care is care that is consistent, easily accessible at any time as when one needs it whether on weekends, public holidays and with available health workers. This health care must be able to maximize resource use and avoid waste as well. On the other hand, Safety in quality of care means delivering health care which minimizes risks and harm to service users. Equitable health care is delivering health care which does not vary in quality because of personal characteristics such as gender, race, ethnicity, geographical location or socio economic status. Patient centered health care is care that is considerate of likings and ambitions of individual end users and the cultures of their communities. Lastly, timely health care is care that is geographically reasonable and provided in a setting where skills and resources are appropriate to medical need and in time when needed.

Ministry of Health in Uganda has categorized operational areas according to their geographical locations. Some places have been categorized as hard to reach and stay; and therefore, difficult to attract health workers (Ministry of Health, 2016). The staffing situation in such places has been reported low, with over 65% of health workers reported to prefer work in urban settlements Kalangala and Bukomansimbi districts both located in the Central Region of Uganda are graded as rural settlements with populations of 50,000 and 154,000 respectively (Uganda Bureau of Statistics, 2015:2016). Kalangala district is located on the shores of Lake Victoria composed of 84 islands of which 64 islands are habitable and only accessible by water/boat transport. The district has a doctor-patient ratio of 3:50,000 with a public health Centre IV and III on the main Island, and Health centre IIIs in the 11 islands: the rest of the 57 Islands have no public health care facilities. In 2017, the health care state in Kalangala district was reported worsening because of insufficient health facilities and more so a District Hospital. Many lives were reported lost on boats trying to reach nearby hospitals of Entebbe and Masaka Districts (BigEye, 2015; Bindhe, 2012, Musisi,
2017) and some dying because they can’t afford the cost of hiring a boat especially at night. The 2017 Human resource for health audit report indicates that Kalangala has an 82% staffing levels for its 17 health facilities, which is very good compared to WHO recommended 75+, although the facilities are few and meagerly distributed for the geography of Kalangala and its population (Ministry of Healt, 2012)

Bukomansimbi district on the other hand is located south of the equator in the central region of Uganda. The district has two Counties (Bukomansimbi South and Bukomansimbi North) with five Sub-Counties (Bigasa, Kitanda, Kibinge, Butenga and Bukomansimbi Town Council). There are 16 health units, 9 belong to government and 7 belong to private. There is one Health centre IV, ten HCIIIs and five HCIIIs. The doctor patient ratio is 1: 152,400, nurse patient ration is 12:152,400, clinical officer’s patient ration is 10:152,400 and midwife patient ration is 9:152,400. Eighty percent (80%) of the population in Bukomansimbi district depends predominantly on substance farming. Like Kalangala, there is no government hospital in the entire district (Bukomansimbi District Local Government and Uganda Bureau of statistics, 2016)

Methodology

The study employed an exploratory design with both qualitative and quantitative approaches of inquiry in localized units of Bukomansimbi and Kalangala Districts with different tasks-shifting levels. Kalangala district is a low task-shifting district with a high level of staffing at 82%, where the recommended staffing is 75%. Bukomansimbi district, on the other hand, has a staffing level of only 62%, and hence is considered a high task-shifting district (Ministry of Health, 2012).

The combined study population was estimated to be 150,000: 100,000 for Bukomansimbi district for the 3 parishes of Butenga, Kitanda and Bigasa, and 50,000 of Kalangala district (Uganda Bureau of Statistics, 2016; 2018). The target population was 150 participants consisting of health workers in health centre IVs and IIIs and patients receiving care in these facilities. The study used systematic sampling, with semi structured questionnaires on 100 patients in the facilities who are health care consumers and purposive sampling with self-administered questionnaires for 50 health workers. Data was analyzed using themes into tables with variables on quality of care pillars. Bivariate analysis was carried out through cross-tabulations on associations between task shifting and quality of healthcare indicators to generate chi-square and p-values.

Results

Quality of health care was assessed on the variables of safety, accessibility, equitability, timeliness, and patient centeredness of health care delivered under task shifting in Kalangala and Bukomansimbi districts.

Reliability of Healthcare Under Task-Shifting

The aspects of reliable healthcare, included ability to see the same person each time one visits the facility for consistency and follow up of ailments, adequate information given about one’s ailment and the treatment prescribed, an opportunity to ask questions and feeling comfortable to talk to the healthcare provider about personal health problems.

Hypothesis testing for the mean scores on quality of healthcare delivered in high and low task-shifting environments.
Bivariate Analysis

In testing the hypotheses, the quality of healthcare was assessed under five indicators which was the basis for the analysis as indicated in the qualitative responses above. Bivariate analysis was carried out through cross-tabulations on associations between the independent variables and the dependent variables to generate chi-square and p-values in the 2 x n tables. The chi-square ($\chi^2$) and p-values generated were used as appropriate to determine the likelihood of any observed relationships between the dependent and independent variables having occurred by chance alone. As an indicator of quality of healthcare, reliability was assessed using four indicators as indicated in Table 1 below. The study sought to test the following hypothesis:

$H_1$: Reliability as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi).

Table 1: Chi-Square Statistics for Reliability as an Indicator of Quality of Healthcare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure of Reliability</th>
<th>Bukomansimbi</th>
<th>Kalangala</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\chi^2$</td>
<td>p-values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Same person attends to me whenever I come for medical care</td>
<td>5.979</td>
<td>0.1127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate information is given about my condition and treatment prescribed</td>
<td>17.608</td>
<td>0.001*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am given an opportunity to ask questions and I am explained to in simple language</td>
<td>18.841</td>
<td>0.0003*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am comfortable talking to the healthcare provider about my personal problems related to my health condition</td>
<td>10.378</td>
<td>0.012*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With a chi-square of 5.978 and p-value of 0.1127 in Bukomansimbi and a chi-square of 4.982 and p-value of 0.1731 for Kalangala, there was no significant difference between the two districts in the same person attending to clients whenever they went for medical care. On the contrary, there was a difference between provision of adequate information about a client’s health condition and treatment prescribed. Clients in Bukomansimbi were more likely to be provided with information ($\chi^2 = 17.608$, p-value 0.0005) compared to clients in Kalangala district ($\chi^2 = 1.463$, p-value 0.691). In both districts, clients were comfortable talking to the healthcare provider about their personal problems related to their health condition with p-values less than 0.05 (Bukomansimbi p-value 0.012; Kalangala p-value 0.042). Overall, reliability as a measure of quality of healthcare was better in Bukomansimbi compared to Kalangala district. As such, the hypothesis that reliability as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi) was rejected.

Below are some of the qualitative response that were generated

Some Nurses are rude. They don’t even greet you; they want you to quickly tell them your ailment and go. When lines are long, they have no time for us. It becomes very difficult to confide in them. You only tell them what your problem is and they give you medicine and you go. But if you find a kind Nurse, then you can have the courage to discuss with them at length. (A female respondent from Luramba HC III in Kalangala district, 2018)
Another patient from Bukomansimbi had this to say:

Sometimes health workers don’t tell you anything about your ailment unless you ask. If you don’t ask, they leave you to go, but when you ask they tell. They have many patients to treat, so you also have to be assertive to ask. But when you ask, they also show interest and give you time. (A male respondents from Butenga HC IV in Bukomansimbi district, 2018)

From the above quotes, it is evident that while attitude of health workers is noticed in both districts, in Kalangala, some respondents felt that health workers were over stretched, have to work to serve all, while some are considered rude. In Bukomansimbi on the other hand, some respondents felt that health workers should be prompted in order for them to give information relating to patients’ diagnosis. Health workers have no self-drive to give health education unless a patient asks, but when patients ask, they are willing to explain and give in time, for health education.

Safety of Healthcare under Task-Shifting

This segment examined aspects of safety in healthcare delivered by health workers who are task shifting. Questions asked were; involvement of patients in decision making about the medication and prescription given, discussion between patients and health workers on prescribed medication, experiencing serious problems from a medical mistake and whether the health workers ask patients any medication-related problems. Respondents were further asked whether they receive enough information about the purpose, benefits and risks of medicines and injections given and whether they received instructions about symptoms to watch for in order to seek further care or treatment.

H2: Safety as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi). The test results of the five indicators for assessing safety as a measure of quality of health care are detailed in Table 2

Table 2 Chi-Square Statistics for Safety as an Indicator of Quality of Healthcare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure of safety</th>
<th>Bukomansimbi</th>
<th>Kalangala</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Had a discussion with care provider</td>
<td>7.688</td>
<td>14.650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-values</td>
<td>0.053*</td>
<td>0.0021*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ever had a serious medical mistake</td>
<td>0.642</td>
<td>16.332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-values</td>
<td>0.725</td>
<td>0.0003*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Always asked about allergies</td>
<td>12.615</td>
<td>4.366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-values</td>
<td>0.006*</td>
<td>0.2245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Given information on drug risks</td>
<td>17.060</td>
<td>1.719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-values</td>
<td>0.0001*</td>
<td>0.6327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructed about symptoms to watch</td>
<td>14.904</td>
<td>3.425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-values</td>
<td>0.0004*</td>
<td>0.3306</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With a $\chi^2$ of 7.688 and p-value of 0.053 in Bukomansimbi and $\chi^2$ of 14.650 and p-value of 0.0021 for Kalangala, both districts ensured that clients had a review and discussion with their primary care provider about prescribed medications they were given in the last visit at the health facility. However, clients in Kalangala district had ever experienced a serious problem as a result of a medical mistake made by health workers during the past two years (p-value 0.0003) compared to Bukomansimbi (p-value 0.725).
Bukomansimbi district had clients who had ever been asked about medication-related problems like allergies in their visit to the health facility in the past 2 years ($\chi^2 12.615; p$-value 0.006); were given enough information about the purpose, benefits and risks of the treatments the last time they received an injection ($\chi^2 17.060; p$-value 0.0001); and received clear instructions from the practitioner about symptoms to watch for and when to seek further care or treatment ($\chi^2 14.904; p$-value 0.0004). This was contrary to the results in Kalangala where the respective values were ($\chi^2 4.366; p$-value 0.2245), ($\chi^2 1.719; p$-value 0.6327) and ($\chi^2 3.425; p$-value 0.3306). Overall, safety as a measure of quality of health care was better in Bukomansimbi compared to Kalangala district. The hypothesis that safety as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi) was rejected.

Asked to explain their responses, below are some of the responses patients gave about their evaluation of safety of healthcare received:

There was a Nurse who was in charge of immunization. All children she injected would have sleepless nights and be admitted after two days. She didn’t know how to give injections but good enough, they transferred her. Coming for immunization meant admission after two days. We all knew it. (Testimony of a mother in Bufumira HC III in Kalangala District, 2018)

Another patient in Bukomansimbi had this to say:

Sometimes they give you medicine without telling you side effects. If you are allergic to some drugs, you get blisters. I was given an injected in 2014, I got a small blister on the leg and scratched it. It developed into a wound and in 2016, my leg was almost amputated, but I was taken to Masaka hospital where specialized care was given to save my leg. If the Nurse had told me the side effects, I would have sought treatment early but I didn’t connect the blister to the drug. Some Nurses are careless (Testimony of a male patient in Bukomansimbi, 2018)

While the respondent in Bukomansimbi suffered as a result of a wrong drug prescribed, the patient in Kalangala thought the Nurse was unprofessional in handling immunization vaccine. This could also be patient ignorance on managing children post immunization and not necessarily the problem of a particular Nurse, but it also speaks volumes on what information Nurses give patients on how to take care of themselves and the side effects of the drugs prescribed.

On a positive note however, one patient in Kalangala indicated that she has always received good information about the healthcare and this is what she had to say:

Although there are no doctors, here, the nurses know what they are doing. Every time they are giving you medicine, they tell you to first eat before you take the medicine and not to drink alcohol. They even ask you if you have ulcers before they give you the tablets. I have no problem with them (A female patient in Bigasa HC III in Bukomansimbi District, 2018)

The above revelation shows that nurses, although not highly qualified as a doctor would be, they possess the required skills to handle the needs of patients. They understand the procedure of prescribing and dispensing drugs. The question would be whether the drugs they dispense are the right drugs for the ailments, but the patients are happy with the services whatever the outcomes.
Equitability of Healthcare Under Task-Shifting

Respondents were asked questions that relate to equitability of care received. These included being provided with all drugs required as prescribed, given healthcare without discrimination, availability of clean water for taking drug and health workers following up how patients are doing with the medication prescribed. Respondents were further asked how easy it is to access healthcare in the evenings, over the weekends and on public holidays. They were also asked whether they receive outreach services in their communities.

H3: Equitability as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi). The test results of the five indicators for assessing safety as a measure of quality of health care are detailed in Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure of equitability</th>
<th>Bukomansimbi</th>
<th>p-values</th>
<th>Kalangala</th>
<th>p-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Always received prescribed drugs</td>
<td>7.493</td>
<td>0.0577*</td>
<td>18.630</td>
<td>0.0003*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No discrimination</td>
<td>4.675</td>
<td>0.1972</td>
<td>2.152</td>
<td>0.5414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clean water to take drugs</td>
<td>21.331</td>
<td>0.0001*</td>
<td>6.176</td>
<td>0.1034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow up</td>
<td>5.504</td>
<td>0.1384</td>
<td>3.242</td>
<td>0.3306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare in evenings &amp; public holidays</td>
<td>24.769</td>
<td>0.0001*</td>
<td>8.281</td>
<td>0.0405*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community outreach services</td>
<td>12.022</td>
<td>0.0073*</td>
<td>21.34</td>
<td>0.0001*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

With a $\chi^2$ of 7.493 and p-value of 0.0577 in Bukomansimbi and a $\chi^2$ of 18.630 and p-value of 0.0003 for Kalangala, both districts ensured that clients were always provided with all the drugs they require as prescribed. In both districts, some level of discrimination was practiced in providing healthcare services (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 4.675 and p-value 0.1972; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 42.152 and p-value 0.5414). Health facilities in Bukomansimbi had clean water when clients needed to take drugs ($\chi^2$ 21.331 and p-value 0.0001) compared to Kalangala. No health workers made follow up to know how clients were performing after prescribing medication in both districts but it was easy to receive care from the health facility in the evening, weekend and public holidays in both districts (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 24.769 and p-value 0.0001; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 8.281 and p-value 0.0405). In both districts, the communities received outreach services from the health facilities (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 12.022 and p-value 0.0073; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 21.34 and p-value 0.0001).

Overall, equitability as a measure of quality of health care was better in Bukomansimbi compared to Kalangala district. The hypothesis that equitability as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi) was rejected.

However, respondents were probed on the quantitative responses concerning equitability and below are some of their responses:

Community outreaches have a financial gain for the health works from PHC money, so when opportunity comes, they will work, but these are not often. However, following up patients is only
for project patients like HIV patients and mothers. May be those projects are funded. But for other illnesses, follow up is rear. (A female patient from Kitanda HCIII in Bukomansimbi District, 2018)

Another respondent had this to say about the drugs not being available at the facilities:

There is limited supply of drugs by the government and they quickly run out. When we see the vehicle coming to deliver the drugs we all come to the facility and in two weeks, the health workers will say some drugs are over. They start giving us Panadol tablets only, telling us to go and buy in drug shops (A female respondent at Bufumira HC III in Kalangala district, 2018)

One respondent also had this to say about accessing service delivery over the weekends and public holidays:

Most departments at the facility are either closed or with no health worker to attend to patients on weekends and public holidays for example laboratory. The staff live in Masaka and Kampala… and come late on Monday because they have to wait for the ferry... You wait for lab staff or pharmacy staff and sometimes you have to come the following day … (A female respondent at Kalangala HC IV in Kalangala district, 2018)

On a positive note, a respondent in Kalangala had this to say about equitability:

The health workers here have regard for all patients, especially the elderly and pregnant mothers. These ones are given special care which is very good. They treat all patients with respect, no discrimination and when the drugs are available, they will give them to you without asking you for money. After all these are not for sale government drugs (A female respondent at Lulamba HC III in Kalangala district, 2018)

While not all drugs prescribed may be available at the facility, depending on the ailments presented, it is worth noting that the facilities do their best to take care of the patients with the limited resource available hence providing equitable healthcare. However, the issue of outreaches and follow up of patients seems to be successful for the specialized ailments like HIV and Maternal health which are funded.

**Patient Centered Healthcare under Task-Shifting**

Respondents were asked questions that relate to patient centeredness as an indicator of quality healthcare. These included attention given to patients’ concerns, respect given by the staff, involvement in healthcare decision making process, having helpful discussion between patients and health workers, sensitivity of health workers to culture, ethnicity, spirituality and values of patients, patients given privacy as they receive care and use of a language which patients can understand.

*H₀: Patient centeredness as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi).*

The test results of the eight indicators for assessing safety as a measure of quality of health care are detailed in Table 4.

**Table 4: Chi-Square Statistics for Patient Centeredness as an Indicator of Quality of Healthcare**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure of patient centeredness</th>
<th>Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$</th>
<th>$p$-values</th>
<th>Kalangala $\chi^2$</th>
<th>$p$-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health concerns listened to</td>
<td>15.977</td>
<td>0.0011*</td>
<td>12.487</td>
<td>0.006*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Treated me with respect 16.066 0.0011* 5.140 0.162
Involved me in drug decision making 9.021 0.029* 3.323 0.344
Helpful discussion about my illness 20.721 0.0001* 18.711 0.0003*
Respected for my culture & values 11.150 0.0109* 1.969 0.579
Understandable language 4.123 0.249 2.153 0.541
Given privacy 2.4264 0.4887 5.0736 0.1665
A forum for feedback 11.6944 0.007* 1.3698 0.7126

In both districts, the concerns of clients were listened to whenever they sought healthcare services (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 15.977 and p-value 0.0011; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 12.487 and p-value 0.006). Equally, clients had helpful discussions with the health workers about their illness (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 20.721 and p-value 0.0001; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 18.711 and p-value 0.0003).

Unlike Kalangala, the healthcare providers who attended to clients in Bukomansimbi treated them with respect ($\chi^2$ 16.066 and p-value 0.0011); they involved the clients in decision making before prescribing drugs ($\chi^2$ 9.021 and p-value 0.029); respected clients’ culture, ethnicity and spiritual values ($\chi^2$ 11.150 and p-value 0.0109); and there was a forum for feedback and clients’ concerns were always taken care of ($\chi^2$ 11.6944 and p-value 0.007). In both districts, the health workers did not communicate to clients in a language that they understood and clients were not given privacy while in care.

Overall, patient centeredness as a measure of quality of health care was better in Bukomansimbi compared to Kalangala district. The hypothesis that patient centeredness as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi) was rejected.

Respondents were probed on the above responses and below are quotes from some of the respondents;

“When you write anything in the suggestion box, the staff will create enmity against you and the next time they will make you wait and make you sit for long. I avoid even getting close to that box” (a female patient at Butenga in Bukomansimbi district about the feedback forum, 2018)

Another respondent in Kalangala had this to say:

Some health workers generally don’t greet patients, but these are few and it’s their character. But generally, they care about us and I have no problem with them (a confession of a male patient from Bufumira HCIII in Kalangala district, 2018)

Not all was negative! A respondent in Bukomansimbi district had this to say:

Some of us are naturally rude and rough that even when we come to facilities we forget that these health workers are providing us a service. The [health workers] really try their best to give us good care. Imagine someone attending to people who are ungrateful, in pain and some with life threatening disease. I highly appreciate and sympathize with them (a male patient at Butenga HC IV in Bukomansimbi, 2018)
In Kalangala, a female patient had this to say on language:

Kalangala has people from all walks of life. We speak different languages and very few of us can ably sustain a conversation in English. Some of the health workers don’t even know Luganda. But they try their best to make sure that each one of us is spoken to in their language or at least get someone to interpret. They are very good! They ensure that

We speak out and say our problems so that we get the right diagnosis (a female patient in Bufumira HC III in Kalangala, 2018)

Customer care in health service delivery may not compare to business customer care. Where patients have pain and one is expected to satisfy their needs by reducing the pain, the challenge is insurmountable. It is worth noting that in both districts, the statistics show a high percentage of agreement that generally healthcare is patient centered as compared to the rest of the indicators of quality of health care. The patient’s comments also indicate that they appreciate the efforts of health workers in providing healthcare amidst the challenges of language barrier, negativity from the patients etc.

**Timely Healthcare Under Task-Shifting**

Time taken by a health worker to respond to inquiries at a facility and the time spent with a health worker while delivering healthcare are crucial in assessing quality of healthcare. Aspects examined on timely health care included sufficient time spent with a health worker, receiving immediate response when an inquiry is made, the facility having a resting area as one waits for care and one being able to receive healthcare within an hour after arrival at the facility.

**H5: Timeliness as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi).** The test results of the eight indicators for assessing safety as a measure of quality of health care are detailed in Table 5

**Table 5: Chi-Square Statistics for Timeliness as an Indicator of Quality of Healthcare**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure of timeliness</th>
<th>Bukomansimbi</th>
<th>Kalangala</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\chi^2$</td>
<td>$p$-values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sufficient time with health worker</td>
<td>18.361</td>
<td>0.0004*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate response for inquiry</td>
<td>12.180</td>
<td>0.002*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiting place available</td>
<td>5.433</td>
<td>0.143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 hour patient waiting time</td>
<td>20.721</td>
<td>0.0001*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the analysis table 5 above, the time clients spent with the healthcare provider was sufficient in both districts (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 18.361 and $p$-value 0.0004; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 7.883 and $p$-value 0.049). Equally, clients got immediate response whenever they made a health inquiry (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 12.180 and $p$-value 0.002; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 11.228 and $p$-value 0.004). Facilities in both districts did not have a place where clients rested while waiting. In both districts, clients were able to get healthcare within 1 hour of arrival at the facility (Bukomansimbi $\chi^2$ 20.721 and $p$-value 0.0001; Kalangala $\chi^2$ 18.770 and $p$-value 0.0003). Overall, timeliness as a measure of quality of health care was the same in Bukomansimbi and Kalangala districts. The hypothesis that timeliness as an indicator of quality of healthcare was better in a low task-
shifting environment (Kalangala) than in a high task-shifting environment (Bukomansimbi) was rejected.

Probed concerning the challenge of timely healthcare, the following responses were noted;

"It’s a common thing to come here and spend almost the whole morning without a health worker especially on Mondays. They come late because they go away on the weekend. They find so many patients and you have to also wait for long. Such delays are inevitable although they are for particular days." (A male patient from Bufumira HC III in Kalangala District, 2018)

In Bukomansimbi however, the story was different, it was about numbers

"In some seasons, many people fall sick and we have very few health workers. If you find like one or two at the facility, you wait for a long time. But when they are all available, especially on Wednesdays when there is immunization, then we take a short time" (a mother from Bigasa HCIII in Bukomansimbi, 2018)

The stretching of health workers who have to look after so many patients cannot be over looked. There are many patients and in known seasons when many sicknesses fall such as when malaria is rampant, the number of health workers is not increased. Patient waiting time therefore can be said to be seasonal.

Multivariate Analysis

To relate the outcome variable with the independent variables, a multiple regression analysis was carried out. The multiple regression equation used was given by the formula: $Y = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_1 + \beta_2 X_2 + \beta_3 X_3 + \ldots$. Where $Y$ is the outcome variable i.e. direct costs or indirect costs of health care, $\beta_0$ is a constant; $\beta_1$, $\beta_2$ and $\beta_3$ are regression coefficients of independent variables $X_1$, $X_2$ and $X_3$ respectively. In making up the model, only factors that were found to be associated with the outcome variable from bivariate analysis and those known to have a bearing on the quality of health care were used. All categorical variables were transformed into dummies to enable performance of linear regression. The best model for each category of reliability, safety, equitability, patient centeredness and timeliness as measurements for quality of health care was selected.

Table 6: Regression Statistics for Quality Of Healthcare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>t Statistic</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reliability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate information given</td>
<td>0.023</td>
<td>0.002*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to ask</td>
<td>0.406</td>
<td>0.016*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comfortable to confide</td>
<td>0.713</td>
<td>0.079*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Safety</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Had a discussion with care provider</td>
<td>2.182</td>
<td>0.034*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ever had a serious medical mistake</td>
<td>-1.490</td>
<td>0.143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Always asked about allergies</td>
<td>1.451</td>
<td>0.153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Given information on drug risks</td>
<td>-0.930</td>
<td>0.357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructed about symptoms to watch</td>
<td>0.465</td>
<td>0.644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Equitability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Always received prescribed drugs</td>
<td>-0.158</td>
<td>0.875</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dependent variable: Quality of health care. (*p < 0.05) Adjusted R Square = 0.64

From the regression analysis in Table 4.13, the results show an adjusted R square (proportion of the variability) of 0.64. It implies that the model has good explanatory power i.e. it explains up to 64% of the variability of the variables that are associated with quality of healthcare services in low and high task shifting environments. Consequently, the quality of healthcare was influenced by the following factors which had a positive correlation. Adequacy of information given to clients, the opportunity to ask and comfortable to confide under reliability, influenced the quality of health care. With respect to safety, the quality of health care was influenced by the ability of healthcare workers to discuss with the clients. In terms of equitability, availability of clean water to take drugs influenced the quality of health care services. Lastly, patient centeredness was influenced by the ability of health workers to listen to the concerns of clients and being able to treat them well. Whereas Kalangala district is a low task-shifting environment with more health workers at 82% as compared to Bukomansimbi at 62%, (Ministry of Health, 2016) the findings indicated that in most aspects of quality of healthcare, Bukomansimbi scored better than Kalangala.

On the aspect of reliability, there was no significant difference between the two districts in the same person attending to clients whenever they went for medical care. On the contrary, there was a difference between provision of adequate information about a client’s health condition and treatment prescribed; Bukomansimbi was doing better than Kalangala. In both districts, clients were comfortable talking to the healthcare provider about their personal problems related to their health condition. These results can be attributed to the trainings, regular support supervision and In-service and mentorship available in Bukomansimbi that healthcare is much more reliable than in Kalangala. There is also a possibility that the personnel in Bukomansimbi district (health workers) are more professional in handling their patients than Kalangala hence their high score in reliability.

Concerning safety as an indicator of quality of healthcare, the findings indicate that both districts ensured that clients had a review and discussion with their primary care provider about prescribed medications they were given in the last visit at the health facility. However, clients in Kalangala district had ever experienced a serious problem as a result of a medical mistake made by health workers during the past two years (p-value 0.0003) compared to Bukomansimbi (p-value 0.725). Respect for clients’ values was equally high in
Bukomansimbi as compared to Kalangala. While Bukomansimbi scored better than Kalangala in safety, the level of difference was not very significant.

Kalangala district has more facilities than Bukomansimbi district, is much more developed and older district (Uganda Bureau of Statistics, 2014), with more health workers, fewer population as compared to Bukomansimbi, the time patients spend at the facility should be less. The findings however indicate the contrary in terms of quality of healthcare delivered. In a study by Musisi, it was noted that a number of health workers take study leave and facilities are left porous without health workers, yet while the statistics show that the staffing is high: the actual numbers in place are few (Musisi, 2017).

Interestingly, studies carried out in Sub saharan Africa have found that quality of healthcare under task-shifting was not any different from that where professionals were involved both in results and cost (Shumbusho, et al, (2008), Jouquet et al, (2009), and Olikira, Baine & Kasangaki (2014). Thompson and Strickland on strategic management advise that an organization’s core competencies reside in its people and in its intellectual capital, not in its assets on the balance sheet (Thompson & Strickland, 2004). This is in support of the study findings that the facilities in Bukomansimbi are depending on the intellectual capital of the few health workers available and not necessarily the numbers.

Moreover, the results of this study can be compared to the study that was carried out in Mozambique (Fulton, et al., 2011) where it was found out that surgically trained Clinical Officers produced similar patient outcomes at a significant lower cost as compared to physicians’ obstetricians and gynaecologists. While the contradiction indicated safety concerns with HIV/AIDS care in sub Saharan African while analysing task-shifting, (Fulton, et al., 2011), this study indicated that patients evaluated healthcare as safe in Bukomansimbi more than in Kalangala. Clients in Kalangala district noted to have ever experienced a serious problem as a result of a medical mistake made by health workers during the past two years (p-value 0.0003) compared to Bukomansimbi (p-value 0.725).

In triangulating the qualitative results, patients in Bukomansimbi appreciated the healthcare provided by male nurses whom they perceived as doctors. While this can be a stereotype kind of thinking that certain roles are better provided by a given gender orientation, there is a possibility that this can be a confounder for the results of the study.

**Theoretical and Conceptual Connections with the Study Findings**

Bandura’s social learning theory gives the study a thought process of looking at what can be done by individuals when given an opportunity to do it regardless of whether they have studied it as long as they are given step by step guidance in doing it. We note that workers in both districts are distinctly performing well and the recipients of services are happy with what they get. This is the connection of the study findings and the theory. However, the theory helps to identify missing links in the performance of health workers under task-shifting. There is limited motivation in form of rewards and punishments. Models/mentors are almost not available to demonstrate to health workers what they are supposed to do. The theory guides that there should be mentorship, and the study findings indicate that mentorship is very limited in both districts although Bukomansimbi is better than Kalangala

Interestingly, the conceptual aspects of the independent variable were all observed in the task-shifting process in both districts however, the intervening variables that could influence the quality of healthcare were in a limited stream. While tasks are shifted in the conceptual four levels of doctor to Clinical officers,
Clinical Officer to Nurse/Midwives, Nurse to Nursing Assistant and Nursing Assistant to care take/patient. There are limitations in resources, supporting policies, and the much desirable support supervision. The theory though, does not provide aspects of how desired outcomes are evaluated and appraised to base the outcomes on the theory assumptions. The study was able to identify that the theory is limited in areas of evaluation of outcomes of individuals who are being mentored. What methods are in place to know that one’s performance is a result of what has been taught through observation, mentoring, supervision and remuneration other than an individual’s own initiative to learn and or intrinsic motivation and personal skills? In a place where there is more than one person, how do you attribute the performance to all supposing the effort belongs to one person? Such aspects are not provided for in the theory and the researcher felt that this is a good area of further discourse. Where task-shifting is successful, and mentors are rightfully available, the theory does not provide how one can appraise the outcomes on mentorship without consideration of aspects such as intrinsic motivation of the workers.

**Conclusion**

The study concludes that the success story of task-shifting cannot be complete without supervision, mentorship and training. As a way of enhancing task-shifting implementation, it is suitable to say that these aspects were available in both districts for the health workers at different levels. At least every worker had attended some kind of in-service training as a way of facilitating task shifting. Both districts scored well in patient centered, safe and reliable healthcare although scoring low on equitability of health care. In all aspects of quality of healthcare, one can conclude that all the aspects are well taken care of in both districts although at different levels. However, the study concludes that quality of healthcare is better in Bukomansimbi district than Kalangala although Kalangala district has more health workers than Bukomansimbi. The conclusion is that while numbers are critical, quality delivered can still be achieved with fewer human resources as long as they are conditioned to supervision, in-service training and mentorships.

Theoretically, one can conclude that Bandura’s learning theory can be localized to aspects of staff performance only if we have mentors, models, motivation and support supervision in place like they were noted in Bukomansimbi as opposed to Kalangala district. The theory though is not exhaustive in all contexts.

The study recommends that in order to achieve quality healthcare, workers should be motivated, mentored, trained and supervised. There should be regular support supervision in health facilities both from the district and the local communities and empower the patients to demand for quality services. Health workers should be given regular training and mentorship in order for them to learn and be updated with medical changes. The training must be systematic and based on skills needs assessment.

With respect to reliability, areas of concern and emphasis should be information given to patients about their ailments, giving patients an opportunity to ask questions. Under safety, emphasis should be on giving information to clients on the risks of drugs prescribed and what the drugs are intended to treat. In terms of equitability, clean water to take drugs was expressed as a need specifically for Kalangala yet both districts were performing well in all other aspects. Under patient centered care, it was noted that patients expressed need for respect, involvement in decisions for treatment plan and respect for their cultures and values. Lastly, under timeliness it was noted that both districts do not have comfortable waiting areas for patients.
Furthermore, whereas task-shifting is a reality in Uganda and perhaps in the rest of Africa, it needs to be recognized, formalized, and mainstreamed into health services policy to address the shortage of HRH. This will require a number of reforms in governance, recruitment and sustainability and a review of the current staffing and health staff cadre levels. It will require harmonization of labor laws and policies. All the changes should then be reflected in the HRH policy and plans of the country. The gist of the policy should not be to limit the growth of health staff numbers but empower lower cadre staff with more skills to carry out more roles in health service delivery. This will be handy in places where higher cadres, such as doctors and senior Nurses, are not available. With this the remuneration and motivation of the cadres should also come automatically.

Importantly, the study recommends a model of task shifting implementation that puts in consideration of the respondents/patients concerns, the health workers expectations and study findings. The recommended model is presented below;

![Figure 1: Showing a Proposed Model for Task Shifting Implementation in Health Care Delivery](image)

The recommended task shifting model above starts with theoretical assumptions as expounded by Bandura’s theories on social learning and social cognitive. It proposes that there should be a strategy for training health workers while in service in order to avoid dependency on their basic training which is not appropriate for the delegated roles. With mentors and regular support supervision, the model suggests that the four levels of task shifting can now start. These are followed up with regulations and policy support that specifies the guidelines for task shifting, the health worker indemnity and reward and punishment strategies for desired performance. In the end, all the above in place should lead to the desired quality of health care that is safe, reliable, patient centered, timely and equitable.
References


A Study on the Barriers Affecting Participation in Public Procurement in Uganda

Faith Mbabazi & Saharu Nassazi
Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority
Corresponding E-mail: faith.mbabazi@gmail.com / snassazi@ppda.go.ug

Abstract
This paper attempts to build knowledge from the experiences of the private sector or service providers in participating in bidding for government contracts within the current public procurement system in Uganda. The procurement law in Uganda provides that all procurement and disposal shall be conducted in a manner that maximizes competition and achieves value for money. In addition the public procurement oversight body’s (PPDA) strategic plan objective targeted to increase the average number of bids received per procurement from three bids to five bids by the end of financial year 2018/19. However procurement audit findings revealed that 63% of the entities audited score an unsatisfactory performance in terms of compliance to at least 3 bids per procurement. This paper presents the findings from a survey of the private sector (potential bidders) on the barriers hindering participation in bidding for government contracts and recommends mechanisms that can enhance competition in public procurement. The findings suggest a number of challenges faced by the bidding community and the need to address these barriers if the country wants to achieve competition in public procurement.

Key words: Public Procurement, Competition, Bidder Participation

Introduction
In every country, the government plays a major role in the marketplace through the procurement of goods, services and works. According to a report by World Bank in 2017 on benchmarking public procurement, Governments in developing countries are significant purchasers of good and services, and these markets represent large opportunities to enhance competition and development. Low-income countries have the highest share of public procurement in their economies, at 14.5 percent of GDP, followed by upper-middle income countries, at 13.6 percent (World Bank, 2017). In Uganda, public procurement is estimated at 60% of the total on-budget resources (excluding wages but including on-budget donor financing).

Because of the magnitude of the spending involved, public procurement is a source of business opportunities for the private sector and therefore can be used as a policy tool to make markets more competitive and thus improve the quality of government services (World Bank, 2016). Public procurement can therefore impact the structure and functioning of the market beyond the mere quantities of goods and services purchased. In the short-term, public procurement can impact competition among potential suppliers; in the long-term, public procurement can affect investment, innovation and the competitiveness of the market. (OECD, 2013).

Since Government is a major buyer of goods and services, its own actions greatly influence how the market operates and therefore impact on competition and on the long-term value for money it can secure. Genuine competition leads to low prices and better products which results in resources either being saved or freed up for use on other goods and services. Competition is also instrumental in preventing bid collusion, corruption and also increases the confidence of bidders while promoting local business development.

To ensure there is competition in the public procurement system in the country, the Procurement law in Uganda stipulates that all procurement and disposal shall be conducted in a manner that maximizes competition and achieves value for money. In addition to the open bidding methods, the PPDA (rules and
methods for procurement of supplies, works and non-consultancy services) regulations provides that a Procuring and Disposing Entity shall obtain at least three bidders for the restricted bidding, request for quotations and micro procurement methods. (PPDA Act, 2003)

**Problem Statement**

In addition to the regulations that are in place to guide procuring Entities achieve competition in public procurement, the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (the regulatory body for public procurement) included in its strategic plan, an objective to increase competition and hence contribute to domestic industry development. The target outcome for this objective is to increase the average number of bids received from three to five by the end of financial year 2018/19. However a report on the performance of the public procurement system for the financial year 2017/18 revealed that an average of only two bids was received per procurement. Furthermore the procurement audit reports further indicated that 63% of the entities audited were rated unsatisfactory in the financial year 2016/17 in terms of compliance to at least three bids per procurement. This was an increase from 52% of the entities for audits conducted in 2015/16. This low level of competition in government procurement means that Government does not benefit from lower costs of purchase and other benefits of competition that would result if several bidders were involved. Therefore, in this paper, a survey was conducted to establish the barriers hindering participation in bidding for government contracts and recommend mechanisms that can enhance competition in public procurement.

**Literature Review**

According to Ware et al., 2007, competitive tendering procedures that limit discretion on the part of procurement officials facilitate maximizing “value for money” and minimize corruption in procurement. Transparency in public procurement means that procurement information is widely accessible, and there are complaints mechanisms and auditing procedures that establish accountability for procurement decisions. These are believed to encourage participation of more firms and deter “kickbacks” and other forms of fraud and corruption (Ware et al., 2007). This suggests that any feature of public procurement processes that limits participation has a negative impact on competition in the short-term.

Open procurement markets foster competitiveness by reducing purchasing costs, encouraging innovation and entrepreneurship. This leads higher productivity, more incentives to innovate, faster economic growth (OECD, 2003). Competition enables the participating firms to learn from one another and thereby to continuously improve their products in addition to their marketing and production techniques. Despite the fact that competition is a core principle of public procurement, its promotion has not received high-level attention as an aspect of international governance. (Schooner, 2002). Public procurement is often said to restrict participation unnecessarily and to increase participation costs, in particular for smaller bidders, thus discriminating in favor of larger firms who regularly take part in public tenders (OFT, 2004). Factors that unnecessarily increase participation costs and discriminate against smaller firms include: restricted communication and publication of contract opportunities, excessive information requirements, and overly narrow pre-qualification criteria, placing too much emphasis on past experience or firm size.

According Tomáš Hanák and Petra Muchová, 2015 in their study on the “impact of competition on prices in public sector procurement”, the number of bids in a tender plays a significant role in the overall efficiency of a project as the prices achieved in the tender will decrease with the increase of the number of bids
submitted. However the authors further noted that the number of bidders depends on a variety of aspects, for example the type of the subject matter (type of structure) or the volume of the project.

Methodology
To obtain the opinions of respondents on the causes of low bidder participation, a survey was conducted. The survey targeted the service providers for all the categories of procurement including supplies, services and works. The respondents were required to complete a semi-structured questionnaire that was administered physically and in some cases by email. A total of 1,200 participants were invited to participate and 737 (61%) responded to the survey. Out of the 737 respondents, 61% dealt in supplies, 44% of the respondents dealt in works, 28% dealt in consultancy services and 17% dealt in non-consultancy services. According to the category of age of business, 5% of the respondents have been in existence for less than 1 year, 44% for between 1 and 5 years, 28% for between 6 and 10 years, 23% have been in existence for over 10 years.

To increase validity of the study findings, face to face interviews were conducted with 12 key informants from competent institutions including head procurement and disposal units, Private Sector Foundation Uganda, Uganda Manufacturers Association and PPDA. The insights from these informants were significant in exploring practical recommendations for improving competition in public procurement. For the survey data, we use descriptives within Microsoft Excel for data analysis while for the face-to-face interview data, we adopt the content analysis method. We used concurrent analyses and complemented this information with the other secondary data including the PPDA annual audit reports for the financial years 2016/17 and 2017/18.

Findings and Discussion

Prequalification of Potential Bidders
The Procurement Law provides for the prequalification method of procurement that is used specifically to obtain a shortlist of bidders, with the particular intention of ensuring that the bids are confined to potential bidders. The method is beneficial where the works, services or supplies to be acquired are highly complex, specialized or requires detailed design or methodology, the costs of preparing a detailed bid would discourage competition; or the evaluation is particularly detailed and the evaluation of a large number of bids would require excessive time and resources from a PDE (PPDA Act, 2003). The study sought to establish whether the respondents had been prequalified with at least one Government entity. 72% of the respondents had been prequalified with at least one government entity while 28% were not prequalified with any Government entity.

Familiarity with Public Procurement Procedures
The study sought to establish whether the service providers were familiar with the public procurement procedures to assess whether they were knowledgeable in participating in public procurement. 94% of the respondents were familiar with preparation of bids, 86% of the respondents were familiar with the bid submission methods. 68% were familiar with the procurement methods and only 40% were familiar with the administrative review process (complaints handling mechanism).

Barriers Affecting Participation in Public Procurement

140
The study sought to establish the barriers hindering the business community from participating in public procurement. 67% of the respondents reported more than one barrier hindering their participation in bidding for government contracts. Overall, 54% cited delays in payments, 53% cited corruption, 46% reported high cost of bidding, 41% reported ambiguous/unclear specifications, 36% reported inadequate knowledge of the available opportunities, 35% reported lack of finances and 14% reported lack of technical capacity to meet procurement demands.

**Figure 1: Barriers Hindering the Private Sector from Bidding for Government Contracts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Delays in Payments</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High cost of bidding</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear Specifications</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate knowledge on the available opportunities</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of finances</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of technical capacity to meet the procurement demands</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Delays in Payments**

The findings revealed delayed payments as a major barrier to participation in bidding for Government contracts as illustrated in the figure above. To compliment these findings, the annual procurement audit reports for the last 2 financial years (FY 2015/16 and FY 2016/17) revealed that an average of only 40% of the entities audited had a satisfactory performance under the payment ratio indicator. The procurement law provides that the period for payment shall be thirty days from certification of invoices however respondents reported that in most cases the payments by Government are beyond the required time and could even go up to beyond six months. Delays in payments lead to increase on the cost of capital where the service providers have used borrowed money to execute the contracts. With the high interest rates in the country, some bidders have fallen out of business. “The business community has no problem borrowing from the banks only if they are assured of timely payments” reported a respondent.

Interviews with key informants revealed that delays in payments are caused by a number of factors including delays in approvals by the respective entity staff, poor planning and budgeting especially in the local governments that have unprotected votes. This means that entities are committing government without securing funds for payments of the delivered goods, services or works. In other instances the entities experienced budget cuts by the Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development and are therefore not able to pay the providers in time.
Corruption
Corruption was reported as a key barrier to competition in public procurement. Respondents reported that there was no transparency in the entire procurement process as sometimes the contracts are awarded to companies owned mostly by the government employees and politicians or their relatives in the respective entities. An example is case where the procurement officers leaked the information to favored bidders “The advertising process is just a formality to comply with the PPDA requirements” reported a respondent.

According to the 3rd Public Procurement Integrity Survey conducted in 2015, 71.8% of respondents believed there to be corruption in public procurement. The survey further revealed that 60% of service providers reported that they had bribed public officials to influence tenders and 54% of respondents reported that the value of bribes was over 10 per cent of the contracted procurement value. It is because of these perceptions that the bidders are discouraged from bidding for government contracts. “It is a waste of money to spend on the bidding process yet the best bidders are already determined” reported a respondent.

Corruption has an impact on the cost of delivering services, as firms anticipate paying bribes, they increase the contract price by an amount corresponding to the anticipated bribe resulting in high public spending and therefore fewer services are provided with the available resources. If tendering processes are rigged, “competition cannot play its role of driving the prices down and the quality up” (World Bank, 2016).

High Cost of Bidding
Respondents further reported that the bidding process involves unregulated high costs of bidding that discourage potential bidders from bidding for government contracts. Some of the direct costs incurred by providers include;

i. the non refundable bidding fee
ii. Printing and photocopying of bidding documents,
iii. the cost of obtaining bid securities from the bank,
iv. cost of obtaining the eligibility documents from the different institutions for example the certificate of incorporation, trading license, PPDA certificate
v. Cost of preparing the bidding documents (some bidders hire consultants to prepare the documents)

The PPDA Regulations (2014) provide that the bidding documents may be sold in order to recover the cost of printing, copying and distribution and the price shall be calculated to cover only the costs and shall not include any profit. However the survey noted that some entities are using the bidding fees as a source of revenue for the entity leading to the increased costs. The transactions costs incurred in fulfilling bidding requirements is more burdensome for mostly the smaller firms as the larger firms are more likely to have the necessary expertise and connections to meet bidding requirements.

In some entities, costs are paid before and after prequalification processes. To a bidder who participated in bidding for more than one procurement to broaden their chances, these costs are higher. Respondents further reported that some entities still request for bid securities even when the PPDA law was amended to provide for the bid securing declaration for quotations and restricted domestic bidding.
**Vague and Unclear Requirements**

Respondents reported that sometimes the requirements stated in the bidding requirements are vague. In addition, in some cases the amount of experience and amount of turnover rates required are not necessary for the procurements stated. This discourages potential bidders as it favors only the few large firms. An example is requiring equipment such as motor grader, bulldozer, and roller when bidding for a classroom block. The setting of restrictive criteria is questionable as the specifications indicated are in some cases exaggerated for the procurement and hence limits the participation of many bidders.

**Inadequate Knowledge on Available Procurement Opportunities**

Respondents reported that the bidding opportunities have not been publicized enough and sometimes they miss out on participating because of lack of knowledge on the available opportunities. In some cases the knowledge about the opportunities is obtained when it’s already too late to prepare and submit responsive bid documents, in other instances providers that are prequalified are not contacted to participate in the bidding for contracts. The survey sought to establish the medium through which respondents access the tender information. 89% of the providers have accessed the tender advertisement through News papers, 31% through the entity notice boards, 15% through entity websites and 16% through the Government procurement portal.

**Figure 2: Accessibility to Government Procurement Opportunities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Newspapers</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entity Notice boards</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Procurement Portal</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entity websites</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Lack of Access to Capital**

Respondents reported that challenges of lack of access to capital/funds to enable them boost and sustain their businesses is a barrier to their participation in public procurement. The cost of doing business in the country is high with Uganda ranking as 122 out of 190 surveyed countries in terms of costs (hardships) of doing business (World Bank, 2018). This implies that most companies did not have the financial strength to deal in government contracts.

**Responsiveness of Bids**

58% of the respondents had not been awarded at least one government contract in the last 3 years while 42% have been awarded at least one contract in the last 3 years. The study sought to establish the reasons for the unsuccessful bids. 71% of the respondents reported that they had not given the reason for failure, 36% reported high bid price, 31% reported lack of experience, 19% reported incomplete documentation and 14% reported lack of technical capacity to meet the procurement demand. Majority of the respondents
did not know why their bids were not successful and were therefore not aware on where they should improve when participating in the next opportunity. Because of this lack of feedback, bidders were bound to believe that the process was not transparent.

Conclusion and Recommendations
The survey findings suggest that there are a number of challenges affecting competition in public procurement. Some of these challenges are internal to the procuring organisation but a number of factors are external and may therefore require the Government’s intervention. There are ongoing reforms in the procurement law that will mitigate some of the challenges. These include the introduction of E-government to promote transparency in public procurement and the promotion of participation of local companies in government procurement.

According to Ardwell et al, 2005, Strategic procurement should put into consideration the factors hindering the participation of bidders for Government contracts. The importance of competition for cost-effective public procurement is validated by the efforts that firms typically devote, in their business transactions, to ensure that they make effective use of competition to reduce the cost and increase the quality of inputs. In order to ensure competitive markets, there is need to incentivize suppliers to suit broader public sector requirements.

There is need to strengthen the compliance by the procuring organizations to the payment terms as stipulated in the procurement law. This can be achieved by establishing an effective monitoring system on the use of the Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS) during the payment of providers and identify the officers in charge of the delays in payment. Once the points of delays are identified then the responsible organizations can employ sanctions against the non-compliant staff.

To reduce the space for negotiating corruption, the Government plans to roll out an E-procurement system to reduce physical interface between service providers and the officials responsible for procurement. Other benefits of the E-procurement system include foster easier and faster access to information, lower transaction costs, participation of a larger pool of firms from broader markets, and a faster bidding process.

There is need for increased awareness, sensitization and trainings of the procurement practitioners simplify bidding requirements so as to enhance competition. The bidding documents should be customized to allow for participation of the local and the upcoming small and medium enterprises. In addition, the oversight body should develop common specifications standards for commonly procured items.

The costs of bidding should be regulated for example the costs of selling the bidding documents as this will allow more bidders to participate at the prequalification stage. The oversight body should monitor the compliance of implementing the bid securing declaration instead of bid security for the quotation and restrictive methods as stipulated in the law.

Improved feedback mechanisms from procurement officers will motivate bidders to participate in public procurement for example a bidder should be given feedback on reasons why the bids were not successful. Procuring organisations should conduct regular pre-bid meetings and bidders’ forums that will improve the relationships and perceptions of the providers towards the personnel in the procuring organisations.
Other motivating strategies include appraising bidders and issuing certificates of good performance to bidders that have executed good work and put in place mechanisms to promote new bidders.

Acknowledgement
The research project was conducted by the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (PPDA). The authors are grateful to the various practitioners and PPDA staff for the comments and suggestions on the content.

References


PPDA (2015). The 3rd Public Procurement Integrity Survey Report

Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority, Regulations 2014.


145
Increasing Unspent Balances Returned to Consolidated Fund in Uganda’s Local Governments: A Factor of Local Government Accountability

Nyenje Aida Lubwama*, Peter Michael Owiny & Baker Lyadda
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
Local government accountability should not be viewed in isolation, but as part of the broader issue of governance and public management. The international community’s recognition in the late 1990s of the corrosive effect of inadequate accountability at all government levels is a logical extension of the link between governance and development created earlier in the decade. While progress has been made in a number of areas toward local government transparency and accountability with the establishment of institutional public sector budget frameworks, the rate of unspent funds in local governments appears increasing in almost all sectors in local government. This has been attributed to both internal and external factors. The diagnosis has been reflected in ensuring that there is better local government accountability.

Key Words: Consolidated Fund, Contingency Fund, Local Government Accountability, Budget, Auditor General

Introduction

According to United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification (UNCCD, 2017), the government of Uganda approved distinct proportions of inter-sectorial budget resources to the specific sectors of local governments for delivery of services to the public. For instance, government approved 42% of the total budget for local governments to primary education, 29.5% to primary health care, 4.9% to agriculture extension, 2.9% to functional adult literacy, 17.9% to road maintenance, 1% to community development and 1.2% to natural resources. A closer analysis of the above allocations to the inter-sectorial budget allocations reveals that primary education, primary health care and road maintenance consume relatively sizeable proportions of the local government budget in comparison to other sectors. In almost all cases, the government funds over 97% of the district local government budgets while other funding is drawn from local revenue and donations.

However, over the last ten years, for instance, the Health sector alone has had its budget on an increasing trend from Ugshs 474.41million in FY 2004/05 to Ugshs 676 billion in FY 2010/11 and Ugshs 1.2trillion in FY 2014/15. Despite the increments, the sector allocations remain at 8% of the national budget. The interesting factor is that whereas the sector receives a paltry 8% of the national budget, the sector often remains with unspent balances by end of the financial year, which is often returned to the Consolidated Fund. During FY 2013/14 the unspent balances at Central Government level accounted for 24.1% of the released national budget. In FY 2014/15, a total of Ugshs 159 billion (exclusive of arrears, taxes and interest payments) remained unutilized by the end of the FY. The Permanent Secretary and Secretary to Treasury, in a letter to all Accounting Officers dated 28th July 2015 noted that “.....Returns to the Uganda Consolidated Fund from closed accounts and various Treasury Single Account holding accounts amounted to Ugshs 192,927,070,399. This excluded returns from Oil and Railway Levy, Local governments, missions abroad and several projects.

Several health sector votes have struggled to absorb all released funds over the years. In FY 2014/15, the sector (Votes on the IFMS) failed to spend Ugshs 3.2bn. Regional Referral Hospitals failed to spend a total of Ugshs 1.4bn of their development budget while the Uganda Cancer Institute returned Ug shs 519m to
the Uganda Consolidated Fund at the end of the Financial Year. Per the Annual Budget Performance Report (FY 2014/15) under spending was significantly higher at Local Governments than at Central Government level.

The 2015 Ministry of Finance Absorptive Capacities Constraints Report ranked, the Ministry of Health 36th out of 62 MDAs. By October 2011, a total of Ugshs 3.7bn for the previous financial year had not been spent; Ugshs 2.3bn was unspent in FY 2011/12; Ugshs 26bn remained unspent in financial year 2012/13; Ugshs 18bn was unspent in 2013/14 and Ugshs 192bn unspent in financial year 2014/15.

Analysis of sector expenditure indicates that the amount of unspent funds have been increasing over the last five years. Specifically, a total of Ug shs 243bn was not spent in the last five years giving an annual average of Ug shs 48bn annually for the last five years. Failure to absorb funds was often attributed to; poor planning, delays in; procurement, disbursements and implementation. A number of entities failed to undertake procurement in a timely manner, for example GAVI failed to achieve and utilize most of the donor funds since Financial Year 2013/14 to date. Cases of late disbursements from Ministry of Finance were noted; during Financial Year 2014/15 all Regional Referral Hospitals received their 3rd and 4th quarter funds, two weeks late.

Implications of failing to spend allocated funds Loss of lives: According to the Auditor General’s Report FY 2014/15, a total of Ug shs 5.8 billion was not spent under the Global Fund project-Tuberculosis component. Uganda is among the high burden Tuberculosis countries in the World hence a number of Ugandans have continued to lose their lives to this deadly disease. The World Health Organisation noted that a total of 4,500 Ugandans died due to Tuberculosis in 2014. During FY 2013/14, only 3% of the Global Alliance for Vaccines Initiative budget was expended leaving enormous stock outs of the Pneumococcal Vaccine. According to the Pneumonia and Diarrhea Progress Report 2014, over 24,000 under-fives lost their lives to Pneumonia and Diarrhea in 2013.

Failing to spend severely affects service Delivery in a number of ways. For example, failure to distribute necessary pharmaceuticals to health centers led to medical stock outs in all public health facilities. At Local Government level, construction and renovation of health facilities are often incomplete yet funds are returned to the consolidated fund. For example in Maddu Health Center III, Gomba district the staff house which was planned for completion in Financial Year 2014/15 was incomplete yet a total of Ug shs 38.8m was returned to Consolidation Fund. Failure to achieve planned outputs and development plans: By the end of FY 2014/15, the Uganda Cancer Institute had unspent balances of over Ug shs 446m from their development budget yet a number of outputs including procurement of specialized machinery and construction of a radiotherapy bunker were outstanding. These two activities were rolled over to the subsequent financial year (FY2015/16).

Distortion of planning activities and losses in the real-time value for money; The Public Finance Management Act, 2015 further requires votes that return money to UCF to revise their annual work plans, procurement and recruitment plans in view of unspent funds. This contributes to loss of time and resources as activities have to be rescheduled. In some instances, delayed implementation is overtaken by changes in policy, for example, during FY 2012/13; a number of communities lost out on the benefits of having a nearby Health Centre II due to redirection of government priorities and policies on construction of HCIIIs. Contingency liability and exchange rate losses resulting from delayed implementation of projects: Some of the rolled over projects include Uganda Health Systems Strengthening Project (UHSSP) and Support to
Mulago Hospital Rehabilitation among others under MoH. As a result, the GoU components have been affected by exchange rate losses thus increasing the project costs. The aim of this paper is to assess the factors behind increasing level of consolidated fund returned from local governments and the best ways to overcome this problem in Uganda.

**Study Methodology**
The study relied majorly on documents linked to management of public funds related to Local Governments. A case study design with a specific focus on qualitative approach was applied to generate and analyze data.

**Rationale of Budgeting and Accountability**
According to the local government finance and accountability regulation Act 1998, the Local Government must produce a budget because: it has scarce resources which are not sufficient to carry out all its programmes and projects, it is a legal requirement, to identify and disclose sources of income, to requisition for funds to implement approved programmes so that a particular programme does not encroach on the resources of others, it is a requirement of good governance and a political tool that provides overall guidance and it is an information/communication tool for both the central government and donors detailing how transfers from them to local governments were utilized and whether compliance with donor and national objectives is being observed.

**Key Players and Stakeholders and their Roles in Budgeting**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Players</th>
<th>Roles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) LG Budget</td>
<td>○ Responsible for managing the local government budget process nationally and setting policies and guidelines to be applied during the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) MoFPED</td>
<td>○ Holds national budget conferences and regional local government budget framework workshops to kick-start the process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Line Ministries</td>
<td>○ Review of sector recurrent and development expenditure policy guidelines, allocation of conditional grants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Local Government Finance Commission</td>
<td>○ Advises on all allocations to LGs ○ Allocates unconditional, equalization grants ○ Ensures that local government budgets are balanced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Uganda Local Government Association (ULGA, ULAA &amp; UAAU)</td>
<td>○ Negotiates sector guidelines with the line ministries and advocates for local government on issues that concern them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) The Local Council</td>
<td>○ Approves the budget ○ Ensures the budget is implemented according to priority areas ○ Sets policy objectives and determines the development goals of LGs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) Executive Committee of the Council</td>
<td>○ Recommends policy to Council ○ Oversees implementation of council policies ○ Reviews costed priorities ○ Evaluates performance against approved work plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) Accounting Officer - CAO</td>
<td>○ Oversees budgeting and budgetary control to ensure that planned activities proceed within the prescribed framework ○ Oversees revenues collection and expenditure according to approved budgets ○ Gives technical guidance to council ○ Makes reports to the executive committee on the progress of activities and projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9) Budget Desk
- Prepares the budget which must be balanced
- Prepares the budget call
- Assists LLGs and HoDs in preparation of their budgets
- Provides technical input to make revenue projections
- Facilitates the prioritization process in sector committees and in the budget conference
- Gathers and records information to the MoFPED regional LG Budget Framework paper workshop
- Ensures sectors/departments observe the formal requirements for the budget including deadlines
- Consolidates and prepares the LGBFP and budget in time
- Prepares annual work plan

10) Chief Finance Officer
- Supervises and coordinates the budget desk
- Ensures that no expenditure is incurred that is not in the approved budget

11) HoDs
- Formulate sectorial plans and budgets
- Act as vote controllers

**Source:** Guide for participatory planning in LGs (MoLG).

### Pre-Conditions for Successful Budgeting
According to Luthas (2014) local government budget must meet the following conditions.

- The preparation process has to be consultative and participatory in order to ensure ownership to both process and approved budget
- A systematic process of prioritization of programmes and expenditure which is based on informed choices must take place
- Planned outputs, activities and expenditure allocations in the annual work plan and budget estimates must realistic and achievable
- Realistic revenue estimates

### The Criteria for Successful Budgeting Process
According to the local government Act 1997, local council budget must be prepared in accordance to the following criteria.

- The full council must be at the center of the process so as to avoid monopolized and biased prioritization and expenditure choices
- Sufficient time must be reserved for participation and dialogue between relevant stakeholders and for public hearings
- Councilors must be provided with well-arranged and accessible budget material that gives a clear financial overview of past financial and output performance and the current and anticipated financial position of the council
- Clear linkages between plans and the budget, including recurrent cost implications of capital investments and development projects must be catered for
- Possible scenarios and the consequences of different choices have been provided as a basis for political discussion and decision making.

### Implications for Late or No Budget
According to the local government Act (1997), the budget is a legal requirement with a legal deadline. Section 83(iv) of the LGA requires that a local government must pass its budget not later than 15th June. The budget is central to effect implementation of local government programmes. The reading and subsequent approval of the budget and annual work plan by the council is a pre-condition for disbursement of central government transfers.

External Factors Contributing to Increasing Consolidated Fund in Local Governments

High Dependence on the Central Government

District local governments are highly dependent on central government transfers. During FY 2008/9, central government transfers accounted for 94.6 percent, while donor contributions accounted for 5 percent, and local revenues constituted only 1 percent. This level of dependency affects the service delivery and overall performance of the district. Most grants from the central government are conditional and therefore earmarked for specific services. Only a slight degree of flexibility is permissible, but even so with restrictions. The unconditional grant, which is the only grant that local governments may use as part of their revenue, is mainly used to pay staff salaries. In many instances, these funds are not adequate, creating a funding gap. This gap means that the districts have to operate below the acceptable minimum personnel structures. (Discussion with chief finance officer–Iganga district).

Absence of strategic development planning and Implementation targets

Almost all districts in Uganda operate using the three-year rolling DDP. The budgeting and implementation of the plan takes the form of an annual work plan with very short-term targets set for every financial year. There is no strategic long-term investment plan that can provide a framework for setting long-term development targets and budget allocations. For example, District Councils have no clearly defined targets for key sectors such as education, health, roads, or even local revenue collection over a number of years. Indeed, the absence of long-term strategic development targets denies the councils the opportunity to operate in a more strategic manner and to measure their own performance on the basis of clearly defined development and service delivery benchmarks. (Discussion with Buyende District Local government councilors).

Lack of Knowledge among the Electorate on the Civic Functions of the Councils

There is wide civic incompetence manifested in a lack of basic knowledge by the electorate regarding the key roles of councilors and the basic functions of the local government system. The electorates in most Districts have serious misconceptions on the roles and responsibilities of councilors, and hence some within the electorate saw their councilors as people who are supposed to bury the dead, attend local parties, and make contributions to individual and community problems. They lack knowledge on the basic functions and duties of the council—from the planning cycle of local governments, to the rights and entitlements that the electorates can expect to get from their councils. This ignorance is an inhibitor for the public’s participation in planning, budgeting, and implementation of the local government’s programmes.

Political Power without Authority over planning and budgeting

Legally and politically, local government councils are responsible for all local government functions, including planning, financial accountability, and the delivery of public goods and services. However, most district political leadership holds no controlling or other appropriate authority to determine or direct how
the funds allocated to the district are utilized. The Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) who is the accounting officer of the district is appointed by the central government. Additionally, the various ministries—including those responsible for local governments and finance—have developed a set of guidelines and procedures that limit the involvement of the local government councils in the management of the district’s financial resources, including the procurement process. The guidelines and procedures enjoin the council to oversee the use of funds by the technical agencies of the local government, but don’t permit them to get involved in the governance of these resources. This is popularly referred to as the “eyes on, hands off” approach to the governance of the financial resources of local government councils.

Corruption and public Service Delivery in the Districts
Findings from the 2016 Auditor General’s Report revealed various forms of corruption including outstanding administrative advances, lack of land titles, poor quality and loss of cash in districts. During a separate investigation conducted by the office of the Inspector General of Government (IGG) during 2017, cases of low ethical standards were exposed in districts like Kaliro where the Town Clerk of Kaliro District was implicated in the payment of bribe in a bid to secure his job. Furthermore, the IGG directed the Chief Administrative Officer to return the appointments of two officers who were deemed to have been irregularly appointed by the DSC in a non-competitive process and thus called their positions to be re-advertised. During 2007 still, the Kaliro District records officer was detained at Central Police Station in Kampala for forging stamps and signatures in a bid to access a loan of Ug. Shs 945,000. Such occurrences undermine and determine increased unspent balances since they fear to use central government grants since they have a lot of conditions and fear being arrested. They rather leave using the money to avoid that (Ashaasha et al, 2010).

Abuse of Public Office
A special audit ordered in Luwero in June 2016 by the State Minister for Primary Health exposed various forms of abuse of office including grave mismanagement in health centres. During the audit, one health centre was visited Kasana and three health centres in Bamunanika Sub County. The health centres did not have drugs including Coartem, a recommended malaria drug that is acquired free of charge from the National Medical Stores. Furthermore, the director for health services was not resident in the district and lived in Kampala. The medical store at the District health unit had expired drugs while patients complained of having to buy paraffin to light up the wards as well as having to pay for most of the prescribed drugs. The audit also highlighted poor monitoring on behalf of the district political leaders to whose attention the matter was not yet known. In a separate surprise visit to randomly-selected health centre III’s including Butuntumula Health Centre III in Katikamu County, only 2 out of 10 health workers were on duty at 4:00pm, both of whom were midwives. This state of affairs reveals abuse of office on the part of the technical officers in District local governments and this undermines performance.

Internal Actors or Poor Performance and Poor Service Delivery

Quality of District Councilors and other Capacity Issues
The quality of councilors is mainly affected by their average level of education. At the moment, there is no minimum education requirement for anyone to hold the office of a district councilor in many districts. In fact, councilors are not required to submit any academic papers as part of the eligibility requirements to contest for the office of councilor. There is widespread consensus that councilors with very low levels of
education fail to express themselves during plenary sessions, while some cannot make written contributions to any committee. The low levels of education undermine effective debate and interaction among councilors and the highly educated technical staff whom they are presumably supposed to supervise. Besides, the councilors themselves do not keep coherent records of their activities and contributions.

**Poor record-Keeping**

As noted above, councilors in many Districts exhibited poor record-keeping in relation to their activities as elected leaders. For example although many councilors claim to have made contributions during meetings and met with their electorate, there are no records to confirm evidence to this effect. Some councilors do not have diaries or note books while others use loose record options and cell phones that cannot be tendered as evidence of performance at the time of the assessment. At the council level, it is common that while councilors claim to make contributions during plenary sessions, many such contributions are not recorded by the clerks to the council due to errors within.

**Failure of Councilors to provide ink between Electorate and the District**

In a study conducted by ACODE (2017) in Namutumba, it was established that many councilors are often absent from their constituencies and leave their constituencies unattended to. It is no surprise, therefore, that the indicators with the worst scores were ‘contact with electorate’ and ‘attendance of lower local councils.’ This leaves constituencies devoid of political direction and the much-needed oversight role that political leaders ought to provide. It was noted, for example, that some councilors are engaged in businesses in Southern Sudan with little time for their council activities.

**Good Governance, Accountability and Development-A Diagnostic Framework**

There is a general consensus that good governance rests upon four pillars: accountability, transparency, predictability and participation. Accountability means the capacity to hold public officials responsible for their actions. Transparency implies that there is low-cost accessibility (and, simplicity) to relevant information. Predictability results primarily from laws and regulations that are clear, known in advance, and uniformly and effectively enforced. Most importantly, public participation is needed to supply reliable information and to provide a reality check for local government action. None of these four components can stand by itself. All four together are instrumental in achieving sound local government public management.

How are the four pillars of good local governance, especially accountability, linked to effective local government [financial] management?

- A lack of local government financial resource **predictability** generally serves to undermine strategic prioritization, and makes it hard for local government officials to plan for the provision of services.
- **Transparency** of local government financial information is essential for mayors, city councils, and the general public to be adequately informed about the performance of the locality. It is essential that information not only be provided but that it is relevant and understandable.

---

1. ADB (2001) Pg 10
2. Ibid. Pg 10
3. Local government accountability is meaningless in the absence of secretive local government administrations.
4. In 1998, the IMF assembled a ‘Code of Good Practices on Fiscal Transparency’ (see Annex A) which underlines the importance of clear fiscal roles and responsibilities, public availability of information, and open processes of budget preparation, execution and reporting.
Appropriate **participation** [involvement] of local citizens, NGOs, public officials and employees, and other stakeholders is necessary for the sound formulation of expenditure programs and for the monitoring of local government operational efficiency.

Accountability is needed for the use of local government funds and for the results of spending it.\(^5\) Although all four pillars of governance are interrelated, accountability rests at the center of good local government practices. Through overuse, the term accountability has acquired a number of different qualities and definitions. Effective accountability has two fundamental components:\(^6\)

- **Answerability** – is the requirement for local public officials to respond periodically to questions concerning how they use their authority, where the resources went, and what was achieved with them. Or more simply stated, local public officials are held responsible for the effective spending and performance of public funds.\(^7\)

- **Consequences** – there is a need for meaningful consequences because local government must account both for the use of public funds and for achieving effective results.

Strengthening local government accountability is necessary in the context of enhancing initiatives for greater decentralization and for local government managerial autonomy. New checks and balances may be required to assure that access to local government services and the quality of public services is not compromised, especially for the poorer segments of the population.

**Accountability Linkages**

In a well functioning government structure, a local government is subject to accountability to its citizens, accountability to public agencies (or institutions), and accountability to higher-level governments. These kinds of accountability are referred to as:

- **Bottom up** - by the local government to local citizens;
- **Horizontal accountability** - by the local government to various public institutions of accountability\(^8\); and,
- **Vertical accountability** by the local government to higher-level governments.

As figure 1 illustrates, bottom-up accountability may include citizens acting through the electoral process or indirectly through civic organizations (i.e. NGOs, civil society) or the news media. Horizontal accountability covers the range of public entities in order to check local government abuses and inefficiencies. These agencies may include but are not limited to: electoral commissions, local government councils (or legislature), the court system, ombudsman or public complaints agencies, or various auditing agencies. Local governments are also held accountable to higher-level governments [central and state]. Central [and, state] governments often set the rules under which local governments operate. In addition, higher-level governments nearly always provide a portion of their financial resources to local governments through fiscal transfers. Thus, there is always some level of reporting and accountability by local governments to higher governmental authorities.

---

\(^5\) ADB (1999) Pg 12

\(^6\) ADB (2001) Pg 11

\(^7\) In other words, internal administrative accountability must be mirrored by external accountability through feedback from service users and citizens.

\(^8\) G.O'Donnell, “Horizontal Accountability in New Democracies” in Schedler et al
Due to various factors including poor salaries, weak morale, weak oversight institutions and laws, as well as the absence of effective local government public sector management practices, governmental accountability is frequently weak in many developing countries. Institutional weaknesses in many governmental organizations (i.e., audit bodies, courts) create an environment where horizontal and vertical accountability frequently fall short. Bottom-up accountability may similarly fall short if elections are dominated by political elites, or if the electorate has few other ways to register its views on the quality of governance, or lacks the capacity to organize itself effectively.

The Local Budget and Public Sector Accountability

Performance information is primarily a management, transparency and financial accountability tool rather than a mere budgetary instrument. Effective and efficient service delivery and local sector accountability requires performance management. In performance management, the local government establishes service objectives and monitors performance towards attaining those objectives. Characteristics of an effective budget that enhances performance are shown below.

---

11 Performance management implies the planning, monitoring, and measuring of service performance.
Table 1: Characteristics of an Effective Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Terms</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accountability</td>
<td>Detailed controls should be established which have the goal of ensuring that policy directives are carried out by managers, contractors and all concerned parties.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensiveness</td>
<td>Includes all uses of government financial resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constraint</td>
<td>Contains limitations on the amount of money that need be acquired by government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>Budgeting should exist in harmony with other decision processes and should not be dominant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td>Contains unbiased projections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgment</td>
<td>Encourages participants to seek the most effect at the least cost.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legitimacy</td>
<td>The budget process should reserve important decisions to legally appropriate authorities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception</td>
<td>Considers both near and long-term.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsiveness</td>
<td>The budget must adopt policies that match public preferences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timeliness</td>
<td>A budget process should complete regular tasks when expected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>The budget and budget procedures should be understood by participants and outside stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some of these characteristics for an effective budget relate primarily to the process of budget prioritization (comprehensiveness, perception). Other characteristics are related almost exclusively to operational efficiency (cooperation, timeliness). These standards, however, do not in general align themselves to clean separations. The most crucial factors that conspire against local government budget accountability are shown in Table 2 below.

---

Table 2 Characteristics That Adversely Impact Budget Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Characteristic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Extrabudgetary Funds</td>
<td>Extrabudgetary funds do not force tradeoffs between competing priorities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Extrabudgetary funds generally circumvent central controls, thereby violating the comprehensiveness standard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earmarked Funds (Earmarking)</td>
<td>Earmarked funds are dedicated to particular uses or purposes. Agencies with earmarked funds may have little or no incentive to economize.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Earmarking may impede the government’s ability to be flexible in managing its budget or in allocating resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unpredictability</td>
<td>Inaccurate budget estimates, arbitrary budget cuts, and non-timely fund disbursements will create substantial budget unpredictability.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unreliable Information</td>
<td>Inaccurate and unreliable information will conspire against enhancing budget performance.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In order for an enabling environment to take place, it is important to diagnose the flows in the current budget system and to develop a strategy for correcting potential flaws. For example, developing methodologies to more accurately predict future financial flows and bringing more activities into the budget will contribute to better operational performance and improve local sector accountability.

6.3 Weak Local Accountability in Developing Countries

Bardhan (2002) illustrates that institutions of local accountability in developing countries are often weak, with the attendant risk of ‘capture’ of public resources by local elite. For example, when local government revenues are largely coming from taxpayers outside the local jurisdiction through intergovernmental grants, as is often the case in developing countries with geographic concentration of national resources and low revenue potential, there is a greater risk of ‘capture’ because local citizens might not be informed about what resources are available to their local representatives for the delivery of public services. What can be done to improve the level of local accountability?

The conditions under which local governments have the right incentive(s) to improve the delivery of basic services have been explored in large volumes of political economy literature. One of the remedies to improving local government accountability suggested by this literature is to ensure greater information dissemination about the roles and responsibilities of government and the outcomes of public resource allocation. As a result, Keefer and Khemani (2005) propose a specific type of policy intervention to strengthen local accountability, namely providing citizens with greater information about the resources and

---

14 See Keefer and Khemani (2005)
responsibilities of their local representatives, so that they are empowered to hold them accountable for the
delivery of basic services.\(^{15}\) The following sections emphasize that policy interventions that address local
information asymmetries are critical to empowering citizens to hold their local representatives accountable.

**Accountability: A Diagnostic Framework**

Although it is beyond the scope of this note to design a multi-pronged local government public finance
accountability program with full diagnostics, provides a diagnostic tool that may be useful in determining
whether a local government is engaged in bottom-up, vertical and horizontal accountability. The diagnostic
represents the first phase of the approach. A more rigorous two-stage approach should be used: the first
stage would be to fully document the existing system using the diagnostic as the background tool and the
second stage would assess each element of the system, and design improvements according to local [and
central] government priorities. A program which implements improvements based on the use of the
questionnaire would have all the technical tools needed to improve its local government public financial
management and accountability performance. Technical tools alone do not guarantee improved local
government management and accountability, the other key ingredients include well-trained and highly
motivated staff and, above all, political will and strong focused leadership.

**Policy Considerations**

Improving public sector accountability in developing countries requires a complex approach that recognizes
the diverse factors underlying the persistence of weak governance. Creating interventions that improve
local government accountability [and combat corruption] generally requires a tailor-made strategy that
takes into consideration the particular contours of the problem in different countries. What are the lessons
that can be drawn from the discussion above? Actions to improve local governance, public financial
management and accountability need to be taken on numerous fronts.

**Local and Central Government Relationships**

The linkage between central and local government should not be overlooked since it can have significant
positive [or adverse] effects on the accountability of local governments to their citizens. What is the
appropriate role of central government to ensure accountability of local governments? Schroeder (2004)
argues that the role of the central government in ensuring local government accountability is to ensure that:
(i) local governments are provided with services in accordance with the assignment of powers and functions
to local governments; and (ii) all local government resources (including the funds that are transferred to the
local government by the central government) should be utilized efficiently and in the manner intended.\(^{16}\)

The two dimensions describing central and local governments inherently create some tension between the
various levels of government. For example, in a decentralized environment, central governments devolve
many expenditure assignments to local governments. Often, local governments [correctly] argue that many
of these devolved expenditures are not fully funded. As a result, this leads to a lack of accountability by
the local government. From the local government’s public expenditure point of view, it is essential that
when the central government devolves expenditure responsibilities, that they be fully funded. This would
enhance local government accountability to local residents.

---

\(^{15}\) Fosu and Ryan (2004) reach similar conclusions with respect to the centrality of information dissemination and disclosure in policy interventions to improve accountability.

\(^{16}\) Schroeder (2004) “Mechanisms for Strengthening Local Accountability” Pg. 18
Building Integrity Incentives into Decentralization Policy

The preceding sections presented a number of fundamental issues which may adversely affect local government accountability. Table 6 outlines some basic decentralization policy considerations/ideals for improving local government accountability. However, due to various factors, these ideals are often compromised in many developing countries.17

Table 6 Building Integrity Incentives into Decentralization Policy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Functional decentralization must be coordinated and precede financial</td>
<td>Transfer revenue- raising capacity before grants and only transfer revenues if obligation for service provision is clearly spelled out.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>decentralization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assets not liabilities should be transferred to local governments</td>
<td>Before decentralizing a service, ‘clean it up.’ Do not decentralize inefficiency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political decentralization must be complete</td>
<td>Transfer full authority and demand full accountability.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergovernmental transfers must provide the correct incentives</td>
<td>Design the transfer system to meet the following criteria: autonomy, equity, predictability, efficiency, simplicity, incentives, and attained objectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assure the regulatory framework, the structure of government and internal procedures do not provide incentives for corrupt behavior.</td>
<td>Put in place a local integrity system. Include a mechanism to assure transparency and public participation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Operational Approach

Reforming public sector management and public finance requires: instilling meritocracy and adequate pay in public administration; clarifying government priorities, institutional goals and strategies, and institutional structures; enhancing transparency and accountability in fiscal management; and, stimulating policy reforms in service delivery. A general review of governance and functional structures local government departments should be given high priority. Some governments have moved local government functions into quasi-private sector structures. These structures blur the lines of policy direction and accountability. Off-budget agency funding also contributes to budget fragmentation and lack of transparency.

To improve transparency and accountability in fiscal management, it is necessary to ensure full budget control and coverage. In some developing countries, local government resources may be diverted into off-budget accounts. These accounts typically lack oversight and transparency. These off-budget transactions take different forms, from extra budgetary funds to the lack of integration of investment planning. A further challenge is to eliminate (or reduce) contingent liabilities (off-balance sheet guarantees) stemming from non-transparent off-budget commitments. In many developing countries, the budget formulation is often flawed by the ambiguity between the executive and legislative branch of government, and lack of policy coordination. In Bosnia, for example, until recently, expenditure projections lacked a medium-term perspective (and, revenue forecasts were often extremely unrealistic). The inability to develop realistic forecasts leads to non-transparent adjustments during budget execution. The potential for local government

17 These issues represent ‘ideal situations’ which may/may not be found in many developing countries. Political decentralization will in all likelihood not be ideal, nor complete, in many countries. However, it is essential to recognize the benchmarks and develop local government accountability mechanisms that fit accordingly.
finance mismanagement increases dramatically. In addition, unclear budget appropriations and unreliable disbursements leave budget managers unable to deliver reliable services.

**Consultation and Participation at the Local Level**

Regional and local governments in developing countries present an uncertain terrain for good governance and effective accountability efforts. A significant amount of research has called into question whether decentralization is conducive to improved governmental accountability. Local governments in developing countries often suffer from low levels of political and social organization, low labor and capital mobility, and inadequate media coverage. In addition, some countries may also lack locally elected municipal councils (i.e. Jordan). There is, however, a substantial body of anecdotal evidence about the positive impact of consultative and participatory mechanisms in improving local service delivery.18 Despite some limitations, local governments in developing economies can offer opportunities for improving public sector governance and accountability. For example, local civil society activism (i.e., Republic of Georgia ‘Rose Revolution’) is one prominent area for improving government accountability. In many developing countries, national legislation is often silent [or, sets minimal standards] with respect to administrative laws. As a result, local government reformers can often develop more expansive procedural rights for the general public at the local government level. While there is no single best way to promote accountability, multiple mechanisms may need to take root in order for local government accountability to prove effective.19 Whatever instruments are promoted, they should be appropriate to the local political, economic and social environment.

Russel-Einhorn (2004) suggests that there are three useful criteria for evaluating transparency and accountability mechanisms relevant to local circumstances in developing countries, including: Degree of visibility of the mechanism in question,20 the simplicity of the mechanism, 21 The degree to which use of the mechanism can have a direct rather than indirect impact on government policies and programs.

The rationale for these criteria encompasses a number of practical factors including placing a premium on high visibility accountability mechanisms in order to cultivate a sense of community empowerment and collective action. In general, governments whose policies are put in question in a very public forum often find it more difficult to obfuscate their intentions. In addition, high costs can significantly retard the utility of any accountability tool. Accountability tools where the costs and legal sophistication are manageable may achieve better results, than those where relatively greater resources and expenditures are required. The third criterion is important given the need for demonstrable civic action.22 While building enhanced government accountability in developing countries is a long-term process, reform momentum critically depends on the ability to influence policy relatively quickly.

**Public Discussion**

The practice of having communities engage in public discussion can effectively increase transparency and public sector accountability. This practice is often used in Africa (i.e. Sudan, Kenya) where elders gather to discuss community matters in public. However, public discussion may exclude marginalized groups

20 According to Russel-Einhorn (2004) this can be measured in terms of the degree of public access afforded by the instrument and the number of citizens able to participate.
21 This can be defined in terms of the likely financial, human, legal and other costs necessary to implement the tool effectively.
22 Ibid Pg 35.
(i.e., women, religious minorities, or immigrants) who may not feel comfortable in expressing themselves. A requirement of public reporting to increase public sector accountability may include weekly postings of budgets in local newspapers.

**Institutional Controls**

Inadequate accountability mechanisms within the local civil service can be minimized with the installation of institutional controls. The most effective controls generally reside inside institutions. This implies that there is honest and effective supervision, auditing oversight and control, and an awareness and internalization of the standards of ethical behavior. Several countries and cities, including Singapore, Hong Kong, and Argentina, have created ethics offices. To be effective, these offices must be independent from the political establishment, have ample personnel and financial resources, and have high ethical standards. Ethics offices must also have to power to enforce penalties. However, several of these offices must report to the higher levels of government which may reduce their effectiveness and politicize the process thereby reducing overall effectiveness.

**Transparency of Rules, Regulations, Laws and Processes**

The lack of transparency in rules, laws, and process in many countries lessens local government accountability. Rules dealing with government procurement process, financial management and accounting are often confusing. Even if an individual exercises some initiative and tries to understand the rules, the documents specifying these rules may not be publicly available. Furthermore, many organizational rules may be changed without public announcements to that effect.

In many instances, regulations and laws are written so that only trained lawyers can understand their true impact. Many laws are often conceptually opaque, thus leaving grounds for different interpretation. In the United States, the judiciary may be called into discern the true nature of the law. In many developing countries, the judicial process is not as efficient. One of the ways to increase accountability in opaque regulations and laws is to establish more efficient regulation processes. The establishment of independent regulatory agencies, both at the national and local government level can be effective in promoting efficiency and limiting opportunities for corruption. These regulatory institutions however, must operate with transparency [hold public meetings], simplicity [rules-based principles], and accountability [election of regulators or term based regulators].

**The Audit Function**

Management controls are the policies and procedures put in place by the managers of an (government) entity to ensure its proper and effective operation. Developing an effective system of controls requires, first, a careful assessment of the risks confronting the organization. Policies and procedures can then be selected to control those risks effectively and at reasonable cost. No system of controls can provide an absolute guarantee against the occurrence of fraud, abuse, inefficiency, and human error. However, a well-designed system of controls can give reasonable assurance that significant irregularities can be detected. There are effectively two types of audit procedures, including:

- Internal audit is part of an organization’s management control structure. The internal audit office audits lower-level units on behalf of management. Among its most important functions, internal audits test the management controls themselves and assists senior management in assessing risks and in developing more cost-effective controls.
External audit of government operations is typically performed by a supreme audit institution (SAI) or an independent external auditing firm. External auditors typically perform compliance/regulatory audits, financial assurance audits, and value-for-money (efficiency) audits.

To be effective, external audit staff must have the professional skills required for the audits being performed. For an external auditor to move from ex-ante and regulatory audits to financial assurance and value-for-money (performance) audits, its staff will have to be more extensively trained in the more complex audits. In order for the external audit function to be effective, especially when pursuing the strategic objective of improved management controls or undertaking more advanced type of audits, an effective means of communicating audit results and a sound approach for encouraging effective appropriate corrective action must also be developed.

National Audit Institution
The introduction of effective control mechanisms on public administration is an integral part of any local accountability [and, anti-corruption] reform. Supreme Audit Institution(s) play a role in improving local government accountability. By definition, the Supreme Audit Institution acts on behalf of taxpayers in order to make sure that the government properly uses the taxpayer’s money. Based on various constitutional and legal provisions, the Supreme Audit Institution should monitor and identify virtually all activities dealing with the budget and is also expected to provide an evaluation of the local government administration, focusing on: (i) local government agencies; (ii) public sector utility companies; and (iii) various government agencies and institutions that are the primary users of public sector funds.

Regulation of Public Procurement Procedures
Public procurement is broadly perceived in many countries as one of the areas most heavily affected by lack of transparency [and, corruption]. Many countries have established a National Public Procurement Agency (NPPA) that reports to the Council of Ministers as the central government body for co-ordination and development of the public procurement system. For example, in Albania, the Law on Public Procurement offers the simplicity of a unified law, which decentralizes the authority for conducting procurement to procuring agencies at both the central and local government levels of administration. One of the strengths of the law is that it established open tendering as the preferred method of public procurement practice. However, the efficacy of the open public procurement practice has been undermined by weak enforcement.

While the organizational arrangement of public procurement maybe in conformity with internationally accepted practices, the effectiveness of public procurement practices can be undermined by under sourcing and is susceptible to political influence. For example, the NPPA is included in the Albania government anti-corruption and public accountability matrix, but still there are significant problems that need to be resolved in order to have a competitive procurement system. One of any government’s priorities should be to implement appropriate oversight measures to combat actual (and, perceived) procurement related corruption, and inadequate accountability, and to strengthen the enforcement of existing legislation.
Conclusion

Good governance and effective local government accountability are the single most important vehicles for establishing a country’s economic and social priorities within the scarce resources that are available to government. Good governance [local government accountability] is an essential feature of a framework for economic and financial management including: financial and economic stability, promotion of efficient institutions, and social and economic equity. The movement toward decentralization of political power, public finance, and in some cases the finance of local public goods is thought to improve resource allocation, public sector accountability, while simultaneously reducing corruption in service delivery. Under the right circumstances, devolution should increase the accountability of governments, public finances, and public service delivery. However, such evidence as there is suggests that decentralization of political power and public finances has not in itself led to better governance, increased transparency and accountability, and improved economic performance. Local accountability may not achieve its potential if not guided by coherent and universal principles: strengthening governance (accountability, transparency, predictability, and participation); reinforce the foundation of civil society; and, engage in improvements in local government public expenditure management programs. In addition, programs to increase local government accountability must carefully consider the country-specific context.

In many developing countries, the budget formulation is often flawed by the ambiguity between the executive and legislative branch of government, lack of policy coordination, and the inability to impose trade-offs at the executive level. Furthermore, the inability to develop realistic forecasts leads to non-transparent adjustments during budget execution. As a result, the potential for public sector finance mismanagement increases dramatically.

In many countries unclear budget appropriations and unreliable disbursements leave local government budget managers unable to deliver reliable services. Reforms to promote greater accountability and control over budgetary expenditures require strong accounting and auditing systems. Effective public expenditure management [including accounting reforms] is instrumental to effective public service delivery and reducing the extent of public sector corruption. Without fiscal discipline, transparency and budget accountability, it is impossible to achieve effective prioritization and implementation of policy priorities.

Access to information on the actions and performance of government expenditures is critical to achieving government accountability. Unless the public knows what goods and services are provided, how well they are provided, who the beneficiaries are, and how much they cost, it cannot demand (nor expect) effective government. To promote government accountability, government budgets and expenditure programs need to be disclosed to the public. Another mechanism that promotes transparency and accountability with respect to public good finance is the periodic public sector audit. The public sector audit has proved to be effective in many developed countries.

There is no simple formula for the proper sequencing of these accountability enhancement activities. Sequencing should be developed in response to the particular constraints identified. Sequencing of reforms should be designed to enhance the credibility of the leadership, to ensure early tangible results and to strengthen the constituency for accountability reform.

Recommendations

The MFPED should reprimand Accounting Officers and project managers that fail to utilize released funds. These Accounting Officers should not be re-appointed in the subsequent years.
The MFPED, MoH, PPDA and Ministry of Local Government (MoLG) should conduct regular mentorship, and capacity building sessions in planning, procurement and project management to improve on absorption of resources.

The MFPED should adhere to the budget circular release timelines. The health sector votes should submit the quarterly warrants to MFPED in a timely manner to facilitate release of funds.

The MFPED, development committee should enforce strict adherence to project timelines. Project time extensions should be discouraged.

References


Bardhan, Pranab and Dilip Mookherjee, Expenditure decentralization and the delivery of public services in developing countries, IED Discussion Paper, Boston University, 1998.


GoU, The Local Government Act 1997
GoU; Health Service Commission Annual Report F/Y 2008/2009


Russell-Einhorn, Malcolm. 2004 “Creating and Implementing a Local Transparency Initiative” Local Government Brief


The Local Government Finance & Accountability Act, 1998


The Local Government internal Audit manual (2000)

Treasury accounting Instruction (2000)


World Bank PREM Notes “Computerizing Tax and Customs Administrations”. No. 44. October 2000.


Decentralisation and Local Government Performance in Mbage Municipal Council

Peter Simon Wakwale

PhD Student, Nkumba University
E-mail: wakwalep@yahoo.com

Abstract
The paper delivers an insight into the research on “Decentralisation and Local Government Performance.” The study adopted approach to literature review using participatory and accountability frame work. A discourse of theories; liberal democratic theory and principal – agent theory were selected for their suitability to expound on the rationale of decentralisation. The methodology used cross-sectional research design, with both qualitative and quantitative in tranquillation approaches, with latitudinal research before and after the launching of decentralisation, to arrive at the performance of local governments. The sample of 292 respondents was used in the study. Research findings were analysed using SPSS, and ANOVA was used to establish the relationships between variables. A rigorous process of interpretation of data was carried out and the findings revealed that on the whole, there was a bit of improvement in performance. This was not to people’s expectation as there was outcry, as revealed in Mbale Municipal Council Report. The study had a number of recommendations that could bring local government performance to people’s satisfaction. As an enhancement for future performance, the model suggested besides serving as a contribution to research, it is assumed to reinvent a new approach to decentralization, targeting both political wing and technical wing and not leaving out other stakeholders and beyond, for now and the future.

Key words: Local Governments, Decentralisation, Performance and Reinvention

Introduction
The recent wave of decentralisation around the world presents particular challenges to meeting people’s needs and wants. Not only does decentralisation transfer resources, power and authority, to lower local governments, but also more people get more involved in deciding the resources and power that affect them. At the same time, decentralisation offers the prospects of increased accountability to citizens through the greater accessibility of decision-making. This is seen as key element of holding leaders accountable, and also, leaders being accountable to the electorates (Conyers, 2007). The study was prompted by the fact that among the countries in Africa, Uganda was considered particularly valuable for research on decentralisation, since it had been pursuing one of the most systematic decentralisation policies in Africa. Although, Uganda’s conditions of living were generally more problematic due to civil strife than other African countries, some of the leading districts like Mbale attracted frequent visits from donors- e.g. Britain, America and other continents- and policy makers of other African countries (Human Rights Watch 2003).

Secondly, despite Uganda having been still heavily dependent on foreign assistance for government activities, the series of decentralisation reforms were not imposed by external aid agencies, as is the case with other African countries (Saito, 2012). Therefore, lessons from the country’s experiences would be valuable for academics, policy makers, and practitioners who are involved in decentralisation. Furthermore, the Human Right Watch (2003) stated that Uganda’s political system can be described as being “semi-authoritarian”. This type of policy usually displays some procedural democracy including constitutional separation of powers, contested presidential and parliamentary elections, as well as providing some degree of political freedom to their citizens.
Golooba (1999) argued that after the enactment of the Local Governments Act in 1997, a new accountability relationship between political leaders and constituencies were established, making the decentralisation policy in Uganda unique. Since these events had significantly altered the policy environment, it was essential to reinvestigate whether the current situation made any contribution to the policy objectives, including the attainment of democratic participation and reduction of pervasive poverty, hence local government performance in Uganda. This scenario presented a unique opportunity for this research by intending to evaluate how the decentralisation policy is operationalised by analysing decentralisation and how it interfaces with local government performance in Uganda.

This study, therefore, assessed the effect of decentralisation policy on local government performance in Uganda by focusing on Mbale Municipal Council since the 1990s to the time of the study. An effort was made to analyse the decentralisation policy design, its implementation, monitoring and evaluation concerns and how these influence local governments’ performance in Uganda. Specific emphasis in the study examined the effect of devolution of powers by Central Government on Local Governments performance basing on the objectives of the study.

**Statement of the Problem**

The study assessed the effect of decentralisation on local government performance, basing on the objectives of the study with aim of establishing the reasons why, local governments like Mbale Municipal Council, its performance failed to meet people’s expectations. The main legal framework for Uganda’s current local governments is the Decentralisation Statute 1993, aimed to transfer power to the people and promote equitable distribution of resources. The 1995 constitution detailed the modalities of a decentralised government, while the Local Governments Act of 1997 made Local Government Council responsible for ensuring implementation and compliance with government policies (GoU, 1997).

According to Saito (2003), ‘Uganda today probably has the most elaborate legal framework for decentralising measures in Africa and is firmly committed to decentralisation. The amount of financial resources transferred to local governments is one of the largest in Africa’. Whereas it can be argued that the amounts of financial resources transferred are significant, what really matters is whether these financial resources have over the years been translated to effective service delivery as promised in the decentralisation objectives. Scott - Herridge (2002), noted that the lessons from Uganda’s decentralisation hold out prospects for improved governance and better service delivery and that, lessons can be applied throughout the Third World countries to bring sustainable improvement to people’s lives. Although optimistic, however, there is a caution that though, decentralisation has potential advantages, there are serious challenges to be faced, and it will not succeed without full commitment of central and local governments, like Mbale Municipal Council.

As Uganda is no exemption as far as the challenges emerging from decentralisation is concerned, analysis of available literature, the study retrieved details from reliable sources including the State of Affairs of Mbale Municipal Council (2013). This clearly unveils the performance of Mbale Municipal Council, before and after the introduction of decentralisation in Uganda, and identified knowledge gaps which called for further investigation. The analysis came up with cases that had captured people’s concern; take for example a report on Mbale Municipal Council by Murisa (2008), revealed that, “in health sector, provision for medical care and services were short of local needs through inadequate finances. Materials like drugs and
personnel like Doctors and other essential staff were in shortage, coupled by lack of proper supervision and monitoring.

One of the areas of transfer of power is primary education, which became the responsibility of local governments after decentralisation. The Universal Primary Education (UPE) programme was introduced in 1997, becoming part of the mandate of local governments. There was initial excitement about the policy as Ugandans would for the first time access free education (Buwembo 2017). Various sources of information reveal that, performance of education sector has not met people’s expectations in Mbale Municipal Council, although the policy framework is credited with increased Primary School enrollment.” Vision Reporter (2017), states that, “Examination results for the period prior and after year 2015 reveal that, only 5% of the students for Senior Four passed in First Grade.” According to national rating, this was exceptionally below average, compared to the performance of other district local governments. This leaves Mbale Municipal Council in a challenging situation that needs urgent improvement.

Much as it had generally been anticipated, decentralisation applauds greater participation by the people who are in control over service delivery; in contrast, local governments, Mbale Municipal Council in particular, benefits of decentralisation in terms of service delivery both in health or education sectors, indicators show minimal improvement, whereas in one way or another stagnating or worsening. Basing on the latest government report rating the performance of districts, Mbale as a whole and Mbale Municipal Council in particular, has always trailed other districts in service delivery, both in health and education sectors.

Likewise, the level of performance that required improvement was equally reflected in other social sectors of Mbale Municipal Council. “Road net-works in Mbale Municipal Council, prior to the launching of decentralisation, as evidenced by the report, were in urgent need of construction, improvement on maintenance has been acknowledged but quality of work failed to meet the required standards, revealed in Mbale Municipal Council State of Affairs Report, (2013). Almost two decades later, there is growing public concern over the quality of service delivery by local governments. Existing research shows that local government delivery failures in performance to meet people’s expectations are connected to a host of factors, including multiple leadership conflicts across different tiers of government, low levels of revenue collection and limited financial autonomy, distortions inherent in the decentralisation policy, and central government’s control of the national budget resources (ACODE, 2014).

On validating the information searched on Mbale Municipal Council performance using the objectives of the study, none of the listed writers has underpinned factors behind poor performance in Mbale Municipal Council and more so the measures in place to turn round the situation to meet people’s needs. It is this situation that inclined the researcher to select a framework in form of a Principle-Agent Model of Decentralisation, intended to bring dynamism in local government performance, that will meet peoples’ needs, and on the other hand, it serves as a justification to research on this study.

Objectives of the Study
The study carried out an assessment of decentralisation on local government performance through the objectives of the study and able to establish causes of poor performance, a fact that opened up for the study to underpin measures in form framework of a Principle – Agent Model of Decentralisation, to serve as a solution, that may bring expected improvement in the performance of Mbale Municipal Council.
i. To examine the effect of devolution of powers on financial accountability in Mbale Municipal Council

ii. To evaluate the influence of devolution of powers on infrastructural development in Mbale Municipal Council

iii. To establish the extent to which devolution of powers affects the provision of efficient services in Mbale Municipal Council

iv. To find out the effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation in Mbale Municipal Council.

Literature

Theoretical Framework

Sequential theory of decentralisation

The theory at hand is the sequential theory of decentralisation that has three main characteristics: a) defines as a process; b) takes into account the territorial interests of bargaining actors; and c) by incorporating policy feedback effects, it provides a dynamic account of institutional evolution.

Decentralisation as a Process

As defined here, decentralisation is a process. It is a set of policy reforms aimed at transferring responsibilities, resources, or authority from higher to lower levels of government. The concept is not used as an adjective to qualify a given political or fiscal system. Decentralisation is a set of state reforms. In general, the decentralisation reforms analysed here followed the collapse of the developmental state and accompanied the move toward free–market economies characteristic of the last quarter of the twentieth century. Finally, as defined here, decentralisation reforms may take place in authoritarian as well as democratic contexts, which means that the concepts of decentralisation and democratisation should not be conflated. I classify decentralisation policies as belonging to one of three categories—administrative, fiscal, and political—depending on the type of authority devolved.

Administrative decentralisation comprises the set of policies that transfer the administration and delivery of social services such as education, health, social welfare, or housing to sub national governments. Administrative decentralisation may entail the devolution of decision-making authority over these policies, but this is not a necessary condition. If revenues are transferred from the center to meet the costs of the administration and delivery of social services, administrative decentralisation is funded (and coincides with fiscal decentralisation). If sub-national governments bear the costs of the administration and delivery of transferred services with their own pre-existing revenues, administrative decentralisation is not funded.

Fiscal decentralisation refers to the set of policies designed to increase the revenues or fiscal autonomy of sub-national governments. Fiscal decentralisation policies can assume different institutional forms. An increase of transfers from the central government, the creation of new sub-national taxes, and the delegation of tax authority that was previously national are all examples of fiscal decentralisation.

Political decentralisation is the set of constitutional amendments and electoral reforms designed to open new—or activate existing but dormant or in effective—spaces for the representation of sub-national politics. Political decentralisation policies are also designed to devolve electoral capacities to sub-national actors. Examples of this type of reform are the popular election of mayors and governors (who were
previously appointed), the creation of sub-national legislative assemblies, or constitutional reforms that strengthen the political autonomy of sub-national governments.

**Participatory Decision Making in pursuit of Service Delivery**

The main theory in this study was Participatory Decision making Theory that is used to throw light on the functions of system of governance and its fundamental aspect of people’s participation in running their affairs in pursuit of their economic and social development (Anderson, 2003), stated that, “In participatory theory, ‘participation’ referred to (equal) participation in the making of decisions. Participatory development enhances the satisfaction of service users, which in turn increases locally generated revenues. People, who are empowered, value the services they receive become more willing to pay for those services. Local participation also contributed to increasing accountability of appointed officers (Cheema, et al, 2007). This is true for Uganda’s case because appointed officials are expected to be accountable to the people through Local Government Public Accounts Committees (LGPAC), whose role is to ensure accountability by these officials as well as value for money.

Varma (2014) regards participation not only as necessary to self-development but the very foundation upon which the free society depends. Participation model puts emphasis on the element of empowerment of the population. For well-informed participation to occur, it is necessary that some version of transparency e.g. radical transparency is necessary but not sufficient. It has also been argued that those most affected by a decision, take for example people of local governments, Mbale Municipal Council in particular, should have the most say in the running of their affairs, the outcome of the decisions do satisfy their needs. The least affected by a decision, on the other hand, like the elected and appointed leaders, should have the least say in a topic. In other words, people are supposed to be the Principles, while both the political and bureaucrats are supposed to be the Agents, (Eckardt, 2008).

According to Anderson (2003), “In participatory theory, the aim is not to decentralize power so as to weaken the role of government. The theory looks at the internal factors of the country and how they may have affected people’s efforts to achieve their development as a result of the decentralisation programme in view of its original objective that was to devolve powers politically, administratively and fiscally to local governments, Anderson (2003) concluded. Serving as a yard stick, Participatory Theory assists this study in the assessment of people’s achievements of their expectations in political and local government’s performance with the key variables of the study: devolution of powers for the people’s participation, accountability by leadership, infrastructural development and service delivery, in reference to Mbale Municipal Council. If people are left out, if self-styled experts and high-handed planners push them around then nothing ever yield real fruits(Schumacher, 2000:140).

The importance of participation to development was stressed by a number of theories and development professionals. For example, Kumar (1994) explained that the debate about participation in the 1980s had focused on various areas of concerns; the new movement stressed the need for self-reliance as well as ecological aspects, gender, human rights, world peace, self-determination and democratisation. Schneider and Libercier (1995) affirmed that participation should be at the centre of development efforts, through adjustment of conventional approaches and methodologies, by establishing new relationships, among the stake holders and viewing people as partners and actors of their own development. In 1999, World Bank’s (1999) findings suggested that participation promotes ownership, brings long term attention to human right
issues, improves sustainability of development programmes, and promotes learning and result-based orientation.

For effective local elections, citizens must participate; therefore, to understand the concept of accountability better, we need to comprehend it in the light of participation. Participation is chiefly concerned with increasing the role of citizens in choosing their local leaders and in telling those leaders what to do—in other words, providing inputs into local governance. On the other hand, accountability—one of the variables of the study, can be seen as the validation of participation, in that the test of whether it attempts to increase participation, prove successful, is the extent to which people can use participation to hold a local government responsible for its actions (DTT, 2012).

It began to be said that some conditions are found to be necessary for enhancing participation, such as democratisation, decentralisation, building confidence among various actors, readiness to share power, and access to assets and rights. (Mathur; 1999, Schneider and Libercier; 1995). In the new Millennium, there was a trend to broaden the participation debate to include governance issues. This was accompanied by the emergence of the ‘participatory citizenship’ concept, which links participation in the political, community and social sphere (Gaventa, 2004). Many participatory development theorists assert that support and belief in participation was almost universal, but development of tools and techniques to put into practices and knowledge of obstacles and how to overcome them, has lagged behind (Mathur, 1999; Gerrit, 1997). There was also concern about the appropriateness for participatory approaches and their abilities to reveal of poor people and to involve them in decision-making process (Nelson and Wright; 1995).

Many participatory theorists like McGee (2002), contend that the concept of people’s in development planning, policy-making as well as policy implementation; being a variable as well, decision-sharing has remained a matter of rhetoric rather than practice. This brings us to the centre of the objective of this study seeking to establish why and for reasons to be established, decentralisation has to the least not enabled local governments like Mbale Municipal Council to realize what it was launched for; fronting the above arguments that earlier discussed the participation theory.

Related Literature

Devolution of Powers on Timely Accountability

Elections are the most commonly evoked mode of representative accountability, although not all elective structures create accountability. Ribot (1999) quoted Lonsdale; “Since in very small communities is it possible for all voices to be heard, community-based decision-making requires that the population in question be represented in an accountable manner, In the absence of such representation, there is a danger that decision-making could be taken over by elite groups. There must be mechanism to keep the representing body responsive to the community as a whole,” he adds. Even when elections are perfectly structured, machine politics and cronyism can reduce the downward accountability of elected representatives. Other mechanisms for local or downward accountability of elected, appointed or any other actors were still needed (Ribot, 1999).

“In developing world, trusting local government often means building up or legitimating this part of the state. Natural resource management can play an important part in the transition to trusted, locally accountable local government. Greater control over natural resources can empower and legitimate local
government by providing revenues and by giving local representatives power of decision over resources that affect the everyday lives of their constituencies” (Ribot, 1999).

Accountability was applauded by Gershberg (2003) in his statement, “A devolution type of governance being used in Uganda, strengthens those it entrusts, it may be counterproductive to support the devolution of public powers to chiefs and other hereditary customary leaders, project or administration- organised non-representatives committees, groups that are temporarily mobilised through orchestrated participatory processes, cooperatives, interest groups, private voluntary organisations or NGOs. These groups may be well meaning (or not) but they are not necessarily representative of, or accountable to, the public. While all such groups can (and should) be subject to the accountability measures mentioned above, they are less appropriate choices than the representative system of a permanent electoral local government with accompanying accountability measures.

Such bodies have an appropriate role as consultants and advisors to or agents of, representative bodies, but they should not be considered representatives of a whole population, nor therefore should they be independently entrusted with the population’s resources or decisions–making. “Accountability requires clear delineation of authority and responsibility and transparent and understandable information on results. When responsibilities are shared by more than one level of government, it may be very difficult to identify who is responsible for poor performance, Gershberg (2003) concluded.

In sharing challenges of performance by decentralisation, Mali may be experiencing different factors affecting decentralisation, as Bengen (2000) revealed, “Decentralisation in Mali insists that the communal institutions must be in place and then each commune will grapple with issues of empowerment, responsibility, and financial accountability. The government is currently elaborating measures to facilitate and order that process: training programmes, common administrative reforms, personnel and organisation data banks, new procedures for tax collection, and allocation of startup funds; nevertheless, it will also be necessary, as some strategists now realize, to reform the culture of the government at the centre so that the national administration sees itself as a complement to, not a supervisor of, local government. The local stake in the nature of the process has not been fully appreciated either by administrators at the centre or potential leaders in the hinterland, Bengen (2000) added. The research question on accountability, examines the impact of decentralisation on how local leadership has been responsive to people’s needs. The undertaking is by assessing their representative roles which should be evidenced by people’s trust, which should be reflected in value for money, transparency, clear delineation of authority and power, regular elections and legitimatising functions of the local government, like Mbale Municipal Council.

Therefore, decentralisation stipulates the role of local governments and specifies the position of the people in the running of the affairs; whereby a true and proper decentralisation, ensures that humans should have a say in their own affairs. In this sense, decentralisation is a strategy of governance prompted by external or domestic pressures to facilitate transfer of power closer to those who are most affected by the exercise of power, (Ribot, 1999) concluded. Concurring with the writer, accountability is one of benefits from political decentralisation, and one of the key variables of this study that may act as a measure of the performance of decentralisation. Mbale Municipal Council had not been referenced by other writers, more so on prior and after (longitudinal) the launching of decentralisation, to establish effect. The study could therefore fill the gap.
Devolution of Powers on Infrastructural Development

“Devolution involves the legal conferment of power upon formally constituted local authorities to discharge specified or residual functions. It entails the transfer of power to local government units outside the command structure of the central government. Devolution demands that should be realistic in granting autonomy and independence, as well as having local units outside the central government’s direct control. The local units have to be given corporate status and the power to raise sufficient resources to carry out specific functions.

Devolution implies the need to develop local governments as autonomous institutions, perceived by the people as belonging to them, in the sense that the local governments provide services like good roads, hospitals and schools, as well as modern infrastructures that satisfy their needs and remain subject to the people’s control.” Rondinelli et al. (1983) added. Clear-cut accountability and division of roles and responsibility are key elements of decentralisation. A common concern voiced to the team by locally elected and administrative officials was their having the assigned responsibility for certain functions without meaningful corresponding authority and resources.

Lessons learnt from the Ugandan experience through LC system, Olowu et al. (2004), stated that, “Most treatments of decentralisation appeared to be caught in the structural dead end (cul-de-sac), familiar to students of African politics, namely that plans for invigorating local government tend to founder in political environments marked by three crucial factors: the political insecurity of those who hold state power can be overcome; the economic poverty of both state and social actors, and the lack of administrative and technical skills in both state and society,” Olowu et al. (2004) affirmed, “Understanding these structural problems of governance in Africa is key to understanding in Africa.”

Contextually, as stated in the background, there were cases relating to decentralisation on local government performance raising concerns in areas of infrastructural development. There were complaints that the Councils appoint the tender boards and works, goods and services were awarded to people with connections with those in district administrative and political structures. It was further stated that above practice leads to hiking of contract fees, delayed completion of contracts and poor-quality work especially in infrastructure projects, (Mbale Municipal Council State of Affairs Report, 2013). As none of the Writers had written on the topic and even used the objectives in this study, it was therefore candidly justifiable to carry out this research, putting in mind the research question on infrastructural development in Mbale Municipal Council. The research question on infrastructural development demanded the study to look into the performance of water and sanitary system, power supply, communication systems and other utilities in correlation to the satisfaction of service users.

Devolution Powers on Provision of Efficient Services

Decentralisation reforms in Uganda followed a long period in which the institutional links between the centre and locality had weakened to such an extent that neither could control the other nor ensure access for the other to its resources. Thus, the failure of government in providing social goods and services in 1970s and 1980s had been attributed to the limited and often fragmented local involvement. Local governments had no major functions and limited resources and practically no political autonomy. The trend towards devolution of powers from central government to local governments which started in 1980s was aimed at increasing of participation in policy-making process and strengthening the local capacity for resources mobilization and power sharing in the provision of social goods and services.
In Uganda, urban councils like Mbale Municipal Council, took advantage of decentralisation reforms by contracting out some services allowed to them to the private sector in an effort to increase local revenue mobilization and enhance efficiency in delivery of local services. There was evidence that in some specific areas, the privatization of market had produced some measure of ‘success’ (Nsibambi, 1995). Certain indicators of success were outlined by UNDP stipulating the need to establish a positive correlation among the following measures: efficient and democratic structures, equity and power alleviation- (In the study the variable is performance) While these indicators remain key to the study, they were analysed within defined contextual boundaries.

Here, success was measured in relative terms, within defined social-economic and political context that includes the following:

- Social-economic, political conditions prior to decentralisation. For the study, focus was on what change has been realized in local government performance on launching of decentralisation up to the time of this research of Mbale Municipal Council.
- Organisational relationship between different levels of government and the internal structures of the units and involved in service delivery.
- The various elements that contribute the redistribution of resources and responsibilities
- Levels of efficiency; effectiveness (resources mobilization and utilization, minimization of costs).

Quoting Lubanga (1996), “Since 1993, NRM administration has, through enactment of laws and the constitution, worked towards dramatically changing the framework within its location governments operates. Given that decentralisation has deep implication for service delivery, the framework in Uganda has been established is worth describing in details, together with legal and policy aspect that enhance community participation, service delivery and participation.”

Birungi et al. on service delivery in local governments, “Principal aim of decentralisation and privatization of services is to orient service delivery process towards the demand of service users. The activities of service providers should therefore be guided by the interest and demands of the users, and ultimately remain responsive to those demands. By empowering local communities to take charge of their of local institutions of self-governance and resource mobilization, the decentralisation in Uganda was expected to build democratic structures that are responsive and accountable to the public and promote capacity building at the local level, bring decision making nearer to the people, Birungi et al., continued, “The introduction of local choice into the delivery of social services promises to enhance sustainability of development projects by fostering a sense of ownership. It is assumed that progressively, decentralisation will create conditions that are conducive for decision making rooted in local opinions and local circumstances,” concluded. The above literature, addressed what service delivery performance is expected by the consumers and calls on the research question on service delivery to explore the state in Mbale Municipal Council. Following scant empirical literature on the objectives of the study, we selected theory of participation and service delivery that were proxies for efficient and effective services provided for people of Mbale Municipal Council in their most fundamental competencies, in line with timely accountability, infrastructural development, provision of services, and policy implementation. This may represent an improvement with respect to previous literature, which so far has not explored in depth the objectives of this study.

In conclusion, despite the good intentions by government for launching decentralisation, at local governments level, like Mbale Municipal Council, the performance of social services had not met people’s
needs. Part of the evidence to that effect, was the Report of the State of affairs, (2013). For Example, Lack of efficient and effective services in hospitals and health centres which existed prior the launching of decentralisation had not improved as no recruitment of staff to cope with increased number of clients, had been carried out since 2006.

**Devolution of Power on Policy implementation**

UNDP- Supported Initiatives highlighted its activities in Uganda in support of decentralisation. Uganda being among the selected countries, this was based on following criteria: pronounced government policies and wide range of UNDP programmes, and the availability of successful and non-successful initiatives. In its report, it was stated that UNDP had been the catalyst for decentralisation and local governance in national development policies. Uganda like Mali had a strong thrust towards decentralisation and local governance in 1990s. Uganda decentralisation policy was promulgated in 1992, Mali’s Mission and for decentralisation and Institutional Reform began in 1993, (UNDP, 2002). Both countries decentralisation policy seemed to have been necessary by civil conflict/ or political and economic crisis. This was widely acknowledged in Uganda as stated in country report: “Uganda’s adoption of devolution as the bedrock of its strategy can be attributed to three major crisis that NRM had to address when it seized power in 1986: an institutional crisis had long paralyzed the functioning of central government; a legitimacy crisis that had created a large chasm between the populace and the government; and the contradiction between the administrative system and the NRM had set up in liberated areas between 1981-1985 civil war and the centralized structures on taking power”(Uganda Country Report).

Although many countries had adopted decentralisation for the benefits it is supposed to bring to the people, but a number of factors had affected its performance denying people the expected dividends like: lack of accountability by the leaders, lack of participation by the people in controlling their affairs, which may result into poor service delivery. Time and again, reformers learned that decentralisation is not a panacea for all of the ills of ineffective governance. That is why according to records, successful experiments in decentralisation had yielded many of the benefits claimed by its advocate, but skeptics also pointed to its limitations (Cheema et al, 2007).

By democratising and transferring power, strong decentralisation threatens many actors. Because of this, some decentralisation programmes had not been fully implemented. It should therefore come as no surprise that this review and most of the literature on decentralisation focused more on expectations and discourse than on practice and outcome. By large, the decentralisation experiment had only taken weak steps in the direction of deconcentration. Many reforms were taking place in the name of decentralisation, but they were not setting up the basic institutional infrastructure from which to expect the positive outcomes that decentralisation promises. Instead, local democracies were created but given no power, or power was devolved to non-representative or upwardly accountable local authorities. Therefore, we must assess decentralisation to identify cases that exist in more than just discourse. When such instances of - that is, downwardly accountable local authorities with power- are found, then we can ask about measuring their outcomes (Ribbot, 2002). In 1994, the Ministry of Local Government in Uganda summarised the policy objectives as follows: “In sum, decentralisation is a democratic reform, which seeks to transfer political, administrative, financial and planning authority from the centre to Local Government Councils, it seeks to promote popular participation, empower local people to make decisions and enhance accountability and
responsibility. Decentralisation is at the fore-front in promoting effectiveness and efficiency in mobilizing and management of resources for the delivery of services” (Secretariat, 1994).

Decentralisation remained a core prescription of international development organisations for promoting democratic governance and economic adjustment and was seen by many of its advocates as a condition for achieving sustainable economic, political and social development and for attaining the UN’s millennium development goals. Reassessing decentralisation in these new contexts was also important because of the continuing difficulties experienced by governments in many developing countries in implementing it effectively. Scholars, policymakers, and development professionals need to rethink why some programmes have succeeded and others have not. The relationships between decentralisation and economic development, decentralisation and local government performance and between decentralisation and poverty reduction need to be clarified. The efficacy of decentralisation in achieving the objectives that advocates claim for, especially in developing countries, needs to be verified, Cheema (2007) concluded. This equally gives the study through the research question on policy implementation to rethink, basing on data available, how political decentralisation affected local government performance in Mbale Municipal Council, in the line of policy implementation.

Methodology

To be able to meet the study’s objectives, cross- sectional design was adopted to be able to establish the situation of service delivery in Mbale Municipal Council, before and after the launching of decentralisation in Uganda. Alongside the cross-sectional design, the study also used a descriptive study design, to ascertain and ably describe the characteristics of variables in the study (Sekaran, 2008, p.121). It equally, undertook both qualitative and quantitative analysis, for reasons that, it is proved that, qualitative analysis fosters a detailed and in-depth presentation of data of variables that constitute a meaningful discourse like people’s participation and accountable leadership, which is a requisite for a decentralisation that guarantees effective people’s service delivery. The relationship of the people and their leaders is reflected in Principle and Agent Model, (Eckardt, 2008). The quantitative approach was used to gather information for proper analysis and making appropriate inferences, generalisations and conclusions to the population (Mugenda and Mugenda, 2010). Qualitative approach was employed so as to capture the information on attitudes and behavior, hence supplementing information from quantitative sources (Arya and Yesh, 2001). While qualitative methodology was dominant in the study, quantitative methodology was used for figures, tables, graphs and charts through the use of a structured questionnaires.

The study population comprised of 1078 subjects, who included: Head Teachers and Teachers, Technical Staff, Municipal Councilors and Local Councilors, and Health Staff. The selection of the sample size was based on the sample size selection table by Krejcie and Morgan (1970), cited in Amin (2005). Since there was an element of homogeneous, in the set-up of population settlement in the three divisions, namely Northern, Wanale and Industrial, a sample of (292) was considered sufficient to generate reliable data, and the sample was arrived at by using Solvin’s formula. Focused group discussions guides were used in evaluating primary and secondary data, which were applied to government officials who were directly
involved in the policy formulation and implementation, and such open discussion yielded important information for the study. A documentary review checklist and interview were used to gather and collect secondary data. An interview guide with pre-determined set of open-ended questions was used during the interview to enable cover the variables under study. The instrument was followed by the researcher to ask questions prompting responses from respondents who mostly were technical staff and were supposed to be a good source of data on the change ushered in, from the time it was launched to date.

After constructing the questionnaire, the supervisors and other experts reviewed the items. Interpretation of the CVI obtained was based on the George and Mallery (2003) scale whereby a value above 0.7 would be considered acceptable validity. And this study obtained a validity that was more than 0.8. Cronbach Alpha was used to establish the reliability of the questionnaire. Interpretation of the coefficient of reliability obtained was based on the George and Mallery (2003) scale whereby a value above 0.7 is considered acceptable reliability, whereas this study obtained 0.97 reliability.

Equally the researcher complied with Uganda National Council for Science and Technology (UNCST) requirements. Data collected from the field was sorted, coded by assigning themes to the study variables and later entered into a computer using statistical software (SPSS) to enable analysis. The data was able to answer the research questions and hypotheses.

The study managed to involve 160 participants for the questionnaires in the process of data collection out of the planned 175 participants; henceforth, constituting a ninety-one (91) percent return rate. Of the 25 planned interviews, the study only managed to reach 21 interviewees in the process (84%). Meanwhile, the study was expected to conduct ten (10) focused group discussions (FGDs) of nine (9) persons each with a total of ninety-two (92) respondents, and all were covered. This constituted 100% for the FGDs participants. On the whole, the entire study sample had a combined average total (93%) response/return rate. The study noted that most of the respondents targeted had busy schedules and therefore, could not be easily reached. Though, the study tried to gather as much information as possible from the participants.

Findings
Devolution of Powers on Timely Accountability
H1: There has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability in Mbale Municipal Council

Table 6.2: ANOVA on Devolution of Powers on Timely Accountability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devolution of Powers on Timely Accountability</th>
<th>ANOVA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sum of Squares</td>
<td>df</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>2.287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>216.902</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>219.189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The one-way, between-subjects’ analysis of variance failed to reveal a steadfast effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability, F (2, 145) = .764, p = .467, MS error = 1.496, α = .05. The 2 is the between-groups degrees of freedom, 145 is within-groups degrees of freedom, .764 is the F ratio from the F column, .467 is the value in the Sig. column (the p value), and 1.496 is the within-groups mean square estimate of variance. In this case, the p value equals .467, which is greater than the α level (.05), so we fail to reject H1
that there has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability in Mbale Municipal Council.

**Table 6.3: Means for Groups in Homogeneous Subsets**

**Devolution of Powers on Timely Accountability**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tukey HSD</th>
<th>Subset for alpha = 0.05</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Division or Location of the Respondent</strong></td>
<td><strong>N</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Division</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wanale Division</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Division</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>.523</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Means for groups in homogeneous subsets are displayed.

a. Uses Harmonic Mean Sample Size = 48.990.

b. The group sizes are unequal. The harmonic mean of the group sizes is used. Type I error levels are not guaranteed.

The means listed in each subset column are not statistically reliably different from each other. On devolution of powers on timely accountability, none of the means are reliably different from any of the other means. That is not to say that the means are not dissimilar from each other, but only that we could not observe a clear-cut difference between any of the means. This is consistent with the fact that we could not also reject the null hypothesis of the ANOVA on devolution of powers on timely accountability.

Whereas accountability might be intricate to delineate, there is a harmony that it involves a rendering of an account and therefore the provision of accurate, relevant and timely information to the appropriate stakeholders (Cameron, 2004). Whilst information cannot be equated with accountability, it is, according to Funnell (2003), an essential ingredient of it. Scholars argue that though public-sector reforms had resulted in public sector organisations providing a wide range of information it had not led to better accountability. Broadbent and Laughlin (2003) similarly argued that the provision of more detailed information does not automatically lead to greater accountability. Barton (2006) likewise argued that accountability requires openness, transparency and the provision of information (Tippett and Kluvers, 2010).

Notwithstanding the different viewpoints, this study considers information as one of the central ingredients of accountability. This assertion is supported by the call by almost all the respondents calling for a minimum education level to be set for LCs (average education level is Ordinary Level Certificate) given the testimony by many respondents that, councilors made a lot of mistakes that rendered the ineffective at holding the technical staff accountable. Furthermore, participation of councilors in Mbale Municipal Council was also said to be limited though the respondents did not link this directly to education but internal squabbles, which in turn hinder proper accountability. One respondent confessed that, some of the LCs failed to read the oath during inauguration. This therefore, implies that, capacity of the local government is an important factor in creating variations in accountability. The effects of capacity can be reflected from transparent revenue and expenditure management a well as value for money.

Meanwhile, focused group discussion findings revealed that: politicians supervised referral hospital to ensure that there are adequate staff that were qualified beside effective deployment, district health inspectors checked on illegal drug shops and pharmacies, also, there was lack of staff welfare from the
central government (one thing that could demotivate officials from carrying on their work). Even then, participants argued that, the officials who carried out their work on the faulty cases, they themselves, had personal interest (as attached to personal gain or benefit). For instance, one interview respondent stated that:

*Devolution of powers has not improved on timely accountability of head teachers. This is because there is conflict of interest for head teachers while executing their duties.*

Besides, participants also cited pride and tribalism at workplace, corruption at time of interviews for jobs, natives’ laxity at work and non-natives commitment at work among other factors as some of the cases that hinder full attainment of Mbale Municipal Council’s attainment of the benefits that come with devolution of power. Participants also cited lack of staff welfare from the central government. That meant that decentralising does not necessarily have done away with central authority’s support for the localised governments. The central government’s efforts are therefore appreciated in financing development projects at local governments’ level, giving an example of a complete unit of machinery for roads construction; leave alone, initiative of promoting Municipalities, like Mbale to city status.

**Devolution of Powers on Infrastructure Development**

**H₂:** There has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on infrastructure development in Mbale Municipal Council

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 6.5: ANOVA on Devolution of Powers on Infrastructure Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ANOVA</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devolution of Powers on Infrastructure Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum of Squares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From table 6.5, the one-way, between subject’s analysis of variance could not show a considerable effect of devolution of powers on infrastructure development, F (2, 153) = .722, p = .487, MS error = 1.754, α = .05. The 2 is the between-groups degrees of freedom, 153 is the within-groups degrees of freedom, .722 is the F ratio from the F column, .487 is the value in the Sig. column (the p value), and 1.754 is the within-groups mean square estimate of variance. In this case, the p value equals .487 which is greater than the α level (.05), so we thus failed to reject H2 that there has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on infrastructure development in Mbale Municipal Council).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 6.6: Means for Groups in Homogeneous Subsets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Devolution of powers on infrastructure Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tukey HSD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division or Location of the Respondent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wanale Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Means for groups in homogeneous subsets are displayed.
a. Uses Harmonic Mean Sample Size = 51.678.
b. The group sizes are unequal. The harmonic mean of the group sizes is used. Type I error levels are not guaranteed.

In devolution of powers on infrastructure development, all three means are listed in a single subset column, so none of the means are reliably different from any of the other means. The means listed in each subset column are not statistically reliably different from each other. That is not to say that the means are not different from each other, but only that we failed to observe a variance between any of the means. This agrees with the latter one way test where we failed to reject the null hypothesis of the ANOVA on devolution of powers on infrastructure development.

To support the ANOVA portrait of devolution of powers on infrastructure development, FGDs participants clearly asserted that the Municipal Council leaders were partially playing their respective roles. Some are compromised by the poor leadership that fails to enforce quality work and end up with what one participant regarded as “shoddy works.” Political wrangles, they noted, delayed service delivery, minimal political will at the district service, while others are corrupt. Besides, there was less consultation from the people at the grassroots and thus less involvement in decision making. In as much as, the people of Mbale Municipal Council are quite abreast with infrastructural development programmes, putting in mind that, they were promised to elevate the MMC from being a town to city status, there were “complaints people have on the performance of their leaders in the shadow.”

**Devolution of Powers on Provision of Efficient Services**

**H**₄: There has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on provision of efficient services in Mbale Municipal Council

**Table 6.8: ANOVA on Devolution of Powers on Provision of Efficient Services**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANOVA</th>
<th>Devolution of powers on provision of efficient services</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sum of Squares</td>
<td>df</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>.131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>224.042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>224.173</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.8, the one-way, between-subjects analysis of variance was unsuccessful in revealing a dependable effect of devolution of powers on provision of efficient services, F (2, 153) = .045, p = .956, MS error = 1.464, α = .05. The 2 is the between-groups degrees of freedom, 153 is the within-groups degrees of freedom, .045 is the F ratio from the F column, .956 is the value in the Sig. column (the p value), and 1.464 is the within-groups mean square estimate of variance. In this case, the p value equaled .956, which was greater than the α level (.05), so we could not reject H₃ (there has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on provision of efficient services in Mbale Municipal Council).

**Table 6.9: Means for Groups in Homogeneous Subsets**

**Tukey HSD**

| Devolution of Powers on Provision of Efficient Services |
|---|---|
| Division or Location of the Respondent | N | Subset for alpha = 0.05 |
The means listed in each subset column are not statistically consistently different from each other. For devolution of powers on provision of efficient services, none of the means are reliably different from any of the other means. Thus, not to say the means are not different from each other, but we only could not observe a difference between any of the means. This is in a constant with the fact that we could not also reject the null hypothesis of the ANOVA on devolution of powers on provision of efficient services.

That is why, as local governments are called upon to provide services to the citizens, service delivery has shifted from the traditional single-agency hierarchies to networks of contractual providers. This shift in the predominant coordination mechanism from bureaucracy to collaboration has underscored the importance of inter-organisational and interpersonal negotiations. Though local governments are formally structured, they contain elements of self-governance that is enabled by informal systems of rules, trust and reciprocity norms, credible commitments, and informal mechanisms for rewarding or punishing those who violate rules and norms or defect commitments (Ostrom et al., 1994).

Devolution of Powers on Policy Implementation

H4: There has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation in Mbale Municipal Council

Table 6.11: ANOVA on Devolution of Powers on Policy Implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devolution of Powers On Policy Implementation</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>3.925</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.963</td>
<td>1.505</td>
<td>.225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>199.511</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>1.304</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>203.436</td>
<td>155</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The one-way, between-subjects analysis of variance failed to reveal a reliable effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation, F (2, 153) = 1.505, p = .225, MS error = 1.304, α = .05. The 2 is the between-groups degrees of freedom, 153 is the within-groups degrees of freedom, 1.505 is the F ratio from the F column, .225 is the value in the Sig. column (the p value), and 1.304 is the within-groups mean square estimate of variance. In this case, the p value equals .225, which is greater than the α level (.05), so we fail to reject H4 (there has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation in Mbale Municipal Council).

Table 6.12: Means for Groups in Homogeneous Subsets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Devolution of Powers On Policy Implementation</th>
<th>Northern Division</th>
<th>Wanale Division</th>
<th>Industrial Division</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>47</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>.962</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Means for groups in homogeneous subsets are displayed

a. Uses Harmonic Mean Sample Size = 51.678.
b. The group sizes are unequal. The harmonic mean of the group sizes is used. Type I error levels are not guaranteed.
Tukey HSD

Division or Location of the Respondent | N | Subset for alpha = 0.05
--- | --- | ---
Industrial Division | 56 | 3.05
Northern Division | 48 | 3.15
Wanale Division | 52 | 3.42
Sig. | | .229

Means for groups in homogeneous subsets are displayed.

a. Uses Harmonic Mean Sample Size = 51.794.
b. The group sizes are unequal. The harmonic mean of the group sizes is used. Type I error levels are not guaranteed.

The means listed in each subset column are not statistically reliably different from each other. In devolution of powers on policy implementation, all three means are listed in a single subset column, so none of the means are reliably different from any of the other means. That is not to say that the means are not different from each other, but only that we failed to observe a difference between any of the means. This is consistent with the fact that we failed to reject the null hypothesis of the ANOVA on devolution of powers on policy implementation.

In support of the above analysis, FGDs participants illustrated that the people of Mbale Municipal Council benefited in policy implementation as a result of decentralisation by embracing government programmes, since they appeared beneficial on the face value. Meaning that the populace benefited little from what programmes were put up, which showed a disagreement with participatory theory of decentralisation though the populace was somehow benefiting from these programmes. Further, on fair note, policy implementation had improved through close monitoring and report submission to the CAO who also reported to the central government.

Putting it direct, there is evidence that timely and annual reports were sent to the central government, a compliance with policy implementation ignoring some complaints about incomplete projects at Mbale Municipal Council, even vendors working on streets, their issue had taken long to be addressed. Late payment of workers also affected the performance of health centres, and so was the accountability by Head Teachers, that form policy implementation motivators. In addition to that, was the undying corruption among the leaders, absenteeism in offices, being part of the causes of poor service delivery in Mbale Municipal Council.

Discussion

Devolution of powers on timely accountability

From the study findings, it was observed that most of the respondents, using the scale of 0.0 – 1 = very low effect; 1.1 – 2.0 = low effect; 2.1 – 3.0 = medium effect; 3.1 – 4.0 = high effect; 4.1 – 5.0 = very high effect, were neither in agreement nor disagreement with the effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability. Using the Likert scale of the study, with a mean value of 3.15, participants reflected that devolution of powers had a high effect (nearing moderate level) on accountability. Furthermore, both interview and FGDs results were not in a solid state to confirm the effect of devolution of powers on timely
accountability. Rather, participants cited a number of challenges such as insufficient resources among others to carry on the activities in the Municipality.

The one-way ANOVA test on the effect of devolution of powers on accountability failed to reveal a steadfast effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability, F (2, 145) = .764, p = .467, MS error = 1.496, α = .05. However, it also failed to reject (H1) that there had been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability in Mbale Municipal Council. Therefore, the study could not adopt one side of the results since the findings proved indifferent. Whereas the study hypothesized insignificance, the desired result of devolution of powers is a higher significant effect on timely accountability. Treisman (2000) held: “Even if local officials are, by nature, self-interested, they may be constrained by institutions of local accountability. Besides control from above, they may be subject to control from below.” He further argued that as long as a particular government at all levels is subject to electoral accountability and the particular contribution of each government to public good/service provision is clear to the voters, the effectiveness, efficiency and honesty of government should be greater when more than one level of government has responsibility for providing and accounting for the same public good/service.

Besides, political or democratic decentralisation being the transfer of authority to representative and downwardly accountable actors, such as elected local governments, Yuliani (2004) alleged that accountability is constituted by the set of mechanisms and sanctions used to assure policy outcomes being consistent with local needs, aspirations and the best public interest as policymakers can make them. As this study revealed that the effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability were not so visible and dependable at the stage it was during the time of this study, gaps could have existed in the accountability bit of Uganda’s decentralisation strategy at Mbale Municipal Council. For that case, Agrawal and Ribot (1999) having argued that there are three basic elements of decentralisation; accountability, discretionary power and security. This study intends therefore, to make a contribution, if only leadership in Uganda took it up well, that it is a duty, to pay attention to its accountability responsibilities to its citizens.

Whereas tax payers may not have full access to control of their resources, those entrusted with the funds should be careful not to jeopardise efforts to advance Uganda’s economic and political development. This is further supported by Ekaterina (2008) where he illustrated that since it might be the case that bad performance is due to problems with accountability rather than inefficiency of hierarchy. He therefore called upon local governments to take into account that other local governments benefit from learning from their failures when deciding whether to experiment – a version of free-rider problem. Thus, Mbale Municipal Council being one of earlier local governments in the region, should take note of the fact that upcoming local government should take Mbale Municipal Council as a model for their own success and it should be in lead to achieve city status.

In summing it up, it depends on the leadership of Mbale Municipal Council, otherwise, Treisman (2000) is still remembered, when he lamented, that some governments are extremely corrupt, wasteful, and ineffective at providing basic public services to their citizens while others are far more honest, efficient and responsive. It’s therefore a public choice that should be taken by Mbale Municipal Council whether to dwell on the latter or adopt a new legacy, which of course would change the course of decentralisation history for the municipality, the whole Eastern Region, Uganda, East Africa and Africa at large.
Devolution of powers on infrastructural development

Table 6.4 (a) and (b) in chapter six (6), with an average [mean of 3.31] reflected that devolution of powers had a high effect on infrastructural development. Findings from interviews and FGDs could not validate whether devolution of powers had a high effect on infrastructural development or not but the responses appeared to be both supportive and non-supportive on both sides. The findings of the study reflected reality since in Mbale Municipal Council, infrastructure was still not performing as expected and there had been minimal improvements. As a matter of fact, most concerned citizens argued that Mbale was a clean and well-built/ planned place before as compared to its status after decentralisation to the time of the study.

In fact, despite the Directorate of physical planning and urban development’s aims to attain an orderly, progressive and sustainable urban and rural development as a framework for industrialization, provision of social and physical infrastructure, agricultural modernisation and poverty eradication and that financial, human and infrastructure resources have been put in place to enhance the process, issues such as land policy being pigeonholed by the government as the most emotive, culturally sensitive, politically volatile and economically central issue in Uganda (GoU, 2011). Yet, physical infrastructures need land for which to be erected upon. In relation to that, there was possibility that these infrastructures were congested to some extent, and so the services they provide depended on their size but also on their level of utilization and on other environmental cost factors (Olle & Esteller, 2005).

Moreover, Savage & Lumbasi (2016) in their study “The Impact of Decentralisation in Kenya” also concluded in their analysis that, whereas there had been growths in infrastructure, resources and changes to governing systems, the full extent of the impact of decentralisation was yet to be realised. It was right to state that since this study found that all the three administrative divisions of Mbale Municipal Council (Northern, Wanale, and Industrial) were nearly having the same experience, as regards to the influence of devolution of powers on infrastructural development. This was seen when comparing the harmonic mean of the group sizes used. In devolution of powers on infrastructure development, all three means were listed in a single subset column, so none of the means were reliably different from any of the other means.

While decentralisation has been applauded for its supposed potential to improve levels of public participation, bureaucratic accountability, administrative efficiency, and responsiveness to local needs, among other goals, it is unfortunate that these are not fully experienced in Mbale Municipal Council. Further, the assessment of decentralisation in a significant share of the academic and practitioner texts has moved from striking optimism to one of restraint, and even pessimism. It has actually been believed that since the 1990s, except for some excessively optimistic donor reports, decentralisation has been branded problematic in the vast available academic literature. One or more dangers such as increasing inequality, the empowering of local elites, political instability, and general ineffectiveness have increasingly been pointed out by academics (Fritzen & Lim, 2006). Mbale Municipal Council and Uganda at large, is no exception to such issues.

Furthermore, the World Bank (2006) stressed that the important goal is to make the local government more responsive to the needs of local population. Most discussions about decentralisation, accordingly, center on attempts to improve the delivery of services. Decentralised authority necessitates an overall enabling environment in the decentralisation reforms processes and programmes in all countries (Nikolov, 2006). This requires that institutional and administrative capacities must be in place, in order to implement successfully local governance reforms.
Besides, decentralised governance cannot be a useful mechanism for enhanced and efficient service delivery, without well trained, professional and qualified local government staff; existing legal framework in the decentralised governance systems in these countries should be further developed and upgraded with more effective legal instruments and institutional framework and efficiency is of colossal significance for successful delivery of public services (Martinez, Kebede, & Ananda, 2015). Further, there is dire need to strengthen measures to fight corruption and promote the cause of clean government, ensure active popular participation in government which is considered as a requirement for good governance and local government infrastructural development.

All in all, The ANOVA results $F(2, 153) = .722, p = .487, MS\text{ error} = 1.754, \alpha = .05$, could not prove the effect being solid and substantial. From the ANOVA result, the 2 is the between-groups degrees of freedom, 153 is the within-groups degrees of freedom, .722 is the F ratio from the F column, .487 is the value in the Sig. column (the p value), and 1.754 is the within-groups mean square estimate of variance. In this case, the p value equals .487 which is greater than the α level (.05), therefore, the study failed to reject H2 that there has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on infrastructure development in Mbale Municipal Council.

**Effect of Devolution of Powers on Provision of Efficient Services**

From the research findings, devolution of powers had a high effect on provision of efficient services. This was evidenced by the fact that majority of the respondents agreed to the statements in the questionnaire. Though this was at a minimal extent since the mean value according to the legend used in the study [0.0 – 1 = strongly disagree; 1.1 – 2.0 = disagree; 2.1 – 3.0 = indifferent; 3.1 – 4.0 = agree; 4.1 – 5.0 = strongly agree] reflected to be nearing moderate effect or at the level of indifference. This matched with what was happening in Mbale Municipality at the time. Results, in terms of provision of efficient services were not so visible.

It was argued by Christie et al. (2003) that the decentralisation decision is an endogenous choice that depends on and affects other policy choices. Therefore, Mbale Municipal Council has to be obliged to be so careful on policy issues. Moreover, the analysis of variance (ANOVA) failed to reject H3 that there had been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on provision of efficient services in Mbale Municipal Council. Though the study seemed to show some effect, insignificant effect could not also be ruled out since participants also disagreed that devolution of powers had a significant effect on provision of efficient services in Mbale Municipal Council.

For instance, in table 5.3, it was reflected that 8.1% of the study participants strongly disagreed, 16.9% disagreed, 23.1% were indifferent, 32.5% agreed, and 18.8% strongly agreed that devolution of powers had enabled people of Mbale Municipal Council to access essential services. Such findings showed a clear balance between the significance and insignificance of devolution of powers on provision of efficient services. Marume & Jubenkanda (2016) of Zimbabwe Open University in their publication on Centralization and Decentralisation argued out that one of the demerits of decentralisation is that it makes administration expensive due to duplication of work and lack of centralized housekeeping services. However, this study suggests that decentralisation makes corruption affordable and cheap due to a rigorous process that seems to be so decentralised to the extent of failing to be implemented, but not necessarily duplication of work. The pertinent issue would be the laxity to do what one is supposed or required to do.
One common issue, that is pulling down decentralisation efforts in Mbale Municipal Council that the participants in the interviews and FGDs pointed out so many times is that of moonlighting and late reporting to places of work. Another was favouring relatives and segregatory tendencies and bad cultural or habitual clings among the serving populates. What's more is Myerson (2014) contended that decentralisation and democracy could improve the chances for successful economic development in Africa because the reputation of local government and democracy is manifest in the history of many countries, yet autonomous local governments has remained not as much of a common phenomenon in Africa as elsewhere in the globe. He further detailed that democratic political competition can improve governance only if voters have a choice among qualified candidates who have good reputations for exercising power responsibly in public service.

Myerson’s trepidations have not been able to open up the case of African nations, where leaders seem to be inclined to the ‘lifetime-saviour-supreme-leader’ mentality. Even biblical, God’s appointed, gave up power when their time elapsed, but our African fellows seem not to be on the literate end when it comes to the element of passing and transitioning leadership service. Yet for Myerson (2014), the crucial supply of trusted democratic direction and governance can develop best in responsible and liable institutions of local government, where successful indigenous leaders can attest their qualifications to turn out to be strong competitive contenders for higher office. Adopting and agreeing to his ideas therefore, ‘a federal constitutional structure that devolves substantial powers to autonomously elected local governments’ (p.1) could upsurge the likelihoods for an up-and-coming democratic development in Uganda and Africa at large.

Generally speaking, just as Batchelor, Smith, & Fleming (2014) put it that decentralisation has resulted in some improvement in public service delivery, although some sources debate this premise noting that it is difficult to create a causal link between decentralisation reforms and improved services (Cabral, 2011; Sharma, 2006: cited). Notable examples, where decentralisation seemed to have improved the delivery of localised public services had been observed (Bashaasha et al, 2009; Dege Consult, 2007; cited). In fact, each of the national studies in ten African countries noted a slight improvement in service delivery (Dickovick and Reidl, 2010: cited). This study therefore joined those studies, although that was not the desired or intended result. In the next chapter, the study goes ahead to elucidate recommendations that would help make Uganda’s decentralisation worthy of recognition and applaud.

**Effect of Devolution of Powers on Policy Implementation**

Study findings on the effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation revealed that devolution of powers played a minimal role with a (mean of 3.15, which from the study scale of 0.0 – 1 = very low effect; 1.1 – 2.0 = low effect; 2.1 – 3.0 = medium effect; 3.1 – 4.0 = high effect; 4.1 – 5.0 = very high effect) reflected nearly moderate performance. To support the above findings, in the Food Security and Land Governance Factsheet (2016), for instance, it was argued out that whereas there is commendable progress in policy development on both land governance and food security, the stakeholders did not have avenues to interact and discuss areas of mutual interest and concern right from the district to the national level. Yet policies keep being crafted in the country. The only question is whether these policies are brought up through national mutual interest surveys, dialogues, and or voting rights or they are simply designed by those with great minds that come up with what is beyond implementation (what this study would rather call: the individualistic approach).
Simply put, Uganda’s policies may be too good to be true, which is why they are so pleasing and promising, yet they just seem to be too nice to be implemented and yield visible results. Henceforth, responsible stakeholders should look into Uganda’s too good to be implemented policy gap. This study would rather support a policy with minor glitches that can yield wider public good than one that is too good but cannot benefit the community, even for once. Furthermore, it was also paramount that the study tested H4 [there has been an insignificant effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation in Mbale Municipal Council] through using ANOVA. The one-way ANOVA therefore, between-subjects analysis of variance failed to reveal a reliable effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation, $F(2, 153) = 1.505, p = .225$, $MS$ error $= 1.304$, $\alpha = .05$. The $2$ is the between-groups degrees of freedom, $153$ is the within-groups degrees of freedom, $1.505$ is the $F$ ratio from the $F$ column, $.225$ is the value in the Sig. column (the $p$ value), and $1.304$ is the within-groups mean square estimate of variance. In this case, the $p$ value equaled $.225$, which was greater than the $\alpha$ level (.05), so we failed to reject H4.

This therefore meant that the study could neither solidify the effect of devolution of powers on policy implementation nor completely erase the possibility of its impact from being felt in Mbale Municipal Council. Boex and Kelly (2011) illustrated in the ‘IDG Policy Brief – Fiscal Decentralisation in Kenya,’ that the 2007 post-election violence saw the adoption of a new Constitution in September 2010, which resolved some contentious issues, among others, the introduction of a new structure of governing power between the center and subnational regions. They however argued that the degree to which the changes in Kenya’s intergovernmental structure will truly prove to be transformative depends on how the constitutional implementation process deals with political relevancy, operational effect, governance, being in charge, and fare in terms of own source of revenues for decentralised areas. This actually represents the nature and direction that Uganda is inclined to. The results of the study still put Mbale Municipal Council in a state of uncertainty, or more of the cross-road, that demands the collaborating commitment for both the political and technical wings, that had all along been coming by, which should not be the case.

The same result was felt across groups in homogeneous subsets, representing Northern Division, Industrial Division, and Wanale Division. Thus, in devolution of powers on policy implementation, all three means were listed in a single subset column, so none of the means were reliably different from any of the other means. That is not to say that the means were not different from each other, but only that we failed to observe a difference between any of the means. This was consistent with the fact that we failed to reject the null hypothesis of the ANOVA on devolution of powers on policy implementation.

In the contribution, the study reveals that for Mbale Municipal Council people to benefit from decentralisation, they have to comprehend how to hold their leaders accountable for each and every action during and also after their term of service. As framed in Principle-Agent Model of Decentralisation, people must know their position in the relationship with the government (Agent) so as to control the electorate of what to do and not to do. Only when the Locals are elevated to their rightful position through the mode of elections that performance of local governments will reflect the effect of decentralisation in Mbale Municipal Council, and the purposes of decentralisation can only be realized when people are given chance to choose what suits their tastes and preferences, practically reflected in principles-agents relationship.

This study is an opportunity to come face to face with the existing challenges facing local governments’ performance in Uganda and Mbale Municipal Council in particular after launching of decentralisation. In view of the findings, these are some of the observations and recommendations that would help improve on
the performance of local governments in areas of: timely accountability, infrastructural development, service delivery and policy implementation as a result of political decentralisation, in relation to the principle-agent model of decentralisation as advanced in chapter seven (07). The study therefore recommended the following:

i. To enable people to exercise their rights by demanding access to information that opens their eyes to what the leaders both political and technocrats are expected to deliver to them in Uganda like elsewhere, people must be sensitized about their rights. Therefore, in order for timely accountability, infrastructural development or service delivery to contribute to local governments’ performance there must be peoples’ awareness that they are empowered to demand for their rights and on the side of researchers, they are tools measures the performance of a government unit.

ii. On the side of service delivery, people should be involved to decide what they need so as to meet their expectations. The role played by the elected representatives should be to ensure that the technical staff diligently carry out their duties and be accountable for their action, more so to the political wing; as politicians are held accountable to the people who elected them. Principal and Agent Theory fitted well for the variable in the study. For instance, it is important legally for the local government officials to know to whom they are answerable and that will in turn foster their work that will subsequently lead to efficient and effective performance.

iii. It is a common short coming which in several cases is assumed normal, whereby there is a lack of qualified staff or a complete shortage of staff to serve in a certain capacity. A reason fronted is new Districts mean employment for the local citizens, where qualification and competencies don’t matter. This leads us to corruption which is the most formidable challenge, not only for Uganda or Mbale Municipal Council, but worldwide, though more serious in Africa countries. It is emphatically put across, that, if accountability meant transparency, dependability and answerability, definitely, corruption would be confronted head on with positive results. This will give people their rights by being empowered as stipulated in realms of decentralisation, more so in devolution type, that emphasizes participation of the people in decision making in all that affect them, and it is what people of Mbale Municipal Council are entitled to.

iv. To win peoples’ support and confidence, the secret is to involve in those being affected in the decision making. This justifies the reason why Liberal Democratic Theory was chosen for this study. People worldwide prefer to go with what they feel is good for them. Liberal Democratic Theory promotes people’s choice, thus empowering them to be the choosers of their destiny.

v. Decentralisation of devolution type, shifts power, authority and resources from the centre to lower level units of local governments that gives democratic rights to the people, who in decentralisation are apt to be the principles, who are mandated to elect their own leaders as agents, whom they hold accountable. Among their rights is policy formulation and implementation; their rights empower them to participate in what affects them. In local Government like Mbale Municipal Council. People’s participation, like planning, budgeting, decision making features among others, all that combined, is supposed to boost people’s the confidence on what is taking place in Mbale Municipal Council.

vi. The counsel of this investigation is hoped to enhance public sector accountability dynamics at the local level, especially decentralising settings. In Uganda like elsewhere, the relationship between governments in Principles –Agent Model of Decentralisation is Agents, and citizens who are the Principles, is changing. These range from sub-government innovations to directly impact on
citizens lives to national legislation and constitutional changes to foster better accountability, which is a prequisite to acquire Middle Class Status in 2020. For this reason, Uganda’s local government seems to be re-centralising certain aspects of government. Whichever way the changes have to take, it is ultimately the government and people to choose the reform path to pursue.

vii. In that aspect, the Researcher in his view argues that political decentralisation can perform effectively in local governments when the people hold their leaders accountable; as it is implied in the Principle-Agent theory (Eckardt, 2008). Meaning that, the people are the principle and the elected political leadership in particular, is the agents. On the other side, Central Government, hold the local governments accountable for the resources and transfers the Central Government surrenders, to lower level of administrations for delivering services to the people. Therefore, the study emphatically down-pinned theoretically on decentralisation in Uganda, on the Principle-Agent Model of Decentraliation as in Fig. 8.1 that can effectively perform when principle-agent theory is at play in relationship between the elected (agents) and the electorates (principles), thus the political leaders and the people that elected them, respectively, under the dominance of accountability.

Conclusion
From the study results, the following conclusions were drawn, which was done according to the research objectives and questions. From the conclusions, the study found it paramount that a subsequent model, may serve as a paradigm shift, from the current status quo to a system that gives people (people) power, authority, responsibility and resources, that mandate them to control the elected and bureaucrats (agents), by holding them accountable for their actions in the process of service delivery. Besides, the study may assist decentralisation agents better understand and innovatively find new ways of making this governance tool work for everyone:

i. First and foremost, it was concluded that ANOVA failed to reveal a steadfast effect of devolution of powers on timely accountability, while the average mean showed a high effect that was nearing the indifference level. Thus, this study found it unreliable to conclude that devolution of powers had a high and significant effect on timely accountability.

ii. Infrastructural development on the other hand was not also found to have benefited more from devolution of powers. Thus, the study concluded that much needed to be done in order to realise the potential that devolution of powers has, when it comes to turning economies downside up. This was as a result of a low mean value that was almost at the level of indifference as per the study legend.

iii. The study concluded that provision of efficient services was not at its desired maximum. There was however some improvement though it was still minimal and the study could not therefore commend devolution of powers for having played its very best role to improve the delivery of social services in Mbale Municipal Council. Rather, the study concluded that delivery of efficient services needed more than just devolving powers.

iv. Policy implementation was concluded to have not also reached its peak as a result of devolution of powers. Though the participants seemed to favour the work that was being done in Mbale Municipal Council, most of them did not lay back as well, in terms of expressing and portraying their reservations as regards to how decentralisation had affected service delivery on the side of policy implementation in Mbale Municipal Council.
References


State Feminism in Botswana

*Keneilwe Sadie Mooketsane*

Keneilwe.Mooketsane@mopipi.ub.bw

*PhD Candidate, Witwatersrand University / Senior Lecturer, University of Botswana*

Abstract

Botswana is experiencing a state of fading feminism, where the women’s movement has collapsed, the women NGO’s have been co-opted by the state, the female political stewards are degenerating and the women themselves appear silenced. The state has done well in other areas of development exhibiting good economic performance and management, good policies and virtuous public administration, a good standing on corruption and good governance but failing on the women’s rights front. This paints a picture of defeat on the women’s agenda. This has negative implications on the social and economic standing of women in Botswana. Some of the implications include the poor political representation of women which this paper will focus on. International norms and standards which Botswana conforms to dictate that women’s rights are human rights thus compelling Botswana and other countries to carefully consider the wellbeing of women. Various actors have made efforts to advance the women’s agenda without much success. This paper assesses the role that the state has played in advancing the interests of women in Botswana and proposes a way forward towards enhancing Botswana’s standing in gender equality. The paper applies and analyses theories and concepts such as women’s movements, agency, state feminism and gender equality in the context of Botswana. It adopts a qualitative and desk based research approach.

**Key words:** State, Feminism, Economics

Introduction

In most parts of the world governments have made it their responsibility to care for women and protect their rights albeit with different degrees of success. This has led to the establishment and acceptance of the state as a foe and agent for women. The establishment of women’s agencies as state’s machineries dealing with the interest of women is widespread. These establishments were borne out of the need for equality between men and women and the emancipation of women. Despite the presence of such establishments women remain economically marginalised and absent in political decision making positions.

The establishment of women agencies is a considerate measure of commitment to women’s issues. Gouws and Hassim (2011) argue that national women machineries are a vehicle for fast tracking gender responsive governance. The presence of women in parliaments is not adequate to represent the interests of women. Women’s policy agencies provide better expression for women and give a stronger voice in public policy compared to women in legislatures (Weldon, 2002).

Despite being established to represent women’s interests and improve conditions of women, it is not clear what the contribution of national women’s agencies has been. In fact, the role of national women’s agencies as an institutional source of representation is an under researched area (Horowitz, 1999; Weldon, 2002). Literature tends to point towards inadequacies of these machineries. For example Gouws and Hassim (2011) point out that the machineries are often not successful, ineffective and dysfunctional. As agents of the state these machineries often act merely as implementers of government decisions which means they often only uphold that which is approved by government.

The focus of this paper is on the institutionalization of gender issues, in particular the paper addresses poor representation of women in political decision making, specifically in parliament in Botswana. It considers the relevance of a state based institution to advocate for gender equality in political decision making. The
paper explains why representation of women in political decision making remains low despite the presence of the state women’s machinery and the exemplary democracy status accorded to Botswana. Furthermore, the paper explores constraints for increasing political representation of women in Botswana.

**Women in decision making and women’s rights**

Representation of women in the national assembly in Botswana is consistently poor with almost nil prospects for improvement. Women make only 8% of the current parliament, in 1989 women made 5% of parliament (Mosime & Kaboyakgosi, 2017). A 3% increase in a period of 20 years is an indication of an imminent challenge facing the country. This paper takes particular interest in the absence of women in positions of political power in Botswana an indication of a deficient democracy, exclusion and misrepresentation of interests. Without representation of women in decision making the ability of women to influence public policy in Botswana is negligible.

There is consensus on the legitimacy and ability of women to govern, equally there is affirmation for support for women’s equality of rights. Research has also shown support for governments to eliminate gender discrimination (Tripp 2010). Women make a significant proportion of the population, therefore they like men and other groups in society must be included in decision making and in all decision making structures. Equally they must like others enjoy economic, political and human rights. Notwithstanding the above, women tend to be inherently disadvantaged, disillusioned and excluded in Botswana and elsewhere. While this seems like an obvious cause for concern, it has not attracted corresponding attention. Where it has drawn some attention strategies have not been resolute or adequate. In an effort to address the disillusion and exclusion of women, governments and societies at large have resorted to varying strategies including gender mainstreaming, empowerment, affirmative action, gender sensitive planning and budgeting among many other mechanisms of resolving the perils of women. These measures have commonly been dispensed through state’s women agencies.

**Gender Affairs Department**

The government of Botswana established the Women’s Affairs Division under the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs in 1981, it was later upgraded from a unit to a department thus Women’s Affairs Department. In 2013 the Women’s Affairs Department was renamed Gender Affairs Department. In its origins the department has always worked closely with women non-governmental organizations.

According to Stetson and Mazur (1995) the extent to which women in the state and women’s machinery lead to policy that benefit women, as well as the relationship between the state and civil society can determine the success or failure of the national gender machineries. The location of the women’s machinery in the governance hierarchy, clarity of mission and mandate, meaningful links with society, resources available, political will, state capacity and political stability and cultural norms about gender equality are important factors that should be considered in their assessment of national gender machineries (McBride & Mazur, 2012). Some of these factors discussed above are discussed in the paper in exploring factors contributing to the poor representation of women in parliament.

The Gender Affairs Department is poorly resourced. Lack of funding undermines effective implementation of gender equality issues (UNDP, 2012). Notwithstanding that the GAD is under resourced, of all the areas of concentration including women and health, the girl child, gender based violence, environmental issues, education and training of women, the GAD seems more focused on economic empowerment perhaps
because it is less controversial and well aligned to government priorities. In concurrence, the Botswana country report (2014) on the implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action indicates significant progress on eradication of poverty and improving the economic wellbeing of women but no substantive improvements or initiatives on improving representation of women in political decision making. The department is not strategically placed and shows no indication of prioritization of gender issues by government. As is the norm, the department could have been strategically situated under the presidency as an indication of prioritization by government. In the past programs such as the housing appeal and poverty eradication have been run from the office of the president, an act interpreted as an indication of commitment.

The Gender Affairs (2014) report suggests that gender issues would be better coordinated from a position with the highest political power and with significant influence over finance and political power. The report recommendation is in alignment with Bauer’s (2011, p. 33) finding that the Women’s Affairs Department was “housed in the wrong ministry, badly underresourced, severely understaffed, lacking in authority and highly demoralized”. Despite the above, the most recent renaming Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs to Ministry of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs is an indication of progressive movement. However, the renaming without additional resources or commitment is ineffectual.

A democracy

Botswana has been declared a middle income country and recognised as a successful democracy. Compared to other African countries Botswana has been heralded a democracy and a peace, stability and development icon. Botswana has been viewed favourably in terms of good governance and controlled corruption (Robinson & Parsons, 2006). Sebudubudu & Mooketsane (2016) state that Botswana has set herself apart from African peers by virtue of economic development and governance.

The fact that Botswana is celebrated as a democracy implies participation, inclusion and good governance. However, a closer look reveals a different picture one of exclusion and poor civic participation. There are identifiable pockets of exclusion and marginalization in Botswana, a case in point is the Basarwa or the san, lesbians and gays and of interest to this paper women. Amidst renowned success in democracy, governance and economic development women in Botswana are confronted by varied challenges including HIV and AIDS, Gender based violence, poverty, unemployment, absence in political decision making positions among others. It appears women have not received adequate attention.

Botswana’s performance in relation to women’s rights has been disappointing. Bauer (2011) reports the lack of concern for gender issues by the Botswana government. Tsie (2017) argues that Botswana’s rapid economic growth was not accompanied by gender equality. Inequality and poverty remain a central concern. Kardam (n/d) argues that there is a gap between Botswana’s reputation as a success and the situation of women in the country hidden behind the success. Several authors share the concern of Botswana’s poor record on women’s rights. The failure of the women’s movement and the state to improve representation of women in political leadership emanating in the consistent poor representation of women in Botswana’s legislature could be a justification of Allen (2007, p. 98) paradox of peace which he argues resulted in “political stability at the cost of political consciousness”.

Conceptual framework - State feminism
According to Mazur (1999, p. 487) state feminism is defined as a field that “examines whether state structures and actors can promote feminist notions through focusing on women’s role in the state as policy makers, the gendered nature of women’s policy machineries in a wide variety of government agencies and branches”. In Botswana state feminism is exercised through the gender affairs department, mandated to eliminate gender discrimination and mainstream gender into government’s policies and programs.

The terms state feminism and women’s policy agencies have often been used interchangeably. McBride and Mazur (2012) argue that post the fall of women’s movements in many countries after the 1970s movements and analysts looked at the state as a means to overcome social and economic inequality. However, in some quarters it is noted that feminists are sceptical of the state as a mechanism for delivering justice for women (Scully, 2010).

Feminist theories dispute the suitability of the state to deliver justice for women. Instead they perceive state institutions as replicating dominance and patriarchy. However over time theorists have reconsidered the role of the state in advancing gender equality and thus view it as a viable partner to women’s movements. Internationalization of gender issues has also opened up opportunities for states to fight for women’s rights.

**The state for women or the state against women - agency**

The state can be both an enabler of women and a constraint to women’s progress. Whether the state is perceived as an organ of patriarchy that perpetuates inequality or as a source of empowerment the national women’s agency plays an important role as a medium through which the state acts for women. Women individually and as a collective can act to their own detriment by being docile and inactive in the pursuit of their interests, but they can also be limited by the state creating dependency and an elusive state of patronage and care. It is generally agreeable that women in groups are better placed to exert pressure as compared to as individuals. According to the World development report (2012:152) “women’s collective voice can contribute to changes in laws, policies, services, institutions, and social norms that eventually will increase women’s individual agency”. The value of collective voice cannot be over emphasised.

States through women agencies, women nongovernmental organizations, international organizations, informal women groups and general civil society groups have made varying attempts at redressing the women issue with varying levels of success. However, it has become apparent that women themselves must take the lead for these strategies to be effective. When aligned, women’s movements in collaboration with women agencies have improved political representation of women (McBride and Mazur, 2006). According to Tripp (2010, p. 224) “collective strategies make it possible to tackle structural dimensions of women’s gender subordination within powerful political and economic institutions”.

Lovenduski (2008) argues that alliances between women’s movements and women’s policy agencies can be said to be successful on the basis of outcome and participants of policy debates. Partnerships or collaborations between women and the state seem to bear better results, leading to a question on whether it is practical to expect the state to take the sole responsibility of the cause of women.

Authors concur that states usually do not make feminist changes without pressure from organized women’s groups (Viterna & Fallon, 2008). States are inherently masculine and patriarchal (Hoffman, 1998b), they have been dominated by men run by men in the interest of men.

While feminists are bound to see the state as inherently male and patriarchal and perpetrating subordination of women there is a new recognition of the state as capable of emancipating women and promoting their interest. The state is seen as legitimate and capable of responding to women’s needs. On the contrary Scully (2010: 39) argues that if women are to rely on the state for aid, it will be a very long
time coming. It appears controversial to mention state and feminist in one breath, as the two terms appear contravening each other. Considering the feminist critique of the state and the patriarchy of the state, Hoffman (1998a, p. 163) argues that the state is conceptualised in a way which makes it unacceptable to feminist theory.

**Agency and women’s movement**

The question of agency seeks to establish if and how “women have organized themselves and have participated as activists to challenge, resist, overthrow or gain entrance to social structures and institutions that tended to ignore, exclude disadvantage or penalize them” (Lee & Logan, 2017, p. 1). Where there is limited collective force it is likely that women will not make a substantive impact in advocating for their rights or change. Tripp (2010) rightly points out that women’s agency is central to addressing women’s capabilities to assert themselves politically.

Rupp (1997) defines women’s movement as a group of people who share a collective identity informed by similarities in their interests, goals, identities and experiences. Operating outside the state, women’s movement play a critical role in enhancing the effectiveness of women’s policy agencies. The women’s movement in Botswana seems to operate from within the states women’s machinery.

**Gender Equality as a policy priority**

Without the requisite political will it is unlikely that the Gender Affairs Department can produce desired results. It is apparent that gender equality in political representation is not a policy priority for government. However the past two presidents have shown varying degrees of support towards equal representation. Although the special nomination provision was not established for women empowerment former president Festus Mogae used it to bring in more women into parliament. The former president Mogae appointed 2 women in 1999 and 3 in 2004 respectively into specially elected/ nominated parliamentary positions, on the contrary former president Ian Khama during his term removed 2 women from cabinet positions and replaced them with men (Bauer, 2011).

The government of Botswana acknowledges women as an important part of society and the economy. The government has signed various protocols at a regional and international level and entered into obligations to protect women’s rights. As a signatory to the African Charter on People and Human’s Rights, Botswana is under obligation to ensure that everyone is equal under the law and to eliminate all forms of discrimination against women. In 1996 the government of Botswana signed and ratified the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) which protects women’s rights and condemns all forms of discrimination against women.

Botswana has adopted CEDAW, national policy on women in development, the national gender framework, and most recently signed the SADC gender protocol after years of refusing to sign. Although Botswana may have expressed her commitment to gender through conventions and legal frameworks challenges are abound. The government of Botswana has not regularly reported on regional and international commitments, the government submitted a report to CEDAW for the first time in 2010 (BOCONGO, 2015). It is unlikely that the number of women in political decision making will increase, the country doesn’t use legislated quotas, in addition the electoral system in place, first past the post, is not favourable for women. The country will go to the polls in October 2019 with less than 10 women standing for parliamentary positions in the elections across political parties. Out of the five women who are current members of parliament only one will contest for re-election, two will not be standing for re-election while the other two
who were specially nominated will not contest either. Out of the 57 constituencies the ruling Botswana Democratic Party has only fielded about 4 women parliamentary candidates.

The country is a signatory to many other international declarations on gender equality and empowerment including International Conference on Population and Development (ICDP) 1994; Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action 1995; Millennium Development Goals; among others. International law tends to make the state the primary vehicle for women’s rights reform, this creates problems for women further excluding them (Scully, 2010). Indigenous reforms work better than externally influenced reforms which countries may implement to be seen as complying and tick the boxes.

**Law, culture and patriarchy**

Botswana uses a dual legal system which includes use of customary and common law. Both systems have been found to be discriminatory towards women. Through advocacy by women NGOs and through its own efforts the government has reviewed and repealed some discriminatory laws. In 1997 the government carried out a review of laws deemed discriminatory towards women. The following were reviewed; the marriage act (CAP 29:01); the married persons Property Act 8 CAP 29:03), The Abortion: penal code amendment (CAP 08:01) The Deeds Registry Act CAP 33:03) The Administration of Estates Act CAP 31:01) The Employment Act (CAP 47:01) The Matrimonial Clause Act (CAP 29:06) The Adoption Act (CAP28:01) the Abolition of Marital Power Act (2004).

Although some changes have been made the law in Botswana favours men than women and women are often found to endure most discrimination (Kalabamu, 2006). Chiepe, Roy, Khama, & Merafhe (2016) claim that a majority of people in Botswana live a traditional lifestyle, this promotes the value of customary law. The enforcement of customary law inhibits gender equality and reinforces traditional order (Chiepe et al., 2016). The fact that Botswana has integrated its traditional system of governance into its modern system shows the sentimental value that the country attaches to culture. Some cultural practices permeate modern societies. However, culture marginalizes women.

Rights are not always freely given sometimes they ought to be defended. Gender issues require a radical approach which requires strong advocacy. Batswana are generally conservative, the leaders and society are patriarchal. Gender equality challenges the norm and social structures. Men will not readily give away their privileges and power. Shifting dependence of women from men to the state is not helpful for women. Women must find and determine their own path. Rhode (1994) argues that decisions made by the state mainly reflect a male point of view therefore represent male interests, thus women’s interests cannot be relegated to the state.

Botswana has been identified as a patriarchal society. Patriarchy systematically disadvantages women and perpetuates inequality. Isaacs (2002) argues that patriarchy encourages women to accept a subordinate position in society and to see it as normal. Patriarchy refers to the “autonomy, power and privilege men enjoy over women” (Thoradeniya, 2015, p. 35). Hoffman (1998a, p. 162) defines patriarchy as a system of power which serves the interest of men at the expense of women. According to Isaacs (2002) feminine socialization apparent in patriarchal societies makes women participants in their own subordination. Women have failed to rise above socialization as they remain and continue to perceive themselves as subordinate to men.

In most parts of the world women are treated as social actors experiencing common oppressions therefore addressed as a group. Botswana has fallen short of this group rights approach in addressing women issues taking inclination towards the individual rights approach. Tripp (2010) argues that many of the countries with the largest gap in political equality between genders tend to be those that treat women’s rights through
a liberal individual rights approach. This provides a possible explanation for Botswana’s reluctance to adopt gender quotas and consequently poor female representation. Without the use of quotas it is unlikely that there will be change in the representation of women.

**A strong and meritorious bureaucracy**

States efforts towards development are discharged through bureaucracies therefore an assessment of the bureaucracy gives an indication of the capability of the state. Botswana has been characterized by a powerful and dominant bureaucracy. The bureaucracy has been identified as a strong actor in the country’s public policy processes. Botswana’s bureaucracy has also been considered professional and meritorious. According to Mosime and Kaboyakgosi (2017) the public administration machinery is considered amongst the most professional in Africa. Public policy in Botswana has largely been a domain of bureaucrats and members of parliament, with limited intervention and influence from civil society. Civil society in Botswana has failed to influence public policy and exert pressure on the state (Carbone, 2005). Danevard (1993) states that while the bureaucracy is strong, dominant politicians have a way of overriding them where they feel it is key to do so. He further argues that harmonious relations between politicians and bureaucrats may be due to the fact that the two have similar economic interests and that most senior politicians would have likely served as bureaucrats before. Although the level of dominance by the bureaucracy may have declined over the years the bureaucracy still has a strong stance over public policy. Galligan (2006, p. 321) argues that “in countries where decision making is largely concentrated in a strong central state with a powerful bureaucracy, change is lasting when brought about through legal reform”. This suggest legal reforms may be a viable response for Botswana.

The limitations of bureaucracies cannot be overlooked. The timidity of bureaucracy means it lacks flexibility to respond to changing gender needs. Women’s policy agencies are state agencies established to improve the status of women. The state led instrument has been found lacking in most areas particularly because women issues require strong advocacy. For example, issues like abortion, prostitution, marital rape, equal political representation and economic empowerment among others require strong advocacy as they challenge the norm. However, an advantage to it has been the trait to possibly “influence the agenda and to further feminist goals through public policies from inside the state apparatus” (Lovenduski 2008:174).

**An effective and strong state**

The Botswana government is effective (Robinson & Parsons, 2006) and has a meritorious bureaucracy (Sebudubudu & Mooketsane, 2016) these attributes have served the country and its citizens well. However, Thorandeniya (2015) argues that with improved living conditions and development indicators people become mere beneficiaries of the welfare state and in the process make the state a patriarchal welfare state. This description is not far from what we see in Botswana, where the state provides well and the citizens have become passive and complacent recipients.

Botswana has been defined as a strong and capable state (Danevard, 1993; Tsie, 2017). The strength of Botswana’s state is apparently drawn from an ineffective legislature and opposition, weak civil society and an effective bureaucracy (Danevard, 1993; Sebudubudu & Osei-Hwedie, 2006). The state remains dominant over all other actors in society. Parliament in Botswana has failed to represent the interests of constituents while opposition has not provided a viable alternative or adequately held the government of the day accountable. A weak parliament and ineffective civil society means limited checks and balances, weak oversight and accountability thus further broods state dominance. This therefore creates a challenge for interests that are not of the state. If gender equality is not a key priority for the state and the civil society and parliament are weak, some important issue will barely reach the agenda as is the case with the representation of women in political decision making.
Botswana’s development, economic growth and performance has been exceptional and impressive, especially so in comparison to her peers. However, recent developments suggest a decline in ratings and good governance. Soest (2009) terms Botswana as a “stagnating miracle”. However, Botswana remains above average in terms of development and governance. According to Tsie (2017) Botswana has over the years proved to qualify as a developmental state, exhibiting Leftwhich’s (1995:405) characteristic of a determined and developmental elite, relative autonomy, a powerful competent and insulated bureaucracy, weak and subordinate civil society, effective management of non-state economic interests and legitimacy and performance. Botswana has as a state centric society with the state is dominating almost all aspects of the economy and social life. The state dominates and imposes authority over citizens. Stetsdon and Mzur (1995) argue that state centric societies allow the state to play a stronger role in narrowing the gender gap in the society, usually by enhancing women’s socio economic status as the state has great authority and power. The Botswana state has a great leverage and opportunity in addressing women’s issues compared to any other force in the country given its strength over other actors.

The capability of the state in Botswana has reduced incentives for questioning the state; the prevalent none-questioning culture aggravates the situation thus creating a monstrous state and a weakly and dependent citizenry. This also implies that the state is left to address the societal problems with no or minimal input from other actors including the public. The non-questioning culture stifles civil society as its objective really is to question the state in pursuit of accountability and the protection of civic interest. Such a culture also has a negative impact on the relationship between the state and its citizens making it a traditional parent child type of relationship where one instructs and the other obeys.

The society expects a lot from the state and has become dependent on it. The private sector is relatively weak. Despite governments efforts to diversify the economy the private sector remains underdeveloped. The Botswana government has deliberately taken a decision to direct the economy (Bothlale, 2017). Thus the government has overt control over the private sector. Due to the small population and limited market, private organizations thrive through doing business with government.

Critical of critics

Carbone (2005) argues that the government of Botswana is notorious for threatening those that criticize it. Perhaps this emanates from a culture of none questioning, making the state abhor external criticism. Maundeni (2004) argues that the Setswana culture is critical of external criticism but rather promotes open discussions in each other’s presence. Some examples of cases which suggest a negative attitude towards criticism include; the declaration of Professor Good as a prohibited immigrant, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government, the dismissal of a popular journalist Reginald Richardson known for criticizing the government. The Botswana state has a great leverage and opportunity in addressing women’s issues compared to any other force in the country given its strength over other actors.

A weak civil society

One of the key challenges confronting Botswana’s civil society is lack of funding. The exit of donors upon Botswana being declared a middle income country further weakened civil society as it meant limited access to funds and ultimately dependence on government for funding. This set the nongovernmental organizations for co-optation or denial of support if their work is not in accordance with the desires of government.

The women’s movement
Admittedly Botswana had a strong women’s movement in the 90s which influenced and witnessed legal reform and civic engagement. The movement, led by Emang Basadi registered various victories, among others winning the citizenship case, supporting women in politics and issuing the first women’s manifesto in Africa (Bauer 2011). Bauer (2011, p. 29) describes the victories as “numerous and significant”. This description appears fit considering the following legal reforms which came as a result; the 2004 abolition of the marital power act, the 1998 penal code (amendment) act 1996 employment (amendment) act. Emang Basadi received credit for an increase in the number of women in parliament following their training and support for female electoral candidates in 1999 and thus broadening democracy.

Despite having been a force to reckon with at a time in memorial the women’s movement has been noted as [perpetually] diminishing (Bauer, 2010). Bauer (2011) cites the following as reasons for the decline of the movement; “the accomplishment of many of the women’s movements early goals, challenges facing civil society in general in Botswana [such as lack of funding due to the exit of donors], an increasing ambivalence within a powerful executive towards a women’s rights agenda and a constitution that is essentially neutral (rather than egalitarian) in terms of gender difference.

**Conclusion**

Factors discussed in the paper indicate that the state has not fully prioritized gender equality in political representation. Although the establishment of the Gender Affairs Department, the renaming of the Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs and the signing of international gender conventions are all positive indications, they are not adequate without political will. The lack of political will, the political system, culture, weak and almost absent women’s movement among other factors culminate into poor representation of women in parliament. The state in its ambivalence towards gender equality in representation renders Botswana’s democracy a democracy for men and in its antagonism plays foe towards women.

The state is dominant and capable therefore it seems realistic to expect the state to represent the women’s interests. On the contrary, McBride and Mazur (2010) and Stetson and Mazur (2010) argue that in a state centric society the state has power and plays a stronger role in narrowing the gender gap in society. Given the dominance of the state in Botswana, the paper suggests that feminist issues will only be a policy priority when the state decides to pursue that agenda. This means the importance of feminist agenda is therefore determined by the state. So far, women empowerment as is the case in Botswana has been left a responsibility of the state, unless the women’s movement rises again it is unlikely that the situation of poor representation of women will change. It is apparent that there is no political will to pursue equal representation in political decision making.

**Bibliography**


Bauer, G. (2010). Cows will lead the head into precipice: Where are the women MPs in Botswana. *Botswana Notes and Records, 42*, 56–70.


Scully, P. F. (2010). Should we give up on the State? Feminist theory, African gender history and transitional justice*.* https://doi.org/10.4314/ajcr.v9i2.52171


Leveraging Public Private Partnerships for Infrastructure Development in Uganda

Vincent Operemo & Tasha Balunywa

Department of Strategic Planning, National Planning Authority
Corresponding E-mail: voperemo@npa.go.ug or tasha.balunywa@npa.go.ug

Abstract
Public-private partnerships (PPPs), continue to emerge as a potential spring for infrastructure investment in developing countries. In Uganda, the quest to address the infrastructure gap has resulted to the pursuit of an expansive fiscal policy to the extent that about 6% of GDP (US$ 1 billion) is spent annually on infrastructure. However, despite infrastructure investment prioritization in national budget, infrastructure gaps still exist. This article reviewed Uganda infrastructure investments with particular focus PPP funded projects to ascertain the effectiveness of their contribution to closing the infrastructure gap. It was established that a number of projects particularly in construction of roads, bridges and dams are already being implemented through PPPs. Several of these projects are behind schedule. Lengthy procurement processes, limited public awareness about PPPs, inadequate disclosure and transparency in PPPs, weak policy, institutional and regulatory frameworks and high infrastructure financing deficit affected the efforts to close the gaps. In addition, infrastructure is the main driver of public debt and Uganda’s infrastructure services costs are highest in East Africa. To improve performance of PPP projects, there is need for adequate preparation, instituting an effective institutional and regulatory framework, allocation of appropriate resources, incorporation of the principles of transparency and accountability into PPPs programs and building a robust PPP pipeline.

Key Words: Infrastructure Gaps, Policy Frameworks, Contractual Processes, Public Private Partnerships

Introduction
All around the world, public infrastructure services needs are fast outpacing the resources for providing them. Hulme (2015), noted that globally 22% of the population lack basic infrastructure including among others transport, safe drinking water, shelter, sanitation facilities and housing. A report by the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA, 2017) noted that about 400 million people in sub-Saharan Africa lack basic infrastructure. Uganda’s 1st National Development Plan (NDPI 2010/11 – 2014/15), noted that inadequate physical infrastructure constrains production in many sectors of the economy. For instance, transport costs remain a significant trade barrier, equivalent to effective protection of over 20% and imposes an implicit tax on exports of over 25% and up to 50% on air freight (NDP1, pg 30). As a result, the cost of doing business in Uganda is high, undermining economic competitiveness. In addition, Uganda electricity consumption per capita is one of the lowest in the world. The consumption per capita is 100 kWh/capita compared to Malaysia about 3,668 kWh/capita, Korea at about 8,502 kWh/capita. It compares poorly even with its peers like Kenya at 152 kWh/capita and Ghana at 253 kWh/capita.

Infrastructural investments are therefore seen as one of the best means for poverty reduction and societal transformation (Uganda Vision 2040 pg 4). Evidence has indicated that lack of mobility is significantly linked to social disadvantages which lead to increased poverty (Ohnmacht et al. 2009, Lucas, 2012). To reduce poverty, it is essential that investments towards transportation, housing and social infrastructure are increased (Uganda Vision 2040). The realization of the envisaged transformation goal will depend on the country’s capacity to strengthen the fundamentals particularly infrastructure (Uganda Vision 2040 pg 4). In order to manifest these aspirations, the Government has expressed its intention of implementing a number of ambitious infrastructure projects, particularly in the energy and transport sectors, but also to support the social sectors through improving water, education, and health infrastructure.
Consequently, infrastructural investment is at the core of policy discussions nationally and globally. The UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) state the need to: “build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation”, (UN 2015, SDG 9), Goal 10 of the Africa Agenda 2063 states the need to ensure that world class infrastructure crisscrosses Africa. The two agenda also note the need to encourage and promote effective PPPs while building on the experience and resourcing strategies of partnerships. In addition, development banks have been considering adjustments to their business models to give more attention to regional infrastructure PPPs. The BRICS countries, at their summit in Durban in March 2013, announced plans to create a new development bank (now known as the New Development Bank) that would focus on infrastructure, the African Development Bank (AfDB) in July 2013, announce the need to create a billion-dollar preparation and financing facility for large infrastructure projects in Africa, referred to as Africa50. The institution's purpose “is to unlock private financing sources... and to accelerate the speed of infrastructure delivery in Africa,” (AfDB 2013).

Uganda’s pursuit of an expansive fiscal policy aimed at addressing the infrastructure gap is therefore in line with the provisions of the SDGs, Africa Agenda 2063 and Uganda Vision 2040. As such, by 2012, Uganda was already spending approximately US$ 1 billion each year, an amount equivalent to 6% of GDP, on infrastructure. Between 2013 and 2016, the value of Uganda’s expenditure on infrastructure increased rapidly, with the Government endeavoring to remove binding constraints on growth and to prepare for the production of oil. In FY 2017/18, total expenditure on infrastructure stood at about 7% of GDP. However, over these years together, the equivalent value of spending on infrastructure is expected to reach US$ 13 billion. While this expenditure is significant, it is still below the level required to close the infrastructure gap. It has recently been estimated that the annual infrastructure funding gap amounts to a value of around US$ 0.4 billion a year.

To attain the NDP II target average GDP growth rate of 5.9% by end of NDP II (2019/2020), Uganda will need to register 8.4% annual GDP growth rates over the remaining Plan period, which is ambitious given that a number of prioritized infrastructure projects to drive growth - like the standard gauge railway project - have progressed at a very slow rate, while productivity of the agricultural sector and the manufacturing sector have not gained sufficient traction to deliver the anticipated growth.

However, although the infrastructure sector that comprises works, transport, energy and ICT, continues to receive highest allocations from the national budget, the infrastructure gaps remain. The objective of this study was to review the progress of the current PPPs in Uganda in comparison to the targets provided in the NDPII and the Uganda Vision 2040 and thereafter provide proposals for leveraging PPPs as a means of closing Uganda’s infrastructure gap.

**Methodology**

To achieve the objective of this study, a triangulated approach involving document analysis to glean empirical evidence was employed. Data generated from document analysis was subjected to a content review to derive a summary report guided by the subject in question. It also involved a review of the key PPP and infrastructural parameters across the East Africa, sub-Saharan African and the rest of the world for compatibility. A three-step approach was implemented to conduct the integrative literature review. First, keywords relevant to the study such as public-private partnership, PPPs in conjunction with, infrastructure, infrastructure investments, infrastructure in sub-Saharan Africa, infrastructure investment in Uganda, procurement etc. Reports by the World Bank, African Development Bank, UNECA, Government of
Uganda Annual Performance Reports, various statistical abstracts, and Google Scholar were used as secondary sources to provide an expanded view of infrastructure PPPs. Next, the amassed articles were inspected to identify those suitable to the study. Lastly, all articles relevant to the study were reviewed and synthesized to extract key information that informed the pertinent to the study.

Literature Review

The Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) defines a PPP as an agreement between the government and one or more private partners (which may include the operators and the financiers). Within the agreement, the private partners deliver the service so that the service delivery objectives of the government are aligned with the profit objectives of the private partners. Furthermore, the effectiveness of the alignment depends on a sufficient transfer of risk to the private partners.

According to the International Monetary Fund, PPPs refer to arrangements in which the private sector supplies infrastructure assets and services that traditionally have been provided by the government. In addition to private execution and financing of public investment, PPPs have two other important characteristics: an emphasis on service provision and investment by the private sector. In this way, significant risk is transferred from the government to the private sector. Standard & Poor’s definition of a PPP is any medium to long-term relationship between the public and private sectors involving the sharing of risks and rewards of multi-sector skills, expertise and finance to deliver desired policy outcomes.

The broad definition of a PPP assumes that there are significant risks and responsibilities borne by the private agent under a long-term relationship. This does not necessarily imply that the private agent will finance part or all of the works when the PPP relates to infrastructure development (infrastructure PPPs). Rather, it assumes that construction/development and management (maintenance and operations) are bundled together. It also assumes that there is a contract acting as the legal instrument that contains the obligations and rights of both parties. It is intended to cover not only the procurement of new or upgraded infrastructure, but also the procurement of infrastructure management services for assets already financed and built, and even services in the narrow sense of the word (that is, public services, such as utilities, transportation of passengers, water supply to homes, and so on, which may be called service PPPs).

The main argument for PPPs is that they can lead to efficiency gains and one channel for this is by improving labor productivity i.e. an increase in the amount of goods and services produced by one hour of labor. Bernadine J. Dykes and Carla D. Jones (2016) described PPPs as cooperative arrangements between governments and multinational corporations that are created to finance, construct and manage infrastructural projects. They argue that over the past two decades Africa’s involvement in PPPs has been limited relative to other continents, but that lately, due to pressures on national budgets and the inability of the public sector to provide efficient services, African governments are looking harder for infrastructure development cash to support population growth and the demand for commodities.

Other scholars like Broadbent, Gill and Laughlin (2003); Akintoye et al (2003) and Prud’homme (2004) view PPPs from a broader perspective that goes beyond the shortcomings of public finance. They argue that PPP initiatives help combine the strengths of both the government and the private sector leading to a more effective facilitation of infrastructure projects than traditional approaches. The government is perceived to possess strong politico-legal position, good credit rating and low risk perception while the private sector may provide cost efficiency, time efficiency and flexibility in infrastructure development.

207
The description of Akintoye et al (2003, p.463) of the rationale of PPPs as “the combination of the resources of the public and private sectors, in the quest for more efficient service provision” best captures the postulations of this school of thought. In a nutshell, this approach views the use of PPPs as a symbiotic relationship between the private and public sectors that help governments meet infrastructure provision objectives while helping the private sector achieve profitability.

Generally, infrastructural expenditure consumes a reasonable fraction of a country’s gross domestic product (GDP). For instance, the US spent $416 billion (2.4% of GDP) on infrastructure in 2014 while Australia and China on average spend about 5% and 9% of its GDP on infrastructure development (McKinsey Global Institute, 2016). This expenditure denotes the critical role infrastructure plays in most developed countries. In order to improve global competitiveness and economic performance, governments in emerging economies and developing countries have increased funding for infrastructural projects (Allport, 2008). In addition to government spending, a significant amount of resources has been committed towards transportation infrastructure development from various sources. For instance, as at 2016, the World Bank Group, through the International Development Association (IDA) and International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) had over 209 active projects totaling $4.2 billion (World Bank 2017). These projects are funded with a mixture of funds from private investors and the government.

A number of projects in Uganda are already being implemented through partnerships particularly in infrastructure with the construction of roads, bridges and dams being the most common (NDPII Mid-term Review, 2019). There are also partnerships in power generation, renewable energy, health, telecommunications and education. Examples of PPPs at work in Uganda include Bujagali power dams; Kalangala Infrastructure Services Project; Indeed, the private sector has actively contributed to Africa’s economic development. Given the budgetary constraints facing several African governments attention is increasingly turning to public-private partnerships (PPPs) to bridge the financing gap. Foreign investments supported by collaborative co-financing with development finance institutions offer the prospect of necessary capital to finance industries, build infrastructure, provide social amenities and create jobs (World Bank, 2015). Examples of flagship PPP projects in Africa include: the Henri Konan Bédié Bridge in Côte d’Ivoire, the Lake Turkana Wind Power Project in Kenya, Senegal’s Dakar-Diamniadio Road, power and water projects in Ghana, Nigeria and Rwanda and the Tanger-Med port project in Morocco, among others.

The 2018 report by the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA) noted that Africa’s infrastructure has the potential to promote economic growth and lift people out of poverty. There is evidence that, between 2005 and 2015, total official international support for infrastructure (millions of constant $) increased by 52% in 28 countries while it decreased in all other countries. Morocco saw an increment of 68.3%, and Somalia had the highest increment of 99.8%, while Swaziland saw the greatest drop from US$40 to US$12.4 million. If Africa is left alone, it will face a funding gap of between 10% and 15% of GDP for selected areas in Education, health, water, energy, and road infrastructure.

The Africa SDG Report (2018) notes that Africa ranks poorly in globally competitiveness due to inadequacy in quality and quantity as well as access to infrastructure. Good governance is a challenge, fragility is pronounced, and peace is, in parts, out of reach. Achieving the target of “universal and equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water for all” will require significant investment in infrastructure. Currently, nearly 40% of African countries currently provide basic drinking services to less two thirds of their people. The infrastructure gap remains large (in terms of quantity, quality and access), and the need for effective
public investment in and management of infrastructure projects remains pronounced (Calderon, Cantu, & Chuhun-Pole, 2018). With limited supply of infrastructure services, associated inefficiencies translate into higher transport service costs – and these related costs are higher in Africa than in other developing regions (African Development Bank Group, 2018).

However, despite the contribution of PPPs in infrastructure delivery, the challenges associated with PPP projects in developing countries cannot be ignored. This view was supported in Ernst and Young (EY), 2015), in which it was stated that despite increasing recognition of the role of PPP as a mechanism to bridge the infrastructure gap in light of fiscal constraints, in Africa and other developing economies, LW remains constrained by limited financial markets, inadequate legal and regulatory frameworks, an absence of technical skills within government agencies, and political and national risks (Ernst and Young (EY), 2015). In Zambia, for instance, the efficacy of adopting PPPs is marred with the legal red tapes inherent in the PPP Act of 2009, which does not favourably provide a policy framework for risk transfer, delineation of responsibilities and dispute resolution among parties (Ngoma et al., 2014).

Ineffective and inefficient institutional and legal framework poses a challenge to successful adoption and implementation of PPPs (NDPII Mid-Term Review, 2019). Such challenges as poor transparency in concessionaire selection, lack of knowledge of and experience in PPP legislation and concession agreements, poor project preparation and lack of bankable studies, poor allocation of risks and management, poor procurement procedures and processes management are thus evident in PPP arrangements (Mudi et al., 2015).

According to Ernst and Young (2015) Governments’ demonstrable commitment to the PPP model through consistent and transparent legislative and institutional frameworks can lower the risks that can reduce investor confidence and deter participation. This argument is in consonance with Zhang & Ali Soomro (2015) who noted that contractual issues are less likely to cause failures given that as a formal way of governance, contractual issues tend to be transparent to outsiders i.e. regulators, judges, and arbitrators and as such governance issues in this group are less likely to be undermined and ultimately lead to failures. Even though some contract arrangements appear to be inappropriate, such as transferring too much risk to the private sector, the contracting parties can correct mistakes through ex-post renegotiations.

Zhang (2005), noted the importance of managerial issues in the success of PPP frameworks. This is because managerial issues have been highly emphasized in building successful PPPs (Zhang, 2005), and less likely to be undermined and consequently lead to failures (Zhang and Ali Soomro, 2015). Moreover, institutional and organizational issues frequently influence managerial issues because managerial issues should follow PPP laws, regulations, and managers’ leadership (Panayides et al., 2015).

A significant number of developing countries (approximately 140) are increasingly exploring increasing private participation in infrastructural development albeit with limited success in closing infrastructure gaps (World Bank, 2017). However, despite having PPP policy frameworks in place, Uganda has struggled in the implementation of PPP projects (World Bank, 2017). On average, 36% of the planned expenditure over this period did not materialize, with the bulk of the recorded under expenditure being in the priority sectors of energy and transport. Challenges to the execution of budgets are exacerbated by overall inefficiencies in the investment process, significantly eroding the value of these investments, and hence reducing the overall
value for money. It has been estimated that up to US$300 million is lost annually due to inefficiencies in spending.

A report on Uganda by World Bank (2017), noted that closing Uganda’s infrastructure gap relative to the best performers in the world could increase the GDP growth rate per capita by 2.6% annually. The largest potential growth benefits would come from closing the gap in electricity-generating capacity. However, even as PPPs continue to change the face of Africa through mega projects, experts are urging African governments to be careful and learn from failed PPPs when signing on to new partnerships.

The UN 2030 Agenda considers private sector initiatives to be central to solving sustainable development challenges. More than a third of financing for SDGs is expected to come from the private sector. However, private sector financing for development in Africa remains low. For example, private sector financing for infrastructure represents 4% of the funding portfolio (African Development Bank Group, 2018). The private sector’s new commitments for African infrastructure projects in 2015 totaled US$7.4 billion – just 8.9% of the total funding mix (ICA, 2018).

The use of Public Private Partnerships has declined in the last couples of years; there are fewer PPP projects by number in African countries than in other developing nations. However, Africa had the largest amount of PPP projects by share of GDP estimated at 1.4% of GDP in 2000-2016. The share of PPP projects that are challenged or marred by capacity and implementation problems is estimated at 0.75% of GDP or about 50% of the projects (IMF, 2016). This is attributed to weak laws, institutions, and regulatory environments, and the associated capacity to negotiate decent contracts (AfDB Group, 2018).

Total investment (including private) has been on a downward spiral since 2015, falling to under US$500 billion. In part, this reflects the drop in gross savings as a share of GDP, from 18% in 2010 for Africa to 16% in 2017 (International Monetary Fund, 2018). The savings investment gap is largely financed by Foreign Direct Investment (FDI). Additionally, in the long run, the widespread limitations of financial development constraints domestic investment. African financial markets, financial institutions and financial depth (domestic private sector credit to GDP) all remain weak compared to other developing regions (IMF, 2016). The median ratio of private sector credit to GDP in sub-Saharan Africa stood at 21%, comparing unfavorably with 40% in the rest of the developing world. The banking sector assets to GDP ratio is also less than half that of other developing regions.

A review of the PPP literature by De Schepper, Haeqendonck, and Dooms (2015), noted agreement among practitioners and academics that PPP preparation costs are higher than preparation costs associated with traditional public procurement. In many cases, these costs are so high that they discourage potential bidders from competing for projects, and in some cases undermine the basic cost-effectiveness rationale of PPPs and negatively impact on the economic and financial viability of projects. De Schepper's study of 172 public infrastructure projects in Belgium found much longer and more complex bidding processes associated with PPPs than with projects procured via traditional public methods. Most published work has focused on transaction costs, usually synonymous with downstream transaction costs, and mostly procurement-related costs incurred by governments or their MDB partners. For instance, AfDB (2013) estimated that their preparation costs for large infrastructure projects in Africa can reach 10 to 15 percent of project capital costs.
Findings
Public–private partnerships possess the potential to help Uganda raise the money it needs to fund investment in its infrastructure (World Bank, 2017). Traditionally, government of Uganda has been the main provider of public infrastructure and other public goods. Budgetary constraints, however, have made alternative options for financing necessary to supplement government resources. And, in this, experience shows that the private sector can successfully finance and manage investment in public infrastructure efficiently and profitably to supplement government-led public spending.

High infrastructure financing deficit: NDPI noted inadequacy of physical infrastructure as one of the most binding constraints to Uganda’s economic growth. The current financing gap is about US$1.4 billion a year for infrastructure investment. In FY 2017/18, total expenditure on infrastructure was anticipated to reach the value above 7% of GDP, yet is still below the level required to close the infrastructure gap. The gaps have also been exacerbated by inefficiencies in resource management resulting to leakages of about 30% or US$300 million a year. Although communication infrastructure has improved significantly following liberalization of the sector that has attracted substantial private sector investments, the limited coverage, cost of access and usage as well as limited diversity of communication mediums are still major constraints. The internet infrastructure is still limited with most concentration in the capital, Kampala and the price of the internet in Uganda is still very high for everyday users at $14 cents per minute compared to Malaysia at $0.155 cents per minute. Infrastructural funding deficits cut across Africa. Brookings (2015) noted that the financing gap is a recurring theme when it comes to African infrastructure standing at $93 billion per year.

Uganda’s infrastructure services cost is highest in East Africa: The unit cost per kilometer on average in Uganda costs between $750,000 and $1m (UGX2.5b to UGX3.5b) while the same in Kenya goes for $300,000 (approximately UGX1b) and $330,000 (UGX1.1b) in Rwanda, a country with a mountainous terrain. The costs of transport per ton-kilometer, from Mombasa, average prices are set at 4 cents per ton-kilometer for Kenya, 8.5 for Uganda, 9 for Rwanda (Oyer 2007). Domestic electricity consumers in Uganda are now burdened with a tariff of 18.5 US cents for 2015, compared to an average in Sub-Saharan African countries of just 13 US cents. In addition, from 2005 to 2012 the Ugandan government was forced to subsidize energy costs to the tune of more than $100m each year.

In line with the above, the OECD (2008) indicated that high costs associated with PPPs arise mainly from PPP project preparation especially when compared with the costs of traditional public procurement. Preparation costs include the legal, financial, and technical costs incurred by both public and private sector actors in developing a PPP for commercial operation, and so include transaction costs like long procurement processes and contract negotiation.

Slow implementation of infrastructure projects: although GoU commitment to accelerate spending on infrastructure projects has been realized to some extent and most of the NDPII priority projects are being implemented a good number of them remain behind schedule. For instance, the Hoima Oil Refinery, oil pipeline, the Standard Gauge Railway and the Ayago hydro power plant (600MW) are significantly behind schedule. Slow project implementation was carried forward from NDPI, leading to slower economic growth (NPA, 2019). This has been attributed to lengthy procurement processes for instance the procurement process for a road construction project can take up to two years, inability to adequately budget for government counterpart funding, leading to delays in implementation, weak management and supervision.
of projects, and weak project preparation before inclusion in the national development plan. GoU has initiated a number of projects to improve the competitiveness of the Economy. Many infrastructure projects including roads, the Standard Gauge Railway, airport expansion, energy and ICT projects, as well education and health infrastructure projects - were supposed to be prioritized under NDP II, but implementation of many of the projects has been slow. Uganda competitiveness ranking has continued to be dismal (96/167 countries). This suggests that the quality of Uganda’s trade and transport infrastructure is still poor and quite below average, and therefore needs further improvements of trade and transport infrastructure, including railway, roads, Warehousing and trans-loading and information technology to enhance the efficiency of logistics industry. However, once these projects are completed, Uganda’s rankings are expected to improve.

**Infrastructure is the main driver of public debt:** The buildup in public debt has been in an effort to achieve the government’s objective of reducing the infrastructure gap in order to reduce costs and improve Uganda’s competitiveness, thereby enabling higher and more sustainable growth over the medium to long term. This phenomenon is similar to that in other African countries where the fiscal deficits in government budgets are associated with expansionary fiscal allocations to address the large infrastructure gap estimated at US$130–US$170 billion a year, with a financing gap remaining in the range of US$67.6–US$107.5 billion (African Development Bank, 2018). As a result, the rapid depreciation of the domestic currencies against major trading currencies in 2015 (associated in part with the reduction in commodity prices) raised foreign currency liabilities for most African countries (IMF, 2016). A third of the countries in sub-Saharan Africa have tax revenues of just 13% of their GDP; the fiscal space has narrowed further since 2015, and 50% of countries are assessed to have pronounced risk, with debt amounting to over 50% of GDP.

For Uganda’s case, whereas the public debt-to-GDP ratio is still below the benchmark level of 56% associated with heightened public debt vulnerabilities for medium performers and the EAC monetary Union protocol, the risk of debt stress is high, given that a number of priority infrastructure projects like the standard gauge railway, oil refinery and oil pipeline are yet to be fully implemented and hence will require substantially more debt financing.

**Strong growth of Information and Communications Sector:** The annual GDP growth from ICT sector activities stood at an average of 14.4% between 2015 – 2017 up from 14.1% between 2010 and 2014. This is attributed to Government efforts to increase access to telephone, internet and development of ICT tools for delivery of goods and services across a wide range of sectors. The laying of the backbone ICT infrastructure has slightly reduced the cost of the internet and continues to increase production and productivity of ICT based production and delivery of services. This is agreement with Estache and Philippe (2012), who concluded that sectors like telecommunications and electricity generation in which cost-reflective tariffs seem less controversial have proven to be reasonably profitable and largely free of subsidies. But most other sectors such as electricity distribution and transmission, transport, and water and sanitation, often require subsidies to sustain cash flows or bring the rate of return close to the cost of capital.

**Low PPP uptake:** compared with other developing economies like South Africa, India, Malaysia, Kenya etc. According to the World Bank database on PPPs, a total of 28 Ugandan PPP projects with a total investment commitment of US$1.9 billion reached financial closure between 1990 and 2017. (The World Bank Group). Most of the projects are in the energy sector and were operationalized prior to the enactment of the PPP Act in 2015. Since then, several projects have been submitted for inclusion in the PPP project pipeline currently under development by the PPP Unit covering various sectors mainly transport, energy,
water, education and health. The energy sector is the most successful PPP. this has been demonstrated by
the improvement in energy distribution efficiencies that resulted to the increase in collection of sales
revenue from 65% in March 2017 to 98% in June 2017. Access to power has also increased. But, despite
its success, it has been tainted by operational and governance problems. A parliamentary assessment found
irregularities and manipulation in the procurement of the concession, and the power distribution agreement
had to be revised to minimize costs to the government.

**Weak Policy, Institutional and Regulatory frameworks:** World Bank (2017) noted that the success of
PPPs depends on the state’s ability to establish a framework with laws, systems, processes, and contracts
that promote financially viable PPPs, especially where there are natural monopolies or market failures.
Delmon (2015), argued that, for PPP to be a viable procurement option, a strong political will is required.
Uganda has instituted legal and regulatory reforms, including the PPP Policy Framework (in 2010), and the
PPP Act (approved in 2015) and the PPP Regulations (2019) to operationalize the Act. The PPP Unit was
also established to serve as a secretariat and technical arm of the PPP Committee but still in its fairly
incapacitated. The capacity of contracting authorities to prepare and implement PPPs is also low.

**Inadequate disclosure and transparency in PPPs.** Although progress has been made in implementing the
reforms, their enforcement is still lacking. The lack of effective and independent enforcement and appellate
mechanisms, including the absence of sanctions for nondisclosure, has led public institutions to be lax in
complying with the law. For example, although the ATIA requires public bodies to publish proactively an
index of records that they hold, this requirement remains largely unimplemented to date. With regard to
PPPs, private parties are crucial players, as they are the implementers of PPP projects. The lack of disclosure
obligations makes it difficult for citizens to hold them directly accountable, especially with respect to
performance.

**Limited public awareness about PPPs:** Majority of Ugandans are still unaware about PPPs and are
therefore not fully aware of their rights with respect to PPPs. Although Uganda has a vibrant media and
committed civil society organizations, which could help mitigate this limitation, even their understanding
of the PPP process remains limited, and this could be a challenge to how they can help drive the process of
disclosure. It is imperative that the government educates the public and civil society organizations about
the PPP process.

**Recommendations**

As has been indicated in the previous sections, PPPs in Uganda are among other things affected by a weak
policy framework, slow project implementation, inadequate disclosure and transparency and limited public
awareness. To harness the PPP potential for developing Uganda’s infrastructure will require the following:

**Need to adequately prepare for PPP engagements:** adequate preparation is one of the pre-conditions for
successful project implementation. Relevant PPP principles like life cycle cost consideration to improve
decision making regarding major project procurement need to be considered. Application of the PPP
principles will enhance long term integrated financial planning and budget processes required as well as
highlight the significant contingent liabilities that may arise in the process.

**Strengthen the PPP institutional and regulatory framework:** It is crucial for every government to have
legislation and a regulatory framework on PPPs. This will encourage local and foreign investors to enter
into these agreements. Although a legal framework for PPP is already in place through the promulgation of
the PPP Act 2015, it requires strengthening of the corresponding PPP institutions for its implementation. In addition, it would need close the gaps identified, including streamlining the processes with the laws within sectors, such as the Electricity Act and to specifically allow local governments to participate in PPPs.

**Ensure proper resource allocation to PPPs:** Uganda’s PPP program needs to be appropriately resourced to enable it to provide stronger leadership and direction, and for funding project preparation, providing viability support and a liquidity reserve to backstop any contingent liabilities. GoU needs to urgently set up the Project Development Facilitation Fund. This will entail mobilizing budgetary and non-budgetary resources, including from bilateral and multi-lateral donors. Revenue flows from projects, including success fees, can be other sources of revenue for such fund. It will also entail setting up the governance and operational framework for the functioning of the fund.

**Incorporate the principles of transparency and accountability into its PPPs programs.** This will enable active citizen engagement and involvement in decision-making. Key information related to both operational and pipeline projects at various stages of preparation and procurement should be placed in the public domain in a timely manner to increase the predictability of Uganda’s PPP program. Public scrutiny is likely to incentivize government to adopt transparent and accountable processes, consequently stimulating investor interest and stakeholder support for PPP as a modality of asset creation, operation and management, and efficient and effective service delivery.

**Consideration and application of sustainability imperatives:** this should start at the pre-feasibility and options analysis phases and incorporating it across the entire life cycle of the project to deliver optimal results.

**Build capacity through solid training programs for staff involved in PPPs.** This needs to be applied across all levels of government. This has to be complemented with a public outreach campaign. This capacity building program plays an important role in enabling government staff, local governments and the public to understand the rationale for PPPs. Training will enable Government staff to select the appropriate projects for PPP and to implement those projects well. In addition, an awareness campaign should be implemented to ensure that the public understands the value and risks associated with PPP. In addition, it is necessary to strengthen the local financial sector to develop the skills and instruments needed to support PPP.

**References**

African Development Bank Group. 2018. *Africa Infrastructure Development Index (AIDI) – Africa Infrastructure Knowledge Program Portal*

African Development Bank Group. 2018 *Africa Infrastructure Development Index (AIDI) – Africa Infrastructure Knowledge Program Portal.*


Financial inclusion and Local Economic Development in Developing Economies: Evidences from Kampala Capital City Authority, Uganda

Michael Kiwanuka
Uganda Management Institute
Corresponding E-Mail: kiwanuka48@gmail.com

Abstract
Local Economic Development is the rage in many developing countries today. In comparison with the traditional macro-economic policies, Local Economic Development is widely believed to provide a more realistic, integrated and holistic approach to development through creating an enabling developmental environment at the local level. Relatedly, the growing universal belief and agreement is that financial inclusion has a very realistic potential of facilitating Local Economic Development. Ensuring access to timely, affordable, and adequate financial services to all citizens has therefore become a goal of public policy in developing countries. A big proportion of Uganda’s population among the urban communities is engaged in the informal sector characterized by both financial exclusion and high poverty levels in Uganda. Strategies like the Government’s Financial Inclusion and National Financial Inclusion Strategy are intended to help the poor raise their incomes and accumulate savings to better cope with shocks to their incomes, thereby enhancing Local Economic Development in Uganda. Whereas about 15 per cent of Uganda’s population is excluded from the financial systems, there is evidence to suggest that low-income earners and the financially excluded citizens have active financial lives and therefore only need a range of financial services to explore their economic opportunities. The paper presents the proposed study that summarises and synthesizes literature on the link between financial inclusion and local economic development among similar contexts like Uganda. The study will then undertake an empirical analysis on the effects of financial inclusion on some selected dimensions of local economic development in Kampala Capital City Authority, Uganda. By reviewing the research on the link between financial inclusion and local economic development, this study will describe how and where the use of financial services can contribute on realising the sustainable development goals. In conclusion, the study will outline opportunities and mechanisms for businesses and governments at local level to deepen financial inclusion in developing countries.

Key Words: Financial Inclusion, Local Economic Development, Poverty Eradication, Kampala Capital Authority, and Uganda

Introduction
Local economic development is the rage in many developing countries today. In comparison with the traditional macro-economic policies, Local economic development is widely believed to provide a more realistic, integrated and holistic approach to development through creating an enabling developmental environment at the local level (Meyers, 2014; Rogerson, 2009; Rodrigues-Pose, 2001). Relatedly, the growing universal belief and agreement is that financial inclusion has a very realistic potential of facilitating local economic development. Although the resultant level of economic growth to be achieved through financial inclusion is expected to differ between countries and regions, financial inclusion is believed to provide a bridge between the financially excluded members of society and the financial institutions (Voica, 2017). Access to and using a broad range of quality and affordable financial services has a potential to ensure citizens’ financial security and can immensely contribute to a more empowered, participative and responsive citizenry that will reciprocate into sustainable and local economic development. It should not be surprising, therefore, that an expansive body of literature recognizes the relationship between financial inclusion and poverty reduction (Beck et al, 2007; Levine, 1998). As countries endure to eradicate poverty through Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), financial inclusion provides a more realistic and appealing tool of supporting and actualizing this. The overcharging goal of financial inclusion in developing
economies should be to provide financial instruments to people who either had no ideas about them or those who had negative attitudes/suspicion about using such instruments. It is in the same pursuit that ensuring access to timely, affordable, and adequate financial services to all citizens has become a significant phenomenon for policy makers and advocates across the world generally and developing countries in particular.

In Uganda’s context, a big proportion of the population among the urban communities is engaged in the informal sector characterized by both financial exclusion and high poverty levels. The country is also characterized by limited local and community enterprise development due to narrow or absence of local orientations to facilitate wealth creation and real household poverty challenges. At the core of the pursuit for local economic development in Uganda is the realization that Financial Inclusion is critical in ensuring that financial products and services are accessible to all individuals and businesses at affordable costs regardless of the size and net worth respectively. The Government Financial Inclusion (2011) and the National Financial Inclusion Strategy (2017-2022), therefore, are some of the strategies in Uganda designed to help the poor raise their incomes and accumulate savings to better cope with shocks to their incomes, thereby enhancing Local Economic Development (LED) in Uganda. Whereas about 15 per cent of Uganda’s population is excluded from the financial systems, there is evidence to suggest that low-income earners and the financially excluded citizens have active financial lives and therefore only need a range of financial services to explore their economic opportunities.

The study will analyze the effects of financial inclusion on some selected dimensions of local economic development in Kampala Capital City Authority, Uganda. The next sections of the paper present a review of related literature, conceptualizes financial inclusion and local economic development describing their structures and institutional set in Uganda. The paper finally presents and justifies the methods to be used in the study.

Literature Review

Although In a theoretical perspective it has been argued that financial inclusion is a driving forces towards economic growth, it is imperative to state from the onset that literature directly relating financial inclusion to local economic growth and development is neither exhaustive nor conclusive. There is still limited empirical evidences on the role and impact of financial Inclusion on economic growth in terms of individual countries (Omar & Sulong, 2018). Relatedly, most of the available literature is in respect with the developed world other than their developing counterparts. Indeed according to Park and Merrcado (2015) and Omar and Sulong, financial inclusion is still in an infancy stage in the context of developing economies. Be that as it may, using a case by case analysis especially from the developed world, literature provides evidences to suggest that financial inclusion where actualized has promoted sustainable development through various channels. Before wading into a review of the literature, the paper provides conceptualizations of the two concepts-financial inclusion and local economic development.

Financial inclusion describes a process of providing access to financial products to the entire population of a country. Going by that perspective, financial inclusion therefore, refers to a situation where individuals and businesses within an economic/social system have access to useful and affordable financial products and services that meet their needs and that are delivered in a responsible and sustainable manner (Uganda National Financial Inclusion Strategy (NFIS, 2017-2019). Operationally, financial inclusion represents formal financial services like deposit and savings accounts, payment services, loans, and insurance, among
others, that should be readily available to consumers and that they should actively and effectively use to meet their day today specific needs (GPFI 2011; Rakesh, 2006). Financial exclusion in this context describes the lack of access of appropriate affordable, supportive and safe financial products and services by some segments of society.

An inclusive financial system, by implication, is the one that allows an efficient repartition of resources which leads to a reduction of the cost of capital and consequently reducing financial exclusion. This is to the effect that financial inclusion strives to decrease the informal credit providers like money lenders in an economy by enabling access to a greater number of the population to the structured and organized financial system. By implication, financial inclusion is well positioned to address the constraints that normally exclude individuals and groups of people from participating in the financial sector.

Whereas the interest of this paper is on both, financial exclusion can be voluntary or involuntary. Voluntary financial exclusion refers to a condition where particular segment(s) of society or firms within an economy on their own choose not to use the available financial services (Sanya, & Olumide, 2017; World Bank, 2008). This may happen where they either have no need for such services or because of social norms that may be cultural, past experience or spiritual. Involuntary financial exclusion, on the other hand, is mostly a result of insufficient income, high risk profile, discrimination, market imperfections and failure or even ignorance (Cyn –Young & Rogalio, 2015)

It is suffice to state that the overcharging goal of the Financial Inclusion should not only be increasing access to financial services but also empowering users of financial services to make rational decisions in their own and personal finances so as to contribute to local economic development. To this far, Financial inclusion is, therefore, expected to be a catalyst for economic growth and developing, insuring a safe and secure way to access a palette of financial services (Voice, 2017).

Simply defined, LED is an approach for economic development which allows and makes people in their local communities to work together for achieving sustainable economic growth and development thereby bringing economic benefits and improved quality of life for all residents in a particular local area. It is a reflection of a deliberate and participative process in which the local actors (public, business and nongovernmental sector partners) are mobilized and empowered to work together in shaping and sharing their future through creating better conditions for economic growth of their local territories (Canzanelli 2001; Rodriguez & Tijmsstra, 2005; World Bank, 2003). Since it’s the successful private enterprises that create wealth, employment and improved living standards in local communities, LED is about enabling local areas to become more attractive to trade and commerce and other forms of business. This is because the success of a local economy and its attractiveness to private enterprise largely depends on favorable local business conditions to achieve prosperity. Local governments therefore, have a central and significant role to play in creating favorable environments for business success and job creation. It’s because of that that LED ideally should be a partnership between local government, business and community interests. Indeed, according to Seberang (2016) LED offers Local Governments, Business and Civil society together with the local communities the opportunity to work together towards improving their local economy. The focus is not only on enhancing competitiveness and sustainable growth but also ensuring that the resultant economic growth is inclusive. As Seberang put it, “LED encompasses a range of disciplines including physical planning, economics, and marketing. It also incorporates many local government and private sector functions including environmental planning, business development, infrastructure provision, real estate development and finance” (p3). The implication from the commentary above is only to emphasize that LED
strives to position citizens centrally and empower them in their local communities to create their own prosperity and manage conditions for their economic advancement. The presumption is that LED should enable entrepreneurs to pursue trade and commerce opportunities, improve the livelihood of homesteads and that workers should be able to find jobs matching their capacities.

**Financial Inclusion and Local Economic Development**

It is no longer in dispute that financial inclusion facilitates business, wealth creation and overall economic development among communities. Indeed, an expansive body of literature supports the view that well-developed financial systems that deepen financial inclusion within an economy have a significant association with those areas’ economic growth (Rajan & Zingales, 2003; Rakesh, 2006; Voica, 2017). It should be noted from the onset, however, that despite financial inclusion becoming topical on the global policy agenda for supporting economic development, empirical evidences to support the same is still sarcastic and in infancy. Whereas there is limited empirical evidence determining the causal relationship between finance and growth, studies have laid the foundation for financial inclusion and given insights to suggest that various measures of financial development (including assets of the financial intermediaries, liquid liabilities of financial institutions, domestic credit to private sector, stock and bond market capitalization) exhibit valuable information and significant links to economic growth in countries where applied (Bourguignon, 2003; King and Levine, 1993; Levine & Zervos, 1998; White & Anderson, 2001). This is to the effect that economies with strong financial system are witnessing relatively faster and recognizable levels of poverty reduction successes.

**Context Local Economic Development in Uganda**

The SDGs present Uganda with another opportunity of eradicating poverty and facilitating socio-economic development. The 17 SDGs’ integrated approach in the Ugandan context, therefore, means eradicating poverty hand-in-hand with strategies that build economic growth as well as addressing social needs like education, health, social protection and job opportunities. As Uganda embark on implementing and translating the SDGs into public value, it needs to bear in mind that an effective finance system sits centrally as a determining factors for effective implementation of all the goals.

In anticipation and facilitation of the above, the Government of Uganda through the ministry of Local Government promoted a shift from delivery of public goods and services to a relatively more proactive approach entailing mapping and tackling actual household poverty challenges. It was in the same pursuit that in 2006, *Promoting Local Economic Development in order to enhance people’s incomes* was created as a 6th objective of the country’s Decentralization Policy. LED has already been incorporated in the Decentralization Policy Strategic Framework (DPSF) and the Local Government Sector Strategic Plan Strategic Plan 2013-2023(LGSSP), the Uganda Local Development Outlook (2014) and subsequently incorporated and addressed in the Sub-national and rural development within the country’s National Development Plan (2010-2040). The primary aims of LED are threefold including Increasing in business support by encouraging local investment centers; Enhancing growth of the private sector investment in LGs; and Increasing in locally generated revenue in form of direct taxes and Local Government own revenue generating ventures. To guide the same, the Uganda National LED Policy (2014) was formulated to provide a framework for partnerships and promotion of accelerated mobilization and galvanization of social and economic actors to effectively address the economic development challenges in their respective territorial localities. The LED policy was informed by an organized and deliberate analysis of the country’s
national and local economic contexts, the performance of country’s fiscal systems, the status of human development, employment status, labour productivity as well as infrastructural development together with other constraints in Local economies. All the above are intended to create a conducive environment for investment, increased household incomes and higher revenues for Local Governments, which should translate into improved livelihoods for the people.

**Methodology**

This study will be a cross sectional survey of the link between financial inclusion local economic developments in the context of the different dimensions of each concept in Kampala Capital City Authority taking a case analysis of Nakawa Division, Uganda. With the said multi-dimensionality of both concepts in mind, the study will analyze whether and the extent to which there is a relationships between the selected dimensions of financial inclusion and selected dimensions of local economic development in Nakawa Division, Kampala. In this paper, financial inclusion is measured using Agency banking, electronic banking focusing on mobile money, and microfinance. On the other hand, LED will be measured by trade and commerce focusing on small and medium enterprises (SMEs), local artisanly focusing on craftsperson and small local companies making locally quality or distinctive products in small quantities, usually by hand or using traditional methods. The paper will also measure LED using availability (creation) of jobs suiting semi-skilled labour.

The survey population will be generated from Nakawa Division and population categories to observe will include: the division executive members (9) who make LED policies; Technical planning committee (15) that executes the policies/projects/programs; Representatives of business community in Nakawa (100) organized under Kampala City Traders (KACITA); and selected financial services providers in the divison (15) making a study population of 139. The sample size will be 103 determined using Raosoft sample size calculator. The sampling procedures are indicated in the table below

**Table 1: Sample size and Sampling procedures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population Category</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Sample size: Khon Kaen</th>
<th>Sampling Technique</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Division Executives committee</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Convenient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Planning committee</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Simple Random</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Representatives</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>Simple Random</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial services providers</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Purposive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>103</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:**

From the table above, Convenience sampling technique will be deemed the most appropriate to select local political leaders. Given the high levels of mobility of this category, they will be selected as they became available at the time of the study. Purposive sampling technique, on the other hand, will apply in the selection of respondents from the financial institutions. The purposive technique is expected to take care of the varying levels of relevant knowledge, understanding, and experience in that population category.
Data Analysis

The basic layer of analysis will include consideration of the effects of local economic development of two related but different research models: The aggregate model of financial inclusion and disaggregate model of financial inclusion. The aggregate model of financial inclusion is hereby illustrated by a simple linear regression model:

\[ Y_0 = \alpha + \beta_0 X_0 \]

\( Y_0 \) = Dependent variable (selected dimensions of local economic development), including:
- Trade and commerce
- Local artisanship
- Semi-skilled job availability

\( X_0 \) = Independent variable represented by average value of the three different dimensions of financial inclusion

In order to determine the specific links between the individual dimensions of financial inclusion and the selected variables of local economic development, we set up the disaggregate model represented by multiple linear regression model:

\[ Y_j = \alpha + \beta_1 (X_1) + \beta_2 (X_2) + \beta_3 (X_3) \]

\( Y_j \) - same as in the aggregate model;
\( X_j \) - independent variable represented by Agency Banking
\( X_2 \) - independent variable represented by Electronic Financing (mobile money)
\( X_3 \) - independent variable represented by Microfinance

We have developed two working hypotheses that will be used in conducting the empirical research:

H1(0): Application of financial inclusion as the aggregate model does not contribute to increase in the value of [selected indicator of local economic development] and H1(0): \( \beta_0 = 0 \)

H2(0): The model does not include any dimension of financial inclusion which explains [selected indicator of local economic development] and H2(0): \( \beta_1 = \beta_2 = \beta_3 = 0 \)

Once we have collected and classified data from several statistical databases, we shall apply the method of statistical analysis that will allowed us to test the established models and to test the hypotheses. With the aim of testing the working hypotheses, we shall use OLS regression; simple regression in case of the aggregate model of Financial Inclusion and multiple regression in case of the disaggregate model of Financial Inclusion.

References


Meyers, F., D. (2014). Local Economic Development (LED), Challenges and Solutions: The Case of the Northern Free State Region, South Africa


Open Access: Vol 7(4): 356


Introduction

Globally organisations in the Petroleum Industry comprehend productivity of the Petroleum Industry through Technology Competence and Human Resource Competence not as a sum of its parts, but measured as a whole to increase their competitive advantage and to boost their operating efficiency and effectiveness (Chouhan and Srivastava, 2014). However, achieving competitive advantage is challenge, especially within the context of the complexity and excessive competition. One strategy to achieve productivity of the petroleum industry which is full amalgamation of the technology competence include: technical-wide competence, technical-specific competence and human resource competence which include: knowledge, abilities and skills (Woodall & Winstanley, 1998 and Gaspar, 2012), cited in Chouhan and Srivastava (2014). It is presumed that these competences enhance the main facets of the oil and gas: exploration, production, refining, transportation, and marketing. According to Lyons and Plisga (2005) productivity of the petroleum industry is dependent on quality assurance and cost-management to appreciate exploration for oil and gas in Uganda.

Productivity of the petroleum industry represents the entire petroleum value chain which includes the upstream, mid-stream and downstream chain (Moffet & Inkpen, 2011). According to Chouhan and Srivastava (2014) competence is a cluster of related abilities, commitments, knowledge and skills that will enable an organisations to act effectively for survival and sustain competitive advantage in the industry of operation. Earlier scholars such as Itika (2011) had also asserted that competence was the underlying force behind the evolution and development of human resource management conditioned by the changing organization in the market place for managers to improve efficiency in the production. This position had also been underscored by Tiong et al. (1992) who had related competence to critical success factors (CSFs) because they had been identified as cause for a significant impact on project success. Nonetheless, Rockart (1979) had described CSFs as being specific to the industry, sector, context sensitive and time. Organisations in the petroleum industry may need to continuously monitor the market to trace changes in the CSFs. Vasconcellos and Hambrick (1989) confirms Itika (2011) that CSFs are conditional in nature as
they are highly dependent on industry situations. Contextually, Grant (2010) affirms that even within a sector of an industry, CSFs are context specific and will vary from time due to changes in industry environment such as competition, technological innovations and maturity of the industry. The study investigated how technology and human resource competences links with the productivity of Petroleum Industry of Buliisa District, Uganda.

**The Contextualization of the Problem**

In 2006 Oil Exploration activities undertaken in the Albertine Graben confirmed the existence of oil reserves in commercial quantities. However, estimates show that Oil Production could be sustained at around 150,000 barrels per day for 20-25 years based on the estimated reserves of 2.5 billion barrels. Production at these levels for 20 years would equate to total production of 1,095 Million barrels. Following this discovery, Uganda has since embarked on the next phase which involves appraisal, development and production (Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development, 2012).

However, in human resource competence there seems to be contrast which relates to learning and developing human resource competence which is still uncertain. If this not counteracted, will not propel the country to accomplish the 1,095 Million barrels in 20 years. Similarly, the differences between the Government of Uganda and the International Oil Companies operating as joint venture on how the oil should be exploited may represent an obstacle in the launch of production of oil (Tumwesigye et al, 2011). As a result this has led to the habitual extension of oil production. In spite of the progressive advances in Technology, Oil exploration as exemplified in Alberta, Canada, and the cost of exploration is high whereby out of 2.5 tonnes of sand yield one barrel of oil is obtained which has resulted into waste; adversely affecting the environment.

Likewise, In Uganda with advances in technology the country will not accomplish the 1,095 Million barrels in 20 years (Oil in Uganda, 2012). Furthermore, cultural leaders, community leaders and local communities through Local Governments need to be engaged pro-actively to accomplish the 1,095 Million barrels in 20 years (Masiko, 2013 p.131). These issues if not clarified and rectified may cause undesirable anxiety and conflict and thus may affect the economic prospects of the region and the country at large. It is against this background that the researcher intends to examine Technology and Human Resource Competences that might shed more light on the productivity of the Petroleum Industry in Uganda with specific reference to Buliisa District.

**Literature review**

Technology is fundamental to human existence (Burke and Ornstein, 1995; White, 1962). At every stage within the cycle of life, humans continuously attempt to acquire new skills to refine existing skills hoping to enhance productivity and quality of life. However, measuring technological competence as a construct may be achieved by extending the work of Dyrenfurth and Layton as cited in Autio (2011). The scholars identified three components considered the dimensions of technological competence which include; technological knowledge, technical and technological skills. These skills are often labelled by psychologists as psychomotor skills and are an important component of technological competence. Therefore, when technology is well utilised, human resource practices will be more efficient and effective.

According to U.S. Department of Energy (2015) the advances in technology and development of human resource competences in oil companies will improve the proportion of the oil that can be technically and
economically be extracted from the ground. This will counteract the surging demand of crude oil that require considerable investment to increase recovery of irregular hydrocarbons, such investments are expected to continue to increase. The irregular hydrocarbons are often located in geographically challenging areas necessitating innovation and differentiation in technology as vital to achieve commercial recovery quantities to feed into the subsequent Petroleum value chain comprised of; midstream and downstream that will be delivered to national, regional and global markets at competitive prices that will encourage economic growth; availed in a reliable, continuous way to support national security and economic needs; supplied and used in ways with minimal environmental impact on local, national, regional and global ecosystems; safe and reliable operations that will enable oil companies sustainability (U.S. Department of Energy, 2015).

The International Labour Organization (2012) also confirmed the psychomotor skills as an important component of technology competence in ensuring scheduled daily operations of the National Oil Companies (NOC), International Oil Companies (IOC) and services companies (contractors). The psychomotor skills counter the large numbers of experienced workers retiring and few young skilled workers entering the industry. The oil and gas industry has undergone radical changes in recent years. Geopolitics are rapidly changing, environmental concerns are rising; global demand for crude oil is rising. Globally, the price of crude oil is steadily rising and investment in oil has surged. Consequently, the industry is increasingly facing a shortage of qualified workers. It is from this premise that the National Oil Companies (NOC), International Oil Exploration Companies (IOC) and services companies (contractors) must take a proactive role in adjusting to the labour market transitions to support the future workforce demands. This will require clear human resource development policies that need to be developed to ensure sustainable expansion, taking into account the skills sets required. This will be achieved by correlating the training to the labour market demand, providing opportunities for long life learning and using skills development to drive innovation and future growth (International Labour Organization, 2012).

In order to avoid a continuing skills shortage in the medium- and long-term and to enable growth, the Petroleum Industry would need to develop clear human resources development policies. Such policies may require a combination of strategies, including a global training strategy for the industry; drawing talent from diverse labour supply pools that may not have been previously tapped sufficiently (such as women and workers with disabilities); and increasing collaboration between industry employers, workers’ organizations and other stakeholders to improve retention schemes and develop technologies for the future (International Labour Organization, 2012).

The petroleum industry in Uganda is expected to generate millions of direct, indirect and induced jobs. Investment in human capital is critical for the Petroleum industry to operate progressive technologies to remain productive and compete globally. To comprehend the global competition, the Government of the Republic of Uganda through the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Development (MEAMD) and other pertinent Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs), International Oil Exploration Organizations, Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Development Partners and workers from diverse labour pool need to collaborate to formulate a global training strategy for the Petroleum sector (Global Witness, 2010).

Such a strategy must include respect for rights at work, non-discrimination, equal opportunities and treatment for women and men (including youth), good governance, transparency and accountability. This
will contribute to job-rich growth in other sectors through transferable skills, and work towards a green economy (Global Witness, 2010).

Technological competence, in summary involves a balance between knowledge, skill, and emotional engagement. This means technological competence is the act of using human inventiveness (Hansen, 2008). Technology innovation will drive innovative projects and processes on budget and on time, requiring constant pressure to learn among the organization employees and thus producing more with less. Van Zyl et al., (2011) confirm the constant pressure for organizations to learn because of globalization demands. However, this necessitates organization to work smarter and takes more risks than ever before. The review on literature on technology competence resulted into stating the following hypothesis.

**H1: Technology Competence (TC) Positively Influences Productivity of the Petroleum Industry (PI)**

Furthermore, the Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology (UTAUT) by Venkateshet al. (2003), postulate user intentions for new technology and subsequent usage behaviour. The theory assumes four key constructs (performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence, and facilitating conditions) which directly determine usage intention and behavior. Gender, age, experience, and voluntariness of use are posited to mediate the impact of the four key constructs on usage intention and behavior. Subsequent validation of UTAUT in a longitudinal study found that it accounts for 70% of the variance in usage intention (Venkatesh et. al., 2003).

According to Edvinsson and Malone (1997); Sveiby (1997), relate the human resource competence to human capital which derives value from intellectual capital. This is illustrated as a tripartite model comprising human capital, knowledge sharing and internal components. This possibly means that skilled human resource will invariably drive innovation and human capital will subsequently comprehend the benefits of favorable customer, supplier and broader external relations. Human capital is portrayed as critical for businesses to compete effectively (Sveiby, 1997).

Fitzenz, (2000), Bontis and Fitz-enz (2002) singled out human resource competence as critical for business to compete effectively, suggesting that people, not cash, buildings or equipment are critical differentiators of business enterprise to realize success (Fitz-enz, 2000). Even Kaplan and Norton (1996), Guthrie and Petty (2000) had affirmed the need for intellectual capital as an asset in terms of competences. Therefore, organizations in the oil sector of Uganda would require personal knowledge management, skill and abilities which depict knowledge sharing as a catalyst to the organization’s workforce to realize human resource competence and obtain general success.

However, the management competence theory by Prahalad and Hamel (1990) postulates that a core competence is a specific factor that a business considers central to the company or its employees’ work. Conversely, the Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development (2012) described human resource competence among the Critical Success Factors that people need to perform a job. The literature review gap led into the development of the following hypothesis

**H2: Human Resource Competence has a Direct and Positive Influence on Productivity of the Petroleum Industry (PI).**

**Methodology**

The conceptual model was developed based on the two hypotheses grounded in the Structural equation modeling (SEM). The SEM is a multivariate statistical analysis technique that is used to analyze structural
relationships. This technique is the combination of factor analysis and multiple regression analysis, and it is used to analyze the structural relationship between measured variables and latent constructs (Hooper et al., 2008). Therefore, the multivariate statistical analysis technique enabled the researcher to analyze the link of the technology and human resource competences with productivity of the petroleum industry in Buliisa District. To investigate the connection among the technology, human resource competences and productive petroleum industry in Buliisa District the researchers employed the quantitative approach. Questionnaire survey was used to collect data from respondents and structural equation modeling (SEM) was used to test the hypothesized relationships.

The data was collected in Buliisa District, Uganda with from a sample of 127. The respondents included senior staff, technical staff, human resource departments from Total E&P, Local leaders, Ministry of Justice and Constitutional Affairs, Solicitor General’s office, Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development, Department of Economics and Investment, Ministry of Energy and Mineral Development, Department of Petroleum and Production, Bugungu oil camp, religious leaders, local elected leaders, local leaders, community leaders, communities around the exploration sites, general community in Buliisa District, Bunyoro Kingdom officials, District officials in Buliisa District and Civil Society Organisations at National and Locally based in Buliisa District advocating for oil extraction and environmental conservation. A sample of out of a sample of 127 respondents, 99 questionnaires were returned, accounting for 78%. Data was analysed using Factor analysis with help of SPSS. However, qualitative data was analysed through content and thematic analyses.

Table 1: Demographic Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondents’ Category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Management</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Staff</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR Departments</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Affairs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Leaders</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Councils</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education Levels</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>29.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Distribution by Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>78.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>99</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Table 1, majority respondents are technical staff (79%) and most of the respondents have attained post-secondary education. This implies that workforce had sufficient knowledge and skill to understand the questionnaire and provide relevant responses. On the contrary, only 21% of the respondents were female. This can be explained by the socialization round gender roles in the field where females are less involved in manual tasks associated with oil and gas sector.
Results and Discussion

The appropriateness of the hypothesized model was evaluated based on the Goodness-of-fit (GOF) indices using IBM AMOS v21.0 software. From Table 2, some GOF indices did not meet the required levels. For example, comparative fit index (CFI)—0.860, the root mean square error of approximation (RMSEA)—0.060, and goodness of fit index (GFI)—0.845. Therefore, the hypothesized model had to be refined to meet the GOF measures.

Table 2: GOF Measurements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GOF measure</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Hypothetical</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Goodness-of-fit index (GFI)</td>
<td>&gt;0.9</td>
<td>0.845</td>
<td>0.960</td>
<td>(Shi et al., 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tucker–Lewis index (TLI)</td>
<td>&gt;0.9</td>
<td>0.825</td>
<td>0.924</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parsimony goodness-of-fit index (PGFI)</td>
<td>&gt;0.5</td>
<td>0.861</td>
<td>0.918</td>
<td>(Shi et al., 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Root mean square error of approximation (RMSEA)</td>
<td>&lt;0.07</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>0.051</td>
<td>(Steiger, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparative fit index (CFI)</td>
<td>&gt;0.9</td>
<td>0.860</td>
<td>0.928</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normed-fit index (NFI)</td>
<td>&gt;0.8</td>
<td>0.611</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td>(Hooper et al., 2008)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To improve the GOF indices, modifications were made based on AMOS modification indices. This was done by adding error-covariance paths among the errors variables. After modification, the recommended GOF indices were satisfied. For example, after modification—NFI was 0.801, while RMSEA was 0.051, and GFI was 0.960. This suggested that the model and the data were absolutely acceptable and the hypothetical model fitted the sample with high level of confidence. Albeit, the modification parameter were based on SEM suggestions, the modifications were practically plausible, therefore. Because the interaction between petroleum and its drivers (technology and human resource) was a complex pillar where different variables could easily interact with each other. From Table 3, the standard regression path coefficients are positive and significant at 0.05 level, thus the observed and latent variable relationship were significant. The final model suggested a successful fit between the hypothesized model and the data; Figure 1 illustrates the final model.

Table 3: Standardized Regression Weights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PI</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.253</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>TCIWC2</td>
<td>--- TC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PI</td>
<td>--- TC</td>
<td>0.361</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>TCIWC1</td>
<td>--- TC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRK1</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.687</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PQA1</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRK2</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.633</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PQA2</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRS1</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.525</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PQA3</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRS3</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.476</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PQA4</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRS4</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.529</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PCM1</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRS5</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.673</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PCM2</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA1</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.524</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PCM5</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA2</td>
<td>--- HR</td>
<td>0.626</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>PCM7</td>
<td>--- PI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 illustrates the results of the measurement model estimates. Majority of the standardized path coefficients for regression weights were positive and significant at the 0.001 level, indicating that the relationship between each observed variable and its corresponding latent variable was significant. In addition, the variable of accurate information for decision making (HRA3) owned the highest factor loading of all observed variables, indicating that this variable has the most impact on the variable of the human resource (HR). In addition, employee experience (HRK1), middle management (HRS5), and the ongoing knowledge shared among employees (HRK2) had the most significant influence on the human resource variable. The private sector’s partnership in the oil sector (TCIWC3) and technical skills (TCISC3) had the most substantial impact on the technology competence (TC) followed by the employees’ capability to operate new technology (TCISC2) and innovation (TCIWC2) combined. Sound environmental measures to protect the community and environment (PCM10) and the type of technology expended in the drilling of oil (PCM1) showed the most impact on petroleum industry management (PI). This was followed by clear environmental conservation policies (PQA3) of International oil exploration organisation Local communities receptiveness (PCM9) also showed a higher influence on petroleum industry.
Figure 1 and Table 3 illustrate the relationship paths among latent variables; these paths were determined, and their effects were also estimated by the regression analysis in the SEM model. All of the path coefficients are positive and significant at $p < 0.05$, and these findings also indicate that the two hypotheses, that is to say, H1, and H2 are supported based on the data collected from the questionnaire survey.

Technology competence (TC) positively influenced productivity of the petroleum industry (PI) according to table 3 there was a significant positive relationship between technology competence on productivity of the petroleum industry ($e=.361; p=.01 <0.05$) at 95% level of significance. This implies that enhancing technology competence initiatives through industry-wide technical competence and industry-specific technical competence will contribute to an improvement of the productivity of the petroleum industry in
Buliisa District. The implications for the petroleum industry in developing countries, are gaining benefits and competitive advantages from the successful implementation of TC initiatives. Encouraging such TC initiatives is the first step in efficiently and effectively transforming or re-engineering traditional petroleum business processes, and ultimately improving the productivity of the domestic petroleum industry. However, it is not enough to only expect that TC will naturally occur. The processes that underpin TC should be continuously evaluated to ensure that the Knowledge and indigenous workers are seamlessly absorbing skills (Cuddington and Moss, 2001; Mohamed et al., 2012). This research study has implications for the petroleum industry of developing and newly oil-producing countries attempting to develop and promote an effective TC process in the petroleum industry. The derived international TC model could be utilized to assist the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Development in Uganda to enhance the evaluation of TC performance.

Table 4: Hypotheses and their results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Probability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td>&lt;---</td>
<td>HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td>&lt;---</td>
<td>TC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The human resource (HR) plays an important role in terms of Knowledge, Skills and Abilities in operating the petroleum project and delivering the services. Findings further indicate a significant positive relationship between Human Resource competence on productivity of the petroleum industry in Buliisa District (e=.253; p=.02 < 0.05) at 95% level of significance. This shows that enhancing human resource competence such as knowledge, skills and abilities will contribute to productivity of the petroleum industry in Buliisa District. Relatedly, interviews with local practitioners and community leaders in Buliisa District indicated awareness and sensitivity to quality of human resource, emerging technology and preservation of environmental issues. The drilling supervisor observed that human resource should be exposed to enhanced efficient competences through research and development and adopt to the most efficient means of production to operate at the minimum cost possible.

Finally, results showed Technology competence affects more than Human resource competence on productivity of the petroleum industry in Buliisa District. This confirms the researcher’s assertion to embrace the advances technology and development of human resource competences in oil companies in order to increase the recoverable oil, that is to say, more quantities of oil.

This confirms Guthrie and Petty, (2000) findings that the need for intellectual capital as an intangible asset in the form of competences processes and people have become vital sources for an organization as transit to the information age to comprehend current wealth and future wealth. Human resource competence derives value from intellectual capital. This means skilled human resource and engaged human resource will invariably drive innovation and both intellectual capital and human capital will subsequently comprehend the benefits of favorable customer, supplier and broader external relations.

The human capital is singled out as being critical for a business to compete effectively (March, 2013; Psacharopoulos and Patrinos, 2004). Intellectual capital is regarded as the hidden value of an organization. Although intangible assets may represent competitive advantage, organizations do not understand their nature and value. Managers do not understand what know-how, management potential, or creativity they have access to with their employees (Noruzi and Vargas-Hernández, 2010). In Uganda therefore,
organizations in the petroleum sector ought to deploy human resources of competence in order to increase job and organizational performance and productivity.

**Implications/ Recommendations**

With technology competence identified to be with greater effect and impact on productivity of the petroleum industry than the human resource competence in Buliisa District, this finding connotes overt and covert implications:

Overtly, there is extensive need for enhanced funding of the petroleum industry to embrace more relevant technologies that match with the contemporary times. Obviously, this to be realised could imply involving bilateral and to a certain extent, multi-lateral cooperation to get sustainable funding of the contemporary technologies. Regrettably, with such options national sovereignty could be constrained and compromised. Nevertheless, the sincere recommendation in this regard, would only remain involvement of the most viable option among alternatives that are democratically discussed.

Covertly, although the effect of the human resource competence was identified to be relatively lower than the technology variable, this does not mean ignoring this means that there is need to pay more attention on human resource development to ascertain its greater productivity. In any case this factor possesses latent effect and can impact on the performance of the harnessed contemporary technology, even on the overall performance of the petroleum industry. By this very fact, it is therefore further recommended that the factor of human resource competence should also be improved and upheld, either via more effective human resource management - job security, and safe working conditions, backed by well-planned future training of the current force and or even, to hire more skilled and relevant personnel to boost performance, an expectation that will also the bolster socio-economic development aspirations of Uganda.

**References**


PART B: GOVERNANCE AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Health Services and the Footpath to achieving SDGs in the East African Region

David Baguma

Uganda Management Institute
Consultant at Lukhwells International Limited
Visiting Professor, Disease Control & Environmental Health Dep't Makerere University Uganda
E-mail: baguma.david@yahoo.com / bagusha2000@yahoo.com

Abstract
The East African region is experiencing rapid growth in cities influencing the health service sector coupled with progressive changes in social, political, rural and urban development. The increase in health risks also caused by climatic and environmental hazards slows strides in the progress along the footpath to achieve health targets outlined in Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), including SDG 3. Quantitative and qualitative data from academic and grey literature was used to review the possible health situation in East African Region. The present paper found that different rates of demographic and epidemiological changes caused inequalities in socioeconomic development and disparities in health services, posing challenges to national health systems, particularly in the control of communicable and infectious diseases. Non-communicable diseases among the aging populations have increased. Furthermore, development changes for rural and urban areas led to trade in health services, medical tourism and the migration of health workers. This overview of the East African health systems presents key demographic and epidemiological policy changes in the region. Public policy strategies are required to address health and natural disasters, especially the long-term effects of climate change. Health policy makers, researchers and legislators could benefit from the findings of this study.

Keywords: Bush Burning, Climate Change, Health, Poverty, SDG, Plants, Water Shortage

Introduction
East Africa includes independent countries located along the equator, namely Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda (The African Development Bank, 2014; Mkenda, 2001; Population Reference Bureau, 2011). The region covers an area of 1.8 million km², has a combined total population of around 537.9 million inhabitants (The World Factbook, 2017), and is endowed with significant natural resources, such as wildlife and forests (Emslie, 2012). Kenya and Tanzania have had a relatively peaceful history since achieving independence, in contrast to the wars and civil strife that have occurred in Rwanda, Burundi and Uganda (Mcknight S. 2015; Finlay et al., 2011; Chacha, 2004). East Africa people seeks to consistently maintain stability and prosperity in the midst of ongoing conflicts in member countries, such as the DR Congo and the Horn of Africa (Siradag A., (2015).

The most prevalent languages in East African people are Swahili, English, Kirundi and Kinyarwanda, although French is also common in Burundi and Rwanda (Pasch, 2005). By comparison to Southeast Asian countries, with fast-growing economies (Chongsuivivatwong, et al., 2011), East African countries are less visible in terms of economic progress, except Kenya. The same is true of progress in the health sector (Kimenyi et al., 2016). In this overview, we analyse the key demographic and epidemiological transitions of the region to delineate the challenges facing health services and to emphasise the potential for regional collaboration in the progressive strides along the footpath to achieve health targets outlined in Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), in the health sector. This overview sets the scene for a more detailed discussion of the specific SDG issues presented in the subsequent sections, profiling maternal health and fertility,
population and urban transition, migration, the aging population structure, the emerging disease burden, environmental issues and health.

**Search Strategy and Selection Criteria**

Basing on published articles, such as Chongsuvivatwong, et al., 2011, we used quantitative and qualitative data from academic and grey literature to review the health situation in East Africa. The search terms used were ‘health’, ‘health statistics’, ‘health systems’, ‘socioeconomic development’ and ‘East Africa’. Data were gathered in line with the objectives of the study related to health (geographical location, history, demography, epidemiology and health systems). Data collection took place between November to December 2018, and July to October 2019. Quantitative data were retrieved from the database of the World Health Organisation (WHO), the World Bank, the United Nations Development Programme and scientific literature. Qualitative information was retrieved from grey literature (WHO reports) as well as academic literature, including a mix of peer-reviewed journal articles and book chapters from publishers. Data were critically appraised and analysed to elaborate trends, projections and associations between socioeconomic and population health measures. The method is widely used in published articles (Chongsuvivatwong, et al., 2011).

**Population and Health Transition**

**Urbanisation**

The East African region comprises all the six East African countries. East Africa has a combined total population of around 537.9 million inhabitants, Table 1, (Population Reference Bureau, 2011). Megacities – defined as metropolitan areas with a total population in excess of 10 million people – have particular significance in the worldwide process of urbanisation and health sector development (Kraas, 2007). More than two-thirds of the megacities are found in developing countries, their populations having increased greatly in the last three decades (Kraas, 2003; Bronger, 2004).

**Table 1: Countries, Capitals and Largest Cities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Capital</th>
<th>Largest city by Population*</th>
<th>2nd, Largest City by Population**</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>East African Community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Kampala</td>
<td>Kampala</td>
<td>Gulu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1,507,114; 2014)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Kigali</td>
<td>Kigali</td>
<td>Gitarama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burundi</td>
<td>Gitega</td>
<td>Bujumbura</td>
<td>Muyinga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(22,989; 2012)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Nairobi</td>
<td>Nairobi</td>
<td>Mombasa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(915,101; 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>Dodoma</td>
<td>Dar es Salaam</td>
<td>Mwanza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The East African region has no megacities, given its average population of less than 250 people per km². Although population sizes are small, the greater sprawl of Kigali and Burundi make them less densely populated. The world is increasingly becoming urbanised. Almost half of the world population live in cities and published literature indicates that more than 60 per cent are likely to do so by 2050 (HABITAT, 2001). The East African Community is experiencing similar trends, see map, Figure 1. Nine of the 30 fastest-growing cities in the world between 2005 and 2010 were in the Greater Horn of East Africa. The hypothesis about the future is that between 2006 and 2020, seven of the world’s 100 African fastest-growing cities will be in the region. The cities are partially marked by towering commercial buildings, better provision of social services vis-à-vis rural spaces, and an immense range of trading activities, many of which are informal. However, the urbanisation capability of the cities is highly differentiated and the apparent lack of adequate deliberate urbanisation policies has led to extremes of poverty and prosperity co-existing in the cities (Kimani-Murage et al., 2007; World Cite, 2012). To provide access to safe, affordable, accessible and sustainable transport systems for all, improving road safety, notably by expanding public transport, with special attention to the needs of those in vulnerable situations, women, children, persons with disabilities and older persons (as per SDG 11) could be difficult to achieve.

Figure 1: Map showing East Africa Countries in the Study
According to 2001 data, 83 per cent of East Africa’s urban population were living in slum conditions (as defined by UN Habitat), which, according to the Society for International Development report, has poor drainage systems and poor health services, thus impacting negatively on the health of residents (SID 2010).

**Aspects of Maternal Health and Fertility**

Although life expectancy in all the countries in the region has improved, there have been significant variations in the rate of progress, as per the WHO report (WHO 2011). Most countries enjoyed continuous rises in average life expectancy from 1950 to 2011, with women living longer (see Figure 2).

![Figure 2: Average life expectancy of both sexes (between 1950 and 2011) in selected countries](image)

In some cases political regimes and a history of conflict, such as in Uganda, have affected progress, coupled with HIV prevalence. However, where life expectancy gains have occurred, this trend has been mainly attributable to slow progress in the reduction of adult mortality. As elsewhere in the developing countries, a high fertility rate is the main factor contributing to the growth in populations, as evidenced by early marriages and low use of contraceptives (Kiwanuka et al., 2008), which calls for emphasis if by 2030, we are to reduce the global maternal mortality ratio to less than 70 per 100 000 live births (WHO, 2019; SDG 3). Rates of infant mortality have varied widely across the region. Kenya’s infant mortality rate fell from 147.01 in 1950 to 64.72 in 2011. Mayotte had the lowest infant mortality of 5.92 per cent by 2011 (Population Reference Bureau, 2011; United Nations 2010).

**Migration**

Progress in the economic and demographic spheres has prompted the movement of people across the region, mainly for short-term employment, but also for settlement (UNDP, 2009). All countries import and export labour. Tanzania and Uganda are major labour exporters, although they are also importers, whereas Kenya and Rwanda both receive migrants and send their nationals abroad. The need for rapid economic growth and inadequate levels of education have prompted some countries (such as Rwanda) to open their doors to in-migration of foreigners at all levels of expertise for employment, with the option of permanent settlement for the highly skilled, and due partially to broad wage differentials (Dzvimbo, 2003). Significant
undocumented or illegal migration as well as the movement of displaced people in the region have been taking place (UNDP 2009). The groups involved are particularly vulnerable, especially undocumented migrants, as they are disproportionately more exposed to health risks due to poor working conditions and irregular movement, yet are unlikely to seek medical attention because of their status, and are also often left out of assistance programmes in times of disaster and emergency (Chongsuvivatwong, 2011). There is need to facilitate orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people, including through the implementation of planned and well managed migration policies, as stipulated in SDG 10.7 to reduce inequality within and among countries (SDG 10).

Environment and Conflict

The interplay between climate change, conflict, violence and refugee movement is considered to be influencing livelihoods (Afifi et al., 2012). Environmental change in countries in East Africa and the Horn of Africa already includes prolonged droughts, desertification, flash floods and land degradation, all of which will likely be exacerbated by climate change impacts in the medium and long terms (Baguma et al., 2010b). The International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) Fourth Assessment Report projects that East Africa and the Horn of Africa will be among the regions most negatively affected by climate change, which will, in turn, affect health services (IPCC 2007). This is because the East African region is a major hub for settling a huge number of people, at one time estimated at five million, and these were asylum-seekers, refugees, internally displaced persons, returnees and stateless persons (UNCHR 2012). Indeed, consistent with SDGs, global health and environmental threats, more frequent and intense natural disasters, spiralling conflict, violent extremism, terrorism and related humanitarian crises and forced displacement of people threaten to reverse much of the development progress made in recent decades.

Population Ageing

The population age structures of the selected countries are almost alike as a result of past similarities in fertility, mortality and migration trends (Figure 2). The structures are, in turn, affected by economic, social, cultural and political developments. Uganda and Tanzania have the youngest populations as far as the under-fives are concerned. Figure 3 shows the estimated trends in the risk of child death (that is between birth and five years of age) during the past four decades.

![Population age structure of the selected Countries of less than five (< 5 years) and above 65 years.](image)

Child survival has improved substantially in all countries but still requires support, particularly for Burundi, Uganda and Rwanda, where the risk of child death (between birth and one year per 1,000) was still high, between 67 and 90 per 1,000, from 2005 to 2010 (Baguma, 2017; United Nations, 2010). However, the population aged 65 years or older (3 per cent) is small in number and uniform (Table 2). This call for the need to strengthen universal access to safe, inclusive and accessible, green and public spaces, to improve
livelihood in the footpath to achieving SDG, in particular for women and children, older persons and persons with disabilities.

**Emerging Disease Burden**

**Mortality**

Countries with aged populations have a higher burden of non-communicable diseases; however, mortality rates for communicable diseases are higher in the developing world than in the developed world (Miszkurka et al., 2012).

**Table 2: Description of quality of life in selected East Africa Countries.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>41.6</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>46.2</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>415</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Chongsuvivatwong et al. 2011; United Nations, 2010

Notes:

- Pop. Density implies Population density (people per km²)
- Urban Pop. Implies Urban population (% of total population)*
- Literacy implies Adult literacy rate (%)**
- Life span implies Life expectancy both sexes (years)
- Life span-W implies Life expectancy women (years)
- Life span-M implies Life expectancy men (years)
- Pop ≥ 65 yr implies Population aged 65 years or older (%)
- Fertility implies Total fertility rate (children per women)
- Mortality implies Infant mortality rate (deaths per 1000 live births) in 2010
- Mortality-D implies Under-5 mortality rate (deaths per 1000 live births) in 2010

The rates of fatalities from communicable diseases are relatively high in East Africa. Longevity is increasingly becoming a result of the diminishing burden from communicable, maternal and prenatal diseases. Furthermore, the increasing life expectancy and the adoption of unhealthy lifestyles present a challenge; for instance, the impact of the metabolic side effects of lifelong antiretroviral treatment and the outbreaks of re-emerging diseases compound the problems and pose a threat all over the world. According to the Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation (IHME), in Uganda the rate of fatality due to non-communicable diseases is, however, declining (see Figure 4) (IHME 2014).
- Uganda Total (All causes) both sexes all ages

Figure 4: Fatality due to non-communicable diseases is declining in Uganda

Injuries are an important cause of death in all countries (Chalya et al., 2010). The cause-of-death data systems found in the countries in the region are inadequate to inform health policy and planning, and where they exist, the quality of data is unreliable. As reflected in Table 3, there exist many causes of death in the region as well as in sub-Saharan Africa as a whole (Jamimson et al., 2006; Adetunji et al., 1996). Understanding how the leading causes of death have changed in the last 50 years can partially provide important insights into what can be achieved and result in strong public health commitment to disease control and injury prevention, to spur the pace to achieving SDGs.

Health and Wealth

Just as in Southeast Asian countries, the region as a whole does not have adequate reliable longitudinal data on disease trends (Chongsuvivatwong, 2011). However, evidence from studies of disease prevalence shows a strong inverse association with national wealth. This can be largely attributable to the social determinants of health, including the provision of inefficient health-care systems for population coverage.

Table 3: Children under Five Years, by Source of Data Proportion of Deaths Due to Diseases and Injuries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Number of Deaths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Verbal autopsy and hospital records</td>
<td>3(0.11)</td>
<td>1,139(0.05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal autopsy (prospective studies)</td>
<td>4(0.14)</td>
<td>1,906(0.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vital registration</td>
<td>3(0.11)</td>
<td>11,878(0.48)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital records</td>
<td>1(0.04)</td>
<td>2,419(0.10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other multiple sources</td>
<td>3(0.11)</td>
<td>1,288(0.05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital autopsy</td>
<td>1(0.04)</td>
<td>953(0.04)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>28(100.00)</td>
<td>24,547(100.00)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Includes ill-defined conditions and cause unknown. Source: Adetunji et al. 1996

In terms of health and medical tourism, in the South Asian countries (Thailand) health-care quality has made medical tourism possible in the region. The use of medical tourism is a realistic possibility in the East African context, if improvements could be made in facilities, transportation, costs and services to
patients. Policy proposals focused on medical tourism could trigger improvement in health as a source of financing and in health services in East Africa.

**HIV/AIDS and other Causes of Fatality**

The Human Immune Deficiency Virus/ Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (HIV/AIDS) has been a major cause of fatality in many countries within the region (such as in Uganda), although its spread is partially controlled by the promotion of Abstinence, Be faithful, and Condom use (Okware et al., 2005). Although universal access to treatment is promoted, patients lack compliance partially due to lack of follow-up within most health-care services (Parkhurst, 2012). An estimate of access to clinical care among the rural and urban populations of the East African countries was not done as this was beyond the scope of this paper; however, information is available in published literature (Sibley and Weiner, 2011; Uhlman et al., 2013). The literature includes significant evidence revealing that health-care utilisation is lower in rural than in urban areas, which also affects child health ((Horner et al., 1994; Dan et al., 1994; Michelle et al., 2001; HSSIP 2010; Lisa et al., 2006; Baguma et al., 2010a).

**Environmental Issues and Health**

The environment is one of the factors that affect health, contributing to the incidence of disease and mortality in the developing world (Baguma, 2015). Regular floods and dry conditions occur in East Africa (Afifi et al., 2012). Climate change phenomena also intensify the annual variation of hot and wet seasons, leading to drought, floods and the occurrence of infectious diseases such as malaria and cholera, and waterborne diseases (Baguma et al., 2010a; Baguma et al., 2010b; Baguma et al., 2010c; Baguma et al., 2012). Countries such as Kenya are severely affected by drought, which has increased in intensity over time. The region is also prone to landslides and is influenced by natural hazards, for example the Indian Ocean atmospheric conditions and earthquakes (Info 2012).

Uncontrolled forest fires rage in the dry tropical seasonal climate. The severity of the fires is also closely linked to the spread of the Sahara Desert, which has over the centuries expanded southwards, creating threats of hunger and food insecurity. East Africa has been identified as a region that could be vulnerable to the effects of climate change, with dire implications for health services, because of rainfall variability linked to floods (Baguma et al., 2010b). Climate change could also exacerbate the spread of emerging infectious diseases in the region, especially vector-borne diseases linked to rises in temperature. There are also other causes of diseases or fatality, such as diarrhoea, respiratory infections, low birth weight and obstetric complications. According to the World Health Organisation, environmental exposure accounts for nearly 10 per cent of fatalities and the disease burden globally and one-quarter of deaths and the disease burden in children under five years of age (Table 4) (WHO 2009).

**Table 4: Deaths Attributable to Five Environmental Risks and to all five Risks combined by Region, 2004**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk</th>
<th>World</th>
<th>Low and Middle Income</th>
<th>High Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indoor smoke from solid fuels</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsafe water, sanitation, hygiene</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban outdoor air pollution</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global climate change</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead exposure</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All five risks</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Health systems in East Africa

East Africa’s on-going economic growth has created new challenges for the region’s health systems, partly owing to industrialisation, liberalisation and globalisation. The world market offers opportunities for the acquisition of modern medical technology but its cost is unaffordable to most of the region’s population, partly because of the prevalence of extreme poverty in most of the population (Pingali et al., 2006; Kondelule., 2010). Many informal and traditional health practices exist alongside the use of new medical technologies and pharmaceutical products, presenting regulatory problems in terms of control, safety and quality. There is also a growing public-private partnership in health services (Garenne, 2006). With rising educational levels, greater freedom of speech and growing consciousness of human rights in the adopted democratic governance systems, the demand for better health care is likely to be high. At the same time, health systems in the region are facing more serious adjustment problems than ever before as a result of a robust increase in population and urbanisation (Chuma and Okungu, 2011).

Health services have become an important industry, with a mix of public and private non-profit and for-profit actors, along with the growth in unmet needs owing to inefficient health-care systems. Some patients travel out of the region, to countries such as South African or Egypt, for trade and medical tourism. Kenya seems to have better health facilities than the other countries in the region and, therefore, attracts a big number of patients holding high government positions within the region (Chuma and Okungu, 2011). The need to restructure health-care delivery and financing systems is required to attain a new demand-supply equilibrium. The pressure placed on national health-care systems by recent demographic and epidemiological needs is amplified by the growing demands of an increasing population for better health-care quality (Human Development Report, 2014). Financial crises in the region, widespread income disparities between the rural and urban areas, the global economic volatility, and an expanding population have an indirect impact on health care, contributing partially to the labour-force distortions in the production and distribution of health services both within and across the countries (Human Development Report, 2014).

Moreover, health-care workers are concentrated in urban areas with higher incomes and better-paying organisations, thus leading to uneven health service provision in rural areas (WHO 2009). Throughout the region, there is need to implement pro-poor financing schemes for indigent patients (Zikusooka and Kyomuhangi, 2008). Schemes such as the health card, and even in affluent areas measures such as medical insurance and a means-tested hospital-fees subsidy scheme, should be emphasised. Currently, the health-care system runs predominantly with donor support and inadequate tax funding, which is fairly unsustainable, given the strong role governments should play in the effective control of the health sector (Health Financing Statregy, 2016; Agaba, 2009). However, critical measures could focus on rising costs, future sustainability of centralised donor-financed systems, efficiency and the quality of public services, as well as higher public expectations. Although the health-care systems are changing from a government-dominated realm towards one where there is greater private-sector involvement, the policy implementation institutions in place are inadequate to ensure efficient health service supply (Konde-Lule et al., 2010). Attempts to privatise public hospitals have been controversial. This has resulted in the existence of many hybrid forms of private health facilities that continue to be inadequately controlled or independent of government. Some of the most innovative and advanced forms of the public-private mix in health service provision have not got off to a good start within the region. This has been partly because the formal urban

employment sector is small relative to the populations in rural areas and in informal employment. The populations often have insufficient income to pay for health services (World Bank 1995; Van Ginneken, 1999; Guhan 1994; Preker et al., 2002). This has affected aspects of system performance and equity even though the impetus for decentralisation was partly political. Equity issues and inadequate infrastructure will continue to challenge the development of the health sector.

**Collaboration in the Health-Sector**

The disease epidemic has given rise to the need to strengthen regional health collaboration. This cooperation has occurred via two channels: direct bilateral collaboration by individual countries (ministries of health and foreign affairs) and those under the aegis of the East African Community. Enthusiasm for regional economic collaboration continues to grow, as evidenced by the explicit goal of the East Africa Community, that is the creation of a free trade area to increase the region’s competitive advantage as a product base geared towards the world market. There is Constitutional Drafting Committee, with members from all the 6 countries of the EAC (info, 2019).

East African leaders could emphasise health care as a priority sector for community-wide integration. From an economic perspective, opening up of the health-care markets promises substantial economic gains. At the same time, however, this process could also intensify competition among the existing health services within countries. Furthermore, it could lead to undesirable outcomes whereby only the better-off would receive benefits from the liberalisation of the trade policy in health. Health and trade policies can and do appear to contradict each other. For instance, tobacco is a major source of revenue in countries like Uganda, yet its consumption could be a health risk. Furthermore, tobacco use is the major preventable cause of non-communicable diseases and fatalities. However, its contribution to the disease burden has changed substantially, especially when both men and women are combined (Lim et al, 2012).

Among all the East African countries, it is increasingly becoming less important for governments to direct all people towards available health sources in urban areas, given the trends in globalisation that make access to diverse health services possible. Patients travel for medical treatment at health-care facilities perceived to offer high quality services and value for money. The East African countries will have to learn more from other communities, especially Southeast Asia, where the private sector has capitalised on its comparative advantage to promote improved health services using medical tourism and travel, combining health services for wealthy foreigners with recreational packages (Chongsuvivatwong, 2011).

**Conclusion**

The overview complements information revealing key demographic and epidemiological transitions to delineate the challenges facing health services and to emphasise the potential for regional and international collaboration in the progressive strides along the footpath to achieve health targets outlined in Sustainable Development Goals (SDG). Social, political and economic development during the past few decades have led to slow progress within the health sector. The increase in health risks also caused by climatic and environmental hazards slows strides in the progress along the footpath to achieve health targets outlined in SDGs. Adjustments in public policy to address uncertainties that cause risks to health have social and economic impacts. Public health strategies (such as communal collaboration focused on disaster preparedness and in the surveillance of health support systems and response) to disease outbreaks certainly have advantages. Moreover, almost all countries globally are faced with similar emerging and chronic disease epidemics. Non-communicable, maternal and infant mortality challenges combined, coupled with
deaths occurring before old age even in the wealthiest populations, are problematic. Health promotion and disease prevention are strategies that are urgently needed to be replicated in the region. Further emphasis on the expansion and integration of the East African region should include, as a matter of priority, enhance communal collaboration in the health sector to enable the sharing of knowledge and the prioritisation of health systems operations, leading to further public health benefits worldwide.

**Conflict of Interest**
The author has no actual or potential competing financial interests.

**Ethical Issues**
There were no human data collected. No Ethic approval was sought.

**References**


Info. 2019. President’s speech at the 57thInDependence anniversary. available from the link at http://www.statehouse.go.ug/media/speeches/2019/10/10/presidents-speech-57th-independence-anniversary Accessed, October 11, 2019


Michelle, M.C., Call, K.T. & Klinger, J.M. 2001, "are rural residents less likely to obtain recommended preventative healthcare services?" American Journal of Preventative Medicine, 21 (3): 182-188.


The African Development Bank, 2014. The African Development Bank A Partner Of Choice For The Eastern Africa We Want. Assessed on October 10th, 2019 from


Advancing Climate Change Adaptation in Uganda’s Agricultural Programming for Sustainable Development: Key Milestones and Constraints

Alinda Fred, Kisambira Ezekel & Kagoro Anthony

1Research Fellow, Uganda Management Institute
2Climate Change Expert, Ministry of Water and Environment, Uganda
3Development Worker Climate Change Research Group, Uganda

Abstract

Climate change remains a key threat to sustainable development particularly to the farming communities which are more vulnerable to the climate impacts. Uganda has made commendable steps in building an institutional framework for addressing climate change. However, the framework remains scattered in several documents making it difficult to track and conceptualize. This paper provides a one-stop center for understanding how effectively climate change is institutionalized in the agricultural sector and identifies the critical issues for future actions towards effective mainstreaming of climate change in agricultural programming. Findings in this paper are based on data collected through document review and a case study of Bududa district, representing the local government of climate change adaptation mainstreaming. The paper observes that significant steps have been taken to mainstream climate change adaptation in agricultural programming but adoption of adaptation measures will necessitate robust institutionalization of agricultural insurance as a climate change adaptation strategy particularly in the context of the rural, resource-constrained farming communities which are also more vulnerable to climate change hazards. Secondly, effective mainstreaming of climate change adaptation in agricultural programming in local governments will necessitate increased budget support from the central government towards addressing the critical institutional capacity gaps which hinder climate change adaptation programming and implementation of adaptation measures in local governments of Uganda.

Key Words: Climate Change, Sustainable Development, Farming Communities, Sustainable Development

Introduction

Global and Regional Context of Climate Change Adaptation

Climate change remains a global issue associated with extreme conditions like floods and droughts which constrain development particularly in poor countries (UNDP, 2018). There is a long history of the World’s Commitment to address climate change reflected in the climate change discourse and the key milestones. These include: the 1979 first World Climate Conference held in Geneva, the 1985 United Nations Environmental Program on greenhouse emissions, the 1988 intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change established by United Nations Environmental Program, the 1994 United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, the 2005 Kyoto Protocol, the 2006 Asia-Pacific Partnership for Clean Development, the 2007-Stern report highlighting the economic rationale and implication for climate change published and the thirteenth conference of parties in Bali, which drew a roadmap towards Copenhagen. Key stakeholders at all levels including: local leaders, Government, Development Partners, Civil Society, Policy Makers, Political Leaders, Private Sector, Academia, Research Institutions, Cultural and Faith Based Leaders and Communities have weighed in climate change issues (Environmental Alert, 2010).

The African sub-regional initiatives demonstrate commitment by governments and civil society towards addressing climate change. Such initiatives include; the African Ministers Conference on Environment (AMCEN) held towards building a common position and voice as Africa, which is taken in the global discussion and negotiations on climate change; the Pan African Climate Justice Alliance (PACJA) a
network of African CSOs which advocate for climate justice and influence the African position on climate change; the East African Community Climate Change Policy responding to the increasing threats of the negative. Climate Change impacts to the development of set targets and goals in the region (Environmental Alert, 2010).

Though earlier approaches to climate changes had focused on mitigation, there is general consensus that climate change is here to stay and is predicted to worsen. What matters is the degree to which systems can adapt to ensure they survive and sustain a high degree of performance. Consequently, development and research approaches to the problem of climate change are getting more focused to climate change adaptation. This is based on the general notion that climate change poses adverse impacts which in absence of effective adaptation mechanisms, affects systems’ performance (Adger 2006; IPCC, 2007; Smit and Wandel, 2006; Isoard et al. 2008).

Uganda’s Climate Change Vulnerability and Impact
Uganda is a landlocked nation with substantial natural resources, including fertile soils and regular rainfall conducive for farming. The country is mainly agrarian, depending on primary production and natural resources. The agricultural sector remain a significant contributor to GDP (24%), export revenues (about 48%) and a source of livelihood for over 70% of the population (Uganda Irrigation Master Plan, 2010). However, Uganda is highly vulnerable to climate change (Thornton et al 2006). Human induced climate change in Uganda has been predicted to increase average temperatures by up to 1.5 ºC in the next 20 years and by up to 4.3 ºC by the 2080s. Such changes bear a detrimental impact on the country’s natural resource base, agricultural production and productivity potential and ultimately curtail sustainable development (MWE, 2018). Consequently, addressing the climate change issue is critical to realization of the Country’s development aspirations.

Floods and landslides remain among the major climate change risks in Uganda (USAID, 2015). The Ministerial statement by members of the Parliamentary Forum on Disaster Risk Reduction and Mitigation in partnership with the Civil Society Budget Advocacy Group and OXFAM Uganda’s National Humanitarian Actors (LNHAs on floods (OXFAM, 2018) paints a picture of the intensity, frequencies and adverse impacts of foods in Uganda between the period 2015 and 2018. According to the statement, Uganda is not flood resistant and experiences catastrophic floods annually. In July 2015, River Nyamwamba in Kasese District, western Uganda, burst its banks for the fourth time in just over three years. In August 2017, heavy rain caused a river to overflow causing flooding in the town of Elegu in Amuru district which depleted the economic livelihoods of 3000 households. In September 2017 about fifteen people died and eight others remained missing after heavy rain triggered floods and landslides in district of Rubanda. In addition, a short period of torrential rain in March, 2018 caused severe flash floods in Mbarara District, western Uganda. Notably, the poor rural farmers remain more vulnerable with minimal or no adaptation. Such shocks deplete economic assets such as crops, livestock and property.

The impact of climate change to agriculture productivity and growth of agriculture is quite evident. Significant crop losses were reported at farm level in 2016 and attributed to climate-related shocks. The Growth of the agricultural sector is reported to have declined from 3.8 percent to 1.5 percent between the period 2004 and 2015. The impact of climate change to the declining performance of Uganda’s agriculture has also been underscored by the UNFCCC report (MWE, 2018). In fact, climate-induced yield losses are predicted to increase to a range of 50-75% by 2050. The potential impact of climate change on the economy
cannot be overemphasized given that the affected agricultural produce such as coffee account for 18% of Uganda’s export earnings. Similar impacts are felt on tea and cotton.

According to the Uganda climate change vulnerability assessment report (USAID, 2013), more vulnerable households are those with: lower proportion of able-bodied (working) members; less educated; headed by females; less likely to sell a portion of their crops or livestock; less access to loans; and minimal participation in community groups. The most affected sub counties include; Bukigai, Nalwanza, Buwali Bukalasi, Bubiita, Bulucheke, Bushiyi, Bushiribo, Bushika and Bududa town Council are more vulnerable (Bududa District Local Government, 2016). The communities face difficulties to adapt despite availability of a range of adaptation options including: use of climate-smart farming practices and technologies such as shifting planting dates, crop rotation, mixed farming, mixed cropping regimes, soil and water conservation and migration as the long-term strategy (USAID, 2013).

Climate change adaptation is inevitable. It is costly but though not to the extent of the cost of none-adaptation. For example, the Economic Assessment of the impacts of climate change in Uganda (MWE, 2015) estimates the cost of climate change adaptation at 3.2% of total government revenues (excluding grants). The cost of none adaptation is 24-46 times greater. Thus in the absence of adaptation actions, climate factors could compromise the Uganda Vision 2040 target of 8% annual growth rate. A vicious circle could be evidenced in absence of effective climate change adaptation. Slow growth economic growth and increased poverty in the face of limited climate change adaptation will mean reduced low adaption capacity and limited adaptation.

The Government of Uganda has demonstrated commitment to address the climate change problem through climate change policies, strategies, action plans, structures and programs. However the framework remains scattered in several documents making it difficult to track and conceptualize. Consequently, it is imperative to consolidate the framework and understand how effectively climate change is addressed in the agricultural sector and identify the critical issues for future actions into framing and advancing the climate change agenda in the context of the agricultural sector. Against this background, this paper addressed the following questions.

i. How is climate change mainstreamed in Uganda’s development programming?
ii. How is climate change adaptation mainstreamed in the regulatory environment for climate change adaptation in the agricultural sector?
iii. How is implementation of climate change adaptation structured in the context of the agricultural sector?
iv. What gaps prevail in the institutional terrain for advancement of climate change adaption in the agricultural sector?

Methodology
Findings in this paper are based on data collected through document review and a case study of Bududa district, representing the local government of climate change adaptation mainstreaming. A critical review of documents highlighting the context of climate change and the adaptation framework in Uganda and the context of agricultural sector was done. Categorically, the relevant documents accessed and reviewed include; climate change policies, plans and adaptation framework at national and district levels.
A case study of Bududa District was undertaken to understand how climate change adaptation is mainstreamed in the agricultural sector programming. Bududa district is located in the Eastern Region of Uganda and is most vulnerable to climate change shock of floods and landslides in the country. It lies between the longitudes of 34° 16’ 18” and 34° 32’ 6.69” East, and latitudes 0° 00’ 58” to 10° 07’ 22.07”. The district lies at an average of 1800m above sea level on the slopes of Mt. Elgon with most vegetation (40%) tropical forests followed by alpine vegetation towards the mountain summit. The district experiences a bimodal type of rainfall with the highest in the first season of March to June and the second normally light, in September to November. The average rainfall is 1800mm per annum, highly supportive to intensive agriculture, which forms the backbone of the District economy. The district has total population 211,683 and 44,861 households of which 96.8% is rural (National Population and Housing Census, 2014). Most households are poor (33%) and 86% depend on subsistence farming for a livelihood. Due to high amount of rainfall, the steep slopes and valleys are vulnerable to hazardous landslides which are recurrent characterized by high intensity and severe impacts on agriculture and rural livelihoods of the farming communities. According to the district multi-hazard, risk and vulnerability profile (UNDP, 2016), Bududa district is highly vulnerable to landslides, and floods reported as the major disasters in the area. There is a high likeliness of occurrence of floods and landslides estimated at 0.3 and 0.2.

Face-to-face interviews were applied to collect qualitative data from key informants. They were selected using purposive sampling with care taken to represent the most relevant stakeholders across diverse categories of key informants or organizations. Consequently, the analysis was able to tap into diversity of stakeholders in mainstreaming climate change adaptation particularly in local governments and in the agricultural sector. The stakeholders include: Political leaders – Local Council V, Local Council III Chairperson, Technocrats Chief Administrative (CAO); Sub county Chiefs & Agricultural Extension Officers (AEOs), Environment and Natural Resources Officer; Technical Committees (District Technical Planning Committee, District Environmental Committees; Disaster Management Committees & Environmental Committees) and Local NGOs and CBOs - Red Cross, Shelters International.

The politicians LCV and LCIII Chairpersons oversee implementation of Government programs, climate change adaptation inclusive. The technocrats Agricultural Extension Officers manages implementation on Agricultural programs including those related with climate change adaptation. The Environment and Natural Resources Officer manages the environmental and natural Resource function or programs. The disaster management committees at district and sub county levels supports implementation of climate change programs. Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Community Based Organizations implement climate change programs and project interventions as well as support the local Government Climate change structures in functions like planning for and evaluation of climate change interventions. The interviews were standardized using an interview guide which was designed with open-ended questions. This ensured probing of respondents to gain a deeper understanding of the issues under study as supported by Creswell (2014). The data was analyzed using content analysis.

Findings
The Institutional Framework for Climate Change in Uganda
The Regulatory Environment for Climate Change

Uganda has made commendable steps in building an institutional framework for addressing climate change. Uganda ratified to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) and the
Kyoto Protocol demonstrating commitment to the adoption and implementation of policies and measures designed to mitigate climate change and adapt to its impacts. Uganda is also a member of the East African Community and therefore bound by the EAC climate change policy which urges Partner States to develop consistent national policies to ensure harmonized action. This demonstrates commitment and obligation to develop and implement strategies at local and national levels to contribute to the overall goal of combating climate change. This leverages the current national framework to address climate change and its impacts.

At country level, addressing climate change is flagged off in the country’s National Development agenda; vision 2040 and the National Development Plan 2016-2021 (GOU, 2012). This framework is the blueprint for long-term development towards realization of sustainable economic and social development. The development agenda identifies agriculture among the sectors which are likely to be more affected by climate change impacts and consequently provides for integration of climate change adaptation measures in agriculture programming at sectoral and local government levels. The development agenda provides strategies for management of climate change including: addressing the legal and institutional frameworks necessary for the implementation of the UNFCCC; multi-stakeholder involvement in tackling the climate change issue; ensuring adequate resources for effective implementation of the committed strategies. Mainstreaming climate change adaptation in Agricultural programs and projects including: the National Agricultural Advisory Services among others.

In 2015, the National Climate Change Policy (NCCP) was developed to ensure a harmonized and coordinated approach towards a climate-resilient and low-carbon development path for sustainable development in Uganda. The NCCP’s sets to address key concerns of climate change adaptation and mitigation giving priority to climate change adaptation over mitigation. It provides a clearly defined pathway for dealing with the challenges of climate change within the socio-economic context of Uganda. The Uganda’s Climate Change Policy provides for a decentralized framework for implementation of the climate change agenda. The Local Governments are to address climate change as an urgent issue of district interests as it is at national level (MWE, 2015). The policy charges District Local Governments with the role of implementing climate change programs at all levels of local governance. This framework is entrenched in the legislative framework of decentralization as provided by the Local Government Statute of 1993, the 1995 Constitution, the Local Government Act, 1997 and Uganda’s Climate Change Policy, 2015 devolves the responsibility for providing services from central ministries to the district level (MWE, 2015).

In 2016 the NAP-Ag Framework was developed with adaptation strategies contextualized into different agro-ecological zones. A budget circular call (BCC) was issued by the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development (MoFPED), requiring the mandatory mainstreaming of climate change into all sectoral budget framework papers and district local government plans, starting with fiscal year of 2017/18 (FAO, 2011; 2016). In 2018, the Uganda National Climate Change Communication Strategy (UNCCCS) 2017-2021 was developed. The strategy outlines a comprehensive action plan that should be followed while communicating about climate change issues in Uganda. It addresses existing gap in communication, coordination, and dissemination of climate change adaptation and mitigation information (FAO, 2016).

Uganda’s Land Use Policy-2011 recognizes the impact of climate change, especially in exacerbating the already degraded, fragile natural ecosystem. Through the policy, the government intends to address climate change mitigation and adaptation by: a) mainstreaming sustainable management of the environment and natural resources in its plans and programs; b) putting in place climatic change adaptation strategies to
reduce impact on people and the economy and c) developing a framework for compliance with all international climate change commitments. These activities are expected to be spearheaded by Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development. However, provision, most of the Local Governments rarely plan for climate change adaptation and where these plans exist, they are hardly monitored, implemented or evaluated as required by the national policy framework on Climate Change Adaptation (MWE, 2013).

**Climate Change Management and Implementation Structures**

Management and implementation of the climate change Agenda engages structures at national and local levels. A summary of the structures is outlined in table 1.

**Table 1: Management and Implementation of the Climate Change Agenda: Key Structures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholders in subsidiary ministries and supporting institutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>o Ministry of Water and Environment (MOWE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development (MOFPED)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Ministry of Agriculture Animal Industry and Fisheries (MAAIF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Ministry of Local Government (MOLG)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Ministry of Lands and Environment (MOLE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o National Agriculture <strong>Research Organization</strong> (NARO)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lead Government Departments’ staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>o MWE Climate change unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Climate change policy committee,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o The Climate Change Task Force of MAAIF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change Policy Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supporting International Development Agencies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>o Food Agriculture Organization (FAO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o United States Agency for International Development (USAID)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o United Nations Development Program (UNDP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Federal Department of International Development (DFID)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Government climate change stakeholders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>o Political leaders – Local Council V, Local Council III Chairperson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Technocrats Chief Administrative (CAO), Sub county Chiefs &amp; Agricultural Extension Officers (AEOs), Environment and Natural Resources Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Technical Committees (District Technical Planning Committee, District Environmental Committee, Disaster Management Committees &amp; Environmental Committees)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Local NGOs and CBOs- Red Cross, Shelters International, Office of the Prime Minister (OPM)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Ministry of Water and Environment is the national coordinating body for climate change issues in Uganda. It manages implementation of climate change adaptation and mitigation interventions. It is supported by five ministries. The MOFPED finances and monitors climate change implementation interventions funded through the ministry. MAAIF manages implementation of climate change adaptation interventions related with agriculture since the sector is among the most vulnerable to climate change shocks. Under the decentralized model of Governance in Uganda, the MOLG provides oversight to climate change programs within the Local Governments, Bududa District inclusive. NARO is a mother research organization which conducts research, develops, disseminates and supports adoption of modern
agricultural technologies including those which are climate-smart or climate –resistant. The Ministry of Lands and Environment works and environment implements and oversees interventions towards soil and environmental conservation.

The key International development agencies which have mainstreamed climate change adaptation into their Uganda country programs include; UNDP, FAO, USAID and DFID. Forexample, UNDP coordinates inter agency responses on climate change adaptation. Funds from the Global Environmental Facility (GEF are channeled through UNDP. UNDP also pioneered and supports implementation of the Climate change National Adaptation Policy Actions (NAPA). It also takes lead on implementation of the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 13 on climate change. FAO provides implementation support to national and local projects designed specifically to address climate change adaptation, climate-related disaster risk management or a combination of adaptation and mitigation. Specifically, FAO supported development of the institutional framework for climate change adaptation in agriculture in Uganda and led the preparation of the country’s National Adaptation Plan (NAP) framework. USAID funds research on climate change adaptation the latest is being the 2013 Uganda Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment. Together with DFID, USAID also funded a study on costs of climate change in Uganda. USAID also funds capacity building interventions for climate change adaptation through programs such as “enabling environment for agriculture activity”. DFID is implementing a project called NUTEC which is specifically implemented in Bududa district.

Notably, the above ministries and international agencies have designated persons in-charge of climate change adaptation which will be of interest in informing the study. For instance; the climate change advisor at DFID; the Team leader–Climate change and energy at UNDP; the Program Manager for Climate Change at FAO; the Commissioner for Climate Change within the Climate Change department at the MWE; and the Climate desk Officer at the MOFEPD. At local government level, climate change stakeholders include: political leaders (Local Council V and Local Council III Chairpersons); Technocrats including; the Chief Administrative (CAO), Sub county Chiefs, Agricultural Extension Officers (AEOs), Environment and Natural Resources Officer. In addition, there are technical committees including; the District Technical Planning Committee, the Environmental Committee as well as Disaster Management Committee at district and sub-county levels.

The LCV and LCIII Chairpersons oversee implementation of Government programs, climate change adaptation inclusive The Environment and Natural Resources Officer manages the environmental and natural Resource function or programs. The Agricultural Extension Officers manages implementation on Agricultural programs including those related with climate change adaptation. The disaster management committees at district and sub county levels supports implementation of climate change programs. Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Community Based Organizations implement climate change programs and project interventions as well as support the local Government Climate change structures in functions like planning for and evaluation of climate change interventions.

**Climate Change Mainstreaming in the Agricultural Sector**

Mainstreaming climate change adaptation in the agricultural sector is flagged off in the Uganda’s climate change policy which identifies agriculture among the priority sectors given its high vulnerability to climate change and significance to the country’s development. Specific emphasis is put on climate change adaptation strategies that enhance resilient, productive and sustainable agricultural systems; and promoting
value addition, improving food storage and management systems in order to ensure food security at all times as a factor of resilience. The policy underscores the need to support research and development, transfer and diffusion of climate-smart technology and information to better understand the impacts of climate change (MWE, 2015).

The policy recognizes agriculture among the key priority sectors in addressing climate change adaptation and sets out agricultural sector climate change adaptation priorities. They are; expanding extension services, climate-smart agriculture, livestock and crop enterprise diversification, value-addition post-harvest handling and storage, markets and access to finance, rangeland management, research on climate resilient crops and animal breeds, as well as value addition and irrigation infrastructure. The key players supporting implementation of these sector priorities include; the National Agricultural Research Organization (NARO), universities and private research organizations, national programs such as the National Agricultural Advisory Service (NAADS) and operation Wealth Creation, NGOs and CBOs (USAID, 2013; MWE, 2016). MAAIF is charged with management of climate change adaptation interventions in the agricultural sector. Notably however, the interventions towards climate change adaptation necessitate financial investment yet farmers have limited access to finance. Agricultural insurance which would potentially promote financing of adaptation measures (Amador-Ramirez, 2007; Aidoo et al., 2014), is loosely advanced as a climate change mitigation strategy particularly in the context of farming communities which are more vulnerable to climate risk hazards. Institutionalization of agricultural insurance in climate change adaptation and its advancement in the climate change vulnerable communities necessitates empirical exploration. Limited advancement of agricultural insurance in climate change adaptation will compromise efforts to create resilient communities in the face of climate change.

**Institutional Structures for Climate Change Adaptation**

Among the stakeholders supporting national efforts include: Climate Action Network Uganda (CAN-U), a coalition of non-governmental organizations advocating for Climate adaptation justice in Uganda; the Department of Meteorology within the Ministry of Water and Environment which coordinates climate change activity for the MWE in its capacity as the National Focal Point for Climate Change under the UNFCCC; the Ministry of Health and Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development which finances climate change adaptation budgets across ministries and sectors; the Commission on Disaster Management & Refugees (CDMR) under the Office of the Prime Minister coordinating an effective response to climate induced disasters such as droughts and floods; the Directorate of Water Resources Management and Directorate of Water Development within the Ministry of Water and Environment. Specific to the Agricultural sector, the National Agricultural Research Organization and universities such as Makerere conduct research developing climate-smart technologies such as risk resistant varieties and water resources management technologies. Agricultural extension organizations particularly the Ministry of Agriculture Animal Industry and Fisheries, the National Agricultural Advisory Service (NAADS) and Operation Wealth Creation work with the Local Government Agricultural Extension structures and NGOs to institutionalize, promote adoption and replicate the technologies. They also extend information, credit services, agricultural financing and agricultural insurance services to farmers (USAID, 2013). However, how the technologies and services are being accessed by farmers, how they influence farmers’ adaptive capacity and emerging constraints in the context of adaptation to climate change induced floods and landslides in Bududa district is yet to be understood. In addition, there is paucity of knowledge regarding the coordination and interactions between agricultural extension, research organizations and local
communities to tap into local knowledge, innovations and technologies towards building more sustainable adaptive capacity.

Case Study Findings: Mainstreaming Climate Change Adaptation Agricultural Programming at Local Government Level

Results of the study showed that Bududa district local government does not periodically undertake periodic planning of climate change adaptation. Climate Change adaptation is loosely mainstreamed into the district programming. Climate change adaptation was underscored in the vision of Bududa District Local Government “to have a prosperous and democratic society in a sustainable environment” though on the contrary stakeholders did not perceive climate change adaptation as central to the vision. This variance signifies insufficient knowledge of the district strategic positioning regarding climate among some stakeholders. The other gap was that the institutional programming was adhoc and focused more on disaster management in times of disasters like landslides rather than the required integrated/institutionalized processes of planning, implementing and evaluation. In addition, there are no specific and stand-alone policies, plans and byelaws towards promoting climate change adaptation. Further to note, there was no evidence of mainstreaming climate change adaptation programming across the different district departments and at the relevant lower level local government structures. While effective climate change programming would necessitate an institutionalized framework for developing abilities of staff in climate change, the district had no institutionalized training plan specific for stakeholders in climate change. The district- level intended actions on staffing, budget and policy frameworks were not responsive to climate change adaptation processes contrary to the requirement under the Uganda Climate Change Policy, 2015 and the Uganda Climate Change Plan of Action. In attest, one of the respondents had this to say;

“One of the problems is that the budget process is often guided by the indicative planning figures yet as a District, we do not have special budget codes or the authority to include critical climate change adaptation that the community will have identified”

Though the identified institutional capacity gaps can be explained by many factors, low level of budget support from the central government, the rural and hard to reach nature of the district appeared more critical. Interviews revealed that the district does not make sufficient budget allocation for climate change adaptation and quite often the budget does not address key priorities of the district for climate change adaptation. The district budget formulation process rarely picks out critical areas of support needed towards climate change adaptation. Arguably, funding is critical to support efforts towards building a competent human resource and institutional framework for effective climate change programming.

Notably however, positive signs of improvement towards strengthening the institutional capacity for climate change adaptation programming were noticed. It was evident that the district leadership team was committed to creating an enabling environment that could galvanize district intended actions that support local climate change adaptation. The district developed a contingency plan for disaster risk reduction (DRR) to major challenges of unreliable weather pattern caused by global weather change. Further interviews revealed that the district in close collaboration and coordination with the Office of the Prime Minister (OPM) and the District Disaster Management Focal Persons routinely collects data using GIS with the aim of identifying the various hazards ranging from drought, floods, landslides, human, animal and crop diseases, pests, wildlife animal attacks, earthquakes, fires and conflicts among others. It was through this
process that the district developed the district Multi-Hazard, Risk and Vulnerability Profile in 2016. These documents provide vital evidence to inform periodic programming for climate change adaptation.

In addition, the five-year District Development Plan mirrors the strategic alignment of the District Local Government programs to the intended district level actions as provided for within the provisions of the law. A case in point is the participatory process for the integration of climate change adaptation plans for the lower local governments and other development partners into the district strategic plan which was being followed as required by the broader National adaptation Policy and Actions (NAPA). This provides an opportunity for stakeholders’ engagement as well as justifies any potential initiatives to support capacity building towards effective stakeholder engagement in climate change programming.

The significance of strategic positioning to climate change adaptation at Local Government level is consistent with Matthews, et al. (2012) who consider strategic alignment as a key success factor for climate change adaptation because it enables local authorities to access a wider range of resources and to develop mutual benefits with other local projects that address climate change challenges. Burton et al., (2006) shares a similar view that for adaptation efforts and activities need to be well directed, they must be guided and supported by policies and strategies developed by the leadership teams of affected areas.

**Conclusions**

Significant steps have been taken to mainstream climate change adaptation in agricultural programming and interventions are geared towards expanding extension services, climate-smart agriculture, livestock and crop enterprise diversification, value-addition post-harvest handling and storage, markets and access to finance, rangeland management, research on climate resilient crops and animal breeds, as well as value addition and irrigation infrastructure. Notably however, adoption of such interventions necessitates capital resources yet farmers are poor with limited access to agricultural finance/credit. Agricultural insurance which would foster access to finance is loosely advanced as a climate change mitigation strategy particularly in the context of farming communities which are more vulnerable to climate risk hazards. Climate change adaptation is loosely mainstreamed in local government programming despite the policy provisions. There are critical institutional capacity gaps which are hinged on low level of budget support from the central government towards climate change adaption in local governments. In the context of agricultural programming, the budget allocation towards expanding extension services, climate-smart agriculture, livestock and crop enterprise diversification, value-addition post-harvest handling and storage, markets and access to finance is quite limited. Generally, district local governments were observed to make insufficient budget allocation for climate change adaptation in terms of addressing the key priorities.

**Recommendations**

The Ministry of Agriculture Animal and Fisheries in collaboration with Ministry of Water and Environment as well as Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development need to institutionalize agricultural insurance in climate change adaptation with focus on the farming communities which are more vulnerable to climate change hazards. However effective institutionalization of agricultural insurance will necessitate further research to identify the potential, opportunities and challenges of advancing agriculture as a robust climate change adaptation strategy in Uganda. Effective mainstreaming of climate change adaptation in agricultural programming in local governments will necessitate increased budget support from the central government towards capacity building of local government climate change structures for effective climate change adaptation programming. The budget should be target to finance key priorities areas for climate change adaptation.
change adaptation in the specific contexts on Local governments. Capacity building will foster districts’ ability to plan, monitor and evaluate climate change adaptation initiatives.

References
Environmental Alert (2010). Climate Change in Uganda: Insights for Long Term Adaptation and Building Community Resilience
Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations (2016). Integrating Agriculture in National Adaptation Plans (NAP-Ag) Inception Report, Kampala, Uganda
file:///C:/Users/DELL/Desktop/Articles/doc%202013%20USAID%20Uganda%20Vulnerability%20Assessment%20Report%202013.pdf
Public Participation and Community Development in Uganda: A case study of Kawempe Division

Mohamed Yusuf Damei

Islamic University in Uganda (IUIU)-Kampala

Corresponding E-Mail: daameey4@gmail.com

Abstract

Public participation has been a constant theme in community for a very long time, due to the fact it has become central to the development community projects and programs as a means to seek sustainability and equity, particularly the poor. The purpose of this study was to investigate the relationship between public participation and community development in Kawempe Division – KCCA. The study adopted a correlational research design which involved collection of quantitative data. Quantitative data was collected by closed ended questionnaires. The study focused on a sample of 150 respondents, who were selected from a total population of 242 respondents. Data collected was edited, coded and then entered in the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS version 20.0). The results of the study indicated that there is statistically significant a positive significant relationship between community empowerment and community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division (r=0.192, p<0.05); there is statistically significant a positive significant relationship between decision making and community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division (r=0.283, p<0.01) and there is statistically significant a positive significant relationship between citizen ownership and community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division (r=0.296, p<0.01).

The researcher recommended that KCCA Kawempe Division. The government should encourage people to identify and brings their own projects in order to empower local citizens through investment. The community members should be involved from the start to the end of the projects and they should not just dislocate people from the original areas to develop the place just because they want to develop the area. There is also need by the government to encourage community to protect and monitoring their own projects in Kawempe division.

Keywords: Kampala Capital City Authority (KCCA), Public Participation, Community Development

Introduction

In the recent past, participation has been used as a tool for local community development as a result of it provides a way for facilitating consultation, involving staff and giving them a voice in health and safety matters of their community (Walters, 2012). For more than two centuries now, the concept of local community involvement in the development process has been an significant idea. The politician and government are now encouraging local public authorities to engage individuals in procedures of growth. It thinks that individuals must be involved in development procedures in order to attain viable growth in the country / community (Njunwa, 2010). Likewise in Uganda the government has made efforts to promote public participatory development in accordance with its decentralization process (Patrick, 2016).

With regard to the above statements, many counties have began to embrace the concept of participation, for instance, in countries such as the United Kingdom, as in many other areas of the globe, the involvement of community officials, voluntary organizations, neighborhood residents and municipal associations in policy choices affecting their life and in the design and implementation of services has risen, especially at the local level (Oll, L., Mar, E., Clara, F., Serrano, L., Moncada, S., & Rovira, J. B, 2014). Public participation has been used as a tool for local community development because it provides a means to facilitate consultation, involve employees and give them a voice in their community's health and safety issue (Walters, et al 2012). For example, in Zimbabwe, community representatives were educated on how to construct Ecosan (ecological sanitation) units, and community members and members of the family supplied work. In buildings and schools, Ecosan units were constructed. The organisation supplied building material and community builders were trained and temporarily employed for the duration of the project (Hewlett, 2010).
Participation strategy is a way of articulating the advantages of involvement of stakeholders in community growth. Because of the reality that there is still a lack of significant involvement, it could not reap the real advantages of stakeholder involvement in the sustainability of initiatives promoted for community development (Kayima, 2015). Still, despite the efforts to implement community programs and projects with the help of public participatory approach in accordance with its decentralization process the impact on Kawempe division in terms community development is not fully recognized and needs to be evaluated in this study. The main purpose of this study is to examine the relationship between public participation and community development in Kawempe Division, KCCA. The study has three specific objectives which are:

i. To examine the relationship between community empowerment and community development in Kawempe division-KCCA.

ii. To establish the relationship between decision-making and community development in Kawempe Division-KCCA.

iii. To examine the relationship between citizen ownership and community development in Kawempe division-KCCA.

Public Participation and Community Development Concepts

Participation an active process which is recipients affects the expected results of the community program and achieves personal development. In addition, participation involves the design, implementation and evaluation of programs and the sharing of advantages (Rifkin & Kangere, 2002). Although many individuals question its importance, other individuals think it is the 'magic bullet' for community development, particularly in the context of poverty eradication, education, and growth of health and infrastructure. Despite this absence of consensus, involvement as a main asset to community growth has continued to be promoted (World Bank, 1996). Defines Participation as an active process in which expected beneficiaries affect the results of the program and achieve personal growth. In addition, participation involves the design, implementation and evaluation of programs and the sharing of advantages (Rifkin & Kangere, 2002).

Therefore the concept Community participation has long been a steady theme in the community, as it has become essential to community development initiatives and programs as a means of achieving sustainability and equity, especially for the poor Samah (Samah & Aref, 2011). Hence Planners and executives need to agree as quickly as possible on the contribution of community involvement to community development in terms of poverty eradication, education, health and infrastructure growth, and address the confusion about involvement.

The concept of global community development involves deliberate collection activities aimed at improving social, financial, physical and environmental well-being, maintaining precious elements of the geographic area's culture. In Western nations in particular, the U.S., Europe, and Canada emphasize residential stock's durability and adaptability as a significant community development subject. Whereas in developing nations such as Uganda, their focus is on war, illnesses, famine, ignorance, extreme poverty, infrastructure development and climate change that can threaten human life and social organisation at such a fundamental level that community development must concentrate mainly on assisting individuals overcome those threats to stability. More so, Also known as community economic development, community development is multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary thinking. Many models and techniques have been created by practitioners and academics representing disciplines such as urban planning, social work, rural sociology, government health and international development (Butterfield & Korazim, 2007).

Community development can be defined as a process where members of the community come together to take collective action and solve common problems. The well-being of the community (financial, social,
environmental and cultural) often results from this sort of collective action at the grassroots level. Hence, Community development concerns people's involvement in the problems that influence their life, which is their own participation). By enabling local individuals to speak in community development, involvement can foster better financial choices and opinions in their own setting and conditions (Kelly & Van Vlaenderen 2005). For that reason, there is need to understand the realities of community participation in community development in order to confront effectively community developmental issues in Kawempe division as case study.

**Conceptual Framework**
The conceptual framework shows the relation between independent variable (public participation) and the dependent variable (Community Development).

**Figure 1.1: Conceptual Framework**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>INDEPENDENT VARIABLE</strong></th>
<th><strong>DEPENDENT VARIABLE</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PARTICIPATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decision making</td>
<td>H1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Citizen ownership</td>
<td>H2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Community empowerment</td>
<td>H3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COMMUNITY DEV'T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Education &amp; literacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Health &amp; Nutrition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Economic livelihood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Food security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Water, environment &amp;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sanitation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Researcher, 2019*

From the above conceptual framework, community participation indicated by involvement in decision making, citizen ownership and community empowerment herein referred to as the independent variable is assumed to impact community development the dependent variable seen in the increase in income, improvement in health, nutrition, education and literacy status of the populations hence socioeconomic development in areas of food security, education and literacy, health and nutrition, water and environment, and economic livelihoods participation and community development.

**Methodology**

**Research Design**
The researcher was employed a correlational research design. The choice of correlational research design in this study was informed by the fact that, the general objective of the study was to examine the contribution of each one the independent variables on the dependent variable. This is based on Oso and Onen (2008). The design was appropriate because the main interest is to explore the viable relationship and describe how the factors support matters under investigations using quantitative approaches.

**Study Population**
The population refers to the entire group of people, events, or things of interest that the researcher wishes to investigate (Kothari, 2005). Therefore the target population of the study was 242 respondents and these was include 1 Town Clerk of Kwempe division KCCA, 3 staff supervisors, 5 Word administrators, 3 Community Development Officers, 30 KCCA Kawempe division officers and 200 selected from local
community members. These people were selected because they are believed to sufficient information
Public participation and community development in Kawempe Division – KCCA.

Sample Size
According to Kothari (2005), a sample is a small group of the universe taken as the representative of a
whole. Sampling is necessary because population interest is large, diverse and scattered over a large
geographic area. In this study, sample size was 150 respondents selected from a total population of 242
individuals using Sloven’s formula.

Data Collection
Research data was collected in Jun and July 2019 through questionnaire. Quantitative data was collected
by closed ended questionnaires. The study focused on a sample of 150 respondents who were selected from
a total population of 242 individuals. Data collected was edited, coded and then entered in the Statistical
Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) program version no.20. Using the SPSS, Pearson’s correlation analysis
was used to establish the relationship between each of the public participation and community development
in Kawempe Division – KCCA.

Result
Descriptive Statistics for Demographic Variables
Descriptive statistics were used to evaluate the data in the first part of the survey. The tables include
frequency information age, marital status, education levels and Experience level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4.1 Demographic of the Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-1 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-3 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-5 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-7 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-9 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The first part of respondents were male and female, the majority of the respondents were male 82 (54.7) remaining 68 (45.3) were females. The findings imply that most of the respondents were males who took part in this survey. The respondents were asked to indicate ranges from 19 to above 50 ages, the ages between 19-25 which had 41(27.3%), are the most age holds those positions in Uganda Kampala, which had a response rate of between 26-30 44(29.3%). The third ages between 31-35 which had 21(14.0); The fourth ages between 36-41 which had 22(14.7); the five ages are above 42-46 above, which had 13(8.7%). The level of education the respondent categorized certificate, diploma, bachelor, and master degree and others. Master degree which respondent rate 9 (6.0%), the second respondents were bachelor degree which respondent rate 50(33.3%) and the third respondents were diploma which respondent rate 37(24.7), the four respondents were certificate which respondent rate 34(22.7%) and the five respondents were others which respondent rate 20(13.3).

The experience level of the sample ranges from less the one year to 9 years. Majority of the sample with 47 people has one year to three years (31.3%), where 31 people have 3-5 years of experience (20.7%), where 29 people have 7-9 years of experience (19.3%) and where 21 people have 0-1 years of experience (14.0%) 22 have 5-7 years of experience (14.7 %).

**Descriptive Statistics: Objective One Community Empowerment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The local governent empowers local citizens to identify and make relevant decisions regarding investment within their areas</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community empowerment helps to boost the internal strengths of local communities and the interface between communities and public authorities, services and governance</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community empowerment promotes change in power structures that improve on the well-being of people in Kawempe</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community empowerment through communication encourages critical thinking which enables communities to understand the challenges operating on their lives, and helps them take their own decisions</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community members in Kawempe are adequately empowered to demand for developmental services from their leaders</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Primary Data (2019)*

The finding in table 4.5 the fist question revealed that the local governent empowers local citizens to identify and make relevant decisions regarding investment within their areas since the majority of the
respondents (32.7%) agreed with the argument. The second question revealed that majority of the respondents (42.7%) agreed that community empowerment helps to boost the internal strengths of local communities and the interface between communities and public authorities, services and governance in the district. The third question revealed that the highest proportion of respondents (40.7%) agreed that community empowerment promotes change in power structures that improve on the well-being of people in Kawempe. This implies that local government promotes change of the power structure and improves well-being of people in the district. The fourth question revealed that the majority of the respondents (42.7%) agreed that community empowerment through communication encourages critical thinking which enables communities to understand the challenges operating on their lives, and helps them take their own decisions. The fifth question found out that majority of the respondents (36.0%) strongly agreed that community members in Kawempe are adequately empowered to demand for developmental services from their leaders.

4.3 Descriptive Statistics: Objective Two Decision Making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The local government structure of Kawempe provides opportunities for community participation in health planning and decision making</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community members in Kawempe are involved in defining their sociertal problems and their active engagement is often essential to the delivery of solutions to these problems</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An active participation of community members in the decision-making process in Kawempe signifies trust and transparency in service delivery</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community engagement in decision making through governance strengthens their local capacities in order to realize social, educational, cultural and scientific development strategies</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging community members in decision making provides an efficient better planning framework in Kawempe division</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary Data (2019)

The finding in table 4.7 the first question revealed that the local government structure of Kawempe provides opportunities for community participation in health planning and decision making since the majority of the respondents (35.3%) agreed with the argument. The second question revealed that majority of the respondents (36.0%) agreed that Community members in Kawempe are involved in defining their sociertal problems and their active engagement is often essential to the delivery of solutions to these problems in the district. The third question revealed that the highest proportion of respondents (27.3%) agreed that an active participation of community members in the decision-making process in Kawempe signifies trust and
transparency in service delivery in Kawempe. The fourth question revealed that the majority of the respondents (31.3%) strongly agreed that Community engagement in decision making through governance strengthens their local capacities in order to realize social, educational, cultural and scientific development strategies. The fifth question found out that majority of the respondents (36.7%) strongly agreed that engaging community members in decision making provides an efficient better planning framework in Kawempe division.

**Descriptive Statistics: Objective Three Citizen Ownership**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The sense of Community ownership supports growing community projects in kawempe</td>
<td>5 (3.3%)</td>
<td>7 (4.7%)</td>
<td>16 (10.7%)</td>
<td>73 (48.7%)</td>
<td>49 (32.7%)</td>
<td>150 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community ownership of projects provides solutions to the problems of accessing credit and capital in community markets in kawempe</td>
<td>5 (3.3%)</td>
<td>15 (10.0%)</td>
<td>20 (13.3%)</td>
<td>59 (39.3%)</td>
<td>51 (34.0%)</td>
<td>150 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community ownership of projects enhances work productivity of community members</td>
<td>6 (4.0%)</td>
<td>16 (8.0%)</td>
<td>16 (10.7%)</td>
<td>63 (42.0%)</td>
<td>53 (35.3%)</td>
<td>150 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community ownership encourages transparent communication of information voluntarily about community development i.e. market information</td>
<td>5 (3.3%)</td>
<td>12 (8.0%)</td>
<td>22 (14.7%)</td>
<td>61 (40.7%)</td>
<td>50 (33.3%)</td>
<td>150 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community ownership encourages greater participation in decision-making and monitoring of community projects</td>
<td>10 (6.7%)</td>
<td>9 (6.0%)</td>
<td>26 (17.3%)</td>
<td>49 (32.7%)</td>
<td>56 (37.3%)</td>
<td>150 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Primary Data (2019)*

The finding in table 4.9 the first question revealed that the sense of Community ownership supports growing community projects in kawempe since the majority of the respondents (48.7%) agreed with the argument. The second question revealed that majority of the respondents (39.3%) agreed that Community ownership of projects provides solutions to the problems of accessing credit and capital in community markets in the district. The third question revealed that the highest proportion of respondents (42.0%) agreed that Community ownership of projects enhances work productivity of community members in the district. The fourth question revealed that the majority of the respondents (40.7%) agreed that Community ownership encourages transparent communication of information voluntarily about community development i.e. market information. The fifth question found out that majority of the respondents (37.3%) strongly agreed that Community ownership encourages greater participation in decision-making and monitoring of community projects in Kawempe division.

**Correlations**

As shown in table 4.5, the relationship between public participation and community development is investigated using Spearman’s correlation. a significant with positive and relationship between public participation and community development.
The result further indicated a significant with positive and relationship between public participation and community development (r = 0.278, \( P < 0.001 \)); However, the below result (table 4.5) supported the hypothesis of the study which was there are positive relationship between community empowerment and community development there is significance relationship decision making and community development. There is significance relationship between citizen ownership and community development.

**Discussion**

The purpose of this study was to investigate the relationship between public participation and community development in Kawempe Division – KCCA. The study also has three objectives; the first objective was to examine the relationship between community empowerment and community development in Kawempe division-KCCA. The second objective was to establish the relationship between decision-making and community development in Kawempe Division-KCCA. The third objective was to examine the relationship between citizen ownership and community development in Kawempe division-KCCA.

The study found out that there is a positive significant relationship between community empowerment and community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division (r=0.192, \( P<0.05 \)). The study reveals that there is a positive significant relationship between decision making and community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division (r=0.283, \( P<0.01 \)). The study further found out that there is a positive significant relationship between citizen ownership and community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division (r=0.296, \( P<0.01 \)). The findings of this study in line with the view of study conducted in Tanzania the concept local community participation in development process has been an important concept for more than two decades now. The politician and the government are now encouraging the Local Government Authorities to involve people in development processes. It believes that for the country/community to achieve sustainable development there must be people participation in development processes (Njunwa, 2010).

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

The study found out that public participation is a positive significant related with community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division. It was established that community empowerment was significantly related with community development, decision making and citizen ownership were also significantly related with community development programmes in KCCA Kawempe division. Meanwhile, the strength of the relationship between the study variable was observed not to be strong enough though it was significant, therefore the study conclude that people need more participation for all community development programmes that carry out in KCCA Kawempe division. The major recommendations are:

**Table 4.5: Correlation Matrix Analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Public participation</th>
<th>Community Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spearman’s rho</td>
<td>Public participation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coefficient</td>
<td>.278**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Correlation</td>
<td>.278**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coefficient</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
The government should encourage people to identify and bring their own projects in order to empower local citizens through investment.

The community members should be involved from the start to the end of the projects and they should not just dislocate people from the original areas to develop the place just because they want to develop the area.

There is also need by the government to encourage community to protect and monitoring their own projects in Kawempe division.

Reference


Addressing Health Inequity through Community Based Education Students’ Projects

Ndaruhatse, G.R., Nkata, J.L., & Nestel, D.

1 Mbarara University Science & Technology
2 Uganda Management Institute

Corresponding E-Mail: gruzaza@must.ac.ug/ gadruzaaza@yahoo.co.uk

Abstract

Relevant health professions education is vital for improvements in health and health care access, yet the challenge to sustain equitable access to improved health and healthcare, particularly to those most in need remains a major global challenge. The Community Based Education (CBE) approach first emerged during the 1970’s in response to population demand for needs-based education. The contribution students can make to delivery of health services, however, is not widely documented particularly for CBE in Africa. Literature denotes progression of curricula to embrace students’ projects and co-learning. Documentary analysis was used to review MUST students’ CBE reports of the five most recent years with a checklist. The findings were analyzed thematically by employing content analysis. The analysis revealed how CBE students’ projects contribute to mitigation of health service constraints of access, acceptability and affordability. In regard to access, students increased the range of services provided at the health facility. They promoted acceptability of health services through enhancing community participation and community – health facility interface. By providing services at no additional cost, students contribute to affordability of health services.

Key words: Community Based Education, health professions, Health Inequity

Introduction

Educational preparation is a key factor in the sustainability of healthcare practice (curan & rourke, 2004). Community Based Education (CBE) and service-learning have been part of health professions curricula since the ’70s. The contribution students make to service delivery is not widely documented and remains unmeasured, particularly for CBE in Africa (Mbalinda Etal (2004,); Omotara (2004). Medical education is in a continual state of evolution and change and has difficulty in adapting to the rapidly changing healthcare systems. This paper presents issues and experiences from Mbarara University Of Science And Technology (MUST).

This paper is anchored in the MUST< Faculty of Medicine CBE Model, that provided the nexus for phd research by the main author. The MUST CBE Program began shortly after the university was established in 1989 as a community-based university. By then, the program lasted for one week at one local health center with a handful of medical students. All students participated as the intake was only 34 students. Currently, the program places about 400 students from Medicine, Nursing Science, Laboratory Science and Pharmacy in more than 50 Rural Health facilities for periods of 4-8 weeks annually. Participating students write and present group reports. The focus of the study was to explore the effect of CBE students’ projects on equitable health service delivery.

Methods

Documentary analysis was used to review must students’ cbe reports of the five most recent years using a checklist. The checklist included the student project objective and focus, the identified community challenge, nature of the intervention and the results of the project. A criterion for inclusion of the projects was geographical location and distance from mbarara city. Sites were grouped into four categories / clusters: sites within 50kms distance from mbarara city formed cluster i, 50-100 kms away cluster ii, 100-150 kms cluster iii and above 150 kms from mbarara cluster IV. Furthermore, the reports were reviewed basing on the following headings: project identification number, year, number of students, location, identified needs, context, aims / objectives, evaluation, outcomes and issues of equity.
The findings were analyzed thematically by employing content analysis (Neuendorf, 2002). Analysis was undertaken within each cluster and across the four clusters for comparison. The findings below are presented chronologically and thematically.

Results

The documentary analysis established that cbe students’ projects mitigate health service constraints of access, acceptability and affordability. In regard to access, students contribute to shortening of the patient waiting time at the health facilities, increase the range of available health services and provide required up to date health promotion information. Students promote acceptability of health services through enhancing community participation and promotion of community – health facility interface. By providing services at no additional cost such as review of health data, information dissemination and participation in clinical care students contribute to affordability of health services. Below detailed findings are provided according to each cluster:

Table 3.1: Summary of findings from Reviewed Students’ CBE Reports indicating CBE Activities and Equity Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location of Sites</th>
<th>Context and aspects from Community Needs Assessment</th>
<th>CBE Activities</th>
<th>Outcomes and issues of Equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Within 50 Kms (Ruhiira, Kinoni, Ruhooko, Bwizibwera)</td>
<td>During 2010, there were myths and misconceptions, inadequate mobilization and knowledge at community level. By 2011 there was low male involvement in antenatal care services and inadequate communication between the health facility staff and the community. By 2013 in Ruhooko there was poor sanitation and hygiene, worm infestation in the community. Inadequate community health education, myths. During 2014, there was a decrease of homesteads with unsafe water. Within communities, there was inadequate access to information on health promotion and disease prevention at Bwizibwera.</td>
<td>Students learnt how to conduct a community diagnosis. Immunization, antenatal care, health education to patients, home visiting, patient care and community based information dissemination were undertaken.</td>
<td>Students contributed to building family planning capacity. By 2011, mothers delivering from Kinoni Health Centre IV increased significantly. Within the community, there was enhanced utilization of the health facility by mothers. The interventions carried out increased the percentage of homes with safe drinking, safe sanitation from 33.3% to 60% in a month in Ruhooko. Immunization coverage increased from 55.5% to 65.0% in Bwizibwera.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-100 Kms (KazoBukinda, Kyabugimbi)</td>
<td>By 2010, only 20% of the target number of deliveries was delivering at the health facility. Fear of routine HIV/AIDS check, lack of emergency obstetric services / surgery and inadequate supplies. During 2011, at Bukinda, the focus was to reduce the percentage of homesteads with mosquito breeding grounds from 75% to 50%; By 2012 in Bukinda, there was need to increase the percentage of households with access to safe water.</td>
<td>A focus was on how to increase utilization of maternity services at the health facility. Students used information charts at the health facility, encouraged health facility staff to continue providing health education. At Bukinda, home visiting, health education at the health facility, clearing breeding grounds, encouraging use of mosquito nets were undertaken. A review of health facility records, and community survey established progress.</td>
<td>The students’ project contributed to increasing deliveries at the health centre from 20% to 50% though health education to the community. Awareness about malaria prevention and control was increased. Students were able to increase percentage of households with</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time Period</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Activities and Outcomes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Kyabugimbi</td>
<td>Low turn up of married people for HIV/AIDS couple counselling and testing. Students aimed at increasing the percentage of married people who turn up for HIV/AIDS counselling and testing as couples, by 7.4% in the next 10 months.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>100-150 kms (Rugazi, Bughoye, Kitagata, Kisomoro)</td>
<td>BY 2010, there was low utilization of family planning. By 2011, at Bughoye, there was inadequate community health education and myths. During 2012 only 36% of women of reproductive age were accessing family planning services from Bukuuku HC IV. At Kitagata during 2013, students aimed at increasing the percentage of married people who turn up for HIV/AIDS counselling and testing as couples, by 7.4% in the next 10 month. In 2014 in Ruhija, Students found out a community challenge of food insecurity and malnutrition mostly among children. Lack of a balanced diet and low community awareness about safe nutrition practices predisposing to high levels of malnutrition. Students aimed at addressing malnutrition among mothers and children. During 2014, at Kisomoro, students found out that the host district (Kabarole) had a prevalence of 11.3% of people living with HIV. This is about 4% higher than the national average.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>100-150 kms (Rugazi, Bughoye, Kitagata, Kisomoro)</td>
<td>Home visits, clinical care, meetings with the community, school visits and market visits were undertaken. Students assessed knowledge about malaria prevention and control at community level. Students focused on how to reduce the number of homesteads with breeding places for mosquitoes in Muhito parish from 63.8% to 13.0% by the end of June. They carried out health education on prevention and control of malaria. Students carried out home visiting, health education at the health facility and community and demonstrating a balanced diet. At Kisomoro during 2014, a students’ intervention project provided school health education, routine HIV/AIDS counselling. Health education focused on topics such as: Transmission, Prevention, and Stigma and Risky behaviour in relation to HIV/AIDS. Intervention in secondary schools was based on the significant impact of HIV/AIDS among the youth as evidenced by the high number of youth who were HIV positive.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>More than 150 kms (Kibiito, Kisoro, Bukuuku, Bwindi)</td>
<td>BY 2010, there was poor health-seeking behaviour with communities preferring to use alternative service providers: traditional healers, herbalists and birth attendants. By 2011 at Kibiito, the focus was on reducing HIV/AIDS incidence and prevalence. Within the health facility, students participated in grand rounds, theatre work, HIV/AIDS clinic and maternal and child care clinic. Education on HIV/AIDS and STIs was provided during 2011. During 2012, there were home visits. There was increased utilization of HIV/AIDS services at Kibiito. Increase of homes with waste pits from 2 to 15 in three weeks. Students increased the number of women of reproductive age accessing enhanced family planning services, enhanced health education. There was a reduction in the proportion of village members of Ibanda II with low knowledge of malaria from 75% to 70%. Increased awareness about benefits of malaria prevention and early treatment. Mitigation of malaria risk factors. Health needs assessment, review of records at the health facility, community survey were undertaken to monitor progress. There was an appreciable awareness of adequate child nutrition practices adopted by mothers by the end of the placement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>More than 150 kms (Kibiito, Kisoro, Bukuuku, Bwindi)</td>
<td>More than 150 kms (Kibiito, Kisoro, Bukuuku, Bwindi)</td>
<td>By 2010, there was poor health-seeking behaviour with communities preferring to use alternative service providers: traditional healers, herbalists and birth attendants. By 2011 at Kibiito, the focus was on reducing HIV/AIDS incidence and prevalence. Within the health facility, students participated in grand rounds, theatre work, HIV/AIDS clinic and maternal and child care clinic. Education on HIV/AIDS and STIs was provided during 2011. During 2012, there were home visits. There was increased utilization of HIV/AIDS services at Kibiito. Increase of homes with waste pits from 2 to 15 in three weeks. Students increased the number of women of reproductive age accessing enhanced family planning services, enhanced health education. There was a reduction in the proportion of village members of Ibanda II with low knowledge of malaria from 75% to 70%. Increased awareness about benefits of malaria prevention and early treatment. Mitigation of malaria risk factors. Health needs assessment, review of records at the health facility, community survey were undertaken to monitor progress. There was an appreciable awareness of adequate child nutrition practices adopted by mothers by the end of the placement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
By 2011 in Kisoro District, the target was to increase the number of homes with refuse pits from 2 to 20 in three weeks was the target. During 2012 only 36% of women of reproductive age were accessing family planning services from Bukuuku HC IV.

During 2013 in Bwindi there was inadequate community education on disease prevention and health promotion.

During 2014 in Bukuuku, there was an appreciable awareness of adequate child nutrition practices adopted by mothers by the end of the placement. Within the community, there were gender based conflicts and conflicts at household level, inadequate access to nutrition information and family planning community meetings, working with community leaders and health facility staff. Review of records, surveys, information by health facility staff was the means of verification. Students focused mainly on clerking patients, health education, home visits and outreaches. Community surveys, records review at the health facility were undertaken as a means of monitoring and evaluation.

Students worked with village health teams and community leaders in raising awareness about malaria prevention and control. Surveys, review of records were undertaken as measures of monitoring and evaluation.

By 2012, there was increase in the number of households with rubbish pits from 7% to 14% in Muramba II community.

By 2013 increased access to information on health promotion and disease prevention was registered in Bwindi. At Bukuuku by 2014, there was increased awareness about malaria and its prevention and increased use of insecticide treated mosquito nets.

**Source:** Review of CBE Students’ Projects Reports: Researcher’s Construction

CBE students’ projects addressed access to health services through increasing utilization of health facilities. During 2010 at Kazo Health Centre, the students’ project contributed to increasing deliveries at the health centre from 20% to 50% though health education to the community; there was increased awareness about the benefits of antenatal care within the community.

By 2010 at Kibiito, there had been low utilization of health services by the community. During 2011, at Bughoye, students found out the challenge of low male involvement in antenatal care and family planning at both community and health facility levels. At Bukinda equity issues were around land shortage, high levels of illiteracy and poverty, low access to mosquito nets, poor access to information on malaria prevention and treatment within the community.

Students also reduced patient waiting time by participating in the delivery of services and widening the range of services provided. At Rugazi Health Centre IV, within the community, students trained community health workers / Village Health Teams (VHTs) on malaria prevention, family planning and HIV/AIDS. At the health facility, students reduced the patient waiting time at OPD through participating in clinical care.

In Kisoro, within the community, there was poor waste disposal, compounded by inadequate health education, low access to information on sanitation, family planning, poor access to and use of insecticide-treated mosquito nets, and poor access to safe water sources. At Kinoni Health Centre IV, Mbarara district, within the community, there was inadequate utilization of the health facility by mothers. During 2012, at Buhara Health Centre, Kabale District, there was poor motivation of health workers, inadequate health education and a general lack of implementation and monitoring of community sanitation.

At Bukuuku, during 2012, obstacles to accessing family planning services were insufficient awareness, low levels of education and long distance to the health centre at the community level, and long waiting
hours at the health facility. In Kisoro, there was inadequate access by the community to information on the benefits of using latrines and latrine covers. At Kitagata, during 2013, there was inadequate access to access to information on malaria prevention and treatment at community level. At community level, students contributed to a decrease in the burden of worm infestations among the residents of Nyakigando village, close to Ruhoooko Health Centre IV.

At Kyabugimbi, within the community, there was poor access to HIV/AIDS information, counseling and care services. Around Bwindi Community Hospital, there was inadequate access to information on health promotion and disease prevention. At Bukuuku, there was a 31.4% increase in the awareness about HIV/AIDS among students. The number of students who came for VCT increased from approximately 10 students per week to 17 students per week; while the number of students who came to the health facility for condoms also increased from about 2 students each week to approximately 14 students each week.

At Bwizibwera, within the community, of the 63.6% defaulting households, 38.5% were missing DPT3, and the other 61.5% missed quite a number of vaccines. A key aspect for enhancing acceptability of health services was enabling community participation in the delivery of services. By 2010, participation by men in antenatal care and family planning at Ruhira was low (less than 2%). At Bukinda, water sources were neglected; there was a lack of community participation and involvement.

During 2014, at Bugamba, poor motivation of health facility staff, low use of ITNs and inadequate community awareness about the signs and symptoms of malaria were found to be the predisposing factors to the high incidence of malaria at the health centre. At Ruhira, during 2014, within the community, there were gender power relations and conflicts at the household level, inadequate access to nutrition information and family planning. Affordability of health services was enhanced by students through provision of additional health services at no extra cost. At Kibiito, for example, funds for health education at the health facility were inadequate; there was poor access to information and to preventive measures of HIV/AIDS by the youth within schools and the community.

Site 1 is found in Ibanda District along the highway about 3km away from Ibanda Town. It is one of the 46 health units found in Ibanda District and includes 1 hospital, 2 health centre IVs, 7 health centre IIIIs and 34 health centre IIs. It serves about 150,000 people in Ibanda District. Site 1 started as a dispensary around 1933. The health unit continues to grow both in size and scope of health service delivery. At the moment, the unit has 100-bed capacity and serves communities beyond Ibanda District (Kirusuru and Kamwengye districts) but targets the sub-counties of Nyabuhikye, Nsansi, Rukiri, Kikyenkye and Igorora Town Council. The health unit supervises the 14 lower health facilities. The facility has 46 personnel which include; 32 technical staff headed by a medical officer. It has 4 clinical officers, 7 enrolled nurses, 3 enrolled midwives, 1 assistant nursing officer, 2 nursing assistants, 2 health inspectors, 1 anesthetic officer, 1 theatre assistant, 2 laboratory technician, 2 laboratory assistants, 1 dispenser, 1 accountant, 1 health information assistant, 1 assistant health educator, 1 vector control officer, 1 store keeper and 13 support staff. It has 4 major departments, i.e. Outpatient Department (OPD), General ward, Maternity, Laboratory and ART clinic which runs from Wednesday to Friday.

Site 2 is located in Kiruhura District in South-Western Uganda. It is located92km to the East of Mbarara Municipality using the Mbarara-Ibanda route. The sub-county has a beautiful landscape of fertile, gently-sloping hills with flat tops and undulating valley bottoms. Most of the gentle hill slopes are used for crop-farming as well as animal-grazing. The health facility is a referral for two other lower health facilities. There are VHTs in all the villages. The facility is headed by a clinical officer who works with a midwife, accountant and a records officer. It has a bed capacity of 15; 10 are for the general ward and 5 for the maternity ward. The following services are offered: general medical services, laboratory services, antenatal care and maternity family planning, immunization and free HIV/AIDS services.
Site 3 is in Kabale District. The facility is remote and located about 60km from the Kabale-Kisoro highway. It is located on the north-east side of the Bwindi Impenetrable National Park. The Bwindi Impenetrable forest actually covers much of the area forming the primary vegetation cover in the area. The neighbourhood is generally hilly. It is quite a sight, indeed, looking at the terraces on the slopes of some hills with different crops such as Irish potatoes, banana plantain, cabbage and sorghum. These, together with beans and sweet potatoes are the main crops grown in the area. A few farmers, however, engage in growing other crops such as avocado, pineapple, and pumpkin. The sub-county where the site is located is composed of five administrative parishes and over 28 villages. Official statistics obtained from the Sub-county office show women outnumbering their male counterparts by over 6% (Males 47% and Females 53%).

Site 3 was built in 1991 and was a result of a joint project between the Government of Uganda and the Swedish Government through the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida). The main aim of constructing this facility was to provide health care to the natives in Ruhija Parish at the time. It is one of the few health centres that was built for utilization by the locals in then Ikumba Sub-county, which is now Ruhija Sub-county. The facility serves the whole of Ruhija Sub-county and part of the neighbouring areas in Kanungu District. Patients trek numerous kilometres and walk up and down a number of hills before they can get to the HC.

On average, about 25 patients attend the out-patient department (OPD) every day. However, this number actually rises on the market day each week to about 50 patients.

There are different activities at the health centre and in the sub-county supported by a few non-governmental organizations (NGOs):

- Reproductive Health Uganda which is involved in helping provide several family planning methods delivered by the health workers at the health centre.
- USAID Uganda Community Connector project which helps provide vegetable seedlings and nutrition counselling to different mothers in sub-county.
- Strengthening TB HIV/AIDS Response (STAR) south-west that provides funds and some drug support for investigation and management respectively of TB and HIV/AIDS patients respectively.

Site 4 is situated along Mbarara to Kabale road, approximately 134 km from Mbarara Municipality and 31 km to Kabale Town. The health centre has a total of 18 employees of different professions under the supervision of a senior clinical officer. These include two clinical officers, one nursing officer, four enrolled nurses, two nursing assistants, one laboratory assistant, one environmental health officer, one record assistant, one dental assistant, four porters and one security officer (source: Health Facility Records Office). There are other nearby health facilities that work in cooperation to enhance health service delivery to the community of Bukinda Sub-county and the surrounding sub-counties.

Several services are offered at the health centre which include: general in-patient and outpatient care, HIV counselling and testing, HIV/AIDS care, treatment services (for both children, adolescents and adult), tuberculosis screening and treatment for both adult and children, prevention of mother-to-child transmission (PMTCT), maternal and child health (postnatal and antenatal care), immunization, family planning services and finally maternity services (source: health facility sign post).

Site 5 was established 16 years ago and is 228 kilometres away from Mbarara University. It is located in Kisoro District. Kisoro District occupies the far south-western corner of Uganda, bordering Rwanda to the South, DRC to the West, Kabale District to the East and Kanungu District to the North. The district had an estimated population of 274,800 people (Uganda Bureau of Statistics 2002). The hospital is surrounded by villages of Nyaruyaga, Nyamirima and Bigina and serves an estimated population of 37,216 people. The hospital has two sections; Outpatient Department (OPD) and In-patient Department. OPD section has: the Pharmacy, Dental clinic, ART clinic, women clinic, immunization clinic, mental clinic, laboratory,
radiology department, ophthalmology clinic, Antenatal clinic and chronic illness clinic. The in-patient department has 134 beds with maternity, paediatric, male, female emergency and private wards. In addition, it has the main and minor operating theatres, in-patient pharmacy, palliative care clinic, rehabilitation clinic and in-patient laboratory.

The illiteracy rate at site 5 is 50.9% (UNDP, 1999) which is higher compared to 38.4% in the rest of Uganda. The district landscape is hilly and mountainous resulting from volcanic process. Most people in the district carry out subsistence farming and the main food crops grown are beans, matooke, cabbages, sweet potatoes, Irish potatoes and sugarcane. Cash crops such as tobacco and coffee are grown on a small scale, while the main livestock reared on a small scale include: cows, goats, pigs and sheep.

Site 6 is located in Isingiro District in south-western Uganda. The landscape in this area is rugged and characterized by broken mountains that rise above sea level and valleys. The steep hillsides are extensively degraded from forest clearing, soil erosion and rapid population growth. The population of Ruhiira Parish has been increasing steadily over the years; with an estimated population of 7,611 in 2007 and 8,751 in 2012 (latest available estimate), children aged 1-14 years contributing half of this population.

Site 6 was a health centre II and was constructed and started operating in 2004 under the Local Government Development Programme. The arrival of the Millennium Villages Project (MVP) in 2006 transformed this health centre into a health centre III through construction of additional blocks and purchasing of additional medical equipment, thus providing an increased number of health care services and with improved quality for the people of Ruhiira Parish. The Millennium Villages Project (MVP) was a project of the Earth Institute at Colombia University, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and Millennium Promise. It is an approach to ending extreme poverty and meeting the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) - eight globally endorsed targets that address the problems of poverty, health, gender equality, and disease. The Millennium Villages aim to promote integrated rural development. By improving access to clean water, sanitation and other essential infrastructure such as education, food production, basic health care, and by focusing on environmental sustainability, the Millennium Villages programme claims to ensure that communities living in extreme poverty have a real, sustainable opportunity to lift themselves out of the poverty trap.

MVP covers all the cells of Ruhiira parish and has also extended to cover other parishes. It initially started with only 15 cells of Ruhiira parish comprising 5,000 people who were needed to make a research village. The MVP research was carried out on issues concerning health, agriculture and business development, education, gender, water and sanitation, nutrition, infrastructure covering energy transport and information and communication strategies. The issues discovered were scaled up and extended to other villages.

Under the MVP umbrella, several sub-projects run concurrently, most notably the WASH programme. WASH (water, sanitation and hygiene) programme was initiated by the UNDP and it aims at the reduction of water-related diseases and optimization of the health benefits of sustainable water and waste management. Hence the WASH programme works to improve water supplies and sanitation facilities in schools, communities and to promote safe hygiene practices. They sponsor a wide range of activities and work with many partners including families, communities, governments, and like-minded organizations. These activities are designed to contribute to the sustainable access to safe water and basic sanitation.

Site 6 has two main blocks. The first block is larger and contains the IPD (4 beds) room, 2 clinical rooms, the dispensary, maternal PNC room (4 beds), midwife office room, maternal examination room and the delivery room. The second block that is much smaller has: the laboratory, the data/records room and the maternal ultrasound scan room. The centre is well enclosed by wire mesh and has a gate at the entrance. It has a neat compound with nice greenery.
The following is the staffing levels: 1 Senior Clinical Officer, 1 Senior Nursing Officer, 2 pharmacy assistants, 1 nursing assistant, 2 laboratory technicians and 2 midwives. The health centre also has support staff who include: the Community Health Workers (CHWs) and the data & records staff (under MVP).

The health care services provided at the health centre include:

- Laboratory services that are: - a) Tests for malaria infection b) Tests related to HIV/AIDS- Routine Counselling and c) Tests for Sexually Transmitted Diseases d) Tests for Hepatitis Antigens e) Blood haemoglobin levels. f) Random Blood Sugar g) Brucella Agglutination Test, h) Blood grouping. i) Stool analysis. j) Urinalysis. k) Sputum analysis.
- Maternal and Child Health (MCH) care services that include: - a) Antenatal care: on average 300 mothers attend antenatal monthly. b) Postnatal Care; the centre has 4 beds that are available for this service. c) Maternal Ultrasound. d) Deliveries; on average 120 deliveries are conducted at the centre each month. e) Prevention of mother-to-child transmission of HIV). f) Immunization. g) Family planning.
- Outpatient: on average the centre attends to 800 patients per month.
- In-patient: the health centre has 4 beds for this service.
- Safe male circumcision; this service is carried out once each month for a week.

The health centre also undertakes activities outside its premises. These include: the 6 monthly general mass school de-worming (April and October) and outreaches for ANC, HIV counselling, testing and treatment.

The transformation has had evident positive outcomes, for example, the reduction of maternal and child mortality witnessed by the improved correlation between the fourth ANC visit and maternal delivery that is currently at 83% for the first third of this year (2014) and the reduction of the prevalence of malaria in the region to near 8%.

The facility serves people from within Ruhira parish and other surrounding parishes, for example Ntungu parish. Medical cases that cannot be handled at the health centre are referred to Kabuyanda Health Centre IV or, if need be, directly to Mbarara Regional Referral Hospital (MRRH). There is a standby ambulance that is stationed at Kabuyanda Health Centre IV (15km away) that can quickly come to collect and transport emergency referrals.

Site 7 is found in Kabale District about 20km from Kabale Town. At the health centre, the following services are offered: family planning, antenatal care, immunization, ART services, maternal health care services, laboratory diagnosis and general medical care (in-patient and outpatient services).

Site 8 began as a leprosy centre in the 1950s. It served thus until the NRM regime, when the centre was transformed into a health centre III. The centre is located in Kasese District.

Site 9 is approximately 13 km from Kabale Town. It was founded by the Government of Uganda in 1978, in the former Kigezi District as a Health Dispensary and it was later upgraded to a Health Centre III in 2012 when additional infrastructures such as the maternity unit, in-patient block plus a laboratory were put in place. The facility serves three parishes with a population of about 5,750 people.

At the health centre, the following services are offered: Safe Male Circumcision (SMC), family planning, antenatal care, immunization, ART services, laboratory diagnosis and general medical care (in-patient and outpatient services).

Site 9 is a HC III facility - a government funded public health facility. The staff are recruited by the District Service Commission and under the supervision of the Ministry of Health. The facility has: 12 staff members of the following cadres: 1 Senior Clinical Officer, 1 Clinical Officer, 1 Enrolled Midwife, 1 Enrolled Nurse, 1 Registered Nurse, 2 Nursing Assistants, 2 Laboratory Assistants, 1 Watchman and 2 Porters.
Site 10 is under the Church of Uganda in Kinkiizi Diocese. It is located in Buhoma village, Mukono parish, Kayonza Sub-county, Kanungu District, in south-western Uganda. It was founded in 2003 as a health centre II, and currently operates as a hospital with a mission of providing holistic health care and life in all its fullness to the staff, patients, clients and visitors in the Hospital and community. Its vision is “A healthy and productive community free from preventable disease and with excellent health services accessible to all”. The hospital was started particularly to provide health care to the Batwa but has grown to serve the health needs of the communities of Kanungu District, part of the neighbouring districts and the neighbouring country, the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC). The hospital has a bed capacity of 112, with different departments that offer services to outpatient and in-patient including paediatrics, medicine, surgery, obstetrics and gynaecology. It also offers other diagnostic services like x-ray and ultra sound, theatre for both minor and major surgeries, laboratory and community health departments. It also offers free HIV services such as HIV counselling and testing with provision of ARVs (Antiretroviral drugs). The hospital also carries out outreaches for immunization, TB screening, HIV testing and ARV supply, antenatal services, malnutrition screening, and many other services on various days. A waiting mothers’ hostel was constructed at the hospital for the expectant mothers in order to reduce the mortality of mothers in labour. Given the remote location with no reliable means of transport, the mothers wait in the hostel for their due date while being provided with health education. Site 10 also has two satellite clinics.

The facility has 121 both medical and non-medical staff. The medical staff include: medical officers, clinical officers, nurses, midwives, laboratory technicians and assistants, dentists and anesthetic officers. The non-medical staff include: the IT and communications team that manage hospital data, communication within and outside, the hospital public relations, and the computer system of the hospital.

The hospital depends on 45% donations from well-wishers, 6% from the government, and 49% from organizations/charities/trusts. It also has a health insurance scheme.

**4.0 Discussion**

According to Zohray, Baingana, Sagay, et al. (2013) increasingly health sciences students participate in the delivery of health and health care interventions. It is recognized, however that about 75% of health sciences graduates in Uganda will have completed high school from Urban areas, yet they are expected to work within the underserved rural areas as well (Kaye, Mwanika, Sekimpi, Tugumisirize et al, 2010). The same study revealed that over 75% of the newly admitted students were willing to have their training from a rural area. Perceived factors that might influence retention in rural areas included the local context of work environment, support from family and friends, availability of continuing professional training for career development and support of co-workers and the community.

From this study, similar issues cut across all the four clusters. There is no marked difference within and across the clusters. Generally, CBE students projects stimulated community participation in health service delivery, increased the scope and range of health services provided at the health facility level and within the community. Students’ projects also enhanced communication within the healthcare system, in turn enhancing the linkage between health facilities, communities and local health authorities. It appears logical that CBE students’ projects address health disparity and inequity by enhancing accessibility, acceptability and affordability of health services.

The findings agree with those of Kaye, Mwanika, Sekimpi, Tugumisirize et al, (2010) that recognized that since over 80% of the Ugandan population resides in the rural areas, training of health workers and service delivery should remain cognizant of this disparity. The study also brought spelt out that there are
educational benefits of rural placements for health professional training. Students acquire knowledge and skills in real-life contexts of ill-health and its related non-biomedical determinants. Training institutions can be enabled to address the medical workforce needs of the communities they serve at the same time as providing educational advantages to their students (Daniels, Vanleit, Skipper, Sanders & Rhyne, 2007; Mubuuke, Gonzaga, Kiguli-Malwadde, Businge, Byanyima, 2009, Mbalinda, Plover, Burnham, Kaye et al, 2011). It appears possible to address characteristics that would influence students’ working in rural areas on qualification. Addressing these factors during medical training, especially during community based training, may increase recruitment, deployment or retention of health workers.

The effect of students’ projects on equitable health service delivery can equally be presented thematically: motivating collaborative learning, provision of evidence based services, clinical services, specific demand driven interventions and participation in health promotion and disease prevention activities. A unique aspect of students’ intervention is innovatively going beyond routine services to innovate new partnerships and strategies.

Students motivate collaborative learning by working closely with health facility staff, lining organizations and institutions to leverage the impact of health services, for example the case of Health Child Uganda (HCU) in tackling morbidity and mortality in children, district health system through the district health team, working with the health staff, VHTs, international programs such as the millennium villages project through Ruhiira health centre III and tackling respiratory tract illness through partnership with ecolife. Students also undertake health related home visiting.

One can categorize the main activities and services provided by students. Students provide evidence based services, clinical care services as well as activities and services targeting some specific illnesses and health problems.

Provision of evidence based services is for example through undertaking community needs assessments, review of records at the host health facilities, appraisal of the national and district health system, documentary review and by prioritizing health challenges.

Students provide a wide array of clinical services including, but not limited to the following: clerking patients in the outpatients department, conducting ward rounds, providing dental health care, dispensing of medicine, participation in management of HIV/AIDS, carrying out laboratory investigations, Antiretroviral therapy (ART), family planning services and children’s’ clinics.

Students also participate in the provision of specific child health services such as: immunization of children, treatment of common childhood illnesses, participation in ongoing community interventions aimed at addressing childhood morbidity and mortality, for example the Healthy Child Uganda Project. One realizes that students enhance a wide array of health services such as: offering laboratory services, family planning services and health education at the health facility, primary and secondary schools.

A cross cutting aspect of the students projects is the aspect of health promotion and disease prevention activities such as: general health education, nutrition education and collaboration with alternative care providers: traditional birth attendants, bone seters, herbalists. Students enhance water and sanitation, hold personal hygiene and hand washing campaigns. They also undertake health problem specific interventions such as malaria interventions by promotion of use of insecticide treated mosquito nets, health education on the benefits of early treatment of malaria, patient clerking and participation in offering laboratory services. They mitigate HIV / AIDS – through health education and targeted health education about sexually transmitted diseases in schools.
Students enhance maternal health services such as: antenatal care services, family planning and health education. They mobilize stakeholders to participate in health services, for example by linking health facility staff, district development staff and community leaders in provision of health services, working with churches and leadership of primary and secondary schools. Students have proven themselves an anchor for school health education on voluntary counseling and testing; sexual and reproductive health and rights as well as for HIV/AIDS.

By emphasizing prevention of communicable diseases, students contribute to the behavior change processes and mitigation of epidemics and locally endemic diseases and health problems. Students themselves in the control of typhoid fever, promotion of use of safe water, health education, nutrition education, promotion of ITN use, design of appropriate interventions and promotion of sanitation. They prevent and control of worm infestation, enhance male circumcision, malaria prevention and control, control of HIV/AIDS. Students in addition to using the established communication channels, are able to innovate due ways of health promotion and disease prevention: school based health education, radio talk shows. They provide school health education services within primary and secondary schools: focusing on voluntary counseling and testing of HIV / AIDS, School health education focused on sex Education, sanitation/hygiene, Nutrition and Malaria.

Conclusions

Increasingly the needs of society need to come to the forefront in any curriculum development process. By founding the medical education curriculum at MUST within the perspective of the needs and demands of society, learners have an opportunity to appraise health needs of communities. The curriculum drives student involvement and interaction. The curriculum has contributed to improvements in service delivery by providing evidence based services, participating in clinical care services as well as activities and services targeting some specific illnesses and health problems. Analysis of students’ projects indicate a relationship with improvement in equitable health services delivery. Students provide an additional human resource, in turn expanding both the range and coverage of services. CBE thus provides an opportunity for curriculum orientation towards mitigating some aspects of the shortage of human resources for health most particularly within developing country contexts. CBE for service learning should be promoted and supported. The collaborative approach to learning embedded in the CBE curriculum enhances collaboration and partnerships in the delivery of health services. Such a synergy promotes community participation and ownership of health intervention projects. A policy framework for strengthening collaborative health service delivery that incorporates students CBE projects is required. My analysis reveals how the CBE curriculum is packaged to address aspects of access to health services. Universities within Uganda and elsewhere could benchmark on the CBE model at MUST.

References

A Critic of the Policy Frameworks that Nurture Sustainable Urban Housing Development among low and Middle Income Urban Households in Kampala

Andrew Amara

College of Engineering, Design, Art and Technology (CEDAT), Makerere University, Uganda
Email: talk2andre@gmail.com

Abstract

In sub-Saharan Africa, the planners of urban housing have to contend with varying dimensions of vulnerabilities, poverty and inequalities, which in turn complicate the delivery of adequate housing and related support services like clean water, good sanitation and sufficient energy; these in turn hamper economic growth and social stability. The increasingly complex challenges of urban housing have led to a search and exploration of new building solutions and policies across the globe (Atkins et al, 2012, p.xi). But the relative success rates of housing policy in some developing countries are low or not as visible and appreciable. In Uganda’s capital city for example, “major socioeconomic and environmental problems… lower the quality of life of the urban dwellers” (Vermeiren, Van Rompaey, Loopmans, Serwajja, & Mukwaya, 2012). In addition to spatial, tenure and cost related challenges (Katukiza, et al., 2010), households have to also deal with environmental challenges such as frequent floods that impact housing settlements, infrastructure and subsequently health (Lwasa, 2010). This paper traces the deficiencies that policy has had in sustainably resolving Kampala’s housing shortage. It discusses some of the issues at the stage of policy planning and suggests some of the factors that policy makers should consider in order to develop more relevant and effective urban housing policies.

Keywords: Housing Policy, Urban Housing, Low-Income Households, Sustainable Housing

Introduction

Housing is more than providing bricks, cement and roofing sheets; it extends to providing an ecosystem that supports livelihoods. Middle and low-income urban households struggle to find decent shelter, at the right price in the right location. In developing countries this pursuit is seemingly oblivious to the changing environmental and urbanisation challenges, with little penetration or implementation of workable and sustainable solutions. Proper, well thought out policy is one of the keys to unlock sustainable positive impact of housing to urban communities. “For policies to make a difference, they must be well informed, evidence-based and responsive to demands and real needs, as well as social problems relevant to housing” (UN-HABITAT, 2010).

The housing policy environment is the set of government interventions that have a critical and measurable effect on the performance of the housing sector (Angel, 2000, p. 11). Housing policies have changed direction many times, over the last 5 decades, and have still failed to solve the housing problems faced by most of the world's population (Choguill, 2007). Harris and Giles (2003) categorise the eras of housing policy across the globe into public housing (1945-1960s), sites-and-services (19721980s) and market enabling approaches (1980s – present).

In the West, towards the end of the 19th century, the governments started providing housing because, of the rural-urban migration that began with industrialization. Urbanisation came with challenges of poverty, slums and poor hygiene. During the world war era, there was little government involvement in housing, but in 1975, the Government then focused on tackling the post war backlog. During the 80s, governments began to gradually withdraw as a provider and instead shift to support private sector – this made the Government an “enabler” (Wakely, 1989). Some consider the enabling approach as a failure (Wakely, 1989), because Government completely retreated from direct housing provision, and the private sector took over entirely; presenting market-driven units that are not accessible for low-income groups.

281
In developing countries, the period of colonization saw the colonial masters providing housing for leaders. In 1950-60s during the independence era across Africa, housing production was mainly for the military and civil servants. In the 1970s as ruralurban migration increased, the state began to seek answers to sheltering the urban poor, with programs such as the eradication of slums (a ‘Top-Down’ approach). In 1990s. John Turner was one of the first to suggest bottom up approaches and promote the sites and services, slum upgrading programs; and the ‘self-help’ term was coined. Public housing programs began to be influenced by some of these self-help ideas, with support of the World Bank. But some of these approaches also had shortcomings: for example, the sites and services provided, were located far from the urban opportunities.

Over the years policy has manifested in various forms such as slum tenements, high-rise apartment blocks, public housing, sites-and-services, among others (Angel, 2000, p. 3). Today the developing countries are seeing a shift towards, ‘whole sector development’ in which governments are trying to create enabling environments. A new challenge therefore has been how to conduct the institutional change for such a policy redirection and there have been calls for international technical assistance to governments in developing countries. The key objective of this paper is to arouse debate on practical steps policy planners can take to better gauge the context of housing challenges and choose the right instruments, tools and policies to sustainably and equitably provide housing for low and middle income urban households.

Methodology

This paper reviews the policies that relate to urban housing in Uganda (with an overview of the past urban planning policies from 1800s, to the present 2016 National Housing Policy) and compares the intents of these policies against the literature on the state of urban housing, in order to query effectiveness. The analysis of literature began with a snapshot of the different policy eras, and the impact on housing, and then a 2018 review of the new housing-related policies.

Results - Review of Literature on the Policy Trajectory

Pre-Colonial Era (1800s)

Before the colonialist came to power in Uganda, the local tribes governed territory depending on the strength of the kingdoms. The population size was less than 3 million, and the cultural institutions at the time dictated the form and arrangement of shelter. In some regions, leadership and power of the elders, chiefs or kings was evident in the hierarchy of the buildings (Atkinson, 1950 and Hailey, 1950). 

The Colonial period (1894 – 1962)

During the colonial era, the economic policy and intention to exclude natives from lucrative activities is entwined with urban spatial and housing development. The historian (Kasozi, 1994, pp. 31-32) documents part of this policy drive:

“As early as the 1890s the colonial state began excluding Africans from the processing and marketing stages of production- the most lucrative in the colony’s commodity-based economy. Kabaka Mwanga tried to buy a saw-mill but was prevented by the authorities from doing so. In 1909, Governor Bell ordered the destruction of hand-gins, which handled some thirty-five per cent of cotton produced in the colony…. In 1913, Kina Kulya Growers’ Society of Ssingo Farmers was discouraged from marketing its own cotton. The Cotton Rules of 1918 restricted middlemen from operating within five miles of a ginnery, all of which were owned by foreigners. The Buganda Growers’ Association tried to market its own cotton in 1923 but was discouraged by the government. Four years later, Sepiriya Kaddumukasa tried to erect a ginnery on his own land but was refused a licence. In 1920 the Buganda Cotton Company was
prevented from ginning and marketing its own cotton. In 1932, when the Uganda Cotton Society tried to obtain high prices by ginning and marketing its own cotton and “eliminating the Indian middleman,” it was not allowed to do so. In the same year, the Native Marketing Ordinance (Coffee) curtailed the buying activities of African businessmen.”

The natives were allowed into the towns mainly as a labour force only (Andreasen, 1996). This was further institutionalised with the promotion of the plantation system for agriculture in East Africa (Padmore, 1931). In the Kampala, the white colonial administrators had residential houses with large compounds, and a separate small building to house the African labourers - “Bachelors Quarters”. In order to maintain their way of life the colonialist chose vantage sites, well located on hilltops with good views and cooler breezes, away from the mosquitoes (Curtin, 1985). Some of these houses are still standing today in original prime urban areas like Kololo and Nakasero, however some are being repurposed. This typology of having a main house and detached servant quarters is still prevalent in new private housing development: perhaps as a tradition copied from this colonial style arrangement, or possibly out of the functional/cultural need to have servants, and keep them separate from the main house. Also evident in the urban layout today is the impact of earlier segregation of Whites from the “colored” – Indians, and the native Africans (Colonial Office, 1955). Kampala’s first ring road, had the colonial masters residing within the core of the ring, and the Indian shops and traders along the perimeter, and the natives outside the ring.

During the colonial era, several laws were enacted: the 1943 Colonial housing policies, and Colonial Development and Welfare Acts gave guidelines on building materials, services and facilities for housing (Ouma, 1991). The 1947 Local Government (Municipalities) Ordinance initiated the creation of municipal councils, including Kampala Municipal council (Colonial Office, 1950). In 1949 a supervising engineer was appointed in the department of public works, and a Housing Committee established by the Development Commissioner (Mukiibi, 2008). The Urban Authorities Act, was setup in 1958. As is the case in many other developing countries, many of such policies were copied from Europe and ‘pasted’ in colonies, without thought for the local cultural differences and context (Angel, 2000, p. 18).

Independence - The Immediate post-colonial era (1962 and 1970) After independence the new government handed over the houses for colonial administratos to senior civil servants (Ministry of Lands Housing and Urban Development, 2016, p. 2). Government continued to provide housing for selected public servants, such as teachers, doctors, engineers and civil workers. The government also established the National Housing Corporation with an Act of parliament in 1964 (National Housing and Construction Company Ltd (NHCC), 2018). The NHCC, a government agency, was supposed to increase the country’s housing stock, by building for the low-income sector and selling units at reasonable prices. But over the years, the recipients of these houses have been the more affluent households.

The Government made amendments to Urban Authorities Act, in 1964, and then enacted the 1964 Public Health Act, and 1964 Town and Country Planning Act, all based on British town planning laws. These two documents are perhaps the most well known documents in Uganda’s modern housing history: most of our developments in the last half-century, have had to abide by these laws. Unfortunately though, many urban authorities did not have the capacity and resource to fully enforce the laws. Further more, the growth in our population over the years, has increased pressure on existing services, infrastructure and housing (Mukwaya, 2004).
The Military: Rule Amin, Obote, Lule, Tito (1971 to 1986)

The years between 1971 to 1986 were marred by political turbulence and insecurity and therefore, there was no significant new housing development (Government of Uganda, 1992): instead the exiting housing stock deteriorated into overcrowded units and little housing maintenance was done. The post-military rule (1986 to 1991). When the National Resistance Movement (NRM) came to power, this ushered in a wave of increased rural-urban migration and subsequently more private housing development and urban sprawl. But Kampala gradually began to develop an informal character because, of the unmatched public housing delivery, and ineffective urban planning guidance (Mukiibi, 2008). There were some ‘spontaneous’ housing projects by government such as the Namuwongo Upgrading and Low Cost Housing Pilot Project (1987) and Masese Self-Help Women’s Project (1989) that were abandoned before completion (Ministry of Lands Housing and Urban Development, 2016, p. 2). The 20year ‘Kony War’ in Northern Uganda alienated towns in the North from those in the South of the Country: many families were displaced into camps, and homes were ravaged (Olsen, 2007), whilst urban centres in the South continued to grow.


In 1992 a National Shelter strategy was developed with support form UN. (Government of Uganda, 1992). This was an adoption of the “enabling approach” (a paradigm shift of the times) and meant that the Government committed itself to indirectly provide decent affordable shelter by supporting individual households, the private sector, NGOs and CBOs (Ministry of Lands Housing and Urban Development, 2016, p. 3). The practice of providing physical housing for public servants still remains in a few institutions, but the provision is far from enough to satisfy the demand: for example some teachers and lecturers are housed by their schools and university, doctors by the hospitals, religious leaders by the church, civil servants by their agencies or ministry.

In 2002 the country’s National housing corporation (NHCC) became a company and was later was privatised during the Government’s privatisation drive, apparently in a bid to raise capital. It appears that when the corporation became private, and profit became one of the main goals, this distorted the targeting of housing away from lowincome households to middle and high-income households. It also cemented the resignation of government from building more public housing.

Table 1. The NHCC Performance Table

Analysis of housing figures from the NHCC (National Housing and Construction Company Ltd (NHCC), 2018)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period and Provision</th>
<th>Number of Houses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From 1964 to early 70’s <strong>over 2,384 units</strong> of various types in different locations</td>
<td>2,384 units</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Kampala: Executive flats, maisonettes and bungalows in top class residential areas of Bugolobi (872), Bukoto White (130), Bukoto Brown (180), Kololo (80), Nakasero (44), Nakasero Flats, Wandgeya (136), Wandgeya Flats Middle to low housing estates where built in Kiwafu (51) and Mulago.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Upcountry: housing projects in Arua, Entebbe, Gulu, Hoima, Kabale, Jinja, Lira, Masaka, Mbale, Mbarara, Moyo, Soroti and Tororo.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1972 – 1980
Little activity in new housing

1989-2005

- Mpumude Housing project - 20 units
- Bukoto housing project - 110 houses (50 marionettes, 35 bungalows and 25 shell houses)
- Ntinda Housing estate - 79 houses (25 bungalows and 54 shell houses)
- Lubowa 108 Housing project - 86 shell houses in Naalya
- Housing project - 610 houses (340 low cost housing units, 55 exclusive shell houses, 215 pride shell houses)

2006-To date

- Kiwatule (268 units)
- Regina Lubowa (40 Units)
- Namungoona Phase I (144 Units)
- Norfolk
- Kyambogo Estate - 6 Bungalows
- Sunderland – Mbuya - 6 Units

848 units

434 units

One observation is that the rate of production of units by the NHCC has slowed down, and yet the demand for housing is increasing. Furthermore the portion of housing for low-income households is low and not equitable in terms of access.

The New National Policy 2016

Over the past decades, policy development in Uganda has been incoherent and haphazard, changing with the political stance of the government of the day. The country has had ad-hoc programs for subsidies, slum upgrade, tax deductions, affordable housing, but these are all disjointed and not bound by a coherent policy approach (Global Housing Indicators, 2009). In their briefing, the Initiative for Social and Economic Rights (ISER) and the Center for Economic and Social Rights (CESR) (2016) note that “the legal and policy framework governing housing is fragmented and inadequately regulates the private sector, while institutional coordination among various ministries, departments and local governments is poor”. In an attempt to harmonise the housing strategies, Government adopted a new National Housing Policy in May 2016 – see table 2 below that sums up the strategies (Ministry of Lands Housing and Urban Development, 2016).

Table 2. The 2016 National Housing Policy Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overview of the Policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vision:</strong> Adequate housing for all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aim:</strong> The aim is to progressively increase the production of new houses from the current annual estimate of 60,000 units to a new level of 200,000 units annually by 2022.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target:</strong> low, middle, high-income groups</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tenure: Ownership and Rental</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Level of implementation:</strong> Housing delivery rests with individuals, while the Government performs its residual role of policy formulation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, standard setting and resource mobilization.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Measures: Harmonizing the policy, legal and institutional framework for the housing sector, to promote an efficient and effective housing delivery system |
Other policies relating to housing development include the Decentralization Policy, Health Policy, National Land Use Policy, National Environment Management Policy, National Land Policy, National Water Policy, and National Gender Policy, among others.

The legal framework regulating the housing sector includes:
The Constitution, 1995,
The Land Act (1998), Cap 227,
The Mortgage Act 2010,
The Registration of Titles Act (1964), Cap 230,
The Land Acquisition Act (1965), Cap 226,
The Survey Act Cap 232,
The Condominium Property Act 2001,
The Cooperatives Act Cap 112,
The Building Societies Act Cap 108,
The physical planning Act 2010,
The Architects Registration Act Cap 269, Surveyors Registration Act Cap 275.

Other relevant laws include
Rent Restriction Act Cap 231,
The Local Government Act (1997), Cap243,
The National Environmental Act Cap 153,
The Public Health Act Cap 281,
The Property Rating Act,
The Engineers Registration Act
The Forestry Act, among other laws.

The strategies in the New Housing policy aim to:
- Increase access to planned and serviced land and affordable housing finance.
- Set up mechanism for delivery of affordable infrastructure, construction/management of institutional/employer housing, development of building information,
- Enable vulnerable groups access adequate housing.
- Build human resource capacity.
- Start a program for affordable housing.
- Promoting rental-housing, formation of housing cooperatives.
- Improving rural housing quality.
- Review / popularise planning approval and enforcement.
- Create legal frameworks to regulate real estate, enforce building repair.
- Advocate for energy efficiency.
- Implementing Environmental and Social policies. Good governance.

Given the scale of the housing backlog and challenges today, the policy has good strategies from the government, however, the underlying implementation plan is not as comprehensive. Although policy planning has received a lot of support from multi-national organisations, Uganda’s new housing policy is not as comprehensive as the policies in developed countries, for instance in South Africa or European countries. The new policy’s ambitions for housing require multiply resources, leadership, coordination and commitment from various government departments and agencies. Other relevant laws and policies still in
the making and yet to be adopted by cabinet are the Landlord and Tenants Bill, the Solid Waste Management Strategy, and the National Urban Policy.

**Discussion of the Findings**

There are the typical external challenges of under funding, corruption, political interference, and low capacity to enforce, that plague most ministries and policy making divisions. However the discussion below dwells on three related fundamental issues in regards to internal planning.

**Response to Context**

The policies of the last two decades, have some input on the socio-economic background and urban context, as the genesis for some of the guiding principles. But the understanding of the knowledge is not reflected in some of the detailed strategies. The implications of the urban context are not thoroughly resolved and explored by the policies. The targeting of housing to low-income households for instance, or the incentives of tax relief on selected building materials, is not coherent with the realities of local urban households. This also begs the question of whether the contextual information is current.

One case in point is the economic situation and its impact on mortgages. Although the central bank interest rate has come down to 9 and 10% in 2018 and inflation rates have been controlled to below 5%, the country’s economic growth has been tempered by a growing debt to GDP ratio – now at 37%, a relatively low tax base compared to the countries in the region, the depreciating shilling (at 3,884 against 1 US dollar as of June 2018) and poor export performance (Centre for Affordable Housing Finance in Africa, 2018, p. 265). Over the 2017-2018 year, the mortgages for residential and commercial developments increased by 8% to USh 2.711 trillion due to a drop in the mortgage rates, following the central bank rate drop. Construction and building takes up 21% of the credit in the country. However because most local banks rely on customers deposits as a source of funds for operational costs and loan portfolio: this pool is not enough to provide long term finance, and the rules on the pension bodies restricts the possibilities for use of pension assets in the construction sector (Centre for Affordable Housing Finance in Africa, 2018, p. 266). Loan acquisitions have steep requirements for low-income households such as collateral and strict payment timelines which low income households struggle to meet. In 2017 the Income tax amendment allowed for mortgage tax breaks, which was expected to be an incentive for investors in the housing market. Given this backdrop and knowledge, housing and financial sector policies should better respond to context and consider relevant tools to improve access to finance for households.

During evaluation of policy, a key concern should be, how the policy perceives housing: what the policy defines housing as. For instance, many policies across the globe present housing as a commodity that is traded in the free market as opposed to basic right that is valued and distributed in a separate arena: there are many examples of this from the sale of public housing in Singapore and England to the slums of Jakarta where customary rights to shelter are sold (Angel, 2000, p. 4). Because of this default in several developing countries, the housing policies end up addressing the housing market mainly and leaving out areas such as equity and equality in housing. In some policies, the legal "standard" for a house is out of reach to the low-income households because of its cost (Sivaramakrishnan, 1969). And this illustrates the stance of many other policies that alienate the low-income household.

Urban planning and housing planning has likewise been inefficient in meeting the needs of the urban poor and low-income households. In 2002, the UN-habitat estimated the slum coverage as 21% of Kampala city with 39% of the city's residents. Most of the slums are in wetlands, which the high and middle income groups do not like, and where policing is less. Guma (2016) observes that informal settlements have proliferated to the extent that they are become the norm. The increasing growth of informal settlements is a perplexing challenge. While they are presumed to present affordable and flexible options, households in
slums face the challenges of insecure tenure and inadequate services (Wakely & Riley, 2011, p. 2). Past policy interventions have failed to stem this trend: housing improvement strategies in Uganda have gone through different eras (slum tenement, modernist block, public housing etc.), changing hands from public to private to market forces (Angel, 2000, pp. 6-8). It remains to be seen if the current policy will adequately and equitably resolve the challenges of informality in housing.

**Lack of Sector Integration**

Many of the policies are stand alone and speak to their specific sector, with little regard for integration with other sectors. The planning at times seems not to meaningfully consult other ministries, and consider their programs and policy. This sometimes results in duplication or missed opportunity for more effective, efficient, and integrated approaches to solving the urban housing challenge. For instance although the land docket and housing docket sit in the same ministry, the new housing policy, explores a few land issues and does not detailed opportunities for an integrated approach to solve the land tenure challenge for housing. Uganda has four land tenure regimes that are recognized by the 1995 Constitution and the 1998 Land Act: Customary, Freehold, Mailo and leasehold. Customary tenure is the most common, accounting for about 80% of the land that is largely untitled. Over the decades, poor land records coupled with undocumented change of owners, land fraud and forced-land evictions, have all conspired to create challenges to access to secure land tenure for several income groups. The new housing policy does mention the idea of land banks, but does not structure the instruments to effect this.

Housing is by nature a multi faceted function. A household will for example need adequate water, convenient transport and good sanitation. Therefore the policy planning should spread across related sectors, and for example questions on how the privatized power sector could extend affordable electricity to new housing estates. Integration of policy would also allow ministries to share resources.

**In-depth Analysis of Context and its Translation**

Given the challenges of collecting credible information on the population, the planners should be credited for having a reasonable amount of data that is sufficient to make some decisions. However the in-depth analysis is somewhat not reflected by the lack of detailed instruments in the policy. One case is the knowledge of the country’s population growth rate of 3.2% and urbanization at 5.1%, (Ministry of Lands Housing and Urban Development, 2016, p. 5) and the estimated annual need for housing at 200,000 units per year (135,000 are in rural and 65,000 in urban areas). More recent studies place Uganda’s population at 42.862 million with an urbanization rate of 5.5% (Centre for Affordable Housing Finance in Africa, 2018, p. 35). Planners also know that residential areas are shifting and growing, for example areas near the CBD are being converted to commercial developments: Kamwoyka, kabalagala, Muyenga, Kololo, Nakasero, Ntinda, Bugolobi, Makerere, Nakawa, Kireka (Centre for Affordable Housing Finance in Africa, 2018, p. 46).

**Table 3. Summary of Uganda’s Housing Requirements 2020 as projected by National Housing and Construction Company**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Estimated backlog Units</th>
<th>Estimated Replacement needed Units</th>
<th>Estimated upgrading needed Units</th>
<th>Projected requirements by 2020 Units</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kampala</td>
<td>82, 184</td>
<td>26,299</td>
<td>32,874</td>
<td>750,791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Towns</td>
<td>92, 730</td>
<td>37,092</td>
<td>46,365</td>
<td>1,092,318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Areas</td>
<td>532, 468</td>
<td>106,494</td>
<td>1,064, 935</td>
<td>8,482,889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationally</td>
<td>707, 382</td>
<td>169,885</td>
<td>1,144,174</td>
<td>10, 325,990</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This dynamics of housing need, its location, its evolution and projected change in nature does not have a strategic and detailed resolution in the recent housing policies. It is not enough to project the needed units, and list incentives for housing construction. Policy should deliver options that response to the demand in the exact location with the relevant housing typology, within a set timeframe.

Perhaps this lack of in-depth analysis could explain why there is little spread of appropriate innovation in the housing sector. The development of urban housing has been a tale of ‘copy and paste’ from other parts of the world. Today Kampala has expanded to over 20 hills, and has seen the number of buildings grow from the Asian shop “duuka” style to more ‘modern and contemporary’ structures. Most of the development has been commercial and office buildings along main streets, and there are several industrial belts as well (Ndeeba, Industrial area, Nakawa, and Ntinda). The road network and size has not changed much since the 70s however the traffic and number of cars has greatly increased.

The capital has seen an experimentation and exploration of materials over the years, as trends change. For long, most facades were plastered and painted as a finish. However, in the 90s tiles were introduced and used to clad buildings. In the 2000s, aluminium panels took over as the material of choice. Most of the buildings of the last decade have more glass and glazed facades, instead of the recessed and shaded facades of the 70s, which utilized “passive design” technics with the aim of creating thermal comfort. The roofs are pitched with metal sheets or clay tiles while some are concrete flat roofs. Even the colours of building have changed to more bold hues such as orange and marrons over the years. But the same can not be said for building forms that have remain the same rectangular box over the years, with the safe orthogonal structural grid. Save for a few ‘expressive’ bursts in the 70s, (by foreign architects), the new building scene is a painting of ‘modern’ simple structures that are limited by the templates of windows, doors, heights and roofs from suppliers. Likewise the capacity of contractors to build more daring and technologically enhanced buildings is limited by tools, technical experience and cashflow. A detailed policy would take opportunity to explore in-depth instruments to enhance sustainability.

In another example, although the planners know the extent of housing shortage, the Lands, Housing and Urban Development was allocated only 1.44% of the national budget 2015/16 and only 0.6% in 2016/17 (Government of Uganda, 2015) and (Government of Uganda , 2016)). This was a decline from the previous year’s allocation. With a small fraction of this (UGX 138 million - USD 41,000 (MLHUD, 2016)), going to the housing department, how can the numerous institutions be expected to implement an ambitious National Housing policy for such a rapidly growing population in a challenging housing sector? The strategies (or indeed the lack of surgical and relevant strategies) in policy miss the opportunity to draw in the current debates such as environmental sustainability and climate change and test or encourage the latest approaches to sustainable housing.

Conclusion

While it is true that there are many external factors that hamper the success and execution of policy, is it very important in the first place that the policy is well developed and comprehensive enough to response to the challenges of urban housing. Policy makers and planners should consider all related sectors and departments as they select and build avenues to promote the development of settlements. More detailed thought and consideration should be given to the underlying socio-economic conditions and realities on the ground, rather than reliance on broad, but not surgical, strategies. Policy makers should also explore the advancements in housing provision and take advantage of sectorial integration and its opportunities. More importantly, it is vital to put the people first; the users and residents of the city. Housing policy planning should be sensitive to the basic needs and lifestyles of the users. If children break off to play a quick game of soccer, while on their way back home from school, then the planners should find a way to
provide play space. Or if a mother of three, treks to the centre to sell her tomatoes to pedestrians at turn of
the rush hour, then the architect should design housing with a nearby market function that weaves into the
street and draws in the pedestrian seamless. Housing policy must sustainably respond to the needs of people
and nurture and encourage a vibrant and fulfilling lifestyle.

References
3650.
Brueggeman, W. B., Racster, R. L., & Smith, H. C. (1972). Multiple Housing Programs and Urban Housing
Curtin, P. D. (1985). Medical knowledge and urban planning in tropical Africa. The American Historical
Review, 90 (3), 594-613.
11 (4), 509-527.
Centre for Affordable Housing Finance in Africa. (2018). HOUSING FINANCE IN AFRICA. A review of
Africa’s housing finance markets. Johannesburg: Centre for Affordable Housing Finance in Africa.
143-149.
His Majesty’s Stationery Office.
Colonial Office,. (1950). The British Territories in East Africa. His Majesty’s Stationery Office. London:
His Majesty’s Stationery Office.
Guma, P. K. (2016). The governance and politics of urban space in the postcolonial city: Kampala, Nairobi
and Dar es Salaam. Africa Review, 8 (1), 31-43.
Global Housing Indicators. (2009). Global Housing Policy Indicators – Kampala, Uganda. Kampala:
Global Housing Indicators.
Government of Uganda.
Development. Kampala: Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development.
Development. Kampala: Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development.
of Uganda.
Initiative for Social and Economic Rights (ISER) and the Center for Economic and Social Rights (CESR).
CESR.
Office, .
Policy and Planning, 6 (1), 35-55.


Public and Private Sectors in Co-production of Public Services: Slovak Experience

Juraj Nemec, Masaryk University, Brno - Czech Republic

Mária Murray Svidroňová, Matej Bel University

Banska Bystrica - Slovakia

Abstract

The goal of this paper was to investigate the scale and nature of relationships between governmental and private sectors in co-production/ co-creation of public services in Slovakia. Based on our analysis from investigated cases we can state that the role of local self-government in co-creation in Slovakia is rather limited. Our opinion is that the main problem and reason of this situation lies in the traditions and type of governance inherited from previous socialist history of Slovakia and cannot be treated immediately. In Slovakia, social innovation predominantly comes from private sector organizations or citizens themselves. The specific interesting point shown in our research was that many innovations in public services provision are based on use of information and communication technologies.

Key words: Co production, Public Services, Slovakia, Social Innovations

Introduction

Most researchers argue that the market-state dualism inherited from the early second part of the 20th century is outdated. The production of public services today promotes partnership as one of its core values, an open process with the involvement of all stakeholders in the design, development and delivery of goods and services. The participation of all stakeholders in the development and subsequent implementation of innovative service delivery is of great importance in terms of the success of the public service innovation process. Recently more and more weight is given to co-production/ co-creation where citizens, non-governmental but also private sector co-operate as co-designers and co-producers of services. The ultimate goal is to provide positive impact on the scope of public services in terms of quality and cost.

The goal of this paper therefore is to investigate the scale and nature of relationships between governmental and private sectors (especially private non-profit organizations), to map the real relations between public bodies and non-governmental sector in co-production/ co-creation of public services in Slovakia. The outline of the planned paper follows its goals. The first part of the paper provides an overview of the key concepts and literature on social innovation and co-production and on the relations between the state and the non-governmental sector in co-production. After the methodology part case studies on co-production of public services from Slovakia are presented, later researchers analysed and synthesised opinions from small expert groups.

Co-production in Delivery of Public Services

The delivery of public services has been undergoing radical changes, switching from a style of delivery dominated by the public sector to a more efficient, more effective mixed system, characterized by variations in ownership and sources of financing. One of first books promoting and arguing mixed service delivery is Cullis & Jones (1987). The book raised questions about the capacity of the state and its subsystems to produce and deliver public services, given that the modes of production and financing are not clearly defined. Two core questions are proposed to be investigated when deciding about public services delivery modes:

- How to produce public/ collective services?
- How to pay for public/ collective services?

It is necessary to understand that there is no common answer to these questions, valid everywhere and any time. Concrete solutions for concrete conditions are necessary. On this base concepts such as public-private civil sector mix, partnerships, co-operation, and co-creation have emerged as ways of organizing public
services production and delivery on this methodological base (other authors promoting partnerships from this early period are for example Kay & Thompson, 1986; Weisbrod, 1988; Yarrow & Jasinski, 1996; Stiglitz, 1997).

Based on these pioneer works and also on learning from New Public Management era (Lane, 2000; Cooper, 2003; Pollit & Bouckaert, 2011). A new concept of government/governance was defined as the sum of interactions where there is a cooperation of actors from public and private sector in solving social problems (Osborne & Brown, 2005). The emphasis is on the citizen and on building the civil society (Pollit & Bouckaert, 2011). According to Osborne (2010), the openness and participation are the core current principles of good governance. Participation of citizens as final consumers of public services, has an irreplaceable role not only in service delivery, but also in the service delivery innovation process.

Defining innovation is not simple - it can include the invention of new knowledge, the application of new knowledge, or both. It can refer to processes within one organization, but also across a service field; and there is an ongoing debate as to whether it is solely a disruptive process or if it can be an incremental one also (Osborne & Brown, 2011). Innovation aims to “shape” the public service following the needs of its consumers/citizens. Therefore the direct participation of citizens in the innovation process and consequently its introduction into practice is of great importance in respect of the success of the innovation process (Von Hippel, 2007; Borins, 2008; Fuglsang, 2008). According to Sørensen and Torfing (2011) public innovation takes place through collaboration with different stakeholders. As a result, innovation is always relative to its context. This context consist of elements such as; (1) the political and administrative context, (2) the legal culture within the public sector, (3) state governance and civil service tradition and (4) resource allocation and resource dependency (Bekkers et al, 2013).

From this point of view we speak of so-called co-creation and the innovation becomes social innovation (two terms can be found in the international literature i.e. co-creation and co-production) and may be with some differences between them. However for the purpose of this article we use the term co-production and we understand it as synonym to co-creation for simplification. Bekkers et al, (2013), argued that the type of co-creation where citizens are involved as co-implementers can be described as co-production, a mix of activities whereby both public service agents and citizens contribute to the provision of public services).

Co-production is regarded as a promising concept against austerity, ageing and the erosion of legitimacy of public institutions (Pestoff, 2014). The literature distinguishes between more types/ phases of co-creation (for example Voorberg et al, 2014):

- In which citizens or other actors act as initiator (co-initiate),
- In which citizens or other actors are invited to co-design (co-design)
- In which citizens or other actors are ‘just’ invited to implement public services (instead of public organizations) (co-implement)
- In which citizens or other actors are directly sharing the cost of services or service development with the state (co – finance).

Co-creation assumes an intensive activation of stakeholders, described in a variety of ways: citizens as value creators (Briscoe, Keränen & Parry, 2012; Díaz-Méndez & Gummesson, 2012), citizens as collaborative partners (Osborne & Brown, 2005), or citizens as active agents in public service delivery (Gebauer, Johnson & Enquist, 2010; Cairns, 2013). Because the focus of this paper is co-production from the point of partnerships between sectors, the researchers also introduced the relationship between government and non-profit organizations. In particular, four often cited alternative views in the literature suggested / provide explanation of the nature of non-profit – government relations. The first alternative suggests that the non-profit organizations operate independently in many cases as supplements to government. The basic proposition of this approach is that “citizens have individual preferences about the
levels, qualities, and the types of public goods they desire and how much they are willing to pay for them and non-profits are seen as fulfilling demand for public goods left unsatisfied by government” (Young, 2006, pp. 41 – 42). This approach, on the other hand, provides the government the opportunity to achieve cost savings by cutting back or eliminating direct service provision and relying more on non-profit service provision and allows the government to promote general welfare without expanding its bureaucratic apparatus (Salamon & Sokolowski, 2014).

The second alternative of government – non-profit relation called complementary where “non-profits are seen as partners to government, helping to carry out the delivery of public goods largely financed by government” (Young, 2000). Many scholars (see for example Pestoff, 2014) argue that government collaboration with non-profit agencies represents a division of labour in the provision of collective goods. Such cooperation might enable delivery of more effective and efficient services by involving various stakeholders and interest groups to the policy making and service delivery process in a larger extent, because there is a greater chance to create services that better meet the users’ needs who were part of policy making process (Thomas, 2013).

The third possible form of non-profit - government relation is rather competitive than cooperative (Najam, 2000). Competition exists as a reality in almost every service field, in every sector and for every organization regardless if it is a for-profit or not. Competition emerges between non-profit and public provider when there’s even a slight overlap in their service type and in their targeted customer. As a consequence, the lack of coordination might create significant overlaps between the public service provider and the non-profit organization.

The fourth possible approach towards government – non-profit relation is the adversarial view (Casey, 2016). It does not claim any specific relationship between the levels of non-profit and governmental activity, rather argues that the non-profits can advocate for better or more efficient government operations or they can advocate for new programs and regulations that would increase government activity.

But beyond the above mentioned economic rationality there might be other well – calculated motivation, namely the political rationality (Moynihan, 2012). Elected politicians are driven by predicting and calculating the political influence of alternative policies or courses of government action based on risk whether they will be punished by voters or gain more credits from them for supporting and pursuing different policies. Similarly, senior civil servants also care about blame if they think it will diminish their reputations and it could damage their careers. This proposition supports the argument that government collaboration with nonprofits also driven by a desire to avoid blame in some cases.

Building up relations with nonprofit is not always or not exclusively driven by rational assessments of economic or political benefits of cooperation. Government action on non-profit cooperation might be shaped by internal rules or norm or external expectations relevant to the situation (March & Simon, 1993).

Case studies on Co-production of Public Services in Slovakia

In this part we provide case studies of different co-production activities involving state (local-government) and non-state partners. The information was collected by our direct research during previous years.

“Photo Traps” in Bratislava

Voluntary initiative Green Patrol (Zelená hliadka), existing in more cities, focuses on preventing of polluting of public spaces in the city in its surroundings. In Bratislava this initiative was the joint action of the city Bratislava and citizen initiative “Green Patrol”. However, the city was never very active and ready to capitalize potential benefits from joint activity. Green Patrol has more activities, for example it directly cleans selected localities in their members own initiative.
This concrete activity was initiated by Green Patrol in the capitol Bratislava since 2011. Its aim is to motivate citizens to start being more considerate towards environmental protection and the problems of waste accumulating in the area where they live. Within the project, the members of the civic association focused on cleaning up five illegal dumps in the period September 2013 – January 2014. In order to keep these places clean, i.e. to prevent any new pollution, photo traps were installed there. The idea of the photo traps is that images are taken when somebody dumps any waste on these places and are immediately sent to the mobile phones and e-mail addresses of Green Patrol members, and thus these offenses are reported to the police in quick time.

The project aimed at cleaning up those public spaces that have been polluted for many years. The cleaned up places where photo traps have been installed report positive results regarding the minimum of pollution or even revealing the waste dumpers. In the initiative, citizens grouped in a civic association came up with the idea, a private company Orange provided information and communication technologies and the city of Bratislava provided some funding; most of the work was done voluntarily.

Support of Education Program: Let’s Go Further!

Children from socially excluded Roma localities face many problems during their school attendance. From low preparedness for school combined with insufficient support from their parents during school attendance to a weak readiness of the schools to meet the educational needs of children result in them falling through the cracks of the education system from the first grade onwards. For these children the education process often ends upon completion of years of compulsory school attendance – and in many cases without passing all expected levels of it. Such situation creates a group of young people without any real education and, consequently, without a real chance to be included in the labour market and wider society.

The main objective of the Support of Education Program, operated by the NGO People in Need – Slovakia, is to improve the educational attainment of Roma children and youth and thereby to improve the possibilities for future access to employment and inclusion into society in general. The program focuses on two main barriers to access education – the barrier on the side of the family and that on the side of schools and the school system as a whole. There is the low stimulation of the social environment in which the children grow up, the unsatisfactory home background for preparing for school, the low education level of the parents and their often insufficient ability to help their own children with preparing for school, all of which lead to the children not being able to keep up with their peers or to meet the requirements of school. On the other hand, the social disadvantages of children at the beginning of and during school attendance are combined with the low ability of schools to adequately react to the educational needs of the children, resulting in many cases to segregation. The Support of Education Program aims to support Roma children on their entire education path until they finish secondary (possibly university) education as well as offering assistance to the schools. In this co-creation initiative, the funding was provided by EEA Grants (Fund for Active Citizenship and Inclusion Program).

The Theatre of the Oppressed

The NGO Theatre without a Home (Divadlo bez domova) in Bratislava was established in 2005 with two main goals: to provide the homeless and socially excluded people with the chance to fill their lives and give them the opportunity to communicate their situation, to socially display themes ignored by "regular" arts. Naturally, the main activity of the theatre is rehearsing and performing the plays. Actors rehearse every week; many of them are physically handicapped with the support from the assistants. They perform the plays mostly in Bratislava on their home stage in Pisztory’s Pallace, which is rented from the city administration. However, they have also performed in other towns around Slovakia on various occasions, from individual plays to festivals, celebrations, etc. The specific project of this theatre is called "The
Theatre of the Oppressed”. It involves the audience in the play, allowing them to directly react to various problems and questions communicated by the actors – the poor and socially excluded people. The main theme of the play is the verbal and physical attacks by the public on the homeless on the streets. The audience try to empathize with homeless people and experience their day-to-day life.

Creating a Network of Attractive Historical Parks the Town of Rusovce

In the context of a cross-border cooperation project "Creating a network of attractive historical parks" a guided participation process was carried out from November 2003 to November 2004 in the town of Rusovce. The aim was to mobilize the local community so as to cooperate in creating a vision of the rare historical park in Rusovce and to strengthen the capacity of local people for further cooperation. Not only the citizens of Rusovce but also local authorities and civic associations had the opportunity to participate in the creation and revitalization of the local park through a series of activities and try out how it is to decide in public affairs. Within a few months, out of a total number of 2,000 residents, inputs were received from 400 people. Numerous workshops, a concert, a poll, a public hearing, a planning weekend, a cross-border seminar and public presentation of the study for revitalization with incorporated suggestions from citizens were realized. Even children from a local school participated by creating booklets about the park.

Conciliation Councils

The goal of this project was to support positive relations and positive conflict solving between majority and ethno-cultural minority (Roma). All types of conflicts were involved – ethno-cultural conflicts, conflicts between minorities and administrative offices, conflicts between citizens (neighbours). Conciliation council was citizen initiative, proposed by the association of citizens (mediators) ready to help with solving of all kinds of conflicts. Other actors were Non-profit organization Partners for Democratic Change Slovakia (coordinator), C.S.Mott Foundation (providing part of resources) and municipalities (Levice, Nové Zámky, Kežmarok, Rimavská Sobota, Prešov). Conciliation councils delivered training activities, supervisory meetings and consultations for volunteers from different social and professional groups, with different nationality, political orientation and religion. Mediator helped to find solutions and common agreements and supervised developments.

Social Housing Kojatice

The goal of this project was building of social houses for Roma citizen, who live in very poor social conditions. The main actors were university students as co-designers and co-initiators. Roma citizen were recipients, but also co-designers, too. ETP Slovakia, financial non-profit body, provided financial support and financial management for the project. Before this initiative 144 Roma citizen lived in the village in 21 small, not maintained houses/huts on private land owned by other citizen (almost illegally and in very bad social conditions. The project was initiated by the Faculty of Architecture, Comenius University Bratislava staff and students, in cooperation with the self-government/mayor and with participation of 13 Roma families. All participating Roma families started to contribute into the common fund 20 EUR/month, students projected houses and self-government provided part of funds and land for new houses. In summer 2013 first three new houses were finished and Roma received better housing. The rest of houses are expected to be finished in 2014 and 2015. The involvement of Roma into building of new houses and financing their costs is important guarantee that the houses will be much better maintained compared to old huts.

“Godmothers”

This voluntary activity focused on the creation of supportive network for individually living mothers. Individual volunteers (ladies) “godmothers” served as long term mentors for young women/mothers in
social need (living alone in difficult social conditions), becoming friends of them and providing help to them in all difficult life situations – care about children, managing households. By this the initiative represents the form of non-institutionalized social inclusion service. “Godmothers” were regularly supervised (minimum one supervision in 8 months) and received any needed advice from coordinating NGO “Šanca pre nechcených”. Sponsors of this activity were Nadácia SPP – SPP pre budúcnosť, Nadácia VÚB, Nadácia Orange and municipalities that decided to support the project on their own decisions. This initiative responded to two kinds of gaps. First it helped to switch from traditional forms of social care for children from such families (placing them to children homes). Second it represents informal form of social inclusion for specific social group – new service, not provided by public institutions.

**Electronic Guard**

Electronic Guard is the innovative concept of social service provided by municipalities. This service is actually delivered to several Slovak municipalities; the pioneers were Martin, Trebišov, Košice and Brezno. Electronic Guard works on electronic connection between localisation device users and the dispatcher centre administered by municipal police. Senior or disable citizen/ user carries the localisation device, which captures the Global Positioning System signal, calculates its location and sends the data to the dispatcher application. If in need, user presses the ALARM button and alerts the dispatcher operator. Electronic Guard also works as a mobile phone: user can receive phone calls, send text messages about his location and dial preconfigured phone numbers (1 to 4). Dispatcher operator/municipal police employee monitors real-time position of the user with the localisation device. If a user sends an alarm, operator receives a notification in the application including a sound alert. He knows immediately which of the users need help, where he is, including other information such as: age, health concerns, blood type, emergency instructions, etc. If the user does not respond to call, operator sends out emergency service. Senior citizens and citizens with disabilities, people with dangerous diagnoses, whose health changes suddenly, appreciate the Electronic Guard service, that gives them the constant connection with an operator and the security that in need they can press one alarm button to call for helps. Comparing to using the standard mobile phone, the emergency service is sent out by dispatcher operator to the user of the localisation device also in cases, when the user cannot communicate and describe health problem or location. The private companies: YMS, s.r.o.; Orange, a.s. were main initiators for this service.

**Relax Path Martin**

Several NGOs together with the municipality participated in the construction of the special relaxation path for seniors. The city Martin allocates regularly certain amount of resources for the better life of elderly people as a part of its services to this group. In this case the city consulted the best use of resources with several actors in the city and the decision was to build barrier free public relaxation infrastructure – nature path for relaxation of elderly people. The path has also educational function – training places are equipped with basic infrastructure to exercise but also with information tables describing fauna and flora in the area. One of outputs is also publication describing simple exercising activities for elderly. The path is so well placed and built that it is regularly used by other age categories for relax.

**Trash out**

The project is real partnerships of private organizations, public authorities and citizen. The initiator is the private Slovak IT company (Trash out, s.r.o.). Citizen can free install Trashout application available for Android, iPhone and Windows Phone and report the illegal dumps by taking a photo of it, defining its size and type, or adding a comment. The report will appear in the TrashMap. TrashOut cooperate with local governments, environmental organizations and waste companies in citizen’s region and notify citizen about the progress in cleaning of reported illegal dump. Few years after the start there were 10 000+ illegal dumps in Trashout database.
“Priestory”

This programme allowed the realization of low cost investment projects proposed and executed by volunteers living in the area. The examples of products are parks, sport places, green places, etc. with disabled access. In 2015 more than 33 small projects were finished – finance were provided by the Foundation “Ekopolis”. This initiative provided extra financial resources, voluntary labour and sponsors money to respond to real local needs and challenges.

Project ViTo

ViTo is the abbreviated name for a European cooperation project aimed at the revitalization of historic city centres in Europe. The entire project title is: "Integrated Urban Development of Vital Historic Towns as Regional Centres in South East Europe". The project was financed by the European Regional Development Fund. The lead partner of the project was the Slovenian town of Ptuj, in Slovakia the project was implemented in the town of Banska Stiavnica. The duration of the project was from August 2009 - August 2012.

For designing integrated and sustainable development planning in historic municipalities, the project focused on the use of public participation. To achieve the revitalization of the historic centre of the town/city, the local government had to work closely with citizens, companies and other stakeholders. The town of Banská Stiavnica organized five public meetings in the first half of 2011. These were the four public meetings called Brainstorming workshops with the topic of revitalization of the historical centre of Banská Stiavnica. The public learnt about these meetings during the initial "kick-off" public meeting organized by the town at the beginning of 2011. The results of the meetings were further used in the project by carrying out pilot projects and the inclusion of the shared vision of the town's development plan. In the public meetings 103 citizens in total took part.

1. Lessons learned: do public institutions (local self-governments) systematically collaborate with private organisations to deliver innovative public services?

To obtain as comprehensive picture as possible about the role of public institutions – in our cases local self-governments – and other actors in selected innovative services we summarise the roles of the different participating actors (see Table 1). We capture their roles in three different stages based on the three different types of co-creation defined above: Initiation (marked as 1 in the table), Design (2), and Implementation (3).

Table 1: The role of different Actors in Co-creation Based Initiatives in Different Stages of the Co-creation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Citizen initiative(s)</th>
<th>Formalized NGOs</th>
<th>Private sector</th>
<th>Local government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 2 3</td>
<td>1 2 3</td>
<td>1 2 3</td>
<td>1 2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo traps</td>
<td>No No No</td>
<td>Yes Yes Yes</td>
<td>No Yes Yes</td>
<td>No Yes Yes Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Let’s go further</td>
<td>No No Yes</td>
<td>Yes Yes Yes</td>
<td>No No No No</td>
<td>No No No No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Theatre of the Oppressed</td>
<td>No No No</td>
<td>Yes Yes Yes</td>
<td>No No No No</td>
<td>No No No No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rusovce</td>
<td>No Yes Yes</td>
<td>No Yes Yes Yes</td>
<td>No No No No</td>
<td>Yes Yes Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data collected in our comprehensive research and displayed by selected cases studies indicate that local governments usually do not initiate co-creation and are not very active in the design and implementation phases. The actors who normally initiate co-creation in Slovakia can be divided into two types: the private sector and formal or informal third-sector structures (NGOs or citizens). The private sector is active especially in the area of information technologies, as implementation of co-created initiatives in that field also improves their sales and profit. Municipalities “take lead” in few cases, normally in situations where resources for the initiative are available from EU funds or similar donor provided help, but partnerships is the necessary pre-condition for successful application (Rusovce case is a very good example).

Local self-governments are expected to use the quality of services as a source of competitive advantage in order to be attractive, however this normally does not work in Slovakia. The purpose might be the fact Vesely (2013) that accountability and responsibility are not very well developed characteristics of good governance at any level of government in Central and Eastern Europe. This fact, combined with lingering habits from the communist era, may explain the behaviour of local self-governments in Slovakia. The values and principles of local politicians and bureaucrats are still influenced by the socialist understanding of the state at every level, national and local, as a ‘ruler’ and not as a ‘servant’ (see also Bunčak et al, 2008). For many local politicians and bureaucrats, co-creation is not perceived as innovation or progress but as a burden, especially if it reveals some existing flaws in the system in which local governments function and in the ways they are organized. This seems to be the most important barrier, accounting for the failed co-creation processes at the local government level in Slovakia.

Conclusions

In this paper we brought several examples of co-creation based innovations on local government level in Slovakia. On the base of our analysis of investigated cases we can state that the role of local self-government in co-creation in Slovakia is rather limited. Our opinion is that the main problem and reason of this situation lies in the traditions and type of governance inherited from previous socialist history of Slovakia and cannot be treated immediately. In Slovakia, social innovation predominantly comes from private sector organizations or citizens themselves. The specific interesting point shown in our research was that many innovations in public services provision are based on use of information and communication technologies (ICT), documenting the fact that information and communication technologies may contribute significantly to the fulfillment of one of the key conditions for successful implementation of innovations to the system of public services, and the direct participation of citizens as consumers of public services in the service innovation process. The ICT driven innovations in public services may therefore be an incentive or driver for social innovations and co-creation process in Slovakia and motivate private sector organisations to participate.
In this situation the core question/study implication seems to be obvious: because co-production delivers important social and service delivery improvements, how to motivate public bodies to be more positive and open to innovative co-production based activities? Simple “ready to use” response cannot be given – the issue is how to make governments more accountable and responsible.

Acknowledgements

This research is supported by the Czech Grant Agency GACR, project 19-06020S Alternative service delivery.

References


Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices towards Cancer Prevention in Uganda: A Review of Literature

Margaret Kemigisa¹ & Ubaldo Mushabe Bahemuka²

¹Uganda Management Institute
²Scientist, Medical Research Council/ Uganda Virus Research Institute and London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine Uganda Research Unit / Vice Chairman, Uganda Cancer Society Board of Directors

Corresponding e-mail: kemimargaret@gmail.com

Abstract

Statistics on the cancer problem globally and in Uganda present a grim picture that calls for responses to increase prevention efforts. The aim of this paper is to; (1) Identify key issues regarding knowledge, attitudes and practices with regards to cancer prevention in Uganda, (2) Determine knowledge of the risk factors regarding cancer in Uganda and (3) Propose suggestions toward a cancer prevention initiative that addresses knowledge, attitude and practice issues.

Methods: An open search for articles was made using Google scholar and Google engine. With each identified article, snowballing was used to identify more articles from references therein.

Results: The results show that awareness of cancer is low. Attitudes towards screening and vaccination as preventive measures are encouraging but there are misconceptions about cancer diseases associated with cultural beliefs and fear of positive diagnosis of cancer. There is varied extent of awareness, attitudes and practices regarding cancer prevention; cancer prevention education is inadequate.

Recommendations: There is need for more research to understand the context of specific KAP to types of cancer, as well as socio-economic and demographic characteristics of populations as they relate to prevention efforts. Strategic efforts are needed to address barriers to adoption of proven prevention methods among those that are aware of the risk factors and prevention measures. A one-stop hub both physical and virtual to provide evidence-based information on primary prevention, secondary prevention and linkages to care for those infected and affected by cancer may help.

Key words: Cancer, Prevention, Knowledge, Attitudes, Practices

Introduction

The International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) estimated 18.1 million (95% UI: 17.5–18.7 million) new cases of cancer (17 million excluding non-melanoma skin cancer) in 2018 (Bray et al., 2018). It has been confirmed that, about 1/3 of the new cancer cases are associated with preventable causal factors (Anand et al., 2008). In particular, the five leading behaviour and dietary risks associated with cancer are:

- Low fruit and vegetable intake
- Physical inactivity
- Tobacco use
- Alcohol use
- High Body Mass Index

There are also cancer causing infections which account for the 25% of cancer cases in low income countries and low income countries generally lack data to develop cancer policies. As indicated on Figure 1, breast cancer and lung cancer were the most common cancers in 2018 (WHO, 2018).
The Cancer Health Burden in Uganda

In Uganda, cancer mortality rates are increasing in varying degrees. For instance, from 1991-2006, breast cancer incidence rates increased by 4.5% per year in Kampala (Uganda), Parkin et al., (2010). The statistics showed almost an equal number of cancer deaths between females and males every year. Parkin (2010) noted that 9100 females, die due to various cancers like cervical cancer (24.2%), breast cancer (12.5%), Oesophagus, 7.7%, liver (5.8%), lymphomas, multiple myeloma, (5%) and others (44.9%) while approximately 9000 deaths among males are results of; prostate cancers (25.1%), oesophagus (16%) due to cancer of the, to cancer of the liver, (8.2%) due to lymphomas multiple myeloma (6 %.), to stomach cancer (5%) and other unspecified cancers (39.8%) a(Parkin, Nambooze, Wabwire-Mangen, & Wablinga, 2010). The most common types of cancer in Uganda are; prostate cancer, breast cancer, cervical cancer and Kaposi sarcoma (Wabinga, Nambooze, Amulen, Okello, Mbus & Parkin, 2013).

The Case for Cancer Prevention

Minimising the health burden of cancers can partly be addressed with prevention measures. Effective prevention efforts may explain the observed decrease in incidence rates for some cancers, such as lung cancer through global tobacco control efforts (WHO, 2018) and promoting evidence-based prevention measures can prevent 30-50% of the cancers.

The modifiable risk factors being promoted for cancer prevention include the following:

- Physical inactivity
- Alcohol use
- Urban air pollution
- Sexually transmitted HPV-infection
- Limited fruit and vegetable intake
- Excessive weight
- Tobacco use
- Infections by hepatitis or other carcinogenic infections
- Ionising and ultraviolet radiation
- Indoor smoke from household use of solid fuels
Thus the prevention measures can include:
- Reducing the above risk factors
- Vaccination against HPV and hepatitis B virus
- Controlling occupational hazard
- Reducing exposure of ultraviolet radiation
- Reducing exposure to ionising radiation (occupational or medical diagnostic imaging)

According to WHO, prevention against HPV and hepatitis B viruses has the potential to prevent 1 million cancer cases each year. Deaths to cancer can be reduced with early detection and early treatment. Early diagnosis calls for three steps:
- Raising awareness and increasing access to healthcare
- Clinical evaluation of diagnoses and stages
- Accessing treatment

One of the prevention measures is by reducing delays and barriers associated with healthcare; this ensures that patients receive treatment when needed. Screening helps in accessing health care. Through screening abnormalities that are suggestive of specific cancers can be revealed, leading to early diagnosis and treatment where relevant. Screening can be done through a variety of ways such as visual inspection, mammography, PAP tests and HPV testing. Understanding population knowledge, attitudes and practices (KAP) regarding cancer can help illuminate the measures to dealing with prevention of cancer. This is because KAP plays an important role in designing appropriate prevention measures.

Methodology

An open search for articles was made using Google Scholar and Google engine. With each identified article, snowballing was used to identify more articles from references therein. Search lines included: Cancer prevention in Uganda, knowledge, attitudes regarding cancer risk factors in Uganda and Knowledge and attitudes towards cancer prevention in Uganda. These searches yielded many articles that have been used for this review. The inclusion criteria were: articles written in English, studies from geographical locations in Uganda, studies on knowledge, attitudes and behaviours/practices on cancer and cancer prevention. Clinical studies were excluded.

Findings from Reviewed Literature

Misconceptions and Fears about Cancer

A look at Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices (KAP) suggest there have been more work on a few types of cancer, namely prostate cancer, cervical cancer and breast cancer. Several studies on knowledge, attitudes and practices related to cancer suggest limited knowledge, misconceptions and fears surrounding the disease (Bingham, Drake, & LaMontagne, 2009; Kiguli-Malwadde et al., 2010; Atuhaire, 2013; Nakandi et al., 2013; Nkonwa et al., 2016; Scheel, 2016; Waiswa et al., 2017; Moses et al., 2018;). However, (Mukama, Ndejjo, Musabyimana, Halage, & Musoke, 2017) established that in Eastern Uganda especially in Mayuge and Bugiri districts, the majority (88%) of the population knew about cervical cancer disease as compared to cancer screening. They also reported that 42% of the respondents were aware of at least a preventive measure and (83%) could name at least a symptom or sign of the disease.

In another study (Bingham et al., 2009) cervical cancer and cancer of the uterus were thought to be the same. Additionally, despite receiving education on breast cancer screening, in the study (Scheel, 2016),
women displayed misconceptions about breast cancer risks and benefits of early detection. Similarly, prostate cancer which affects men is poorly understood and misconceptions regarding the disease are a barrier to prevention. For example, in a study of knowledge, attitudes and practices of 545 adult men aged 18–71 years, in Kampala regarding prostate cancer, (Nakandi et al., 2013) found that (46%) had never heard about it, while 54% of the respondents had ever heard about prostate cancer, mostly getting information via mass media. While 13% of the respondents got information about prostate cancer from health workers and 50% could not tell any risk factor for prostate cancer. Prostate cancer was linked to with gonorrhoea by 11% of the respondents and only 10.3% could correctly tell the symptoms of prostate cancer. A related study on cervical cancer also showed limited knowledge of the disease as well as many barriers to prevention efforts, (Atuhaire, 2013); with perception of risk were high the fear of positive results and health discomfort (e.g. pain), women’s busy work schedules, perceived unfriendly screening procedures and lengthy waiting at health facilities were barriers to cervical cancer screening.

Increasingly people are aware about some of the cancers. The study by Katende et al(Katende, 2016), found that among female university students, breast cancer awareness was high 98% and 77% of them practised Breast Self-awareness Examination (BSE), while 61% had average knowledge of breast cancer risk factors and BSE skills were present among just 44% of the respondents, with 57% of them receiving information via mass media.

Mwaka et al., (2015) found high knowledge of risk factors for cervical cancer as well as its symptoms and aspects of prevention. The majority of the 448 respondents (99%) had heard about the disease, and many knew about some of the risk factors including multiple sexual (885%) human papillomavirus infection (82%) and early onset of sexual activity (78%). A good number of the respondents knew some of the symptoms, including offensive vaginal discharge (83%), intermenstrual bleeding (85%), post-menopausal bleeding (84%). The majority, (92%) understood that it can be cured if diagnosed and treated early, while 70% believed it’s preventable. Among health workers, a study by Mutyaba et al., (2016), established that out of 285 respondents, 93% regarded cervical cancer a public health risk, 83% knew about a Pap smear test, below 40% knew the risk factors for the disease, and out of the female respondents, 81% had never screened for cervical cancer, yet 65% felt they were susceptible to the disease.

Nawagi et al. (2017), studied awareness and self-perceived risk of cervical cancer among women in Namuwongo in Uganda. The study established that 83.3% out of 311 respondents knew about cervical cancer and of these (87.5%) knew that early detection can help to prevent it. Such awareness was attributed to mass media (47.6%) and healthcare professionals at the health facility (37.6%), friends and family (14.1%). However only about 48% knew about prevention through HPV vaccination, and 70% felt they were at risk of cervical cancer. Overall, the study found limited knowledge of the symptoms, preventive measures and importance of cervical cancer screening. This highlights an important area to focus intervention efforts.

Few studies have been conducted on knowledge and attitudes toward screening for cancer in Uganda. Waiswa et al., (2017) studied knowledge and attitudes of female out-patients aged 15 - 49 years towards cervical cancer screening in Oyam district. The study found wrong perceptions about cervical cancer and mixed attitudes towards screening revealing inadequate understanding and a lot of misunderstandings about cervical cancer screening. Out of the 445 of the study participants, about 63% had ever heard about cervical cancer, while only 35% had been screened for it and approximately 6% considered screening as removal of the cervix. A further 39% were aware and believed that it is possible to prevent cervical cancer while others believed screening would lead to infertility. For the majority of the study’s population (80%), information was obtained from health care providers. The study recommended sensitisation to promote screening. Nkonwa et al., (2016) studied knowledge and attitudes about Human Papilloma Virus (HPV)
vaccination and cervical cancer screening among women. The study found that out of 384 women 84% knew about cervical cancer compared to 71% who knew about cervical cancer screening and only 43% that knew about HPV. Only 58% of the women knew that HPV was sexually transmitted while 75% were aware of the value of HPV vaccination.

Kiguli-Malwadde et al., (2010) KAP study of women on breast cancer and mammography, in Mulago hospital, Uganda, revealed that out of the 100 women most (71%) were unaware of mammography, 50% did not know the risk factors for breast cancer and there was negative attitude towards mammography. The level of literacy, occupation and marital status were important factors for knowledge, attitudes and practices, and lack of information presented a barrier towards mammography.

Erin et al (2018) established that 98% of men in their study would support their partners to access screening for cervical cancer, while 100% would support their daughter to get an HPV. Related attitudes were reported in Nkonwa et al (2016) and Waiswa et al (2017).

Misconceptions about cancer lead communities to ask for comprehensive health education (Bingham et al 2009; Nkonwa et al 2016; Waiswa et al 2017). Mutyaba et al (2006) assessed the competence of 63 medical students on the topic of screening for uterine cervical neoplasm. The study established that knowledge of the prevention of cancer did not necessarily mean practical experience where only 13.0 % of the students had performed a Pap test. While Galukande & Kiguli-Malwadde (2010) recognised the importance of mammography for prevention of breast cancer, they suggest that mass mammography is not possible in resource poor settings. They propose ultra sound scan as a “better than nothing” option that can aid early cancer diagnosis and meet a dire need where both mammogram machines and trained experts in their use are hardly available.

Vaccination against specific cancers increases knowledge about the cancers but may not increase vaccine acceptability due to misconceptions about vaccine side effects and associated fears. In a study of girls vaccinated against HPV in Uganda, Kampikaho et al., (2014) found that vaccinations increase knowledge of HPV vaccine. The study also noted the motivations for HPV vaccination acceptance were a role in preventing cancer, minimal side effects (such as peer influence) and improvement in reproductive health. Yet barriers to vaccine acceptance existed in misconception on side effects, and limited information about the vaccine. Knowledge about cervical cancers was more prevalent among those vaccinated compared to those not vaccinated. While acceptability for screening and vaccines is positive, this may be compromised by misconceptions about some of the cancers (Waiswa et al., 2017, Bingham et al 2009,) and genuine fears over issues of quality, safety and side effects of the screen and vaccines, and the effect on fertility were raised (Bingham et al 2009).

Overall, there are limited studies on knowledge, perceptions and practices regarding cancer risk factors. We found that majority of the studies reviewed were conducted in specific populations (demographic/geographic) which may be prone to various forms of investigational bias. It is, therefore, important to conduct a national survey, using standardised methods, in order to have more generalizable data.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

While the several studies show increasing knowledge about cancer, there are also many that report misconception about the disease, even in view of different types of cancer. Most KAP studies concentrate on cervical and breast cancer; this shows limited research on other cancers that affect populations. Moreover, studies that show high awareness about cancer e.g. cervical and breast cancer recommend further public education and sensitisation to prevention of the disease. Some studies have specifically recommended public sensitisation to cancer screening, and prevention education (Nkonwa et al 2016;
Waiswa et al (2017). In addition, according to Martel et al, (de Martel, Georges, Bray, Ferlay, & Clifford), when cancer prevention is largely considered in a non-communicable disease context, there is a crucial need for resources directed towards cancer prevention programmes that target infection, particularly in high-risk populations.

The literature reviewed in this paper is limited to awareness of cancer and some of the prevention efforts such as screening, vaccination and none on behaviours related to risk factors such physical inactivity, alcohol and tobacco use, urban air pollution, dietary practices, among others. Review of studies, in these areas can also shed more light on attempts for comprehensive cancer prevention efforts.

While some studies report sources of information for cancer prevention (Nakandi et al., 2013; Waiswa et al., 2017) the reliability of such information remains questionable given the misconceptions on cancer reported in several studies. There is limited understanding of the best and most reliable methods that provide evidence-based information for cancer prevention. For example, the use of social media and the extent to which the population may use information passed via social media for prevention efforts is less understood.

Due to socio-cultural and economic differences, some information channels may be more reliance than others. Further, further individual preferences and differences in accessing, and processing information may have implication for uptake of prevention efforts. Yet, most of the cited studies recommend public education and awareness within a broad sense (Bingham et al 2009; Nkonwa et al 2016; Waiswa et al 2017).

This study has its limitation. A thorough review was impossible due to limited access to KAP studies done in Uganda. There was an inherent bias to review studies on Uganda, due to the desire to develop an intervention to address the situation in the country. While this respects the importance of options by context, it misses knowledge of what is implemented outside Uganda that may offer useful insights. The review did not consider study limitations of the reviewed papers but concentrated on findings due to the objective of the review. Most of the studies were on cervical and breast cancer, less on other cancers. Despite these limitations, the review provides useful insights to make preliminary proposals for an initiative for cancer prevention in Uganda.

**Implications for Implementation and Future Studies**

The main recommendation is consideration of a cancer for a prevention intervention with the following components:

- Prevention efforts that focus on improving knowledge and increasing uptake of cancer screening and understanding of secondary prevention for cancer.
- Rapid assessment of the preferred means of receiving cancer prevention information among the population to inform design of specific messages for specific audiences, including the role of ICT in cancer prevention.
- Establish a one stop hub both physical and virtual, to provide evidence based information on primary prevention, secondary prevention and linkages to care for those infected and affected by cancer may provide needed information.
- More literature sources to include studies on other cancers.
- More studies to understand knowledge gaps and barriers to adoption of prevention efforts among those that are aware of the risk factors and prevention measures.
References


Atuhaire, L. (2013). *Barriers and facilitators to uptake of cervical cancer screening among women accessing maternal and child health services in Kampala, Uganda*. (Masters in Public Health at the School of Public Health), University of the Western Cape Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/11394/3924 (Magister Public Health - MPH (Public Health) [373])


Understanding the implementation of Public Private Partnership in Universal Secondary Education and its Critical Success Factors: Insights from Stakeholders’ Experiences in Uganda

Ivan Twinomuhwezi & Chaya Herman

Uganda Management Institute

Correspondence E-mail: twino_ivan@yahoo.com

Abstract

While there is abundant extant literature on critical success factors (CSFs) for PPPs, it largely focuses on non-educational services and infrastructure projects with hardly any debates that resonate to universal secondary education (USE) from stakeholders’ lived experiences and insights. Yet, this information is vital in informing policy reforms especially This study therefore seeks to explore CSFs for PPP policy in USE, using evidence-based stakeholders’ understandings and experiences of its implementation in context of Uganda. Methodologically, the study was informed by Freeman’s (1984) stakeholder theory and conceptualised within the interpretive qualitative case study paradigm. The 28 stakeholders who participated in this study were purposively selected officials from the education sector and other MDA’s and PPP school proprietors. Data collected through document analysis and semi-structured interviews were analysed using content and thematic qualitative approaches. The key findings indicate variations in most stakeholders’ subjective understandings of the PPP policy in USE. These variations were largely attributed to context-specific experiences they negotiated in its implementation. Besides, some participants, mainly the school-based stakeholders (school proprietors, teachers, parents and local community leaders) were found implementing a policy which they did not clearly understand with regard to its intent and guidelines. Findings also indicate stakeholders’ mixed perceptions on policy impacts and its success. Though most stakeholders commonly affirmed that the policy had a positive impact on increasing learners’ access to USE, they had divided opinions on its overall success, which they perceived differently. While most government-based stakeholders considered the policy as successful from its impact of increasing learners’ access to USE, majority of nongovernment-based stakeholders perceived it unsuccessful due to its inability to achieve the objectives of equity and quality; which were perceived as low and compromised in teaching-learning process. The policy ineffectiveness was attributed to stakeholders’ conflicting motives; noncompliance to policy guidelines; inadequate monitoring; lack of commitment to roles; negative attitude to policy; political interferences; inadequate funding and its delayed disbursement; poor accountability and inadequate partners’ capacity. Based on how they experienced its implementation, most stakeholders perceived regular policy review; commitment to partnership roles, sufficient funding; selection of suitable partners with adequate capacity; transparent enforcement mechanism; effective communication and sensitization strategy, enhanced monitoring and supervision mechanism as the critical factors for successful implementation of PPP policy in USE delivery in Uganda and other similar contexts. These findings will inform context-specific policy reforms for successful implementation of PPPs in education. Can you also show how the paper concludes or recommends based on its objective.

Keywords: Public Private Partnership, Universal Secondary Education, Stakeholders, Critical Success Factors

Introduction

Education is increasingly considered to be a precondition for socio-economic, technological and political transformations of any nation (World Bank, 2011; Amuche & Kukwi, 2013; UNESCO, 2015; Mgaewa & Poncian, 2016). Most governments, therefore, not only put much emphasis on ‘education for all’ initiatives but also take up the constitutional responsibility of financing and providing it at all levels (World Bank, 2009; Rose, 2010). However, with the increased population sizes in most developing nations and the demand for education as a basic human right, school enrolments have rapidly exceeded the public sector capacity and/or resources to manage and provide it sufficiently (LaRoque, 2008; Bano, 2008; Rose, 2010; World Bank, 2011; Luthra & Mahajan, 2013).

As a policy response, most governments, particularly those in resource-constrained developing economies such as Uganda, adopted neoliberal policies to encourage greater involvement of the private sector in public service delivery through public PPP (Robertson, 2011; Robertson & Verger, 2012). The proponents of PPP
arrangements in education perceive them as efficient and effective education management policy tools for achieving the goal of equitable access to quality education (LaRocque, 2008; Fennel, 2010; Robertson, 2011; Mannan, 2014; Ismail & Haris, 2014). Verger and Moschetti (2016) argue that PPPs are innovative market-led policy approaches to ensuring access to quality public goods or services in a cost-effective way through risk- and responsibility-sharing between the public and the private sectors.

PPP refers to an arrangement between the public and private sectors for the delivery of a defined quantity and quality of specified public goods and services in which the private sector is contracted to provide them on behalf of the government (Taylor, 2003; LaRocque, 2008; Babatunde et al., 2012). The central philosophy behind PPPs is that all organisations have strengths, but no organisation has all the strengths required to do everything alone (Rotter et al., 2010). Reim (2009, p.14) opines “the primary objective of PPP is to deliver a better service than either the public or the private sector could do alone”. However, Patrinos et al. (2009) and the World Bank (2014) point out that, owing to market failures and/or imperfections as well as equity concerns in developing countries, the government, through the public sector, needs to remain a key player and source of finance and leadership in providing certain public services irrespective of its shortcomings. PPP in education is defined as ‘the process whereby government procures education or education-related services of a defined quantity and quality at an agreed price from specific providers’ (Patrinos et al., 2009, p.9). It is perceived as an education policy for minimising inefficiencies in the delivery and management of public education services while improving both access to and the quality of education, particularly for students from low-income families (Patrinos et al., 2009; Fennell, 2010).

There are critical success factors (CSFs) which, if properly addressed, would significantly improve the efficiency and effectiveness of project/policy implementation in service delivery (Jamali, 2004; Zhang, 2005). Rockart (1982) defines critical success factors (CSFs) as those few key areas of activity in which favorable results are absolutely necessary for a manager to reach his/her goals. Some PPP studies (Jamali, 2004; Cheung et al., 2012; Ismail & Ajija, 2013; Jomo et al., 2016) have shown that there is need for an evaluation and understanding of CSFs for PPPs in public service delivery owing to the contextual differences among countries in which they are implemented. Moreover, Chan et al. (2004) suggest more in-depth case studies to verify the reliability of CSFs identified for PPPs in other contexts. However, not much has been done to assess the implementation of PPPs and their CSFs from stakeholders’ experiences and understandings in some developing countries that have just adopted them (Cheng, Chan & Kajewski, 2012), particularly in the education sector. This calls for exploring the CSFs for the implementation of PPP in USE in Uganda from its stakeholders’ experiences and perceptions.

**The Origin of the PPP Policy in USE in Uganda**

The structure of education in Uganda, which has existed since the early 1960s, includes seven years of primary education, six years of secondary education (divided into four years of lower secondary and two years of upper secondary school) and three to five years of post-secondary education. Historically, the Ugandan government, through its public sector or ministry of education and sports (MOES), has been a major provider of education services at all levels. However, owing to Uganda’s population structure, characterised by a bigger percentage of youth, there have been ever-increasing enrolments at primary level. As most of the resource burden for the basic education of children was carried by parents (Uganda Education Sector Policy Overview, 2006), the government adopted UPE to reduce it. This resulted in heightened demand and increasing enrolments for fee-free USE services in government-owned/aided secondary schools, exceeding their available supply capacity (Uganda National Development Plan, 2010). The PPP in USE policy emerged in 2007 to enhance the government capacity to provide secondary education in Uganda (MOES Report, 2007; MOES Report, 2013).
Uganda adopted a contracting-out PPP model (Taylor, 2003; World Bank, 2009) in which the government contracts a private sector provider to deliver a defined quantity and quality of a specified service at an agreed price for a specified period. In this model, the Ugandan government guides policy and provides finance to procure USE services while the contracted partnership private schools, which ought to be registered with the MOES, deliver USE services to a specific number of enrolled USE students on behalf of the government (LaRoque, 2008; MOES, 2012). The PPP policy requires a range of stakeholders to take on various roles for its successful implementation (Asian Development Bank, 2010). These include government-based stakeholders (mainly from the MOES and district local governments), proprietors of partnership schools, parents of the USE-sponsored children, teachers and head teachers (principals) of partnership schools, parliamentarians (MPs) on the Education Committee (policy-makers), district education officials, school inspectors, local community leaders and academics.

Local empirical studies on stakeholders’ experiences and understandings of the PPP policy implementation in USE and its CSFs in Uganda have been both scarce and methodologically limited. Further, they have hardly ever used phenomenological interpretive qualitative case study approaches to an understanding of this policy phenomenon. For example, Brans (2011), who used discourse analysis of policy documents and only looked at the perceptions of donors, NGO-based managers, and a few policy-makers about PPP in USE in Uganda, reveals that the policy was perceived as ineffective in the provision of quality education and achieving equity. However, his study failed to account for what he perceived as ‘real or primary stakeholders’ (district education officers, school inspectors, head teachers, teachers, parents and community leaders) and their understanding of PPP in USE and perceptions of its CSFs. Similarly, Barungi et al. (2014) in their study on performance evaluation of PPP in USE, whose scope was more evaluative than exploratory, hardly investigated stakeholders’ understanding of this policy and its CSFs from their lived experiences and understanding. Additionally, other studies on PPPs and CSFs in Uganda (Basheka et al., 2012; Alinaitwe & Ayesiga, 2013) largely focus on non-educational projects with little knowledge on stakeholders’ understandings of PPP in USE and what they conceptualise as its CSFs from their lived experiences and contexts.

Besides, other international studies on the topic, such as that by Patrinos et al. (2009), suggest that more research is necessary on the linkages between PPPs and education outcomes in different country-specific settings. In addition, Pakistan Institute of Social and Policy Sciences (2010) argues that there is a lack of rigorous research on the PPPs and that most of the existing evaluations data are generated by the PPP program owners themselves who may have conflicted interests. In the light of the above knowledge gaps, this study, therefore, explores and contributes to an understanding of how and why the various stakeholders perceive the PPP policy in USE, its purpose, impacts (on USE access, equity and quality) and success, and the critical factors for its successful implementation in context of Uganda.

**The Research Questions**

The study was guided by the following key research questions:

i. How do stakeholders understand the origin, purpose and implementation guidelines of the PPP policy in USE in Uganda?

ii. How and why do stakeholders understand the impacts and success of the PPP policy implementation in USE delivery in Uganda in the way they do?

iii. What critical factors do stakeholders perceive for the successful implementation of PPPs in USE delivery in Uganda?

**Theoretical Framework**

PPP in USE was adopted as a national education policy reform (MOES, 2012) whose implementation activities were believed to affect and be affected by many stakeholders in Uganda. As a result, stakeholder
theory was adopted as an appropriate theoretical lens to inform this study. The theory was first introduced by Freeman (1984) in strategic management and later expanded into other fields of project and policy studies (Bourne, 2009; Freeman et al., 2010; Mathonsi, 2012; Siering & Svensson, 2012). A stakeholder refers to any individual, group of individuals or organisation that has an interest, or stake, in a particular (policy) issue or system, and whose interests are believed to affect and/or be affected by a change in that system (Freeman, 1984) and how it is experienced.

Stakeholder theory distinguishes between internal and external key stakeholders in a project or policy through stakeholder analysis criteria. It maintains that the participation of stakeholders in a project or policy is socially shaped and determined by the power influence which stakeholders have over it and over the actions of other stakeholders, and by legitimacy and importance (how closely their interests/stakes coincide with the objectives of the policy) in its implementation. Freeman’s (1984) stakeholder theory also advances the following principles or ground rules for the fair conduct of contracts and the coordination of stakeholder interests: the principle of entry and exit (the contract clarifies entry, exit and renegotiation conditions for stakeholders); the principle of corporate legitimacy (the organisation/project should be managed for the benefit of all its stakeholders, who must also participate in making decisions that affect their welfare); the stakeholder fiduciary principle (the manager must act in the interests of stakeholders as their agent for the benefit of the organisation to ensure its survival); the agency principle (any party/partner must serve the interests of all stakeholders); and the principle of contracting costs (each partner/stakeholder must have a share in the cost of the contract).

Methodology
This paper draws on an exploratory qualitative case study conducted using the interpretive lens (Crotty, 1998; Yin, 2009; Grix, 2010; Maree, 2012). The main area of study was Wakiso district, which is located in the central region of Uganda. It was purposively selected as a case study area owing to its dominance in having relatively more secondary schools offering USE through PPP with a higher enrolment of students than other districts in the country (MOES, 2012; MOES Statistical Abstract, 2014). The stakeholders, who participated in this study, numbering 28, were purposely selected from the MOES, the Wakiso district local government, education-based NGOs, PPP schools in Wakiso, and a public policy think tank. They included 4 government officials from ministry of education, 4 district local government officials, 2 members of parliament, 2 school proprietors, 4 head teachers, 4 teachers, 2 parents, 2 local leaders, 2 NGO-based educators and two 2 academics with some experience and knowledge of PPP policy in USE. Owing to the diversity of their composition, stratified purposive sampling was employed to ensure that an adequate sample of information-rich participants was selected from at least each specific stakeholder group. Snowball sampling also emerged naturally into this study owing to the instances in which some interviewees would refer to other information-rich cases of stakeholders of this policy. The sample size was also partly pre-determined and largely determined by data saturation (Miles & Huberman, 1994; Onweuegbuzie & Leech, 2007).

Four PPP private secondary schools were purposively selected in Wakiso district. One school was urban, another semi-urban and two were rural-based. The selection of PPP schools for this study was based on maximum variation sampling (Christensen et al., 2015) with regard to school performance, location in relation to urban or semi-urban and rural settings, and the size and distribution of USE-sponsored students in each of the PPP schools. In each of the selected PPP schools, a head teacher or school proprietor (school manager), two teachers, one parent representative on either the PTA or BOG and a local community leader were purposively selected as school-based stakeholders.

Semi-structured interviews and document analysis, together with diary field notes, were employed to collect the data in 2015 and 2016. All the interviews were recorded in audio format with the consent of all the participants. For confidentiality purposes, pseudonyms were used to represent the participants’ voices.
We transcribed the recorded interviews into text data, which was analysed using content and thematic approaches. This was inductively done through open coding of interview transcripts by collating and comparing qualitative interview data with similar words, phrases/common ideas to generate certain categories, themes and sub-themes (Rubin & Rubin, 2005; Saldana, 2009) on stakeholders’ understanding of the PPP policy and its perceived CSFs. The key interview information was corroborated with data and literature drawn from the analysis of relevant documents. Document analysis focused on an understanding of the PPP policy origin, purpose, guidelines, impacts, success and CSFs. The documents reviewed for more data and related literature included, but were not limited to, the MOES policy guidelines for PPP schools in Uganda, the MOES Statistical Abstracts, the memorandum of understanding (MOU), the PPP Policy Act (2015) for Uganda, various journal articles and international publications on PPPs and CSFs for successful implementation.

Findings and Discussion
Stakeholders’ Understandings of the PPP Policy in USE
The study revealed that stakeholders’ understandings of policy origin, goals/purpose and guidelines varied subjectively within and across different stakeholder groups and contexts in which they negotiated its implementation. It was evident that most government-based stakeholders and academics demonstrated a better and clearer technical understanding of the policy than the majority of school-based stakeholders. It was also evident that some stakeholders were implementing this policy without a clear understanding of it. Regarding the policy origin and its purpose, most stakeholders understood and perceived the PPP in USE policy to have emerged from the government’s need to increase learners’ access to USE for equity and quality purposes; from the need to meet the excess demand for USE from an influx of UPE learners; from the need to provide affordable secondary education for equity; and as a result of the inadequacy of government-aided secondary schools to deliver USE. However, some few policy actors (especially MOES officials, academics and MPs) perceived this policy to have originated from budgetary constraints and through political influences.

It was evident from this study, as depicted in the following excerpts, that most stakeholders perceived the PPP policy in USE to have emerged from its purpose of increasing learners’ access to USE amidst the inadequacy of government-aided schools to provide it. One of the Inspectors of Schools from the MOES stated that:

… The major goal[ of this policy] is really ensuring access for all; and since access for all [children] could not be achieved in the government-aided schools, then the private schools were a second window through which this access could be achieved. (Government official 3, MOES)

A teacher in one PPP school, who concurred with the above understandings of the policy aim and reasons for its adoption, elaborated his viewpoint thus:

This policy, it is an agreement signed between the private [school] owners and the government to implement the universal secondary education. And this was so because few government schools were built in different areas, meaning that other areas did not have access to schools. … (Teacher in PPP school B)

This understanding ties in with the extant literature on PPPs in education (Latham, 2009; LaRocque, 2009; Patrinos et al., 2009; Verger, 2011; Sehba, 2013; Mgaiwa & Poncian, 2016).

Other stakeholders perceived the policy purpose as government’s need to increase universal access to affordable secondary education for the purpose of equity. A PTA representative demonstrated his understanding of this policy as promoting equity by enabling the children of most low-income parents to attain secondary education. He stressed:
About that policy, my understanding is that, it was purposely meant to give equal opportunity to all the children, both the rich and the poor, and to eliminate illiteracy and ignorance among the communities… So, with the introduction of this policy, many of the children from poor families are also able to attend education. … (Parent representative)

On the other hand, most government-based stakeholders indicate that the policy arose from the inadequately
capacity and number of government-aided schools to accommodate all students and sufficiently deliver USE to them.

…the policy was brought in as a stop gap, especially to address the issues of inadequacy of secondary schools. In secondary [education sector], the private sector has more schools compared to government schools, although the policy is that every sub-county in Uganda should have a government-aided school… So it was agreed that we needed to bring on board the private sector and have partnership agreement with them to enable us [to] have children access secondary education. (Government official 4, MOES)

However, another government-based stakeholder related the genesis of the PPP policy in USE to the
government’s need to sustain an interrelated policy, UPE. He argued that USE creates an opening for UPE products (learners):

…the genesis of this [policy] was a realisation that government did not have enough government secondary schools to absorb all the children who are leaving the primary level … So in a way they [UPE learners] were becoming a danger to the UPE programme as well; because when you are having children accessing free universal primary education [UPE] at primary level and they don’t have anywhere to go after, then, that becomes a policy issue at primary level… (Director of Education, Kampala Capital City Authority)

Other policy-makers and regulators in the MOES attributed the policy origin and purpose to the influx of
learners from UPE, whose demand for USE exceeded the capacity of the available government-aided secondary schools to provide it adequately:

…the government schools which were available could not handle the influx of the children [learners] who were joining secondary schools at that level. So, it was considered pertinent to involve other stakeholders [private schools] who would be willing to work with government. … So, that’s how the policy started. (Government official 3, MOES)

The aforesaid stakeholders’ understandings of the policy are consistent with the literature (LaRocque, 2009; Rose, 2010; Sehba, 2013), which affirms that PPPs in education emerged as a result of the increasing number of children enrolling and seeking affordable public secondary schools beyond the available capacity, and yet neither the public nor the private sector could achieve this end as a single entity.

Other stakeholders perceived the purpose of the PPP policy in USE and its genesis to have emerged from
government budgetary or fiscal constraints in USE service delivery. They believed that government could not carry out its planned activities singlehanded amidst inadequate public financial resources. One district official argued that the PPP policy in USE emerged as a means of bridging the public financial resource gaps experienced in its delivery.

… Resources across the globe have never been enough, and the government cannot do what it’s supposed to do singlehandedly [alone]. It would have loved to do that, but because of the public financial constraints, some other private organisations come in to bridge the gap. So, … also government sought help from the private practitioners [PPP schools] in bridging this gap in education… (Government official 6, district local government)
These understandings are consistent with that of Reeves (2013), Luthra and Mahajan (2013), who identify fiscal pressures as the major trigger for the emergence of PPPs and the country’s engagement in their implementation.

Regarding the political outlook of the policy, some stakeholders maintain that the PPP policy found its way into the USE agenda through political influences. In their understanding, this policy emerged from presidential pronouncements, which some stakeholders perceived as a strategy for fulfilling the president’s earlier political pledge of having at least a secondary school in every sub-county.

Government pledged that it will have a secondary school in every sub-county; and over the years it has failed to fulfill that pledge. So, in order to reach the unreached or underserved or not served areas, it was felt that a public-private partnership would help to cover that gap and create incentives for the private sector [schools] to go into those undeserved areas. (Academic)

This understanding echoes Moniroith’s (2012) view, which identifies political influence in education policy implementation as a common practice by the government-based politicians to achieve and shield their interests from any perceived policy threats. It also corroborates Brinkerhoff and Brinkerhoff’s (2011) opinion that PPPs that are higher in perceived public benefits or interests attract greater political support, and are always accorded more legitimacy.

On contrary, this study showed that some stakeholders, especially school-based actors, lacked a clear understanding of the PPP policy in USE. They participated in its implementation without clearly understanding it. One proprietor and director of one PPP school remarked:

I don’t know what the hidden criterion was, but I assume they [government] would select the schools [with] the best results. We think we were selected because our results have always been good. (Proprietor, PPP School C)

Some teachers in PPP schools expressed a lack of awareness and understanding of the policy they implemented. They attributed the lack of awareness and a clear understanding of the policy to not being informed about it. One teacher reiterated:

…I am not aware of this policy…I really don’t want to deceive you, I really don’t know. To be sincere…I cannot tell you as we are not informed about the policy. … I don’t think [that] all the people [school-based] are informed about it, …a few who are within the Ministry of Education maybe, … because we have not had groups of people coming around at least to sensitise us about partnership [PPP policy in USE] ... (Teacher at one PPP school)

One local community leader revealed unawareness of the policy:

…people who are informed about this policy are very few. …the reason I argue [is] that they [government and schools] should have publicly informed us like on radios or public address system so that all people in the community are informed of such policies. …We would be greatly involved in the implementation of ‘USE in PPP’ (sic) but they don’t inform us. (Local community leader)

The above findings imply that some public policies (PPPs in education) can be implemented by some stakeholders who experience inadequate access to policy information and/or clear understanding of its details. This calls into question how effectively they implement this policy. These findings corroborate Higham and Yeoman’s (2009) affirmation that the differences in the degree of inclusivity, the scale of involvement and the depth of engagement in the partnerships seem to be key factors that influence the extent to which partners understand and collaborate in the education partnership policy in the way they do.

The preceding findings relate with Ball et al. (2012), who assert that sense-making (understanding) of the policy by policy actors through effective communication is the key factor for its enactment and implementation.
Stakeholders’ Perceptions of the PPP Policy impacts and its Success in USE Delivery

Stakeholders perceived policy success mainly basing on the extent to which its implementation contributed to its objectives of access, quality and equity in USE delivery. Most stakeholders had a common understanding that PPP policy succeeded in increasing access to USE through improved student enrolments. However, they differed in their understandings of policy success with regard to its impacts on equity and quality in USE delivery.

The findings indicate that most government-based stakeholders perceived the policy as successful based on its impact of increased access to USE (increased students’ enrolment in PPP schools) and its unintended positive consequences. For instance, one government stakeholder said that the policy was successful because it enabled more eligible children to access USE:

It has been a success story because at least we’ve been able to bring more children on board to access secondary education. They’ve been able to fill up gaps where government was not able to do, so that has been a success story. (Government official 1, MOES)

Other government stakeholders pointed out that the policy also succeeded basing on its other unintended consequences despite the low quality of USE delivered. It contributed to exposure, civilisation or attitude change, mental growth, skill development and reduced teenage pregnancies among students through ensuring increased access to USE.

It [policy] has been a success story because at least we’ve been able to bring more children on board to access secondary education…and training skills…I think you have heard about ‘Skilling Uganda’. So, we have people [who completed USE] going to BTVET [vocational] institutions for certificates for skills. …So, it has been quite a great positive impact on USE; …it has also reduced on teenage pregnancies because now the girls can go to school, there is no longer an issue of saying that we cannot afford. (Government official 4, MOES)

Another government official reiterated:

…the number of children who have accessed secondary education since the beginning of USE…even if they don’t excel, but they definitely have grown physically, they have grown mentally, and they’ve been exposed more. So, they are more civilised citizens than those who didn’t have that. But in terms of the quality of results, we still have a big gap. (Government official 3, MOES)

These findings seem to be consistent with similar results in literature (Gibson & Davies, 2008) that education PPPs have positive impacts on delivery, class attendance, attitude and behavioural change among students, and not necessarily on the intended policy impacts of access and quality only. Though most government-based stakeholders gave less consideration to quality as a measure of policy success, others were concerned about the compromised quality and equity impacts of the policy in spite of its recorded success in increasing access to USE:

…while access has increased, quality of education has not really improved that much. … So it is an indication that quality is somehow compromised. …there is improvement in access, especially in sub-counties that had no government schools. …The [policy] goals were first of all equitable access to quality education…but we are saying that while access has been achieved largely, equity is not clearly achieved because quality is not across the board. Quality is an issue that we are grappling with as a ministry… (Government official 1, MOES).

On the other hand, the vast majority of school-based stakeholders and academics perceived the PPP policy in USE as unsuccessful in Uganda owing to the low and compromised quality of USE outcomes as well as the cynicism about its equity impacts in most PPP schools. They attributed this to the larger numbers of
students, mainly from low-income groups, who enrolled for the affordable USE. They, however, also appreciated its contribution to the reduction in illiteracy:

…it is partly successful and somewhere it has failed. Successful [because] the number of enrolments of the students has gone high …Then it has enabled the students from low-income earners to have access to education and in turn illiteracy levels have been partly reduced from our communities…. But that does not mean that some important milestones of equity and quality have been achieved… (School manager)

This understanding of policy success is consistent with Hodge and Greve’s (2011, p.11) outcome-based approach in which the PPP policy is said to be successful ‘if its objectives are met and desired outputs are achieved’. However, by comparing the low quality of USE outcomes (perceived by most stakeholders) to how other scholars (Harvey & Green, 1993; Brown, 2010; Nabaho et al., 2017) perceive and define the concept of quality as ‘fitness for purpose’, it indicates that PPP policy seemed to have failed [in its fitness for purpose] to ensure its objective of increasing equitable access to quality USE.

Theoretically, these findings also show that the principle of corporate legitimacy and the agency principle, as presumed in Freeman’s (1984) stakeholder theory, do not hold in PPP schools where some stakeholders act illegitimately with non-compliance on quality and equity issues in the implementation of this policy. The unsuccessfulness of this policy as depicted from its compromised USE quality and equity impacts indicates that some stakeholders acted against the principles of good conduct of partnerships. Based on this, most stakeholders suggested the key necessary factors for successful implementation of this policy as discussed in the next section.

**Stakeholders’ Perceptions of Critical Success Factors of the Policy**

Stakeholders’ perceptions of the key success factors for the successful implementation of the PPP policy in USE were identified as follows:

**Choosing Suitable Partners with Adequate Capacity**

The findings revealed that most selected PPP schools in Uganda experienced capacity limitations in terms of understaffing and resource inadequacies.

We have inadequate teachers and the PPP schools have even more constraints, they still have untrained teachers in those schools. And if they have trained teachers, those are science teachers, and then they are part-timers. They cannot attract permanent teachers because of low pay and also there are scarcities, especially for science teachers… (Government official, MOES)

This corresponds with another government-based stakeholder’s view that ‘other than the infrastructures, PPP schools normally lack facilities and operate below the basic requirement’. Yet, such resources and facilities are vital for the effective implementation of this policy. In view of such experiences, most stakeholders suggested that for schools to be eligible for PPP they should have adequate capacity in terms of quality facilities, human and monetary resources.

A good human resource, including both support to teachers and management… if there is good management and there is quality of well-qualified and supported teachers, this [policy] will be sustained. We need to provide them with the right numbers and the right quality of teachers…and on top of that quality management…the [policy] environment should be conducive [with] the equipment and facilities especially for science subjects, the labs should be okay, they should have the libraries…(Government official 6, District)

Patrinos et al. (2009) argue that the capacity of a contracting agency/partner is paramount for the successful implementation of PPP in education.

Other stakeholders maintain that those who manage schools should have a background in education.
I think they should review whom they partner with and should only choose partners that are not-for-profit, and…who have confidence and are able to manage schools, that are educationists… So, if you have good partners with good accountability structures… you will make the policy more successful in USE delivery… (School manager)

These findings are partly consistent with the literature (Grimsey & Lewis, 2004; Brent & Hentschke, 2006; Heald & Georgiou, 2009; Forrer et al., 2010; Amuche & Kukwi, 2013) on PPP implementation in which most proponents emphasise the selection of PPP partners with adequate capacity in terms of teaching facilities as well as financial and quality human resources as critical factors for its success.

However, the study revealed that some government-based stakeholders did not base the eligibility of schools for PPP at the selection stage on their capacity and adequacy. This was attributed to political influence and the urgency with which the selection was done.

Some of these PPP schools really have come on board because of politics. …sometimes there was so much [political] pressure that we were forced to have PPP schools…. where we didn’t even require to have it. You have a PPP school…it does not even have enough facilities but because you know somebody with [political] power has already written, requested and there is pressure, I mean you have to go ahead and say okay [approve it]… and we put the advert. So we were relying on their goodwill…and documentation … (Government official 4, MOES)

This finding is in keeping with Srivastava’s (2010, p.543) argument that ‘political expedience and political pressure (McFadden & Priest, 2011) based on political priorities over others’ interests, may be the main reason behind the push towards PPPs in the social sectors irrespective of the quality of their outcomes. In order to negate the politically motivated selection of PPP schools, it is necessary to understand their motives and establish strong structures through which better and suitable PPP schools should be selected and regulated with minimum undue political influence. One school-based stakeholder elaborated that:

…if you have good partners with good accountability structures, and then you increase or improve funding, you will generally increase quality. But if the government was able to do more rigorous selection of better partners and then do better school inspection, I think you can assume that more funding will improve quality and access… (NGO-based education manager)

This finding is consistent with the view of Bradly and Galisson (2008), who advocated creating a partnership structure with clearly defined roles, procedures and evaluation framework against which partners can be assessed and held accountable in the implementation of PPPs in education.

Commitment to Partnership Roles
In the implementation of this policy, lack of commitment by some stakeholders to their respective partnership roles was revealed as a key barrier to the implementation of this policy.

…the programme [policy] was a very good [one] but the way it’s being implemented is wanting… [Because] as time goes on, most of the schools have not really lived to some of their commitments. (Government official, MOES)

It is evident that without commitment to partnership roles by its stakeholders, successful implementation of the PPP policy in USE will remain challenged. Thus, each stakeholder should be committed to its specific role in the partnership:

We should get to know that this education is a collective responsibility… each and every stakeholder should do his or her roles. [For instance], government must increase funding, parents must provide scholastic materials for their children, and a politician should tell the truth about the roles and responsibilities of each player as far as the policy is concerned. And timely release of funds, of course by the central government; and even the schools must account [for the money] on
time and they must stop wasteful expenditures. [And] we try to behave as professionals … [as] we stick to the standards of the game… (Government official, district local government)

The commitment and responsibility of all partners were perceived as fundamental principles in PPPs in other international studies (Ismail & Ajiija, 2013; Higham & Yeomans, 2009). This is in line with Freeman’s stakeholder principles of corporate legitimacy and agency, which stress that each party must fulfil its roles to serve the interests of all stakeholders for the benefit of all.

One stakeholder asserted that commitment to and engagement in implementation should be the collective responsibility of all stakeholders from the local to the ministry level:

I think government needs to start engaging the proprietors of these schools [to commit themselves]…But even then, that engagement should not only be left between the government and school proprietors… it should also involve the local authorities as well at district and sub-county levels…. Actually government needs to challenge them into engaging them in those schools so that they get involved in what is happening [in policy implementation]. (Member of Parliament, Uganda)

The preceding stakeholders’ views are in conformity with prior scholarship (Rotter & Ozbek, 2010; Forrer et al., 2010; Brinkerhoff & Brinkerhoff, 2011; Babatunde et al., 2012; Cheung et al., 2012; Ismail, 2013) on PPPs in which commitment, trust and responsibility of public and private actors commonly emerged as CSFs for their successful and sustainable implementation. To ensure stakeholders’ commitment to roles, one school-based stakeholder suggested that:

…performance should be tagged to the capitation grant… there should be [a] payment-by-results approach… So, that schools that seem to have poor performance should either receive less or have those learners transferred to other schools that are seemingly performing better. (Government official 4, MOES)

This recommendation resonates with Sehba’s (2011) revelation regarding Pakistani PPPs in which government support is withdrawn from partnership schools that are non-compliant with the required criteria in order to ensure quality outcomes. An alternative approach was also suggested by a government stakeholder who called for a planned and structured way of consistently following the progress that stakeholders made:

…but I think there needs [to be] a more structured way of handling the partnership to ensure that at any one point [in time] both parties in the partnership are seeing their objectives being achieved… [And] consistently follow up on the partnership with clear road maps on what are we committing ourselves to do on both sides and how are we doing in fulfilling our commitments in that partnership. (Government official 3, MOES)

This finding is in keeping with the views of Brady and Galisson (2008), who advocate creating a partnership structure with clearly defined roles, procedures and evaluation framework against which partners can be evaluated and held accountable with regard to commitment to and performance of their roles for the successful implementation of PPPs in education.

Regular Policy Review

In this study, it became evident that while the environments or contexts in which stakeholders implemented the policy continued to evolve over time, its eligibility requirements, policy terms and conditions, as stipulated in the MOU and PPP policy guidelines (MOES, 2013), to which they were subjected for compliance and quality assurance, remained relatively fixed and restrictive. For instance, the PPP policy guidelines forbade PPP schools from charging any extra fee or cost to children over and above what government paid as a PPP subsidy of USh. 47,000 (US$12) per child per term, yet this fund has been found
not only to be inadequate but also fixed since 2007 when the policy was adopted (MOES, 2013). This supports Latham’s (2009) argument that a flexible PPP contract creates a better fit or match between the supply and demand for education.

In view of the existing mismatch between the policy terms and the evolving socio-economic conditions within its implementation terrain, most stakeholders unanimously suggested and advocated regular/consistent policy review of its policy guidelines, terms and conditions with flexible, simple and clearly set out objectives and targets (consistent with the evolving policy contexts) against which stakeholders should be evaluated and held accountable for its successful implementation.

We need to review the policy guidelines and make them much more binding and comprehensive …by introducing aspects of quality. Because the guidelines are just broad areas, they are looking at mainly inputs but we are not tagging this partnership to the outcomes. So, we are not achieving that… guidelines should have also come up with clear targets. [If] there are no targets; so how do you [we] hold these schools accountable, against which targets? (Government official 4, MOES)

These policy recommendations are in conformity with Forrer et al.’s (2010) perception of regular policy review as a necessary condition for successful policy implementation owing to its ability to make the policy and its guidelines clearer, simpler, flexible and more binding for compliance in its evolving environment. This finding concurs with Mgaia wa and Poncian (2016) who suggest for education policy review as a corrective measure for successful implementation of education PPPs in Tanzania to ensure quality outcomes amidst high student enrolments and inadequate capacity/ institutional resources.

### Timely Provision of Sufficient Funding

Most stakeholders went through the commonly experienced challenges of inadequacy and delayed payments of PPP funding as well as its mismanagement. They, thus, unanimously pointed to the timely provision of sufficient funding and its proper use as CSFs for successful implementation of the PPP in USE. The head teacher of one PPP school revealed his experience:

… the amount paid by the government, sincerely speaking, it is very little. In my personal view it is too little to cater for payments of [teacher] salaries, to cater for scholastic materials like chalk, like textbooks, and so many other teaching aids. That the amount is very little… that we always go in for bank loans, we get some soft loans such that we keep paying it for some years to come, but again, you find the whole thing is still very hard to go through. (School manager, PPP school)

As a result of their experience of funding inadequacies in the provision of public education, as affirmed by the empirical literature (Patrinos et al., 2009; Rose, 2010; Luthra & Mahajan, 2013), most stakeholders suggested an increase in funding to improve teachers’ pay and teaching facilities in PPP schools.

I think government should increase the funding… that money which schools receive is little. Then…if the government could as a partnership take up some teachers’ [pay] and be incorporated in the government salary scheme, I think that would help these PPP schools in delivery of quality USE. (Parent)

These findings support Brinkerhoff and Brinkerhoff’s (2011) argument for effective public service delivery through PPP. The governments of poor countries should retain the responsibilities of financing and paying for such services that are provided by the private partner on its behalf to expand their capacity for successful implementation of PPP in delivery of quality services (Srivastava, 2010). Moreover, Verger (2011) argues that education systems with high funding levels have better performance outcomes.

### Consistent Monitoring and Supervision of Policy Implementation

Having experienced the challenge of lack of follow-up of policy implementation by the government as its regulator (Rose 2010; Srivastava, 2010), most stakeholders suggested the need to enhance regular
monitoring and supervision of policy implementation activities of PPP schools as key strategies for it success.

There is need for strengthening the supervisory function because we are talking of schools that are now growing into [a] big number….currently, the department responsible for that doesn’t have the whole capacity to go to these schools regularly as possible but also at the same time… So, the supervisory function should be improved from the local level structures. (Government official 1, MOES)

Likewise, some school-based stakeholders suggested the need for establishing a mechanism for routine monitoring and evaluation of the policy to ensure adherence to policy terms.

… The government should provide a mechanism for monitoring and supervising the policy to ensure that the [PPP] schools adhere to contents of the partnership agreement between them and the government…The other issue that government needs to ensure is routine monitoring of the programme in all schools wherever they are implemented so that there is no diversion of resources, so that we can stick to the main goal to which it was intended... (Head teacher-School Manager)

In agreement with the above findings, the available literature on the implementation of PPPs (Latham, 2009; Hodge & Greve, 2011) acknowledges the need for strengthening the monitoring and regulatory capacity of government mechanisms to ensure compliance with the policy guidelines and quality assurance standards for its success.

Some stakeholders also suggested that the government should identify best practices and what could be done better to improve PPP policy implementation or decide to phase it out.

…I think what we also need to do as a sector is to go back and document the success stories, the best practices and the challenges, because what comes through, people think that partnership schools are not working…. Do we need to continue partnership, do we need to phase out from it or how do we improve it? (Government official 4, MOES)

This finding concurs with the literature (Jamali, 2004; Sheba, 2013; Verger & Moschetti, 2016) that the government should continue to set clearly defined standards and build the capacity to regularly enforce them through a transparent monitoring and regulatory framework to ensure successful implementation of PPP success. However, Hodge and Greve (2011) argue that the existence of different understandings of PPPs and their success by stakeholders call for universal indicators and standards against which success is monitored and evaluated.

**Transparent Regulatory and Accountability Enforcement Mechanisms**

It was evident from this study that the PPP funds were misappropriated and abused by some stakeholders owing to lack of functional and transparent accountability structures. Yet, they continued receiving it despite such accountability shortcomings. In this regard, one district official commented:

…”The issues of accountability are a very big problem. This money is not used for the purposes it is supposed to be used. There is a lot of diversion and misappropriation of funds within those private partnership schools…because of lack of proper structures of administration and infighting amongst the proprietors…” (Government official 5, district local government)

Based on such adverse lived experiences, most concerned stakeholders in this policy proposed that the accountability framework should be enhanced and made more transparent to ensure timely disbursement, effective use and accountability for PPP funds. In this respect, some school-based stakeholders suggested that the MOES, school owners and head teachers of PPP schools should be transparent and accountable for PPP grants they receive and use.

…”all government money should be accounted for promptly… We should make it more transparent because …people think that the headmaster gets a lot of money. Transparency should be taught to
people in the Ministry and to us the recipients and the parent to know exactly what amount of money is received] (Proprietor and Manager of PPP School)

The above finding corroborates Patrinos et al.’s (2009) proposal that the criteria for receiving and spending the grant by partners should be transparent, publicly available and easily understood by all stakeholders. Similarly, one NGO-school based stakeholder suggested that the government should work with the right PPP schools that have better accountability structures with which regular rigorous inspection and student head-counts can be done for accountability of PPP grants. She elaborated:

… if government has good partners with good accountability structures… and the government was able to do more rigorous selection of partners and better school inspection…. So, if the partners are good they should be receiving more funding; but if then they are failing to deliver on student learning outcomes, and then it should be able to be taken away from them... the government should also do headcount … We should also do lots of internal audits of our schools, but also be externally audited as well... (NGO-based educator)

The preceding perceptions of CSFs resonate with Mosha’s (2006) argument that a strong auditing system should be incorporated to supplement existing internal control measures for ensuring accountability. These findings and the views of the NGO-based educator on ensuring accountability by tagging funding to compliance and performance bear out those of Sheba (2013), who indicated that in Pakistan non-compliance and failure by private PPP schools to perform based on the required criteria led to the withdrawal of government support.

However, Heald and Georgiou (2009) and Brinkerhoff and Brinkerhoff (2011) argue that ensuring accountability as a necessary condition for successful PPP policy implementation may not be realised as anticipated unless there are adequate enforcement capacity, legitimacy and a transparent regulatory system through which PPPs are implemented with shared commitment.

**Effective Policy Communication and Sensitisation Strategy**

Finally, this study revealed that while some stakeholders clearly understood the PPP policy they implemented, others did not. Yet it was the same policy irrespective of the different contexts in which they perceived and negotiated it. Some stakeholders attributed the misconceptions, miscommunications and variations in understanding of the policy to lack of effective and adequate communication, limited access to policy information and language barrier in policy communication. One stakeholder (teacher) revealed that ‘…sometimes interpreting something that is read in English into the local language creates its own problems’. These findings corroborate Hodge and Greve’s (2011) and Reim (2009) and Reeves’s (2013) position that asymmetric information due to lack of effective coordination and information-sharing among PPP partners is both a policy implementation governance challenge and a critical barrier to its success. In view of this, most stakeholders suggested that there was need for them to be regularly informed, sensitised and adequately communicated to about the policy details through appropriate channels and forums.

*Sensitise* the public [stakeholders] about this programme [policy]… they just hear about it but they are not having any clue about its terms and conditions; even some of us [teachers]; let everyone else [stakeholders] be informed about this policy… (Teacher)

Another school-based stakeholder suggested that all stakeholders should be sensitised regarding about the policy using different but appropriate strategies to make them understand its contents and their respective roles in policy implementation:

I think we need to put some extra effort in terms of sensitising the masses but specifically in making them understand their role in the whole programme, because every stakeholder has to play his part…to make the programme successful. It is the collaborative effort which is going to make it successful…. (Head teacher, PPP school manager)
Similarly, the academics pointed out that how the policy is packaged in its communication matters a lot. …packaging of the policy message clearly is what matters first. The communication passing from the Ministry needs to really be clear and brief and concise to show out what government expectations are for the community and also what documentation they expect from the government. (Academic, public policy think tank)

These findings and stakeholders’ suggestion are in conformity with the empirical literature on PPP policy challenges and CSFs (Reim, 2009; Rotter & Ozbek, 2010; Hodge & Greve, 2011; Reeves, 2013), which emphasises the need for consistent and clear communication among stakeholders through appropriate and effective communication strategies and channels as critical factors for the successful implementation of PPP policy.

**Conclusion**

This article has contributed to an understanding that stakeholders subjectively vary in their understandings and perceptions of the PPP policy in USE owing to their context-specific differences and lived experiences in its implementation. It was evident that some stakeholders can implement the policy without having a clear understanding of its details. It has also been explored the CSFs for PPP in USE informed by stakeholders’ perceptions and understandings of the lived policy influences its successful implementation in Uganda. Since this case study was limited to one geographical area or region of the country, its findings may not be statistically generalized to the entire population of PPP schools and stakeholders of the policy. Nevertheless, its findings will have analytical (theoretical) generalisability to PPP schools and stakeholders in some similar contexts. In view of these findings, we conclude that, unless suitable policy reforms informed by stakeholders’ understandings and evidence-based CSFs are made and adopted through transparent mechanisms by partners with sufficient capacity, the implementation of PPP policy in some contexts of Uganda may not be successful, resilient and sustainable in ensuring equitable access to economically free quality education for all as envisioned.

**References**


Freeman, R. E., Harrison, J. S., Wicks, A. C., Parmar, B. L., & De Colle, S. (2010). *Stakeholder theory. The state of the art*. Cambridge: Cambridge University.


The Doldrums of Development Projects in Uganda: Gauging the role of PRDP Health Project on Antenatal Care Attendance in Lira District, Uganda

Innocent Nuwagaba¹ & Henry Omoo²

¹²Consultants, School of Business
¹²Management Uganda Management Institute

Corresponding email: innocentnuwagaba@gmail.com

Abstract
This study investigated the contribution of Peace, Recovery and Development Plan (PRDP) health project deliverables to Antenatal Care (ANC) attendance by pregnant women and child birth with care from skilled birth attendants in Lira District, Uganda. The study was guided by the theory of Change. Lira District continues to register low levels of ANC attendance by pregnant women and child birth despite the existing health facilities. The main objective of the study was to examine the role of health project deliverables on antenatal care attendance. The study adopted both qualitative and quantitative approaches under a case study design using questionnaire, documents review and observation methods. The data obtained was analyzed and the study findings revealed that variation in skilled birth attendance, availability of trained health workers and change in the availability of trained health workers causes are highly responsible for skilled birth attendance. The study concluded that availability of staff houses, adequacy and usage of the staff houses, availability of maternity wards, their functionality and usage and availability of trained health workers guarantee realization of improved skilled attendance and child birth in any health facility. The study therefore recommended that the policy makers, and management in Lira district should effectively enforce utilization of staff houses and other infrastructure constructed to improve on accessibility of trained health workers by mothers seeking skilled attendance services.

Key Words: Antenatal Care, Child Birth, Health Facility

Introduction
The study focused on management of health project deliverables and skilled birth attendance, a case of Peace, Recovery and Development Plan (PRDP) Projects in Lira District in Uganda. Maternal mortality ratio (MMR) is one of the key indicators tracked globally as a measure of development. According to the recent publications, the globally the burden of MMR remained high (389/100,000 live births) (Kassebaum et al., 2014). Sub-Saharan Africa was disproportionately (62%) affected by global maternal deaths in 2013. In Uganda MMR is above the global and regional trends (438/100,000 live births)(UBOS, 2012). Northern Uganda which consist of Lango and Acholi sub region, where Lira district is located, accounted for 700/100,000 live births of maternal mortality over the period between 2005 and 2010(UBOS, 2012). Most of the maternal deaths had been linked to one or combination of the following: obstructed labour, bleeding, eclampsia, retained placenta, sepsis or abortion-related(Say, Chou, Gemmill, Tünçalp, et al., 2014). Majority of these deaths occured among pregnant women who gave birth assisted by unskilled persons in the communities (outside the health facilities)(Kyomuhendo et al., 2003). These causes could be avoidable if deliveries/child birth was done with care from well-equipped skilled birth attendant in the health facility. The number of child birth occurring under the care of skilled birth attendants has remained low (52%) in Uganda(Ministry of Health, 2015).

In the financial years, 2010/11 and 2013/14, a period which the PRDP intervention was undertaken, Lira district recorded 46% and 44.9% child births in health facilities with skilled attendance respectively against a national target of 80% (Lira District HMIS database, 2014). This suggests that more than half of expected child births still take place in unsafe environment, a practice whose implication on child birth and maternal mortality in the district this study examined. Ahn and Burke (2015) coined the term “three-delay-models” as the major causes of maternal death. They revealed that, maternal mortality resulted from delays in: Firstly, seeking suitable medical care for an obstetric emergency; secondly getting to an appropriate health
(obstetric) facility; and thirdly getting sufficient care while at the facility (Ahn, et al.; 2015). Improving availability and access for safe motherhood could potentially contribute to reduction in the numerous maternal mortality causes that are occurring locally and nationally. Each of the health project deliverables’ contribution in this study variables are critical to improve availability and access to safe motherhood (WHO, 2016). Construction of staff houses provides accommodation for skilled health workers needed to provide skill birth attendance services, maternity wards provided a safe, private and hygienic environment for easy monitoring of mothers during child birth whilst medical equipment provide the tool to conduct safe and clean delivery to control risks to maternal and neonatal death (Lira District HMIS database, 2015).

Statement of the Problem
Maternal mortality is associated with increased risk of child birth without care from skilled birth attendants. In Lira district 46% of the expected child birth in FY 2010/11, were supervised by skilled birth attendants, against national target of 80% (Ministry of Health, 2014). The district from FY 2010/2011 to FY 2015/2016 provided health project deliverables to directly contribute to reduce maternal mortality from avoidable causes with PRDP specific funding (OPM, 2011). Despite of all these health projects deliverables achieved by the district, not much change in the level of antenatal care (ANC) attendance by pregnant women and child birth from health facilities with skilled attendance is observed. Preliminary examination indicates that child delivery in health facilities with care from skilled birth attendants have been sluggish and only 44.6% of child birth occurred in the health facilities (Lira District HMIS database, 2014). Very little is also known about the contribution of these health project deliverables to the trends of child birth in the health facilities in Lira District. This study therefore investigated their contribution to child birth under the care of skilled birth attendants in Lira district.

Purpose of Study
The study investigated the contribution of health project deliverables to antenatal care attendance by pregnant women and child birth with care from skilled birth attendants.

Study Objectives
i. To assess the influence of staff housing on health project deliverables in Lira District, Uganda
ii. To establish the influence of maternity infrastructure on skilled birth attendance in Lira District
iii. To establish the influence of availability of trained health workers on skilled birth attendance

Literature Review
The study was guided by the Theory of Change (ToC). ToC describes the types of interventions be it a single program or coordinated initiatives that bring about the outcomes shown in the expected outcomes. Each intervention is tied to an outcome in the causal framework, revealing the often complex web of activity required to bring about change (Funnell & Rogers, 2011). Existing research recognizes that adherence to the ToC method keeps the processes of implementation and evaluation transparent so that everyone involved knows what is happening and why (Walker & Matarese, 2011). In the study, ToC helped in establishing the desired change brought about by health project deliverables with special focus on; staff housing as evidenced by availability of staff houses, adequacy of staff houses and usage of staff houses, maternity infrastructure as indicated by availability of maternity wards, functionality of maternity wards and their usage, and medical equipment as evidenced by the availability, utilization and functionality, in child birth occurring in health units with skilled attendance in Lira district local government (Funnell & Rogers, 2011).

Maternal mortality ratio (MMR) still remains high (389/100,000) (Kassebaum et al., 2014) and this is associated with avoidable causes of maternal mortality including bleeding, retained placenta and sepsis during child birth (Say, Chou, Gemmill, Tuncalp, et al., 2014). These causes could be avoidable if child
birth occur with care of well-equipped skilled birth attendant in the health facility however, child birth in health facilities in Uganda remain low at 50% (Ministry of Health, 2015). The avoidable causes of maternal deaths is attributed to late seeking of care, distance to health facility and delay in decision making thus the “three-delay” model. Maternal mortality is due to delays in: Firstly, seeking suitable medical care for an obstetric emergency; secondly getting to a suitable health (obstetric) facility; and thirdly getting sufficient care while at that health unit (Roy Ahn, Thomas F. Burke, 2015). Peace, Recovery and Development Plan was designed to lay a steady basis for recovery and development with specific focus on improving health systems in the communities of Northern Uganda. These plan is intended to close the economic development gaps between the Northern part of the country and the rest of the country side, in a bid to leverage the North to catch up with “national average level” in major development indicators (OPM, 2011). Soucat et al., (2013) claimed that shortage of housing facilities, poor road networks, and no power (electricity) affects health service delivery.

Staff housing, highly contributes to child birth in the health facilities. Soucat et al., (2013) claimed that shortage of housing facilities, poor road networks, and no power (electricity) affects health service delivery. Evidence suggested that access of child birth at health facilities with maternity contribute to maternal and perinatal health (Hussein et al., 2012). According to (Onta, Choulagai, & Shrestha, 2015) distance to health facility influence skilled birth attendance. It is claimed that child birth under the care of a skilled attendant reduce maternal death by up to 80% (Cathryn Ellis, Laura Schummers, 2013) and most causes of maternal deaths were associated with avoidable causes of bleeding, retained placenta, and sepsis (Kassebaum et al., 2014). In Lira district only 43% (Lira District Health Department, 2014) of the total district population accessed the nearest health facility within five kilometer. Whether the maternity wards constructed improved this situation which contributes to child birth with skilled attendance, this study established. Every sub county in Uganda is required to deliver basic emergency obstetric care (BEmOC) and this poses a need for maternity ward availability (Ministry of Health, 2010).

This increases mothers’ access to child delivery services with 5km radius as pregnant women need to access the right care timely (WHO, 2016). Adequate coverage of care for maternal and perinatal health goal was achieved with availability of good quality maternal services (Hussein et al., 2012). (Hussein et al., 2012) further argued that maternity services is dependent upon the health system and elements including human resources, drugs, equipment, transport, communication system and physical infrastructure are crucial to maternal service availability. However, the study failed to mention if maternity wards contributed to the observed change in child birth occurring under the care of skilled birth attendants and this motivated the researcher found out the contribution of maternity infrastructure to skilled birth attendance. Equitable access and use of essential, quality maternal health life-saving commodities when made available and affordable contributes to the reduction of maternal deaths from avoidable causes (Cathryn Ellis, Laura Schummers, 2013). (Firoz, O’Brien, Bahirai, & Stan, 2015) asserted that unsatisfactory maternal care cumulatively result into insufficiencies in health units, characterized by lack of running water, equipment, health supplies, and medicines needed during pregnancy and child birth and this undermines the efforts of skilled attendants to provide the required care. Because of such shortages in health facilities, mothers receive inadequate and low quality of child delivery care (Mselle, Moland, Mvungi, Evjen-Olsen, & Kohi, 2013).

Whilst some research have been carried out on maternity infrastructure, the influence on childbirth under supervised attendance has not be established. It was the researcher’s interest to find out the implication of maternity infrastructure on childbirth occurring in health facilities with care from skilled birth attendants. Kagurusi, (2016) argues that, while is believed that one’s health can be easily restored in the health facilities, the trend regarding health workforce are such that unless something is done now to train, equip and skill the other health workers health service provision in Uganda will still hang in a balance. (Ademe
et al., 2016) asserts that inadequacy of health equipment has overwhelming effect on healthcare. Ademe et al., (2016) further maintained that most medical equipment in the rural settings were out of use and those in resource constrained localities were non-functional. It is claimed that because medical devices have associated risk to patients and staff, its impacts on patient outcome (Ademe et al., 2016). Non functionality and non-use of medical equipment is caused by the type of equipment purchased and the attitude of staff in taking care of the equipment. The correlation between medical equipment functionality and skilled birth attendance is yet to be ascertained. Availability of health workers in the facilities moderates the influence of project deliverables on the level of skilled birth attendance. Bonenberger et al,(2014) asserts that retention of health workers in rural areas is quite challenging, because human resources for health in these areas often endure heavy workloads, in a very unconducive work and living condition, and aggravated by poor infrastructure. Some health workers leave immediately they reach their duty stations. Actually, they come to the duty station, Look, See and Go (Shemdoe et al., 2016). Grobler, Marais, & Mabunda (2015) suggested that governments and those who hold stake should take deliberate actions and address inequalities in distribution and long-term health care specialists’ retention in various setting. Health workers are subject to ‘push’ influences, like remuneration and working environments, and ‘pull’ influences, say job satisfaction and fiscal predictions(Ojakaa, Olango, & Jarvis, 2014). How this influences the health workers to provide skilled attendance, given the availability of health projects deliverables was investigated by this study. Evidence provides that maternity with skilled birth attendance contribute to decline in maternal death(Hussein et al., 2012). Whilst according to Onta, Choulagai, & Shrestha,(2015) distance to health facility influence skilled birth attendance and the claimed that child birth under the care of a skilled attendant reduce maternal death by up to 80% (Cathryn Ellis, Laura Schummers, 2013), a glaring gap still leaves a number of research question unanswered.

Methodology
The researcher used the mixed approach under the case study design (Creswell, 2013). The study population consisted of 379 key project stakeholders of UNRA (Uganda Bureau of Statistics, 2016). A sample size of 214 respondents was used (Krejcie & Morgan, 1970). Simple random and convenient sampling techniques were used. Data was collected using self-administered questionnaires, interview guides, and documents review check list (Lapan, Quartaroli, & Riemer, 2012). Quantitative data was analysed using descriptive statistics and qualitative data was analysed using documents analysis (Schutt, 2011).

Study findings
Response rate
Table 1: Target Population and Sample for Instruments Returned

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Accessible Population</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Planned No of Respondents</th>
<th>Actual No of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td>Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Committee</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health workers</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub County Chiefs</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>379</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

Table 1 above; presents the category of respondents in the study. A total of 151 questionnaires out of the 186 which were administered to the various respondents (mothers who delivered in health facility) in Lira District were returned, presenting a response rate of 81.2%. While, out of the planned 28 interviews, only
21 representing 75.0%. Therefore the above response rate results are in line with Amin (2005:7) who argues that a response rate >= 50 is good enough as the representative of a survey population.

Demographic Characteristics

Table 1: Results of the Respondents’ Background Characteristics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-25</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>55.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-35</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>95.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-45</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>99.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 and above</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.7</td>
<td>.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highest Level of Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed Tertiary</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed Secondary</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed Primary</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>41.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incomplete Primary</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>94.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Occupation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peasant</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>69.5</td>
<td>69.5</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid Employment</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>78.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petty Trade</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>96.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student/Pupil</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital Status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>92.1</td>
<td>92.1</td>
<td>94.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced/Separated</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>99.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widow/Widower</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>151</td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Primary data from field study*

The study sought to find out the ages of the respondents. The results in table 5 shows that the majority (55%) respondents were young mothers between 15 and 25 years. This may mean the respondents could be first time mothers who needs most the skilled birth attendance services. Also less than one percent (0.7%) of the respondents were at least 46 years old, showing a good gesture among the respondents by reducing the risk associated with child birth at advanced age. Table 5 also indicates that majority (59%) of the respondent had incomplete primary or no education at all, revealing incapacity to understand and comprehend messages relating to skilled birth attendance and information about health project deliverables in the health facilities. Whereas the results in table 5 also showed that 69.5% of the respondents were peasants only 8.6% of them had gainful employment. This suggest that the mothers may be dependent to access skilled birth attendances services such as attending ANC visits and child berth in health facilities. In the same table 5, the results showed that those who were single were 2.0% and the majority (92.1%) of respondents were married.
Findings for Staff Housing and Skilled Birth Attendance in Lira district

### Table 2: Descriptive Statistics for Health Staff Housing in Lira District

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable items for Staff Housing</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Sd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The health staff houses in this health center was constructed with PRDP</td>
<td>31 (20.5%)</td>
<td>38 (25.2%)</td>
<td>80 (53.0%)</td>
<td>0 (0.0%)</td>
<td>2 (1.3%)</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>0.852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The health staff houses in this health center constructed with PRDP funding was completed to habitable status.</td>
<td>74 (49.0%)</td>
<td>53 (35.1%)</td>
<td>21 (13.9%)</td>
<td>0 (0.0%)</td>
<td>3 (2.0%)</td>
<td>4.29</td>
<td>.853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The staff houses constructed in the health center accommodates all the health workers who provide skilled birth attendance</td>
<td>89 (58.9%)</td>
<td>48 (31.8%)</td>
<td>6 (4.0%)</td>
<td>4 (2.6%)</td>
<td>4 (2.6%)</td>
<td>4.42</td>
<td>0.897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The staff houses constructed in the health center adequately accommodates all the health workers who provide skilled birth attendance and all their family members</td>
<td>87 (56%)</td>
<td>34 (22.5%)</td>
<td>13 (8.6%)</td>
<td>12 (7.9%)</td>
<td>5 (3.3%)</td>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>1.110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When allocating staff houses, first priority is given to health workers who provide skilled birth attendance</td>
<td>76 (50.3%)</td>
<td>33 (21.9%)</td>
<td>35 (23.2%)</td>
<td>1 (0.7%)</td>
<td>5 (3.3%)</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>1.031</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: Primary data from field study**

Table 2 above indicates that although more than half (53.0%) of the respondents were not sure of the source of funding for constructing staff house, almost all the other respondents (45.7%) agreed that PRDP funded construction of staff houses in health facilities in Lira district. Whereas only 4.0% of the respondents were unsure if all skilled birth attendants are accommodated, majority (91.7% and 72.2%) of the respondents respectively, agreed that staff houses adequately accommodate all the skilled birth attendants and that first priority is given to skilled birth attendants when allocating staff houses compared to 5.2% and 4.0% respectively who disagreed. However, one member of the district executive committee in Lira district had this to say in an interview:

> “the district with support from central government constructed staff houses for health workers in almost all the health facilities but it is disappointing to find the houses not being used although already completed and commissioned. Some health workers have opted to commute from town. The in charges of these health facilities have failed to enforce use of the staff house. This suggested a possible management challenge by those in authority in Lira district.”
Findings for Maternity Infrastructure and Skilled Birth Attendance

Opinion of respondents was sought on the maternity infrastructure being one of the dimension of health project deliverables.

Table 3: Descriptive Statistics for Maternity Infrastructure in Lira district

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable items for Maternity Infrastructure</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This health facility has a maternity ward</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The maternity ward in this health center was constructed with PRDP funding</td>
<td>138 (91.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The maternity ward in this health center constructed with PRDP funding was completed to usable status.</td>
<td>50 (33.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The maternity ward constructed in this health center has necessary utilities (water, lighting, etc.) to conduct child birth with skilled attendance</td>
<td>81 (53.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The maternity ward constructed with PRDP funding in this health center has been operational for at least three years</td>
<td>70 (46.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: Primary data from field study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The findings in table 3 above indicates that, almost all (96.0%) the respondents agreed that the health facilities sampled had a maternity ward and 2.0% of the respondents disagreed that health facility had a maternity ward. The results also shows that almost half (49.0%) of the respondents were not sure whether the maternity care was constructed with PRDP funding and the same percent (49.0) agreed that the maternity wards in the health facility was constructed with PRDP funding compared to their counterpart who disagreed (2.0%). Whereas the majority agreed that the maternity ward was usable (81.4%), had necessary utilities (74.2%) and had been operational for at least three years (73.5%) prior to this study, those who disagreed forms 2.0%, 21.5% and 12.6% respectively. Those who had no opinion about usability of the maternity ward, availability of utilities and functionality of the wards were 15.9%, 5.3%, 13.9% of the respondents respectively. This means some mothers in Lira District probably lack information on skilled attendance services in the district. However in the own words of a Sub County Chief;

“*I was disappointed on one occasion when I personally found vaccines being administered to mothers who had turned up on an antenatal visit by a village health team (VHT) member outside the maternity ward and yet there are facilities in place from where mothers could access such service. It suggested that whereas the number of health facilities in Lira from 201/2011 to 2015/2016 were sufficient, their availability and accessibility by the pregnant mothers was still a challenge.*
Availability of Trained Health Workers and Skilled Birth Attendance in Lira District

The third objective of this study was to establish the influence of availability of trained health workers on antenatal care (ANC) attendance and child births at health facilities in Lira District Local Government. To achieve this objective the respondents were asked to react to several statements on the adequacy of health workers, and their accessibility in Lira District.

Table 3: Descriptive Statistics for Availability of Health Workers in Lira District

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable items for availability of Health workers</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Sd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The number of Health workers in the health facility is sufficient to manage skilled attendance</td>
<td>77 (51.0%)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4.34</td>
<td>0.999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled birth attendants are available in the facility most of the times</td>
<td>84 (55.6%)</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>1.456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled birth attendants are accessible in the facility most of the times</td>
<td>84 (55.6%)</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>1.195</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data from field study

Table 3 above indicates that majority 66.9% (15.9% agree and 51.0% strongly agree) of the respondents agreed that the number of health workers in the health facility is sufficient to manage skilled attendance compared to their counterparts who disagreed (27.1%). The results further shows that majority (82.8%) of the respondents agreed that skilled birth attendants were available in the facility most of the times compared to 15.2% (9.9% disagree and 5.3% strongly disagree) who disagreed. On whether skilled birth attendance were accessible most of the time, four in five of the respondents agreed compared to their counterparts who disagreed. This means that in Lira district, skilled birth attendance are available in their numbers and could be accessed in the facility most of the times. One of the health workers who is the in charge of a Health Sub District (HSD) in Lira had this to say:

“You can’t understand what some of our colleagues are up to. They sign duty attendance book and disappear yet others sign this book in advance especially for days they will absent themselves form duty.”

A councilor (member of the district executive committee) from the district wondered why only support staff such porters and askaris were found in the facility most of the time but highly qualified health workers were rarely seen at their duty station and yet they have very good accommodation allocated to them. According to one district councilor, they had ever found a nursing assistant delivering mothers despite their limited skills in the absence of a midwife. To them, these signals a maternal death if labour is obstructed and thus can be managed by a nursing assistant. This qualitative data sources also confirms that, accessibility of trained health workers has influence on skilled birth attendance services in Lira district.

Discussion of Findings

Findings revealed that that majority (91.7% and 72.2%) of the respondents respectively, agreed that staff houses adequately accommodated all the skilled birth attendants and that first priority is given to skilled birth attendants when allocating staff houses. These was so probably because these deliverables would
improve accessibility of trained health workers by mothers when they come for ANC visits and child birth at facility. However, the interview result carried out with the health unit in charge revealed the contrary that it was not easy to access skilled attendants as most of them prefer to commute leaving the staff house vacant and in some instances be used by support staff who do not provided skilled birth attendances. None use of the staff houses by skilled birth attendants as was intended may be due to laxity by the district authority to enforce use of these staff houses. This status quo poses a management question that responsible managers need to provide an answer. Up to 84.1% of the respondent in the study agreed that, the maternity wards constructed with PRDP funding was usable while 74.2% of the respondent agreed that the maternity wards had necessary utilities and had been operational for at least three years prior to this study. This testifies that project deliverables is a contributor to improved skilled birth attendance. This research finding is in congruence with the earlier findings by Hussein et al., (2012) that, adequate coverage of care for maternal and perinatal health goal is achieved with availability of good quality maternal services including infrastructure such as maternity wards. Therefore, the maternity wards provided a safe environment for monitoring labour progress and normal delivery. It is worth to notice that, project deliverables and skilled birth attendance were found to be positively related in this study. Majority (94.1%) of respondents in the study agreed that medical equipment were available in maternity in Lira District and being used to carry out skilled birth attendance. It means the conducting skilled birth attendance is unquestionable in terms of the tools of work required and this was confirmed by the researcher to positively influence skilled birth attendance in Lira district. However, Hounton et al., (2008) contrasts that functioning of health facilities as measured by equipment and infrastructure is not linked to increased utilization of skilled attendance at child birth. The study revealed, there is a significant relationship between availability of health workers and skilled birth attendance. Implying that as more trained health workers are available skilled birth attendance would improve. However, the availability of trained health workers only explains 24.8% of the variation in skilled birth attendance whilst the rest is explained by other factors. The study further revealed that, taking all factors into account (Skilled birth attendance as a result of Availability of health workers, and project deliverables) constant at zero, skilled birth attendance will be 15.996 and an increase in availability of health workers by 1% would lead to a 45.6% increase in the skilled birth attendance. The study further revealed that that of the filled health facility staff positions, only 66% of the trained health workers were available in the health facilities three months prior to this study. This means that health workers are not available in the facility most of the times as required. This research finding is in congruence with the earlier findings by Bonenberger et al;(2014) that retention of health workers in rural areas is quite challenging, because human resources for health in these areas often endure heavy workloads, in a very unconducive work and living condition, and aggravated by poor infrastructure.

**Conclusion**

Findings revealed that availability of staff houses, adequacy and usage of the staff houses, availability of maternity wards, their functionality and usage, availability of medical equipment, their utilization and functionality, right number of trained health workers and their accessibility by mothers result into improved skilled birth attendance and guarantee realization of improved skilled attendance.

**Recommendations**

The policy makers (councilors), administrators and managers of the district should enforce proper utilization of staff houses and maternity infrastructural facilities constructed to improve on accessibility of trained health workers by mothers seeking antennal care services and child births in health facilities. The district local government staff and the policy makers should put strategies in place to ensure the availability of health workers.
References


Grobler, L., Marais, B. J., & Mbunda, S. (2015, June 30). Interventions for increasing the proportion of health professionals practising in rural and other underserved areas.


Lira District Health Department. (2014). *Health Management Inforrmation Database*.

Marc Bonenberger; Moses Aikin; Patricia Akweongo and Kaspar Wyss. (2014). The effects of health worker motivation and job satisfaction on turnover intention in Ghana:


WHO. (2016). WHO | Pregnant women must be able to access the right care at the right time,


Feasibility of the Sustainable Development Goals Localisation: Evidence from the Community Based Monitoring System

Johnson Lubega Kagugube

Corresponding E-mail: jkagugube@gmail.com

Abstract
The paper aims to provide an analysis of the socio-economic conditions of the Project Site based on the Community Based Monitoring System (CBMS) Study in the context of monitoring the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) at the local level. The progress on the attainment of some of the SDG goals is assessed by analyzing the data gathered from the project site after the implementation of the CBMS census in Akoboi and Katakwi sub-counties of Katakwi district. The Study was carried out with a grant from the Partnership for Economic Policy (PEP) – Community Based Monitoring System (CBMS) Network supported by the Department for International Development (DFID). It is CBMS Research Grant number 17-RG-20141. The research was approved by the Uganda National Council for Science and Technology (UNCST). The research approval reference is ARC 206/ SS 4554. Uganda has been amongst the first UN member states in the world to integrate the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) into its national development planning framework to ensure that no one is left behind. The findings of the Study revealed good progress in a number of sustainable development areas including; access to safe water, poverty reduction, nutrition, gender equality and women empowerment, and equitable quality education. The SDGs where more efforts are still required include; ensuring healthy lives, safely managed sanitation services with hand washing facilities, access to electricity, address the high unemployment rate, and the civil registration. Inequality was identified as one of the major barriers to the attainment of the SDG goals. It is recommended that the Government of Uganda should put in place strategies to address disparities that restrict opportunities to access quality education, safe sanitation, and access to income generating activities, access to information, and access to electricity.

Keywords: Community Based Monitoring System, Sustainable Development Goals, Income Generating Activities

Introduction
The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) built on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and were adopted in January 2016. The SDGs are universally applicable 17 goals and 169 targets of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The SDGs which the Government of Uganda ratified are clear on ending poverty of all forms, ending hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture, ensuring healthy lives and promote well-being for all, ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all, achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls and reduce inequality.

Uganda actively pursued the sustainable development agenda since the early 90’s with three distinct transition phases: post war reconstruction (1986 – 1997); poverty eradication (1997 – 2009); and social economic transformation (2010 –2020). The second National Development Plan (NDP II 2015/162019/20) which is Uganda’s current medium term plan is also the framework for implementing the 2030 Agenda and SDGs. The NDPII intends to achieve middle income status by 2020 with a per capita income of US$ 1,039 through strengthening the country’s competitiveness for sustainable wealth creation, employment and inclusive growth. NDP II integrates the SDGs into the plan. Over 50% of the SDG targets are aligned to the NDP II. An assessment undertaken by the National Planning Authority indicated that the NDPII had integrated 69 percent of the SDGs. The integration of SDGs would continue to trickle down to sector and local government planning frameworks. The localization of the SDGs in the local governments required putting in place data generation strategies to inform the monitoring process. This is in line with the call for a Data Revolution (DR) by the United Nations High Level Panel (UNHLP) on the Post–2015 Sustainable Development Agenda. A data revolution is required to underpin transformational shifts for attaining sustainable development.
The DR also entails the increase in accessibility to data through much more openness and transparency, and ultimately more empowered people for better policies, better decisions and greater participation and accountability, leading to better outcomes for the people and the planet. In order to design and make informed policies and decisions, there is a need to collect and process real-time data. This would facilitate drawing of conclusions about the various sections of the population. Regular up to date information to inform policy makers about household livelihoods and the status of financial inclusion at the local government level is currently lacking. A Community Based Monitoring System (CBMS) is one of the most effective ways of generating real-time data for evidence decision making.

Development Research and Training (DRT) embarked on the Community Based Monitoring System (CBMS) Research Project in 2016. The financial and technical support was provided by the Partnership for Economic Policy - Community Based Monitoring System Network (PEP-CBMS-N). The grant enabled DRT to conduct the CBMS in two lower local governments of Katakwi Town Council and Kapujani subcounty of Katakwi district in Eastern Uganda. The information generated enriched the understanding on the coping strategies employed by the youths when they are unemployed. The research findings informed policies on youths and data was provided to support the planning processes at lower local government and village level.

During the year 2018, a CBMS study was conducted in two lower local governments of Akoboi and Katakwi subcounty of Katakwi district in Eastern Uganda, with the aim of filling the information gap with regard to understanding household livelihoods and financial inclusion and how individuals and households make decisions on the various options of saving their money. Such information would be vital to inform the planning process at both local and national level. The data would enable individuals, community leaders, businessmen, and non-profit organisations to plan more effectively with up-to-date data. In addition, data was collected on some SDG indicators. In the context of SDG monitoring, this paper presents the findings on some of the indicators in the two lower local governments of Akoboi and Katakwi.

Map of Uganda showing the Study Area

Methodology

Data Collection
The Study employed the CBMS methodology, which involves complete enumeration of all the units (households). Two data collection modules, namely the quantitative and qualitative, were employed to achieve meaningful results. The CBMS module was employed to generate quantitative data. The CBMS module was administered in all households of the Project sites using tablets. The enumerators visited the
respondents in their homes. On the other hand, a checklist for the qualitative information was developed to guide the Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) at village and sub-county level to generate information that would enrich/complement the quantitative findings. The venues for the FGD meetings were in the village centers for the village participants and Subcounty council hall for the subcounty level participants. DRT sought for assistance from PEP Asia Community Based Monitoring System International Network (CBMS-N) to provide technical support for further development of the mobile applications for data generation methodologies, including: development of the data collection applications, procurement of a statistical package STATA, training on generation of poverty maps, and the database development.

The enumerators were recruited from Katakwi district in order to minimize or even avoid the challenge of language barrier. Senior Secondary Six (High School) leavers who were residents of the subcounty or a nearby one with knowledge of the local language (Ateso) were hired for the job. On the other hand, the supervisors and editors were recruited from the headquarters (Kampala) given the high-level of experience required for the job. The recruitment process of the fieldworkers ensured a gender balance. Overall, a total of 20 enumerators, 5 editors and 3 supervisors were recruited for the CBMS data collection. The field workers were trained at district level by the trainers from the Centre (DRT). The training of the trainers was conducted at the DRT offices before deployment to the field. The data collection was a door to door data gathering exercise, which covered all households in the Study area. The enumerators used tablets to collect the data which was uploaded on the servers every day. The data collection was carried out during the day. All the supervisors and editors supervised data collection. The editing of the data on the tablets was carried out in the evening after the day’s fieldwork. In addition, the supervisors were in charge of facilitating the FGDs at both village and subcounty level.

Coverage

At the time of data collection, Katakwi district was constituted by two counties of Usuk and Toroma. It had a total of 17 lower local governments (16 sub-counties and one Town Council). According to the 2014 Population and Housing Census, Katakwi district had a total of 30,791 households with an average household size of 5.4 persons per household. During the second phase, two lower local governments of Akoboi and Katakwi were covered. The Study enumerated 5,201 households in the two lower local governments. Out of the total, 2,767 households were in Katakwi subcounty while 2,434 household were enumerated in Akoboi subcounty. Overall, 24,314 people were enumerated. An average household size of 4.7 persons per household was recorded, which was similar to the National figure from the 2014 National Population and Housing Census.

Limitations of the Study

Some of the limitations of the study included the following:

- Delayed approval of the CBMS research by the Uganda National Council for Science and Technology (UNCST): The approval process delayed the CBMS data collection for about three (3) months.
- High expectations from the respondents in terms of individual hand-outs. The fieldworkers had to explain to the respondents the objectives of the Study to minimize on the expectations.
- In some areas the households were sparse making movements between households consume a lot of time.
- Data collection was carried out during the rainy season. The rain affected the movement of enumerators in the villages.
The SDG Study Indicators

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) also referred to as the Global Goals, are aimed at ending poverty, protecting the planet and ensuring that all people enjoy peace and prosperity. There are 17 goals and 230 indicators. The SDGs build on the successes of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The new areas such as climate change, economic inequality, innovation, sustainable consumption, peace and justice, were included. They provide clear guidelines and targets for all countries to adopt in accordance with their own priorities and the environmental challenges of the world at large. The SDGs are an inclusive agenda. They address the root causes of poverty and unite us together to make a positive change for both people and planet. Poverty eradication is at the heart of the 2030 Agenda, and so is the commitment to leave no-one behind. The Agenda enables the whole world to move together on a more prosperous and sustainable development path.

The SDGs focus on key areas including poverty alleviation, democratic governance and peace building, climate change and disaster risk, and economic inequality. The Government of Uganda received support from UNDP to integrate the SDGs into the second National Development Plan (NDP). Many national indicators were matched with the SDG indicators. The indicators in the national reports that were matched included; the NDP indicators, the National Standard Indicators (NSI), and the National Priority Gender Equality Indicators (NPGEI). The 28 SDG indicators that could be generated from the CBMS Study.

Study Findings

The second CBMS Study collected information from 5,201 households in the two subcounties of Akoboi and Katakwi. Overall, 24,314 people were enumerated. Out of the total population, 11,675 and 12,639 were males and females, respectively. A sex ratio of 92.4 was revealed. In addition, the results indicated a household size of 4.7 which was similar to the National average household size (4.7 persons per household), obtained from the 2014 Uganda Population and Housing Census. The findings of the CBMS II with regard to selected socio-demographic, household and housing characteristics are presented in the subsequent paragraphs.

Socio-demographic and Economic Characteristics

The examination of socio-demographic factors is necessary since they affect the people’s ability to function normally in their everyday life. The findings presented below are in relation to selected demographic characteristics, household, and some of the socio-economic variables which are relevant in the assessment of the progress on the SDGs. The results are summarized by locality, gender of the household head, and age of the head of household. The household size by category is presented in table M1 and the map below. The majority of the households presented six persons or less per household. There were no major marked differences when the comparison was carried out by subcounty.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Size</th>
<th>Sub-County</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>Kataki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One Person</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>10.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Persons</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>10.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three Persons</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four Persons</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FivePersons</td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>15.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six Persons</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>11.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seven Persons</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eight Persons</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nine Persons</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ten or more persons</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table M2 presents the distribution of the population in five-year age groups by sex and locality. Close to 50 percent of the population was aged less than 15 years. Considering the sex of the person, 51% and 47.8% of the males and females, respectively were aged below 15 years. The females presented a higher proportion for the overall population and for those aged 65 years and above, irrespective of the locality. An analysis of the age dependency ratio which is a measure showing the number of dependents, aged zero to 14 and over the age of 65, to the total population, aged 15 to 64 indicated that there were more people in the non-working ages than in the working ages (figure M1). At subcounty level, the dependency ratios were, 126.1 and 127.2 for Akoboi and Katakwi, respectively. The analysis of the data by considering the survival status of the parent by age of a household member depicted an inverse relationship. There was a significant reduction in the parents as the age of the household member advances. Furthermore, more fathers than mothers were likely to die as the age of the household member increases.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age categorised in 5 years</th>
<th>Akoboi Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Katakwi Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 - 4 Years 15.6</td>
<td>899 16.2</td>
<td>895 15.4</td>
<td>1794 15.8</td>
<td>1004 16.4</td>
<td>1017 14.9</td>
<td>2021 15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 - 9 Years 16.3</td>
<td>936 16.9</td>
<td>897 15.4</td>
<td>1833 16.1</td>
<td>1058 17.3</td>
<td>1051 15.4</td>
<td>2109 17.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 - 14 Years 17.9</td>
<td>1006 18.1</td>
<td>1004 17.2</td>
<td>2008 17.7</td>
<td>1143 18.6</td>
<td>1169 17.2</td>
<td>2312 18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 - 19 Years 7.5</td>
<td>417 7.5</td>
<td>403 6.9</td>
<td>820 7.2</td>
<td>464 7.6</td>
<td>510 7.5</td>
<td>974 7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 - 24 Years 6.4</td>
<td>334 6.0</td>
<td>405 6.9</td>
<td>739 6.5</td>
<td>349 5.7</td>
<td>481 7.1</td>
<td>830 7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 - 29 Years 3.9</td>
<td>206 3.7</td>
<td>251 4.3</td>
<td>457 4.0</td>
<td>200 3.3</td>
<td>311 4.6</td>
<td>511 4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Group</td>
<td>Deaths</td>
<td>Males</td>
<td>Females</td>
<td>Males</td>
<td>Females</td>
<td>Males</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 - 34 Years</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>922</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 - 39 Years</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>615</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 - 44 Years</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>453</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 - 49 Years</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>376</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 - 54 Years</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55 - 59 Years</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 - 64 Years</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+ Years</td>
<td>305</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>707</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018*
The distribution of the household population by relationship to the head of household and sex is presented in table M3. The majority of the household members were related to the household head as sons and daughters. The male heads of household formed 68.5 percent of the total, while the female heads constituted 31.5%. It is worth noting that some of the female spouses were identified as heads of household due to separate eating arrangements especially for the polygamous families. A household is defined as a

![Image of bar charts showing distribution by sex and age groups.](Image)

**Figure M1: Analysis of the Age, Structure and Survival status of parents**

**Distribution of the population by sex**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>48.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katakwi</td>
<td>52.6</td>
<td>47.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Distribution of the population by functional age groups**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0-14 years</th>
<th>15-64 years</th>
<th>65+ years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>64.2</td>
<td>29.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katakwi</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>44.7</td>
<td>49.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>44.5</td>
<td>49.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Survival status of mother by age and locality**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Akoboi</th>
<th>Katakwi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 to 14 years</td>
<td>92.4%</td>
<td>93.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 to 64 years</td>
<td>70.4%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65 and over</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
<td>9.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Survival status of father by age and locality**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Akoboi</th>
<th>Katakwi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 to 14 years</td>
<td>80.3%</td>
<td>80.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 to 64 years</td>
<td>51.1%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65 and over</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

Figure M2 presents the findings on survival status of parents by the five-year age group of the household member. The findings confirm that the probability of losing a parent increases by the age of the respondent. Consistently, more fathers than mothers were reported dead at every age group.

**Figure M2: Survival status of parents by age group of the household member**

![Image of bar chart showing survival status by age group and gender.](Image)

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

The distribution of the household population by relationship to the head of household and sex is presented in table M3. The majority of the household members were related to the household head as sons and daughters. The male heads of household formed 68.5 percent of the total, while the female heads constituted 31.5%. It is worth noting that some of the female spouses were identified as heads of household due to separate eating arrangements especially for the polygamous families. A household is defined as a
group of people eating and living together. For the polygamous families several households could be determined based on the eating arrangements.

### Table M3: Distribution of the Household Population by Relationship to Household head

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship to Head of Household</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head</td>
<td>29.3</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>23.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son/ daughter</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>46.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son/ daughter in law</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand child</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other relative</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic worker</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other specify</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

### Social Characteristics

The social characteristics considered in this sub-section are; marital status, possession of a birth certificate, religion, education and health status. Table M4 presents the distribution of the household population aged 18 years and over by locality. Over a half of the population aged 18 years and over was married, while about one-fifth of members in the same population category were single. The widowed formed about onetenth of the entire population.

### Table M4: Percentage distribution of the population aged 18 years and over

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Akoboi</th>
<th>Katakwi</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>21.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legally married</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>53.2</td>
<td>55.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separated</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-habiting</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

The analysis of the data by religion showed that the majority of the household members were Catholics forming about 60 percent of the total (figure M3). The other important religions were; protestants and born again.
The CBMS 2018 collected information pertaining to the literacy status. The findings revealed that the male literacy levels were higher than those presented by their female counterparts (figure M4). Overall, 55% of the population was literate.

The household members aged three (3) years and above were requested to indicate their school attendance status. Overall, 37.6 percent reported that they were still attending school. The population who were still attending school among the males formed 39.5 percent while for the females 35.9 percent. The persons who reported that they were not attending school were asked to state their highest level of education (table M5). Those with no grade formed 26.3 percent of the population in Akoboi, Katakwi and the overall. The proportion of the females (29.8) was higher than that of their male counterparts (22.5). Most of the people in the two localities were ending their education chapter before reaching secondary school level. Long distance to school and lack of funds were as the major reasons for not continuing with formal education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Akoboi</th>
<th>Katakwi</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>10-17 yrs.</th>
<th>18-30 yrs.</th>
<th>31-60 yrs.</th>
<th>Over 60 yrs.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018
Figure M5 presents the distribution of the population in the study area by possession of a birth certificate. There is an inverse relationship between age of the person and possession of a birth certificate. As the age increases, the proportion of the persons with a birth certificate reduces.

### Economic Characteristics

The economic situation of the household was assessed by analyzing a number of variables including; ownership of assets, sources of income, total annual income, poverty levels, standard of living, and the coping strategies when the household is faced with challenges of scarcity of basic needs. Table M6 presents the proportion of households owning assets. The common assets owned by households were; mobile phones, houses, land and radio. Those assets were either individually or jointly owned.
Subsistence farming was the most important source of earnings followed by wage employment (table M7). Some variations were noted when the proportions for those in subsistence farming and wage employment were compared for the two subcounties. The total annual income by subcounty is presented in figure 4.6 below. About half of the households were categorized in the total annual income group of 1,000,001 to 5,000,000. The households earning more than five million Uganda shillings formed 19 percent of the total.
Respondents were asked to indicate the poverty status of the household (figure M6). Over two thirds of the total households indicated that they were poor. The households falling in the categories of neither poor nor rich and rich formed less than 20 percent of the total. A similar trend in the reporting was presented for the standard of living. To the majority of the households, the income was very unstable. Only few households testified that the income was stable forming about two percent. With regard to the changes in living standards, it is worth noting that close to half of the households indicated that the situation stayed the same. The distribution of households by selected characteristics of poverty is presented in maps 5 to 7 below.

**Map 3: Ownership of livestock**

**Map 4: Households owning a radio, TV or phone**

**Table M7: Percentage distribution of households by important sources of income and locality**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Important Source of Earnings</th>
<th>Sub-county</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>Katakwi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsistence farming</td>
<td>73.2</td>
<td>67.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial farming</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wage employment</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-agricultural enterprises</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018**

M6: Assessment of Poverty and Standard of Living
Subjective poverty levels (%) and Standard of living (%)

Stability of household income (%) and Changes in living standards (%)

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

Map 5: Distribution of the households by subjective poverty levels

Map showing the distribution of households by subjective poverty levels.
When faced with challenges of meeting the needs of the households, most of the household heads reported seeking assistance from neighbours and extended family members (table M8). It is worth noting that 6.4 percent of the households lacked any form of coping strategies when in need of assistance.

**Table M8: Percentage distribution of the households by coping strategies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Katakwi</th>
<th>Akoboi</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Depend on to Provide Assistance</td>
<td>41.8</td>
<td>40.3</td>
<td>43.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighbours</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious organisations</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional associations</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>29.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Map 6: Distribution of the households by changes in standards of living

Map 7: Household ranking of the standard of living
Housing and Household Characteristics

Figure M7 presents the distribution of households by selected characteristics. The characteristics considered are: occupancy tenure of the house, type of dwelling, type of roof and type of wall. Most of the households were staying in their houses. The houses were mainly detached roofed with iron sheets and constructed using unburnt bricks with mud.

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

The distribution of the households by source of energy for lighting is presented in figure M8 below. The findings show that the majority of the households were using hand torches as a source of energy for
lighting. The other important sources of energy were electricity and paraffin.

From figure M9, it is very clear that accessing water from the boreholes is almost universal. More households from Akoboi (98.6%) were accessing water from the boreholes than their counterparts in Katakwi subcounty.

Figure M8: Source of energy for lighting (%)

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018
With regard to sanitation, the CBMS study collected information on the type of toilet facility used by the households and whether a hand washing facility existed. The findings are presented in table M9 and figure M10 below. The majority of the households were using covered pit latrines without slabs forming 34 percent overall. The percentage of households using covered pit latrine without slabs was higher in Akoboi (44.5%) than in Katakwi subcounty (24.6%). It is worth noting that a substantial proportion of the households were lacking toilet facilities. Similarly, the majority of the households lacked hand washing facilities after toilet use. Overall, the households with hand washing facilities with water and soap constituted only 3.1 percent of the total.

Figure M9: Source of drinking water (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Akoboi</th>
<th>Katakwi</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public tap/borehole</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public borehole</td>
<td>98.6</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>97.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protected well/spring</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018
Table M9: Distribution of households by toilet type and sub-county

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Toilet Type</th>
<th>Sub-county</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>Katakwi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flush toilet</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIP toilet</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Covered pit latrine with slab</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Covered pit latrine without slab</td>
<td>44.5</td>
<td>24.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncovered pit latrine with slab</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncovered pit latrine without slab</td>
<td>14.8</td>
<td>11.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecosan</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No facility</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>44.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census in Akoboi and Katakwi subcounties, Uganda, 2018

Figure M10: Availability of hand washing facilities (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Availability of hand washing facility, Akoboi</th>
<th>Availability of hand washing facility, Katakwi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None, 78.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Availability of hand washing facility, Overall
The majority of households lacked hand washing facilities after toilet use

CBMS SDG Indicators

The findings of the Study with regard to the SDGs are presented below.

GOAL 1 – End extreme poverty in all forms by 2030

According to the United Nations (UN); ―eradicating poverty in all its forms remains one of the greatest challenges facing humanity. While the number of people living in extreme poverty dropped by more than half between 1990 and 2015, many people are still struggling for the most basic human needs. Table M10a presents results of the indicators generated using the CBMS data. Ending poverty in all its forms involves targeting the most vulnerable, increasing access to basic resources and services, and supporting communities affected by conflict and climate-related disasters. To compute the poverty levels, two approaches were employed namely; the International Poverty Line of United States Dollars 1.9 per capita per day and the National poverty line. An exchange rate of Uganda Shillings 3,700 for every One United States Dollars was considered. Generally, the findings show that the poverty levels for the Study area were higher than the National average (27 percent) given that the computations were based on the International Poverty Line. Furthermore, few households were accessing all the basic services, that is basic education, drinking water, sanitation and shelter (maps 8).

Table M10a: Relevant Indicators for Goal 1: generated from the CBMS Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.1.1 Proportion of population below the international poverty line, by sex, age, employment status and geographical location (urban/rural)</td>
<td>The international poverty line used in determining the population below the poverty line is United States Dollars (USD)1.90 per capita per day. Uganda National Household Survey (UNHS) is the source of poverty statistics. The poverty head-count index is computed based on the household consumption expenditure</td>
<td>Poverty Head Count—UNHS 2016/17 National – 27.0% Eastern – 42.7%</td>
<td>Based on the international poverty line of USD 1.90 per capita per day Akobo – 94.5% Katakwi – 93.9% Gender of head of household: Male – 93.6% Female – 96.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 2.1.1 Proportion of population living below the national poverty line, by sex and age

The Uganda National Household Survey is the main source of data for computation of poverty statistics. A poverty line is constructed based on the household consumption expenditure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Poverty Head Count—UNHS 2016/17</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>27.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern</td>
<td>42.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the National Poverty Line of Shs. 29,505 per person per month

- Akoboi – 54.4%
- Katakwi – 56.5%
- Overall – 55.5%

### 4.1.1 Proportion of population covered by social protection floors/systems, by sex, distinguishing children, unemployed persons, older persons, persons with disabilities, pregnant women, newborns, work-injury victims and the poor and the vulnerable

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Not Available</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katakwi</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>17.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5.1.1 Proportion of population living in households with access to basic services

Basic services included in this indicator are the following: basic education, drinking water, sanitation and shelter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Households enjoy some basic services. The services considered were education, safe drinking water, sanitation and shelter</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Akoboi</td>
<td>Akoboi – 99.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katakwi</td>
<td>Katakwi - 99.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>Households enjoy all basic services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Akoboi – 7.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Katakwi – 7.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Map 8: Households enjoying all basic services*
Derivation of the Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI)

The Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI) is an extension of the one-dimensional class of decomposable poverty measures proposed by Foster, Greer and Thorbecke (1984) and emerged from the dimension-adjusted poverty headcount ratio proposed by Alkire and Foster (2007). The index is made up of two components: the poverty headcount, H, and an adjustment measure, A, which represents the number of deprivations suffered, on average, by the poor. Table M10b present the weights which were used for the MPI, while table M10c shows the results.

Table M10b: Weights for the Multidimensional Poverty Index Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Dimension Weights</th>
<th>Indicator Weights</th>
<th>Magnitude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>Children under 5 years old who died</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/6</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Malnourished children 0-5 years old (Proxy considered the type of breakfast)</td>
<td>1/6</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Children 6-12 years old not attending school</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/6</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Children 13-18 years old not attending school</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/6</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Conditions</td>
<td>No electricity</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/18</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No access to clean drinking water</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/18</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No access to adequate sanitation (uncovered pit, no facility and other)</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/18</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>House has dirt floor</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/18</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Household uses dirty cooking fuel-firewood, charcoal and dung</td>
<td>1/3</td>
<td>1/18</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GOAL 2 –End Hunger
End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture. In Uganda, hunger has largely dropped in most of the Country’s areas that used to suffer from famine. This has been addressed through the Country’s implementation of the National food and nutrition policy, the Food and Nutrition Policy is important because it provides a framework for addressing food and nutrition issues in the country so as to sustain development. The policy focused on some key areas like food supply and access to good quality food for human consumption, food processing and preservation so as to promote adequate, safe, high quality and nutritious foods within the country.

With regard to Goal 2, the proportion of children below 5 years (0-4years) who feed on non-nutritious meals was used as a proxy indicator. The children who were not given anything, those who were served with tea/drink with sugar only, and those who were served porridge without sugar formed 17.8 percent of the total (table M10d).

**GOAL 3 – Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages**
Under Goal 3, the Study attempted to provide information of proxy nature on two indicators, namely, maternal mortality ratio and under-five mortality. Due to the complexity associated in the computation
of those two indicators, the numbers derived were used as a proxy to the indicators. Out of 137 deaths reported in the households in the past 12 months preceding the data collection, four (4) were connected to complication during child birth, and 19 cases for children below five years (table M10e).

The major causes of death for children below five (5) years were; disease of the heart, pneumonia, measles, complications at the time of birth, malaria, lack of blood and accidents.

### Table M10e: Goal 3. Ensure healthy lives and promote wellbeing for all at all ages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.1.1 Maternal mortality ratio, per 100 000</td>
<td>Instead of using the live births data as denominator, since this is not available, the number of children 0 to 1 year old plus the total of number of women who died due to pregnancy-related causes was used.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Death of a family member reported in connection to complications during pregnancy or child birth in the past 12 months preceding data collection 4 out of 137 deaths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.2.1 Under-five mortality rate, per 1000</td>
<td>Instead of using the live births data as denominator, since this is not available, the number of 0 to 5 year old plus the total number of children 0 to 5 years old who died were used.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Overall 19 children aged less than five years died out of the total 137 deaths in the past 12 months preceding data collection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**GOAL 4 - Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education**

Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all. According to the 1995 Constitution of Uganda, Article 3, children have a right to education. Article 34 provides that a child is entitled to basic education which shall be the responsibility of the State and the parents of the child. The Ugandan Parliament effectively passed Universal Primary Education (UPE) in 1997 so as to ensure that the right to education is met and fully enjoyed. Table M10f presents the
relevant indicators in connection to ensuring inclusive and equitable education. The findings revealed a higher Net Enrolment Rate (NER) at primary school level than the one revealed by the UNHS for the rural areas. However, the NER at secondary school level for the study area (11.3) was lower than the national average for the rural areas (23).

**GOAL 5 - Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls**

Many countries are committed to ending all forms of discrimination against women because it is crucial for accelerating sustainable development in addition to being a basic human right. There are critical gender differences in the Country which should be addressed. Uganda has a Gender Policy which guides the country to achieve gender equality and women's empowerment. The policy has also led to awareness and acceptance of the equal opportunities and gender equality and treatment in employment and allocation of resources.

Table M10g presents the proportion of households where at least one member had a mobile phone by locality and gender of household head. Over 50 percent of the households in the study area reported having mobile phones. The percentage obtained was lower than that revealed by the UNHS for ownership of mobile phones individually or jointly (73%).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4.1.1 Proportion of children and young people: (a) in grades 2/3; (b) at the end of primary; and (c) at the end of lower secondary achieving at least a minimum proficiency level in (i) reading and (ii) mathematics, by sex</td>
<td>The following were used as a supplemental indicator: Net and gross enrolment rate in primary and secondary education</td>
<td>UNHS Literacy rates— Overall - 74% Female – 70% Male – 78%</td>
<td>NER – Primary – 88.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NER- Secondary - 11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.2.1 Proportion of children under 5 years of age who are developmentally on track in health, learning and psychosocial well-being, by sex</td>
<td>Proxy indicator to 4.2.1 Number of children in child development centers/ day care centers</td>
<td></td>
<td>28.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.2.2 Participation rate in organized learning (one year before the official primary entry age), by sex</td>
<td>Proxy indicator to 4.2.2Enrolment Rate in kindergarten:(a) Net Enrolment Rate(b) Gross Enrolment Rate</td>
<td></td>
<td>NER – 28.1 GER – 36.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Goal 5. Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.b.1 Proportion of individuals who own a mobile telephone, by sex</td>
<td>This is computed as proportion of households with at least one member who owns a mobile telephone</td>
<td>UNHS 2016/17- Ownership of mobile phone individually or jointly – 73%</td>
<td>Akoboi – 47.8% katakwi – 50.3% overall – 50.1% Male headed households – 54.9% female headed households – 38.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**GOAL 6 - Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all**

The Government has invested a lot of resources to ensure universal access to safe and affordable drinking water for all by 2030. Access to safe drinking water was one of the targets which the Country achieved under the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Uganda has fresh water sources which are important for life sustenance and socio-economic development. The results on SDG indicators generated using CBMS data are presented in table M10h. Access to safe drinking water in the two localities was almost universal. However, it is worth noting that only few households were accessing safe sanitary facilities.
GOAL 7 - Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all

In fulfilling the 2030 development agenda the Government of Uganda through its Ministry of Energy and Mineral Development, designed an energy policy for the Country with a core goal of meeting energy needs for the Ugandan population in all social and economic development. The energy needs will be met in an environmental friendly manner which is sustainable. Currently, the percentage of households accessing electricity is low (table M10i).

Table M10i: Relevant Indicators for Goal 7: generated from the CBMS Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>6.1.1 Proportion of population using safely managed drinking water services</td>
<td>The proportion of households accessing water from the safe sources will be considered.</td>
<td>UNHS -2016/17 National -80% Urban- 92% Rural – 75%</td>
<td>Akoboi - 99.7% Katakwi – 99.8% Overall – 99.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>6.2.1 Proportion of population using safely managed sanitation services, including a hand-washing facility with soap and water</td>
<td>The proportion of households using safe sanitary facilities will be determined; And The availability of hand washing facilities with water and soap after toilet use.</td>
<td>UNHS- 2016/17 National – 6.2% Regional (Teso) – 2.1%</td>
<td>Akoboi – 4.9% Katakwi -1.4% Overall- 3.0% Male headed households – 3.3% Female headed households – 2.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GOAL 8 - Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all

In achieving this goal by 2030, the Government of Uganda came up with a policy which aims at ensuring decent employment for all women and men and is in line with the Second National Development Plan (NDP II). The national employment policy has eased the creation of employment opportunities thus
leading to stable incomes, savings and improved livelihoods hence leading to economic growth which sustains development. Table M10j presents the relevant indicators in relation to promotion of sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth and productive employment and decent work for all. The youth (age 18 to 30 years) not in education, employment or training constituted 69 percent of the total.

**Table M10j: Relevant Indicators for Goal 8: generated from the CBMS Data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Goal 8. Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>8.5.2 Unemployment rate, by sex, age and persons with disabilities</td>
<td>Those attending school will be excluded. Considered those who had no job in the last 3 months</td>
<td>Census 2014</td>
<td>Males – 10.1%; Females – 12.5%; PWDs – 16.4%; Non PWDs – 11.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Not working population – 28.9%</td>
<td>Akoboi – 10.8%; Katakwi – 11.8% Overall – 11.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>8.6.1 Proportion of youth (aged 15-24 years) not in education, employment or training</td>
<td>To consider the population aged 15 to 24 years (Youth)</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Males -2.5%; Female-3.4% Akoboi – 2.5%; Katakwi – 3.4% Overall – 3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>8.7.1 Proportion and number of children aged 5-17 years engaged in child labour, by sex and age</td>
<td>The term—child labour—is often defined as work that deprives children of their childhood, their potential and their dignity, and that is harmful to physical and mental development.</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>The children currently studying were excluded Males – 1.4%; Females – 0.9% Akoboi – 1.1; Katakwi – 1.3 Overall – 1.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*** - Not available

**GOAL 10 - Reduce inequality within and among countries**

Uganda is promoting financial inclusion; the Uganda National Financial Inclusion Strategy was launched on October 26, 2017 by The Bank of Uganda together with the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development. The strategy ensures access to financial services to all. In addition to that, the Bank of Uganda has provided financial consumer protection, financial literacy within the country through forming financial inclusion working groups.
Table M10k presents the proportion of the households whose members live below 50 per cent of the median income. Households headed by females or illiterates revealed higher proportions compared to their counterparts.

**Table M10k: Relevant Indicators for Goal 10: generated from the CBMS Data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 22  | Goal 10. Reduce inequality within and among countries. | Proxy indicator considered households below 50% of the median annual income (UGX 1, 502, 000). The analysis was carried out by sex and literacy status of household head, and locality. | ***                | Akoboi – 48.3%  
Katakwi – 50.9%  
Overall – 49.7%  
Male Headed households – 47.3%  
Female headed households – 54.9%  
Literate household heads – 41.9%  
Illiterate household heads – 57.8% |

*** - Not available

**GOAL 11 - Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable**

In response to rapid urbanization in Uganda, the Government has embarked on a process of developing a national urban policy for Uganda so as to have better cities. The pace at which urbanization is picking up in Uganda is currently at 4.5% per year, and it is likely to accelerate with rising incomes. The policy was launched in 2010 so as to raise the profile of Government’s attention to urban planning through which programs like Transforming the Settlements for the Urban Poor in Uganda (TSUPU) was put up targeting Uganda’s secondary cities to align urban development efforts at the national government

*** - Not available

**GOAL 16 - Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels**

This Goal aims at to reducing all forms of violence and having peaceful societies. This can be done through having and maintaining the rule of law, reducing in-flow of illegal arms and influencing developing countries into the system of good governance. Uganda in its struggle against violence and conflict came up with a number of strategies to address the unique challenges in each of the sub-regions based on the conflict status and the extent of vulnerability.

**Table M10m: Relevant Indicators for Goal 16: generated from the CBMS Data**
**GOAL 17 - Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development**

The Government of Uganda has adopted the Uganda Partnership Policy which sets out the guiding principles and so as to help in its interaction with other states so as to increase effectiveness of development assistance in support of its goals and objectives, ensuring transparency and accountability with its development partners and the citizens as well.

---

**Table M10n: Relevant Indicators for Goal 17: generated from the CBMS Data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Goals/Indicators</th>
<th>Explanation on the localization of indicators</th>
<th>National Indicator</th>
<th>CBMS Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>17.8.1 Proportion of individuals using the Internet</td>
<td>Used proportion of households owning a</td>
<td>Census 2014- Proportion of households</td>
<td>Akoboi – 1.9%; Katakwi – 2.0% Overall – 1.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Conclusion

Uganda has been amongst the first UN member states in the world to integrate the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) into its national development planning framework to ensure that no one is left behind. The findings of the Study revealed good progress in a number of sustainable development areas including; access to safe water, poverty reduction, nutrition, gender equality and women empowerment, and equitable quality education. Based on the findings of the Study, the SDGs where more efforts are still required include; ensuring healthy lives, safely managed sanitation services with hand washing facilities, access to electricity, address the high unemployment rate, and the civil registration. Inequality was identified as one of the major barriers to the attainment of the SDG goals. It is recommended that the Government of Uganda should put in place strategies to address issues of inequalities that restrict opportunities to access quality education, safe sanitation, access to income generating activities, access to information, and access to electricity. Regular data collection is required to track the progress.

The CBMS responds to the ever-growing need for provision of accurate, regular and reliable data/information to facilitate evidence based planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of Government and other development partner programmes at all levels of administration. The basic information generated from the communities/ villages to monitor households’ welfare as well as promote efficient utilization of information at grassroots level, is meaningful for the local governments.

It is feasible to employ the CBMS methodology to generate data on the SDG indicators in order to assess and monitor the progress. The implementation of the CBMS is viewed as a response to the call by the High Level Panel (HLP) on the Post–2015 Sustainable Development Agenda for a ‘Data Revolution‘ (DR) to underpin transformational shifts for attaining sustainable development. The data Data Revolution was designed to support transformative actions needed to respond to the demands of a complex development agenda including National Development Plans (NDPs) and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) among others. It ensures that good data are produced and used across society and that a culture of evidence-based policy, planning, decision-making, accountability, monitoring, evaluation and reporting on development results is entrenched in society. The barriers to the generation of data to inform tracking of progress on the SDGs are; limited funding, poor coordination and collaboration, and inadequate capacity among the stakeholders.

### References

Republic of Uganda (2010); The National Development Plan 2010/11-2014/15
Republic of Uganda (2007); Vision 2040
Sabiti B. (2013). How open data could contribute to poverty eradication in Kenya and Uganda through its impacts on resource allocation —Resource allocation in Uganda is a political action‖, June 2013
Uganda Bureau of Statistics (2016); National Service Delivery Survey (NSDS)
Uganda Bureau of Statistics (2017); Uganda National Household Survey (UNHS)
Uganda Bureau of Statistics (2014); Uganda National Population and Housing Census (UNPHC)
An Analysis of Staff Indiscipline in the Malawi Civil Service

D. Yekha, B. Motsegwa & T. Molokwane

University of Botswana

Abstract

Staff indiscipline is one of the challenges affecting service delivery in the public service in most African countries. This study explores this challenge within Malawi public service. The challenge of staff misconduct in the country’s public service is assumed to be one of the factors contributing to the current state of poverty in the country. An examination of previous studies on indiscipline in Malawi’s public service in illustrates that economic hardships experienced by civil servants and flawed leadership underlie this challenge. Further to this, corrective and punitive measures applied in a bid to address this challenge, have not served as effective remedies. The methodological approach adopted by this study is a mixed method analysis. The approach has been applied in examining the causes of indiscipline in Malawi civil service. Study findings indicate that the level of staff misconduct varies across government ministries. Higher levels of staff indiscipline feature more in some government ministries than others. Findings further indicate that the type of indiscipline, prevalent in a particular ministry relates to the nature of its functions. Possible factors contributing to the persistence of staff indiscipline include management interventions that are often post-entry and reactive in nature. This study recommends regular review of public servants remuneration, increasing the control function of public service managers and curtailing potential indiscipline at recruitment level as a preventive measure.

Key Words: Staff Indiscipline, Civil Service, Public Service, Manager, Misconduct, Organisation, Malawi

Introduction

The Malawi civil service comprises all Government ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs) (Republic of Malawi, 2018). These MDAs are entrusted with public resources to implement government policies and provide various public goods and services meant to address the needs of citizens and achieve both human and national development (Republic of Malawi, 2018; Todaro, 2012). As it obtains elsewhere across the globe, the civil service in Malawi is staffed with disciplined human resources capable of ensuring both proper custody and utilization of these public resources. Notwithstanding this positive development, there are elements within the service who portray attributes of indiscipline.

The Malawi civil service adopts a dual public management system comprising political appointees or elected politicians, on one hand, and professional public administrators, on the other (Dzimbiri, 2016). In relation to staff indiscipline in the civil service, this model suggests that any lapses in discipline management by the leadership affects the general public. In Malawi such cases have tended to incite public anger which has often been conveyed back to the public service system in various ways including the media or mass demonstrations. To illustrate, the Malawi Daily Times of 15th September, 2018 and Malawi Nation Newspaper of 28th June, 2018 published articles exposing civil service indiscipline with titles: “Health workers at the centre of drug theft” and “Government audit exposes rot” respectively.

In terms of mass demonstrations, on 27th April, 2018 the public went on the street to protest against alleged abuse of public resources, inefficiency and poor service delivery in the public service (Malawi Nation Newspaper of 21st March, 2018). To this end, this study seeks to examine the underlying factors responsible for the persistence of staff indiscipline in the Malawi public service, its gravity, types and approaches.
applied to remedy it. The study is organised as follows. First is a review of literature on the concept of indiscipline and indiscipline within organisations. This review is succeeded by a theoretical framework of workplace indiscipline followed identification of factors contributing to workplace indiscipline. A brief discussion on public service staff indiscipline in Malawi and how of public service staff indiscipline is handling in Malawi’s public service are then provided. Subsequent to these are findings of the study which begin with an analysis of gravity and levels of indiscipline in Malawi’s public service. The theory and practice of managing staff indiscipline is applied to the findings with preventive management interventions on staff indiscipline are also examined. Last are recommendations and conclusion.

**Staff Indiscipline within Organisations**

Indiscipline refers to conditions of disorderliness in which members of an organisation conduct themselves without respect to the rules and regulations governing employee behaviour (Osezua, Abah & Daniel, 2009: 463). In workplaces including the public service, staff indiscipline is expressed in various ways such as absenteeism, lateness, theft, lack dedication to duty, engaging in corruption, abuse of public property, embezzlement of public funds, drunkenness, just to mention a few (Dzimbiri, 2016; Osezua *et al.*, 2009).

Staff indiscipline is one of the retrogressive factors for organizational productivity which continues to motivate interest among researchers and management practitioners (Omotayo, Olubusayo, Olalekan, & Adenike, 2015; Arthur, 2011; Akikibofori, 2008; Griffin, O’Leary-Kelly & Collins, 1998). One of the main reasons for the rising interest in workplace indiscipline are its pervasiveness and the huge costs associated with it (Omotayo *et al.*, 2015; Ivancevich, Matteson, & Konopaske, 2014; Peterson, 2002; Vardi & Wiener, 1996).

The costs of workplace indiscipline range from economic to social. Economic costs include loss of money through theft, litigations, loss of organisational productivity, and loss of investment. Social costs include loss of jobs, denial of better services to society as a result of poor employee and organisational performance (Omotayo *et al.*, 2015; Dunlop & Lee, 2004; Mohapatra, 1992). Managing discipline in organisation should as such, be a priority to both corporate and public service managers.

**Theoretical Framework of Workplace Indiscipline**

Workplace indiscipline can variously be categorised into deviance, aggression and political behaviour. Employee deviance concerns social situations under which certain behaviours are deemed to be out of order. Workplace aggression concerns hurtful or injurious behaviours while political behaviour is associated with abuse of power and influence. These three categories of workplace indiscipline, however, overlap and interrelate (Vardi and Weitz 2004). At the back of workplace indiscipline are a number of variables that underlie it. These include the individual employee, the job, the group and the organisation. Vardi and Weitz (2004) term these variables *antecedents* to misbehaviour. They also assume that before misbehaviour is expressed by either individuals or groups of individuals there is an *intention to misbehave* which arises from the person’s expectations on how he or she ought to behave.

**Intention to Misbehave**

Intention to misbehave is an important concept. Termed as a mediator, it mediates the relationship between the antecedents to misbehaviour and the *outcomes*, which are the actual acts of misconduct (Sackett &
DeVore, 2001; Vardi & Weitz 2004). Knowing the triggers of the intention to misbehave can be the starting point for indiscipline management and therefore avoid the negative consequences, referred to as costs of staff indiscipline above (Vardi & Weitz 2004).

Managing Employee Discipline

Managing discipline in the workplace is generally an exclusive domain for managers (Vardi & Weitz 2004). In agreement with this view, Ivancevich et. al., (2014: 205) argue that “managers are responsible for identifying, solving and correcting problems” related to employee misbehaviour. However, for managers to achieve this they must know what exactly constitutes misbehaviour in workplaces and their underlying factors. The model of staff misbehaviour, according to Vardi and Weitz (2004), suggests some management interventions focusing on three different levels namely, the individual, the job and finally the group and organisation.

The assumption of the model is that managing indiscipline ought to start at the entry level by putting in place mechanisms that can screen out dangerous individuals before they are hired. It also suggests that management interventions can be undertaken at job, group and organisational levels. However, the only challenge at these stages is that the individual is already hired implying that the most effective management intervention stage for staff indiscipline is at the “pre-employment phase” (Ivancevich. et. al., 2014: 209; Opatha, 2009).

Factors Contributing to Workplace Indiscipline

As indicated earlier, managers in organisations need to understand, not only what constitutes indiscipline, but also its underlying causes in order for them to be able to manage it competently. In his study Hackett (1989), established that there is a positive relationship between employee dissatisfaction and increased absenteeism suggesting that discontented employees are more likely to misbehave than satisfied employees while Peterson (2002: 48) asserts that “possible explanations for workplace indiscipline include individual factors, social and interpersonal factors, and organizational factors,” concurring with Vardi and Weitz (2004)’s antecedents to misbehaviour.

Individual Level Factors

Studies conducted to investigate the relationship between an individual’s personality characteristics and misbehaviour show very little linkage (Peterson, 2002). This suggests that personality variables alone may not be a reliable basis for predicting employee deviance in the workplace. However, Trevino & Youngblood (1990) cited in Peterson (2002: 490) argue that, employee misbehaviour is more likely predictable by looking at “a combination of personality variables and the nature of the workplace”. Further this, empirical studies done to investigate some demographic variables and misconduct at individual level found some linkages to some forms of staff misbehaviour such as production and property deviance (Frank, 1989; Hollinger & Clark, 1983). They argue that this is most likely to occur among young, new, part-time and lowly paid employees. Other views have, however, differed with this argument contending that the findings might be due to the nature of the job and not necessarily personal demographic features (Peterson, 2002).

Interpersonal or Group Level Factors

Studies on social, interpersonal factors and employee deviance have shown some positive linkages. Just as Ivancevich et al., (2014) postulate, Robinson & Greenberg (1990) as well as Robinson & O’Leary-Kelly
(1998) cited in Peterson (2002: 49) pronounce that “perceptions of unfair treatment, social norms, and the influence of work groups can contribute to workplace deviance” This suggests that managers need to treat their subordinates well, at the same time making sure they are vigilant to detect any developing negative group norms that may be detrimental to the success of the organisation.

**Organisational Level Factors**
In terms of linkages between organisation factors and workplace deviance, Robinson and Greenberg (1990) as cited in Peterson (2002) argue that not much research has been conducted in this area except the ones investigating the relationship between equity in pay and employee deviance. However, in his study investigating the linkage between ethical organisational climate and deviant behaviour, Peterson (2002) found that misbehaviour in workplaces can be “partially predicted from the ethical climate of an organization” particularly political deviance. Political deviance, according to Peterson (2002: 57) is “a minor form of deviance directed at members of the organization, such as favouritism, gossiping, and blaming co-workers (while) an ethical organisation climate is one in which the employees perceive that the organization is very concerned about the welfare of everyone in the organization. What all this suggests therefore, is that managers in organisations need to create a work environment that offers a favourable climate that will not foster subversive organisational politics.”

**Methodology**
The study adopted a desktop research approach and employed a mixed method in data analysis. The quantitative approach of data analysis, involves numerical presentation and analysis of data while the qualitative data analysis entails describing, discussing and examining the data that has been collected (Babbie, 2013). The gravity of indiscipline in the Malawi public service is assessed by computing the number of various disciplinary cases reported by government ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs) for a period of five years and whether it adopts preventive measures addressing challenges of staff misconduct. It also assesses the extent to which handling of disciplinary cases in the Malawi public service is supported by the existing theories of discipline management. The quantitative data analysis details the gravity, identifying MDAs with high rate of indiscipline, the disciplinary cases handling efforts that are made to deter it and the efficiency and effectiveness of the disciplinary control system through facts and figures.

**Public Service Staff Indiscipline in Malawi**
The public service in Malawi is the machinery that government uses to implement public policies meant to steer national development (Davis & Weller, 1999; Washington, 2000). In other words, it is the engine of national development. However, the enormous levels of negative publicity that the Malawi public service receives from the media on staff indiscipline suggests serious lapses in disciplinary control (Malawi Nation Newspaper of: 6th December, 2014; 5th October, 2015; 4th February, 2016; 14th August, 2018; 21st June, 2018; 28th June, 2018; 17th September, 2018). Cases of corruption, fraud, absenteeism, embezzlement of public funds, poor employee performance, insubordination, including theft among others, bedevil the Malawi public service, a scenario which begs serious questions as to whether staff disciplinary control measures employed in the sector are indeed effective or not (Republic of Malawi, 2018; Dzimbiri, 2016; Tambulasi, 2009; Anders, 2002; Hussein, 2005).
In its recent study, the Malawi Public Service Reform Commission (MPSRC) (2015) noted similar cases and argues that the level of indiscipline in public service has reached deplorable proportions. Why such levels of staff indiscipline yet there are comprehensive policies in form of laws, rules and regulations governing public service staff misconduct? The state of staff indiscipline in the Malawi public service is a major concern, not only to Malawians, but also the international donor community. They lament that if the current trend is left unabated, innocent Malawians will continue to live in perpetual poverty (International Monetary Fund, 2017). In its report last updated in April, 2018, the World Bank indicated that Malawi’s poverty and inequality levels remained extremely high. One in every two people live below the poverty line of $1.90 per day with most of it attributed to worsening levels of corruption (World Bank, 2018). Malawi’s ranking on corruption level in 2017, according to Transparency International, went up to 120/175 economies from 112/175 economies in 2016.

In an effort to arrest the malaise, in 2018 alone, Malawi has seen two mass demonstrations across the nation organized by Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) with full support from the Faith community organizations. The first one took place on 27th April, 2018 followed by another on 21st September, 2018. Government’s attempts to go into negotiations with the CSOs not to proceed with the demonstrations proved futile because the CSOs adamantly maintained that such negotiations would only be accepted if the Head of State himself was present because that would ensure proper participation and authority to provide binding answers (Malawi Nation Newspaper of 5th December, 2017; 21st March, 2018; 17th September, 2018; Malawi News of 18th September, 2018). All these public reactions paint a picture of a failing public service disciplinary control system in Malawi.

Handling of Public Service Staff Indiscipline in Malawi
The handling of staff indiscipline in the Malawi public service is not centralised (Republic of Malawi, 2018; Dzimbiri, 2016; MPSRC, 2015). There are various institutions including sector service commissions such as Civil Service Commission (CSC), Local Government Service Commission (LASCOM), Teaching Service Commission (TSC), Health Service Commission (HSC), Judicial Service Commission (JSC), Parliamentary Service Commission (PSC), Police Service Commission (Pol.SC) and Prison Service Commission (Pri.SC) and bodies like Appointments and Disciplinary Board, in other government institutions.

Although managing of staff indiscipline in Malawi public service is done at different levels depending on the nature, gravity and the offender’s position, in general, the process adopts the internal, external and exit model as advanced by Ibietan (2013). The model suggests that policies, rules, regulations, codes of conduct and service commissions fall under the internal approach. The judiciary, the anti-graft bodies such as the Malawi Anti-Corruption Bureau (ACB), Financial Intelligence Unit (FIU), the Ombudsman, and Public Accounts Committee of Parliament (PAC) represent the external category (Chiweza, 2010).

Lastly the exit approach involves voting in and out of political leaders in an electoral process, grievance ventilation through demonstrations, decentralization, and privatization, just to mention four. All these approaches, in one way or the other, address matters of staff indiscipline in the public service in different ways. For example, decentralization and privatization reduce the span or scope of control by the central government leadership thereby reducing the risk of abuse. This in turn facilitates efficiency in service delivery (Chiweza, 2010).
Disciplinary Action in Malawi Public Service

Disciplinary action in the public service in Malawi ranges from minor disciplinary action to immediate dismissal relative to the seriousness of the misconduct committed by an employee. These are provided for in the laws, rules and regulations governing employee behaviour and conduct such as, the Public Service Act of 1994, Corrupt Practices Act of 1995, Malawi Public Service Commission Regulations (MPSCR) of 1989, Malawi Public Service Regulations (MPSR) of 1991, just to mention a few. The Malawi Public Service Commission Regulations (MPSCR) of 1989, section 39(1), for example, lists penalties that MDA Management, ADCs and Service commissions can inflict on any civil servant who commits an act of misconduct. These include:

- Dismissal, termination of a contract, reduction in grade, rank or seniority, reduction in salary, stoppage of increment, withholding of increment, severe reprimand, compulsory retirement, stoppage of pay of an officer, order the recovery of the cost of any loss of money or damage to property of Government by default or negligence or no salary where order of interdiction involves loss of public funds or false representation (Republic of Malawi, 1989: 15).

Research Findings

Gravity of Indiscipline in the Malawi Public Service

The level of staff indiscipline in the Malawi public service has been described as pervasive suggesting that it is not only seriously entrenched but also extensive (Republic of Malawi, 2018; Dzimbiiri, 2016; MPSRC, 2015). To appreciate the gravity of staff indiscipline in the Malawi public service, this study analysed a sample of latest available data compiled from reported disciplinary cases to Malawi Civil Service Commission (CSC) for consideration and direction between 2008 and 2012. Table 1 below presents the number and types of misconducts committed by civil servants annually. It also provides the percentage of each type of misconduct and average number of misconducts committed in a period of five years. Further below, the same scenario is presented graphically in Figure 1. Table 1: Gravity of reported staff indiscipline in Malawi civil service (2008-2012).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Abscondment</th>
<th>Absenteeism</th>
<th>Theft/ Fraud</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total No. Of Cases</th>
<th>% Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>23.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Of Total</td>
<td>37.4%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>48.5%</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Average Number Of Disciplinary Cases Reported Annually

Source: Authors

Figure 1: Disciplinary Cases Reported by Government MDAs in Malawi between 2008 and 2012

As Table 1 and Figure 1 above indicate, Malawi civil service recorded a total of 227 disciplinary cases between 2008 and 2012 which, in terms of gravity, 45 disciplinary cases were committed in a year. Hundred and ten (110) theft and fraud related cases were committed in the period representing 48.5% of the total reported cases. These were the most frequent seconded by abscondments which were 85 in total representing 37.4%. Absenteeism was the lowest with 1 reported case representing 0.4% of the total reported cases while poor performance, as misconduct, was non-existent contrary to the claims of CSOs and the public at large.

With reference to the typology of staff indiscipline and how each type of misconduct is practically handled, however, the recorded levels of absenteeism and poor employee performance are not a surprise. Saundry, Jones & Antcliff (2011), Salin (2008), Robinson & Bennett (1995) and Rowe (1990) have argued that absenteeism and poor employee performance are minor forms of indiscipline as such they are normally resolved informally through counselling, supervisory advice, training or coaching without entering the formal disciplinary case handling process and because of this they go undocumented and unreported to CSC hence they appear to be minimal and non-existent in terms of records respectively. Disciplinary cases which constitute corrupt practices, misuse of public property, insubordination and causing grievous harm, referred to as ‘others’ in this study, totalled 31 representing 13.7%.

Levels of Staff Indiscipline across Malawi Government MDAs

As indicated earlier, it is claimed by both scholars and interested parties that indiscipline in the Malawi public service has reached deplorable proportions (Republic of Malawi, 2018; Dzimbiri, 2016; MPSRC. 2015 Tambulasi, 2009; Anders, 2002; Hussein, 2005). The question, however, is: how is this staff indiscipline distributed across government ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs)? The study undertook a quantitative analysis of data on disciplinary cases reported by MDAs to Malawi Civil Service
Commission (CSC) in a period of five years to appreciate the extent of staff indiscipline in government MDAs. Table 2 and Figure 2 below present the results.

### Table 2: Extent of Staff Indiscipline across Malawi Government MDAs between 2008 and 2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MDA</th>
<th>Abscondments</th>
<th>Absenteeism</th>
<th>Fraud/Theft</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>% Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OPC</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHRMD</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>44.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Planning &amp; Development</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Affairs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry &amp; Trade</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>85</strong></td>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
<td><strong>110</strong></td>
<td><strong>31</strong></td>
<td><strong>227</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Total</td>
<td>37.4%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>48.5%</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average Number Of Misconducts Per Mda Per Annum**

**Source:** Authors

### Figure 2: Extent of Staff Indiscipline across Malawi Government MDAs between 2008 and 2012

**Source:** Authors
From the picture painted by Table 2 and Figure 2, all MDAs appear to experience certain levels of staff indiscipline which varies in seriousness. Ministry of Agriculture, for example, recorded 102 disciplinary cases representing 44.9% of the total reported misconducts and was the highest. Abscondments and fraud/theft cases stood at 66 and 34 respectively. Ministry of Finance was second highest with a total of 56 disciplinary cases representing 24% of total registered disciplinary cases. It also featured the highest number of fraud/theft cases – 44 in total. On average each Government MDAs reported 21 disciplinary cases in five years translating to 4 cases each year. The study, however, did not probe into the reasons why some MDAs like Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Finance reported more staff indiscipline than others and specifically, more abscondments and fraud/theft cases respectively. This could be an important direction for further research.

**Theory and Practice of Managing Staff Indiscipline**

Managing of staff indiscipline according to Fenley (1998) adopts, among other approaches, the punitive and corrective theories. The punitive perspective assumes that indiscipline in workplaces can be deterred by punishing the errant employee through disciplinary actions such as dismissal, demotion or suspension while the corrective model suggests that employee misbehaviour can be reformed through gradual disciplinary actions such as counselling, supervisory advice, verbal warning, written warning and if the employee’s behaviour does not positively change, suspension, demotion or dismissal can ultimately be considered (Dzimbiri, 2016; Armstrong, 2010; Cooke, 2006; Fenley, 1998).

This section examined the Malawi civil service disciplinary case database compiled between 2008 and 2012 to assess the extent to which scholarly theories were applied in managing staff discipline. It looked at how disciplinary cases were concluded in a period of 5 years where an aggregate of 227 cases were reported by MDAs to the Malawi Civil Service Commission, a constitutional institution mandated to oversee all matters relating to employee indiscipline, recruitment and selection. Table 3 and Figure 3 below show how the cases were handled by the Civil Service Commission.

**Table 3: Conclusion Of Disciplinary Cases Reported by MDAs in the 5 years under Assessment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dismissed</th>
<th>Reinstated</th>
<th>Retired</th>
<th>Demoted</th>
<th>Out-Standing</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>41.4%</td>
<td>28.2%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Authors

As Table 3 above and Figure 3 below indicate, 41.4% of reported disciplinary cases were concluded by way of dismissals as compared to 28.2%, 1.3% and 0.4% that were resolved through reinstatements, demotions and retirements respectively. This suggests that Malawi civil service strongly applies the punitive perspective to deter staff indiscipline besides the corrective theory which is used in cases of minor disciplinary cases partly evidenced by 64 cases that were concluded through reinstatements representing 28.2%. This is consistent with what Mellish and Collis Squires (1976) cited in Fenley (1998) states that, in practice, there is no punitive-corrective dichotomy but rather both approaches may be applied by organisations depending on the gravity and nature of the misconduct.
Efficiency and Effectiveness of the Disciplinary Control System in the Malawi Public Service

Table 3 and Figure 3 above indicate that at the close of 2012 sixty five (65) disciplinary cases representing 28.6% of the reported cases were still not concluded. This suggests that the disciplinary control system is inefficient and ineffective. In terms of inefficiency and ineffectiveness of the disciplinary control system in the Malawi public service, a number of studies including one by Dzimbiri, (2016) and MPSRC (2015) have argued against the procedures followed in handling of disciplinary cases which tend to be too long and do not empower public managers to exercise their controlling function, respectively. Further, MPSRC (2015) has also argued that for the disciplinary control system to be efficient and effective in the Malawi public service there is need to support it with better working conditions which should include better salaries that are consistent with the prevailing economic conditions.

Preventive Management Interventions on Staff Indiscipline

The study examined the new entrants’ recruitment and selection process by looking at the advertisement for vacancies, candidate interview data forms and sample interview questions. The purpose was to assess whether employees are screened for indiscipline in Malawi public service before they are hired on the job as a preventive measure of staff indiscipline. The findings indicated that, except for the candidate interview data form, which contained a question: “have you ever been convicted?” both the advertisements and interview questions had no elements indicative of indiscipline screening. The advertisement emphasised on relevant qualification while the interview questions were framed based on the job descriptions of the posts to be filled.

In terms of the literature, the theoretical framework for staff indiscipline suggests that management interventions on staff indiscipline can be done at three levels namely, the individual, the job and finally the group and organisation levels (Vardi & Weitz, 2004). At individual level, emphasis is on screening the candidates’ behaviour before they are hired. This intervention is preventive in nature whereas interventions at the job, group and organisational levels occur while the employee is already hired. From the findings, therefore, while an attempt to screen candidates is done through the question in the candidates’ input data forms as indicated above, largely management interventions on staff indiscipline in the Malawi civil service
are post-entry and reactive in nature. This could be one of the possible factors contributing to the persistence of staff indiscipline in the Malawi Civil Service despite the numerous efforts that have been in place to abate it since the hiring system keeps letting in unscreened job candidates at the entry level.

Conclusion
This study has examined staff indiscipline in the public service with specific attention on understanding the contributing factors, its gravity, levels across government MDAs, the application of theory in the practice of handling disciplinary cases, efficiency and effectiveness of the disciplinary control system and use of preventive measures on managing staff discipline. The findings indicated that contributing factors for staff indiscipline in Malawi public service include the procedures followed which are too long and exonerate public managers from their controlling functions and challenges in equity in pay for public servants. It has also shown that levels of staff indiscipline in Malawi public service differ across government MDAs. As regards the extent to which theory supports practice in discipline management, the study found that, to a larger extent, discipline management practices are supported by scholarly theories such as the corrective and punitive models.

As regards the efficiency and effectiveness of the disciplinary control system in the Malawi public service, the study has shown that a considerable level of disciplinary cases remains unresolved. In terms of whether the Malawi public service adopts preventive measures for managing workplace discipline before an employee is hired, the study found little evidence to show that potential employees are screened for indiscipline at the entry level before they are hired. This is contrary to what Vardi and Weitz, (2004) advance in their theoretical model of discipline management. The model assumes that screening potential employees before they are hired prevents placing dangerous people on the job. In a nutshell, the Malawi public service minimally applies preventive indiscipline interventions and such being the case porosity for easy inflow of deviant employees is easily created.

Recommendations
Based on the analysis of the findings, this study advances the following recommendations on how staff indiscipline could be handled in the Malawi public service. Since staff indiscipline falls under the management function of controlling, it would be appropriate if public managers are given full authority to handle matters of staff indiscipline at their MDAs. This should be supported by regular evaluation of their performance and where leadership gaps are identified, appropriate training should be provided. The current set up where a different body called Malawi Civil Service Commission decides the fate of errant civil servants is clearly less effective. The inefficiency of the setup is rooted on its formal and strict adherence to long procedures of disciplining staff.

While all MDAs experience certain levels of staff indiscipline, management interventions need to be strengthened further particularly in institutions with high levels of staff misconduct. Regarding remuneration for public servants, remuneration should be reviewed regularly to reflect the prevailing economic conditions so that poor salaries are not a scapegoat for indiscipline. On recruitment, this process in the public service should be reviewed to mainstream preventive measures to assess potential employee misbehaviour before hiring is done. This could be done by subjecting the potential civil servants to a thorough screening interview process at entry level.
References


Sustainable Local Economic Development for Developing Economies: The New strategies for the Future Local Governments in Uganda

Stella B. Kyohairwe
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
Being a process whereby the tri-partite partnerships between Local Government, the private sector and the community are jointly and collectively engaged in identification, mobilization, management and initialization of resources at the local level, Local Economic Development (LED) is one best models that can enable sustainable development at the local level. “Localization” is by no means of less importance when it comes to the principle of “leaving no-one-behind” in pursuance of both the Urban and rural development national Agenda. Born in mind however is that mindset change for predominant self-reliant communities can bring innovative, accountable and transformed societies. Looking at subnational level as an epitome for investments to increase employment opportunity and spur desirable growth, this paper assesses the challenges inhibiting Local Economic Development to reap the development benefits in Uganda. Through a document review of Local government initiatives in Uganda and elsewhere, the paper analyses the approaches used in LED in Uganda, documents reviews the progress so far attained, documents the current impediments and identifies areas for future improvements.

Key words: Local Economic Development, Sustainable Development, Inclusion, Self-Reliance, Transformed Communities

Introduction

LED in the Emerging Economies

Local Economic Development (LED) in today’s developing economies may be conceived as a globalization a wave traced back from 1960s, (Rogerson & Rogerson, 2010) and influenced by the western (largely Europe and America) pressures as a response to inequitable outcomes in the economic landscape but also as a driver for local investment (Blakely1989; Le Heron, 2009). LED strategies emerged a response to the social and economic conditions resulting from the persistence of locality-specific development problems as well as unsatisfactory outcomes of traditional top-down isolated development strategies. These traditional approaches in the development discourses emerge as reasons for persistent unemployment and regional inequalities prompting the search for alternative development strategies that would offer opportunities for growth to all areas (Roberts 1993; Nel 2001).

Considered as an approach that plays a substantial role in local and international development, LED takes an advantage of local potentials tapping into localities to initiate solutions for local challenges and support local competitiveness and inclusive development (Rodriguez-Pose, 2008; ILO, 2008). LED as a development approach is grounded in the LED theory comprising of various strands categorizable into market-driven development theories, theories of local economic (re-) generation and theories of alternative local development (Gomez & Helmsing, 2008). Within a market-driven development, firms are the central objects of analysis. The local economic (re-) generation theories focuses on the renewal of the localities through the mobilization of local entrepreneurship, building the capabilities of local people and also promoting inclusive economic organization. The theories of alternative local development looks at the a growing number of people and localities which is unable or unwilling to participate in a market-driven development, due to various reasons including deficiencies in capabilities, resources or as a result of other
self-motivations. Gomez & Helmsing view is that the LED theory from outlook majorly explores the dynamics of actors, structures, and processes of local regional growth within a particular defined territory. Such theoretical interpretations on LED prove some consistency with Pike et al., (2006) and Bingham & Mier (1993) who believe that LED is a branch of regional development theory and interdisciplinary in nature drawing from fields of physical planning, business economics, urban sociology, and geography among others. The multidisciplinary nature of LED is a signal of the complexity of the approaches used in the implementation of the LED strategies.

While the LED practice and researches on regional economic development have been evidenced in the local and global perspectives, uneven spatial economic activity especially in the developing economies and in most of sub-Saharan Africa (Rodriguez-Pose, & Tijmstra, 2007) have persisted over time. Wide-ranging challenges encountered in the LED processes include unfunded mandates, donor dependence and competing government priorities, LED policy transfer with undue consideration of local contexts, land tenure systems, complex integrated planning, a weak civil society and lack of business skills, capacity and attitudes (Meyer, 2013; Platforma 2015)

Even when students of regional development have endeavored to theorize the problems posed by unbalanced growth and in their scholarship they have advanced the conditions justifying regional policies and the projected outcomes with sound recommendations, (Barberia & Biderman, 2010), literature for some countries like Uganda where LED approach has been experimented for over a decade, lacks both sufficient documentation and clear outcomes to guide future LED strategic actions. Thus, this paper aims at documenting the practices, gains and losses of LED in Uganda based on the exiting secondary information sources to augment the literature on the LEP policy implementation.

**Local Economic Development: In search of a meaning**

While the conceptual meaning of LED may be both elusive and contested (Trah, 2004; Pike et al., 2007), some literature comes in handy to offer us a clue on the way we should understand this concept. The World Bank views LED as ‘a process by which public, business and non-governmental sector partners work collectively to create better conditions for economic growth and employment generation’ (World Bank, 2003:1). Helmsing & Egziabher (2005:1) consider LED to be ‘a process in which partnerships between local governments, NGOs, community based groups and the private sector are established to manage existing resources, to create jobs and stimulate the economy of a well-defined territory’. The OECD (2013) defines local economic development as “a cross cutting and integrated activity where the physical development of a place is linked to public service, place management, and wider drivers of change such as employment, skills, investment, enterprise, innovation, productivity, quality of life, and positioning” (p. 9). LED signifies “a participatory development process that encourages partnership arrangements between the main private and public stakeholders of a defined territory, enabling the joint design and implementation of a common development strategy, by making use of the local resources and competitive advantage in a global context, with the final objective of creating decent jobs and stimulating economic activity. (ILO, 2006:2)

In the Uganda LED Policy (2014), Local Economic Development (LED) means a process through which Local Governments, the private sector and the communities form partnerships to mobilize, manage and invest resources effectively into economic ventures to stimulate development and growth of the locality. It is a process by which national and local stakeholders collaborate to assess the local economy, and to
evaluate possible opportunities as well as challenges and obstacles within the local economy. Thus LED is perceived to be focused on formulating and implementing practical action plans to realize opportunities and resolve impediments.

Conceptually, the meaning attached to LED therefore suggests a strategic approach planned by local governments in conjunction with private sector partners and those in the civil sector to promote favorable environment for business development, employment and general wellbeing of the local people. LED is meant to build up the economic capacity of a local area to improve its economic future and the quality of life for those in the respective locality. The approach suggests that local governments take a central stage in the LED process by ensuring that enabling conditions such as a good investment climate, infrastructure development, local strategic plans, positive attitudes and deliberate efforts for community participation and engagement exist. It also implies that LED is not a sole prerogative of local authorities but a collaborative partnership with underlying assumptions that: 1) stakeholders are interested to rally behind a common LED strategy and contribute their own resources to implementing it; and 2) that the private sector and other partners from the civil sector has the capacity and resources to make investments towards the enhancement of the local economy (World Bank 2016). These assumptions are part of the explanations as to why LED has scored limited gains in some of the developing economies.

A consequential LED: The distinction between LED and other developmental approaches.

Led approach to development differs from other top-down traditional community development approaches with regard to three major differences which include the locus of development, the level of intervention and the type of instruments (Rodríguez-Pose, 2002). On the locus of development Rodríguez-Pose argues that LED takes a territorial approach, focusing on the development of a region or locality rather than an industrial sector. By so doing, economic development and employment is achieved through diagnosis of local economic, social and institutional conditions and through the formulation of a tailored strategy aimed at allowing each territory to reach its economic potential. This substantially differs from the traditional ways which tend to adopt a sectoral focus aimed at increasing growth and employment through policies for promoting industrialization as a way to attain economic development. Secondly, Rodríguez-Pose believes that unlike in the traditional top-down in which the central government officials decide the nature of interventions, where they should be and ways of implementing the interventions with little or no input from local actors, LED involves localities and adopts tools to promote development from below. This, Rodríguez-Pose argues, is based on conviction that national institutions are often too remote to effectively respond to drastic local needs and that local institutions may be more flexible and are better positioned to interact with other local economic and social actors permitting formulation of more responsive strategies. Lastly, LED, development is largely related to the ability of the locality to exploit and build on its comparative advantages and local economic potential. As such there are accruing advantages of relying on the local opportunities for development, tapping into local economy resources through use of a variety of instruments, including business support systems, educational programs, and micro finance, in line with traditional instruments.

The above distinctions make it clear that LED is a bottom-up development approach. However, in order to diminish possible misperception between LED and other community development approaches of bottom-up nature, Andrés Rodríguez-Pose and Sylvia Tijmstra in their Sensitizing Package on Local Economic Development for International Labour Organisation (ILO, n.d), two distinguishing aspects are emphasized.
The first aspect concerns the goals for the approach and the other key issue is the actors involved in each approach. In their explanations Rodríguez-Pose and Tijmstra state that LED primarily aims at creating economic development and decent work so as to alleviate poverty and encourage inclusion of previously excluded groups in social and economic life. On the other hand Community development approaches focus primarily on addressing social issues, such as poverty and social exclusion, and problems of short-term survival related to them. Their view on the actors involved LED approach, focuses on broad coalitions of actors, including local stakeholders, international organizations and NGO’s and that local governments often play a key role in the formulation and implementation of the strategy. Conversely, in other community development approaches a variety of individual actors, including NGO’s and international organizations may initiate community projects and that the planning and implementation processes often target involvement of previously excluded groups and the poor.

The two broad LED distinctions of bottom-up as opposed to top-down approaches and two discrete areas of focus that include goals and actors emerge as strong points in favor of LED as a unique and ideal approach to community development. With well-developed strategies and finely orchestrated actors there is a lot of benefits that may accrue to communities embracing LED development purposes.

**Local Economic Development in Uganda**

Since 1992, the Government of Uganda has been implementing decentralization as a framework for service delivery to local communities. The decentralization and local governance processes was initially were based the Local councils statute (1993) and later on Chapter 11 of the Constitution of the Republic of Uganda (1995) and on the Local Governments Act CAP 243 (LGA). The LGA devolved, political, administrative and financial decision-making powers to Local Governments and administrative units so as to improving local democracy, accountability, efficiency, effectiveness, equity and sustainability in the provision of devolved social services country-wide. During the period, a number of achievements were realized notably in areas of governance at the local level, investments in health, education, roads, and water sectors because of the increase central government financial transfers to local governments (MOLG 2009).

With the initial achievements at the onset of decentralization policy, it was hoped that decentralization would lead to local development. However, due to a number of challenges experienced in the implementation of the decentralization programme, the policy failed to stimulate local and community enterprise development and the participation and coordination of stakeholders in locality development remained limited. High levels of household poverty in Uganda estimated at 31% of the total population were documented (UBOS 2005).

Consequently, A number of national, sectoral and district programs such as the Poverty Eradication Action Plan (PEAP), the National Development Plan (NDP), the Decentralization Policy Strategic Framework (DPSF) and the Local Government Sector Strategic Plan (LGSSP) were gradually initiated and implemented to boost local development.

Because of the continuous looming challenges in the economy, in 2006 Government of Uganda through the ministry of Local Government initiated a new strategy for improving the development of the communities. Through the new initiative, a sixth decentralization objective ‘To promote Local Economic Development in order to enhance people’s incomes’ was created and subsequently incorporated in the Decentralization Policy Strategic Framework (DPSF) and the Local Government Sector Strategic Plan Strategic Plan 2013-2023(LGSSP). Although LED initiatives were in 2006, the formal implementation of the LED framework is more pronounced after the National Local Economic Development policy (2014)
which to provided a framework for partnerships in local economic development and served as a vehicle for promoting and implementing LED initiatives at local government.

Designing of the Uganda National LED policy was based on an analysis of the national and local economic contexts, the fiscal performance of the country, the human development situation, employment and labour productivity as well as infrastructural development and other constraints facing Local Government and the private sector actors. The policy is driven by a Vision to establish a vibrant and competitive private sector-led local economy for poverty reduction, wealth creation and prosperity with an overall Mission is to create a local governance mechanism which promotes a conducive economic and political environment for private sector investment, employment in local areas for improved household incomes and service delivery. The Goal of this policy is to have a transformed local government system that facilitates effective business oriented local development with a focus on poverty reduction and sustainable wealth creation. The policy is based on a number of principles that include: public-private partnerships, consistency, competitiveness enhancement, gender equity and equality as well as inclusiveness.

Initiated in 2006, as a sixth objective of decentralization LED was primarily meant ‘To promote Local Economic Development in order to enhance people’s incomes’. To ensure a wholistic approach to development, LED aims and objectives were subsequently incorporated in the District Development Programme (DPD-III), Decentralization Policy Strategic Framework (DPSF), and the Local Government Sector Strategic Plan Strategic Plan 2013-2023(LGSSP). It was also included in the Uganda Local Development Outlook (LDO) 2014 and also integrated in a chapter on sub-national and rural development within the National Development Plan (NDP).

Primarily, LED in Uganda aimed at: i) Increasing business support by encouraging local investment centers; ii) Enhance growth of the private sector investment in LGs; and iii) Increase in locally generated revenue in form of direct taxes and LG own revenue generating ventures. In Uganda, LED implementation was to be guided by Seven core principles (Section 34 of the LED policy) that included the following:

- Consistency with the National Development Plan and Decentralization Policy and Strategic Framework to ensure that LED implementation is aligned to National Development objectives.
- Commitment of Relevant Stakeholders including the Local Governments, the private sector, the communities and civil society to fully participate in economic development of the locality.
- Public-Private Partnership (PPP) for LED-related ventures.
- Competitiveness Enhancement with special emphasis on building the capacity of the private sector to improve the country’s global competitiveness and export earnings aimed at improved trade balance and attainment of macro-economic stability. Local Governments to work closely with the private sector to establish the potential and competitive advantages of each locality and the strategies for exploiting the potential.
- Transparency and Accountability systems to ensure that generated revenue is properly utilized and accounted for to improve delivery of services to citizens.
- Gender Equality, Equity and Inclusiveness through encouraging effective and inclusive participation of different stakeholders irrespective of status, gender or class.
- Sustainability through promotion of a local governance system that ensures optimal utilization of natural resources and on-going processes of wealth creation through LED.
Following the above objectives and principles, planned avenues for an effective and meaningful LED implementation were suggested. These interventions under LED policy (section 3.5.1) include among others:

i. Local development that involves improving the state of natural and built environments (including basic infrastructure such as roads, electricity, water and waste removal);

ii. Local enterprise development, which will stimulate economic growth in the rural areas in Uganda. These enterprises include large, medium, small and micro enterprises in both the agricultural and non-agricultural sectors;

iii. Local economic governance that entails improving the economic performance of local government in Uganda, based on better management, accountability and transparency.

iv. Establishment of Local Economic Investment Committees. The major role of these Committees is to identify local opportunities that they can market to investors from within and outside the country. For example, if there is need for land, they identify the land; notify the Uganda Investment Authority at the centre especially if the land needs to be serviced with utilities and infrastructure.

v. Establishment of Millennium Development Villages. These are still at trial level. However, the objective to this initiative is to provide examples of what a community with access to services looks like.

vi. Promotion of Public Private Partnerships in provision of local government services.

**Cases of Local Development Initiatives by Region**

LED interventions that were introduced in district local governments of Apac, Arua, Nwoya, Kasese, Kayunga, Mbarara Jinja (LED policy 2014). In the recent ULGA draft report on LED implementation challenges in Uganda (Ssemakula, 2009), a list of local governments that implemented LED deliberate or circumstantial initiatives are indicated in table 1 below:

**Table 1: Selected districts with LED initiatives in Uganda**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGION</th>
<th>DISTRICT</th>
<th>INITIATIVES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>Kayunga</td>
<td>• Piloted LED under catalytic projects and PPPs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Ongoing LED efforts with pineapple growing and exporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lwengo</td>
<td>• Piloting own LED model based on the Rwandese concept of Umuganda (community contribution) and Imihigo (performance contract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• District propelled LED efforts, Strong governance focus for LED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wakiso and KCCA</td>
<td>• Variety of Works force development LED Models – vegetable growing, service industry, transport (taxi and motor bike)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Land banking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Labour Supplier for Kampala</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western</td>
<td>Sheema</td>
<td>• Home to the Model Village in Kabwohe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• District propelled LED efforts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Isingiro</td>
<td>• Ongoing Millennium Villages Project – premised on LED</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Independent strong case for District LED promotional role at district
- Has implemented the recommended LED District framework
- Strong governance focus for LED

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Initiative Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North Eastern</td>
<td>Dokolo</td>
<td>Piloted Public private Partnership under UNCDF Support and ULAM Uganda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern</td>
<td>Kitugum</td>
<td>Ongoing partnership between Cheers Uganda and District. This a good case study for District LED Promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern</td>
<td>Nwoya</td>
<td>Implemented successful Community Development (CDD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern</td>
<td>Sironko</td>
<td>Multiple subsidiary LED models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern</td>
<td>Jinja</td>
<td>High forms of Works force development (industries and Sugar factories)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 1 above summarises initiatives in selected pilot districts within Uganda. The presented summary of the initiatives per district illustrate the diversity of LED projects within most of the districts and the ambiguity about the nature and objectives of the projects. The intricacies within these projects are bin tandem with the broad challenges discussed in the subsequent sections.

Performance of LED Policy Initiatives in Uganda

Even when LED Policy initiatives were introduced in selected districts across all regions in Uganda the LED outcomes in relation to the policy objectives are limited in scope and scanty in documentation. The World Bank Report (2016) presents the findings of the LED assessment in the districts of Jinja in central Uganda, Arua in North Western Uganda and Nwoya in Northern Uganda. A draft report on the challenges on the Challenges Faced By Local Governments In The Implementation Of The Local Economic Development Policy ULGA (2009) report incidentally does not document the achievements from the indicated 10 district cases across all the Uganda regions. From the outlook, it is observed that the initiatives are cross-cutting in all service delivery sectors amongst the case districts. The sectors in which LED has been integrated include industry, tourism, agribusiness, infrastructure, skills and innovation, enterprise support and finance as well as institutional regulatory environment for business. The unlimited scope, structural designs, technical capacity, demographics and social-economic dynamics; and documentation of LED programs are some of the impediments for the LED performance in Uganda

The Policy Structural Design

First is the challenge is structural design. The World Bank (2016) report identifies the challenge of LED preoccupation on the institutional arrangements rather than economic aspects which incapacitated delivery

---

23 UNCDF = UN Capital Development Fund
24 CDD = Community Driven Development
of the desired results for the local economy. Accordingly, the World Bank notes that more attention was put on institutional aspects of LED strategies and Forums than Local governments need to economically do and that LED pilot projects focused more creating enterprises in partnership with the local governments than making investments which would alleviate poverty. Evidence from the Local Economic and Business Assessment (LEBA) manual (2009) clearly indicate the complexity that LED encountered from the onset. The LEBA 2009 assessment tool was premised on the seven major assessment areas of LED which include: i) Local Economy ii) Regulatory Environment iii) Economic Infrastructure and Social Services Survey iv) Financial Services Sector v) Public Private Partnership vi) Business Development Services vii) Civil Society Organisations (p7-8). The development of multisectoral assessment tool to be used by multidisciplinary teams presented a number of key indicators for a given locality to be identified and recorded in the LED assessment areas of local economic and business. The targeted LED assessment results, outputs, outcomes and impacts were not only ambiguous but also immeasurable. Lack of a clear implementation and evaluation framework from 2006-2014 when the LED policy was approved created a window of uncertainty for the LED procedures and ultimate goals.

Even with the 2014 LED policy, the LED objectives seem to remain complex and more process-oriented than aiming at tangible outcomes which poses a challenge of effective implementation, proper evaluation and possibly a limited motivation for the development partners. The institutional framework for implementation and coordination of the National LED policy (p.17) also remains compounded with multilevel actors of diverse categories.

A further critical analysis shows that even though LED is clearly stipulated in the National Development Plan (NDP), there is an apparent lack of clear linkage between the LED policy and the NDP, the national budget and other local development initiatives. As a development strategy, LED design should demonstrate a visible orchestration with other rural initiatives such as Agricultural Sector Development Strategy and Investment Plan (ASDSIP) 2010/11-2014/15, Northern Uganda Reconstruction Program (NUREP), Agriculture Sector Strategic Plan (ASSP 2015/16 to 2019/20), Northern Uganda Social Action Fund, Youth Livelihood Program and other Presidential initiatives for poverty eradication such as Prosperity for All (PFA) and Operation Wealth Creation (OWC).

**Institutional Capacity**

A review of LED documentation reveals that LED projects are scattered throughout diverse local government areas. This requires local government capacity in terms of numerical staffing and also in terms of technical abilities. One of the key implementers of LED at the district level as indicated in the policy (section 4.2) is the commercial officer. There is a presumption that the district commercial officers and the district administration as a whole are knowledgeable and competent in initiating and managing LED strategies. There seems also to be an assumption that the staffing levels for the post of commercial officer and other core district administrators are at optimal to initiate, design, implement and evaluate the LED performance. Essentially, LED is a technical approach to development that requires technical skills and competences of the implementing persons within the leading local governments to mobilize and coordinate other government, private and NGO partners and resources.
Demographics and Socio-Economic Dynamics

Various anecdotal sources indicate that LED initiatives in pilot local governments in Uganda are also made limited achievements because of the socio-economic and demographic factors. The Uganda’s economy is characterized by poor earnings of the majority population that is fast growing and largely youthful. Mapping the workforce growth rate estimated at 4 million people per year, against the poverty levels of 21.4 per cent in 2016/2017 (Uganda National Household Survey 2016/17) suggest difficulty of have meaningful LED partnerships between the government, the private sector and the NGO world and civil society aiming at yielding substantial outcomes. The poor national economic conditions may not permit a desirable environment for all stakeholders to effectively participate in the LED process. Further, the much of Uganda Economy is characterized with small holder farmers in most local governments which limit access to large scale commercial agriculture, large scale productivity and markets. Apparently and clearly pronounced also is the fact that most Local Governments are characterized by a weak Micro Small and Medium (MSME) enterprises sector (business oriented organizations) which operate individually and are not organized into sector associations or clusters and are therefore unable to either generate resources internally or even lobby for the necessary support from the external stakeholders. The local economy consist of a high proportion of unemployed or underemployed the population many of whom are in informal employment. These social-economic and demographic challenges coupled with poor infrastructure in the local governments such as lack of robust road network, insufficient water for production, marketing infrastructure and agro-processing facilities and the absence of cheap and affordable sources of agricultural financing enervate the environment for private sector investment. Their participation in LED therefore may not only be constrained by this but also their contribution may be quite minute to bring about observable outcomes.

Documentation

For over a decade, LED has been adopted as a development approach in Uganda. It is however evident that apart from the LED policy of 2014, there is little documentation on the initial institutional design, implementation and assessment of the LED performance todate. A few dispersed anecdotal resources in form of web material, workshop presentations, and specific targeted institutional information are in existence. Lack of a comprehensive multisectoral detailed accounts of LED achievements that are based on the Ministry of Local Government Local Economic and Business Assessment (LEBA) assessment tool (2009) or on the national LED policy implementation and Monitoring and evaluation Frameworks creates a knowledge gap of what has been programmed and achieved through LED approach. There is a possibility that the complexity of the structural design and the malleable scope of the LED actors and goals may explain the challenges related to the comprehension, implementation and evaluation of LED in the Uganda context. These conditions may subsequently affect the profilins and recoding consistent LED reports for reference and action.

Conclusions and the Strategic Shift for LED Initiatives in Uganda

In the process of examining LED in developing economies this paper establishes that there are a number of challenges encountered in the conception, design and implementation of LED. This paper takes these as learning spots for review, aimed at improving the performance of LED initiatives. One argument for embracing LED is its territorial bottom-up approach. Attention well drawn to the region or grassroots localities where the majority poor targeted in the local development process reside is of great advantage. It
emerges clearly in the socio-economic and demographic challenges of LED implementation earlier discussed that majority of the population in our local economies are under unemployed and other are under employed. It is also agreeable that Micro, Small and Medium (MSME) enterprises there in are feeble, and not unified on their own to pool together the few resources and skills for developmental purposes. This may however not mean that the un/underemployed or MSMEs have no potentials of contributing to development. First, such categories may need deliberate community mobilizations within their own household and community activities. Looking at the initiatives as those presented in Table 1 in this paper, there is a feeling that the current designed LED approaches and initiatives are not typically bottom-up. Many of these development ideas seem to be adopted from the frameworks of LED policy introduced to the communities by the government officials either from the local or national level.

My second view is that for LED to demonstrate a reasonable impact in Uganda, the geographical scope needs to be further narrowed preferably to the lowest administrative unit of local government. This may be an alternative structural arrangement in addition to the zoning proposal of the current LED policy. The administrative level unit will not only reduce the diverse categories of local people and their wishes and developmental interests but is a strategy for coordination and collaboration of the local people in the absence of well-established and strong local associations to interact with other local economic and social actors. It will ease processes for lobbying support from government and other development partners. Ideally “village model” approaches to development would be more ideal for LED implementation. The few adjacent households in the same locality may be mobilized to support each other in common areas of interest for development based on the time and material resources within their reach. As Rodríguez-Pose (2002) argues, such communities are capable of adopting ideas and corresponding tools/instruments for their own development initiatives. The local government support would be better availed through a community development officer that links these households to respective government officers in the line ministries/sectors where the local initiatives fall. In short, the local actors within the clustered in a village model unit should be able to plan their activities, make their goals, and mobilize themselves to attain their goals with the support technical officers from the nearest local government. This village model approach though may be more appropriate with in a rural locality compared to urban setting. For the urban localities the approach to local economic development may need a different design.

Thirdly, to resolve issues of the institutional capacity, the first step to be taken in LED should be to empower the communities technically, economically socially, and politically. A bottom-up developmental approach requires proper planning and forecasting. The local people in proposed village model geographical units should initially be sensitized about the development approach and guided on how the model can work. Local government technical staff should train the locals on the basic community planning and project management techniques. Notably, skills on record keeping and financial literacy plus other elementary management skills like conflict management, communication, etc, should be given to these communities through regular courses. A clear documentation will assist in the tracking of the LED initiatives progress but also in evaluation of the performance for purposes of improvement.

Finally, within their local economic development plan should integrate self-help initiatives. It is true that the government under LED is responsible for creating enabling environment through efforts like infrastructural development, security, investment climate, support for disadvantage groups, and promotion and support of MSMEs. Such responsibilities have always been obligatory for the local or national governments. The challenges for meeting these obligations by the government is a great lesson for the
communities that are focusing on LED. Through community leadership, communities can be mobilized to improve their own local development environment in which community members agree on modalities to attain such environment in areas like community policing, community access roads, community health, safe water access and maintenance.

References


MOLG (2009). Ministry of Local Government Local Economic and Business Assessment (LEBA) manual


Uganda Vision 2040, The Republic of Uganda

Critical Analysis of Regulatory Mechanisms for Governance of Community Health Insurance Schemes: The Uganda Perspective

1Hizaamu Ramadhan, 2Basaza Robert & 3Namara B. Rose
1,2Uganda Management Institute, Uganda
2St. Augustine International University, Kampala, Uganda

Abstract

Introduction
Regulating operational modalities of community health insurance schemes is important in protecting the interests of the consumers and service providers in mitigating the escalating costs of health care especially for the poor rural communities. This study on governance of community health insurance schemes was guided by the research question related to the current policies and legislation and the extent to which they addressed governance and sustainability issues of the schemes. The aim was to explore the existing community health insurance schemes’ regulatory mechanisms in as far as they impacted on enrolment and sustainability.

Subjects and Methods
The research paradigm was underpinned by the interpretivistic philosophical orientation that sought to use qualitative data as the source of knowledge. It adopted an inductive cross sectional explanatory case study design. The study site was Kampala Capital City, Nakasongola, Nakaseke, Kanungu and Luwero districts. The target population included policy and decision makers as well as program implementers who were purposively sampled. A total of 16 key informants were interviewed. The variables of interest were enrolment and sustainability of community health insurance schemes. Key informant interview and documents review guides were used to generate the required data which was analyzed using thematic and content analysis.

Results
The study established that the current policies and legislation do not adequately address governance of community health insurance schemes within the premises of diversity and homogeneity in communities. The governance structures of the schemes require serious attention given the variations in the socioeconomic set up and the diverse social networks in the different communities in Uganda. The drive by Government of Uganda towards universal health coverage will continue to meet constraints especially with respect to integrating community health insurance.

Conclusion
While regulations put in place will be used to operationalize the law, it is imperative that provisions for social networks underpinned by diversity and homogeneity of communities be reflected in the law. This will ensure that the poor and vulnerable populations who bear the brunt of disease burden and catastrophic health care expenditures are included in the drive towards universal health coverage.

Key words: Community Health Insurance Schemes, governance,

Introduction
The study was conducted with the view of providing insight in the current laws and policies regulating community health insurance schemes in Uganda and how they facilitate or constrain enrolment and sustainability of the schemes. The study aimed to provide luminance to the legislative and knowledge gaps whose redress will be instrumental in facilitating the Government’s drive towards universal health coverage. Community health insurance is one of the strategies for mitigating catastrophic health expenditures incurred by the poor communities under the universal health coverage program (Chen et al.
The stakeholder theory which has been widely used in health related studies to explain the roles of service users, service providers and policy makers in improving quality of health care was used in this study (Murdock, 2004). The study objective was to critically examine the existing regulatory mechanisms on community health insurance governance and how they facilitate or hinder sustainability of the schemes.

**Literature Review**

While the schemes provide different options to address gaps in health care financing, they have not spread out to all Districts of Uganda and the reasons being lack of supportive legislation and policies. As such, Basaza et al. (2013) noted that beneficiaries’ premiums are insecure in absence of Government regulated body for professional accreditation, lack of standardized quality assurance mechanisms, uncertain redress measures and contract management systems are as divergent as the number of schemes available. Measures for community participation and ownership, equity in access, efficiency in operation of the schemes and the social objectives are equally not streamlined. This limits the ability to mobilize, enroll and retain beneficiaries which also affects the resource base, quality of health care services provided and sustainability of the schemes.

The Draft National Health Insurance Bill, (2017) is an attempt by the Government of Uganda to provide guidance to governance of the National Health Insurance scheme. However, there are no provisions to regulate how the schemes should be governed yet they are expected to cover the informal sector which has majority of the population (UCBHFA, 2014). Studies have shown that enhancing accountability in health systems using various mechanisms, including streamlining governance structures through regulatory frameworks, is progressively emphasized as vital in uplifting the type and quality of health services delivered globally and more especially in the less developed nations (Cornwall et al. 2000; Atela et al. 2015). This position is echoed by several scholars (Alatinga and Fielmua, 2011; Basaza et al. 2007; De Allegri et al. 2005) who argue that unregulated community health insurance schemes suffer limited enrolment. This is partly contributed to by the minimal community involvement in decision making, governance of the schemes, adverse selection which progressively results into reduced repeat-enrolment and subsequently smaller risk pools and higher insurance costs. These combine to adversely impact on sustainability of the schemes.

Government regulatory mechanisms are essential in defining the power relations and such help in creating and strengthening trust between the governance (Basaza et al. 2007; De Allegri et al. 2005; Alatinga and Fielmua, 2011) and communities to increase enrolment. As argued by different scholars (Atela, 2009; George, 2009; Atela et al. 2015), regulatory frameworks have the overall impact of increasing efficiency, sensitivity and responsiveness of health services, and community health insurance schemes for this matter. This is especially so in less developed nations where health care delivery structures and systems are under pressure to address the challenges of high disease burden amidst dwindling resource envelopes. The absence of clear policy and regulatory mechanisms for community health insurance governance leaves a lacuna which this study sought to cover. This is in the perspective of fostering local accountability mechanisms which, as argued by George (2009), facilitate communities to meaningfully engage directly with health service providers. This has an impact on sustaining community health insurance schemes which we shall now examine.
Methodology

The research paradigm was underpinned by the interpretivistic philosophical orientation that sought to use qualitative data as the source of knowledge. The reason for using qualitative approach was based on the notion that community health insurance schemes’ operations are context specific and cannot be generalized to the entire population (Basaza, O’Connell and Chapčáková, 2013; Schneider, 2005; De Allegri, Sanon and Sauerborn, 2006). The research adopted a cross sectional explanatory case study design study and was inductive in nature. The study site was Kampala Capital City Authority, Kanungu and Luweero districts. The choice of the study areas was informed by the existence of the two forms of community health insurance schemes namely provider managed and community owned. These schemes have been operating in the two districts for over five years (Save for Health Uganda, 2016), thus providing sufficient grounds for exploring the variables under study. The choice of Kampala Capital City Authority was based on the fact that this was where policy and decision makers were located. The target population included policy and decision makers as well as program implementers who were purposively sampled on the basis of their expert knowledge related to legislation and operations of community health insurance schemes. A total of 16 key informants were interviewed. Data quality control involved ensuring acceptable levels of reliability and validity of the study. These two concepts are rooted in positivist perspective but have been redefined for application in the naturalistic (interpretive) paradigm (Golafshani, 2003) under which this study was premised. The study tools were field pre-tested and reviewed for flow and content so that they generate the desired information (Johnson, Onwuegbuzie and Turner, 2007). Measurement of variables took an inductive approach, creating new concepts as data collection progressed. Data codes or labels were assigned to emerging themes as they unfolded (Golafshani, 2003). Themes and sub themes were identified and built upon during analysis and discussion. The ethical codes of conduct of Uganda Management Institute, International Health Sciences University-Research Ethics Committee and the Uganda National Council for Science and Technology were adhered to throughout the entire research process.

Findings and Discussions

Given the fact that his study was qualitative in nature and that it adopted an inductive approach, we deemed it convenient to present the results and discussions simultaneously in order to maintain coherence.

Uganda’s Policy and Legislative Frameworks on Community Health Insurance Schemes

A number of legal, policy and program documents provide for the establishment of the Universal health Coverage under which community health insurance schemes falls. The 1995 Constitution of the Republic of Uganda under part XIV on general social and economic objectives provides for State to fulfill the fundamental rights of all Ugandans to social justice and economic development. In particular, it states the Government’s obligation in ensuring that all Ugandans enjoy rights and opportunities and access to among others health services. Under the National Objectives and Directive Principles of State Policy, the Constitution under part XX on Medical services provides for the State to take all practical measures to ensure the provision of basic medical services to the population. This is operationalized under the Second National Health Policy (2010) where one of the Policy strategies states that Government shall “Establish overall adjusted health financing mechanisms based on pre-payment and financial risk pooling aiming at universal coverage and social health protection. These shall include national health insurance and other community health financing mechanisms”. This will be based on pre-payment and financial risk pooling aiming at universal coverage and social health protection including national health insurance and other
community health financing mechanisms. Community Health Insurance schemes are provided for under the latter.

The Uganda Vision 2040 highlights the importance of co-financing for health by adopting the universal health insurance system through public-private partnerships. The Second National Development (2015) further states that the health sector will work towards achieving Universal Health Coverage through establishing a national health insurance scheme. In the absence of the National Health Insurance Act as the governance and regulatory framework (The Draft National Health Insurance Bill has been gazetted), the Insurance Regulatory Authority of Uganda regulates all health insurance activities in the country. The Authority was established under the Insurance Act, Cap 213 Laws of Uganda with the main objective of ensuring effective administration, supervision, regulation and control of the business of insurance in Uganda. This was consequent to Government’s adoption of the liberalization and privatization policies which ended its role of directly engaging in the provision of goods and services and taking on the role of supervisor or regulator. Against this background, we analyze the specific legislation that regulates the operations of health insurance with the view of identifying gaps related to governance of community health insurance schemes in Uganda.

The Ministry of Health derives its mandate from the Constitution of the Republic of Uganda (1995) and is responsible for implementing health care interventions in the country. Investment in the promotion of people’s health ensures that they remain productive and contribute to national development. The Uganda Health Accounts, National Health Expenditure Financial Years 2014/15 and 2015/16 indicate that health services are provided by the public and private sub-sector with the latter contributing about 43.4%. The Ministry of Health established a formal mutually supportive partnership with Uganda Protestant Medical Bureau towards realizing the Health Sector Development Plan goal of accelerating movement towards Universal Health Coverage with essential health and related services needed for promotion of a healthy and productive life (MoH, 2015). It is through this partnership and the desire to realize Universal Health Coverage that the community health insurance scheme under Bwindi Community Hospital was premised.

As a stakeholder, Ministry of Health is responsible for among other, policy formulation, regulation, advising, setting standards and quality assurance, capacity development and technical support, and evaluation of the overall sector performance. These responsibilities directly relate to the power and influence exerted on the community health insurance schemes with respect to health service quality and quantity provided to communities. Attention is now focused on the specific legislation related to community health insurance schemes.

**The Insurance Act, (2017)**

The Insurance Act, (Uganda, 2017) established the Insurance Regulatory Authority of Uganda whose objectives are (a) to promote and facilitate the maintenance of a sound, efficient, fair, transparent and stable insurance sector; (b) to promote and uphold public confidence in the insurance sector; (c) to protect the interests of persons who are, or who may become, policy holders of insurers or customers of other licensees; (d) to regulate and supervise licensees on a risk-sensitive basis; (e) to promote effective competition in the insurance sector in the interests of consumers, the growth and development of the insurance sector and the development of an inclusive insurance sector. Indeed these objectives provide a strong basis for operationalizing the community health insurance schemes in general sense. It is however, notable that the thrust of the Insurance Regulatory Authority is on Social Health Insurance Scheme that covers public
servants and formal employees in the private sector as well as the Private Commercial Insurance scheme. This omission has hitherto left community health insurance schemes to operate with minimal regulation and without streamlined governance and management standards as elaborated by one of the key informants:

“The Insurance Regulatory Authority tends to focus on Social Health Insurance Scheme which where public servants and the private sector formal employees plus the Private Commercial Insurance scheme which are more vibrant. Community Health Insurance schemes by nature of their focus on rural populations present as very challenging to regulate given the big number of informal community groups” (MoH official)

The limited legislative focus on community health insurance schemes by the Insurance Act, (2017) lends credence to our earlier assertion and as posited by (Basaza, O’Connell and Chapčáková, 2013) that beneficiaries’ premiums are not protected in absence of clear legal frameworks. The multiplicity of community health insurance schemes without clear governance and leadership structures have adversely impacted on their performance. Some schemes had closed out while the functional ones continue to experience low enrolment. It is our contention that in the absence of Government regulated professional accreditation body that can ensure quality mechanisms services under community health insurance schemes, it will be a tall order to sustain the schemes. In addition, the weak regulatory mechanisms have left the schemes without clear legal redress measures and contract management systems which as we earlier noted were as divergent as the number of schemes available. The example of the stakeholder relations and power play in the Save for Health Uganda supported schemes in Luwero and eQuality health insurance schemes run by Bwindi Community Hospital in Kanungu district which are not streamlined provides further insight into the regulatory dilemma. Another key informant stated thus;

“Regulating community health insurance schemes is actually the function of Insurance Regulatory Authority. Although we are mandated to work together with Ministry of Health in regulating these schemes, our hands are tied with respect to resources, technical expertise and the diversely spread community groups. A more specific law is necessary to further streamline the management and leadership structures of the schemes. I am hopeful that the Draft National Health Insurance Scheme Bill and its regulations thereof if passed will make good these gaps” (Official from Insurance Regulatory Authority)

The lack of sufficient research literature on regulatory frameworks for community health insurance schemes has created a gap in streamlining them. Given their informal operational modalities, the social dynamics involved and the context specific environment in the communities where they exist, there has been more focus on the other more organized schemes. The Insurance Regulatory Authority is supposed to work in partnership with the Ministry of Health to regulate these schemes but lack the requisite resources in terms of finances and human resources skilled in this area. But this requires a specific legislation to back their mandate. Its absence has further constrained resource allocation to facilitate effective monitoring of performance of community health insurance schemes.

In fact, the core factor upon which community health insurance schemes are grounded is informed by the social networks mechanisms (Lovell, 2002). This is a social factor that transcends the Ministry of Health and the Insurance Regulatory Authority to include the Ministry of Gender Labour and Social Development. It is grounded on the fact that the focus of the community health insurance scheme leadership is based on
trust and social networks rather than a mere health financing issue. In addition, the voluntary nature of joining community health insurance schemes gives community lee way not to join yet this is one of the key strategy to address the financing gaps in health care service provision. It is therefore our remit that limited the enrolment in the existing community health insurance schemes is a result of lack of supportive legislation which would have seen an enforcement of a mandatory registration to any of the available health insurance schemes. This would ensure equitable distribution and delivery of health care services and respond to the call for universal health coverage.

Gaps in the Insurance Act

The Insurance Act, (Uganda, 2017) provides for the functions of the Authority under section 12 which specifically aim to: (Sub section a) to regulate, supervise, monitor and control the insurance sector; (Sub section O); promote awareness of, and undertake public education concerning, the insurance sector; and (Sub section b) to establish standards for the conduct of business in the insurance sector and to issue such guidance as it considers appropriate. However, there is an apparent void on how these provisions are applied to community health insurance schemes. It is out thesis that the schemes’ governance and management have been left in the hands of those whose epistemic influence to drive the agenda. This is to the disadvantage of the ultimate community beneficiaries the schemes are intended to protect and serve.

We further contend that the existence of multiple and complex configurations of social network arithmetics under which the different schemes operate take precedence over formal governance procedures to which the laws and regulations must conform to. In Uganda, few if any of the community health insurance schemes would resonate with the provisions of the Insurance Act considering the high standards set in terms of qualifications of the scheme governing boards. The Law provides for a governance framework under section (58) which requires that (1) every insurer and Health Membership Organization shall establish and maintain an appropriate governance and management framework. Subsection (3) further states that the governance and management framework shall provide for the apportionment of roles between shareholders, directors, senior management and key persons in control functions. We thus contend that these legal frameworks notwithstanding, the current governance practices in both the provider, and community initiated and managed schemes falls short of these provisions. This is on account of the voluntary nature of operations and the fact that the governance committee members do not have the requisite educational levels necessary to comprehend the complexities inherent with the insurance business. The gaps in the legal frameworks debunk the weak local accountability mechanisms and epistemic influence that would enable beneficiary communities to meaningfully engage other stakeholders in managing the schemes (Smudde and Jeffrey, 2011). It is our considered opinion that even with the provisions of the legal frameworks, the concept of social networks should be an integral part of the scheme leadership. This will provide a middle ground that accommodates the very essence for which the organically formed health insurance groups were premised.

Setting Premiums

The Insurance Regulatory Authority under section 64 of the Insurance Act, (Uganda, 2017) is supposed to approve premium and commission rates. It prohibits the insurer or Health Membership Organisation not to issue any policy of insurance if the premium rates and commission rates contravene any regulations made by the Authority under subsection (2). Furthermore, the Authority may prescribe minimum premium or maximum commission rates for any class or type of insurance business. In fact, applying these provisions
will definitely undermine the spirit under which communities come together to form community health insurance schemes. The high poverty levels and catastrophic health expenditure that the schemes are supposed to mitigate cannot facilitate issuance of regulated premiums. This is on account of the different poverty indices in the regions of the country. For example, the Eastern region of Uganda has high levels of poverty estimated at 42% compared to 19.1% in the west (Uganda Bureau of Statistics, 2014) and as such the premium levied for this region cannot be comparable to the western region with lower poverty indices.

It is our contention that setting minimum premium for community health insurance schemes across the country would require considering regions with the highest poverty levels as bench marks. This would address health equity issues which have been defined as the lack of logical disparities in health between social groups with divergent social economic dispositions (Kotoh, Aryeetey and Van der Geest, 2017). We further aver that the need for Government to set up the minimum and maximum ranges of premiums cannot be overemphasized. This will provide for some level of elasticity within which premiums can be fixed to integrate all levels of social economic variations in the different communities across the country. This position is underpinned by our earlier understanding that community health insurance schemes generate much of their premiums from enrolled members and to some extent from external funding by development partners (UCBHFA, 2014). The latter is usually not very reliable hence the need to focus on the more sustainable community sources of funding.

**The Draft National Health Insurance Bill, (2017)**

Government of Uganda is in the process of enacting a law for National Health Insurance Scheme which is now the Cabinet. This Law provides for pre-payment and financial risk pooling aimed at universal coverage and social health protection (MoH, 2015; MoH, 2013). While it may not be appropriate to discuss the provisions of the draft Bill before it comes into Law, it is important to highlight some salient gaps which might contribute to low enrolment. The purpose of pooling resources for health financing is to make funding available, as well as to set the right financial incentives for health care service providers. This would ensure that all individuals have access to effective public health and personal health care irrespective of their social economic differentials (Orem and Zikusooka, 2010). The draft Bill does not provide for compulsory enrolment yet it evident that without additional funding through health insurance, it will remain a tall order for Government to equitably address the health care access disparities in the country as noted infra;

> “Joining community health insurance schemes is voluntary in nature; there are no legal provisions for forced enrolment where the provisions of the Law on insurance can be effectively applied. It is important that the proposed Draft National Health Insurance Bill includes provisions for mandatory enrolment for all adults” (Program Officer from an implementing organization)

Mandatory enrolment into community health insurance schemes has been recommended by scholars with a disclaimer that this should be accompanied with quality health services. It has been noted that in some countries like Ghana where every citizen is enjoined to being to one form of health insurance, cases of out of pocket expenditures still occur. The quality of services in the designated health facilities were poor resulting into enrolled members going to private health care service providers. This in their opinion supported the observation that compulsory or voluntary informal payment is a barrier to healthcare access for poor families. For example, about 25% of healthcare users in Ghana pay illegal fees to public health providers (Kotoh, Aryeetey and Van der Geest, 2017). While this observation may be correct, we contend that the basic principle for compulsory enrolment boarders more on ensuring equity in access to health care.
We further posit that the failures in ensuring provision of quality health care services by Government agencies cannot on its own negate the good intentions of compulsory enrolment.

Community health insurance schemes are mutual solidarity groups built around the concept of trust and reciprocity characterized by common social expectations (Katia et al. 2012; De Allegri, Sanon and Sauerborn, 2006). Given the diversities in the Uganda society, it is unlikely to have the same governance mechanisms for community insurance schemes. This means that the law should provide for alternative schemes that accommodate the social diversities as noted hereunder:

“The focus of the community health insurance scheme leadership is based on trust and social networks rather than the provision of the Law. In fact, if you go by the provisions of the Law, it is very likely that community trust will be undermined and this will affect the levels of enrolment which are already low” (Program Officer from an implementing organization)

If trust, as argued by different scholars is core in managing sustainable community health insurance schemes (Katz, 2018; Chen et al. 2012), then it should resonate with the legal provisions. The implications are that the concepts of mutual reciprocity should have presence in the laws regulating community health insurance schemes in order to ensure that the social fabrics that bind communities are integrated. We thus present that this will promote community ownership of these schemes even in situations of compulsory enrolment.

**Salient provisions of the National Health Insurance Bill**

Uganda’s Proposed National Health Insurance Scheme Clause 6(k) of the National Health Insurance Bill makes provision for the establishment of community health insurance schemes. These are intended to cover persons who do not qualify as members of the National Health Insurance Scheme by virtue of not being either public servants or employees making National Social Security Fund contributions. The broad objective of the National Health Insurance Bill is to provide for the establishment of the National Health Insurance Scheme and its functions. Accordingly, it will enable among other things the establishment of the Scheme’s Board, outlining its composition, functions and powers as well as provide for staffing and funding. The Bill will further provide for registration of contributors and their beneficiaries; the articulation of benefits available under the scheme; the creation of an accreditation committee to review prospective health care providers and their service and payment agreements. Other provisions include the regional health insurance offices and an Appeals tribunal to hear disputes arising from the implementation of the Bill.

One salient omission of the Bill is how community health insurance schemes will integrate the different perspectives of social networks in the leadership structures and regulatory mechanisms. It is our contention that the provisions for the National Health Insurance Scheme governance give more focus on the national, regional and district levels and do not in any way address the divergent social networks that impact on enrolment and sustainability of the schemes (Basaza, O’Connell and Chapčáková, 2013). Furthermore, the Bill is not very clear about communities in the informal sector who constitute 43 percent of gross domestic product and employs about 90% of the total non-farm private workers (Government of Uganda, 2015). It is therefore pertinent to make adequate provision for the informal sector as a significant proportion of Uganda’s economy is dependent on this sector. The Bill presumes that the informal sector implies and includes all members who are not public servants, members of the National Social Security Fund or indigent
persons. Clause 8 provides that whoever is not a beneficiary of the National Health Insurance Scheme under clause 5 shall be registered under the community health insurance. We thus note that Clause 8 of the Bill which provides for the informal-sector population is elaborated in the regulations. The regulations should be able to detail out how the community health insurance schemes will be organized, their mode of operation and generally how social networks mechanisms will be integrated.

Conclusion

The study has significant health financing policy utility to the Government of Uganda, Development Partners, Researchers, Academicians and Managers of community health insurance schemes in informing policy review under the National Health Insurance program. This study has established that the current policies and legislation do not adequately address governance of community health insurance schemes. Against this background, it will be very challenging to sustainably run the schemes without sufficient provisions in legislation and policies. The provisions of the National Health Insurance Bill only serve to offer technocratic solutions to a more sophisticated societal issue with respect to social networks that drive group formation upon which community health insurance schemes are founded. Equally, the leadership mechanisms adopted by the different community health insurance scheme structures further pose challenges of standardization across the country. The notion of prescriptive legislation based on standard leadership structures and mechanisms may not promote people’s participation. It is our thesis that the manner in which the different stakeholders are regulated and how the schemes are governed constitute the forces that determine the level congruence for institutional sustainability. Regulating these forces will definitely enhance the drive towards streamlining community health insurance schemes as viable entities towards realization of universal health coverage in Uganda.

The study makes a proposition for review of supportive policies to community health insurance schemes to address significant lapses especially on the governance perspective. The process of policy reviews on the national Health Insurance Bill should integrate the societal diversities as a background variable for leadership of community health insurance. We further recommend legislation for establishing compulsory community insurance schemes but allowing for flexibility to integrate the social cultural disparities inherent in the different populations. This will ensure that every citizen is enroled under the different types of health insurance and also foster enrolment and sustainability. This study further proposes the “Bull’s Eye Governance Model” (Annex 1) for community health insurance as a practical framework for streamlining governance and enhancing trust building mechanisms within District Local Governments. However, the framework will require supportive legal backing to have optimal effects.

References


George, A. (2009). By papers and pens, you can only do so much: views about accountability and human resource management from Indian Government health administrators and workers. The International Journal of Health Planning and Management.
and Energy Abstracts. 37. 137-144. 10.1016/j.pubrev.2011.01.008.


Uganda Community Based Health Financing Association (UCBHFA). (2014). Community Health Insurance - a vital sub scheme of the National Health Insurance. Position Paper presented to the Ministry of Health, Kampala, Uganda
Annex 1: The Bulls “Eye Model”

District Superstructure Governance

Intermediate structure Governance (Umbrella organization or Union of Community Health Insurance Schemes and health service providers)

Operational level Governance
- Inorganic and Organic community health insurance schemes

Governance of Community Health Insurance Schemes

Other stakeholders at District level

Community Health Insurance Schemes implementing NGOs

Health service providers’ representatives

Community Health Insurance Schemes representatives

District Local Governments

Laws

Guidelines

Policies
Corporate Governance in Developing Economies

Kennedy Ongoye Ogwengo

Abstract

This study examined cooperate governace setting in developing countries. Data was collected through intensive literature review. The literature revealed lack of simultaneous development of legal and institutional framework among cooporations; and lack of effective institutions associated with successful market economies. The researcher concludes that corporate governance is critical for the effective operations of an economy’s financial market resulting to efficient allocation of financial resources and is the key to economic growth.

Key Words: Developing Countries, Corporate Governance, Institutional Framework

Introduction

Globally, corporate governance has become a political debate. Over the last two decades, various events have determined the levels of corporate governance, these include: the influence of investors or shareholders, the powers of the board, rules governing takeovers, international financial institutions, the global business environment and the compensation of the chief executives. Research on corporate governance span across various fields such strategic management, finance, political science and sociology.

Corporate governance is in the forefront in many economies as a result of the vital role it plays in the overall health of economic systems. The wave of U.S. corporate fraud in the 1990s was attributed to deficiencies in corporate governance. The global financial crisis between 2008-2009 triggered by the unprecedented failure of Lehman Brothers and the subprime mortgage problems, renewed interest in the role corporate governance plays in the financial sector. The development of a strong corporate governance framework in any economy is therefore key to protecting stakeholders, maintaining investor confidence in the transition countries and attracting foreign direct investment which can contribute to sustainable economic growth and development in the countries (World Bank, 2010).

Corporate Governance

The World Bank’s definition of corporate governance is present in two different approaches. First, from the stand point of a corporation, emphasis is placed upon the existing relations between the management board, the owners and the stakeholders who include customers, investors, employees and communities. The main advantage in corporate governance is presented to the board and its ability to achieve a sustainable value by balancing the interests. From the public policy point of view, corporate governance is defined as the provision for the development, growth and survival of a company and its accountability in the exercise of power and control over entities or companies. Public policy is mandated to discipline companies and business entities as well as ensure that they minimize differences between social and private interests (World Bank, 2010).

According to OECD (2009), corporate governance is the system by which business corporations are directed and controlled. The corporate governance structure outlines the distribution of responsibilities and rights among different participants in the corporation, such as the board, managers, shareholders and other stakeholders, and defines the rules and procedures for making corporate decisions. Through this, it also provides the structure for which the objectives of the company are set, and how to achieve the objectives.
and monitor performance.” The OECD further presents a broader definition that: “…corporate governance refers to the private and public institutions, including accepted business practices as well as legal and regulatory frameworks which together govern the relationship, in a market economy, between corporate managers and entrepreneurs (‘corporate insiders’) on one hand, and those who invest their resources in corporations on the other hand” (OECD, 2009).

**Corporate Governance in Developing Economies**

In developed economies, corporate governance system has been gradually developed over several years, and as now, corporate governance can be seen as a complex mosaic comprising of legal framework, politics, professional associations, public institutions, regulations, and codes of ethics. In developing economies on the other hand, corporate governance is still on its development stages and much details of the mosaic are still missing. Efforts aimed at the development of a system of good corporate governance in transitioning economies has been hindered by challenges which include weak legal and regulatory frameworks, weak institutions, underdeveloped human resource capabilities as well as complex corporate ownership structures. In the transitioning economies, there are often-overlooked corporate governance problems. These include:

- The scope and validity of the definition,
- The corporate governance framework,
- The appropriate corporate governance model
- The specific corporate governance settings

A strong corporate governance foundation is critical for any developing economy. Strong corporate governance must comprise of applicable laws as well as checks and balances, sound financial and accounting practices as well as corporate practices that are in line with the international standards. The legal framework must be clear, timely and consistently enforced. Establishing effective corporate governance is of particular importance for developing countries since its success not only important for the growth of a healthy corporate sector but also for sustaining a healthy market economy (Tricker, 2010).

**The Importance of Corporate Governance for Developing Economies**

The recent experience of countries in transition shows that the assumption that a strong system of corporate governance will appear automatically as a result of ownership transformation is unrealistic. Even in developed market economies, differences in the ownership structure and level of concentration or dispersion of owners influence the selection and adjustment of corporate control mechanisms. For the countries in transition, the problem of good corporate governance development becomes more complicated due to the underdeveloped institutional infrastructure. For this reason there is a need for a careful approach to governance restructuring so that a private sector can be formed, powerful enough to realize successful economic transformations towards a market economy.

According to Babic (2000), the importance of sound corporate governance for transition economies can be explained through its four main influences which include:

- Creation of the key institution, the private corporation, which drives the successful economic transformation to a market based economy
- Effective allocation of capital and development of financial markets,
Attracting foreign investment and Making a contribution to the process of national development

To develop effective corporate governance, there is a demand for the establishment of certain market economy institutions that are necessary for economic growth. Corporates cannot achieve their goals and missions of making profits as well as improving the social welfare without good corporate governance. Without regulations of governance and the institutional support or without the acceptance of corporate governance culture among owner, managers and stakeholders, corporate entities cannot operate successfully.

For developing countries, corporate entities and associated instructions are key drivers of successful economic transformation towards a market economy. As such, well developed corporate governance requires that all the relevant actors understand and recognize their roles in achieving good corporate governance. Increased privatization results to a high proportion of inactive participants in ownership since they do not recognize their responsibilities and rights. Majority simply wait for dividend payments which are not worth their value.

Managers do not have a clear understanding of their roles as agents whey a comparison is made to the owners, but the managers tend to run the entities as their own satisfying their own interest at the disadvantage of the owners and the corporate entity as a whole. Strict and coherent legal regulations are required for good corporate governance which demands an urgent consideration by policy makers in the developing countries. Further, it is important to provide for systems to recruit, train and reward professional managers who can be held to high standards of competency, ethics, and responsibility.

Financing and investments are directly linked to corporate governance. Disciplining managers through corporate governance mechanisms leads to an efficient allocation of resources. For developing countries, it is doubly important: the scarcity of domestic savings demands that capital be allocated to the most profitable corporate entities, which is possible only if principles of corporate governance are given publicity, transparency and monitoring; in addition, due to the imperfection of market mechanisms (underdeveloped stock and bond markets and an ineffective banking system), corporate governance presents an additional mechanism for discipline and effective management control in corporations.

Current Corporate Governance Settings in Developing Countries

In developing countries, the corporate sector is made up of “instant corporations” formed as the result of mass privatization; these corporations lack the simultaneous development of legal and institutional framework necessary for operations in a competitive market economy. Under these circumstances of diffuse ownership, insiders are able to strip assets and leave little value for minority shareholders (World Bank, 2009). Despite this almost all the corporate entities have effective boards, professional managers as well as components necessary for modern corporate governance.

The business environment in the developing countries only favors the old corporation that have been in operation for several years, this does not allow healthy competition as new and young vibrant corporations are not able to entire or survive in the markets dues to various barriers. With the unpredictable economic conditions in the developing countries, managers of corporations consider their positions temporary and as such they are not willing to embrace corporate governance effectively hence they only maximize their
benefits instead of the corporations and the key stakeholders. Weak government systems in the developing countries is also a hindrance in corporate governance since most policies being formulated have not been effective in streamlining corporate governance. The missing element in the context of corporate governance in developing economies is the lack of effective institutions associated with successful market economies.

Conclusion

Corporate governance is critical for the effective operations of an economy’s financial market resulting to efficient allocation of financial resources and is the key to economic growth. The efficient financial market itself needs to promote better practice of corporate governance, reinforcing market discipline for corporate managers. The global flow of capital enables corporate entities to tap sources of financing from a variety of investors. If developing countries intend to exploit the global capital markets as well as attract long-term capital, the countries must comply with the international corporate governance standards and guidelines. The level to which corporate entities apply basic principles for good corporate governance is a relevant factor for investment decisions as well. It is especially important when considering direct investments, which are beneficial to developing countries since they mean not only capital, but the transfer of skills, technology and professional know-how as well.

Although direct investors exercise a lot of control, they also pay considerable attention to the framework of corporate governance. They request adapting to the global standards (of transparency, accounting), in order not to be in an environment where local companies may externalize their costs by means of corruption and hidden government subsidies. Corporate governance is important for national development as it has a growing role in increasing the flow of financial capital to firms in developing economies. Equally important are the potential benefits of improved corporate governance for overcoming barriers to achieving sustained productivity growth, such as the actions of vested interest groups. Improved corporate governance, however, cannot be considered in isolation. In the financial sector, attention must also be given to measures to strengthen the banking sector, and a country’s financial institutions as a whole. In the “real” sector, close attention must be given to competition policy and sector-specific regulatory reform (OECD, 2009).

References

Addressing Indigenous People’s Rights in the Contexts of Foreign Investment Law in and amongst the EAC-P’Sates

Francis M. Magare

Abstract
While the concept of indigenous people is conflicted and generally not recognized in most states’ laws, the realization of the rights of this group of people, which is in realm of human rights law is mind-boggling. In the contexts of foreign investment law, the body of which consists of Bilateral Investment Treaties (BITs), Multilateral Treaties with Investment Provisions (TIPs), and Investment Related Instruments (IRIs), there is no direct mentioning of human rights generally and human rights of the indigenous people specifically. Realization of the human rights of this group of people in regards is by construction of the promissory clauses in the BITs or states obligations arising from the TIPs and IRIs. This is gelatinous, non-predictable and it results into non-inclusivity of Indigenous people and generally massive impacts on their human rights. This paper revisits the extents to which foreign investment law in East African Community (EAC) generally and amongst the EAC Partner States specifically, addresses the human rights of the indigenous people. Finding ultimate inconsistent bearings and addresses, the author recommends harmonious co-existence of foreign investment and human rights of indigenous people by encouraging purposive indigenous peoples’ human rights protection lenses in states’ regulatory spaces to meeting their obligations in the contexts of EAC laws.

Keywords: Rights of the Indigenous People, Foreign Investment Law, EAC-P’Sates

Introduction
Addressing indigenous people’s rights in the contexts of foreign investment law in and amongst the East African Community Partner States, (herein after EAC-P’Sates) is assessing the extents to which the EAC Community in its parent documents and policies mentions or addresses the questions of human rights of the indigenous people in one hand. On the other hand, how partner states, respectively in their constitutional laws do the same. It is a point blank, foreign investment and human rights law– to include, the human rights of the indigenous people, are subjects or subsets of international law. They share little in terms of the protection mandates and procedural for settlement of disputes, interests and policies. In fact, one of contentious areas in the dispensation of the protected rights and interests in international law contemporarily. In the vein, Indigenous peoples’ rights— this being in realm of human rights, stands mentioned among the risks of the foreign investment.

This paper and arguments thereof, comes in the midst of impecunious authorship in this area. The little works noted, for the purposes thereof is in three categories as herein explained:- Firstly, there are those


works, which generally argue for foreign investment and the rights of the indigenous people in biased scopes. In the ultimate, scholars in this category, among other things, suggest promotion of equilibrium between economic development and indigenous rights.28

Secondly, there are those works that addresses antagonism of interests in foreign investment and human rights, generally, in what case; the rights of the indigenous people are inclusive.29 Just like the former approach, these are also predominated by thrive to propose measures for attaining equilibrium of interest in international human rights and economic law30 and treatment of laws in uniformity.31

Finally, this paper acknowledges the magnanimity of the works that shoot questions on the relationship between foreign investment, human rights, as well as sustainable development. Very specifically in this category, Zarsky is illustrioulsy submitting towards mandatory balance of interests as a central principle of an investment regime, which aims to promote sustainable development.32 He thus advocate for a balance between private rights and public good; balance between investor rights and investor responsibilities; and balance in development strategies between promoting domestic producers and encouraging foreign investment. In the premises, despite variation of the outlook into relationship between foreign investment and human rights of the indigenous people, it is fairly and affirmative that both scholars are at some point agreeing on the interaction of the foreign investment and human rights of the indigenous people.

Although not going in the details of the foundation of this interaction, this paper attest to the need of addressing the human rights of the indigenous people in the contexts of the foreign investment law. This paper has major four sections preceding this introduction, namely, Section 2 that builds the contexts by conceptualizing indigenous people and show their distribution and situation against foreign investment in East Africa. Section 3 demonstrates the relationship between foreign investment and human rights of the indigenous people in an isomorphic relation, while section 4 devotes to discuss reality in EAC and P’Sates with conclusion and recommendation at the end.

The Concept, Distribution and Situation of Indigenous People in East Africa

Definition of Indigenous People
The concept of Indigenous People is conflicted. It ascends from various frameworks tending to define it with various criteria. In thee, the problem has always been with the use of the terms, “indigenous” and

---

30 Valadi, infra, Pg 35; see also ibid, Pp 886
31 P.M. Dupy, Pg 45
“people” that is to say, who is indigenous? In addition, the term “People” as opposed to population, tribal groups or societies. With the colonial fallacy, the concept “indigenous” referred to all Non-European natives in colonies, which is wrong perspective anyway. To the contrary, the argument is that “indigeneity” is a socially constructed and politically contingent concept. The details of this assertion come in with presence of a number of terms associated with indigeneity. These terms are such as “native” which refers to origin of an individual; the term “first nations” appearing from treaties especially on cases of intellectual property rights; the term “autochthonous peoples” a French term referring to the ones residing in the same place from time immemorial; the term “aboriginal” that has been employed mostly in Australia to deemphasize the condition of colonial-like dependence on a national state; and predominant term “indigenous,” a term commonly adopted in Anglo-Saxon literature bearing strong connotations of authenticity, belongingness and time-honoured prescriptive rights. 33

The use of the term people to suffix indigenous became debatable again. This found it roots from the fear of conflicting rights such as the right to self-determination if indigenous would decide to pursue their desire to exist as distinct population, deriving aspirations on the use of the term peoples. Of course, the use of the term “peoples” in international law attracts seriousness considerations; ipso facto “peoples” not only have the rights of an individual, such as civil and political rights, but also those of collective entities such as self-determination.34 For state adhesion principles and needs, indigenous peoples’ rights were a disgrace. In the end however, adoption of the term “indigenous people” took place in the year 2002 by a UN World Summit qualifying its’ use for the first time in a UN official document.35

Even though, defining indigenous people is still cumbersome. Both the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of the Indigenous (Indigenous Peoples’ Declaration) and the International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries (ILO Convention No. 169), which are closely relevant to indigenous people in international law, affords no comprehensive definition.36 Some of the furnished reasons are ranging from history to rejection of imposed definitions.37

34 The Utilization of the word people is predominantly in the Charter of the United Nations, the Covenant on civil and political rights, see article (1)(2) and common article 1, respectively
36 ibid
37 The absence of an authoritative definition of indigenous people in international law is reiterated in the UN, Indigenous Peoples and the United Nations Human Rights System, Fact Sheet No. 9/Rev.2, (New York: The Office of the High Commissioner of Human Rights, 2013) Para 2-3, also The Special Rapporteur to the U.N. on indigenous peoples, Erica-Irene Daes, is quoted to have stated that a definition of indigenous peoples was unnecessary because “historically, indigenous peoples have suffered, from definitions imposed by others” Indigenous representatives on several occasions have also expressed such a view before the UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations that “a definition of the concept of ‘indigenous people’ is not necessary or desirable,See also W. Chen, Indigenous Rights in International Law, Cher, 2014 DOI: 10.1093/academic/9780190846626.013.77
Taking a glimpse look in terms of the Indigenous Peoples’ Declaration, short of stating the right to belong to an indigenous community or nation in accordance with the traditions and customs of the community or nation concerned, and that, they have the right to determine their own identity no definition of indigenous people is afforded. The ILO Convention No. 169 on the other hand, while describing its scope, distinguishes between tribal people and indigenous peoples in a manner likely to define the term indigenous people. Taking the character of “pre-existence” and “continuity in the mode of life”, the convention defines indigenous people based on descent from the populations, which inhabited countries or a geographical region to which the country belongs. This is taking consideration of the time of conquest or colonization, or the establishment of present State boundaries. Above all, it retain the fact that indigenous people must irrespective of their legal status, retain some or all of their own social, economic, cultural and political institutions. This definition, taken strictly, it excludes the indigenous people in areas never colonized, which is again not comprehensive.

In the upshot, quite many frameworks propose what constitute the necessary and sufficient criteria that identify, or should identify indigenous peoples, and neither has proved universally, authoritatively and accepted definition. To mention a few, the special U.N. rapporteur Mr. Martinez Cobo frequently cited definition of “indigenous peoples”. Accordingly, it describes the constituents of what “indigenous populations are composed of. i.e. “the existing descendants of the peoples who inhabited the present territory of a country wholly or partially at the time when persons of a different culture or ethnic origin arrived there from other parts of the world, overcame them, by conquest, settlement or other means, reducing them to a non-dominant or colonial condition”. This definition freezes the identity of indigenous people in historical contexts, failing to appreciate the survival of the indigenous identity in the face of the adversity. Hence, the definition is applying to “only a limited group of indigenous peoples in Americas, Australasia and the Pacific”. The UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations expanded this definition. It added that the principle of self-identification, that is, “any individual who identified himself or herself” as indigenous and was acknowledged by the group or the community as one of its members, was to be regarded as an indigenous person. In general and in the view of the above, the definition of who are indigenous people lays on the broad criteria for identification of this group as laid by the United Nations Human Rights Council. The main ones are the criterion of self-identification and those proposed which include: Historical continuity with pre-invasion and/or pre-colonial societies that developed on their territories; Distinctiveness; Non-dominance; and a determination to preserve, develop and transmit to future generations their ancestral territories and identity as peoples in accordance with their own cultural patterns, social institutions and legal system. The United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Peoples Issues (UNPFII) has stressed, in

---

38 See, Declaration on the Rights of the Indigenous People in International Law, adopted by the United Nations General Assembly on 13 September 2007, articles, 9 and 33
39 See, The ILO Convention No.169, Article 3
40 E/CN.4/Sub.2/1986/Add.4
44 Ibid
addition to the above, the need for strong link to territories and surrounding natural resources; distinct social, economic, or political systems; and distinct language, culture and beliefs.\footnote{45 UN, \textit{Indigenous Peoples and the United Nations Human Rights System}, Fact Sheet No. 9/Rev.2, infra}


**Distribution and Situation of indigenous People in EAC**

As for distribution of indigenous people in East African Community, though, EAC region has a number of indigenous people there is no official data verification. Very few scattered data by the Indigenous Peoples of Africa Co-ordinating Committee (IPACC) and other organizations suggests that indigenous people in East Africa are hunter-gatherers as well as pastoralists.\footnote{48 The Indigenous Peoples of Africa Co-ordinating Committee founded in 1997. It is one of the main trans-national network organizations recognised as a representative of African indigenous peoples in dialogues with governments and bodies such as the UN, official Data available at, \url{https://www.ipacc.org.za/en/} Last accessed o 17.08.2019} Distribution of the hunter-gathers and some small fishing communities include the Hadzabe and Akiye of Tanzania, the Ogiek, Sengwer, Yaaku, Elmolo, Waata, and Aweer of Kenya and the Batwa, Benet, and Ik of Uganda. There is transhumant pastoralist peoples of the region including the Barbaig (and the wider Datoga), Baraguyu, Maasai, Samburu, Turkana, Rendille, Pokot, Borana, Endorois as well as the Basongora and the Karamojong of Uganda.\footnote{49 See generally the “Report of the African Commission’s Working Group of Experts in Indigenous Populations/Communities,” International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs and African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights (2005)},\footnote{50 See also “Research and Information Visit Report to Uganda,” International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs and African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights (2009), available at \url{http://www.achrpr.org/files/sessions/43rd/missionreports/uganda/missionreport_indig_uganda_2006.pdf}}\footnote{51 See also, “Research and Information Visit Report to the United Republic of Tanzania,” International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs and African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights (2015), \url{http://www.iwgia.org/iwgia_files_publications_files/0719_TANZANIA-ENGELSK.pdf}} In Rwanda and Burundi, it is the hunting-gathering Batwa while in South Sudan, the newest member of the East African community, indigenous people is Toposa and the Murle.
The situation of the indigenous people against foreign investment in regards is menacing. Following discovery of raw materials for extraction works in nearly all the countries of the region, possibility of more threats, coupled with improvement of infrastructure for the same is alarmingly high.  

There are reported cases of this. In Kenya for instance, discovery of oil in areas belonging to the Turkana Indigenous pastoralists and the best locations for wind power in the country, resulted into eviction of indigenous. The same is true with biogas. In Tanzania, home of the unique Tanzanite in Simanjiro District situated in the home to the Maasai.

In addition, the eviction of the Parakuyio (Baraguyu) Maasai of Morogoro from the lands they occupied for close to one hundred years to give way for sugarcane production from the corridor of the Kilombero Valley. The violent eviction of the Maasai of Ngorongoro and violation of their rights many times in order to provide space for a hunting concession for the royal family of the United Arab Emirates. The removal of Barbaig pastoralists of Tanzania in a similar vein, from their ancestral territory to make room for wheat production sponsored by Canada is few of many examples. In Uganda, indigenous pastoralists, such as the Karamojong and Basongora, are reported “abandoned” in the isolated parts of the country, with their rights to development being denied.

The wishes of states are to implement projects that benefit broad national interests. For Indigenous Peoples, however, with their specific experiences of exclusion and marginalization, prefer projects that do not exacerbate their already precarious situation. In the process, Indigenous Peoples of EAC, just like in any part of the world, are perceived as somewhat resisting development and, in doing so, are perceived as denying their respective countries a chance to achieve development visions or to emerge into middle-income economies. While many of the projects are in their initial and middle stages of prospecting, so far they have led to evictions and maltreatment of Indigenous Peoples in the areas concerned. Some people suffered physical attacks, including burning of their houses to the ground along with all their property.


51 See for example the Ngong Hills and Kipeto wind power projects as well as other wind energy projects of Olkaria, Longonot (Loonong’ot) and Suswa geothermal sites on the Great Rift Valley. All of these are located in Narok and Laikipia counties, which are ancestral territories of the Maasai people. The Lake Turkana Wind Power and geothermal sites in Turkana, Rendille, Borana and Samburu respectively are in ancestral territories of Indigenous Peoples going by those names; the Bogoria- Silali site is in the ancestral area of the Endorois and many others


A common storyline in Tanzania lest to acknowledge has always been that the Indigenous Peoples are disparaging to the environment and that they cause conflict even in cases where this is not the case. Hence, their eviction is justified along the lane from environments they created and nurtured for decades, which is very wrong in the contexts of the human rights of the indigenous people. Given the abstracts, distribution and situation of the indigenous people in east Africa, the next section revisits how foreign investment law relates with human rights of the indigenous people in isomorphic kind of relation.

The Human Rights of the Indigenous People & Foreign Investment: The Isomorphic Relations

The rights of the indigenous people are such the right to self-determination and its analogous rights. To wit, the latter includes such rights as the right to non-discrimination, respect to cultural integrity, right to land and natural resources, Right to social welfare development, and right to self-government. Generally, these rights are necessary in realization of the right to self-determination of the indigenous people. How these rights are address in the contexts of foreign investment is isomorphic. This section considers this relationship in detail, i.e. indigenous right vis-à-vis the foreign investment address on the same.

The Right to Self Determination

The right or norm of self-determination reckoned a predominant norm of international law character. The Charter of the United Nations and a myriad of International and Regional Human Rights Instruments affirm this right. In the contexts of indigenous people position, both the UNDRIP and ILO convention No. 169 specifically acknowledges the right to self-determination. Accordingly, indigenous people have rights to participation and in decision in all affairs affecting their lives, to have some forms of autonomy or self-government without compromising the existence of states, and without their assimilation by the existences of the states.

See also Feminist Activist Coalition (FemAct), www.tgnp.org, and Pastoralist Forum Press Release about gross violations of human rights and citizenship rights in Ngorongoro District (TZ) carried out on behalf of the private investor ORTELLO Business Corporation (OBC): http://www.theecologist.org/News/news_analysis/2771261/tanzania_breaks.promise.thousands.of.maasai._evicted_to_make.way.for.lion.hunt.html (last accessed on 19.08.2019)

58 ibid
60 See, respectively, the Declaration on the Rights of the Indigenous People, article 4 and ILO Convention No. 169, infra, article 1(3), article 6 and 7(1)
Associating self-determination with foreign investment ventures in this context, focus is on the process of negotiating and finally striking off the international investment agreements, which is usually taken care by the parental states. The right to self-determination ensues in the requirement that indigenous people are informed prior to the process and their consent to the ventures be sought free and whenever the investment ventures needs some adjustment or relocation, such to take place upon reasonable time and notice, in other words, the principle of free prior informed consent (herein referred as to FPIC).

The principle of FPIC is developing into a framework currently falls short of being an international legal principle. Accordingly, indigenous’ consent must be sought prior to access to the traditional lands, innovations and practices. Similarly, States are at a duty to ensure that they take no decisions directly relating to indigenous peoples’ rights and interests without seeking the consent of the later. Away from merely advocacy in legal instruments in the regards, the courts of law in human rights realm, which is so connected with this area, is characterized with two approaches of this aspect, namely, the interpretation of the obligation to “consultation” or “discussion” against the need that indigenous population give their consent to the investment ventures in their lands.

In the matter of Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v Ecuador, which is a latest decision, the inter-American Court of Human rights (IACtHR) court referring to its comments in the Saramaka decision in no isolation, observed that indigenous needed to “consent” if not having been consulted. In this case, the court changed the language of practice from that of “consultation” to that of consent. The IACtHR stated that the “right to consultation is a fundamental guarantee of indigenous participation in a pluralistic, multicultural, and democratic society, and is based on the right to cultural identity.” On this basis, “the obligation to consult, in addition to being a treaty-based provision, is also a general principle of international law.”

In another instance, the African Commission on Human and Peoples’ earlier than the Kichwa Indigenous case, with its judgment in the Endorois case referring to the Saramaka decision. The Commission emphasized that a duty exist to actively consult with the community according to their customs, to ensure effective participation in development or investment plans within the community’s territory. It specifically

---

61 Ibid, article 10, 11(2) 19, 28(1), 29(2)
63 See generally, the Saramaka People v Suriname, 2007, Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v Ecuador 2012, and the Endorois 2010 cases.
64 Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v Ecuador, Merits and reparations, Inter-American Court of Human Rights Series C No 245, 27 June 2012, [159]-[160]
65 ibid
67 Fully cited as the Centre for Minority Rights Development (’CEMIRIDE’) (Kenya) and Minority Rights Group International on Behalf of Endorois Welfare Council v Kenya (Endorois Case), African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights 142 ILR 1 (4 February 2010).
68 ibid
requires “States to both accept and disseminate information, and entails constant communication between the parties. These consultations must be in good faith, through culturally appropriate procedures and with the objective of reaching an agreement”. The Commission concluded that the state had a duty to not only consult but also to obtain free, prior, and informed consent where any development or investment project would have a major impact within the Endorois community’s territory.

In practice, the reflection of this trend is taking the cognizance of the World Bank (WB) advocacy on this aspect with its guidelines. In addition, the utilization of the banking principle “the equator principle” containing FPIC requirements to do away with any risks in investment ventures in the lands occupied with the indigenous people and therefore assures the indigenous participation in the process. Many advocates and case laws accepts that participatory rights under the FPIC gives the birth to right to consultation in good faith whose object is to obtain the consent of the indigenous people, so as to mitigate the risks such as resistances if the consent is not given or cannot be given.

Non-discrimination: A shared Norm with Opposite Implications

The norm of non-discrimination on indigenous people is currently addressed in the contexts of the ILO Convention No. 169 and UNDRIP. Accordingly, the government takes affirmative obligations to eliminate all the incidents and legacies of discrimination against the indigenous people and all aspects of their good identity. Additionally, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) in the same contexts, requires states to eradicate racial discrimination by "all appropriate means”, and considers "special measures" aimed at particular groups to be momentary and "not to lead to the maintenance of separate rights for different racial groups.” To the realization of the position of the indigenous people against foreign investment specifically, the principle of non-discrimination, for argument saves a dual role. That is as against the investors and the host states. As against the host states, non-discrimination is enrooted into the need to recognition and protection of the communal or traditionally owned or used lands and other properties. It is thus a requirement that FPIC need to be conducted with the Indigenous people. It also goes that whenever indigenous people are deprived of their properties without administration of FPIC, states are at duty to redress the situation by returning it to them. In this context,

---

69 In this regards J. Franco, ‘Reclaiming Free Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) in the context of global land grabs’ (Transnational Institute for Hands on the Land Alliance 2014) pg 13
73 ILO Convention No. 169, Op cit, article 3(1)
74 UNDRIP, preamble read together with article 46(3)
75 See, Convention on Elimination of All Racial Discrimination, at article. 2(1)
76 General Recommendations, 23 UNDOC, CERD, C-1/55/,isc. 3, paragraph 3
the inter-American Court on human rights in *Saramaka People v. Suriname* accepted that deprivation of indigenous property and cultural identity constitutes discrimination that need to be condemned in the strongest possible terms.

Both UNDRIP and ILO Convention No.169 in the same ends requires states to do away with discrimination by engaging on effective consultation by the indigenous people before embarking on the measures that would deprive their enjoyment of the rights to land and territories in favour of foreign investors. The UN Special Rapporteur on Indigenous Peoples’ Rights has found that “FPIC is essential for the protection of human rights of indigenous peoples”. The same is approved by the UN General Assembly *vide* the Resolution of the World Conference on the rights of the indigenous people of 22 September 2014.

Against the investors, the norm of non-discrimination is considered into two levels, substantively and procedurally, as the law applicable in investment dispute settlement. While the former is reflective and considerate of the fact, that foreign investment has not always gathered praise and concern about their role in human rights. Therefore, Its role in the rights of the indigenous people in this regard is in the contexts of the co-operate social responsibility with endurance to apply the human rights obligations of the investors. It is settled at the moral level, that multinational enterprises (MNEs), most of which engages in foreign investment should observe fundamental human right standards. This can be supported by the need to protection from assaults of human dignity, regardless of whether their perpetrators are state or non-state actors. Even though, the legal responsibility of MNEs remains uncertain so far to large extents. A fair number of international human rights legal instruments imposes only voluntary obligation to MNEs or soft law in nature as opposed to states, whose obligations are negative. Even though, under customary international law, emerging practice and expert opinion increasingly suggest that corporations may be held liable for committing, or for complicity in, the most odious human rights violations. In the hint, non-discrimination being one of the human rights norms, enchains the investors to observe against the indigenous in the running of their investment ventures, whenever circumstances allows, employ and work with the indigenous communities in the ventures as part of operations requirements.

The later depends on the choice of law clause as inscribed by the parties in their respective IIA. It is not impossible IIA to contain human rights provisions, but this would be quite exceptional, of course looking at

---

78 See respectively, articles 10, 19, 29(2), 32(2) and article 16
84 Ruggie, supra, note 126 at para 61
the choice of law clause of the BIT. In the absence of specific human rights norms in BIT and given the parties’ freedom to select the applicable law, human rights provisions are applicable to the extent to which they are included in the parties’ choice of law.

In fact, certain IIA provides the applicability of international law. The same being too generic, the report of the WB Executive Directors specifies that ‘the term international law’ as used in this context should be understood in the sense given to it by the Statue of the International Court of Justice, allowance being made for the fact that this provision was designed to apply to inter-State disputes. Thus, relevant human rights rules are pertinent in investment ventures based on these instruments’ choice of law clause, as international law. At the level of analysis, taking various view points of international law, in totality one can draw an inference for purposes of non-discrimination, that there is mandatory obligation on the part of the both host states and the investors. In the former, this obligation ensues in the requirement of the FPIC before investment ventures actually pushes through in the areas occupied by the indigenous populations. The indigenous consent must be sought indiscriminately. The Administration of the consent must follow all indigenous traditional means of representation and decision-making with no discrimination. The Convention on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination and the recent decisions of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights and the African Commission of Human Rights, provide solid support for such conclusions. On the other hand, non-discrimination as an obligation on the part of the investors is generally in the realm of the obligation to observe human rights and fundamental freedoms on the part of the investors. Against this, non-discrimination is envisaged against the investors to ensure the indigenous enjoys all the fruits of their lands in the realm of international cooperate social responsibility and generally as applicable law in dispute settlement.

The Respect of Indigenous Cultural Integrity

In the realm of self-determination, the norm of respect of cultural integrity upholds for the indigenous people, all possibilities to freely develop, and maintain their cultural identities in coexistence with the other sectors of humanity. With the foreign investment in the contexts of this paper, investment ventures need to consider the rights and the position of the indigenous in all complexities and simplicities. Affirmed in the 1992 United Nations Declaration on the rights of the persons belong to National, Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities, the 1966 UNESCO Declaration of the Principles of International Cultural

---

86 Article 38(1) of the Statute of the ICJ
87 See Report of the Executive Director on the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of other States, 1 ICSID Reports 31, Para 40
88 For inclusion of human rights in IIAs, see, Article 1131 of the NAFTA determines that ‘[a] tribunal established under this Section shall decide the issues in dispute in accordance with this Agreement and applicable rules of international law’; Furthermore, the ECT disposes that ‘[a] tribunal . . . shall decide the issues in dispute in accordance with this Treaty and applicable rules and principles of international law’; Article 42(1) of the ICSID Convention establishes that in the absence of an agreement of the parties on the applicable law, ‘the Tribunal shall apply the law of the Contracting State party to the dispute
Cooperation,\textsuperscript{90} the ICCPR and United Nations Charter, the right to cultural integrity stems from minority rights as opposed to the rights of the indigenous people. Of course, it is fairly in authorship and jurisprudence that international law in regards, maintain that indigenous people and minorities are compromising distinct, but with overlapping categories of rights subject to common normative considerations.\textsuperscript{91}

In a very sharp contrast to note, the Cultural integrity of the indigenous people is thus in basis of the provisions of article 27 of the ICCPR. Both United Nations Human Rights Committee and the Inter-American Commission of Human Rights have hold that this norm cover all aspects of the indigenous people’s survival as a distinct culture, understanding of the culture to include economic or political institutions, land use patterns as well as language and religious practices.\textsuperscript{92} At the level of analysis again, while cultural integrity applies to all fragments of humanity, the norm has developed remedial aspects particularly to the indigenous people in the light of their historical and continuing vulnerability. The cultural integrity norm entitles indigenous groups to affirmative measures to remedy the past injustices against their cultural survival and to guard against continuing threats in this regard. ILO Convention No. 169 provides an imperative language the government undertaking of the responsibility for developing in association with the indigenous people a coordinated and systematic action to protect the rights of these and to provide them with the guarantee to respect their integrity.\textsuperscript{93} Any foreign investment ventures need not to be compromising the cultures of the indigenous people. It is in this regard, submission is that in observing the human rights standards as noted herein, in formation of investment contracts or during the subsistence of the investment ventures, party’s observer with kin the integrity of the indigenous cultures. At what point of time, relevantly remains the matter to be consider at the onset of the venture and at the running of the investment activities, including relocations, at prompt compensations of course.

Right to Land and Natural Resources

Very essential to indigenous, right to land, territories and natural resources, lays the common denominator, i.e. the protection of property rights as cardinal principle in the international human rights legal framework. This affirms the categorical provision common to the international human rights covenants for economic social and cultural rights (ICESCR) and that for civil and political rights that (ICCPR) that “in no

\textsuperscript{90} Declaration of the Principles of International Cultural Cooperation, proclaimed by the general conference of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization at its 14th session, Nov. 4, 1966, art. 1, reprinted in \textit{U.N. Compilation of Instruments, infra}, vol. 1, pt. 2 at 591


\textsuperscript{93} See, ILO Convention No. 169, \textit{infra}, article 2(1)
circumstance a person may be deprived of his means of subsistence” that of course contextualizes the provisions of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights on the other hand. The notion of property includes the view that human beings have rights to lands and chattels that by some measure of legitimacy have reduced to their own control.

Contextually, both the ILO Convention No. 169 with the counterpart the UNDRIP respectively evidences this position. Accordingly, the concept of indigenous territories is embraced and it includes within it, the coverage of the areas, which the peoples concerned, occupy or otherwise use. Therefore, Indigenous land and resource or territorial rights are of a collective character, and they include a combination of possessory, use, and management rights. For example, the ILO convention No. 169 affirms in with imperative term “shall” on the obligations of the States in appropriate cases to safeguard the right of the peoples concerned to use lands not exclusively occupied by them, but to which they have traditionally had access for their subsistence and traditional activities. It further requires state parties to safeguard the indigenous peoples’ right to the natural resources throughout their territories, inclusive of right to participate in use, management, and conservation of the resources. In realizing this norm, it is a principle that indigenous people need not to be denied the right to surface and mineral rights in the event such right is provided to the landowners. In the case, the convention mandates that indigenous peoples are to have a say in any resource exploration or extraction on their lands and to benefit from those activities.

Moreover, it is a principle that indigenous peoples need not to be removed from the lands, which they occupy unless under the prescribed conditions, and where it is necessary as an "exceptional measure. Whenever the grounds for relocation no longer exist, it is further that they "must be accorded with the right animus revitendi to their traditional lands" and whenever such is not possible then they must be provided in all possible cases, with lands of quality and legal status at least equal to that of the lands previously occupied by them." In this hint, these instruments, the Convention No. 169 and the Declaration on the Rights of the Rights of the Ingenious People, affirms the notion promoted by the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights and the U.N. Human Rights Committee. Accordingly, indigenous peoples as groups are entitled to a

94 See, common article 1(2) to the ICCPR and ICSER
95 UDHR, article 17
97 See, ILO Convention No. 169, article 11, 12, 13, 14 to 17 the rights of ownership and possession of [indigenous peoples] over the lands, which they traditionally occupy, is imperatively recognized and guaranteed
98 UNDRIP, articles 8(2)(b), 10, 25 and 26 “Indigenous peoples right to maintain and strengthen their distinctive spiritual relationship with their traditionally owned or otherwise occupied lands, territories, waters and coastal seas and other resources and to uphold their responsibilities to future generations in this regard”
100 ILO convention, article 14(2)
101 Ibid, article 13(2)
103 UNDRIP, article 15(3)
continuing relationship with lands and natural resources according to traditional patterns of use or occupancy in a continuous manner.\textsuperscript{104}

At the level of analysis, in the light of the acknowledged inert position of land and resources to indigenous cultures and economies, the condition to supply significant redress for indigenous land claims implies an obligation on the part of states. The afforded remedies include the option for indigenous peoples to regain their lands and access to natural resources.\textsuperscript{105} At the ultimate, the acceptance of indigenous land rights is evident in multiple instruments proving consistently the state practices sufficient to render it part of customary international law. For instance, in Chapter 26 of Agenda 21 adopted by U.N. Conference on Environment and Development,\textsuperscript{106} and the World Bank's Operational Directive for bank-funded projects affecting indigenous peoples by establishing recognition of customary or traditional indigenous land tenure systems as a premise of bank-assisted projects.\textsuperscript{107} As against the international investment establishments, lays the principle that imposing the need to conduct FPIC and other remedial measures available including relocation.\textsuperscript{108}

\textbf{Social Welfare and Development}

Just like the indigenous people’s interest to secure land and natural resources being both cultural and economic right. In its association lays, the right to social welfare and development. Pursuant to mission of the United Nations to "International Economic and Social Co-Operation"\textsuperscript{109} and both ICCPR and ICESCR affirmation of the right to social welfare rights of “everyone” with the respective state obligations to reach them.\textsuperscript{110} The right to development extends to indigenous people, linking the rights to social welfare cardinal to the ICESCR\textsuperscript{111} and in fact, the United Nations General Assembly resolution in regards.\textsuperscript{112} The UNDRIP defines the right to development as “an inalienable human right by virtue of which every human person and all peoples are entitled to participate in, contribute to, and enjoy economic, social, cultural, and political development, in which all human rights and fundamental freedoms can be fully realized.”\textsuperscript{113} States are obliged to realize the right to development \textit{vides} international and domestic initiated programs and associations.\textsuperscript{114} Contained by the framework of the foregoing principles, a special rubric of rights and analogous duties has developed with regard to indigenous peoples.\textsuperscript{115} Responding to these phenomena the

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{104} Anaya, pg 106
\bibitem{106} Chapter 26 recognizes indigenous peoples’ "historical relationship with their lands," Agenda 21, infra at Para. 26.1, and prescribes a number of measures to protect and strengthen that relationship, \textit{ibid.} Paras. 26.1, 26.3, 26.4
\bibitem{108} D. G. Newman, supra note, 94, Pg 134
\bibitem{109} See, entirely Chapter IX notably article 55.
\bibitem{110} See for example, the ICSECR, \textit{op cit} article. 6(1) (regarding the "right to work, which includes the right of everyone to the opportunity to gain his living by work which he freely chooses or accepts")
\bibitem{113} ibid, article 1(1)
\bibitem{114} ibid, articles 2 -8 and 10
\bibitem{115} Anaya, pg 106
\end{thebibliography}
ILO convention 169 established as a matter of priority "the need for improvement of the conditions of life and work and levels of health and education of [indigenous] peoples," and it mandates "special projects to promote such improvement." Both the convention and the declaration, furthermore, specifies duties on the part of states to ensure the absence of discriminatory practices and effects in areas of employment, vocational training, social security and health, education, and means of communication. The convention emphasizes, in accordance with core precepts of self-determination, that the special programs devised to ensure the social welfare and development of indigenous peoples are to in cooperation with the indigenous peoples concerned. At the level of analysis, one note a consensus in the provisions of the Convention No. 169 and the Declaration on the Rights of the Indigenous people’s rights and this co-relate with the general need for the FPIC against investment ventures.

**The Right to Self-Government**

The notion of Self-government is a controversial political aspect surrounding self-determination debate by the indigenous people in international law. The position of the foreign investment and indigenous people in association to this touches the need for FPIC has two aspects. One is the aspect of political integration in which the modern precepts of democracy is build in the idea that “decisions made at the most local level possible to national levels”. The second conception is on a premise that major development embrace on notions of cultural pluralism identified earlier and the consent or consultations of the interests affected person’s pushes through instantly. Against the indigenous peoples, the notions of democracy, which involves the decentralized government among other issues and of cultural integrity, unite to create a unique self-government norm. The norm upholds spheres of governmental or administrative autonomy for indigenous communities, while seeking to ensure the effective participation of those communities in all decisions affecting them appropriately to the larger institutions of government. In the vein, to accommodate the precepts of self-determination, any reductions in the authority or alterations of de facto or de jure indigenous institutions of autonomous governance are bound not take place until and unless the indigenous people are consulted prior and freely.

The ILO Convention No. 169 in the regard upholds the right of indigenous peoples to "retain their own customs and institutions;" and requires that "the methods customarily practiced by the peoples concerned for dealing with offences committed by their members shall be respected." Similarly, U.N. declaration on the rights of the indigenous people also confirms the "Indigenous peoples right to promote, develop and maintain their institutional structures and their distinctive customs, spirituality, traditions, procedures, practices and, in the cases where they exist, juridical systems or customs, in accordance with international human rights standards."

---

116 See, ILO Convention No. 169, op cit, article 7(2), similar is reiterated in UNDRIP, see article 21(1)
117 See, respectively articles 20-23 of the Convention and article 21(2) of the Declaration, ibid.
118 ibid article 20(1)("special measures" regarding conditions of employment are to be adopted "in co-operation with the peoples concerned."); also Declaration in article 20(2)
119 Anaya, pg 107
120 ibid
121 Ibid.
122 ILO Convention No. 169, supra, article 8(2)
123 Ibid, article 8
124 See, UNDRIP, op cit, at article 34
In the view of these provisions, regardless of the level indigenous peoples have managed to be autonomous in law and policies, they are by large extents at liberty to develop autonomous governance relevantly to their circumstances and on grounds instrumental to securing sustainable self-determination. In regards, self-government for the indigenous people is instrumental to their capacities to control the development of their distinctive cultures, including their use of land and resources. It is furthermore unspoken means of enhancing democracy. Now, because of their non-dominant positions within the states, to devolve governmental authority onto indigenous communities is to diminish their vulnerability in the face of powerful majority or elite interests and to enhance the responsiveness of government to the unique interests of indigenous communities and their members. In regards again, the declaration on the right of the indigenous people makes it clear that: “Indigenous peoples have the right to autonomy or self-government in matters relating to their internal and local affairs, as well as ways and means for financing their autonomous functions” This provisions corroborates the similar provision in the U.N. Draft declaration, which in elaborate manner did mention specific internal and local affairs that indigenous may exercise their powers vis, culture, religion, education, information, media, health, housing, employment, social welfare, economic activities, land and resources management, environment and entry by non-members.

A fair good number of states despite the difficulty in accepting this formulation of the right to autonomy on the part of the indigenous people have articulated agreement that indigenous peoples are entitled to maintain and develop their traditional institutions and to otherwise enjoy autonomous spheres of governmental or administrative authority appropriate to their circumstances. This is a true manifestation of the growing harmony of global opinion and anticipation in this regard. Whilst the norm of self-government sustains in the spirit toward the development of autonomous institutions and effective participation in the larger political order by the indigenous people, the draft U.N. declaration affirmed devastatingly "indigenous peoples’ right to participate fully, if they so choose, at all levels of decision-making, which may affect their rights. This is similarly reflected in the contexts of both the ILO Convention No. 169 and the UNDRIP.

At the level of analysis, just like other norms explaining self-determination as against international investment, self-government for indigenous peoples is characteristically reputable in the consensual growth of a nuanced political order that accommodates both inward and outward-looking associational patterns of indigenous people within their states insitu. International law neither requires nor allows for any one particular form of structural accommodation for all indigenous peoples indeed, the very fact of the diversity of indigenous cultures and their surrounding circumstances belies a singular formula. The underlying

125 Dussias, supra note, 91
126 ibid
127 Anaya, pg 110
128 See, UNDRIP, infra, at article 4
129 Draft United Nations Declaration, supra, article 33
130 See for example, the UN Human Rights Council, Progress report on the study on indigenous peoples and the right to participate in decision-making, Report of the Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, A/HRC/EMRIP/2010/2. See also, the Nicaraguan government entered into negotiations with Indian leaders and eventually developed a constitutional and legislative regime of political and administrative autonomy for the Indian-populated region, O.A.S. Doc. OEA/Ser.L/V/II.62, doc. 10 rev. 3 (1983), at para 96
132 Draft United Nations Declaration, op cit article. 19.
133 See, respectively ILO Convention No. 169, article 6(1)(b) and UNDRIP, article 18

425
objective of the self-government norm, however, is that of allowing indigenous peoples to achieve meaningful self-government through political institutions that reflect their specific cultural patterns and that permit them to be genuinely associated with all decisions affecting them on a continuous basis. Constitutive self-determination, furthermore, requires that such political institutions in no case be imposed upon indigenous peoples but rather be the outcome of procedures that defer to their preferences among justifiable options. In both ends, it lays in the need to conduct FPIC against any investment ventures. These settings lead us to find the contexts of EAC adherence of rights of the indigenous people. Hence the second section, i.e. indigenous people’s rights in the contexts of EAC and P’states.

**Indigenous Peoples’ Rights in the Contexts: The findings**

**In the Level of EAC**

Just like elsewhere in the world, the Treaty establishing the EAC\(^{134}\) and the EAC modal law on Investment\(^{135}\) are quite relevantly here. While the former stands the constitution of the EAC, the later is specific instrument for foreign investment, recently adopted by the community, pursuant to directives of the Sectoral Council on Trade, Industry, Finance and Investment. In its introductory remarks that I wish to reiterate *verbatim*, the Modal law draws from the approaches set out in the 2012 Model Bilateral Investment Treaty Template of the Southern African Development Community (the SADC Model BIT), the COMESA Common Investment Area Agreement and the Model Text for the Indian Bilateral Investment Treaty (Indian Model BIT). It also has inputs from the International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD).\(^{136}\)

Starting with the treaty establishing the EAC, it makes adherence with human rights one of the conditions for state’s acceptance into EAC membership.\(^{137}\) The EACJ one of the principle organ of the EAC, have original jurisdiction on human rights.\(^{138}\) In the matter of *Ololosokwan Village Council, Oloirien Village Council, Kirtalo Village Council, Arash Village Council v. The Attorney General of the United Republic of Tanzania*,\(^{139}\) as one occasion relevant to note, the EACJ issued an injunctive order against the United Republic of Tanzania from evicting from their land in favour of an investor, the Maasai indigenous, pending determination of the main case. Of course, the court has dismissed this matter on what appeared to be technical ground. The Applicants (indigenous) produced neither witness before the court given ample time nor had furnished sufficient reasons for not doing the same.\(^{140}\) Whether Tanzania’s state will embark on the original cause to evict is quite not certain. More so, issues of human rights are one of the areas of cooperation between partner states.\(^{141}\) On address of human rights of the indigenous people in the contexts of foreign investment, apart from mentioning human rights in state obligations just as the usual drift elsewhere, the

---

\(^{134}\) As amended on 14\(^{th}\) December 2006 and 20\(^{th}\) August 2007

\(^{135}\) Adopted EAC Model Investment Treaty February, 2016

\(^{136}\) See, the EAC Model Investment Treaty, ibid

\(^{137}\) See, ibid, article 3(3) (b) “The Partner States undertake to abide by the principles of good governance, including adherence to the principles of democracy, the rule of law, social justice and the maintenance of universally accepted standards of human rights”

\(^{138}\) See, ibid, article 7(2) and article 27(2)

\(^{139}\) Reference No. 10 of 2017

\(^{140}\) See, the first instance judgment dated 6\(^{th}\) March 2019, Para 5

\(^{141}\) See, ibid, article 123(3) (d)
EAC treaty does not mention indigenous people rights specifically. Neither does it mention the aspects of self-determination and its supportive rights and FPIC.

On the other hand, the EAC model law specifically mentions important contribution investment have on sustainable development of partner states in among other things–human rights “particularly in light of EAC Partner States” commitments to international conventions”. More so, this law make provisions for compliance with domestic law by investor.\(^{142}\) This law also retains the host state’s regulatory space.\(^{143}\) According to the commentary, this article reinforces that the treaty ‘does not change the states’ right to regulate, in ‘public interest’. In a way relevant to the contexts, states have right to pursue development goals, take measures necessary to address historically based economic disparities suffered by identifiable “ethnic or cultural groups” due to discriminatory or oppressive measures against such groups prior to the signing of this Treaty.\(^{144}\) In addition, inessential to the law governing disputes settlements, say it otherwise the promissory clause, the EAC modal takes the open-ended drift of international law.\(^{145}\) According to the commentary, this article intends to enable a broader interpretation and application of the treaty to prevent tribunals from focusing on investment protection provisions only while precluding the addition of obligations from other parts of international law, where “expressly” stated.\(^{146}\)

At the level of analysis, against the EAC modal Investment Treaty’s address of human rights of indigenous people, it also takes the usual drift of constructions of promissory clause, i.e. application of international law in disputes settlement and retention of host state regulatory space. Even though, it is merely a template for investment negotiations of the EAC and/or individual EAC Partner States with third countries or a Bloc of countries. It does not have any binding force in regards, something reducing it as good or best as a well wish.

**Indigenous Peoples’ Rights Address in EAC Partner States**

In the contexts of the EAC Partner States formed of Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, South Sudan, United Republic of Tanzania, and Uganda. The address of the indigenous people’s rights from the EAC treaty provisions is in line with the human rights obligations of respective member States. Across the provisions of statutory laws on foreign investment of these states, it is taking the usual drift of exclusion of human right issues on foreign investment. The framework provisions of these laws have no mentioning of human rights generally and rights of indigenous people. The translation of human rights and rights of the indigenous people is reflective of their constitutional setups for available provisions relevant for human rights of indigenous people.

Citing Burundi and Rwanda in first instance, the constitutional dispensations have no mentioning of indigenous people as such. One can associate the experience of ethnic cleansing and genocide, which plunged these states with this. In Burundi, the constitution is in reaffirmation of national unity and reconciliation following the Arusha Accord. The indigenous Batwa, have been in struggle for their rights to

\(^{142}\) See, EAC Model Law on Investment, article 10
\(^{143}\) Ibid, article 15
\(^{144}\) Ibid, article 16(2) and (3)
\(^{145}\) Ibid, article 25(1)
\(^{146}\) Ibid, article 25(2)
land. The case available in the behalf, MRG and UNIPROBA (on behalf of the Bahakwaninda family) v Burundi\(^{147}\), though not directly associated with foreign investment. The case surrounds some interests of the indigenous Batwa over their land. i.e. the decision of the local Burundi court that granted the Batwa rights to access and ownership over the land in dispute has never been enforced, and the community remains deprived of access to their land. In 2005, in violation of usual court procedure, it re-opened by the judiciary on request of the majority community, and eventually decided against the Batwa, in clear violation of national and international law. This case is pending in the African Commission on Human rights. The general comment from thee is that of Burundi’s international human rights obligation other than foreign investment.

Very similarly, in the contexts of protecting the Batwa indigenous people in Rwanda, the constitutional dispensation reaffirms state adhesion following ethnic strife and the experience of genocide. The Rwandan government enacted the Law Number 47/2001 on Prevention, Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Discrimination and Sectarianism, This law is bans identification by ethnicity.\(^{148}\) There is no manifestation of Indigenous peoples’ rights pursuant to the dictates of human rights. It transcends to foreign investment. Of course, this is not withstanding the fact that Republic of Rwanda has made great strides in creating promoting equality among all people in its human rights obligation.\(^{149}\) It is in records, the government has taken action in the fields of education, health and housing in favour of the Batwa.\(^{150}\) However, many of the issues faced by the Batwa people surround the government’s stance on not recognizing the Twa as an Indigenous people despite several calls in regards.\(^{151}\) In the upshot, the address of the indigenous peoples’ rights in the contexts of foreign investment is reasonably almost impossible.

Taking South Sudan and Uganda in this second instance, both tends to have specific provisions mentioning indigenous people as opposed the Rwanda and Burundi of the first instance. Both the states are not parties to the ILO Convention No.169. In South Sudan a newly member of the EAC, the situation of the indigenous people, takes an important bearing, first makes all indigenous languages of South Sudan as national languages, which need to be developed and promoted. Secondly, the all levels of government are mandate to facilitate and ensure development of indigenous as one of the economic objective of the state.\(^{152}\) This is along fundamental equality of human being as guaranteed in the Constitution. Just like the usual drift, foreign investment address of the indigenous people is not as clear but can form by construction.\(^{153}\)

In Uganda, the constitution refers indigenous people among qualified persons for citizenship by birth. They form component of the regional Assemblies. However, the state of indigenous human rights in lights of the


\(^{148}\) It is a criminal offence in Rwanda to manifest as member of indigenous community


\(^{151}\) See, ibid at pg 2, the citation of Many groups, conventions and previous UPR reports have called for the government of Rwanda to recognize the Twa as an Indigenous people

\(^{152}\) See, the Transitional Constitution of the Republic of South Sudan, 2011 respectively, article 6 and 37(2)(c)

\(^{153}\) ibid
UNDRIP is full of violation of rights. The two Indigenous groups currently facing the most pressing issues are the Batwa and the Karamojong. The Batwa have been struggling with forced eviction from lands for quite a long time. There has been a violation of the community’s FPIC regarding mining in the Karamajong. In one study carried out by Human Rights Watch sometimes found that companies exploiting minerals on lands owned and occupied by Karamoja’s Indigenous People are violating land rights established in the UNDRIP. It is noting substantively that the government of Uganda allowed concessions to mining companies, such as East African Mining, Indian Jewelry Company, Jan Mangal, and DAO, a Saudi/Kuwaiti construction firm, without the consent of the Indigenous Peoples in the area. Worse scenario in the contexts is that in administration of both, no FPIC of the indigenous.

Lastly, Kenya and Tanzania United Republics’ aligning with cultural survival observations on the State of Indigenous Human is alarming. In Kenya for instance, there is no specific legislation on indigenous people and she has yet to endorse the UNDRIP and the ILO Convention 169. The principle of Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) remains one that Indigenous Peoples in Kenya are advocating. Forceful evictions from lands and territories are in order of the day. For example on a report by cultural survival of the year 2016, notes eviction of Maasai from rift valley and Naivasha with neither alternative shelters nor compensation. All these are happening despite clear and multiple Constitutional mentioning of the indigenous people and commitment to have investment legislation that is favourable to local communities. In the ends, Kenya is cited among the cases that indigenous have challenged the government acts internationally for failure on the part of the state to FPIC on the Endorois (cited above) indigenous community. The African Commission on Human rights ordered Kenya to restore the Endorois to their historic land and to compensate them. It is the first ruling to determine who indigenous peoples in Africa are, and what their rights to land.

Tanzania as opposed to Kenya, the constitution does not mention indigenous people in any construction despite being the home to four ethnic groups who identify as Indigenous among more than 124 ethnic groups, i.e. the Akie, the Hadzabe, the Barabaig, and the Maasai. Tanzania supported the UNDRIP and signed various international human rights treaties is has yet to ratify the ILO Convention 169 from the last check just like other EAC partners. The country does not explicitly recognize the existence of Indigenous people, i.e. no legal and administrative measures that address the inherent link between land, identity and traditional culture. Indigenous people suffer from a lack of land rights and have experienced repeated land grabbing as Indigenous lands are being used for mining, large-scale farming among other non indigenous context use, of course with no administration of negotiations involving indigenous in FPIC. The Ololosokwan Village

156 For example the constitution is built in the position to development and use of indigenous languages, see article 7(3); the indigenous technologies in development of the nation, article 11(1) (b); protect ownership of seeds, plants and use, see article (3) (b); and generally enhance and protect the intellectual property in and indigenous knowledge, see article 69(1)(c) whereas article 66(2) Parliament shall enact legislation ensuring that investments in property benefit local communities and their economies
157 Cultural Survival, 2015
159 Cultural survival, op cit
Council, Oloirien Village Council, Kirtalo Village Council, Arash Village Council\textsuperscript{160} is manifestation of the instances in Court. The translation of the address of human rights in the general state obligation of partner state of EAC in regards to Tanzania is an irony of an affirmative action Tanzania undertakes in human rights legal framework. All the circumstances to include the incumbent, gives a full picture of the manner the human rights of the indigenous people is in the contexts of the EAC and partner states wanting a conclusion, hence, next section.

Conclusion

In the upshot, there are inconsistent bearings and addresses of the human rights of the indigenous people with the law in the EAC and in member states as well. While the legal framework for foreign investment in the former is generally not so much developed as compared to other regions of the world, the treaty establishing the EAC mentions human rights generally and specifically extends to respective member obligations, the adherence with human rights. The model law on investment despite its non-binding status also do not have anything to do with human rights of the indigenous. Even though, the modal law takes the usual drift of expanded promissory clause, tending to mention “international law” among the source of law used to settle investment disputes. This reduces the only avenue for address of human rights in the contexts of foreign investment in domestic law address of human rights.

From what we have noticed herein, both States legal frameworks despite demonstrated senses with human rights generally, they are reluctant in giving in, the specific human rights of the indigenous people. Hence, the situation of human rights of the indigenous people in the contexts is not predictable. The study recommends harmonious co-existence. How possible, is through purposive human rights protection bearing in states regulatory space. For instance improving domestic adherence with state indigenous people’s human rights obligations and improving domestic investor-state disputes settlement.

Taking Tanzanian contexts in this regards, international investor-state dispute is totally contained in law. The amendments of the Public Private Partnership Act, in 2018 with the Public Private Partnership (Amendments Act)\textsuperscript{161} this provision supports other provisions of Natural Wealth and Resources (Permanent Sovereignty) Act and The Natural Wealth and Resources Contracts (Review and Re-negotiation of Unconscionable Terms) Act, respectively\textsuperscript{162} now providing for domestic disputes settlements. Taking their positive side in regards is tantamount to the fact that laws of Tanzania will be applicable in investment disputes settlement domestically. Taking holistic approach of this, with strong provisions, recognition of the rights of the indigenous people will be at best. This later however remains as good as a well wish.

\textsuperscript{160} Supra
\textsuperscript{161} Act No. 9 of 2018
\textsuperscript{162} Act No.5 of 2017 and Act No. 6 of 2017
The Effect of Credit Reference Bureau Information Sharing On Credit Assessment in Financial Institutions in Uganda

Pius Mukiibi, Paddy Mugambe & Joseph Kampumure

Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
The purpose of the study was to investigate the effect of Credit Reference Bureau (CRB) information sharing on credit assessment in financial Institutions Uganda. The objectives of the study were to examine the effect of financial information on credit assessment in financial Institutions in Uganda, and to examine the effect of non-financial information on credit assessment in financial Institutions in Uganda. The study adopted a descriptive survey design on 33 regulated financial institutions in Uganda (Bank of Uganda, 2015) with a sample size of 30 respondents selected using both purposive sampling and census. The study found that financial information on credit reports by financial institutions significantly used during credit assessment. Non-financial information also significantly used in credit assessment. The study recommended that stakeholders need to work together to continually ensure that CRB information shared is relevant, accurate, reliable, accessible and secure because the information will affect significantly the credit assessment decisions. Furthermore, financial institutions, central bank and CRB service providers need to continuously develop financial literacy programmes to the public so that the public can understand the importance and use of the CRB information because it plays a crucial role in the financial sector. The study further recommends that there is need to revise and enact regulations and laws to broaden the scope of CRB Information to include more financial stakeholders as evidenced in other countries according to IFC (2012).

Key Words: Credit Reference Bureau, Information Sharing, Credit Assessment, Financial Institutions

Introduction
According to the World Bank (2011), credit reporting systems are a critical element of a country’s financial infrastructure and are essential in facilitating access to financial services. Before 2008, many banks in Uganda experienced situation of multiple borrowing across banks and even within the same banks but branches. This situation was easy to go unnoticed due to the different identifiers and lack of a common National Identity Number, or other unique way of identifying individual borrowers. Currently, financial institutions are able to grant credit to borrowers by first referring to Credit Reference Bureau (CRB) reports to know how they are, or have serviced other loans and what collateral has been encumbered. This facilitates each lender's estimation of their exposure in case a loan is approved. The bureau has over one million FCS card numbers that have been issued and two million accounts with active loan balances each month (Malan, 2015). The bureau has a historical database of five years of data, currently in excess of sixty million account records showing how good and not so good borrowers repay their debt (Malan, 2015).

The whole concept of introducing credit reference bureau services was to improve on loan performance through lenders being availed more information across the market to improve their credit assessment decisions (Compuscan, 2008). Unfortunately, since 2008 when Credit Reference Bureau services were introduced in Uganda, the percentage of non-performing loans to the total loan portfolio in financial institutions indicates mixed results (Bank of Uganda, 2014). The percentage of non-performing loans to the total loan portfolio in financial institutions indicated a reduction of 1.1% in the period from 2009 to 2011 and an increase of 3.6% from 2011 to 2014 leading to a net increase of 2.5% between 2009 and 2014 (Bank of Uganda, 2014). The declining portfolio quality represented an increase in nonperforming loans and bad debts possibly due to gaps in the credit assessment process contrary to the goal of introducing CRB services.
The hope was the CRB services would reduce on the information asymmetry about the character, capacity and capital of borrowers during credit assessment and eventually lower non performing and bad debts among the financial institutions. There is therefore need to critically examine the effect of the CRB information sharing on credit assessment in financial Institutions in Uganda so as to arrive at recommendations for improving the effectiveness of use of the CRB information in credit appraisal. The rest of the paper is structured as follows: section two deals with the literature review, and is followed by the methodology in section three; while section four presents the results. We discuss and draw policy implications, and highlight research limitations in sections five and six respectively.

Literature Review

Theoretical Review

Information sharing can help financial institutions and their (potential) borrowers to overcome the problem of information asymmetry. The inability to differentiate between a good and a bad borrower leads to an information gap. If this information gap is not overcome, lenders might ration credits (Stiglitz & Weiss, 1981) and extract informational rents (Padilla & Pagano, 2000), while borrowers might apply for multiple credits without the knowledge of the lenders (McIntosh, Sadoulet, & Janvry, 2006). To overcome such exemplary problems resulting from information asymmetry, financial institutions (principals) need to align the interests of their borrowers (agents) with their own interests. As (Legerwood, 1999) observes, financial institutions can ask for physical collateral, frequent loan payments, compulsory savings, guarantees, or even threat their borrowers with public embarrassment and legal action to make sure every borrower is fully motivated to pay back their credit. These may help the financial institutions to lower their risk exposure while extending loans but unfortunately may also be both cumbersome and detrimental to borrowing, which calls for alternative strategies such as the non-physical collateral of information sharing through the CRB.

With the non-physical collateral, information sharing via a credit bureau or a credit registry can play a close substitute to the physical alternative. Lenders can share data on a borrower’s default history, or even exchange default data (black information), along with information about the characteristics of a borrower (white information) with other lenders (Ledgerwood, Earne, & Nelson, 2013). By so doing, lenders create incentives for borrowers to put in enough effort to improve the probability of a successful investment so that they are able to pay back their loans. In case a borrower defaults, they are likely to be excluded from future credit (Morduch & Armendáriz, 2005). Additionally, information sharing eliminates the informational rents of (Padilla & Pagano, 2000). The availability of CRB information can also facilitate lender trade-off. If the borrower fails to receive the lowest possible interest rate, they can threaten to borrow from another lender. This is subject to the sharing of both black and white information, which theoretically eliminates any information asymmetry. Indeed, Pagano and Jappelli (1993) show that information sharing reduces adverse selection by improving banks information on credit applicants. In their mode of doing business, each institution has private information about local credit applicants, but has no information about foreign applicants. If they exchange information about their clients’ credit worth, they can assess also the quality of foreign credit applicants and lend to them as carefully as they lend to local customers. By reducing information asymmetry between lenders and borrowers, credit registries allow loans to be extended to safe borrowers who had previously been priced out of the market, resulting in higher aggregate lending.
When banks exchange credit information about borrowers’ kinds, the increase in lending to good credit borrowers may fail to compensate for an eventual reduction in lending to risky types, thereby reducing adverse selection problem signals. The adverse selection problem is a situation where, when lenders cannot distinguish between good and bad borrowers, all borrowers are charged a normal interest rate that reflects their pooled experience. If this rate is higher than worthy borrowers deserve, it will push some good borrowers out of the borrowing market, forcing in turn to banks charging even higher rates to the remaining borrowers.

Through sharing of the credit information, the lender is able to distinguish bad borrowers from good borrowers in the market. Good borrowers with low risk would be given more attractive prices, stimulating credit demand, and fewer higher-risk borrowers would be rationed out of the market because of lenders’ inability to offer these borrowers accommodating rates (Barron and Staten, 2008). If banks exchange credit information on defaults, borrowers are encouraged to apply more energy in their projects to ensure smooth payment of their loans. Non-payment is a sign of bad quality for outside banks and carries the penalty of higher interest rates or no future access to credit facility and a high chance of default Padilla and Pagano (2000).

The exchange of information between banks may also reduce the informational rents that banks can extract from their clients within lending relationships, as shown by Padilla and Pagano (1997) in the context of a two-period model where banks have private information about their borrowers. This informational advantage confers to banks some market power over their customers, and generates a hold-up problem: anticipating that banks will charge predatory rates in the future, borrowers exert low effort to perform, resulting in high default and interest rates, and possibly market collapse. If they commit themselves to exchange information about borrowers’ types, however, banks restrain their own future ability to extract informational rents, leaving a larger portion of the surplus to entrepreneurs. As a result, these will invest greater effort in their project, resulting in a lower default probability, lower interest rates and greater lending relative to the regime without information sharing.

The moral Hazard problem implies that a borrower has the incentive to default unless there are consequences for his/her future applications for credit. This result from the difficulty lenders have in assessing the level of wealth borrowers will have accumulated by the date on which the debt must be repaid, and not at the moment of application. If lenders cannot assess the borrower’s wealth, the latter will be tempted to default on the borrowing. Forestalling this lender will increase rates, leading eventually to the breakdown of the market. (Kwambai & Wandera, 2013). Financial institutions can tackle this incentive problem by committing to sharing one with another their proprietary information about borrowers’ quality. Expecting that this information pooling will promote competition among lenders, borrowers will be reassured that no hold up will be possible and will step up their effort, lowering delinquency rates (Padilla and Pagano 2000). In this case, a high-quality borrower knows that anyway his/her high quality will be disclosed to lenders, regardless of whether his credit history is good or bad.

**Financial Information and Credit Assessment**

Financial Information is used in determining financial indicators obtained as relations between relevant categories of the figures in the financial statements. Financial indicators have a great analytical importance in assessing financial structure and financial standing of a potential debtor. By comparing the values of
these financial indicators with the desired values, a clear picture is obtained of the loan applicant’s capacity, possibilities of the loan repayment and justification of the loan application in general. The most commonly used categories of financial indicators include liquidity indicators, indebtedness indicators, activity indicators, profitability indicators and cost-efficiency indicators. (Romana & Milivoje , 2011). In terms of loan applications, financial institution may have to review the current loan balance from the CRB report. Current loan balance on a credit report is the sum of all open balances across all open accounts (Compuscan, 2008). Interest expense on these loans payable is another factor that financial institutions consider when assessing the financial statements of an entity before awarding credit. The financial institution will review this financial information in an attempt to determine the ability of the applicant to make the loan payments and hence the risk exposure for the bank (Horngren, Harrison , & Oliver, 2012). In terms of liquidity, an entity’s most liquid assets (those that can be easily converted to cash) are compared with its short-term liabilities. The greater the coverage of liquid assets to short-term liabilities the better as it is a signal that the entity can pay its debts that are coming due in the near future and still fund its on-going operations. An entity with a low coverage rate should raise a red flag as it may be a sign that the company will have difficulty meeting running its operations and obligations (Romana & Milivoje , 2011).

Other areas critical to the assessment is the arrears amount. Arrears amount on a credit report is the sum of all arrears amount across all open accounts (Compuscan, 2008). An entity is in arrears when it is late in paying the money it owes (University of Oxford, 2010). Arrears amount helps in determining how the person is paying his obligations and therefore aid in partially judging the person’s character. Persons lacking character are assigned a low priority to repaying debts and are quick to default on any loan commitment (Ruth, 2004). Arrears amount shades light into the bill paying habits of the person, the way the person manages business affairs and the way they manage adversity which have a major bearing on a person’s character (Matz, 1988).

The other key information consideration is the Instalment amount, the sum of all instalment amounts on all open accounts (Compuscan, 2008). Instalment amount is the total loan instalment that is principal and interest that is payable by a borrower at a given time period depending on the loan terms specified at the time the loan was granted by the bank (Legerwood, 1999). Loan instalments are therefore important in the assessment of the cash flows of the borrower for a given period of time as they contribute to the total cash out flows of the borrower. Financial institutions often refer to capacity to repay debt as cash flow where capacity is the borrower’s is ability to satisfy all obligations or manage cash. Cash flow aids in the quantitative determination of one’s capacity or ability to service debt (Ruth, 2004).

Non-Financial Information and Credit Assessment

Non-financial information on the credit report is used in assessing the borrower beyond the boundaries of the financial information. Non-financial information shades more light in the character and capacity of the borrower. The results of this analysis in are subjective in nature and are therefore to the discretion of the lender (Ruth, 2004). Non-financial information critical for credit assessment may include worst days’ arrears, security commitments and adverse accounts. Worst days in arrears on a credit report is the highest number of days in arrears on all accounts displayed (open and closed) held by the client (Compuscan, 2008). Arrears days show when the person has paid or is paying his obligations late thus assisting in revealing more about a person’s character. The number of days in arrears is directly proportional to loan loss reserve
and hence more loan loss provisioning expense is incurred by the bank (Legerwood, 1999). Therefore, borrower may pay all the loan instalments but if payments are made many days in arrears, the bank incurs a huge cost of provisioning before the payment is cleared. Days in arrears therefore help to shade more light on the customer’s willingness and determination to meet loan obligations (IFC, 2012).

Security Commitments on a credit report is the number of times a person or entity is linked as a guarantor on any other loans in any institution (Compuscan, 2008). Often a guarantor is analysed to ensure that the guarantor can perform as required. Guarantee agreements are often as precise as possible, stating the specific credit facilities being guaranteed and under what circumstances the guarantor will be expected to perform. Adverse accounts refer to the sum of adverse account listings in the credit report. An account becomes adverse when its risk classification changes from normal to outstanding and beyond terms, write-off or recovery (Compuscan, 2008). Different accounts can have different adverse levels depending on the number of days in arrears of the account. It’s important to assess the way the borrower has been responding to adversity which will show the true character of the borrower (Matz, 1988).

Methodology

The study adopted a descriptive survey design which is a method of collecting data and information by any means and using the data to describe a given situation (Ordho, 2003). The study used both qualitative and quantitative approaches. The study population was made up of 33 financial institutions implementing the CRB services in Uganda by December 2015 (Bank of Uganda, 2015). A sample of 30 respondents were selected using statistical tables for Morgan and Krejcie (1970) using purposive sampling. The study utilised open ended questionnaires and interviews to collect qualitative data, and closed ended questionnaires to collect quantitative data.

The questionnaire instrument for data collection was tested for validity following the conventional practice of computing the content validity index (CVI) which was found to be 0.9, which is above the recommended. For reliability of the instrument, Cronbach’s alpha tests were performed and values yielded an alpha value higher that 0.70 accepted for social sciences and therefore it can be concluded that the instrument was consistent in measuring them and therefore reliable. Following successful pretesting of the questionnaires, the instrument was administered to the target respondents.

Data was organised in a manner that facilitates analysis and it involved data being converted to numerical codes, a process known as coding (Mugenda & Mugenda, 1999). Completed questionnaires were edited for completeness, accuracy, uniformity and comprehensiveness. The interview guide was used to check the feedback from the respondents, noting the relationships between the given answers and asked questions. The data analysis was to help the researcher to make conclusions on the previously stated hypothesis.

Results

In terms of the effect of financial information on credit assessment in financial Institutions in Uganda. Correlation Analysis was undertaken regarding the indicators of financial information and credit assessment and the results of the results of the correlation test are presented in the table 1 below:
Table 1: Correlation of Financial Information and Credit Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Financial Information</th>
<th>Credit Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial Information Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.928**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Assessment Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.928**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Source: Primary Data (2016)

Table 1 shows Pearson’s correlation coefficient $r = 0.928**$ and $p = 0.000$ between the financial information and credit assessment suggesting a high positive relationship between financial information and credit assessment in financial institutions in Uganda. This implies that credit analysts highly depend on credit report financial information in order to inform their decisions as they perform credit assessments for credit.

A regression analysis was conducted to measure the extent to which Financial Information affected Credit Assessments using the ANOVA techniques of adjusted $R^2$ values, standardized beta values, t-values and significance measured at 0.05 levels as shown in table 2 below:

Table 2: Regression model between Financial Information and Credit Assessments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Summary</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
<th>Change Statistics</th>
<th>df1</th>
<th>df2</th>
<th>Sig. Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.928*</td>
<td>.862</td>
<td>.857</td>
<td>.1005462</td>
<td>.862</td>
<td>168.420</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Financial Information

Source: Primary Data (2016)

The regression model shows adjusted $R^2$ value of 0.857 between financial information and credit assessment suggesting that financial information alone predicted 85.7% of the variance in credit assessments in financial institutions. This implies that financial information on credit reports highly influences the credit decisions made by credit analysts during credit assessments. In terms of the effect of non-financial information on credit assessment in financial Institutions in Uganda correlation analysis was undertaken and the correlation test results are in table 2 below;

Table2: Correlation of Non-Financial Information and Credit Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Non-Financial Information</th>
<th>Credit Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-Financial Information Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.771**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.771**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Credit Assessment

**Sig. (2-tailed): .000**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>29</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**

*Source: Primary Data (2016)*

The Table shows Pearson’s correlation coefficient \( r = 0.771^{**} \) and \( p = 0.000 \) between the Non-financial information and credit assessment suggesting a high positive relationship between Non-financial information and credit assessment in financial institutions in Uganda. This implies that credit analysts highly depend on credit report Non-financial information in order to inform their decisions as they perform credit assessments for credit. The Regression model results between Financial Information and Credit Assessment are in table 3 below:

### Table 3: Regression model between Financial Information and Credit Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
<th>Change Statistics</th>
<th>df1</th>
<th>df2</th>
<th>Sig. Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.771*</td>
<td>.595</td>
<td>.580</td>
<td>.1722106</td>
<td>.595</td>
<td>39.616</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*a. Predictors: (Constant), Non-Financial Information*

*Source: Primary Data (2016)*

The regression model shows adjusted \( R^2 \) value of 0.595 between Non-financial information and credit assessment suggesting that financial information alone predicted 59.5% of the variance in credit assessments in financial institutions. This implies that Non-financial information on credit reports highly influences the credit decisions made by credit analysts during credit assessments.

### Discussion and Policy Implications

#### Financial Information and Credit Assessment

The study found out that current loan balance had the strongest correlation (0.919) followed by arrears amount (0.768) and Instalment Amount (0.536) respectively. The study also showed that current loan balance had a strong significance in determining the capacity the borrower to pay the loan and capital considerations. This is in agreement with Romana and Milivoje (2011) who argued that since current loan balance affects the liquidity ratio calculation, the greater the coverage of liquid assets to short-term liabilities the greater the entity’s capacity to meet its debts that are coming due in the near future and still fund its on-going operations.

The study showed that arrears amount was significantly used in the character assessment and capital considerations of the client during credit assessment in agreement with Matz (1988) who posited that arrears amount helps in determining how the person is paying his obligations and therefore aid in partially judging the person’s character. Ruth (2004) also states that persons lacking character are assigned a low priority to repaying debts and are quick to default on any loan commitment. Matz (1988) further argues that arrears amount shades more light into the bill paying habits of the person, the way the person manages business affairs and the way they manage adversity which have a major bearing on a person’s character and capital requirements.
Moreover, the study found that installment amount was significantly used in determining the capacity the borrower to pay the loan. This agreed with Ruth (2004) who argues that loan installments are important in the assessment of the cash flows of the borrower for a given period of time as they contribute to the total cash out flows of the borrower which aids in the quantitative determination of one’s capacity or ability to service debt.

**Non-Financial Information and Credit Assessment**

In terms of non-financial information, security commitments had the strongest correlation (0.633) followed by adverse accounts (0.558) and days in arrears (0.539) respectively. The study also clearly showed that security Commitments information were strongly considered in character assessment. This supports the U.S. Department of Treasury (2011) which states that since a guarantor is often analyzed to ensure that the guarantor can perform as required and guarantee agreements are often drafted as precise as possible, stating the specific credit facilities being guaranteed, under what circumstances the guarantor will be expected to perform, an unconditional guarantee therefore extends liability equal to that of the primary obligor or conditional guarantee requires the creditor to meet a condition before the guarantor becomes liable hence affecting the borrower’s character.

The survey showed that worst days in arrears information were strongly considered in character assessment. This is in agreement with Legerwood (1999) who asserted that since arrears days show when the person has paid or is paying his obligations late therefore they assist in revealing more about a person’s character and since loan loss reserves depend on the arrears days of a loan in default and thus loan loss provision banks. International finance corporation (2012) further states that the reason why arrears days are considered is that the borrower may pay all the loan installments but if they are always paid when they are in many days in arrears the bank incurs the huge cost of provisioning before the payment is cleared shading more light on the customer’s willingness and determination to meet loan obligations.

The study also found out that adverse accounts was strongly used in both character and capital assessments. The study agreed with Matz (1988) who suggested that since different accounts can have different adverse levels depending on the number of days in arrears of the account and therefore it is important to assess the way the borrower has been responding to adversity which will show the true character of the borrower.

**Policy Implications**

The banking stakeholders including clients, financial institutions, Bank of Uganda and CRB service providers need to work together to continually ensure that CRB information shared is relevant, accurate, reliable, accessible and secure since it will affect significantly the credit assessment decisions. CRB service providers need to come up a uniform objective credit scoring matrix to aid in quick decision credit decision making process by financial providers and easy to use by clients. The financial institutions, central bank and CRB service providers need to continuously develop financial literacy programmes to the public so that they can understand the importance and use of the CRB information because they it plays a crucial role in the financial sector. The central bank and legislators need to revise and enact regulations and laws to broaden the scope of CRB Information to include mobile money network operators, insurance companies,
utility companies and unregulated financial institutions who play a major role in financial inclusion as evidenced in other countries according to IFC (2012).

Limitation of the Study

The major limitation of the study was the scope in terms of geographical coverage. The study was limited to financial institutions in Uganda where CBR services were introduced recently and the available is both scanty and not regularly updated. Therefore, the findings of the study may not be replicated in economies with different environmental factors regarding the CRB services.

References


Human Resource Capacity Building and Environmental Conservation in Hamurwa Sub County, Rubanda District, Uganda

Natukunda Susan & Tindyebwa Joseph, Ph.D
Bishop Barham University College, Uganda Christian University
Corresponding E-mail: natukundasusan3@gmail & joseytin@yahoo.com

Abstract
The state of environmental degradation in Uganda, specifically in Rubanda district, Hamurwa Sub County have a relationship with human resource capacity building especially due to under motivated local government staff and limited capacity of local council leaders. The major theoretical foundation of this study is psychological empowerment Spreitzer, (1995), supported by ‘X’ and theory ‘Y’ that also centers on the basis and implication of psychological empowerment in consideration by ‘X’ and ‘Y’. The research paper was guided by two objectives that include: To assess the impact of human resource capacity building on soil conservation; to analyze strategies to solve the challenges that affect human resource capacity building for wetland conservation. The study adopted a descriptive and cross section survey design focused on quantitative and qualitative techniques of data collection and data was collected using questionnaires, interviews and documentary analysis and was then used to generate tables and descriptive statistics. The study target population was 330 respondents; the researched derived at a total sample size of 198 by use of Slovenes formula. Simple random method, purposive and stratified sampling techniques were utilized during respondent selection. The research findings reveal that 78% of the respondents indicated that human resource capacity building for community leaders has contributed to soil conservation, it was also analyzed that 75% of the respondents agreed that inadequate human resource empowerment leads to conflicts in the community and affects wetland conservation. It was also found out that 80% revealed the need for motivation and training of extension worker and community development officer to encourage a forestation and agro forestry practices and awareness in tree planting for environmental conservation. The key conclusion was the adoption of strategies for human capacity building through local government leaders’ capacity building and sensitization which has impact on environmental conservation. However, it was recommended that, for purposes of addressing the challenges of environmental degradation at Hamurwa, there should be emphasized by training and orienting community stakeholders the need for recruitment of self-motivated skilled employees that contributes further community awareness for sustainable environmental conservation. There should be environmental conservation information dissemination to the community, building capacity for effective utilization of the existing natural resources for rural community’s soil conservation. Nevertheless, the central government of Uganda should fund local government’s human resource capacity building to enhance environmental conservation through sustainable environmental conservation policies. Thus, policy implementers at district and sub county local government level should be persistent in addressing gaps of community empowerment for effective environment conservation.

Key words: Human Resource Empowerment, Environmental Conservation

Introduction
This journal paper was based on the urgent attention to environmental conservation and environmental sustainability that has a degree of correlation with human resource empowerment, and the strategies for environmental conservation and sustainability in Hamurwa sub county of Rubanda District, Uganda. Capacity building in this study refers the coverage of human resource empowerment activities such as orientation, training of the human resources to strengthen managerial system, institutional development that involves community participation and creation of an enabling environment. The need to address environmental degradation challenges such as floods have affected agricultural production of which are basis for social- economic wellbeing of citizens. The author was enabled to disseminate information
relevant to human resource capacity building and environmental conservation in consideration of the following sections; background to the study, statement of the research problem, research objectives, conceptual framework, literature review that contains theoretical review and reflection on the objectives of this study, research methodology, research design, presentation of research findings, conclusions and recommendations.

**Background to the Study**

Human resource capacity building is an essential factor that can enhance sustainable development especially in developing countries of Sub-Saharan Africa. Azikwe (2006) refers capacity building as the ability that enable the people to make use of their creative potentials, intellectuals capacities and leadership abilities for personal as well as nation growth and development. Capacity building therefore means planning for people to acquire knowledge and advanced skills that are critical to a country’s economic growth, its standard of living and individual’s empowerment. It is the planned programs that will impart skills which will enable the recipient put the knowledge and skills acquired into productive uses to solve wide range individual and national problems. David, Hulme et.al. (2001), explains that, environmental conservation was a creation of reserves, particularly for forests, for example in west indies during 18th century, and in India and South Africa in the 19th Century. Conservation in African in the last decade has followed three main principles; that conservation should be community based; that the things concerned should be managed to achieve both development and conservation goals and that market should play a role in shaping the incentives for conservation (David Hulme et.al. 2001). However, it’s worth noting that, the need to enhance environmental conservation in Uganda requires well trained and equipped human resource with adequate skills, knowledge on policy, legislations, by laws especially on soil and water conservation. He further states that, it becomes compelling to conserve these resources by everybody, everywhere in Uganda, since without the resources the survival and development of mankind becomes very threatened.

Psychological empowerment is vital in that whenever an employee exhibits work behaviors that are inconsistent with the work environment or is unable to perform the way expected, such an employee should be counseled. Maicibi (2007), states that the benefits of employee psychological empowerment unrecovered the reason for poor performance, appropriate use of counseling can prevent underperformance and reduce labor turnover and absenteeism, it can give employees the encouragement necessary to take responsibility for self-development and career development. Therefore, empowerment of human resource for public policy making and implementation in regard to environmental conservation especially for conservation of soil and water has to be taken serious for sustainable human survival and social-economic development. The pursuit of human resource capacity building for environmental conservation in Uganda seems to target the social economic wellbeing of the people especially in Rubanda district.

However, environmental degradation in Uganda has been a challenge to environmental restoration, preservation and sustainable utilization of the environment resources. Environmental officer and forestry officer of Rubanda district have tried strategies to control human activities that have degraded the environment based on deforestation, wetland reclamation, soil erosion due to bush burning, over grazing, and iron ore and extraction of sand and hard core all requires attention. Environmental degradation in some districts of Uganda has led to soil erosion, seasonal floods, and climatic changes which have the strategy for human resource capacity building should focus on local council leaders in particular to be trained and educated. The strategy to build capacity for the parish leaders should focus on how to achieve improved
methods of farming such as terracing and crop rotation, wetland conservation and management. However, the study was so keen to examine the nature and impact of human resource capacity building for environmental conservation. Agricultural productivity has faced challenges of floods during rainy seasons. This is as a result of poor agricultural methods such as poor land tenure system that has caused rampant loss of soil fertility and food insecurity.

Nevertheless, in this study context, two vital questions within environmental conservation and human resource capacity building strategy discourse will seek to be answered: (1) what is the impact of human resource capacity building on environmental conservation? (2) What is the relationship between human resource capacity building strategies and environmental conservation in some communities of Hamurwa Sub County? However, there are significant environmental concerns that rural local governments have identified that need to be addressed, include: wetland mismanagement, soil erosion, landslides, deforestation, over grazing, charcoal burning, bush burning and flooding of water. It is suggested by community leaders that, the main causes of environmental degradation are; increased population that leads to land fragmentation, the over cultivated hilly terrine and poor tree species especially eucalyptus, bush burning which leads to the disappearance of the soil cover. Increased charcoal burning for business has led to the disappearance of natural forests and increased demand for timber generally has led to environmental degradation due to controlled indiscriminate tree cutting.

Statement of the Research Problem

Despite of some districts in Uganda that have faced environment degradation challenges during the previous four years such as Bududa and Kasese district, there is need to employ environmental conservation strategies. It is believed that Kabale district has had a need for human resource capacity building that would have addressed environmental conservation challenges. Notably, Hamurwa Sub County has experienced seasonal floods and rampant soil erosion, reclaiming of wetlands for farming which seems to have led to environmental degradation with indicators of floods in lowlands, loss of soil fertility, and food insecurity. The nature of environmental degradation and existing poor performance of local government employees, local governments have attempted to empower agricultural extension workers though with scanty impact. Attempts to empower local government council leaders through training workshops and seminars for environmental conservation is are still vital. Such strategies for capacity building to local government community development workers is required if rural areas are to obtain sustainable environmental protection and agricultural productivity. It is not known why the attempted human interventions and environmental mitigation measures have not had tangible impact on sustainable environmental conservation. That is why the researcher intended to examine the relationship between human resource capacity building and environmental conservation, and analyze factors which compromise effective human resource capacity building and environmental conservation.

Research Objectives

The study objectives were as follows:

1. To examine the effects of human resource capacity building on soil conservation in Hamurwa Sub County?
2. To establish strategies that can solve challenges faced during human resource capacity building that hinders wetland conservation in Hamurwa Sub County?
**Conceptual Framework**

Figure 1 below reveals that, human resource capacity building that is the independent variable understood in terms of local leader’s orientation, workshop for local council leaders, employee rewards, incentives, effective communication, recognition and trust. It is conceptualized that environmental conservation that is a dependent variable without come /indicators of afforestation practices, controlled soil erosion, improved soil fertility, flood control, soil conservation, better farming methods, soil conservation and soil fertility; food security, wetland conservation and regeneration, then climate stability. The inputs that are mediating variables are essential for the realization of environmental conservation indicators that includes; Government policy; laws and rules, local council capacity building work plan; community based organizations and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO) interventions.

The above conceptualization can be affirmed by theory of psychological empowerment Spreitzer, (1995), who asserts that psychological empowerment, exists when employees perceive that they exercise control over their work life. This reflects an individual’s active orientation to his or her work role and consists of cognitions that are shaped by the work environment rather than a fixed personality attribute. Psychological empowerment consists of a set of four cognitions reflecting an employee’s orientation to his or her role,-namely meaning-the value of his work or her work, competence-his or her capability to perform the work, choice- the choice in initiating and regulating actions and impact- the ability to affect organizational outcomes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human Resource Capacity Building (IV)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local leaders orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training workshop for community leaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee rewards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition of empowered staff</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environmental Conservation (DV)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afforestation practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Controlled soil erosion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flood control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soil conservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wetland conservation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Government policy, environmental laws and rules.
- Local council capacity building work plan.
- Community based organizations and Non-Government Organizations’ interventions

**Source:** Spreitzer, (1995), Modified by the Author, (2017)
Theoretical Review

There are theories that slightly relates to the study of environmental conservation and sustainability such as: the theory of neoclassical sustainability of the growth. (Cozzi T., Zamagni S., 1989) the neoclassical theory of growth (or development) considers the increase of production and, therefore, of disposable income in higher levels of consumption as a solution to poverty for progress and development. The neoclassical approach is based on the assumption that the capacity for self-regulation (Tietenberg T., 2006) of free markets and not bound, and technological advances are able to ensure capacity of substitutions endless between the various forms of capital, mitigating so, the constraints arising from the possible scarcity of resources, allow sustainable growth, a level of consumption does not decreasing over time. This may imply that the established laws or regulations for environmental conservation especially the NEMA Act regulates how best the available capable human resource interprets and implements in their areas of jurisdiction. That can lead to profitable use of natural resources and environmental sustainability for social economic growth provided other factors are constituent.

Nevertheless, this study was underpinned by the human capital theory as developed by Barney (1991) is associated with the resource based view of the firm. This study adopted human capital theory. The theory view people as assets and stresses that investment by organization in people will generate worthwhile returns. The human capital theory was affirmed by theory of psychological empowerment Spreitzer, (1995), who asserts that psychological empowerment, exists when employees perceive that they exercise control over their work life. The theory therefore underpins the philosophies of human resource management and human capital management, Armstrong (2006).

In addition, the study was opined by ‘X’ and theory ‘Y’ also known as ‘hard guy’ ‘soft guy’ approach for managing people within the organization. Theory ‘X’ describes the employee having negative views whereas ‘Y’ represents employees in a positive manner. Theory ‘X’ states that the most people have little capacity for creativity in solving organizational problems in motivational results only at psychological and security level. In contrast theory ‘Y’ claims that people can be self-directed and creative at work if positively treated. The capacity to use their imagination and originality is widely found among employees.

Motivation occurs at all levels of employee-social security, psychological or spiritual. It can be stated that theory ‘X’ is more applicable into traditional organizations whereas theory ‘Y’ is appropriate for modern open decentralized and egalitarian organizations (Adhikari, 2003).

Considering the above connotation especially ‘Y’ it can be inferred that the positive encouraging and egalitarian dealings of any organization motivates human resources to become more productive and capable. This indicates that capacity building can be efficient approach to motivate and encourage human resources or employees to be more effective and result oriented to achieve targeted goals in this case that may be environmental conservation.

Human Resource Capacity Building Empowerment and Environmental Conservation

Capacity building in the context of development implies a dynamic process which enables individual agencies to develop the critical social and technical capacities to identify and analyze problem as well as proffer solution to them. Azikwe (2006a) cited in Azikwe (2008) emphasizes that capacity building is the process by which an individual’s, irrespective of sex, are equipped with skills and knowledge they need to perform effectively and efficiently in their different callings. Thus, capacity building from the human
capital point of view could be explained to mean when people possess the needed knowledge and advanced skills that are critical to individual growth as well as the country’s growth and development. The capacity needed by any country to sustainable development is primarily dependent on the adequacy and relevance of its entrepreneurship. According to Banjoko (2002) capacity building is needed in the Nigeria government parastatals because the link between needs and supply is weak. There is lack of realistic funding in the tertiary institutions, which make adequate manpower development difficult. Given this background, Banjoko believes that there is need for support and change. He also observed that training institutions are isolated and communities are poor. For him, development of teaching materials is inefficient in schools. Alternative ways of capacity building are not adequately recognized. Banjoko (2002) argues that the above three scenario make capacity building imperative, adding that Nigeria needs to use capacity building strategies and other ways of empowering people and changing current practices. As far as he is concerned, Capacity building is the means of achieving productivity and sustainable environment in our case study that results to development.

Furthermore, Banjoko (2002) notes that ability of a country to follow sustainable development paths is determined to a large extent by the capacity as well as by its ecological and geographical conditions. According to him, the fundamental goal of capacity building is to enhance the ability to evaluate and address the crucial question related to policy choices and modes of implementation among development options, based on the understanding of environment potentials and limits of needs as perceived by the people of the country concerned. Ajayi (2006) to enhance Nigeria’s competitive edge, the scholar suggests that special emphasis should be given to increasing productivity and efficiency through human capacity building, encouraging rural development activities as well as synergy of all stakeholders. It is clear today that there is a desperate need to develop effective management in industries and organizations of both private and public sectors. This needs developed out of the realization that the industrialization and development of Nigeria greatly depends on the existence of an efficient, dedicated, innovative and productive workforce, Nwankwo (2014). Nwankwo went further to emphasis that various effort made to develop this type of workforce have not yielded fruitful result. Moreso, perhaps, the institutionalized orientations and attitudes of Nigeria management personnel towards performing their management functions may be a major contributing factor. Henri Fayol went further to identify three basic kinds of skills: technical, human and conceptual. He emphasized that every manager needs these skills for effective service delivery. Technical skills is the ability to use the procedure, techniques and knowledge of a specialized field, e.g., surgeons, engineers, musicians and accountants have technical skills in their respective fields. Human skills are the ability and capacity to work with, understanding, and motivate other people as individuals or in groups. Conceptual skills are the ability to coordinate and integrate all of an organization’s interests and activities. It involves seeing the organization as a whole, understanding how its parts depend on one another, and anticipating how a change in any of its parts will affect the whole, cited in Stoner (2005). From the foregoing, Fayol is emphasizing on increasing Human Capacity Building in all ramification to understand any incidences that may occur in organizational operations. National Environmental Management Authority (NEMA), (2008) through their report reveals of what local government stakeholders are expected to do for environmental conservation. Thus, they are expected to participate actively in the enforcement of environmental regulations, review of environmental impact assessment and audit reports in decision making processes regarding the permitting and use of ecologically sensitive ecosystems like river bank and lake shores, wetlands, hilly and mountainous areas.
They largely regard many environmental management responsibilities as the role of NEMA. Yet lead agencies were envisaged in the National Environment Act Cap 153 as critical elements of the backbone for environmental management in the country.

In addition, NEMA (2008) reveals state of environment management in Uganda also analyzes that, the relative ineffective and inadequate local government Environmental Natural Resource (ENR) management structure occasioned by the low status of the under empowered district environment officer and lack of representation at lower levels. This is particularly at the sub-county level and the local government level planning and budgeting process that place little emphasis on ENR management, inadequate integration of ENR issues into districts and lower local governments’ development plans. In order to prevent the violation of environmental conservation legislation and local council bye-laws community sensitization, effective organizational communication is ideal. This will prevent environmental degradation and improve the performance of local council authority’s employees and other stakeholders. Thus information dissemination on environmental conservation is vital because; it contributes to agriculture that is the mainstay of Uganda and therefore conservation of agricultural resource is necessary to ensure sustainable productivity. The author asserts that, it has been observed according to the author opinion that, soil and water resources of our country are increasingly being degraded as a result of the growing population.

**Impact of Human Resource Capacity Building on Soil Conservation**

Namirembe, et.al (2007) analyses that, there is a need for empowerment through training the Ugandan population by emphasizing agro forestry practices that aims at improved and sustainable agricultural production. This is vital because it supports livelihood of farmers especially planting fruit trees that are integral part of many agro forestry systems in Uganda. They further explain that, although the fruit marketing process is not well developed, there is high potential for maximizing profits through improved harvesting and handling practices for improved household incomes. Social and environmental tree services provide shades for traditional village meeting of which is also appreciated through community awareness for environmental protection at various community levels. The above author’s views leaves a methodological gap and conceptual gap, in that, although they articulated and appreciated the need and impact of human resource empowerment for environmental conservation, they seem to have not revealed the best approaches for community mobilization and how to effectively empower local community leaders in relation. This is part of the gaps the researcher intends to address in this study.

However, Agea, Namirembe, et.al (2007) further relates his views in supporting human resource empowerment and human activities that influences complex systems within the natural environment (soil, water, flora, fauna, and air). Amsalu, De Graaff (2006) indicates that, soil conservation in the Ethiopian has significant implication on several households based on socio-economic factors that influences decisions for environmental conservation and agricultural development. However, Agricultural development in Ethiopia is hampered by land degradation; degradation in turn is threatening the overall sustainability of agricultural production. Soil erosion is a major cause of land degradation in Ethiopia. The author points out a conceptual gap that is addressed by this study. Based on the above opinions, effective human resource empowerment, through sensitization may favor the probability of adopting traditional soil and water conservation measures.
In addition, environmental degradation include: over cultivation on the steep slopes, bush burning that leads to the disappearance of soil cover and Charcoal burning also leads to the disappearance of the natural cover is cited to be a challenge for environmental conservation. All these are caused by the increasing population in different areas of Uganda (Agea, Namirembe, Bukenya, Zziwa 2007). Related to the above, the challenges faced by environmental conservation based on the immediate consequence of land degradation, are brought about by limited control over their work, absence of motivation of workers and limited trainings on conservation strategies which has led to the reduction of crop yield followed by economic decline and social stress to the citizens in Uganda. Some studies reveal that degradation resulting from soil erosion and nutrient depletion is one of the most challenging environmental problems in Ethiopia. The Ethiopian highlands have been experiencing declining soil fertility and severe soil erosion due to intensive farming on steep and fragile land (Amsalu and de Graaff, 2006). Soil-water management practices should overcome adverse effects of processes such as erosion, sanitization, solidification, water logging and loss of fertility, drought and misuse of agro chemicals that may render the soils partially or completely unproductive. The author identified both a methodological and theoretical gap that identifies human resource empowerment and environmental conservation challenges yet the previous researchers does not reveal how they may be solved through better practices for environmental conservation in Uganda.

State of environment report for Uganda, (2008), reveals that there is no adequate effort that local governments have put in place to train and equip extension officers, motivate, relate and trust them to face the new challenges of environmental conservation. In addition, lack of funding by the central government to operationalize governance functions, particularly at the local government level have affected required improved team performance in environmental protection. NEMA (2008), reports that Uganda’s wetlands are still under siege, despite having some of the best wetland policies in the sub-region. This could be due to a number of reasons like lack of sufficient capacity at local levels and knowledge gaps concerning Uganda’s wetlands that should be addressed. There is a serious risk that wetland conservation might become a mantra, unless it is backed by some verified data on the opportunity costs of conserving or converting a wetland. The other challenge in the sector is wetland degradation due to lack of management capacity at the local government levels, climate change factors are likely to contribute to further wetland degradation in the short to medium term. There is no effort in place to train and equip community development officers to face the new challenges of wetland degradation.

Research Methodology

The author of this paper employed descriptive and cross-sectional designs which are based on quantitative and qualitative approaches for data collection. Field observation and expert judgment also form part of the research methodology. The questions to be answered focus on the impact and challenges of human resource capacity building on environmental conservation. The design helped the researcher to relate environmental conservation and human resource empowerment. In both cases quantitative research approaches that have connection with observation and mathematic expression of quantitative relationships were relevant. The researcher targeted a population of three hundred thirty (330) from Mpungu, Shebeya, Ruhonwa, Igomanda and Kakore parishes of Hamurwa Sub County. There was also selection of five community leaders per each parish and they involved; religious leaders, L.C II chairpersons, parish chief, model farmer group chairpersons, councilors, District officials who include: District environment officers, community development officer, sub county chief, secretary for agriculture and production and agricultural officer thus the total population of (330) three hundred thirty respondents. The total sample size of 198 was derived at
by use of Slovenes formula based on both purposive sampling and stratified sampling in relation to the target population. The total sample size for selected community members was 171 respondents. The total community leaders selected from the five parishes was 27 respondents.

The author also employed several research instruments and methods in order to achieve the research objectives. The instruments which were employed included; questionnaire was used as a data collection instrument which consisted of a set of questions to which respondents utilized to give their responses and opinions. Both open ended and close ended questions were used to collect information from informants; Interview was also utilized as an oral questionnaire used by the researcher to gather data through direct verbal interaction with participants. The interview consisted of questions in which were asked to the community members who could not read and write from the questionnaire and opinion leaders and key informants. The responses were recorded by the interviewer; Observation as an instrument of data collection. The researcher employed non-participatory method of observation depending on the specific matter which included the topography of the area, vegetation and soil conservation methods. The researcher had the observation schedule on which the above items were recorded. Documentation was an instrument used to derive information by carefully studying written documents. Focus group discussion was based on a total of two focus groups, one for community leaders and one for community members. Each focus group had 10 participants and composed of both women and men. Focus group discussions were used to collect only qualitative data. The focus groups were used among others to get information on human resource empowerment and environmental conservation.

**The impact of Human Resource capacity building on Soil Conservation**

This was to establish whether there was impact of human resource capacity building on soil conservation. In order to obtain information from Hamurwa sub county stakeholders were requested to respond indicating Yes or No. Findings in table 1 below reveals that majority of the respondents 80% agreed that Human resource capacity building for community leaders has led to soil conservation. Those who responded that Human resource capacity building through awareness has empowered the community on better farming practices were 75%. While 72% confirmed that human activities are the most common causes of environmental degradation like floods and soil erosion/degradation, were followed by 71% who agreed that Government policy, training and workshops has made the community aware of land use options for sustainable soil production and environmental conservation. Nonetheless a smaller portion of 55% also agreed that Community and CBO’s partnerships have contributed on efforts for sustainable environmental conservation. This implies that human resource capacity building for community leaders should be emphasized for sustainable soil conservation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Showing responses on the impacts of Human Resource Capacity Building on Soil Conservation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The qualitative data based on interview guide and focused group discussion revealed the “all people at Hamurwa know how to construct terraces like fanyajuu and fanyachiini to control soil erosion and floods”. They further said that “men who have the energy to construct terraces most of them spend their time in bars taking “mujakure” a local brew. One of the community leaders said ‘that whenever they are mobilized for agricultural trainings not all of them turn up’”. In a focus group discussion it was revealed that, the 72% responses on how human activities are the most causes of floods and soil degradation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Items for Respondents | (F) | Yes | No
---|---|---|---
Community leaders’ capacity building leads to soil conservation | 160 | 80% | 15%
Human resource capacity building through awareness has empowered the community on better farming practices. | 149 | 75% | 15%
Human activities are the most common causes of environmental degradation like floods and soil erosion/degradation | 143 | 72% | 23%
Public policy training and workshops leads to community awareness on land use options for sustainable environmental conservation | 141 | 71% | 24%
Community and CBO’s partnerships has contributed on efforts for sustainable environmental conservation | 109 | 55% | 40%

Source: Primary data 2017

However, related studies agrees that, human resource capacity building through participatory monitoring is a conservation strategy that enables empowerment to be more effective because it depends upon the local interests and strategies employed when monitoring community participatory programs including environmental conservation programs in Hamurwa Sub County.

Challenges of Human Resource Capacity Building and Wetland Conservation

The author inquired the opinions of respondents as to whether there were challenges faced by human resource capacity building for wetlands conserving in Hamurwa Sub County. The views of the respondents were captured and presented in the table 2 below.

Table 2 Showing Responses to the Challenges of Human Resource Capacity Building for Effective Wetland Conservation

| Statements | (f) | Yes% | No %
---|---|---|---
Equip community leaders with capacity to conserve environment | 30 | 15% | 80%
Community leaders can acquire environmental conservation awareness | 59.4 | 30% | 65%
Technical skills for local leaders to conservation wetlands is necessary | 19 | 14% | 39%
Environmental conservation and training community leaders needed | 149 | 75% | 20%
Human resource capacity building has effect on wetlands conservation | 139 | 70% | 25%

Source: Primary Data 2017

Results exposed that majority of the respondents 75% revealed that inadequate human resource capacity building leads to conflicts in the community and that can be solved by environmental conservation and training community leaders. In addition respondents by 70% who asserted that limited human resource capacity building has diverse effects on corrective responsibility to conserve the wetlands. Community leader’s capacity building has failed to solve challenges of wetland degradation this was revealed by 30%
while 15% of the respondents revealed that lack of community leader’s capacity building has led to wetland degradation practices. This implied that inadequate human resource capacity building leads to conflicts in the community and hence improper wetland conservation.

Qualitative data points out that in relation to the existing documentary reviews and reports about the study indicates that Hamurwa Sub-county local government five year development plan (2015/2016) emphasizes human resource capacity building and environmental conservation in selected parishes of Hamurwa sub-county require community leaders involvement in decision making and ensuring that the stream lined environmental issues are implemented. The sub-county development plan asserts that environmental degradation is caused by iron ore, sand and hard core extraction in some centers of Hamurwa sub-county and this has led to deterioration of natural resource base. The different key players or stakeholders in human resource capacity building and environmental conservation include; the local community leaders, the government, non-governmental organization and community based organizations. Their role is to make sure that the environment is sustainably conserved. The above findings are in agreement to the secondary data revealed through the state of environment report for Uganda, (2008), reveals that there is no adequate effort that local governments have put in place to train and equip extension officers, motivate, relate and trust them to face the new challenges of environmental conservation. In addition, lack of funding by the central government to operationalize governance functions, particularly at the local government level have affected required improved team performance in environmental protection.

**Strategies for Effective Human Resource Capacity Building for Afforestation and Agro-forestry practices.**

The information from respondents were summarised below.

**Table 3 Showing Responses on Strategies to Improve Human Resource Capacity Building for Afforestation and Agro-forestry Practices**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements/ Items</th>
<th>(f)</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monitory rewards motivates environmental extension officers.</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity building via workshop trainings promotes agro-forestry</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental gender mainstreaming enhances afforestation</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public policy environmental reforms conserves the environment</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate policies.</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Primary data, 2017*

Results in table 3 above revealed that 80% of the respondents revealed that there is need for monitory rewards and training of extension officers to encourage human resource staff high performance practices in a forestation and agro-forestry followed by 75% who agreed that capacity building of extension workers in a forestation and agro-forestry practices leads to sustainable environmental conservation. Also 60% of the respondents also said that environmental gender mainstreaming enhances afforestation should be considered in a forestation and agro-forestry to achieve environmental conservation while 55% revealed
that Government support with incentives like tree seedlings encourage the community to participate in a forestation and agro-forestry. The same percentage of 55 confirmed that there is need for appropriate policies to collaborate with empowered human resource in sustainable use of forests. This meant that 80% of the respondents were in support for the motivation and training of extension workers to promote high performance practices in a forestation and agro-forestry to achieve sustainable environmental conservation.

Qualitative data revealed that, when the community development officer was interviewed in relation to other challenges leading to increased wetland degradation, he said that “there was political influence, limited capacity building for all sub county leaders which has led to negative community attitude towards wet land conservation and weak byelaws to control environmental degradation practices such as bush burning, deforestation and poor tree species especially eucalyptus grown on steep slopes which have led to run offs and floods”. During discussion meeting one of the Sub county local government leadership team led by the sub county chief revealed that, strategies for human resource empowerment and environmental conservation, there is need “in regard to the constraints and effective for the allocation of adequate funds to facilitate trainings to empower the available human resource such as farmer leaders in agro-forestry practices”. This is in coherence with theory of psychological empowerment Spreitzer, (1995), who asserts that psychological empowerment, exists when employees perceive that they exercise control over their work life. Related to the above the ‘X’ and theory ‘Y’ also known as ‘hard guy‘ ‘soft guy’’ approach for managing people within the organization. Theory ‘X’ that describes the employee having negative views whereas ‘Y’ represents employees in a positive manner. Theory ‘X’ states that the most people have little capacity for creativity in solving organizational problems in motivational results only at psychological and security level. In contrast theory ‘Y’ claims that people can be self-directed- and creative at work if positively treated. Thus, the capacity to use their imagination and originality is widely found among employees.

Conclusions

Based on the findings of this study, the conclusions were mainly coherently linked to the research objectives and theories that underpinned this study as follows:

Based on the previous questions on of this study, it was found out that human resource capacity building through training and orienting employees and sensitization of community development leaders, has affect soil conservation in terms of protecting soil erosion and lack of soil fertility. Thus, there is a continuous need for training extension officers, community development officers on methods that foster effective performance in promoting afforestation and agro-forestry reforestation practices and awareness in tree planting in Hamurwa Sub County. This implies that, capacity building strategies if they are effectively utilized by Sub County and community leaders that could lead to sustainable soil conservation for social economic welfare of the people in Hamurwa sub-county.

Furthermore in conclusion human resource capacity building requires workforce or community members training, orientation, employee rewards, incentives, training and equipping human resource with skills and information dissemination. Thus, limited involvement of community members in decision making and limited monitoring by community local leaders leads to wetland degradation and undermines conservation practices hence depleting the utilization of natural resources. The effect and strategies of human resource
capacity building for environmental conservation was validated by the human capital theory as developed by Barney (1991) that viewed people as assets and stresses that investment by organization in people will generate worthwhile returns. The theory in the study was affirmed by the philosophies of human resource management and human capital management, Armstrong (2006). Hence human resource capacity building via motivation occurs at all levels of employee-social security, psychological or spiritual. This can be realized through both psychological empowerment as stated by psychological empowerment Spreitzer, (1995) and the “X and Y” theory. The ‘X’ remains more applicable into traditional organizations whereas theory ‘Y’ remains appropriate for modern open decentralized and egalitarian organizations (Adhikari, 2003), of which is relevant decentralized local government entity of Hamaurwa sub-county with empowered community members and leaders for sustainable environmental conservation in Uganda..

**Recommendations**

Based on the research findings and significance of the study the following are recommendations:

The central government of Uganda especially through the ministry of environment and disaster preparedness, ministry of lands, local government as public policy should enforce environmental management laws, rules, and procedures aiming at promoting environmental conservation. Therefore human resource should be trained to acquire skills and knowledge to achieve a sustainable environmental conservation. This can be enhanced by pro-poor community member’s participation approach to avoid environmental degradation for social economic sustainability.

It is further recommended that, policy implementers with factual information especially local government leaders at district and sub county level. They should adopt reliable strategies to address identified challenges that are faced during human resource capacity building for effective both soil and wetland conservation. Local government community development officers, agricultural and environmental officer’s acquisition of skills required is still vital for purposes of sustainable environmental conservation in Uganda.

**References**


453


Abstract
Programme evaluators are known to adopt various research methodologies depending on the purpose of the evaluation, evaluation questions and methodological preferences of evaluation commissioners and stakeholders. Many adopt typically quantitative, while others prefer a mix of quantitative and qualitative designs and methodologies. It has been a tradition among evaluators to prefer using quantitative designs and methodologies with a notion that these produce more objective and valid findings compared to qualitative ones. This article underscores the benefits of using participatory methodologies in programme evaluations to enhance hard evidence and put a human face to the findings. The authors explore the various relevant participatory methodologies available for use in programme evaluations, their applicability and the benefits they offer in enhancing the quality of evidence for programme evaluations across various sectors. The authors did a literature review on participatory methodologies and how they can be utilized in evaluations, as well as reflecting on their own experiences in using such methodologies in their research and evaluation work. An inclusion and exclusion criteria for the literature was developed and based on it, scholarly articles, book chapters and grey literature were collected to inform the article. The findings revealed various relevant participatory methodologies that can be handy in enhancing the quality of evaluation findings. Many of these methodologies have a high potential of clearly illustrating participant’s reality in relation to their experiences and level of impact the programmes accrue to them, compared to the quantitative methodologies. Adoption of participatory methodologies in programme evaluations, will provide the evaluator and the consumers of evaluation findings with the lived realities of how programmes impact the intended and unintended beneficiaries.

Keywords: Participatory Methodologies, Programme Evaluations, Evidence-Based Management, Humane Evaluations, Participant Reality

Introduction
Programme evaluations continue to gain momentum among development practitioners and evaluation academics across the globe. Programme evaluation is conceptualized as “a set of mechanisms for collecting and using information to learn about projects, policies, and programmes, to understand their effects, both intended and unintended, as well as the manner in which they were implemented” (Cook, 2014 p.108). Programme evaluations have proved to be a key management tool that NGOs, public sector agencies, donor agencies and of recent the private sector use to support informed decision making, organizational learning and programme improvement. Through evaluations, management and other decision makers are able to get answers to questions related to the relevance of their work to the needs of their target beneficiaries, effectiveness of their strategies in achieving their goals and objectives and efficiency in terms of inputs used to produce intended outputs. The managers and stakeholders are able to get information about the sustainability potential of their interventions beyond programme funding, but also measuring the impact of their interventions on intended beneficiaries through programme evaluations (Chianca, 2008). Programme evaluations are handy in helping managers and other stakeholders identify implementation challenges, good practices and providing baseline information for future programmes or interventions. Often the
development of new programmes is informed by evaluation findings of previous similar or related interventions.

Programme evaluators are known to adopt various research methodologies to enable them collect, analyse data and come up with evidence and information that decision makers need about their programmes or interventions. The research methodologies adopted depend on the; purpose of the evaluation, evaluation questions to be answered and methodological preferences of evaluation commissioners and stakeholders. Evaluators can choose from a wide array of research methodologies within the quantitative, qualitative and mixed methods approaches. In most evaluations however, managers and donors have showed preferences for quantitative methodologies especially in measuring impact of programmes. This bias towards quantitative methodologies is due to the fact that most decision makers are interested in numbers as a way of illustrating the magnitude of the situation or even the impact of an intervention. Often they ask; how much is the benefit of the intervention to the target population? How many have benefited from the intervention? How many have been reached by the intervention disaggregated by gender, age group and rural/urban divide? What is the impact of the intervention in quantitative terms? This then calls for experimental or quasi experimental research designs like Randomized control trials, difference in difference, propensity score matching, regression discontinuity designs and other pre and post related designs that often are quantified.

Some donor agencies and managers would want to triangulate the findings (though the main findings are quantitative) with some qualitative ones and therefore will require that evaluators collect some qualitative data and mostly through interviews and focus group discussions. Literature shows that evaluators and commissioners of evaluations have of recently moved towards promoting participatory evaluations. There are several advocates of participatory evaluations including; Estrella et al (2000); Probst (2002); Brown, Jacobs and Leith (2012); Marphatia & Edge (2015) etc. Patton (2008) argued for participatory evaluations to enhance utilization of evaluation findings. He argues that most evaluation findings are not utilized because of lack of active involvement of the users in the entire process. The author argues that “the challenge of using evaluations in appropriate and meaningful ways represents just such a crisis in institutional arrangements” (p.4). In his opinion active involvement of the primary users of such evaluation findings in the entire process could promote effective utilization of evaluation findings thereby advocating for appropriate methodologies that actively engage and involve the primary users of evaluation findings.

Though a lot has been written about participatory evaluation approach, little is found in the literature on how participatory research methodologies can be explored fully to provide hard evidence in programme evaluations. In this article we focus on exploring this aspect by answering the following key research questions; What participatory research methodologies are available for programme evaluators to choose from? How can these methodologies be used to enhance evidence in programme evaluations? What are the potential benefits of participatory research methodologies to evidence based evaluation findings? What potential challenges can we anticipate in using these methodologies in programme evaluations?

This paper attempts to add to existing literature by answering these questions through a review of the literature and using professional experiences of the authors. The article begins with conceptualizing programme evaluation and participatory M&E, then provides an introduction to participatory research methodologies that are available to programme evaluators. It also explores applicability of participatory research methodologies to programme evaluations and the potential benefits that these methodologies can
accrue to evidence based evaluation findings. The article ends with exploring the anticipated challenges of using participatory methodologies in programme evaluations and how these challenges can be dealt with effectively to harness the benefits of these methodologies to evaluations.

**Research Design and Methodologies**

The authors did a literature review on participatory methodologies and how they can be utilized in evaluations, as well as reflecting on their own experiences in using such methodologies in their research and evaluation work. An inclusion and exclusion criteria for the literature was developed and based on it, scholarly articles, book chapters and grey literature were collected to inform the article.

**Key Findings**

**Conceptualizing Programme Evaluation and Participatory M&E**

Programme evaluation is a concept that has been around for some time. Davidson (2005) argues that several authors have attempted to define it in various ways.

**Introduction to Participatory Research Methodologies**

Participatory research methods have been used as tools to elicit marginalised and excluded people’s voices, to make their voices heard on social and developmental matters (Bowd, Ozerdem & Kassa, 2010). This methodology has been useful in disciplines such as sociology, anthropology, and in the field of Education. Bowd, Ozerdem and Kassa (2010, p.2) state that “unlike other research techniques, participatory techniques place extensive emphasis on the importance of harnessing the non-academic, local knowledge of the people themselves in order to act upon and solve local problems”. Babbie and Mouton (2001) also note that a participatory framework views the active involvement of affected societies as vital to the knowledge construction surrounding the phenomenon under study. The benefit of using participatory research methods is their ability to shift power to the participants in a more reflexive manner.

An important principle of participatory research is an interest in knowledge generation or construction by participants rather than knowledge extraction. This has been identified as a key feature of participatory research. Veale (2005, p. 253) states that participatory research generates knowledge “through a merging of academic with local knowledge to provide oppressed people with tools for analyzing their life conditions.”

**Visual Arts-Based methods**

Visual arts-based methodology is an approach to participatory research that engages and mobilises people as a way of empowering them. The methodology is sometimes referred to as image based or art informed research methodology. Richards (2011) stated that using visuals is important to researchers who want research participants to present how they perceive their world. Richards further noted that

…visual methods can actually aid participation because images are often more accessible to people than dense academic text, and they also have a novelty factor which is likely to keep people stimulated and engaged in the research process for longer (2011, p.2).
Richards (2011) has noted a rise in the use of Visual Elicitation, a method which involves the use of Drawings, photographs, filming, sculpture, painting or any activity that can produce data in the form of visuals (Richards, 2011). A growing body of researchers are employing this methodology in their research (De Lange, Mitchell & Stuart, 2007; Khau, 2011; Leitch, 2007, Mitchell, De Lange, Stuart, Moletsane & Buthelezi, 2007). This methodology is particularly useful in studies that explore topics that are very hard to discuss (Khau, 2012). Through the use of visual arts-based methods, participants feel less pressured engaging with these sensitive issues because they express themselves through an artefact as a go-between and not directly speak about the topics (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011).

In support of arts-based methods, Prosser (2007, p. 13) highlights how visual research can help to “slow down” the everyday details of life in an engagement environment and enable deeper reflection to take place. Participant-generated images can provide different modes of expression which may contrast with the dominant written discourses of report-writing and assessment. These ways of meaning-making acknowledge that adults as well as children may benefit from being able to explore their views and experiences through combining visual and verbal modes.

**Drawings**

Drawings are part of the visual participatory methodology which is not new in research and is being used today in social research (De Lange, Mitchell, Stuart, 2007; Motalingane-Khau, 2010; Leitch, 2008). By using drawings people can also structure and facilitate their reflection on painful and silenced subjects in a safer way (Leitch, 2009). Stuart (2007, pp.229) affirms that “within visual methodology, there is a vast body of work on the use of drawings as form of expression, reflection and therapy”. Leitch’s (2009) study commented on the significance of drawing’s ability to shed light on people’s experiences that could have been hard to articulate.

**Applicability of Participatory Research Methodologies to Programme Evaluation**

Participatory research is primarily differentiated from conventional research in the alignment of power within the research process. It focuses attention on the central issues of power and control. As Rifkin (1990) notes, participation is more than just taking part. She suggests that it involves activeness, choice and the possibilities of that choice being effected. This raises several important questions about how people are involved in the research process. Christensen and James (2008) argue that whilst conventional research tends to generate “knowledge for understanding" which may be independent of its use in planning or implementation, most participatory research focuses on "knowledge for action". According to them, the practice of participatory research raises personal, political and professional challenges that go beyond the bounds of the production of information. They state that:

…what is important is that the particular methods chosen for a piece of research should be appropriate for the people involved in the study, for its social and cultural context and for the kinds of research questions that are being posed. (Christensen and James, 2008, p. 13).

According to Clark (2011), participatory methodologies are often characterized as being reflexive, flexible and iterative, in contrast with the rigid linear designs of most conventional science. One of their key strengths is seen to reside in exploring local knowledge and perceptions and engaging people as active contributors to knowledge production.
From the field of Agriculture, Biggs (1989) distinguishes four modes of participation:

**Contractual:** people are contracted into the projects of researchers to take part in their enquiries or experiments:

**Consultative:** people are asked for their opinions and consulted by researchers before interventions are made:

**Collaborative:** researchers and local people work together on projects designed, initiated and managed by researchers:

**Collegiate:** researchers and local people work together as colleagues with different skills to offer, in a process of mutual learning where local people have control over the process.

These methods can be comfortably adopted during the design of the evaluation studies. They can be combined with the traditional survey methods. The methodologies can be handy in generating data from participants. The focus should be on both the process and the product.

**The Process**
- Provide an orientation to the research team and participants about the specific participatory method to be adopted.
- Develop the prompts and have all the materials ready.
- Then engage participants in activities.
- Ensure that you document the process and prepare field notes exhaustively.
- Let the participants and research team reflect on the process.

**The Products**
- Let participants freely express themselves on the products e.g. drawings, photos, collage, story boards etc.
- Ask follow up questions and reflections on the products to ensure more data is collected.
- Feel free to ask participants to write down any additional captions or stories in addition to the products.
- Ensure all the products and related data are well recorded for analysis.

**Potential benefits of Participatory Research Methodologies to Evidence-Based Evaluation Findings**

- Promotes active involvement
- Promotes team work and collaboration in generative process
- Promotes learning for both research team and participants
- It stimulates deeper thinking among participants
- It makes participants relaxed and enthusiastic to take part
- It is fun and play
- It promotes clear sightedness and insightfulness among participants and research team
- It enhances transformation due to the high level of reflection
- Attitude of the researcher towards qualitative methodologies
A lot of planning and skill
Time and resource constraints
Ethical issues that require a lot of preparations

Conclusions and Recommendations for Practitioners

The findings revealed various relevant participatory methodologies that can be handy in enhancing hard evidence in programme evaluations.
Many of these methodologies have a high potential of clearly illustrating participant’s reality in relation to their experiences and level of impact the programmes accrue to them, compared the quantitative methodologies.
Adoption of participatory methodologies in programme evaluations, will provide the evaluator and the consumers of evaluation findings with the lived realities of how programmes impact the intended and unintended beneficiaries.

References


Integrating International and Regional Agenda in Uganda's Planning, Implementation and Reporting Frameworks

Tasha Balunywa & Vincent Operemo
National Planning Authority

Abstract
Implementation of global, continental and regional agenda at national level is now central to policy discussions and analyses. The push is for countries to nationalize the agendas that include among others the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and Africa Agenda 2063 to enable a unified approach in achieving global goals aimed at leaving no one behind. For Uganda, in addition to the SDGs, the East African Community Vision 2050 has to be incorporated to the existing planning, implementation and reporting frameworks. However, the challenge lies in implementing these agenda in a harmonized manner that minimizes duplication. This paper through detailed content analysis of the three agendas finds converges and divergent areas among the three agendas in the context of the 5Ps (People, Planet, Prosperity, Peace and Partnerships) and also examines what it will take to implement the agendas in a coherent manner. In line with this, the study further analyses Uganda’s existing implementation capacity and recommends areas of improvement in the current institutional arrangements, building awareness, integration into planning frameworks, data, monitoring and reporting on the goals and ability of the financing framework to meet the financing needs.

Key words: 2030 Agenda, EAC Vision 2050, Agenda 2063, Integration, Planning, Implementation, Reporting, Uganda.

Introduction
Uganda has committed to achieving the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and played a crucial role in the adoption of the 2030 Agenda where it held presidency of the 69th Session of the United Nations General Assembly. Since then, the country has been mobilizing several efforts to focus on achieving the goals in a balanced manner. For example, the second National Development Plan (NDPII 2015/16 – 2019/20) which is currently under implementation integrates the goals, an SDG coordination framework with structures at the political and technical level has been adopted, and civil society has mobilized several campaigns around the SDGs, and many other initiatives have been and are currently being implemented.

At the continental and regional level, Uganda also participated in various processes that led to the adoption of the Africa Union Agenda 2063 and the East African Community (EAC) Vision 2050 respectively. The adoption of these agendas presents both an opportunity and a challenge for the country. Although these frameworks place sustainable development at their center, the differences in their timelines, goals and targets poses a challenge in coherently implementing them and integrating them into the planning, implementation and reporting frameworks in a balanced way. The opportunity on the other hand lies in the benefits that accrue from an integrated implementation process that encourages policy coherence, minimizes duplication and the reporting burden on policy makers.

Studies have highlighted the need to coherently integrate the 2030 Agenda and the Africa agenda 2063 in national development plans. For example, UNECA proposed undertaking a mapping/alignment exercise to identify the synergies among multiple development agenda in order to integrate them into planning frameworks and the need to strengthen advocacy and awareness raising of the different initiatives and their interrelatedness (Economic Commission for Africa, 2017). UNDP also mapped the 2030 agenda, agenda 2063 and the African Development Bank’s operational priorities (High Fives – Hi5s) aligning development aspirations within the African region, and between Africa and the globe as a starting point to promote better
implementation through aligning ideas, strategies, processes and practices (UNDP, 2017). The MDG-SDG Transition Report (African Union, Economic Commission for Africa; African Development Bank and United Nations Development Programme, 2016) notes the need for an integrated approach to implementation of the two agenda 2030 and agenda 2063. The report highlights key issues such as awareness raising on the relationships between the two agendas, integrated coordination, integration and follow-up and review as necessary for the transition into the 2030/2063 agenda.

Despite the above existing literature, mechanisms of implementing the global, continental and regional frameworks in a coherent manner at the country level have not been examined. This paper contributes to this discussion and generates recommendations that member states of Regional Economic Communities (RECs) and other international policy makers can consider or apply to implement different development frameworks in the context of Uganda. The paper can also contribute to the on-going discussions on the preparation of Uganda’s 10-year National Development Plan (NDP) and the third 5-year NDP.

This paper consists of six sections including the introduction. Section two presents the methodology used. The third section focuses on demystifying the three development agendas. The fourth on key issues to consider for coherent implementation, the fifth is an analysis of these issues in the Ugandan context and section six concludes the paper with policy recommendations.

Methodology

A critical review of the three agenda documents and other related documents was conducted. The review focused on answering the following questions: i) how to they converge or diverge; ii) what is the current progress towards implementing the agendas ii) how do countries move towards implementing these multiple agenda in a coordinated manner; iii) given this, how far has Uganda gone in implementing these agenda and where are the gaps in light of what needs to be done.

Findings

Evidence of Synergies between the 2030, 2063 and EAC Vision 2050

Agenda 2063 comprises 7 overarching aspirations, 20 goals, 29 priority areas, 174 targets and 200 indicators. On the other hand, the 2030 Agenda structured around the SDGs has 17 goals, 169 targets and 234 indicators while the EAC Vision has 7 goals, 2 enablers and three cross-cutting issues. Convergence exists among all the agendas especially at goal level.

This paper builds on the mapping study done by the EAC commission and determines convergence among the three agendas. Analysis of the three documents is based on the goals, priority or focus areas of the agendas and how they contribute to the economic, social and environmental dimension of sustainable development.. The analysis shows that, at the goal level, Agenda 2030, Africa Agenda 2063 and EAC Vision do not exactly match but overlap each other. This means that there are similarities amongst the goals. All the seven goals and enablers of the EAC Vision 2050 overlap with the Agenda 2030 and 2063 Goals. In addition, the cross-cutting issues in the Vision 2050 related to sound fiscal and monetary issues, gender, women and youth empowerment, urban cities overlap with some of the goals in both the Agendas.

Similarities and divergences among the global, continental and regional frameworks are identified below within the context of the 5Ps of sustainable development where People, Prosperity and Planet represent the social, economic and environmental dimensions respectively while peace and partnerships are vital to sustainable development.
People: All the three agenda aim to improve the lives and well-being of the people. SDGs 1,2,3,4,5, and 6 focus on the basic sustenance of the people (no poverty and hunger) and access to the fundamental needs (education, health, water and sanitation) and ensuring that all people everywhere are treated with dignity and equality. The Agenda 2063 goals 1,2,3,5, 16, 17 and part of goal 7 (water security as a priority area) also focus on the people. The EAC Vision 2050 goal on enhancing agricultural productivity is geared towards improving the livelihoods of the east African people. Health, social security and social protection, water and sanitation are enablers centered on the people whereas gender, women and youth empowerment are essential to the effective implementation of the goals. Culture and values are emphasized in the continental (Goal 16) and regional frameworks unlike the 2030 agenda. Overall, the three frameworks are similar in terms of pursuing people centered development.

Prosperity: The SDGs 7, 8,9,10 and 11 (affordable energy, sustainable growth, resilient infrastructure and industrialization, reduced inequalities and sustainable cities) focus on prosperity for all. The goals 4, 10, 20, 8 and 9 of the agenda 2063 are aimed at building a prosperous continent that can drive and sustain its own development. The EAC vision goals on affordable and efficient infrastructure, tourism and trade, industrialization are in line with the vision theme on prosperity of the region. The EAC political federation and issues related to sound fiscal and monetary policies are critical to the vision and align with the agenda 2063 Goal 8 and 9 which are not in the 2020 agenda. Despite this, ensuring prosperous lives is a driving factor across the three frameworks.

Planet: In order to protect the planet’s natural resources and climate for the future generation, SDG 12, 13, 14 and 15 aim to address the challenges the planet is facing with emphasis on sustainable consumption and production patterns, climate change and its impacts, protecting both life on land and below water. Environmental sustainability is also prominent in Goal 7, 5 and 6 of the agenda 2063 which focus on biodiversity, conservation and sustainable natural resource management, climate resilience and natural disasters preparedness and blue/green economy. The EAC vision goal on sustainable utilisation of natural resources, environment management and conservation with enhanced value addition echoes the need to protect the planet although strategies for sustainable consumption and production are not well articulated.

Peace: Promoting peaceful and just societies and strengthening institutions is a key aspect to all three frameworks. SDG 16 is dedicated to achieving this as a driver of sustaining inclusive growth and development. Agenda 2063 Goals 11,12, 13, 14 and 15 are aimed at having a peaceful and secure Africa that is based on good governance, democracy, social inclusion and respect for human rights, justice and rule of law. These are also goals under the EAC vision framework as the region aspires to become competitive and secure.

Partnerships: All three agendas recognize the critical role partnerships will play in implementing the set goals. SDG 17 - means of implementation seeks to leverage partnerships as important vehicles for mobilizing and sharing expertise, knowledge, technologies and financial resources to support the goals. Goal 19 of agenda 2063 specifically aims at Africa becoming a major partner in global affairs through advancements in science, technology and innovation and partnerships. The aspect of countries taking responsibility of their own development through effective domestic resource mobilization is common to the agendas. Goal 9 and 20 of agenda 2063 and the implementation modalities set out in the EAC vision 2040 devise various mechanisms to achieve this.

From the above analysis, the three agendas recognize the 5Ps as fundamental to achieving sustainable development. Countries should therefore strive to integrate and uphold these elements in their respective
national planning and implementation processes. The challenge however is in designing integrate policies that consider the trade-offs among the goals given their interconnected nature.

Furthermore, although similarities exist among all the agendas within the context of the 5Ps, the Agenda 2063 is broader as it incorporates the concerns of moving towards a United Africa. The EAC Vision also incorporates matters for regional integration which are in line with the continent’s aspirations. Member states therefore should not only focus on the SDGs as they risk missing out those goals particular to agenda 2063 and EAC vision 2050.

**Progress on implementation**

A review on the implementation of the SDGS and the goals of the Agenda 2063 indicates that some progress has been made in on the goals although at a slow pace (African Union; Economic Commission for Africa; African Development Bank; United Nations Development Programme, 2018). There have been improvements in goals related to access to water and sanitation, electricity, urbanization, education and conservation and sustainable use of mountains. Efforts have also been made to strengthen the rule of law, increase participation, and observe human rights and increase transparency and accountability.

African countries however continue to face the challenges related to; low economic growth rates averaging 3.2 per cent; huge infrastructure gap; rising debt levels; high dependency ratio; lack of sufficient productive and decent jobs, adverse and severe impacts to climate change; continued insecurity, political tension and increased crime, majorly organized crime; and increased illicit financial flows. Furthermore, African countries statistical systems are not well developed, there is slow adoption and transfer of science and technology and the continent has the lowest government revenue to GDP ratio compared with other regions.

**Implementation issues to Consider**

This section looks at the key emerging actions arising out of the implementation frameworks of the agendas. An analysis of the agendas reveals key actions to consider include: strengthening institutional capacities and arrangements; raising awareness; integration into national planning frameworks; strengthening data and inclusive follow-up and review mechanism; enhancing financing mechanisms.

These actions are further reinforced by documented best practices and recommendations for improving implementation of the 2030 agenda, four years into implementation (Kindornay, Surasky, Risse, & Hasnaoui, 2019). Given the integrated nature of the goals under the three agendas, an integrated approach to their implementation and reporting will be key to avoid duplication of efforts and promote coherence in policy design and implementation by member states (Economic Commission for Africa, 2017). These actions are discussed in the sections that follow.

**Strengthening Institutional Mechanisms**

The integrated nature of the goals requires corresponding institutional arrangements, within and across national local governments, involving multiple ministries, departments, and other government institutions (Sustainable Development Solutions Network, 2015) and adopting a whole-of-government approach where all ministries, agencies and public are involved in the decision making process. Four years into implementation of the 2030 agenda, many countries have designed coordination mechanisms to oversee SDG implementation. These mechanisms include creation of inter-ministerial committees (e.g. Belgium, Canada, Colombia, Ghana, Japan, Mexico, and Portugal), or entrusting a specific ministry to spearhead implementation (Belize, Cyprus, Ethiopia, Morocco, Netherlands, and Republic of Korea) while some have also assigned specific goals to specific ministries as with the case of Bangladesh.
The mechanisms described above show that there is no one size fits all but countries should tailor mechanisms to their existing institutional structures. It’s also important that the goals are not perceived as restricted to a specific sector such as environment or only to foreign affairs (UN Department for Economic and Social Affairs Division for Public Administration and Development Management, 2018). An independent assessment of the voluntary national reviews recommends formalizing institutional mechanisms to increase participation of non-state actors.

The 2063 agenda on the other hand requires member states to establish a national agenda 2063 Focal Group made up of civil society and private sector directly linked to the Economic, Social And Cultural Council (ECOSOCC) to track progress on implementation of the agenda activities, advocate, and engage the public. Whereas the Ministries in charge of East African Community Affairs (MEACA) are responsible for the coordination of implementation of EAC Vision activities at country level.

Member states will therefore have to review existing institutional arrangements in a manner that reduces duplication of efforts and brings together all stakeholders to discuss ensure the aspects of the 5Ps are incorporated into the planning and implementation.

**Enhancing Communication and Advocacy**

The successful implementation of the 2030 Agenda and Agenda 2063 requires public awareness of their content and relevance to the local contexts, the synergies and complementarities that they both share and their role as a social contract between people and their Governments in order to help to ensure that these Governments are held accountable (AU-UN, 2019). This can be expanded to include the EAC Vision 2050 for the case of the EAC member states. It will be vital to raise awareness to clarify the relationships at global, continental and regional.

**Integration of the Agendas into National Development Plans**

National planning frameworks constitute the basis for the implementation of internationally agreed commitments. Identifying horizontal and vertical synergies is a prerequisite for ensuring coherence in the integration of multiple development agendas into national planning frameworks. (Economic Commission for Africa, 2017).

The 2030 agenda recognizes that countries are at different levels of development and have different capacities. Countries like Vietnam, Nigeria (Nigeria’s Road to SDG to guide the transition from MDG to SDGs) crafted roadmaps to achieve the SDGs. For countries whose planning frameworks coincided with the adoption of the agenda, or those that did not have, it was advisable to integrate the SDGs during the formulation of the plans/strategies. This means therefore that the agenda should not be treated separate from the existing planning frameworks.

From the mapping exercise, the 5P’s (people, prosperity, planet, partnership and peace) should be integrated into national plans and strategies and integration especially at target and indicator level. The challenge however is the differences in the targets. Member states should therefore set national targets depending on its national circumstances guided by these agenda targets.

**Data, Monitoring and Reporting**

Data and statistics are a key factor in achieving and monitoring sustainable development. The AU-UN coordination framework recognizes that coherent monitoring and evaluation of both the 2030 and 2063 agenda frameworks will require an integrated set of goals, targets and indicators and a harmonized review
and reporting platform (African Union, Economic Commission for Africa; African Development Bank and United Nations Development Programme, 2016). The Africa Regional Forum for Sustainable Development (AFRSD) agreed that the indicators selected to monitor and report on Agenda 2063 (core and complementary) could also be used to monitor the agenda 2030. The integrated regional indicator framework has thus been developed to monitor and report on both agendas. It has 142 indicators that will be used for the integrated regional follow-up and reporting of both agendas.

Although a mapping of the three agendas has been done at goal level as presented in this paper, this has to be done at also indicator level i.e. mapping of the EAC Vision 2050 indicators against the agreed upon 138 indicators of the UN-AU indicator framework. It will then be the responsibility of EAC member states to harmonize these with their respective national indicators.

The institutional framework for reporting on the goals is at the national, regional and global levels. The High Level Political Forum (HLPF) and the Africa Regional Forum for Sustainable Development (ARFSD) currently provide a platform at global and regional level for follow-up and review of the implementation of the 2030 Agenda and Agenda 2063. Member states are encouraged to conduct regular/annual national reviews on the goals that can feed into reporting at the HLPF and the ARFSD.

**Financing the Goals**

The Addis Ababa Action Agenda, an outcome document of the United Nations Third International Conference on Financing for Development is a key framework for financing the sustainable development goals. It includes measures that address financing for development (domestic public resources, domestic and international private business and finance, international development cooperation, international trade as an engine for development, debt and debt sustainability) and other enablers of development and financing such as science, technology and innovation, trade and capacity building.

Since the adoption of the action agenda, domestic resource mobilization has been at the heart of financing the agendas. To implement the 2030 Agenda and Agenda 2063, it is important to advocate for measures to expand DRM through areas such as improving tax administration; broadening the tax base and eliminating loopholes for tax avoidance; prioritizing expenditures with the biggest impact on the less privileged; and combating illicit financial flows (Economic Commission for Africa, ARFSD, 2018). The agenda 2063 financing strategy also articulates the various potential sources of financing, how to mobilize the additional required resources and channels through which the funds can be accessed. While a wide range of financial resources and instruments are available, the challenges for African countries are about knowing and gaining access to these resources. African countries therefore have to enhance their capacities to prepare bankable projects. Given the above, an integrated approach to implementing them must be underpinned by an integrated financing mechanism that minimizes duplication, leverages economics of scale and optimizes the use of resources.

**Implementing the Global, Continental and Regional Frameworks in Uganda**

**Strengthening Institutional Arrangements**

In 2016, Uganda adopted an SDG coordination framework for the implementation of SDGs. The framework which is anchored within the existing government coordination framework was developed to ensure coherent, consistent and seamless implementation of the goals. It comprises policy and technical structures i.e.: The Policy Coordination Committee (PCC), the Implementation Steering Committee (ISC), the National SDG Taskforce and five Technical Working Groups (TWGs) around Planning and mainstreaming,
coordination, monitoring and reporting, data, communication and advocacy and resource mobilization and financing. The TWGs are supposed to meet quarterly to discuss progress on roadmap activities however this is not the case.

The Sector Working Groups are the link between the TWGs and the Ministries, Departments and Agencies and the Local Governments. The SWGs are members of the TWGs and form the basis for planning, coordination and monitoring of all activities in the sector. A study on strengthening the national coordination function of Uganda found that all the 16 sectors were relatively weak in multi-annual budgeting, tracking development partner investments and obtaining feedback on service delivery and sector performance (Office of the Prime Minister, 2017). The functionality of the SWGs should therefore be strengthened.

On the other hand, there have been little efforts to set up institutional mechanisms for the implementation of the Africa Agenda 2063 in the country i.e the requirement for a national Agenda 2063 Focal Group. Given the similarities in all the agendas, leveraging on the SDG coordination framework and incorporating the other two - continental and regional frameworks in the policy committees and TWG will further strengthen the implementation of the goals.

**Communication and Advocacy**

There has been a lot of effort towards ensuring that the SDGs are known all over the country. This has been through the multi-stakeholder collaborations between the government, media, civil society and the development partners. For example, the SDGs have been translated into ten local languages (Acholi, Ateso, Kiswahili, Luganda, Lugbarati, Lumasaaba, Lusoga, Nga Karimojong, Runyakore, Rukiga, Runyoro/Rutooro) and an action plan to advance the SDGs in Uganda through mobile-enabled digital transformation has been produced.

Regarding the Africa Agenda 2063, Uganda was among the 37 Member States (MS) that the African Union visited while undertaking its domestication mission. A national workshop was held to build awareness and strengthen MS and Citizens’ engagement and ownership of Agenda 2063.

Despite these efforts, the SDGs are more widely known in the country as a lot of emphasis has been placed on them in communicating the sustainable development message. Although the Ministry of East African Community Affairs is undertaking some popularization activities on EAC integration agenda, there is need for the MoICT&NG together with the National Planning Authority, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of East African Community Affairs (MEACA) to work together to harmonise and communicate the message of integration all the agenda.

**Integration into Planning Frameworks**

The global, continental and regional framework will be implemented through the already existing national development planning frameworks - the Comprehensive National Development Planning Framework (CNDPF). This is Uganda’s overarching strategic planning framework that provides for the development of a 30-year Vision, 10-year perspective plan, five-year national development plan, sector and local government plans and annual work plans and budgets.

The second National Development Plan (NDPII – 2015/16- 2019/20) is currently Uganda’s medium-term plan in line to achieve the Uganda Vision 2040. It was developed within the context of development agendas at the national, regional and global obligations e.g. EAC, COMESA, IGAD, Africa Agenda 2063, the Post
2015 Development Agenda and UNFCCC. The plan seeks to leverage the country’s growth opportunities and honor development partnership obligations at these levels (Republic of Uganda, 2015).

Furthermore, the macroeconomic framework for the plan was informed by assumptions of the macroeconomic convergence criteria for the EAC monetary union. Projects such as Northern Corridor Projects, Ayago Hydropower Plant 600 MW, Karuma Hydroelectric Power Project – 600 MW, Isimba Hydroelectric Power Project – 183 MW, Oil refineries (Hoima), oil and gas pipeline, ICT Broadband Infrastructure network which are flagship projects in the EAC Vision 2050 are included in the plan and are in the process of being developed or implemented. As a result of this deliberate integration effort, the plan has 69% alignment to the SDGs at strategic level (National Planning Authority (NPA), 2016) although assessment for level of alignment with the Africa Agenda 2063 and EAC Vision 2050 is not known.

As the implementation of the NDPII is coming to an end, cautious effort should be made to integrate the goals into the third National Development Plan (NDPIII). NPA will need to consider the five Ps during the integration of these agendas in the plans. Attention should be paid to the goals that are specific to Africa agenda 2063 and the EAC vision i.e. Goal 8, 9 and 16 of agenda 2063 and on efforts towards the EAC integration. But also, on SDG 12 which the other two agendas do not place a lot of emphasis on. The integrated regional indicator framework which has the 138 indicators can be used to guide the planning, harmonization, prioritization and setting of targets while considering those in the EAC framework guided by the country’s Uganda Vision 2040. At Sector level, effort was also put into integration of SDGs into the sector plans. The Energy and Mineral Development sector development plan (2015/16 – 2019/20) integrates SDG 7 on “ensuring access to affordable, reliable sustainable and modern energy for all by 2030”. (Ministry of Energy and Mineral Development, 2015)

The Health Sector Development Plan (2015/16 – 2019/20) was also developed in the context of the SDG and the Common African Position (CAP) of the African Union. It integrates SDG 3: Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages and commits to the working towards achieving Universal Health Coverage. Regarding integration of EAC programmes into national and sectoral plans policies and strategies, the Ministry of East African Community Affairs notes that challenge of limited mainstreaming of EAC regional activities and programmes into the Ministry, Departments and Agency annual work plans and budgets (Republic of Uganda, 2018). Effort should be strengthened through the coordination framework to integrate these programmes across sectors.

**Data, Monitoring and Reporting**

Data production, monitoring and reporting of the sustainable goals follows the existing arrangement under the NDPII. The data needs for the SDGs are met through the second National Strategy for Statistical Development and the second plan for National Statistical Development (NSDS II – PNSD II) which are both aligned to the NDPII. The major data sources for monitoring SDGs include: Administrative Data from MDAs, Civil Registration and Vital Statistics, National Population and Housing Census (NPHC), Census of Business Establishment, Uganda Census of Agriculture (UCA), Uganda National Household Surveys (UNHS), the Uganda National Panel Survey (UNPS), the Demographic and Health Surveys (UDHS), National Service Delivery Survey (NSDS), Governance, Peace and Security Survey, Malaria Indicator Survey, Sero and Behavioral Survey and National Biomass Study.

Uganda’s current statistical capacity (sum of currently available and easily feasible indicators) to compile data on SDGs stands at 49% of applicable indicators (98 out of the 232 SDG indicators). This percentage increases to 89% (179 out of the 232 SDG indicators) when indicators if more effort is put to the collection of missing data (Uganda Buruea of Statistics, 2018).
The Uganda Bureau of Statistics (UBOS), lead agency of the SDG data TWG is undertaking an exercise to develop a national SDG indicator matrix. This involves mapping SDG indicators based on the existing national development frameworks such as the NDPII Results and Reporting Framework (RRF) and the National Standard Indicator (NSI) Framework. The SDG indicator matrix which consists of 186 indicators mainly in Tier I and a few in Tier II is to be validated and endorsed for implementation. Despite the above, the Ugandan data ecosystem remains constrained by the following: limited disaggregation of data and small area statistics; limited coverage of surveys, weak administrative data production; development of Registration systems; limited Coordination of community generated data and Big data.

Monitoring and reporting on the goals is through the National Development Reports (NDR), Government Annual Performance Reports (GAPR) and sector and agency performance review reports. These are produced on an annual basis. Separately, as provided for in the SDG coordination framework, the TWGs are supposed to submit quarterly reports to inform the biannual reports presented to cabinet and parliament. So far, only two status reports have been submitted. This is mainly because TWGs are not yet fully operational and hence do not meet quarterly as required. The functionality of these working groups should be strengthened to generate reports on a quarterly basis to feed into the bi-annual reports.

Member states are supposed to prepare annual monitoring reports on the agenda 2063 and present to the legislative organs however there currently no reports produced specific for the Africa agenda 2063 and there is no clear framework for reporting on the continental framework at the national level.

Financing the Goals

Financing and resource mobilization for the implementation of the goals is enshrined in the NDPII fiscal strategy. The plan is financed both by public and private resources. Public sources include domestic financing, budget support, concessional loans, semi-concessional borrowing, non-concessional borrowing. The non-public sources include; Public Private Partnerships, direct private sector investments (domestic and foreign) and CSO contributions. Non-concessional financing was aimed at projects with the capacity to pay back.

Despite the effort to integrate the goals into its planning, monitoring and reporting systems, financing and resource mobilization remain a major challenge to accelerating implementation of the goals. Key challenges are highlighted below:

a) Weaknesses in alignment between planning and budgeting. For the last two financial years, an assessment of budget compliance to the SDGs done under the Certificate of Compliance found that the FY2018/19 budget is 63 percent compliant to the SDGs. This is a slight increment from the previous FY2017/18 budget (60.9 percent).

b) The national budget in a bid to finance the national development plan concentrates more on the expenditure side but is weak on how revenue will be innovatively mobilized from domestic sources (NPA, 2018). Although the ratio of tax revenue to GDP has improved from 11.7 percent in 1999/00 to 14 percent in 2017/17, it is still below the Sub-Saharan Africa average of approximately 16 percent and compares poorly with her regional neighbors. Challenges related to tax collection efficiency, compliance and tax administration remain hampering the level of DRM.

c) Weak project development and implementation capacity. The progress of implementation of NDPII core projects is unsatisfactory. Most of the projects are performing below NDPII schedule while others have completely failed to kick off. With regards to the core projects for example, 19 percent have not
yet started, 16 percent are at feasibility stage, 9 percent have been prepared, 53 percent are under implementation but below schedule and 3 percent are under implementation and on schedule (NPA, 2019). In order to access the various financial resources and instruments available in the region and beyond, the country will have to strengthen its capacity in preparation, appraisal, and analysis of projects.

Conclusions

This paper has shown that the three agendas all address similar development challenges including poverty, inequalities, environmental degradation and climate change, access to essential services (water, education, health and housing), infrastructure development, peace and partnerships among others. Despite this, they differ not only in operational timelines but also have different goals, targets and priority areas of action. In order to create synergies therefore and avoid duplication of efforts, Uganda will have to cautiously consider these similarities and variances in its planning, implementation and reporting. In this respect, the following recommendations are suggested:

a) Expand the roles of the SDG coordination framework to consider the continental and regional agenda. Although MEACA is responsible for implementation of the EAC vision activities, this framework through the various working groups will bridge the gap in mainstreaming EAC activities across sectors.

b) Incorporate the message of integration of the three agendas into communication strategies of the different stakeholders. The Ministry of Information and National Guidance will play a key role in taking lead together with other key partners.

c) Conduct a mapping of 142 indicators identified in the integrated regional indicator framework against the EAC Vision 2050 indicators. Where gaps exist, consider adding the EAC indicators. Furthermore, mapping should be done of the three agendas against the Uganda Vision 2040 targets to further localize the indicators to the Ugandan context. This full list of indicators therefore inform the integration of harmonized goals into National Development Plan results and reporting framework and used by the Uganda Bureau of Statistics to collect data, coordinate and report on the harmonized goals and indicators.

d) Strengthen the production, development and dissemination of quality statistics and improve statistical coordination

e) Enhance integrated monitoring and reporting on the frameworks on an annual basis with the incorporation of the goals into the annual reports;

f) On financing:

- Fast track the finalization of the Domestic Resource Mobilisation Strategy
- Strengthen alignment of plans and budgets
- Strengthen project development to ensure availability of bankable projects
- Leverage nontraditional sources of financing such as PPP, infrastructure bonds

References


Economic Commission for Africa, ARFSD. (2018). *Background paper on the subtheme “Strengthening the means of implementation and the partnership for sustainable development”.*


MOH. (2015). The Uganda National Tuberculosis Prevalence Survey. MOH.


National Planning Authority (NPA). (2016). REVIEW REPORT ON UGANDA’S READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 2030 AGENDA.


An Analysis of the Effects of Strategic Planning Practices on Disaster Management in Kenya (A Case of State Corporations)

1Linah Chepkoech Boit, 2John Bii, 3Njenga Gitahi & 4John Tanui
1,3,4Kabarak University, Kenya
2Kenya School of Government, Kenya

Abstract
This study sought to analyse the effects of strategic planning practices on disaster management in Kenya, with reference to State Corporations taking the survey research design. This was a pilot study of an ongoing study and a sample of 20 heads of departments from 4 state corporations based in Nairobi was reached. To obtain the data, semi-structured questionnaires were used. The data was analysed by descriptive statistics using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences. Findings indicate that a majority of government institutions have disaster management plans in place in accordance with the National Policy for Disaster Management. It was also found that a considerable number of institutions integrate disaster considerations in their strategic plans. The study further established that strategic planning practices employed by a majority of the institutions reached have positively impacted disaster management as indicated by considerable reductions in loss of life, financial loss and environmental damage. However, the study established that most institutions lack disaster management teams with skills required to carry disaster management activities.

Key words: Strategic Planning Practices, Disaster Management, State Corporations

Introduction
Strategy making is arguably the most important activity of a practising manager and is regarded as a unifying idea which links purpose and action. Strategy therefore combines the articulation of human goals and the organization of human activity to achieve those goals. White (2004) identifies a number of distinctive perspectives to strategic approach discussed hereunder; Firstly, strategy involves looking into the future, not simply focusing on the present or extrapolating what has happened in the past. Secondly, strategy tries to achieve a balance between flexibility and stability and so avoid either the straitjacket of excessive rigidity or the anarchy of repeated and random changes of direction. Thirdly, strategy emphasizes asking pertinent question as much as providing the answer. Fourthly, strategy is complex, dealing in highly intricate systems of cause and effect. Lastly, strategy is itself holistic in that it recognizes the many interconnections between superficially different aspects of business activity and different problems.

The concept of disaster has been defined by Nickerk (2013) as a sudden accident, event or a natural catastrophe that cause great damage or loss of life. Disaster management essentially deals with management of resources and information towards a disastrous event and is measured by how efficiently, effectively and seamlessly one coordinates these resources (Modh, 2010). Disaster management at the individual and organisational level deals with issues of planning, coordination, communication and risk assessment. At the very outset of the disaster life stages, development of certain strategies and plans are necessary as to stop or limit the impact of such unavoidable event. Organisations concerned with the management of disasters must be able to design pre-disaster goals (Nam, 2012). However, the real challenge is to recognize any such event in a timely fashion and implement coping strategies to limit their damage.
Background to the Study

A striking world-wide trend towards rising fatalities and economic losses due to natural and man-made hazards can be seen all over the world (Nojavan Et al, 2018). According to Canniff (2017), today’s disasters are often generated by, or at least exacerbated by human activities. At the most dramatic level, human activities are changing the natural balance of the earth, interfering as never before with the atmosphere, the oceans, the polar ice caps, the forest cover and the natural pillars that make our world a livable home.

The occurrence of disasters triggered by natural hazards has seen number of people affected and economic losses are rising in Africa. Hydro-meteorological hazards (drought, flood, windstorms, particularly tropical cyclones, landslides and wildfire), occur most pervasively and account for most of the people affected by disasters (Akali, 2015). African countries and regional organizations have made significant strides in addressing disaster risk reduction on the African continent. However, despite the development of policies, plans and legislation, disaster risk reduction in Africa remain low (Niekerk 2013). Most African countries have limited resources to invest in disaster risk reduction and minimal fiscal space to fund relief and recovery efforts after a major disaster.

According to Akali (2015), Kenya has been exposed to a variety of disasters and like many other countries in Africa and elsewhere in the world, Kenya has experienced an increase in the frequency of disasters over the past two decades. Mbogo E et al (2014) noted that the 1999 – 2001, drought was the worst in the last 100 years. It affected most parts of the country including some high potential areas in late 2000. Over 4.5 million people had lost their livelihood and had to depend entirely on relief food. Terrorism is without a doubt, one of the biggest challenges facing Kenya and the world in general, serving as major threat to security and the economy. Kenya has experienced a number of attacks in the recent past (Momanyi, 2015). The attacks include the 1980 terror attack at the Norfolk hotel in Nairobi where a total of 20 people perished and more than 80 wounded; the 1998 US embassy bombing in Nairobi and Dar es Salaam which targeted US citizens leaving over 200 people dead.

Kenya’s response to disaster has been ad-hoc and uncoordinated, and overly reliant on well-wishers (Owuor, 2015). According to a report by Nam (2012), the legislative and institutional framework on Disaster Risk Reduction in Kenya is fragmented, uncoordinated and many of the institutional mandates overlap. Nam (2012) notes that apart from the draft National Policy on Disaster Management and the National Disaster Response Plan, there is no single or series of laws or regulations pertaining specifically to disaster management, but rather a series of sectoral Acts, Regulations and Rules that support disaster management. The level of impact has become more severe with rising deaths of people and livestock, loss of livelihoods, destruction of infrastructure, and economic and environmental loss (Owuor, 2015). The impact of these hazards has often grown into wide scale disasters due to Kenya’s economic, social and political vulnerability.

Literature Review

Intervention by the absence of comprehensive and fundamental planning will have unpredictable, unexpected and subsequently unacceptable consequences (White 2004). Services are found disrupted right at the time they are most needed, so strategic planning has to include some solutions in order to minimize these types of operation disruptions in times of crisis. Strategic planning provides the appropriate
infrastructure for integrated, coordinated decision making following a disaster (CASITA, 2018). Hence, applying Strategic planning to disaster management can reduce the impact of a disaster. A major contribution of the strategic planning process to emergency and disaster management is the necessity of monitoring the nature and changing character of external forces and their impacts on the operations of an organization (Dillon, 2014). Therefore, the countries which have no structured comprehensive strategic plan would be confronting more problems.

According to Suda (2000), the ability to anticipate disasters before they occur and to respond to them expeditiously and effectively in a well-coordinated manner requires, among other things, the development of an efficient early warning system with state-of-the-art capabilities. As contained in the Draft National Disaster Management Policy, disaster preparedness is viewed as one of the disaster management strategies which involves the operation of an early warning system and consists of timely activities to minimize the effects of a catastrophe. Disaster preparedness is part of a mitigation measure and it lies along a continuum of other disaster management activities which range from relief and rehabilitation to recovery and reconstruction. Zorn (2018) notes that in actual practice the level of preparedness and the capability to reduce vulnerability to disaster largely depends on the developmental stage of a country or a community and the balance between the strengths and imperfections in the functioning of its sectors, structures and institutions. Suda (2000) further argues that although disaster preparedness is an important component of preventive development, its usefulness can only be determined, if the people who are so often affected by natural hazards are sensitized about the potential danger and empowered to respond effectively. Suda (2000) concludes that disasters are development issues, and that an effective disaster management strategy requires a shift in focus from relief and other short-term measures to a long-term, integrated, and multi-sectoral approach which incorporates recovery operations into existing development programmes.

As cited by Akali (2013), Kenya is a particularly disaster prone country and the disaster risks often affect the most vulnerable people disproportionately. In the pursuit of effective preparedness and timely response to disasters, the Government of Kenya through National Disaster Operations Centre has formulated a National Disaster Response Plan (GoK, 2009) that seeks to advance the activities that fall under Priority Area Number Five of the Hyogo Framework for Action 2005-2015 which is geared towards strengthening disaster preparedness for effective response at all levels. Akali (2013) identifies strategies and operational objectives to be implemented by responsible lead agencies during disaster response as follows; Ensure a collaborative and coordinated response to the disaster among all the stakeholders; Ensure food availability/security and good nutrition to affected populations in times of disaster; Ensure hygiene promotion, water supply, and proper sanitation; Ensure adequate health services and health systems infrastructure are adequate; Ensure availability of shelter and planned settlements as well as availability of non-food items to displaced populations following disaster. Based on the review, Akali (2013) recommended the following measures: Promotion of disaster awareness culture and capacity building for disaster preparedness at all levels; Awareness creation on the legal, policy and institutional framework on disaster risk reduction to be increased; Establishment of an institutional and legal framework for effective and efficient disaster management in the country; Promotion of linkages between disaster risk management and development establishing disaster relief trust; Strengthening disaster management institutions in the country through allocation of adequate resources; and Strengthen partnering with other agencies in the field of disaster preparedness and response regionally and internationally.
Successfully diffusing a crisis requires an understanding of how to handle a crisis before it occurs (Manyasi, 2016). As managers take significant time strategizing on how to achieve business or academic objectives according to the organization’s vision and mission, the same vigour ought to be used in planning for crises. Organisations ought to integrate crises management into strategic planning processes and statements of corporate excellence Karam (2018). The way teams are vital in performing varied organizational tasks, strategic planners should come up with various crises management teams with clearly defined team tasks. This can transform the organization from being crisis prone to being crisis prepared.

According to Aljuhmani and Emeagwali (2017), strategic planning is characterized as organizational activities that systematically discuss mission and goals, explore the competitive environment, analyse strategic alternatives, and coordinate actions of implementation across the entire organization. The goal of the strategic planning process is to design competitive strategies that enable the firms to define its position in the business environment. Crisis management has become consequential for organizations operating today (Aljuhmani and Emeagwali 2017), and the purpose of organizational crisis management is to make timely decisions based on best facts and strategic thinking when operating under extraordinary conditions.

The practice of commerce has been subject to more challenging and complex pressures in the modern world, therefore, any type of work that is not handled in a strategic manner will be severely weakened (Al-Khrabsheh 2018). As a result, strategic management involves retaining the idea of achieving corporate objectives and purposes while viewing the growth of a firm in terms of the corporate resources used. According to Aljuhmani and Emeagwali (2017, organizations are confronting changing difficulties at various times in this new millennium. The world is becoming smaller in operational extent due to progress in information and communications technologies and other modern advances. Strategic planning is critical to make sure that the organization is prepared to meet future difficulties. Modern strategy-oriented planning comprises a lengthy system for realizing a vision or managing future environmental conditions. Coombs (2014) asserts that management of a crisis must still be subject to good planning for appropriate responses. This will help company workers to improve their skills and allow the firm to survive as well as prosper. Although strategic planning also pursues the discovery of opportune prospects, its use during periods of crises can be of considerable profit to the company by affording it the ability to work and compete as well as own strength in dealing with risks (Pal et al., 2014).

**Methodology**

This study was anchored in the positivism paradigm because it seeks to objectively establish facts by empirically establishing relationships among variables. The researcher observed the principles of positivism by remaining neutral and external to the study. The proposed design for this study was survey research design. Survey research designs are procedures in quantitative research which are conducted to gather information that reflects population’s attitudes, behaviors, opinions and beliefs that cannot be observed directly (Mathiyazhagan & Nandan, 2010). The location of the study was Nairobi City.

This was a pilot study of an on-going study where 20 heads of departments from 4 State Corporations based in Nairobi were reached. State Corporations are semi-autonomous agencies under the National Government ministries and therefore their governance structures are heavily borrowed from the ministries. The average number of heads of departments in State Corporations is five, hence a target of respondents was five for each of the 4 state corporations. To obtain the data, semi-structured questionnaires were used.
The researcher mostly formulated fixed and open-ended questionnaires. The researcher was guided by the concepts of this study, theory and other previous studies to develop closed ended questionnaires as well as a few open ended ones. The study employed descriptive statistics in data analysis. This entailed the computation of frequencies, percentages, means and standard deviation. Inferential statistics were also conducted to determine the causal effect of strategic planning practice on disaster management. A regression model was thus adopted as hereby indicated:

\[ Y = \alpha + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + \beta_3 x_3 + \varepsilon \]

Where:
- \( Y \) = Disaster Management
- \( \alpha \) = Constant term
- \( \beta \) = Beta Coefficients
- \( x_1 \) = External Orientation
- \( x_2 \) = Internal Orientation
- \( x_3 \) = Functional Integration
- \( \varepsilon \) = standard Error

**Results**

The study sought to analyze the effects of strategic planning practices on disaster management in Kenya with reference to State Corporations in the National Government Ministries. To achieve the foregoing objectives, the study employed descriptive analyses.

**Descriptive Test Results**

The study first sought to evaluate the application of the variables under study among respondent institutions. This would give an overview of the most and least employed strategic planning practices by the institutions reached. To this end, respondents were asked to indicate their levels of agreement with pertinent statements relating to the influence of strategic planning on disaster management as experienced in their respective institutions. Responses were given on both a ‘Yes’ and ‘No’ basis, and on a five-point Likert scale (where 1 = Strongly Disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Not Sure; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly Agree). The mean scores of 0 to 2.5 have been taken to represent statements dissented upon by a majority of respondents while mean scores of between 2.6 to 5.0 have been taken to represent statements agreed upon by a majority of respondents. The strengths in disagreement or agreement are represented by the respective strengths of the mean scores. Findings are as hereunder presented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Descriptive Results on Disaster Management Plan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presence</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Timeline covered</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Five years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over five years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As presented in Table 1, the study sought to establish whether or not respondent institutions had a disaster management plan in the place, to which a majority (70.0%) affirmed. The study further found out that for a majority of institutions, the disaster management plan in place covers a time of one year (43.0%), while some affirmed to five years (36.0%) and only a few affirmed to over 5 years (21.0%). Accordingly, it was also established upon further probing that 42.9% of the institutions reviewed their respective disaster management plans annually. Asked on what informed the need for review, a majority cited emerging trends and other factors including lessons drawn from the preceding year.

It follows from the foregoing findings that indeed a majority of government institutions have disaster management plans in place. This is in line with the Draft National Policy for Disaster Management in Kenya (GOK, 2009) that aims at mainstreaming disaster risk reduction in the development process in Kenya, across both the public and private sectors with a view to strengthen resilience in coping with potential disasters. The existence of a disaster management plan among a majority of institutions indicates preparedness on the part of government institutions in disaster risk reduction activities.

The study also sought to find out the effects of strategic planning practices on disaster management. The findings from an on-going study by the same author with the unit of analysis as the Kenyan National Government ministries are as shown in Table 2 below.

**Table 2: Extent of Strategic Planning Practice**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>External orientation</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The institution collaborates with other ministries and agencies on matters of disaster management</td>
<td>3.9000</td>
<td>.96791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The institution is flexible and adapts to evolving disaster management needs</td>
<td>3.5000</td>
<td>.94591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internal orientation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety needs of all employees is guaranteed</td>
<td>3.9000</td>
<td>.78807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The institution has an insurance plan for its employees in the event of a disaster</td>
<td>4.3000</td>
<td>.73270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Functional integration</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a department that deals with disaster management issues</td>
<td>3.8000</td>
<td>1.10501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The department that coordinates disaster management activities has terms of reference clearly spelt out</td>
<td>3.3500</td>
<td>1.22582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is an active disaster coordination team specifically assigned to handle disaster management activities</td>
<td>3.1500</td>
<td>1.34849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The disaster management team has skills required to carry disaster management activities</td>
<td>3.3000</td>
<td>1.21828</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results of an on-going study, as presented in Table 2, found out that a majority of National Government Ministries employ strategic planning practice ($\bar{x} = 3.65$) in disaster management. A majority of respondents affirmed that with regard to external orientation, majority of the ministries collaborate with other ministries and agencies on matters of disaster management ($\bar{x} = 3.9000$); and that the ministries are flexible and adapt to evolving disaster management needs ($\bar{x} = 3.5000$) to a great extent. On internal orientation, a majority of respondents also affirmed that to a great extent a majority of the ministries have an insurance plan for its employees in the event of a disaster ($\bar{x} = 4.3000$); and that safety needs of all employees is guaranteed ($\bar{x} = 3.9000$) (Boit et al, 2019).

Functional integration was however found to be largely practiced to a moderate extent with a majority of respondents indicating that there is a department that deals with disaster management issues ($\bar{x} = 3.8000$); and that to a moderate extent, the department that coordinates disaster management activities has terms of reference clearly spelt out ($\bar{x} = 3.3500$); disaster management team has skills required to carry disaster management activities ($\bar{x} = 3.3000$); and that there is an active disaster coordination team specifically assigned to handle disaster management activities ($\bar{x} = 3.1500$) (Boit et al, 2019).

According to the Draft Disaster Management Policy (GOK 2009), the Government will play a lead role in the strategic planning and management of disasters in participatory collaboration with development partners, international agencies, and other bodies. The Kenyan Government functions through its ministries, Agencies and State Corporations. It therefore follows that strategic planning practices on disaster management have been incorporated in State Corporations. The Draft National Policy for Disaster Management in Kenya (GOK, 2009) aims at mainstreaming disaster risk reduction in the development process in Kenya across both the public and private sectors with a view to strengthen resilience in coping with potential disasters.

The study also sought to find out the effects of strategic planning on disaster management and its implications. The results from an ongoing study is shown in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Effects of Strategic Planning and Disaster Management</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategic planning has a great effect on disaster management</td>
<td>4.5500</td>
<td>.51042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster management has led to reduced loss of life</td>
<td>4.6500</td>
<td>.48936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster management has led to reduced financial loss</td>
<td>4.6500</td>
<td>.48936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster management has led to reduced environmental damage</td>
<td>4.6000</td>
<td>.50262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Mean</td>
<td>4.6125</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results of an on-going study, as presented in Table 3, found out that a majority of respondents from the National Government Ministries highly agreed that strategic planning has a great effect on disaster management ($\bar{x} = 4.6125$). A majority particularly highly affirmed that in their respective ministries, strategic planning has had a great effect on disaster management ($\bar{x} = 4.55$). It was also found that consequently, disaster management has led to a number of desirable outcomes including reduction in loss of life ($\bar{x} = 4.65$); reduction in financial loss ($\bar{x} = 4.65$); as well as reduction in environmental damage ($\bar{x} = 4.6$) (Boit et al, 2019).
According to the Draft Disaster Management Policy (GOK 2009) the Government will play a lead role in the strategic planning and management of disasters in participatory collaboration with development partners, international agencies and other bodies. The Kenyan Government functions through its ministries, Agencies and State Corporations. It therefore follows that strategic planning practices on disaster management have been incorporated in State Corporations. The Draft National Policy for Disaster Management in Kenya (GOK, 2009) aims at mainstreaming disaster risk reduction in the development process in Kenya across both the public and private sectors with a view to strengthen resilience in coping with potential disasters. The effect of strategic planning in disaster management is reduced loss of life, reduced financial loss and reduced environmental damage.

Inferential Statistics for Strategic Planning Subscales and Disaster Management

Table 4 presents the Pearson correlations for the relationships between the various subscales under Strategic Planning of on-going study. From the findings, a positive correlation is seen between each pair of subscale. Positive and significant correlations were obtained between Internal Orientation and External Orientation measures of strategic planning (r = .265; p<.005); and between Functional Integration and Internal Orientation (r = .314; p<.05). The correlation was performed at 95% confidence interval. The finding also confirmed the reliability results that Strategic Planning as a composite variable is internally consistent as a majority of the sub-scales are positively and significantly internally correlated (Boit et al, 2019).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4 Strategic Planning Subscale Correlation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functional Integration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

To establish the effect of various strategic planning subscales on disaster management, a regression analysis was conducted. As presented in Table 5, regression analysis of an on-going study produced the model summary, ANOVA and regression coefficients.
The results from the ongoing study showed a correlation value (R) of 0.474 which depicts that there is a linear dependence between the independent and dependent variables. With an adjusted R-squared of 0.201, the model shows that external orientation, internal orientation, functional integration explain 20.1 percent of the variations in disaster management while 79.9 percent is explained by other factors not included in the model. Analysis of variance was done to show whether there is a significant mean difference between dependent and independent variables. The ANOVA was conducted at 95% confidence level. The P-value of 0.000 implies that individual subscales making up strategic planning, have a significant joint relationship with disaster management, which is significant at a confidence interval of 0.01 level to 0.05 level. This also depicted the significance of the regression analysis done at 95% confidence level and can thus be used to assess the association between the dependent and independent variables (Boit et al, 2019).

The regression coefficients table further reveal that individually, only External Orientation has a significant effect on disaster management, keeping all other factors constant ($\beta = 1.888$, $t= 4.473$, $p = .000$). A unit change in external orientation would lead to a 1.888 change in disaster management *ceteris paribus*. This
can be attributed to a majority of ministries employing external orientation more that either internal orientation or functional integration. Since most ministries lack a function department dedicated to disaster management, most of them domesticate their disaster management plans and collaborate with other ministries and agencies on matters of disaster management. This is consistent with the Draft Disaster Management Policy (GOK 2009) which emphasizes Government role in the strategic planning and management of disasters in collaboration with development partners, international agencies and other bodies.

**Inferential Analysis for Strategic Planning and Disaster Management**

Table 6 presents the Pearson correlations for the relationships between the independent variable strategic planning practice and disaster management, which is the dependent variable from an on-going study. The results show that a positive and statistically significant correlation is observed between each pair of the independent variables and between the independent and the dependent variables. A strong, positive and significant correlation was established between Strategic Planning Practice and disaster management (r=.392; p<.01) (Boit et al, 2019).

The findings indicate a statistically significant linear dependence of disaster management on strategic planning practice. This implies that increase in strategic planning practice will lead to an increase in disaster management. As such, to improve on disaster management among national government ministries, pertinent and adequate resources ought to be allocated to strategic planning practice. According to the Draft Disaster Management Policy (GOK 2009) the Government will play a lead role in the strategic planning and management of disasters in participatory collaboration with development partners, international agencies and other bodies. The Kenyan Government functions through its ministries, Agencies and State Corporations. It follows therefore that there is positive and significant correlation between strategic planning practice and disaster management in State Corporations, hence the need to allocate more resources for strategic planning for disaster management to these State Corporations.

**Table 6 Correlation Matrix for Strategic Planning practice and Disaster Management**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strategic Planning</th>
<th>Disaster Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Planning</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaster Management</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.392**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

To establish the effect of strategic planning practice on disaster management, a regression analysis was conducted. Results from an on-going study are presented in Table 7. Regression analysis produced the model summary, ANOVA and regression coefficients. The results were also used to test the hypotheses of the study.
The results showed a correlation value (R) of 0.493 which depicts a good linear dependence between the independent and dependent variables. With an adjusted R-squared of 0.146, the model shows that strategic planning practice explains 14.6 percent of the variations in disaster management while 85.4 percent is explained by other factors not included in the model. Analysis of variance was done to show whether there is a significant mean difference between dependent and independent variables. The P-value of 0.000 implies that strategic planning practice has a significant joint relationship with disaster management, which is significant at a confidence interval of 0.01 level and 0.05 levels. This also shows that the regression model adopted is statistically significant and can thus be used to assess the association between the independent and dependent variables and to make further inferences (Boit et al 2019).

Further the regression coefficients table reveals that at 0.01 confidence level, keeping other factors constant, strategic planning practice has a significant effect on disaster management (β = .736, t= 4.345, p = .000). The study therefore concludes that there is a statistically significant effect of strategic planning practice on disaster management in Kenya (Boit et al 2019).

Strategic planning practice was found to be of considerable implication to disaster management (x̅=3.65) across a majority of the State Corporations. This implies that a majority of State Corporations orient their strategic plans both internally and externally by collaborating with other institutions and agencies on matters of disaster management and incorporating employee safety needs in their strategic plans in addition to having insurance plans for their employees. This may be attributed to the adoption of occupational safety and hazards policies and practices in addition to disaster management plans.
Functional integration is however inadequate in a majority of the State Corporations as most lack a department that deals with disaster management issues, an active disaster coordination team specifically assigned to handle disaster management activities, and a disaster management team with skills required to carry disaster management activities. Tran (2015) argues that successful companies invest in integrating environmental, social, and economic goals across the organization expecting each functional area to understand the effects of their activities, accept the responsibilities for implementation, and develop policies and practices for achieving these goals.

The on-going study also found that there is a statistically significant effect of strategic planning practice on disaster management in the ministries of Kenya ($\beta = .736, t= 4.345, p = .000$). This can be attributed to the cross-cutting nature of the concept and practice of strategic planning which entails identifying all the external and internal elements, which can affect the organization’s disaster management. Strategic planning is also a stronger factor as it sets priorities, focus resources, strengthen operations, ensure that employees and other stakeholders are working toward common disaster management goals, and assess and adjust the respective ministry’s direction in response to impending disasters.

The findings further imply that strategic planning practices employed by the State Corporations reached have positively impacted disaster management as indicated by considerable reductions in loss of life, financial loss and reduced environmental damage. This shows that a considerable number of State Corporations integrate disaster considerations in their strategic plans and collaborate among each other with a view to mitigate disaster. Some institutions for instance, incorporate employee safety needs in their strategic plans as well as having insurance plans. This may be attributed to the adoption of occupational safety and hazards policies and practices in addition to disaster management plans. It is however notable from the findings that most State Corporations lack disaster management teams with skills required to carry disaster management activities. As exemplified in the Draft Disaster Management Policy (GOK 2009), the Government plays a lead role in the strategic planning and management of disasters in participatory collaboration with development partners, international agencies and other bodies. The Kenyan Government functions through its ministries, Agencies and State Corporations. It therefore follows that strategic planning practices employed by a majority of the State Corporations reached have positively impacted disaster management as indicated by considerable reductions in loss of life, financial loss and reduced environmental damage.

Accordingly, Karam (2018) offers that organisations ought to integrate crises management into strategic planning processes and statements of corporate excellence. This is also in accordance with Lima et al (2013) who assert that emergency response can mean the difference between life and death. Well-defined strategies for recovery and reconstruction can reduce human suffering and financial losses by providing for rapid return to normal community functions. Karam (2018) particularly offers that the way teams are vital in performing varied organizational tasks, strategic planners should come up with various crises management teams with clearly defined team tasks.

The findings are also in accordance with Aljuhmani and Emeagwali (2017) who observe that strategic planning is characterized as organizational activities that systematically discuss mission and goals, explore the competitive environment, analyse strategic alternatives, and coordinate actions of implementation across the entire organization. Aljuhmani and Emeagwali (2017) argue that the goal of the strategic
planning process is to design competitive strategies that enable the firms to discover a position in the business environment. Crisis management has become consequential for organizations operating today, and the purpose of organizational crisis management is to make timely decisions based on best facts and strategic thinking when operating under extraordinary conditions. Coombs (2014) also agrees that management of a crisis must still be subject to good planning for appropriate responses. This will help company workers to improve their skills and allow the firm to survive as well as prosper.

Conclusions
It can be concluded from the foregoing findings that a majority of Government State Corporations have disaster management plans in place. In accordance with the Draft National Policy for Disaster Management, the existence of a disaster management plan among a majority of institutions indicates preparedness on the part of government institutions in disaster risk reduction activities. The draft policy calls for the mainstreaming disaster risk reduction in the development process in Kenya across both the public and private sectors with a view to strengthen resilience in coping with potential disasters.

The concept and practice of strategic planning which entails identifying all the external and internal elements, which can affect the organization’s disaster management. Strategic planning is also a stronger factor as it sets priorities, focus resources, strengthen operations, ensure that employees and other stakeholders are working toward common disaster management goals, and assess and adjust the respective ministry’s direction in response to impending disasters. study also concludes that there is a statistically significant effect of strategic planning practice on disaster management among the State Corporations reached. This can be attributed to the cross-cutting nature of the

The study also concludes that a majority of the State Corporations orient their strategic plans both internally and externally by collaborating with other government agencies on matters of disaster management and incorporating employee safety needs in their strategic plans in addition to having insurance plans for their employees. Functional integration is however inadequate in a majority of the State Corporations reached, as most lack a department that deals with disaster management issues, an active disaster coordination team specifically assigned to handle disaster management activities, and a disaster management team with skills required to carry disaster management activities.

Recommendations
Based on the foregoing findings and the conclusions drawn, the following recommendations are made to practice, policy and theory. The study has established that there is a statistically significant effect of strategic planning practice on disaster management in the State Corporations sampled. As such, it is recommended that in order to effectively carry out disaster management government institutions ought to enhance their respective strategic planning practice with particular regard to a combination of external orientation, internal orientation and functional integration. The institutions ought to enhance their collaboration with other government institutions and agencies on matters of disaster management; adopt flexibility to evolving disaster management needs; guarantee the safety needs of all employees; and have insurance plans for employees.

Whereas a considerable number of institutions integrate disaster considerations in their strategic plans with a view to mitigate disaster, most lack disaster management teams with skills required to carry disaster management activities. It is recommended in this regard that policy makers make it mandatory for every
government institution to have a team of disaster management specialists and that disaster management concepts including preparedness and early warning systems are incorporated in various professional training programs to equip employees with pertinent disaster management skills.

It is also recommended that the government ensures adequate budgetary allocation to funding both strategic and disaster management plans by government institutions particularly for staffing, staff training and application of pertinent technology. The study also established that government institutions adopt a proactive approach in the implementation of their disaster management plans as opposed to reactionary and piecemeal. It is therefore suggested that disaster management plans are regularly reviewed to capture current developments and that a more proactive implementation approach is taken by government institutions.

The present study was anchored on the Social Capital Theory which stresses the ability of people to work together for common purposes in groups and organizations and the incorporation of disaster preparedness and resilience or creation of new networks and activities focused on disaster and sustainable livelihood. In internal orientation, internal actions are seen to lead to stronger internal networks, bonding with employees, and social capital accumulated within the company. According to Aldrich & Meyer (2014), social capital is the ability of people to work together for common purposes in groups and organizations. Social capital has a great potential in disaster preparedness and resilience of individuals, community and nations thus provides opportunities to work together in the event of a disaster. The present study findings support the Social Capital Theory in that the State Corporations orient their strategic plans both internally and externally by collaborating with other institutions and agencies on matters of disaster management. They also incorporate employee safety needs in their strategic plans, in addition to having insurance plans for their employees.

The study was also underpinned by the Protection Motivation Theory which is organized as two mediating sub processes that consumers use in evaluating threats (threat-appraisal process) and in selecting among coping alternatives (coping appraisal). Assessments of threats (severity, vulnerability, and benefits) and coping factors (self-efficacy, response efficacy, and costs) combine to form a motivation in stakeholders to protect themselves from the risk. The present study supports Protection Motivation Theory due to the cross-cutting nature of the concept and practice of strategic planning which entails identifying all the external and internal elements as well as functional integration which can affect the country’s disaster management. This facilitates the continuous alignment of strategies within the ever changing environment.

The study was also grounded on the Contingency theory which suggests that management principles and practices are dependent on situational appropriateness. Different situations are unique and require a managerial response that is based on specific considerations and variables. Crisis management is extremely complex and full of uncertainty due to chaotic nature of disaster. In order to perform well in the crisis management, the government needs to consider both the environmental situations as well as internal conditions. This is supported by the present study findings that strategic planning particularly with regard to functional orientation has the potential to contribute significantly towards disaster management if adequate resource allocation is made towards development of a robust disaster management unit.
Suggestions for Further Studies

The present study analyzed the effects of strategic planning on disaster management in the Kenya. The analysis was however limited to one direct factor that is strategic planning which accounts for only 14.6 percent of the variance in disaster management while 85.4 percent is explained by other factors not included in the model. This implies that there exists a host of other underlying factors that possibly influence disaster management in Kenya. As such the study suggests that future studies be conducted with reference to a set of other direct and indirect variables in relation to disaster management in Kenya.

The present study was a pilot study and employed a sample size of 20 respondents, which ran the risk of large variability, bias or under-coverage. The full study will reach a larger sample size to address this limitation. The present study also focused on the national government level. It is suggested that future studies explore the study concepts at the county government levels with a view to determine any differences or disparity, including taking care of the views of all other actors in disaster management.

References

Aljuhman, H. Emeagwali, O. (2017). The Roles of Strategic Planning in Organizational Crisis Management: The Case of Jordanian Banking Sector


Organisational Knowledge Sustainability Concept: The Nexus between Knowledge Management and Organisational Learning

Wilberforce Turyasingura, (PhD)
Uganda Management Institute
Corresponding E-mail: wturyasingura@umi.ac.ug

Abstract

Knowledge management and organisational learning have received much attention in recent times, owing to the increased recognition which has been accorded knowledge as a source of organisational success and sustainability. However, while it seems clear that both KM and OL have the same goals, that is to nurture and harness knowledge resources, the concepts have tended, in the past, to be regarded independently of each other, with parallel strategies having been implemented for each. The current study examines the nature of the relationship between KM and OL, with the aim of providing a unified framework for understanding how the above-mentioned knowledge-based concepts relate to each other. A quantitative approach was used to achieve the set objective. Data were collected using questionnaires from 56 respondents, employed at 4 urban local governments in Uganda. Canonical correlation analysis was applied to the data. Empirical evidence confirmed that KM and OL have an interdependent relationship, which is manifested in two main dimensions, namely the institutional strategic focus and people (human resources) focus. Based on such dimensions, the study proposes a re-conceptualisation of the linkage between KM and OL aimed at evolving the two concepts into a single organisational knowledge sustainability notion.

Key words: Knowledge Management, Organizational Learning, Organizational Knowledge Sustainability, Uganda

Introduction

The importance of knowledge as a strategic source of competitive advantage (Petruzzelli, 2008; Karma 2006; Appelbaum & Gallagher 2000) has grown tremendously in the past two decades. This has been complemented by the increased recognition of the fact that organisations that will not learn faster will quickly lose competitive ground and disappear (Shenbagavalli, 2013). Consequently, both researchers and practitioners have concluded that Knowledge Management (KM) and Organisational Learning (OL) greatly influence organisational competitiveness and survival in this dynamic environment (Abdi et al, 2018; Vieira 2013). Whereas there seems to be a general consensus that KM and OL are critical for organisational performance, no such consensus exists on how they interact with each other to deliver that performance. In fact, Cavaleri (2004) argues that these two disciplines have been considered by their respective advocates to be two separate and distinct fields of praxis. The intention of this paper is to explore the interdependency of KM and OL with the view of advancing an Organisational Knowledge Sustainability (OKS) framework.

Central to this study is the fact that the convergence of KM and OL literature has been taken for granted, and the exact manner in which they are interdependent has not been clearly documented. In addition, previous research on KM and OL has mainly focused on business enterprises (Abdi et al 2018), higher education institutions (Turyasingura, 2011) and little attention has been paid to the Local Governments (LGs) where the bulk of service delivery takes places in most countries. There is therefore a need for an empirical investigation on how KM and OL are interdependent of each other in the LG setting. This paper articulates a position that knowledge management and organisational learning can be brought together both theoretically and practically through an understanding of their interdependence.

Review of Related Literature

If KM refers to any practice of creating, acquiring, capturing, sharing and applying knowledge (Lin, 2014) and OL is the process of improving action through better knowledge and understanding (Fiol and Lyles (1985) then the two concepts can be brought together in a unified framework. Pasteur, et al (2006) argues
that the ultimate objective of knowledge management and organisational learning might be quite similar, but the paths and methods to achieve those objectives considerably vary in thinking and practice. As a result, different strategies have been applied for each of these interventions. In fact, some authors (e.g. Wiig et al. 1997) consider organisational learning as a KM strategy, while others like McElroy (2000), assert that knowledge management is an implementation strategy for organisational learning. The confusion surrounding this linkage is exacerbated by other authors like Vera and Crossan (2003) who argue that practitioners are the main promoters of knowledge management, while organisational learning is concerned with the process of knowing and therefore theoretically oriented. The OL concept appeared earlier in organisational literature compared to that of KM. The first reference to OL was in 1960s and was popularised in the 1980s after the works of Argyris and Schön, (1978), but KM which only emerged in the 1990s (Pasteur, et al 2006) has attracted significant attention from both scholars and practitioners thus underlying its centrality in this competitive era.

At the heart of the matter is the fact that organisations can only be competitive if they “continuously learn and upgrade their knowledge assets in order to respond to the changing environment” (Appelbaum and Gallagher, 2000:40) This therefore means that in pursuit of a competitive advantage, organisations ought to implement KM initiatives and pursue strategies that will make them learning organisations thus underpinning the possible interconnection between the two. This study draws meaningful inferences from Huber’s (1991) framework, where we infer that organisational learning process constitutes knowledge acquisition, information interpretation, information distribution and organisational memory. Additional insights are drawn from Lyles’ (1998) perspectives that organisations learn when there is a change in their states of knowledge occurring through knowledge acquisition, dissemination, knowledge creation, knowledge refinement and knowledge implementation. When these two perspectives are contrasted with Davenport (1995) five processes of knowledge management and Filius et al’s (2000) KM processes, it raises OL and KM to almost the same level, at least theoretically. Davenport et al (1996) talk of understanding knowledge requirements, creating new knowledge, integrating knowledge created externally, applying existing knowledge, and re-using knowledge. While Filius et al (2000) focus on knowledge acquisition, knowledge documentation, knowledge transfer, knowledge creation and knowledge application. This apparent interconnection of organisational learning perspectives and processes of knowledge management raise the need for confirmation through an empirical investigation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisational Learning</th>
<th>Knowledge Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Huber (1991):</strong></td>
<td><strong>Davenport 1995</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OL includes: Knowledge acquisition, information distribution, information interpretation, organisational memory</td>
<td>KM entails: understanding knowledge requirements, creating new knowledge, integrating knowledge created externally, applying existing knowledge, re-using knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OL includes: knowledge acquisition, knowledge dissemination, knowledge creation and refinement, knowledge implementation</td>
<td>KM entails: knowledge acquisition, knowledge documentation, knowledge transfer, knowledge creation and knowledge application</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is more intriguing is the fact that some writers on the two concepts (organisational learning and knowledge management) seem to discuss one without the other and at best, the two are pursued parallel to each other especially in practice. In fact, some writers from the KM school suggest that OL is an entirely different discipline from KM.

Pasteur et al (2006) in a theoretical paper for KM development drew on Easterby-Smith and Lyle’s (2003) framework and argued that basing on the social construction of knowledge; knowledge is created and supported through the processes of learning by way of human interaction and situational embedding. In such a framework, knowledge and learning are co-dependent and cannot be separated. They go on to question whether it is still helpful to see them as separate disciplines given the linkages between learning and knowledge both in theory and in practice? They emphasised the need to draw from the richness of these two literatures and ensure greater alignment of organisational roles and strategies. This therefore creates the need to draw on both organisational learning and knowledge management under a unified framework. Pasteur et al, (2006) however did not take the process further to develop this framework and this leaves a void in their prescription of unifying the two concepts. Thus the hypothesis for research question for this study:

H1: There is an interdependent relationship between KM and OL underpinned by at least one dimension

Methods and the Context

This study applied a correlational design. The target population comprised of technical staff of Urban Local Governments (ULG) in Uganda. Four ULG were selected representing four major regions of Uganda (Western, Central, Northern and Eastern). ULGs in Uganda are structured in 7 divisions and 1 unit. They include the Administration division; the finance and planning division, the works division, the production and marketing division, education division, public health division, community based services division and the internal audit unit. Two personnel (the division head and one technical staff) were purposively selected amounting to 16 in each ULG and 64 in 4 ULGs. The researcher administered questionnaire was deployed and out of a sample of 64, only 56 questionnaires were returned fully filled and in a usable state representing a response rate of 87.5% Data were analysed using the Canonical Correlation analysis (CCA) technique. The CCA is a multivariate statistical technique that facilitates the study of interrelationships among sets of multiple variables (Hair, et al, 2010) and it is used to investigate relations among two or more variable sets. In a CCA analysis, the variables in each set are combined in such a way as to produce, for each set, a predicted value that has the highest correlation with the predicted value in the other set (Lew and Bruin, 2006). The canonical variate, which is the square of the canonical correlation, expresses the proportion of variance in each composite that is related to the pair of variables. CCA helps to understand the features of the overall relationship between a set of variables since the correlation will be analysed not only at individual correlations but according to critical dimensions of the inter-relationship. The technique provides an overall picture of the dimensions (or variates) underlying the relationships between the two variable sets (Davies and Kinaka, 2006).

Results and Discussion

This CCA procedure was executed using syntax in the SPSS programme version 20. It involved entering variable set 1 representing KM variables (knowledge documentation, knowledge transfer, knowledge application, knowledge creation, knowledge acquisition,), and variable set 2 representing OL (Individual
level learning, team level learning, and institutional level learning). Interpretation of the results was based on the following classical rules namely that canonical correlations with a loading value greater than .30 as the acceptable minimum loading value (Lambert and Durand, 1975) and canonical correlations with significant loadings.

Table 2: CCA Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Canonical correlation</th>
<th>Wilk’s λ test</th>
<th>Chi-SQ</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.749</td>
<td>0.341</td>
<td>264.009</td>
<td>13.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.390</td>
<td>0.682</td>
<td>30.011</td>
<td>6.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.082</td>
<td>0.233</td>
<td>1.314</td>
<td>2.000</td>
<td>.541</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above table, it is clear that only two canonical variates were found to be significant at 99% degree of confidence. The first canonical variate produced a correlation of 0.749, a Wilk’s λ of 0.341, chi-SQ of 264.009, p<0.000. The second canonical variate produced a canonical correlation of 0.390, a Wilk’s λ of 0.682, chi-SQ of 30.011, p<0.000. Results further show that, the first canonical correlation $R_{c1}^2 = 0.749^2$ contributed 56.1% of the variance ($R_{c1}^2$) while the second canonical correlation contributed 15.2 % of the shared variance ($R_{c2}^2 = 0.390^2$. The third canonical variate, which produced a correlation of 0.082, and a Wilk’s λ of 0.433, and chi-SQ of 1.314 is not significant. Based on Hair et al (2010), the most common practice is to analyse the canonical variates whose canonical correlation coefficients are statistically significant beyond a certain level usually 0.05 or above. From the above findings, only two functions have significant canonical correlation coefficient, 1 and 2, at 0.000. The third canonical function is therefore dropped from further analysis.

Table 3: Canonical loadings of KM and OL on Respective Canonical Variates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Canonical variates</th>
<th>V1</th>
<th>U2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canonical correlations</td>
<td>0.749</td>
<td>0.390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Squared canonical correlations</td>
<td>56.1%</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge management practices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge documentation</td>
<td>.420</td>
<td>.269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge transfer</td>
<td>-0.598</td>
<td>-0.762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge application</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td>.823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge creation</td>
<td>-0.411</td>
<td>.162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge acquisition</td>
<td>.441</td>
<td>.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisational learning dimensions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual learning</td>
<td>-0.432</td>
<td>.594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Team learning</td>
<td>.541</td>
<td>-0.647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional learning</td>
<td>-0.582</td>
<td>.239</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Exploring the first Dimension of the Interdependence between KM and OL: *Future focus orientation*
It is evident from the above results that the variables that are mostly associated with the first pair of canonical variates represented by V1 and U1 (see table 2) are knowledge documentation, knowledge creation, and knowledge acquisition from the KM set. From the OL set it is institutional learning that is mostly associated with the first canonical variate. These variables seem show an inclination towards institutional memory and knowledge preservation. Knowledge creation, knowledge documentation and knowledge acquisition are all practices that are implemented with focus on the future. It can be taken to reflect the strategic intent of the institution, which in turn determines the extent to which that organisation engages in KM practices identified under this dimension. This seems to support the view presented by Malhortra (1996) which states that the increasing complexity and rapidity of change of the environment dictates that organisations continuously learn new ways of doing things and adapt to the changes. Learning new ways implies getting new knowledge and innovation. Sustainability is a term that is used in reference to the future situation. Similarly, a practice of documenting knowledge is implemented with the underlying reasoning that in future that knowledge will be useful to the organisation. This is consistent with the call made by March (1991) on all organisations that they must continuously exploit their existing knowledge while at the same time exploring new knowledge in order to survive in this ever increasing competitive era. The exploring new knowledge is accomplished through knowledge acquisition.

The variable on the criterion set that is mostly associated with the first canonical variate is institutional learning. The possible explanation of this outcome is that through knowledge creation, knowledge documentation and acquisition the focus is on building institutional capacity for knowledge retention. In the same vein, Grant (1996) argues that competitive advantage is based on the firm’s or institution’s ability to integrate individual’s specialised knowledge into organisational memory.

Exploring the second Dimension of the Interdependence between KM and OL: People Orientation

In respect of the second pair of canonical variates represented by V2 and U2, it can be seen that the variables that are mostly associated with it from the KM set are knowledge transfer and knowledge application (see table 3). On the other hand, from the OL set, variables that were mostly associated with it are team learning and individual learning in that order of strength of relationship. These variables show an inclination to people focus. They imply a people perspective in their outlook. This is possibly because knowledge transfer or sharing as it is commonly understood, takes place when people are willing to do so. People cannot be forced to share knowledge with others; they cannot be coerced into transferring knowledge to other people as Connelly and Kelloway (2003:294) suggested, employees can receive suggestions on what and how much to share with their colleagues, but the final decision is always up to them. This probably partly explains why the first generation of KM that heavily relied on information technology failed to yield the desired benefits to organisations. The results confirm what Sabherwal and Becerra- Fernandez (2003) posited in their assertion that traditional emphasis of KM (first generation) focuses mainly on organising and making available important knowledge wherever and whenever it is needed. They go on to argue that increasingly, KM has incorporated managing important tacit knowledge. Tacit knowledge is unique in a sense that it is held in people’s minds, and because of that, it is hard to share or transfer. Transferring such knowledge therefore requires existing social relationship among people (individuals and teams) which are determined by continuous interactions that are in turn is influenced by trust and trustiness among people.

The second mostly associated KM variable on the second pair of canonical variates is knowledge application which is synonymous to what Skyrme (1999) called knowledge use. It can also be known as knowledge utilisation or knowledge exploitation. This process is vital in order to create value for organisations. It must be noted however that knowledge is applied through people who are the value creators for organisations. Armstrong
(2008) argues that the most important resource any organisation has is its people, who work either individually or collectively to help the organisation achieve its goals and objectives. Essentially, people hold the key to the success of any organisation through the application of the knowledge they possess.

Re-Conceptualizing the Interdependence of KM and OL: The Organizational Knowledge Sustainability (OKs) Perspective

Findings of this study seem to suggest that the way we look at knowledge management and organisational learning require a re-conceptualisation. This is precipitated by the fact that both of these knowledge initiatives have been treated separately by some practitioners and scholars; and strategies for their implementation have been implemented parallel to each other. This reason is usually advanced to explain their dismal success rates. The understanding from this study appears to indicate that when these knowledge interventions are implemented together with OL initiatives, their chances of success are improved. Joint implementation of both knowledge management and organisational learning strategies is largely based on the integration of the two dimensions that link them together. As explored above, these dimensions are the human resource orientation and the strategic focus. Literature is awash with assertions that people constitute a critical driver for knowledge management and organisational learning success. While it is true, it should be discussed in light of the institution’s future strategic intent, which is the future focus. An organisation that clings on the status quo has little incentive to pursue organisational learning strategies which are essentially change focused. But organisations which prioritise flexibility in the face of the changing environment are highly motivated to unlearn old ways and learn new ways of doing things in pursuit of their competitiveness and sustainability.

Since it is no longer a subject of debate that knowledge constitutes a key source of competitive advantage and sustainability, its continued exploration and exploitation should be a major pre-occupation of any modern and responsive organisation. Effective application of existing knowledge, while at the same time creating and acquiring new knowledge through promotion of learning activities at various levels of the organisation calls for a new understanding of this knowledge phenomenon. This notion may be referred to as Organisational Knowledge Sustainability (OKS) which emphasises proper utilisation of existing knowledge to serve today’s needs of the organisation, while mindful of the future knowledge requirements on the organisation. The pivot upon which organisational knowledge sustainability can be built is found in the human resource of the organisation and the activities implemented by the organisation in line with its future knowledge requirements. In line with this thinking, Su et al (2003) asserted that establishing strategies for developing organisational members’ learning ability requires two main issues, namely paying high regard to human resources and establishing an open learning environment. The former addresses the human resource orientation while the latter addresses the institutional activities geared towards creating an open learning environment.

Conclusions

The study set out to examine the interdependent relationship between KM and OL with a view of proposing a unifying framework for the two knowledge concepts. Findings revealed that organizations would benefit more if both KM and OL interventions are implemented in tandem. The two dimensions that seem to constitute the linkage between KM and OL are the human resource orientation and the futuristic focus. There is need for organizations to prioritize human resources in a bid to promote KM but at the same time constantly take stock of existing knowledge and put in place strategies to acquire more knowledge to meet future knowledge requirements. This is deemed to constitute the organizational knowledge sustainability phenomenon.
References


An assessment of Participants’ Perception of Public Private Partnerships in Uganda: A Conceptual Analysis of PPPs and Value for Money for Uganda National Roads Authority

Innocent Nuwagaba, (PhD)
Consultant, Uganda Management Institute-Kampala, Uganda

Abstract

The study assessed participants’ perception of Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) in Uganda through a conceptual analysis of PPPs and VFM for Uganda National Roads Authority. The study was guided by the quantity theory of Value for Money. Over the last few years, the use of contracting out model by UNRA has led to increased costs of road construction in Uganda which has failed government to realize VFM in the roads sector. The main objectives of the study was: To assess stakeholders’ perception of the use of PPPs to ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda. The sample size comprised of 126 stakeholders of UNRA. The data collected was analyzed by the researcher and the findings of the study revealed that there are difference opinions of the UNRA stakeholders’ regarding the concept of PPPs, VFM and the role of PPPs in ensuring VFM in the roads sector in Uganda. Based on these findings, the following recommendations were made: Based on this finding, UNRA needs to educate its staff regarding the concept of VFM and how it can be effectively applied and achieved in the current contracting out PPP model being used. Concerns of all major stakeholders in PPPs projects need always to be addressed by UNRA in time before questionable issues arise; for instance, excessive profit at the public expense and hence questionable value for taxpayer’s money in the roads sector in Uganda. UNRA should not use only contracting out model but also should endeavor to use other models that can to ensure more VFM such as design build operate and transfer. All such PPP models should always be used by UNRA based on the notion that any PPP model to be used by UNRA should always present enough opportunities for VFM.

Key words: Participants, perception, Public Private Partnerships, Value for money, Roads, Authority

Introduction

The concept of PPPs was not born with the digital revolution. Often presented abstractly as an essential element, it is rarely understood even if the digital revolution gives it all its meaning (Aghroum, 2018:1). Therefore, a rising demand for quality public infrastructures amidst financial constraints of governments has accumulated widespread favor for the concept termed as Public Private Partnership (PPP) (Khadka, 2018:1). The concept of PPP was first coined by British government as Private Finance Initiative (PFI) (Hu & Han, 2018:1). PPPs are different from privatization programs, as the objective of the contractual agreement with private partner is to improve the operational efficiency of Government assets rather than their perpetual ownership (Chauhana & Marisetty, 2018:1). However, some scholars such as Jomo et al. (2016:1) contend that PPPs cannot work as long as the objectives of public actors and private entities are still incongruent. In fact, Jomo et al., (2016:6) assert that the private sector only provides only a small proportion of financial resources of about 15% to 20% to fund implementation of PPP projects compared to the financial investment in PPPs implementation by the public sector in the developing world. Regardless of any general perception, PPPs are sometimes defined by the laws of each country, hence the importance of having a framework that clarifies these concepts (Berrone at al., 2018:14). VFM is a popular analysis tool widely used by public agencies to determine the success of the project delivered via PPP model, where VFM is the difference between the Public Sector Comparator (PSC) and the
Life Cycle Cost (LCC) of a PPP project. The PSC is commonly treated as the core quantitative component of VfM assessment (Zhang & Dong, 2017:1).

However, some scholars such as Jomo et al. (2016:1) are of the view that PPPs cannot easily produce results since the objectives of the public and private players tend to be contrary. Scholarly literature reveals that although PPPs are associated with many benefits to public and private sector stakeholders that are VFM related, they are also associated with a number of complexities and constraints which may water the realisation of VFM (SAIIA, 2005:7). The qualitative components of VFM, however, have not been considered seriously in VFM analysis due to lack of a valid mechanism characterizing and treating them. In addition to VFM analysis, many researchers pay much attention to evaluation of PPP projects from the perspectives of risk management and key successful factors for the performance of PPPs. Such aspects closely related to risks and performance are always non-financial and they tend to be qualitative (Zhang and Dong, 2017:2). On the other hand, the reviewed literature points out that with the right policies in place and government support, PPPs may enable countries to realise VFM in developmental project (World Bank, 2016 & SAIIA (2005:7). This study was guided by the quantity theory of Value for Money. This theory is relevant to this study since it aims at conceptual analysis of PPPs and VFM for Uganda National Roads Authority.

Problem Statement
UNRA as a government agency responsible management of all road construction and maintenance projects in Uganda has tried its best work with private partners through using the contracting out PPP model to ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda (Dentons, 2014: 1). However, the use of contracting out PPP model to ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda has had a number of issues which have hindered the realization of VFM in the roads sector in Uganda. According to the Auditor General report (2010:2), over the last few years, the use of contracting out model by UNRA could have partly led to the cost of road construction in Uganda to go up from $180,000 per km to about $ 1,000,000; a cost most stakeholders in the roads sector in Uganda think is grossly exaggerated leading to failure to realize VFM in the roads sector (Auditor General, 2010: 2). This reveals some gaps in the use of PPPs to ensure VFM in the road sector. This study, therefore, is intended to fill this gap so as to gain insight in the use of PPP to ensure VFM in the implementation of road projects in Uganda.

Purpose of the Study
To assess stakeholders’ perception of the use of PPPs to ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda.

Objectives of the Study
i. To establish UNRA stakeholders’ perception of the concept of PPPs and VFM
ii. To examine the use of PPPs in ensuring VFM in the roads sector in Uganda.

Literature Review
This conceptual review of PPPs and VFM focuses on critical analysis of literature on the different aspects of PPPs and VFM and examining scholarly writings and debates on different approaches to understanding the concept of PPPs (Mouraviev et al., 2016:169). This study was guided by the quantity theory of Value for Money. This theory was relevant to this study since it aimed at exploring the use of PPPs by UNRA to ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda (David, 2011:30). PPP projects are defined by space and time. Unlike indefinite privatizations, which can transfer to the private sector an entire system (transport or energy, for example) for an indefinite time period, PPPs transfer to the private sector certain responsibilities associated with a project bound by specific objectives, space and time (Berrone, Fageda, Llumà, Ricart, Rodríguez, Salvador & Trillas,
Many PPP studies have however tended to ignore analysis of the way different stakeholders understand the concept and terms related to PPPs and their adoption in the roads sector. From the scholarly literature reviewed, different scholars assert that due to increased pressure for efficient service provision from the citizens in addition to insufficient investments in public infrastructure, governments have adopted a new strategy of using PPPs (SAIIA, 2005:17; ADB et al., 2014:33-34). Such demand for infrastructure projects is necessary to uphold the development of the economy. This circumstance pressures the government to expand infrastructure expenditure. In order to alleviate the financial burden, the government has commonly used the PPP scheme to attract the private sector to invest in infrastructure projects (Yan, Chong, Zhou, Sheng & Xu, 2018:1).

This has made many governments appreciate the role of PPPs in service delivery (ADB et al., 2014:13). PPPs are different from privatization programs, as the objective of the contractual agreement with private partner is to improve the operational efficiency of Government assets rather than their perpetual ownership (Chauhana & Marisetty, 2018:1). However, some scholars such as Jomo et al. (2016:1) contend that PPPs cannot work as long as the objectives of public actors and private entities are still incongruent. PPPs are usually used by the government for provision of public services to the citizens in order to realize more VFM (Geng, Xu, Linc, Yin & Yan, 2018:1). Different scholars argue that due to increased pressure for efficient service provision from the citizens in addition to insufficient investments in public infrastructure by governments, a new strategy to deliver public services and ensure VFM has been embarked on (SAIIA, 2005:17; ADB et al., 2014:33-34). Value is created and captured primarily through a risk sharing strategy to allocate risks to partners that are best aligned with the resources of the respective partners and the alignment of control mechanisms with transaction attributes (Chunga & Hensherb, 2018:1). This has compelled many governments globally to acknowledge the role PPP plays in ensuring VFM in terms of promoting efficiency, effectiveness and economy in the provision of services to the citizens (ADB et al., 2014:13). In this case, literature reviewed showed that VFM is a popular analysis tool widely used by public agencies to determine the success of the project delivered via PPP model, where VFM is the difference between the Public Sector Comparator (PSC) and the Life Cycle Cost (LCC) of a PPP project.

The PSC is commonly treated as the core quantitative component of VfM assessment (Zhang & Dong, 2017:1). However, some scholars such as Jomo et al. (2016:1) are of the view that PPPs cannot easily produce results since the objectives of the public and private players tend to be contrary. Scholarly literature reveals that although PPPs are associated with many benefits to public and private sector stakeholders that are VFM related, they are also associated with a number of complexities and constraints which may water the realisation of VFM (SAIIA, 2005:7). The qualitative components of VFM, however, have not been considered seriously in VFM analysis due to lack of a valid mechanism characterizing and treating them. In addition to VFM analysis, many researchers pay much attention to evaluation of PPP projects from the perspectives of risk management and key successful factors for the performance of PPPs. Such aspects closely related to risks and performance are always non-financial and they tend to be qualitative (Zhang and Dong, 2017:2). On the other hand, the reviewed literature points out that with the right policies in place and government support, PPPs may enable countries to realise VFM in developmental project (World Bank, 2016 & SAIIA (2005:7).

**Research Methodology**

The researcher used a qualitative approach under a case study design followed by quantitative approach under the cross-sectional survey design (Baxter, 2008; Yin, 2009; Creswell, 2013). The study population consisted 100 key stakeholders of UNRA and 35 key stakeholders of UNRA for the quantitative part of the study (Shari, 2012).
A sample size of 91 respondents was targeted in the study and issued with a questionnaire using statistical tables of Krejcie, and Morgan (1970) and 35 respondents were interviewed. A combination of simple random sampling for quantitative part of the study and purposive sampling for qualitative part of the study was used. Primary data was collected using questionnaires and interview guides. While secondary data was obtained using documents review (Joubish, Kharram, Ahmed, Fatima & Haider, 2011). The qualitative data was analysed by use of narrations and descriptions (Braun & Clarke (2006) while quantitative data was analysed using descriptive statistics and inferential statistics. The SPSS was used to generate descriptive and correlation statistics (Ashatu, 2009).

**Study Findings**

This chapter focuses on presenting study findings and interpretation of the data collected and analyzed. The chapter is structured along UNRA stakeholders’ perception in the use of PPPs to ensure VFM in the as illustrated in tables 1 to 7.

### Response Rate

**Table 1: Response rate for study Participants from UNRA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Planned</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
<th>Short fall (%)</th>
<th>Total (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaires</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018) \( n=126 \). Table 1 shows that out of 126 respondents, only 97 responded to the study. 91 questionnaires were distributed to UNRA stakeholders. However, only 62 questionnaires were returned reflecting a response rate of 68%. All the 35 interviews were successfully responded to, reflecting a response rate of 100%.

### Demographic Characteristics of the Survey Study

**Gender of the Researcher’s Respondents**

The descriptive statistics for the gender of the respondents are presented in the Table 2 below:

**Table 2: Gender of Respondents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of respondents’ Gender</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid Male</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>70.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018) \( n=62 \). As illustrated in Table 2, the majority of the respondents were male representing 70.1% and the rest were female representing 29.9%.

**Age Group of the Respondents**
Table 3: Respondents by Age Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Respondents’ Age Group</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>43.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018) n=62. As illustrated in Table 3, the most predominant age group that responded to the researcher’s questionnaires was 30-39 representing 43.3%, followed by 20-29 representing 37.8% and 40-49 representing 8.9%.

Respondents’ Terms of Employment with UNRA

Table 4: Respondents’ Terms of Employment with UNRA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Respondents’ Terms of Employment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary staff</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract staff</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent staff</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others terms</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018) n=62

As illustrated in Table 4, the majority of respondents were permanent staff representing 67%, followed by contract staff representing 22%, temporary staff representing 9%, while staff employed by UNRA on other terms constituted 2%.

Respondents’ Level of Education

Table 5: Respondents’ Level of Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of respondents’ education level</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid Bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>48.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduate diploma</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>35.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master’s degree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctorate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As illustrated in Table 5, majority of respondents were Bachelor’s degree holders representing 48.4%, followed by those with post-graduate diplomas representing 35.5%, Master’s degree holders representing 14.5% and those with a Doctorate represented 1.6%.

Respondents’ Working Experience with UNRA

Table 6: Respondents’ working experience with UNRA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of respondents’ experience</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than 2 years</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>12.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 – 6 years</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 – 10 years</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 years and more</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>46.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018) n=62

Table 6 shows that the majority of respondents had working experience of 11 years and above (46.8%), followed by those of 3-6 years (29%), less than 2 years (12.9%) and 7-10 years (11%).

Quantitative findings for stakeholders’ perception of the concepts of PPPs and VFM

Table 7: Descriptive Statistics of Respondents’ Self-rating on Perception of PPPs & VFM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perception of the Concepts of PPP and VFM</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A PPP is a long-term contract between public &amp; private party for providing a product to the public while VFM is about providing such a product in a cost effective manner.</td>
<td>10 (16.1%)</td>
<td>36 (58.1%)</td>
<td>6 (9.7%)</td>
<td>10(16.1%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td>.932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A PPP is a long-term contractual arrangement between public and private sector to provide a service to the citizens while VFM is about providing such a service in an efficient manner</td>
<td>8 (12.2%)</td>
<td>20 (32.3%)</td>
<td>9 (14.5%)</td>
<td>25 (40.3%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2.94</td>
<td>1.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A PPP is a form of co-operation between a public and private entity to provide an asset to the nationals while VFM is about providing such an asset in an economical manner</td>
<td>3 (4.8%)</td>
<td>22 (35.5%)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>31 (50.0%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>1.074</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 7 above shows appropriate frequency tables, means and standard deviations about the respondents’ self-rating on the perceptions they had on PPPs and VFM.
A Public-Private Party Long-Term Contract and Cost Effective Product Delivery

The study examined the statement that “a PPP is a long-term contract between a public and private party for providing a product to the public while VFM is about providing such a product in a cost effective manner.” In all, 46 respondents representing 74.2% agreed with the statement compared to 10 respondents that represent 16.1% who disagreed. A total of 6 respondents that represent 9.7% were not sure about this statement. The good rating is confirmed by a good mean value = 2.82 and standard deviation = 0.932. This corresponded to some UNRA stakeholders’ perception of the concepts of PPP and VFM in the roads sector in Uganda who look at a PPP as a long-term contract between a public party and a private party for providing a product to the public. They also look at VFM as a cost effective way of providing such a product to the public. The scale was intended to measure perceptions of some UNRA stakeholders who look at a PPP and VFM from an angle of public-private party long-term contract and cost effectiveness of product delivery. As shown in the Table 7 above, Figure 1 below confirms the statistics generated.

**Figure 1: Public-Private Party Long-Term Contract and Cost Effective Product Delivery**

![Bar chart showing responses to the statement “a PPP is a long-term contract between a public and private party for providing a product to the public while VFM is about providing such a product in a cost effective manner.”]

**Source:** Primary data (2018) n=62.

As presented in Figure 3, 36 respondents that represent 58.1% agreed with the statement while 10 respondents that represent 16.1% disagreed. This confirms that the perception held by some of UNRA stakeholders is in line with what the researcher intended to measure.

Partners’ Long-Term Contractual Arrangement and Efficient Service Delivery

The study examined the statement that “a PPP is a long-term contractual arrangement between public and private sector to provide a service to the citizens while VFM is about providing such a service in an efficient manner.” In all, 28 respondents representing 44.5% agreed with the statement compared to 25 respondents representing 40.5% that disagreed with it. A total of 9 respondents that represent 14.5% were not sure about this statement. The fair rating is confirmed by a mean of 2.94 and standard deviation of 1.037, thus corresponding to other stakeholders’ perception of the concept of PPPs and VFM. They look at a PPP as a long-term contractual arrangement between the public and private sector to provide a service to the citizens and also look at VFM as an efficient way of providing such a service to the public. The scale was intended to measure perceptions of some UNRA stakeholders who look at a PPP and VFM from such an angle of a public-private sector long-term contractual arrangement and efficient service delivery. Figure 2 below confirms the statistics generated.
As presented in Figure 2 above, 28 respondents representing 44.5% agreed with the statement that a PPP is a long-term contractual arrangement between the public and private sector to provide a service to the citizens while VFM is about providing such a service in an efficient manner, compared to 25 respondents representing 40.5% that disagreed with the same statement. This confirms other UNRA stakeholders’ perception that a PPP and VFM is a public-private sector long-term contractual arrangement and efficient service delivery.

**Co-operation between Public-Private Entities and Economic Asset Delivery**

The study discussed the statement that “a PPP is a form of co-operation between a public and private entity to provide a certain asset to the public while VFM is about providing such an asset in an economic manner.” On this issue, 25 respondents representing 40.3% agreed with the statement compared to 31 respondents representing 50.0% that disagreed with it. A total of 6 respondents that represent 9.7% were not sure. The fair rating is confirmed by a mean of 2.06 and standard deviation of 1.074. Therefore, the above statistical results do not correspond to the majority of UNRA stakeholders’ perceptions of the concept of PPPs and VFM in the roads sector in Uganda. Such stakeholders do not look at a PPP as a form of co-operation between a public and private entity to provide an asset to the public. They also do not look at VFM as an economic way of providing such an asset to the public. The scale was intended to measure perception of the rest of UNRA stakeholders who look at a PPP and VFM from such an angle of co-operation between a public and private entity and as an economic asset delivery. As shown in the descriptive statistics, Figure 4.8 below confirms the statistics generated.

As presented in Figure 3 above, 28 respondents representing 40.3% agreed with the statement compared to 31 respondents representing 50.0% that disagreed with it. This confirms the perception held by the majority of UNRA stakeholders that a PPP is a public-private entity co-operation and an economic asset. This finding is not in agreement with what the researcher intended to measure.
Qualitative Findings on the Role of PPPs in Ensuring VFM in the Roads Sector in Uganda

During interviews with respondents concerning the role of PPPs in ensuring VFM, the majority of them said that “Since PPPs are about government working with private companies to provide services to the people, then provision of such services should be done in a more effective and efficient manner to ensure VFM.” Other respondents said that they did not know because it was their first time to hear about such a term. They however doubted whether contracting out PPP model leads to VFM in the roads sector since it is associated with a lot of cases of corruption. For instance one of the respondents said:

“Are you really living in Uganda? Why not! Definitely some corruption issues cannot miss when it comes to implementing some PPPs in the roads sector since some times it’s hard for us to win some PPP road construction tenders without first cooperating well with those who matter in this country.”

Another Respondent observed: “Although I am not sure because officially it is not yet confirmed, there is a rumor that the reason why PPPs that had been originally planned to be used in the construction of the Kampala-Entebbe express highway, were not used to finance that project is because the private investor who had at first been solicited to handle the project was discouraged after one official from UNRA’s former management team requested for a bribe before the contract could be endorsed. So government had no alternative but to get a loan from Exim Bank of China so that it could be able to go ahead with the implementation plan of the project. Respondent 3 lamented: “I suspect the reason why the Kampala-Jinja express highway has delayed to start since 2015 could be because there might be someone standing in its way so that something can be done for him first before the project is allowed to commence.”

From the above responses, it can be observed that the qualitative findings highly concur that PPPs have strong effect on VFM in the roads sector and so the results were obviously in line with what the researcher intended to measure.

Discussion of the Study Findings

Findings revealed that respondents’ ratings on UNRA stakeholders’ perception of these concepts was average with Mean = 3.21 and Median = 3.17. The opinions ranged from 2.97 to 3.44 at 95% Confidence Interval for Mean. The difference in opinions on low and high levels of the UNRA stakeholders’ perception of the concept of PPPs and VFM was at 3.00 and is supported by the standard deviation of 0.856. The findings revealed that 74.2% agreed that a PPP is a long-term contract between a public and private party for providing a product to the public while VFM is about providing such a product in a cost effective manner. This implies that the perception held by some UNRA stakeholders on these concepts is truly in line with what the researcher intended to measure. This finding agrees with debates by scholars and development partners such as Qistina & Salmiah, (2018:1), European Commission (2003:16) and World Bank Group (2014:14) who assert that a PPP is a long-term contract between a private party and a government entity for providing a public asset or service, in which the private party bears significant risk and management responsibility, and remuneration is linked to performance. Secondly, it was revealed that 44.5% agreed with the statement that a PPP is a long-term contractual arrangement between public and private sector partners to provide a service to the public while VFM is about providing such a service in an efficient manner. This indicates that the perception held by some UNRA stakeholders who look at a PPP and VFM from an angle of a public-private sector long-term contractual arrangement and efficient service delivery respectively, is in line with what the researcher intended to measure.
This finding of the study agrees with Khadka (2018:1), Krol (2018:21), Qistina and Salmiah (2018:2), Stevenson (2018:7), Mehmet and Cuma (2018:4), Alaghbandrad and Hammad (2018:1), Marzouk and Ali (2018:3) and Garvin and Bosso (2008:163) who suggest that a PPP is a long-term contractual arrangement between the public and private sectors where mutual benefits are sought and ultimately the private sector provides management and operating services which puts private finance at risk. In addition, this finding agrees with debates from development agencies who assert that this has compelled many governments globally to acknowledge the role PPP plays in ensuring VFM to promote efficiency, effectiveness and economy in the provision of services to the citizens. Finally it was discovered that 40.3% agreed that a PPP is a form of co-operation between a public and private entity to provide certain assets to the public while VFM is about providing such an asset in an economic manner. That implies that the perception held by UNRA stakeholders who look at a PPP and VFM from an angle of a public-private entity co-operation and economic asset delivery, is in line with what the researcher intended to measure. This finding agrees with Yan, Chong, Zhou, Sheng and Xu, (2018:1), Chauhana and Marisetty (2018:3), Guofeng, Qingjuan and Kedi Wang (2018:1), Chunga and Hensherb (2018:2), Badasyan and Alfen (2018:3) and Lukamba (2006:26) who contends that a PPP is a form of co-operation between public authorities and the world of business to provide infrastructure and that VFM is a concept used to assess an organisation’s capacity to obtain the maximum benefit from the goods, services or work it acquires or provides, in relation to the resources available to it.

Conclusion
There are difference in opinions on the UNRA stakeholders’ perception of the concept of PPPs and VFM and how PPPs ensure VFM in the roads sector in Uganda, which can be attributed to the different levels of knowledge and experience of what PPPs are held by the different stakeholders of UNRA.

Recommendations
From study findings, majority of the UNRA stakeholders were of the view that that a PPP is a long term contract between government and private companies, while VFM is where a product is delivered to the citizens in the most cost effective manner. Based on this finding, UNRA needs to educate its staff regarding the concept of VFM and how it can be effectively applied and achieved in the current contracting out PPP model being used. From study findings, majority of the UNRA stakeholders were of the view that UNRA’s use of contracting out PPP model has led to a lot of corruption cases in the roads sector in Uganda. Based on this finding, Concerns of all major stakeholders in PPPs projects need always to be addressed by UNRA in time before questionable issues arise; for instance, excessive profit at the public expense and hence questionable value for taxpayer’s money in the roads sector in Uganda. UNRA should not use only contracting out model but also should endeavor to use other models that can to ensure more VFM such as design build operate and transfer. All such PPP models should always be used by UNRA based on the notion that Any PPP model to be used by UNRA should always present enough opportunities for VFM.

References
Amin, E. 2005. Social Science Research, Makerere University Printery, Kampala, Uganda.
Andrew, B. 2013. The Public Private Partnership model in the UK: PFI in the UK and PPP in Europe


Braun, V. & Clarke, V. 2006. Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology


Commission of inquiry, 2016. Alleged corruption, mismanagement and abuse of office at UNRA


Creswell, J. W. & Plano, C. 2011. Sequential exploratory mixed methods research design


David, L. 2011. Professor Fisher and the Quantity theory of value for money: Research Report Series, Social Science Centre, Department of Economics, the University of Western Ontario, Canada
Freeman, R. E., Harrison, J. S., Wicks, A. C., Parmar, B. L. & De Colle, S. 2010. Stakeholder theory.
Goldkuhl, G. 2012. Pragmatism vs interpretivism in qualitative information systems
Guofeng, M., Qingjuan, D. & Kedi, W. 2018. A Concession Period for PPP Projects:
Harris, R. 2004. Setting PPP prices as a factor for managing costs” by governments for efficiency
Jamali, D. 2004. Success and failures mechanisms of PPPs in Developing countries:
Jean, S., Anne, S., Pam, s. & Peter, M. D. 2008. Financing black holes: Accounting Roads in the UK.
Leedy, D. P. & Ormrod J, E. 2014. Practical Research Planning and design. Edinburg Gate, England:


Pansiri, J. 2005. Pragmatism: A methodological Approach to researching Strategic Alliance


Ssebugwawo, A. 2012. Investigation of variations in paved road construction unit rates
Strukelj, E 2018. Writing a Systematic Literature Review; journal of European Psychology students.
Stake, R. E. 1995. The art of case study in research methodology for academic researchers. Sage
Teddlie, C. & Tashakkori, A. 2009. Overview of contemporary issues in mixed methods research. Tony, B. K.
2013. Uganda Transport Infrastructure and the Public-Private Partnerships: Turkey, Treaquest, D., Won,
Wannop, U. 1990. The GEAR Project: A Perspective on the Management of Urban Regeneration,
Weaver, C. and M. Dennert (1987). Economic Development and the Public-Private Partnership,
Monitoring and Evaluation Processes Critical to Service Provision in South Africa’s Rural-Based Municipalities

Prof. Betty C Mubangizi
School of Management, IT and Governance
University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa
Corresponding E-mail: mubangizib@ukzn.ac.za

Abstract
South African municipalities are at the coalface of service provision, with communities relying on municipal performance for life-impacting services. The impact of effective service delivery or the lack thereof is particularly significant for the poor who generally lack safety nets to cushion themselves against the inadequacies of poorly resourced, mainly rural, municipalities. Although municipalities are distinct entities, they rely on other levels of government for important resources. Further, municipalities draw on the support of other non-government actors to provide public services. In such a scenario, where variously positioned actors contribute to the attainment of the public good, the role of monitoring and evaluation (M & E) is critical as it ensures compliance by each of the role-players in the effective delivery of basic services to communities. What are the complexities of service delivery and the processes through which M & E takes place in rural municipalities? How are the beneficiaries of municipal services included in M & E, and what might be the critical contributors to a functional and all-inclusive M & E process in rural-based municipalities? This conceptual paper, posited in complex systems theory, draws on relevant literature to answer these questions. The conclusion drawn is that while current M & E process are, mainly, monitored through statutory structures; non-statutory structures formed out of ad hoc self-organising models can provide useful forums for monitoring municipal service provision for sustainable livelihoods.

Key words: Rural Municipalities; Partnerships in Service Provision; Monitoring and Evaluation; Community Participation

State of Local Government in South Africa
To understand the challenges that rural municipalities are faced with and the need for a unique Monitoring and Evaluation (M & E) Model, it is necessary to get an understanding of the state of local government in the country. South Africa comprises 278 municipalities. Of these, 8 are metropolitan, 44 are district and 226 are local municipalities. Many of these local municipalities are in small towns with a vast hinterland of small villages. Municipalities have the mandate to focus on growing local economies and providing infrastructure and basic services. While municipalities draw on the national government to provide the much needed finances to provide infrastructure and services, it is expected that municipalities fund their mandated responsibilities. Being the sphere of government closest to the people, it is to be expected that a core function of municipalities is the rendering of a variety of basic but essential services to the community within their jurisdiction (Koma 2010:113). The mandate of South African municipalities is succinctly captured in key legislation and policies.

The provision of services by municipalities is a constitutional obligation. Part B of Schedule 5 of South Africa’s Constitution – concerning functions falling concurrently within the national and provincial competence constituent units – identifies the following services within the ambit of local government (LG) and municipalities: water; electricity; town and city planning; road and storm-water drainage; waste management;
emergency services such as fire fighting; provision of licences; fresh produce markets; parks and recreation; security; libraries; and economic planning. Part B of Schedule 4 of the Constitution further identifies the following areas to be the responsibility of municipalities: air pollution; building regulations; child-care facilities; and electricity and gas reticulation – in addition to local tourism; municipal airports; municipal planning; municipal health services; municipal public transport; and municipal public works (RSA 1996).

Furthermore, the mandate for LG is explicit in the preamble to the Local Government: Municipal Structures Act, 1998 (Act 117 of 1998) as:

> A vision of democratic and developmental local government in which municipalities fulfil their constitutional obligations to ensure sustainable, effective and efficient municipal services, promote social and economic development, encourage a safe and healthy environment by working with communities in creating environments and human settlements in which all our people can lead uplifted and dignified lives.

Lastly, the White Paper on LG asserts that “basic services enhance the quality of life of citizens and increase their social and economic opportunities by promoting health and safety, facilitating access to work, to education, to recreation and stimulating new productive activities” (Ministry for Provincial and Constitutional Development 1998:92).

All these legal and policy expectations of municipalities require funding, and a good revenue base is vital for municipalities to function effectively and efficiently. In highlighting the fundamental problem in the finances of local municipalities, Steytler (2005:199) points out that, at 80.6%, the operating expenditure of local municipalities accounts for the bulk of their budgets – with the paltry remainder devoted to capital budgets. Steytler further points out that, of the operating budgets, salaries of municipal workers take up the largest share at 32.9%, and yet LG receives only 17% of its revenue from national government. There is a further source of revenue for municipalities in the form of grants and an equitable share of revenue raised nationally. However, there is significant pressure on LGs to raise their own revenue and become self-sufficient – and herein lies the challenge for most rural-based municipalities.

Several urban-based municipalities have a good revenue base in the form of property rates, service payments and other taxes. However, as observed in a 2009 Cooperative Government and Traditional Affairs (COGTA) report:

> Local Municipalities are very vulnerable both from a revenue generation and from an institutional development perspective. They are located in economically depressed areas and have difficulty in attracting and retaining skilled managers, professionals, and technicians. It follows that some of these municipalities are seriously challenged to fulfil their obligations. They may be financially non-viable, articulate distress via heightened levels of community protests, and be particularly vulnerable to political control and poor institutional management and compliance (COGTA 2009:22-21).

There are other factors that typically prevent local municipalities from attaining self-sufficiency and effectively delivering on their mandate. A few are outlined below:

**Unfunded Mandates:** These occur when municipalities take on responsibilities they cannot perform, as is usually the case when municipalities are expected to implement policies crafted by national government. This legal framework is intended to prevent municipalities from receiving ‘unfunded mandates’, but as Atkinson (2003) notes, these measures do not guarantee adequate protection against unfunded mandates. These ‘unfunded
mandates’ weaken municipalities financially and are a drain on local government’s administrative capacity. A case in point is the indigent policy whose aim is to alleviate poverty in disadvantaged communities, by providing free basic water (at least 6 kilolitres per month), free basic electricity (at least 50 kWh per month), and subsidised sewerage and sanitation as well as solid waste management (Statistics SA 2017). Even with the equitable share from national revenue that municipalities receive, it severely constrains those municipalities (mainly rural-based) that have a significantly high level of indigents (Arntz, Botes, and Bekker 2003).

**Skills Shortage:** While studying the profiles of several municipalities in South Africa, Koelble and LiPuma (2010) noted a severe skills shortage in financial and technical matters at the local level and a lack of enforcement mechanisms to oversee the financial processes of the municipalities. They further noted this was most visible in the poor and rural areas of the country. This was echoed by Robinson (2007), who, in recommending service improvement in municipalities, highlighted the value of a skilled resource base in municipalities – advising that increasing efficiency and performance of poorly resourced municipalities requires requisite skills to manage complex planning, implementation, and M & E.

**Revenue Collection:** This relates to the amount of money collected as a percentage of the amount billed. Fjeldstad (2004:542) observes that revenue collection levels have worsened in many municipalities in recent years – despite the Masakhane campaign launched by government in 1995. The role of this campaign was to, *inter alia*, accelerate the delivery of basic services and housing, stimulate economic development in urban and rural areas, and promote the payment of municipal rent and service charges (Fjeldstad 2002). While the inability to pay for services is a significant part of low revenue collection levels, the credibility of the enforcement mechanisms and penalties imposed on defaulters affect citizens’ ability to pay service charges. Enforcement mechanisms and the imposition of penalties all relate to a complex administrative process that many rural municipalities may not be privy to.

The disturbing state of municipalities in South Africa was recently articulated in the Attorney General of South Africa’s (AGSA) 2018 Report. In May 2018, the AGSA reported an overall deterioration in the audit results of South Africa’s municipalities for 2016–17. The report points to, *inter alia*, shortcomings in the development and maintenance of infrastructure. Specifically, the AGSA’s audits identified several shortcomings in the development and maintenance of infrastructure by municipalities. These included the under-spending of grants, delays in project completion, poor quality workmanship, and inadequate monitoring of contractors:

> These are symptoms of the larger problem that local government has with managing finances, performance and projects and with taking accountability for outcomes. Although funding and support are generally available from national government for the development and maintenance of municipal infrastructure, the non-delivery thereof at some municipalities and the impact on communities are the issues that need the most focused attention by all role players to ensure that the objective of a better life for all is achieved (AGSA 2018).

This directly impacts the wellbeing of the citizenry, in that it significantly affects the basic services of water, sanitation and transport – not to mention that less effort is directed to investment in resources for local economic development. A situation of this nature, where inadequate service delivery by poorly resourced municipalities is a result of a complexity of causes and where, by extension, the solution itself lies in collaboration by a complexity of actors – requires that the planning, implementation and M & E be assiduously adhered to. We look to complex system theory to enable us to problematise M & E mechanisms in poorly resourced, mainly rural, municipalities – with a view to operationalising possible solutions. A discussion of the complex systems theory now follows.
Theoretical Framework

The complex systems theory is a helpful approach within which to frame an M & E model for poorly resourced municipalities. Complex systems theory proposes that the world is affected by many variables that interact strongly with each other, unlike the more traditional systems theory that assumes that a few variables, interacting weakly with each other, determine the behaviour of actors and outcomes of activities within systems (Liebovitch 1998). For Svyantek and Brown (2000), this nonlinear view of systems used to describe complex systems’ behaviour that originated in physics and chemistry, and is commonly known as chaos theory or complexity theory. As the discussion will show, South African municipalities, by necessity, engage in complex systems of horizontal and vertical partnerships in their pursuit of effective and efficient service provision. As Koch and Laurent (1999) advise, from a natural science perspective, explaining the behaviour of such a complex system requires an understanding of the variables determining the system’s behaviour, the patterns of relationships among these variables, and the fact that these patterns and the strengths associated with each relationship – may vary depending on the lifecycle and phase of the activities in the partnerships. Partnerships, by necessity therefore, exhibit multi-level and multiphase phenomena. Loorbach (2007) and Rotmans and Loorbach (2008) in Loorbach (2010: 167-168), have formulated several principles as a form of governance based on complexity theory. These principles offer insight into how M & E could be best conceptualised. With respect to M & E, the four main tenets are worth pointing out: Objectives should be flexible and adjustable at the system level. The complexity of the system is at odds with the formulation of specific objectives and blueprint plans. While being directed, the structure and order of the system are also changing, and so the objectives set should also change. Steering from the “outside” a societal system is not effective: Structures, actors, and practices adapt and anticipate, such that these should also be directed from “inside”. A focus on (social) learning about different actor perspectives and a variety of options (which requires a wide playing field), is a necessary precondition for change. Participation from and interaction between stakeholders is a necessary basis for developing support for policies, but also for engaging actors in reframing problems and solutions through social learning. Against this backdrop, the discussion proceeds to highlight areas in municipalities where multiple actors are drawn upon to deliver services. First, however, attention is drawn to the methodology used in the study.

Research Methodology

A qualitative research methodology was used, through content analysis. Thus, desktop research was used to explore how M & E processes take place in municipalities and the critical contributors to a functional and all-inclusive M & E in rural municipalities. A review of books, journal articles, newspaper articles and internet sources was done, while the relevant texts were analysed thematically to help provide insight into the manner in which M & E processes are being handled in rural communities, and the various challenges limiting their effectiveness.

Partnerships and Relationships in the Delivery of Rural Public Services

In delivering on their mandate, municipalities draw on intergovernmental relations between the three spheres of government. Municipalities benefit from the oversight role of the provincial and national spheres and from financial transfers from national government – including the much needed oversight role of the AGSA.

Partnerships in South Africa’s municipalities have long been a modality in delivering services. Indeed, the White Paper on Local Government recommends that municipalities look for innovative ways of providing and accelerating the delivery of municipal services. It is in this regard that White Paper on Municipal Service Partnerships of 2004 provides a framework within which to leverage and marshal the resources of public
institutions, CBOs, NGOs, and the private sector toward meeting the country’s overall development objectives. Many writers having mused about the value and quality of such partnerships - see Farlam (2005); Akintoye, Beck, and Hardcastle (2008); and Ruiters and Matji (2016).

The main partnership arrangement municipalities engage in, is partnering with other levels of government through intergovernmental relations – as provided for in Section 41(2) of the Constitution (RSA 1996). The national sphere of government bears the responsibility of regulatory oversight. This sets the framework for general socio-economic development, and, specifically, the delivery of basic services. The provincial and local spheres have to fit into this policy framework. In addition, the national government provides some of the finances for service delivery, while provincial government oversees execution of the plans and programmes in the national government’s policy framework. Lastly, the local government sphere is the implementing agent of those activities that specifically fall within the ambit of Schedule B, which was discussed earlier. Often, however, policy decisions are delegated to local municipalities, which are sometimes not adequately equipped to deliver the services.

However, this linear relationship is not the only one through which municipalities function. There is often a network of parties and stakeholders, and municipalities have dyadic linkages with many service providers external to them. In such partnerships in service delivery, agents like civil society organisations and private companies innovate to save costs, and thus develop capacity for future sub-contracting – so increasing their entrepreneurial confidence. At the same time, the image of LG improves. Awortwi (2003) emphasised the range of skills required by LGs to improve governance of multiple forms of service delivery – for example, equipping staff with skills to manage contracts, implementing by-laws and sanctions, and improving negotiation skills to achieve better terms and build consensus as well as M & E skills. A snapshot of areas where municipalities typically engage in partnerships is provided below:

**Provision of Housing:** Is a synchronised national and provincial competency. However, in many instances all three spheres of government take the responsibility – even when it is not the task of LG (SA Cities Network 2007:12). Basic service delivery such as electricity, sanitation and water are the sole responsibility of municipalities and yet the delivery of these services has to fall within the policy framework of the national Departments of Energy and Department of Water Affairs respectively. The level of overlap and depth of grey areas in the responsibilities and functions of the three spheres suggests that one sphere’s activity influences and determines the ability of local municipalities to effectively and efficiently deliver services.

**Delivery of Water and Sanitation:** Matibane (2010) studied improving service delivery through partnerships between LG, civil society and the private sector within Imizamo Yethu Township outside Stellenbosch in South Africa. It was observed that LG, civil society and the private sector could, through partnership, work together to mitigate the situation in the particular community – while further noting that many civil society organisations, business organisations and LG departments, although involved in service delivery and development in Imizamo Yethu, operate in isolation of each other (Matibane 2010:85). Forums by means of which local government, civil society organisations and business can work together should be formed. Such forums could assist in terms of devising a strategy to provide services, and disseminate information in a clear and structured manner. Furthermore, such forums would play the much needed oversight role for, as Ruiters and Matji (2016) advise, the lack of technical and financial skills and monitoring of the private operator are serious challenges.

**Formulation of Integrated Development Plans (IDPs):** In a study on compliance with legislation, Ndzelu (2016), using Matatiele Local Municipality as a case study, noted that while many municipalities may be
compliant when it comes to IDP legislation, there was an observable lack of capacity to plan for the long term and efficient project implementation. Ndlazi noted that some municipalities often employ external consultants and, through this partnership arrangement, manage to execute their legislative mandate of project planning and management tasks (Ndzelu 2016:73). Such partnership arrangements, useful as they might seem, can be viewed with suspicion because Ndzelu also observed the approach has been criticised by some officials, who “feel like the external service providers (partner) are trusted more than the officials themselves” (Ndzelu 2016). More fundamentally, however, when planning is done by an external consultant, the monitoring of such plans become problematic to implement as, while planning is cyclical and can be outsourced, the implementation, M & E of such plans are, by necessity, routine and continuous.

The discussion on partnerships and outsourcing brings the important aspect of planning and implementation of service delivery projects and programmes – M & E – into sharp focus. Given that rural municipalities require the support of, not only other levels of government, but also the support and involvement of extra government actors in the private sector and in civil society – it stands to reason there is a complex web of actors involved in the delivery of services, by necessity. This is a web whose actors and activities ought to be judiciously monitored, so that focus on outcomes is not lost.

**The Value of Monitoring and Evaluation**

Municipalities are faced with complex and diverse problems, due to high expectations from the various stakeholders to deliver on their mandate. To be more effective in service delivery, M & E is a very important process that can enable projects and programmes to be delivered such that the outcome of these processes will make a meaningful impact on the intended communities (Maepa 2014).

The M & E concept has been practised globally over the years (Boukeart 1994), in order to achieve an effective and sustainable socio-cultural economy through development; it is important that projects and programmes are effectively monitored and evaluated (Boukeart 1994). Globally, there has been increased pressure on governments and various stakeholders to become more responsible in relation to how the needs of their population are provided for through good governance, and be more accountable and transparent to promote effectiveness. Thus there is a move toward improved performance, which has necessitated the need to monitor and evaluate programmes and projects. As such, performance and evaluation is fast becoming a management tool used to improve activities of government to help achieve a viable outcome of development initiatives in the communities (Maepa 2014).

In South Africa, beginning from 2009, the government has, at central level, recognised the importance of M & E as a transformational programme that could be used as a tool to transform socio-economic programmes. This led to the establishment of the department of M & E within the Presidency, charged with the mandate of ensuring that the various policies and reforms are implemented across the board (SA – The Presidency 2009). The OECD (2002) defines M & E as, firstly, monitoring being:

> a continuing function that uses systematic collection of data on specific indices to provide management and stakeholders of an ongoing development intervention with indicators of the extent of progress and achievement of objectives and progress in the use of allocated funds.

Secondly, evaluation is then defined as:

> … the systematic and objective assessment of an ongoing or completed project, programme or policy, it’s design, implementation and results. The aim is to determine the relevance and fulfilment of objectives,
development efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability, it should provide information that is credible and useful, enabling the incorporation of lessons learned into the decision-making process of both recipients and donors.

The manner in which M & E is carried out in South Africa is somewhat complex, due to the decentralisation of power and, as such, not much can be carried out in the municipalities without heavy reliance on central government. Mthethwa and Jili (2016) studied how M & E is carried out in South African municipalities with a special focus on the Mfolozi Municipality, arguing that a lack of effective M & E is still a major challenge facing the various stakeholders. The result is the inability of the various projects and programmes to meet the set objectives. Therefore, no meaningful impact is felt by the various communities after implementation (Mthethwa & Jili 2016). This is supported by Maepa (2014) who conducted a study to ascertain how M & E is carried out in metropolitan municipalities in Gauteng. It was found that, because of the complexity of M & E in South Africa, it has not been affective due to a lack of political will of elected officials in the municipalities – in addition to a scarcity of requisite skills to conduct effective M & E.

Steytler (2008:767) observed that over-regulation leads to direct commands, effectively eliminating the discretion of the Municipal Council and the managers to find innovative local solutions to developmental challenges. One can thus argue that expecting battling municipalities to judiciously comply with M & E requirements, is a case of adding yet further responsibilities. However, with specific reference to M & E, the policy framework of government-wide M & E is cognisant of this fact. The framework points out that as a matter of principle “… the administrative burden of compliance across government should be minimised” and that implementation milestones must be linked to existing capacity and the ability to build capacity over the medium-term. This applies to local municipalities in particular, which, as pointed out, are hamstrung by many capacity and resource constraints. Of course while capacity should not dictate government’s normative long-term ideal for M & E, the capacity of local municipalities, specifically, must be factored into implementation plans and risk-managed accordingly.

Namara, Karyeija and Mubangizi (2015:84) note that LGs in many African countries devised new governance approaches, such as network governance and public–private partnerships, in order to include other players in delivering public services. Usually, such external providers have linkages with each other – thus increasing the complexity. These horizontal and vertical relationships involving the public, private and community actors ought to be managed and monitored, and it is this aspect that has seen this interface increasingly becoming the subject of an academic focus. A network of actors rather than a linear arrangement of actors will inevitably require more complex M & E modalities. What then are the M & E activities at play in rural municipalities, and how do these pan out in the delivery of basic services?

To start with, the Intergovernmental Relations Framework Act No 13 of 2005 provides a framework for the three spheres of government and all organs of state to facilitate coordination in the implementation of policy and legislation, including: monitoring the implementation of policy and legislation, to ensure a coherent government for the realisation of national priorities. District intergovernmental forums, provided for in the Act, are a space for municipalities to engage and monitor policy outcomes. In particular, Section 26(1) of this Act prescribes that District intergovernmental forums must ensure the coordination and alignment of the strategic and performance plans and priorities, as well as objectives and strategies of the municipalities in the District, and any other matters of strategic importance that affect the interests of the municipalities in the District (Section 26(1). Govender and Pencelia (2011) note that District intergovernmental forums are not effective as M & E structures, due to the lack of capacity in District and local municipalities.
Perhaps the most instructive legislation on M & E for municipalities is the Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000. The Act outlines the details of monitoring and review of the performance management system, and the core components that must be included therein. Section 40 prescribes the monitoring and review of the performance management system and that a municipality must establish mechanisms to monitor and review its performance management system. In Section 41, it is prescribed that municipalities must set appropriate key performance indicators to be used as yard sticks for measuring performance, including outcomes and impact with regard to the municipality’s development priorities and objectives – as specified in its IDP. In addition, it further prescribes that municipalities establish a process of regular reporting to: (i) the council, other political structures, political office bearers and staff of the municipality; and (ii) the public and appropriate organs of the state.

Another legislative area for M & E is the IDP with the Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000; the Integrated Development Planning Policy sets out the service delivery and economic development priorities of the municipality by establishing key performance indicators and performance targets. The IDP is a description of a comprehensive and strategic plan that directs and informs decision-making processes pertaining to municipal management and development (Municipal Systems Act No. 32 of 2000). In other words, the IDP lays out municipal plans and objectives for the future development of municipalities. It is important to stress that IDP processes involve municipal authorities and the broader municipal community – both of which discuss long-term development goals. IDP processes comprise planning, implementation and evaluation of the development aspects. The process involves considering the existing resources, current problems and their causes – as well as the means to solve the particular problems. For Pieterse (2002), the IDP is a planning methodology linking a statement of purpose with plans, programmes, institutional design and practices – along with monitoring mechanisms and financial flows (Pieterse 2002:5). The information on these issues is obtainable through public meetings with the relevant stakeholders of the municipality – hence the importance of public participation (Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000). Community members need to be consulted and allowed to take part in issues that affect them directly or indirectly. This also implies that the IDP should mirror the needs and priorities of communities, and, therefore, the authorities will be able to implement and monitor the relevant programmes put in place to deal with those needs.

The main goal of the IDP is to facilitate reduction of poverty levels, which is why it is most relevant for previously marginalised societies. The IDP aims to improve the livelihoods of people. In order to achieve that, there is a need to look at existing conditions in terms of the socio-economic development aspects of the municipal area. What follows is a framework of the required infrastructure services and how these should be established without damaging the environment (Auriacombe and Acron 2015). While municipal authorities, the community and other relevant stakeholders partake in the preparation and implementation of the development plan, the IDP outlines the strategic, tactical, and operational developmental challenges to be achieved over a five-year period. The plan, according to Schoeman (2006), must be all-encompassing, with involvement of the relevant stakeholders in ensuring that everyone plays their part. Hence, it is important for each LG to develop their own plan in a manner that enhances their economic growth and addresses the development needs of the community they serve. Therefore, the IDP defines the need for M & E systems at local level to assess the progress and quality of the inputs, activities, outputs, outcomes and impacts of the implemented policies, programmes and projects (McCarthy 2000:113).

**Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements – Matatiele Local Municipality**

MLM is located in the Alfred Nzo District Municipality in the Eastern Cape province of South Africa and is located alongside the Drakensberg and Maluti mountain ranges. (Matatiele Local Municipality, 2018). The
municipality is predominantly rural in nature and the settlement pattern is characterised by dispersed rural settlements surrounded by subsistence farmlands in the former Transkei region (ECSECC, 2017). Livelihoods are fragile for according to the IHS Markit (in ECSECC, 2017) MLM has an unemployment rate of 30.3%, an HDI of 0.542 and 72.9% of its people were living in poverty. This rural, largely poor, municipality is used here to illustrate formal and non-formal processes of M & E and what important principles can be drawn

6.1 Formal legislated processes: As part of enhancing public participation in M & E activities of the municipality, the MLM embarked on an IDP Community Outreach programme. A local paper reported that the MLM regularly embarks on a programme that gives citizens the power to make their voice heard (Hitchcock 2016). The purpose of these sessions are to present a report on service delivery backlogs and progress per ward. Communities are usually enlightened with regard to the financial year’s projects under way, and what priorities, per ward, require revision.

During such community M & E sessions, teams visiting the respective wards are generally allocated and led by the mayor and members of the executive committee, accompanied by councillors, managers, municipal officials, as well as representatives from the District municipality and government departments. Some of the main service delivery concerns highlighted by communities typically relate to infrastructure backlogs, inadequate electrification of surrounding villages, and the shortage of clean drinking water. Following such sessions, the municipality may initiate the addressing of identified issues at the legislated inter-governmental relations forum that sits at the District municipality.

In addition to the legislative requirement of the IDP’s community outreach programme, the Municipality established the Local Communicators Forum (LCF) in 2010. Spearheaded by the Matatiele Local Municipality Communications Unit, the LCF comprises the Special Programmes Unit of the municipality; communications officials from the Alfred Nzo District Municipality; a representative from the Office of the Premier of the Eastern Cape Province; and a representative from the Government Communication and Information System (GCIS). In addition, pertinent NGOs and CBOs, as well as community development workers and Ward Support Assistants, participate in the LCF. The LCF is a brainchild of South Africa’s Local Government Association (SALGA). At national level, the Communicators Forum provides a platform for municipal communicators to better communicate progress in LG performance and facilitate inter-municipal peer learning. The expectation is that the LCF enables and supports municipal communicators in their important role of informing and educating citizens, while also providing a platform for the sharing of municipal innovations and good practices that will inform improvements in the sector (SALGA 2017).

Both the IDP outreach programme and the LCF are formal and structured spaces through which information on M & E of the municipality’s activities is shared and, by extension, through which communities are themselves involved in M & E activities.

Informal, ad-hoc Processes: In addition to the above-mentioned formal and legislated for a, it is clear that informal processes have developed in this region. These have developed as a means to specifically ensure M & E of water resource systems and their conservation. Such ad-hoc, self-organised forums are not unusual in situations where citizens perceive a gap or void in formal structures. Mubangizi and Gray (2011:213) stated that such ‘invented spaces’ are needed through the construction of informal structures for grassroots community participation and action. While the IDP and local communication forums constitute invited spaces, for the most part, citizens have to work with ‘invented spaces’ – wherein grassroots communities collaborate with a variety
of organisations around a matter of common interest. The Umzimbuvu Catchment Partnership Programme (UCPP), a discussion of which follows, is a case in point.

The Umzimbuvu River catchment is a vulnerable river system in the eastern part of South Africa. The Umzimvubu catchment and river system lies along the northern boundary of the Eastern Cape and extends for over 200 km from its source in the Drakensberg to its estuary at Port St Johns, where it joins the Indian Ocean. Due to the vital catalytic role the catchment can and should play in the socio-economic development of the region, South Africa, through its Department of Water and Sanitation, has classified the Umzimvubu Water Project as a Strategic Integrated Project (DWA 2013).

The institutional elements governing the river catchment consist of multiple networks, ideologies, and collaborative arrangements of exchange. The network of actors has developed and grown over the past five years in the context of the Umzimbuvu Catchment Partnership Programme (UCPP). The UCPP is a consortium of organisations who, by signing an MOU, commit to collective action to develop and implement a catchment management strategy and restoration plan for the Umzimvubu River corridor. Actors in this consortium derive from community organisations, farmer associations, tourism agencies, conservation activists, local government officers, researchers and academics – to mention but a few. The UCPP members work together to deliver multiple short- and long-term benefits in line with such priorities as integrated rural development, job creation, appropriate pro-poor infrastructure development, and service delivery. A strong component of the programme centres on working with partners and government authorities present within the catchment. In this regard, the “developing of a robust monitoring framework for the catchment through sound research and GIS database development to manage information on the catchment baseline and project impacts is critical” (UCPP 2011:14).

The UCPP comprises 27 organisations with a strong presence in the catchment corridor. Broadly these stakeholders are drawn from state and parastatal regulatory bodies, local government (including the Matatiele Local Municipality) and non-governmental organisations. In its 1st phase strategy outline, the UCPP noted that “a structured monitoring and evaluation system supported by a lead organisation can add immeasurable value to the work being done in the catchment most of which is in line with the ideals of the Local municipality” (UCPP 2011:15). Also noted in this strategy report, is that, if well coordinated, an overarching advantage of the consortium is that it potentially strengthens the achievement of outcomes, while reducing budgetary requirements (UCPP 2011:16).

The UCPP is an example of how communities can galvanise around a specific issue and, of their volition, create M & E processes that are outside the framework of formalised policy and legislative structures.

Both examples from the Matatiele Local Municipality typify collaborative monitoring, in which, according to Cundill and Fabricius (2009:3205), multiple actors are engaged in an ongoing process of data gathering, analysis and decision-making. Such collaborative processes offer an avenue through which social learning objectives for sustainable livelihoods can be pursued.

Implications for M & E Practices in the Local Municipalities

The key exposition emerging from the narratives of this article, is that while rural and poorly resourced municipalities stand to gain from strong M & E models, there are, currently, inadequate M & E processes being followed by most local municipalities in South Africa, and this could be a result of insufficient requisite skills. As the discussion has shown, this is due to overregulation that effectively eliminates the discretion of the Municipal Council and the managers to find innovative local solutions to developmental challenges. The
discussion has shown that collaboration between the local municipality and a diverse set of actors – in which individuals and organisations coordinate actions voluntarily in a self-organising and self-enforcing manner – appears to be evolving as a coping mechanism in poorly resourced municipalities. How can such self-organising processes work, and how can they be nurtured to strengthen M & E processes?

The fundamental principle is to recognise complexity and non-linearity in the provision of municipal services and therefore seek to integrate variables at more than one spatial and temporal scale (Campbell et al. 2001; Bellamy et al. 2001). Drawing on complexity theory, on Loorbach’s principles outlined earlier and on the lessons drawn from M and E processes in Matatiele Local Municipality, the following suggestions are advanced:

To start with, the ideal system should be one that produces information relevant to rural policies, while being reliable and timely enough to inform and influence planning and implementation processes. This requires comprehensive information covering the multidimensional nature of sustainable livelihoods (Solesbury 2003; Carney 1998; Scoones 1998). The sustainable livelihoods framework focuses attention on five sets of assets: natural, human, social, physical and financial. The framework further directs attention to those transforming processes of policy, institutions and processes that enable citizens to transform assets, though livelihood strategies, to desirable and sustainable livelihood outcomes.

An ideal system of M and E, based on the sustainable livelihoods framework requires comprehensive information which, from this perspective, interrogates all five facets of the livelihood framework as well as policy and institutional processes of governance. Such comprehensive information should draw on quantitative and qualitative information garnered through participatory methods. As shown in the UCPP structure in Matatiele Local Municipality, an important factor in this regard is that stakeholders collaboratively identify indicators to assess impact in the process of M & E. It is thus beneficial when a variety of skills exist in the network of collaborators as the data collection will depend on time, skills, and the nature of the variable being monitored. Of course, it is critical that the municipality remains a core stakeholder so that, as Loorbach (2007) suggests, there is “steering from the outside with direction from the inside”.

Because the complexity of the system is at odds with the formulation of specific objectives and blueprints (Loorbach 2010:167) – flexibility and adjustment to suit the context of the local community are vital. This avoids the ‘one-size-fits-all’ approach, wherein local municipalities are expected to implement programmes and projects formulated elsewhere.

Furthermore, an ideal M & E system should be integrated into policy processes by nurturing an organisational culture and institutional framework that engenders the interaction between citizens and local government. This appears to be the intention of the Local Communications Forum in Matatiele Local Municipality, discussed earlier. However, as shown in the UCPP case, a much more expansive livelihoods’ monitoring network is likely to have more impact. In network theory, a focus on learning about different actor perspectives and a variety of options, is necessary to bring about desired change. An expansive monitoring network will bring together and ensure collaboration between community workers, research institutions, local planners, policy-makers, and civic institutions.

Finally, an ideal M & E system must have effective mechanisms for providing M & E information to a variety of users, who, typically, include policy-makers, service providers and, most importantly, the beneficiary citizens. This is perhaps the complex aspect of M & E for local municipalities, as it requires the articulate and concise condensing of qualitative and quantitative information into a user-friendly form. It also requires that such information be appropriately and honestly packaged for dissemination through a variety of settings. Platforms
of academic journals, policy briefs, community newspapers and Facebook postings, along with other such social media platforms, appeal to a variety of users who all need to be kept abreast of the M & E information of local municipalities.

Conclusion

This article examined how M & E is practised in local municipalities in South Africa. It is clear that the question of M & E in South Africa continues to receive considerable attention, due to its importance in assisting municipalities to achieve their developmental mandate. That municipalities require the involvement of a multiplicity of actors operating within a complex network to deliver on their development mandate is further reason why M & E processes should be above board. Specifically, M & E frameworks should be accessible to a range of users; they should be participatory and should be empowering for both the beneficiaries and service providers. The current M & E process in municipalities are mainly monitored through statutory structures whose operational guidelines are laid down by a range of local government legislation and policies. While these are important and beneficial, the discussion in this paper has shown that non statutory structures formed out of ad hoc self-organising models can provide useful forums for monitoring local service provision for sustainable livelihoods.

It is clear that without detailed M & E processes, through an all-inclusive plan, with contributions from various stakeholders at the different levels of government and the local communities, along with skills development and political will – M & E initiatives will remain one of the failures, with the potential to further marginalise South Africa’s rural areas. Collaborative monitoring holds promise in this regard, and deserves greater attention as a means to integrate learning-based approaches in settings where a variety of stakeholders and role-players interact to contribute to the delivery of services. Lastly, and against the backdrop of complexity theory, it is worth exploring how Loorbach’s principles can be incorporated in the Integrated Planning processes of rural municipalities. In this regard, community participatory mechanisms need to be developed in the medium- to long-term, after extensive research and testing.

Acknowledgements

I acknowledge the financial assistance of the National Research Foundation (NRF) towards this research. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at, are my own and are not necessarily to be attributed to the NRF.

References


Factors Affecting Development of Gender-Sensitive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems in Humanitarian NGOs in Uganda. A case of IRC Uganda

1Grace William Maiso, 2David Ssekamatte, & 3Rose Namara
1African Community Empowerment and Development Initiative (ACEDI)
2,3Uganda Management Institute (UMI)

Abstract
This study sought to examine the factors that affect the development of gender-sensitive monitoring and evaluation systems in humanitarian NGOs in Uganda. The study assessed the effect of organizational and programme factors. The organizational factors assessed included; organizational structure, organizational culture and leadership while the programme factors were; staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and how these affect the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in a humanitarian NGO in Uganda. Using a cross sectional survey design and quantitative methods to data collection, with a sample of 147 respondents, the study found out that; organizational factors had a negative and insignificant effect on gender sensitive M&E systems while programme factors had a strong and significant effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. Therefore, programme factors were a strong predictor of gender mainstreaming in M&E and organizational factors were not. The study recommends skills training gender mainstreaming to programme staff and investments in organizational changes may be necessary over the long term.

Key words: Gender-Sensitive M&E Systems, Organizational Factors, Programme Factors, Humanitarian NGOs

Introduction
Gender equality has been a concern for development practitioners for centuries. This study examined gender concerns within the Monitoring and Evaluation systems among NGOs in Humanitarian work. The development of gender sensitive M&E systems falls within the rubric of gender mainstreaming- a concept that gained currency after the Beijing 1995 Fourth World Conference for Women and the adoption of the Platform for Action (PfA). The call for all actors to mainstream gender in all their programmes and projects including policies at Beijing 1995 stemmed from the realization of the short comings of the Women in Development (WID) Approach to gender that was prominent in the 1970’s. This approach had noted that development programmes had ignored and worsened the conditions of women. It sought to change the women conditions by integrating women into economic development processes through separate women offices, women projects and units separate from the mainstream. Although this approach led to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) legislation which Uganda is a signatory, it was not sufficient to address gender inequalities as it ignored among others the role of men in decision making (KFW, 2006) and had little application to Africa (Beetham, & Dimitriades, 2007).

To enhance accountability to the international treaties and national legal and policy frameworks, it is clear that understanding of the link between gender and M&E is important for the understanding of how gender sensitive M&E systems can be developed (Rensburg, & Blaser Mapitsa, C. 2017). It is often assumed that M&E systems should be able to measure the issues of gender as impacts may differ across different targeted categories of people whom the project or programme aims to address, and programmes are never gender neutral (FAO, 2014). Gender sensitive M&E systems are thus assumed to help in the measurement of the gender equality goals in themselves (FAO, 2014). Although Resnburg and Mapista (2017) have shown, the linkage between M&E and gender, this linkage is still unclear in humanitarian programming.
This study was undertaken in a humanitarian NGO in Uganda – the International Rescue committee that started operations in Uganda in 1998. It is a humanitarian organization that responds to humanitarian crises and helps people recover their lives and livelihoods that have been affected by conflict and disaster. The International Rescue Committee (IRC) operates nationwide serving Internally Displaced People (IDPs) and conflict affected populations. The organization was chosen because it has a full gender programme that has been put in place to deal with issues of gender mainstreaming and also its long history in humanitarian and M&E systems development as shown from its literature. Since 2011, the organization has articulated its commitment to gender mainstreaming and promised to follow the SPHERE minimum standards for humanitarian action by conducting gender analysis on all their programme activities (SPHERE project, 2011). It thus provided a good basis for the study on the effect of organizational and programme factors have on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. In this study, gender-sensitive M&E systems is conceptualized in terms of; planning measuring gender analysis, budget allocation, and strategy/work plan; data collection and management measuring gender sensitive indicators, gendered teams, tools development, and gender information management system and; reporting measuring gender responsive reporting, dissemination and use of M&E findings. Particularly the study set out to test the following hypotheses:

- **H1**: Organizational factors have no effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in NGO
- **H2**: Programme factors have no effect on the development of gender responsive M&E systems in NGO

The article explains the methodology of the study, highlights existing literature on the key variables including theoretical considerations. The paper presents the key findings and discusses the results before stating conclusions and recommendations.

**Research Design and Methodology**

**Research design:** A cross sectional study design was adopted using quantitative methods of data collection and analysis. The selection of the design was informed by the need to test hypotheses regarding organizational and programme factors and their effect on gender sensitive M&E development, providing an appropriate opportunity to study the M&E systems in its natural real-life context (Pickard, 2013).

**Sampling and sample size determination:** The study population comprised of the M&E officers, SGV and WPE managers, Finance, HR staff, gender focal persons, project officers, and programme officials, senior management staff of IRC at both head office and field staff in the Yumbe humanitarian programme. From the population of 264, a sample of 147 respondents were selected for the study using proportionate stratified sampling technique across the stratum of the employees at IRC. The sample size was determined using the Yamane (1967) formula for calculating sample size.

**Data collection and analysis:** Quantitative data was collected using a survey questionnaire. A self-administered questionnaire was used to collect data from the finance and HR staff, senior managers, programme staff, and administration staff at IRC. The questionnaire was structured collecting data on demographic characteristics of respondents, a Likert scale measuring attitudes of employees regarding programme and organizational factors (organizational structure, organizational culture, leadership, staff gender competences, project methods and tools as well as programme context) and how these affect the development of a gender-sensitive M&E system. Questionnaires were scrutinised for usability – consistence and accuracy and then cleaned, edited and assigned identification numbers and coded for data entry (Kothari 2004:123). Quantitative data analysis was done using SPSS IBM 20 to generate frequencies, measures of central tendency as well as measures of dispersion on study variables. These include; organizational factors including; the organizational structure in terms of M&E Unit,
staffing and governance; the organizational culture in terms of Values, attitudes, commitment, models, practices and; the leadership in terms of vision, accountability, capacity, and commitment within the organization; The programme factors including; Staff gender competencies in terms of the Methods they use, integration skills, self-image, and training; the project methods and tools in terms of gender mainstreaming tools, participation, and capacity and; the programme context conceptualized as the socio-economic conditions, attitudes, laws, and partners). The gender-sensitive M&E systems including; planning measuring gender analysis, budget allocation, and strategy/work plan; data collection and management measuring gender sensitive indicators, gendered teams, tools development, and gender information management system and; reporting measuring gender responsive reporting, dissemination and use of M&E findings. The relationship shown is a linear dependence one.

Theoretical Review

The study uses the Gendered Organizational Theory attributed to Aker (1990) who examined the subtle ways that gender was established and reproduced in organizations such as overt and covert practices and processes that in themselves perpetuate gender inequalities such as “concrete activities, what people do and say, and how they think about these activities” (Aker, 1992: 420). According to Aker (1992) there are five processes through which to examine gender in an organization and these are: analysis of “production of gender divisions,” and “the gender patterning of jobs, wages and hierarchies, power and subordination” (Acker, 1992, p. 252). This involves examining the processes that produce them and those that resist their formation and practices. The second process to examine is “the creation of symbols, images, and forms of consciousness that explicate, justify, and, more rarely, oppose gender divisions” (Acker, 1992:253) such as “language, ideology, popular and high culture, dress, the press, television” (Acker, 1992:146) in other words organizational culture and processes. Third need to examine “interactions between individuals that enact dominance and subordination and create alliances and exclusion” (Acker, 1992: 253) within the organization and outside it. The fourth process is the impact of the gendered organization on the identity of the individual (presentation of self-etc). The fifth is the processes of creating and conceptualizing social structures such as race, ethnicity and relationships with other structures or analytically different processes (Aker 2012).

While Aker(1990) is credited with this theory the perspectives of the theory that emerge are that it consists of three distinct attributes or perspectives (Makarem n.d) namely, First, Inter-sectionality- how the organization interacts with the disadvantaged (women, minority groups etc) and how structure, culture, class and self-image of participants interface to create new meanings and experiences (Acker, 2012) that can perpetuate gender inequalities including linkage to other forms of inequality processes and practices in existence. The second perspective of understanding gendered organizations relates to examine gender, ethnicity and culture. It could relate to how gender and ethnicity affects leadership experiences (Showunmi, Atewologun, and Bebbington, 2015), or how culture (in such forms as gender scripts, stereo typing etc) and influence leadership (Ayman & Korabik, 2010) and how the leadership is affected by the three perspectives of how gender inequality can be established- intrapsychic, the social structural, and the interpersonal perspectives (Korabik and Ayman (2007). The third perspective to understanding gendered organizations is to examine leadership- focusing on the intersections of leadership and those that are led, organizational context(policies, HRM practices, laws and strategies(Budgets, Plans etc) that are formulated for change to take place (Britton and Logan,2008). Thus identifying the inequalities is not sufficient but there is need to examine the organizational structures, processes and culture and how they interact to perpetuate inequality and also linkage to socio economic factors in/outside the organization (Metcalfe, 2006). Makarem notes that in gendered research it is important to understand how
gender inequalities are built in and reproduced by social structures in order to develop appropriate and adequate gender-bias free policies.

Aker (1990) and the gendered organizational theorists have been criticized for assuming that organizations are inherently designed for male domination which is not correct. In addition any structure that exists often is a reflection of what the society or situation is like and so gender inequalities outside will often reproduce themselves within the organization. Despite these shortcomings the theory helps us to examine gendered practices and processes in the development of M&E such as proposed by the theory such as organizational structure, culture, leadership and these are key components of organizational factors whilst organizational context, staff self-images seen in their competencies to identify gender inequalities, and project methods that determine inter-sectionality between internal and external conditions of gender inequality form programme factors in the study.

Organizational Factors and Gender-Sensitive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems

Organizational Structure and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems
Caroline Moser, 2016 demonstrate and argue that organizational structures can be determinants of gender transformation or pathways in which gender relations and power can be exercised. The structure of an organization can cause an autocratic structural change- where technical staff determine changes (UN Women, 2013), or a participatory and more engaging approach that enables demands from women and communities for gender transformation advocated by organizations such as Oxfam (Sweetman, 2013). USAID (2016) notes that an organizational structure plays an important role in the integration of gender in M&E systems basically through two major pathways: the human resource management pathway through staff placement, gender unit establishment and gender responsive organizational policies and procedures pathway which provides the framework for the functionality of the staff positions and units created.

Studies show that an organizational structure influences the way change occurs, especially if the change is radical in nature such as may be introduced by the feminization of M&E systems, as this challenges the power relations and the infrastructure that supports it with implications for staff at all levels(Aruna, 2005, Caroline Moser, 2016). Batliwala (2011) has argued that an organizational structure has a direct link to the effectiveness of the M&E system to address gender issues. Nasambu (2016) has noted that an organizational structure has a positive and significant correlation to M&E performance. Mary Njenga et al (2008) have noted that issues of access to resources and control, decision making, division of labour and knowledge which are critical in reduction of gender inequalities are directly linked and affected by the organizational structure. Thus for an organization to make the necessary changes such as in the development of gender sensitive M&E systems it must have the views of all staff taken into consideration in a participatory way and thus create space for a gendered organizational structure that also needs to be accountable.

Organizational Culture and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems
The European Institute for Gender Equality (2016) cautions that organizations are not static or fixed and often have unwritten rules and undocumented behaviors that potentially affect the gender mainstreaming process. These are embedded in the organizational culture and relate to the behavior of staff and their outlook of issues especially that regard to organizational change. Individuals learn the organizational culture in a socialization process and many of the stereotypical behavior towards gender issues is learnt this way too. So they do note that gender transformation can only take place if organizational culture is taken into account in the process of change.
Kadam, and Acuner, (2018) writing on public sector regarding National women machinery mechanisms in Turkey have averred that gender mainstreaming is a political process that requires a shift in organizational culture. Accordingly it requires a shift of mindset and structures where budgets, staff, incentives, tools and methods and policy making are all shifted and brought on board to support gender mainstreaming and transformation. The linkage to the development of M&E systems in general is seen from the institutional processes crafted within the organization and how these can be supported by existence of National women machineries.

USAID (2010) notes that it’s the cardinal duty of all staff within an organization to reflect and question the cultural norms and practices within the organization and see how they affect their workplaces in terms of how they can integrate gender in the processes including M&E often guided by organizational policy. Policies are major instruments used to ensure gender concerns are well integrated into the culture and operations of an organization (Mergaert and Lombardo, 2014). Resource allocation for gender mainstreaming affects the response and commitment to developing gender sensitive systems. Franklina Mantilla (2012) argues that gender mainstreaming should be provided for with a non-discretionary, fixed budget line and not depend on extra-budgetary resources that is common in gender integration processes. Espinosa (2011) cited in Espinosa, (2013) argues that the failure to allocate resources and insufficient institutional capabilities stems from lack of political will in an organization’s leadership.

Studies in organizational management show that deliberate recruitment of women and the closing of gender gaps in countries like New Zealand has led to the rise in GDP by 10% (Borkin, 2011) and where the gender gap is reduced at the senior management level cases of increased and better performance have been realized (Desvaux, Devillard, Sancier-Sultan, 2010; Whelan & Wood, 2012) and in other cases increased organizational efficiency, profitability and effectiveness, (Borkin, 2011; Desvaux, Devillard Hoellinger & Meaney, 2008; Fitzpatrick, 2011). How this can be linked to M&E is still a grey area.

Indeed Taylor-Powell & Boyd (2008) show that several motivators such as leadership opportunities, professional development in the career path and recognition by peers can be strong motivators for increased engagement in evaluation practices. Thus the attitudes of people regarding gender in itself is critical to ensure gender sensitive M&E systems are developed. In the case of the growth of EvalPartners and the eventual resolution on gender equity in evaluation processes in the UN in December 2014, the past experience of Mr. Segone in UNICEF and the amiable support from his mentor ensured that gender concerns were integrated into UNICEF work (Catsambas, 2015), but also led to donors such as Finland to adopt gender sensitive M&E systems that were considered a risk, triggering a movement that today has a membership of more 140,000 (Catsambas, 2015). Staff who have residual knowledge on how to tackle gender inequalities gained from previous experiences or practices within organizations often are an important strategy for effective gender mainstreaming (Hankivski, 2008; Squires, 2007) in M&E processes. Hoole and Patterson (2008) have argued that the process of building evaluation capacity in organizations requires infrastructure to support it and a learning culture. The learning culture is established through strategic learning- a process which is “the integration of evaluation and other feedback into decision making about strategy…using evaluation and evaluative thinking to learn in real-time and adapt their strategies to the changing circumstances about them” (Coffman & Beer, 2011). According to Hoole and Patterson (2008) feedback that consists of stakeholder input and incorporation of external evaluation expertise is critical in the development of a learning organization.

**Leadership and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems**
In the development of gender integrated and responsive systems the successful story of the development of the EvalPartners a network of evaluators globally clearly shows that leadership is central. Segone and Oksanen are credited with providing the leadership that not only led to the Chiang Mai declaration on evaluation but also adopting a resolution on evaluation by the UN in December 2014 and declaring 2015 a year of evaluation (Catsambas, 2015). Scholars (Brennan & Major, 2011; Carman & Fredericks, 2010; Taylor-Powell & Boyd, 2008) show that leadership, organizational culture, including support for evaluation are important pillars in developing evaluation culture and that sharing of gendered evaluation experiences among Key leaders (Preskill & Boyle, 2008) helps build capacity to enhance the uptake of gender mainstreaming.

Where organizations may not have gender specialists to direct or lead the process of causing gender sensitive M&E systems, Taylor-Powell and Boyd (2008) and Oxfam Canada (2012) suggest that leadership can champion new policies and resources and provide ability to withstand setbacks to the development of M&E processes that could be caused by the absence of a champion or model through influence over peers and possession of particular skills and interests. The bolstering of champions within organizations can be reinforced by the formation of networks of role models and committed staff to catalyse change (DANIDA, 2008) such as in the case of EvalPartners (Tessie Tzavaras Catsambas, 2015). There is need to understand how Leadership for example influences uptake of gender approaches, tools and practices among staff and lead to an ethos that is reinforced and voluntarily taken on by all M&E staff within an organization.

Ivankovich & Faramand (2015) argue that whereas organizational gender strategies, tools and policies can be in place but once not well communicated effectively and perceived as mission critical by the leadership, then gender mainstreaming can have considerable challenges. For example the lack of women representatives in leadership positions can affect the effectiveness of the gender mainstreaming process. According to these scholars, gender mainstreaming requires to be given the due space and support and prioritized in all organizational activities by the leadership. This can be through communication to all staff, providing support in terms of resources, time, commitment, participation (Harvey, 2010) and policy reform to enhance gender sensitive M&E systems.

Canyon, (2017) found in his research that organizational structure, culture and leadership are intertwined in the development of gender inclusion within the security sector. He notes that erstwhile positions that were earmarked for women within the armed forces were open to women as a result of leadership and transformation of the structure of the organization. But this could only be done with the reorientation of the culture of the organization and not just toeing the line. The leadership of any organization plays a crucial role in changing the culture of an organization and also initiating policies that help to restructure the organization and shape the attitudes of those for and against gender inclusion in all processes including M&E systems.

Programme Factors and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems

Staff Gender Competencies and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems

McNairn (2011) cited in Ivankovich and Faramand (2015) in studying gender inequalities that exacerbate food insecurity and under nutrition has averred that building capacity in gender and behavior change communication can enable gender transformation take place. In light of the fact that most project staff have their own experience and attitudes towards gender, it’s important that they are trained in principles of gender integration in projects to help them develop competencies sufficient to enable integration of gender in programmatic processes (Ivankovich and Faramand, 2015). Newly recruited project staff, require training in order to enhance their skills
and competencies to understand gender issues and apply appropriate approaches/* for gender mainstreaming. In addition to building the capacity there is need for commitment of staff on integration of gender into processes. USAID (2010) has argued that in order to successfully ensure integration of gender into program activities, project staff at all levels need to have skills in gender mainstreaming and be responsible for gender integration in addition with staff having access to rebuilding their skills through training. However, how these skills can be sustained in cases of humanitarian aid that are often transitional in nature is still poorly researched.

**Project Methods, Tools and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems**

Glaister Leslie and Nathalie Holvoet (2013) note that the adoption of appropriate M&E approaches, should be able to show what changes must take place in the organization and the results of those changes that ought to be realized as premised on the theory of change. Scholars show that the majority of capacity building interventions focus on one off trainings and workshops and in some cases technical assistance in terms of project management expertise (Datta et al., 2012) and advise often leaving the higher intangibles of organizational change such as power, incentives unaffected and not even measured due to difficulty in indicator identification and measurement (Ubels, 2010). Gender mainstreaming has often been done in workshops and one off trainings or sometime payment of salaries for gender specialists who are expatriates and thus leaving many projects and organizations with limited capacity and desired change at the organizational level.

Funders of projects are one of the major stakeholders to affect the development of M&E. The rigor with which organizations mainstream gender in M&E processes is determined in many respects by the perceptions and interests of the donors who sponsor or fund projects. For instance a study by GEO (2012) showed that evaluations served internal audiences as demanded by donors and concluded that funders were not living up to their promises of ensuring that evaluation results should be communicated and used as a platform for learning in the gender process. The power relations between grantee and grantor have had serious implications on the conduct of evaluations and affected the mainstreaming of gender in evaluation processes.

The challenge with mainstreaming is partly affected by the perception that organizations attach to the evaluation process. A study by The Center for Effective Philanthropy found that grantees of funding perceived evaluations as a wastage of resources and a distraction (Buteau & Chu, 2011) rather than a helpful learning exercise. Participation of stakeholders such as women in M&E activities have an impact on what outcomes emerge from the exercises as a gender evaluation of World Bank programmes shows (IEG, 2010). The evaluation found that when women participate less in project design or evaluation exercise then they benefit less from the project. Similarly according to two studies in Bangladesh (Tabassum Naved, 2006) the disregard of women in the project processes soon gave way to men controlling project activities. Harvey (2010) argues that however good a policy change or shift may be often resistance may emerge and it requires the participation of people to enhance reception and understand the purpose and benefits of a gender mainstreaming process. Multi stakeholder participation requires tools and methods that utilize and enhance the spaces for participation. How tools and methods can be effectively applied seems to be a grey area in the literature reviewed.

**Programme Context and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems**

The level of gender integration in M&E systems is determined by donor conditions as most NGO’s M&E systems are established to provide accountability to donors or sometimes designed with support of peer organizations (Szper and Prakash 2011) to meet society requirements or regulations of government that now require transparency to counter the growing concerns of the quality of NGO work (Murtaza, 2011). Thus in such
scenarios gender if not budgeted for or emphasized by the donor then gender responsive M&E systems are hard to develop given the financial constraints. Evaluations are often done but as part of contract compliance for the donors and even when there are lessons to learn such as the challenges of gender mainstreaming, the lessons are not taken as it has implications for the fundraising for the organization if the weaknesses have a significant impact on their reputation. According to Gulrajani (2013) the demand for gender mainstreaming by donors in funding or aid modalities is more emphasized and used in project selection than in implementation or results/outcomes as a whole.

Mainstreaming of gender including in M&E systems would require sufficient resources, building capacities among others but like Ogden et al. (2008) notes mainstreaming ends up as ‘gender as usual,’ a scenario where commitments to address gender equality are not supported with processes of staff capacity development, allocation of adequate financing, and adequate monitoring and evaluation of results. According to Sen and Östlin (2010) the failure of gender mainstreaming is among others caused by organizational plaqueness where they are traditionally encrusted by usually male dominated organizational relationships, values and approaches to work while on the part of African Development Bank (2011) it is the problem of looking at gender mainstreaming as more of a process than targeting outcomes of the process.

According to Caren Grown (2014) the other reason for the difficulty in attaining effective gender mainstreaming stems from the multi dimensionality of the gender equality concept and the fact that there is mismatch between different donors in approaches across different sectors and resources allocated for the exercise in relation to policy commitments. Financing of gender mainstreaming is crucial and Caren Grown (2014) has noted that whereas there has been no agreed amount of the budget to be allocated to gender mainstreaming they suggest that 15% of budget should be ideal allocation but unfortunately that has not been the case as many donors have only emphasized gender mainstreaming without budget allocations for gender mainstreaming (Grown et al., 2005). So the efforts to mainstream gender in M&E systems become difficult.

Summary of the Literature Review and Gaps
The literature is largely fragmented either addressing issues of gender mainstreaming in general but little on M&E systems development specifically and limited study on development of gender responsive M&E systems in Uganda. In addition, much of the literature is not within the humanitarian action sphere presenting a limited understanding and appreciation of how gender sensitive M&E systems ought to be developed, a grey area that needs to be researched upon. This is why this research became cardinal to provide new insights into the whole process contributing new knowledge to the field of M&E.

Study Findings
Response Rate
The researchers distributed 147 questionnaires to respondents and a total of 120 questionnaires were returned. The response rate is presented in the table 4.1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1; Response Rate for the Study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instruments</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Nulty (2008) a response rate above 50% is acceptable in social research and thus the rate attained was sufficient to subject the data to analysis.

**Background Characteristics of Respondents**

The following were the background characteristics of respondents as presented in Table 4.2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age of respondent</strong></td>
<td>Below 30 years</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>61.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Between 30 and 40 years</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over 40 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex of respondent</strong></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>61.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>38.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital Status</strong></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>62.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Widowed/widower</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic qualification</strong></td>
<td>Bachelors</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Time of service in the organization</strong></td>
<td>Below five years</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>90.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Between five and Ten years</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over ten years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in table 2 above shows that majority of respondents (61.9%) were below the age of 30 while 36.4% were between the ages of 30 and 40 while 1.7% were above 40 years. This shows that IRC had a young staff profile in its humanitarian programmes. The majority of the staff interviewed were male constituting 61.9% while the females were 38.1%. In addition, 62.7% of the staff interviewed were married while 34.4% were single. Also, to note is that 2.5% were widowed. The large number of married shows the respondents consisted of persons having the appropriate background experience to respond to a gender study. Also given that the majority of respondents were below 30 years and many married it shows that marriages could have been nascent and therefore provide lessons to learn on issues of gender as these respondents were likely to be sensitive to the gender concerns at the workplace and organization (KII, 2018).

In terms of academic qualifications 69.5% of the respondents had a bachelor’s degree, 25.4% had diploma and 5.1% had a masters. This means the respondents had the requisite knowledge and competencies to comprehend the questionnaire and thus take part in the study. The majority (90.7%) of the staff interviewed had spent less than five years in the organization while 7.6% had spent between five to ten years in the organization and 1.7% having spent over ten years in the organization. The time spent in the organization was sufficient for respondents
to be able to recollect organizational issues that were relevant to the answering of questions posed in the study especially that most emergency projects last between one to three years in duration.

**Description of Dependent Variable: Gender sensitive M&E System**

The questionnaire used measured the dependent variable (DV) - gender sensitive M&E system using 18 items scaled using the five-point Likert scale where, 1 = Strongly Disagree, 2 = Disagree, 3 = Not Sure, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree. It consisted of three constructs namely Planning (PN), Data collection and Management (DCM) and Reporting (RP).

**Gender Sensitive M&E System Index**

In order to analyse further gender sensitive M&E system variable, an average measure of GSME was derived from the three components (PN, DCM, and RP) in order to get an overall picture of how the respondents rated GSM, an average index was computed for the 18 items that constituted 7 items for PL, 7 items for DCM and 4 items for RP.

**Table 3: Summary Descriptive Statistics for Gender Sensitive M&E System**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.6560</td>
<td>.06559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
<td>3.5258</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Bound</td>
<td>3.7862</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Trimmed Mean</td>
<td>3.6990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>3.7460</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>.409</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.63925</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interquartile Range</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-1.107</td>
<td>.247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.761</td>
<td>.490</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in table 3 above show that the mean = 3.66 was close to the median = 3.72 Therefore, despite the negative skew (skew -1.107), the results were normally distributed. The mean and median close to 4 suggested that gender sensitive M&E system was realizable basing on the scale used that shows that the code 4 corresponded to agree. It also showed that the respondents were certain about the gender mainstreaming process in M&E systems in IRC in the emergency and recovery phases of humanitarian aid. Thus it seemed plausible to note that the ingredients of a gender sensitive M&E system were in place.

**Description of Independent Variable: Organizational Factors**

The independent variable (IV) organizational factors consisted of and was measured using three constructs namely; Organizational structure, organizational culture and leadership. These items were derived from the first objective of the study that sought to establish the effect of organizational factors on development of gender sensitive M&E systems. Organizational structure was measured using 6 items, Organizational culture was
measured using 7 items and leadership measured using 6 items on a five-point Likert scale where, 1 = Strongly Disagree 2 = Disagree, 3 = Not Sure, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree. In order to regress a composite mean for variable of Organizational Factors was computed and results are presented below:

Table 4: Summary Statistics for Organizational Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.9313</td>
<td>.05853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for Mean Lower Bound</td>
<td>3.8149</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for Mean Upper Bound</td>
<td>4.0476</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Trimmed Mean</td>
<td>3.9608</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>4.0159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.54908</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interquartile Range</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-.800</td>
<td>.257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.208</td>
<td>.508</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in Table 4 show that the mean = 3.93 was almost close to the median = 4.02 Therefore, despite the negative skew (skew -.800), the results were normally distributed. The mean and median close to code 4 used in the scale showed agreed and thus suggested that there was a general agreement across the organization that the factors analysed were important to gender mainstreaming in the organization.

**Description of independent Variable: Programme Factors Versus Development Of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems**

The independent variable (IV) Programme factors consisted of and was measured using three constructs namely; staff gender competencies, Project methods and tools and Programme context. Staff gender competencies was measured using 5 items, project methods and tools was measured using 5 items and programme was measured using 4 items on the five-point Likert scale where, 1 = Strongly Disagree 2 = Disagree, 3 = Not Sure, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree. In order to find out the overall view of how the respondents rated the variable of programme factors in the development of gender sensitive M&E system, a composite mean of programme factors was computed for all the three sub constructs of the variable; staff gender competencies (5 items), project methods and tools (5 items) and programme Context(4 items). The summary of the statistics on programme factors are presented in Table 4.14 below.
Table 5 Summary Statistics for Programme Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.4594</td>
<td>.05773</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for Lower Bound</td>
<td>3.3450</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.5739</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Trimmed Mean</td>
<td>3.4903</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>3.533</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>.353</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.59433</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interquartile Range</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-.925</td>
<td>.235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.629</td>
<td>.465</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in Table 5 show that the mean = 3.46 was almost the same with the median = 3.53 and so despite the negative skew (skew -0.925), the results were normally distributed. The mean close to 3 which is neutral and median close to Code 4 that in the scale represented agree suggested that programme factors were moderately positive in the process of gender mainstreaming.

Inferential Analyses

In order to determine whether a relationship existed between organizational and programme factors on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems inferential analyses namely in the form of correlation and regression were undertaken and the results are presented in the sub sections below:

Correlation of Organizational Factors and Development of Gender Responsive M&E system

In order to establish whether the organizational factors namely; Organizational structure, organizational culture and leadership had a relationship with development of gender sensitive M&E system, correlation analysis was carried out using Pearson product Correlation coefficient and the results are presented in table 4.15 below:

Table 6: Correlation Matrix for Organizational Factors and Gender Sensitive M&E Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Gender sensitive M&amp;E systems</th>
<th>Organizational Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender sensitive M&amp;E systems</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation 1</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed) .95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>.695**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pearson Correlation 1</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Factors</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed) .000</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>78</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
The results from table 6 show that organizational factors had a strong positive and significant relationship with the development of gender sensitive M&E systems ($p = 0.00 < 0.05$). This therefore led the Hypothesis 1 to be supported and the alternative hypothesis to be rejected.

**Regression Model of Organizational Factors and Development of Gender Responsive M&E System**

At the confirmatory level, to establish whether organizational factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems a regression analysis was carried out and the results are presented below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Significance (p)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Factors</td>
<td>.695</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted $R^2 = 0.477$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$F = 71.166, p = .000$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*a. Dependent Variable: Gender Sensitive M&E systems*

The regression results from table 4.16 above shows that organizational factors only account for 47.7% (adjusted $R^2 = 0.477$) of the variation in gender sensitive M&E system variable and 43.3% is accounted for by other factors. The standardized coefficient ($\beta$) of 0.695 ($p = 0.000$) shows that organizational factors have a strong positive and significant relationship with the development of gender sensitive M&E systems and thus we accept Hypothesis 1 and reject the alternative hypothesis.

**Correlation of Programme Factors and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E System**

In order to establish whether the programme factors namely; staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and programme context have a relationship with development of gender sensitive M&E system, correlation analysis was carried out using Pearson product Correlation coefficient and the results are presented in table 4.17 below

**Table 8: Correlation Matrix for Programme Factors and Gender Sensitive M&E System**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Gender sensitive M&amp;E systems</th>
<th>Programme Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.796**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**

The results from table 8 above shows that programme factors have a positive and significant relationship with the development of gender sensitive M&E system. Thus Hypothesis 2 is supported and the null hypothesis not supported.

**Regression Model of Programme Factors and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E System**

At the confirmatory level, to establish whether programme factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems a regression analysis was carried out and the results are presented below:
Results from table 9 show that programme factors account for 62.8 % (Adjusted $R^2 = .628$) of the variation in gender sensitive M&E systems variable and the remaining 31.2% explained by other factors. The standardized coefficient ($\beta$) of .796 ($p = 0.000$) shows that programme factors have a positive strong and significant relationship with gender sensitive M&E systems. Thus Hypothesis 2 is accepted, and the null hypothesis rejected.

**Discussions of Findings**

**Research hypothesis 1: Organizational Factors have an Effect on the Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems in A Humanitarian NGO**

The descriptive results on organizational factors showed that the mean was 3.93 thus suggesting that the relationship between organizational factors and development of gender sensitive M&E system was good. Results from regression analysis showed that organizational factors had a positive and significant relationship to the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. The hypothesis that organizational factors have an effect on development of gender sensitive M&E system was therefore accepted and the alternative hypothesis not supported.

The findings revealed that the first hypothesis ($H_1$) to the effect that organizational factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems was supported and thus accepted and the alternative hypothesis ($H_0$) rejected. This could be because of leadership and structure matching with what Mukhopadhyay (2014) found in a study on theoretical exploration of gender mainstreaming approaches in which the author found that the absence of institutional mechanisms had led to the failure to attain gender mainstreaming in all processes and also what Neumann, Jan (2014) found in a PhD study in developing a framework for monitoring critical success factors to enhance strategic change within organization.

The findings of organizational structure, culture and leadership as critical organizational factors in the development of gender sensitive M&E systems also matches what Canyon, D(2017) found in his research that organizational structure, culture and leadership are intertwined in the development of gender inclusion within the security sector. What however seems unclear and what the current study also fails short is the fact that a combination of culture, structure and leadership often produce an organizational climate that can lead to gender inequalities including non-gender sensitive M&E systems. This is what Aker (1992) notes as the subtle manifestations of gendered issues that eventually lead to self-identity. So how organizational climate leads to gender sensitive M&E systems is not fully understood and needs further exploration, whether as a mediating or intervening variable.
Findings show that organizational structure was favourably rated among the constructs of organizational factors and this matches with UNU World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU-WIDER, 2014) study on gender equality in Aid which found that for mainstreaming of gender to be effective then it has to be embedded in the institutional processes and the organization should take it as a business. The study concluded that gender mainstreaming has to be an organizational culture and ethos to get effective results. The high rating of organizational structure for the development of gender sensitive M&E resonances with the conclusions of USAID (2016) and Batiwala (2011) who have argued that an organizational structure plays an important role in the integration of gender in M&E systems either through a structured process such as in human resource management practices in terms of competencies or pooling skills or through an organizational ethos that is articulated in the mission or vision statement of the organization and confirms theoretically what Aker(1992) recommends that one way to study gender in an organization is to examine its mission statements and other processes that define its structure.

Evidence within IRC showed that while gender training had been undertaken there was limited use of the training as staff lacked confidence and also no evidence existed to show the use of gender findings for social justice as recommended by Aker (2012), Batiwala (2011), Van Eerdewij and Dubel (2012) and Wong (2012). Indeed IRC seemed to fall into the one off trainings that scholars such as Datta et al., (2012) and Ubels, (2010) warn about. These trainings have limited empowerment effect as they are not directly linked to organizational change in the long term. This partly explained why IRC staff seemed not confident on gender analysis although acknowledged that the practice was common place.

It was also found that the existence of a gender focal person among senior management was an important driver of change in the organization especially in the process of gender mainstreaming in M&E. This finding agrees with what DANIDA (2008) and Catsambas, (2015) found out that champions or models are important to ensure that the gender mainstreaming agenda takes place and is effective. Indeed as Cho & Perry, (2012) have noted the existence of these technical persons allows the articulation of the vision of gender mainstreaming within the organization that in turn builds the tempo for the development of gender sensitive M&E systems.

The study findings of organizational culture being crucial in gender mainstreaming echo what the European Institute for Gender Equality (2016) notes viz that organizations are not static or fixed and have organizational cultures that often display unwritten rules and undocumented behaviors that potentially affect the gender mainstreaming process. While in IRC it was seen that the culture promotes gender mainstreaming, the researcher was unable to investigate further the inter staff relations and socializations processes that Aker (1992) recommends in her theory of gendered organizations. Thus how the socialization process within the organizations as a mediating or moderating variable could be a good area of further investigation.

Leadership in IRC has played a crucial role in promoting gender mainstreaming in being accountable and participatorily encouraging staff and sharing their vision for gender mainstreaming. This finding is in line with what studies by Brennan & Major, (2011), Carman & Fredericks (2010); Catsambas, (2015) Taylor-Powell & Boyd, (2008) have found namely that leadership when combined with other factors becomes a pillar in the development of gender integration within the M&E systems. However on leadership this study findings of leadership being crucial in gender sensitive M&E systems does not resonant with the findings of ADB (2012) study that undertook synthesis of gender mainstreaming in evaluations done between 1990 and 2010 and made a number of conclusions that show leadership was not providing the impetus for gender mainstreaming in evaluations by the multilateral agencies or even donors or organizations. It also concluded that in the absence of
accountability (a key aspect of organizational culture) and sufficient resources made it difficult to undertake integration of gender into organizational activities becomes.

Research hypothesis 2: Programme factors have an effect on the Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems in A Humanitarian NGO

The summary descriptive results of programme factors showed that the mean was = 3.46 thus suggesting that the relationship between programme factors and development of gender sensitive M&E system was not good. Results from regression analysis showed that programme factors had a strong positive and significant relationship to the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. The hypothesis that programme factors have an effect on development of gender sensitive M&E system was therefore accepted and the alternative hypothesis rejected.

The findings revealed that the second hypothesis (H2) to the effect that programme factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems was supported and thus accepted and the alternative hypothesis (H0) rejected. Findings from respondents during interviews also show results of moderately to high level of appreciation for the linkage between programme factors and gender sensitive M&E systems. The sub constructs of programme factors included staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and programme context. These findings are in tandem with the findings of other scholars such as Kenny and O’Donnell (2016) who found in their study of World Bank projects that gender integration varied and largely depended on clearly defined objectives and targets. The approaches used determine to a large extent the level of gender integration including processes of determining the outcomes needed in programmes.

The findings of programme factors having an effect on gender sensitive M&E systems also match those of FAO(2014) who in their assessment of factors crucial to gender sensitive M&E found that programme factors particularly participatorily engaging stakeholders in M&E was more important in addition to a reflective and learning M&E process. It also agrees with findings from other studies by SIDA (2015), Sudarshan and Sharma (2012), who found programme factors important in developing gender sensitive evaluations.

Findings from the study show that IRC Staff were not familiar with methods and tools for gender analysis and were not able to integrate them into project activities as the mean was 3.03. This contradicts another finding within the same study were they noted that gender analysis was always done. This could point to the use of consultants as findings showed that the organization often conducted independent gender studies. These findings contradict with SIDA (2015), and USAID (2016) findings that show that staff competencies are very important requisites if gender sensitive M&E systems are to be attained. While the staff skills were low, findings show that IRC had been able to attain a high level of developing gender sensitive M&E systems which could be as a result of other factors. It is important to continuously build capacity of both men and women to ensure that both genders meaningfully participate in project M&E processes and programmes.

Findings from qualitative data analysis of stakeholders outside the organization not effectively provided with capacity to gender mainstream, had implications on the overall attainment and sustainability of gender mainstreaming in M&E systems. These findings show and contradict with what Espinosa(2013), Catsambas (2015), USAID(2016), World Bank (2010), have shown that the success to gender mainstreaming in M&E processes among others needs a holistic approach that also considers the building of capacity of those outside the organization. Thus it can be pointed out that there was less utilization of gender data and findings within
IRC to attain social justice within the communities as demanded by feminists advocating for taking gender beyond just statistics (Espinosa, 2013). It is important to include in further analysis those gender impacts anticipated by the project and thus correlate these with the M&E systems to examine the linkages.

In programme context donors play the biggest role in ensuring that an organization’s M&E system gender-sensitive such as in humanitarian setting. DFID funding to IRC in 2013-2017 had clear demands on gender disaggregated data reporting. This finding corresponds to what scholars (Caren Grown, 2014 Gulrajani, 2013, Szper and Prakash, 2011) have found that the approach to gender mainstreaming is a donor driven process and the many approaches that organizations take to gender mainstream are often dictated by the donors themselves. In some instances, as Catsambas (2015) has shown, donors can completely transform an organization’s gender mainstreaming approach and pathway. However, in the case of IRC there was little evidence to suggest that the donor approach would be sustainable given the transitional nature of the served communities and also the attitudes of the communities who saw gender equality as not an essential ingredient of development according to the respondents. In addition, given the transitional nature of the workforce being recruited largely in emergencies it shows that gender sensitive approaches in M&E may take time to take root.

Conclusions and Recommendations for Practice

The findings clearly showed that organizational factors particularly organizational structure, culture and leadership as sub constructs are not significant predictors of the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in emergency and recovery phases of humanitarian aid in NGOs in Uganda. More practical and hands on experience and support is more important to the development of gender mainstreaming in M&E systems than just an articulation of policy and guidelines although these are also crucial to the process as they determine budget allocations and lines of accountability. It also emerged that programme factors specifically staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and programme context are predictors of the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in emergency and recovery phases of humanitarian aid in NGOs in Uganda. It is clear that there are other factors that contribute to the development of gender sensitive M&E systems within the humanitarian context that are not of organizational or programmatic nature. This is because both organizational and programme factors explain not more than 65% variation in gender sensitive M&E systems according to the findings.

Findings show that organizational aspects of gender mainstreaming though crucial, have less significance on gender mainstreaming in emergencies and recovery aspects of humanitarian aid and so, researchers recommend paying more attention to building programme factors as they easily enhance gender mainstreaming in M&E. there is a need to provide more field based and hands on training on how to integrate gender into project activities. More investment should be made on enhancing staff competencies in gender mainstreaming and also training them on project methods and tools that enhance gender mainstreaming in M&E. Evaluators and other specialists in M&E should be keen on contextual issues and how they affect the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. These issues include how donors, partners and other stakeholders perceive gender mainstreaming. Efforts are needed to develop ownership of gender mainstreaming efforts by all stakeholders at all levels of project design and implementation especially in humanitarian work.

References
African Development Bank (2012) Mainstreaming Gender Equality: A Road to Results or a Road to Nowhere? Tunisia
Caren Grown (2014)”Aid and Gender Equality” Position paper, Helsinki: UNU-WIDER.
Franklina Mantilla (2012) Review of Gender Mainstreaming in UNEP, UNEP evaluation office

IRC (2017) Family Planning & Post Abortion Care in Emergencies Program bi annual report, Kampala


USAID (2010) Gender integration index, Washington Dc

USAID (2016) Guidelines for integrating gender in Monitoring and Evaluation systems and policies, Washington Dc
Yasmeen Makarem (nd) Gendered Organizations: A Critical Review
The Mediating role of Planned Behaviour on Deterrence Initiatives aimed at Managing Local Government Workplace Compliance-Replace Musuya

Lungisa S & Nzewi O.I.
Corresponding E-mail: slungisantlemeza77@gmail.com

Abstract
Orientation: Compliance culture within the South African local government context is perceived to be critical to sustainable municipality service delivery. Improving compliance culture is therefore important.

Research purpose: This article therefore developed a compliance framework based on Deterrence Theory (DT) and the Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) to identify human behavioural factors to be considered in the development and use of work procedures as a way to improve workers’ compliance with work procedures.

Motivation for the study: Reports (e.g. Auditor General Reports) on municipality service delivery fall short of providing a clear assessment and study of work and human behavioural dynamics in relation to compliance with work procedures.

Research approach, design and method: This article tested a conceptual model focused on the effect of deterrence initiatives on workplace compliance as mediated by the theory-planned behaviour. Data were collected from 119 workers in two municipalities of the Eastern Cape Province in South Africa through a structured questionnaire and analysed using structural equation model.

Main findings: Findings show that a positive attitude towards compliance to work procedures cannot be achieved through intimidation; reinforcement has a positive effect on attitude, subjective norms and Perceived Behavioural Control (PBC). However, only the PBC aspect of the TPB explains significant mediation between deterrence and compliance.

Practical and managerial implications: The study demonstrates how compliance culture can be engendered by non-intimidating deterrent measures and PBC.

Contributions or value-add: The negative effect of intimidation on compliance culture and the positive effect of PBC on compliance attitude of workers are critical contributions.

Key words: Compliance culture, Theory of Planned Behaviour, Human Behavioural Factors

Introduction
Understanding organisational behaviour is critical for effective management of human resources. There is consensus among scholars that the concept is essential in cultivating a culture of compliance towards work procedures. The insinuation here is that employee behavioural management is cardinal in driving the institutions and organisation forward. In recent years, however, Human Resources Management (HRM) has come under major scrutiny, especially in the South African local government context where sustainable service delivery still remains a challenge. This is partly attributable to the lack of a compliance culture in relation to following work procedures on the part of both the managers and the employees (AGSA, 2016). Nzewi (2017) argues that informal application of work procedures seems to be widely evident in the local government context because of a plethora of administrative factors such as limited communication and lack of documentation among others. Despite this state of affairs, most government reports such as the Auditor General (Republic of South Africa, 2016a), the local government turnaround strategy (Republic of South Africa, 2009) and the back to basics policy (Republic of South Africa, 2014) are mute on providing in-depth analyses on, as well as solutions to, the internal challenges of compliance faced by municipalities. In particular, these reports fall short of providing a clear
assessment and study of work and human dynamics in relation to compliance with work procedures and legislative provisions that govern them.

In a bid to cover this void in the literature and weaknesses in the practice of compliance to work procedures in the local government context, this study used the Deterrence Theory (DT) and the Theory of Planned Behaviour (TPB) to identify behavioural factors to be considered important in the development and use of work procedures. Work procedures in this sense are viewed as organisational design statements or rules that can be strategically employed to improve compliance with legislation and regulations applying to local government. In this regard, the study sought to determine the mediating role of planned behaviour on deterrence initiatives aimed at managing local government workplace compliance. As a result, a conceptual model testing the mediating role of planned behaviour on deterrence initiatives at managing workplace compliance was developed and tested in two selected municipalities in the Eastern Cape Province, the Oliver Tambo District Municipality and Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality. To this end, the article sought to answer two questions:

(1) What is the mediating role of planned behaviour on deterrence initiatives aimed at managing local government workplace compliance?
(2) How valid are the TPB and DT hypothetical model for managing workplace compliance to work procedures?

Theoretical Framing

A review of the relevant theories guiding this study is prudent in exploring and articulating the nexus between theories and employee compliance to work procedures. Based on the South African local government experiences on the adoption and practice of work procedures, the study hinged on DT and the TPB in informing the development of the proposed model.

Theory of Planned Behaviour

The TPB, whose main architects are Ajzen and Fishbein (1973):

\[ I \] is a social-psychological theory that explains behavioural decision-making processes of human beings with aiming at understanding and predicting the behaviour of individuals, advocating that the successful completion of human behaviours are mainly controlled by individual will (Zhang, 2018, p. 76).

The main tenets in relation to this include three primary assumptions, which are: (1) attitude, (2) subjective norm (SN) and (3) perceived behavioural control (PBC). Ajzen (2006, p. 35) defines attitude as ‘a learned predisposition to respond to an object or class of objects in a consistently favourable and unfavourable way’. Attitude towards the act (AAAct), however, is defined as the degree to which performance of the behaviour is positively or negatively valued by an individual (Ajzen, 2006). In the light of the definitions, this study adopts Ajzen’s (2005, p. 30) definition of attitude as a disposition to respond favourably or unfavourably to an object, person or institution.

More so, SN is defined by Conner, Norman and Bell (2002, p. 197) ‘as a function of normative beliefs, which represent perceptions of specific significant others’ preferences about whether one should or should not engage in a behaviour’. According to Ajzen (1991, p. 195), ‘normative beliefs are concerned with the likelihood that important referent individuals or groups approve or disapprove of performing a given behaviour’. In other words,
SNs deal with people with the ability to influence others (Fishbein & Ajzen, 2010). Perceived behavioural control refers mainly to people’s perceptions of their ability to perform a given behaviour (Ajzen, 2006). In the TPB, PBC is determined by the total set of accessible control of factors that may facilitate or impede the performance of the behaviour. To be specific, the strength of each control belief (c) is weighted by the perceived power (P) of the control factor, and the products are aggregated (Ajzen, 2006). Perceived behavioural control can also predict behaviour directly to the extent that the measure matches actual control.

In this research study, the assumptions and antecedents of TPB are used to measure the relevance and importance of managing workplace compliance to accelerate organisational performance and simultaneously to enforce the culture of compliance to work procedures among the employees. This is largely based on the notion that the local government (sphere) is underpinned by non-compliance with legislative and regulatory frameworks, which hinders effective municipal performance and service delivery (Ijeoma & Nzewi, 2016). The intent of this study was to determine the mediating role of planned behaviour on deterrence initiative aimed at managing local government workplace compliance.

**Deterrence Theory**

The roots of the modern-day DT date back to the era when the USA was coming into existence (Johnson, 2019). The main proponents of the theory are Cesare Beccaria who wrote essay on *Crimes and Punishments* in 1764 and Jeremy Bentham who wrote *An Introduction to the Principles of Morals and Legislation* (introduction to the Principles) in 1781. These philosophers emphasised the notion that ‘punishment must be proportionate to the crime committed and that punishment should occur as immediately after the commission of a crime’ (Johnson, 2019, p. 3). Therefore, under DT, an individual is punished for breach of a rule or law, and this serves as a lesson for the rest of society. Through this, a clear message is conveyed, which outlines what is right or wrong and consequences for such actions are indicated. In deterrence, punishment is viewed as a medium or tool of communicating a message, with the intention of stimulating individuals’ conscious and unconscious thoughts against committing an offence (Bates, Darvell, & Watson, 2015, p. 27). This will result in the development of a habitual culture of compliance with procedures and law within a society (Hawkin, 1969).

According to Schneider (2019, p. 1), the concept of deterrence ‘focuses on the use or the threat of punishment, with the intention to avoid people breaking the law that governs the coexistence of a society’. This is relevant in the study of municipal employee behaviour because the most deviants are often public office holders who occupy the top rungs of the administrative machinery and their subordinates. Noteworthy, non-compliance to work procedures directly or indirectly reduces an organisation’s competitive advantage. In this regard, the DT emphasises the need to abide by the law, and failure to that, organisational employees have to face punishment.

Beyleveld (1979, p. 207), in his contribution to DT, argues that at the centre of the effectiveness of deterrence is the consistent application of sanctions. He eludes that through sanctions, an individual is deterred from committing an offence because he fears the application of the sanction. In essence, sanctions act as the primary stimulator of the fear of intimidation found in the deterrent effect (Beyleveld, 1979) in (Bates et al., 2015, p. 24). Elliott (2003), in the light of Beyleveld’s (1979) definition, alludes that deterrence is therefore pivotal in ensuring compliance with rules and laws. Elliot (2003) further outlines how deterrence operates, explaining that the introduction of sanctions deters and prevents an offence in the following ways:
A clear knowledge of consequences associated with the breach of legislation and regulation invokes individual perception on costs of offending that results in compliance being seen to be more attractive than offending.

At the centre of sanctions is moral education, which stimulates a culture of habit to comply with legislation and regulation.

Implementation of sanctions on breach of law is pivotal than merely providing threats.

Through punishment of an individual on breach of law, offences can be reduced by capacitating potential offenders and reforming offenders which results in informal pressure to comply.

Therefore, this study uses DT to develop and present a work and human dynamic compliance-based model through that municipalities can improve legislative and regulatory framework compliance, which has been a recurring challenge for municipal performance. In the next section, the article presents how these theories are applicable in terms of the proposed context of local government performance.

**Application of Theory of Planned Behaviour and Deterrence Theory in Local Government**

Among the many challenges of local government, non-compliance with legislation and regulatory frameworks is weightier than others (Nzewi, 2017). Therefore, it is important to understand the challenges of the South African local governance (Ijeoma & Nzewi, 2016). Thus, this study identified the TPB and the DT as possible foundations for the design of work procedures for organisational compliance towards improved performance and service delivery in local government. To our knowledge, very few studies have focused on organisational compliance using TPB. Nzewi (2017) developed a TPB-based conceptual framework to manage municipal audit compliance through work procedures. However, Nzewi’s (2017) conceptual framework fell short of providing strategies on how the antecedents of the TPB will be strengthened to ensure a culture of audit compliance through work procedures.

Herath and Rao (2009) used both the TPB and DT to examine employee security compliance intentions. Their study identified that the antecedents of the TPB need to be supplemented by a theory that ensures conduct with law; hence, their study emphasised the adoption of the DT. Deterrence theory focuses on the notion that punishment must be used on employees who fail to abide by the set rules and regulations. At the heart of this study is the exploration of the interplay between the DT and the TPB to ensure that compliance with work procedures is achieved at local government domain.

The main objective of this research study was to find out the mediating role of planned behaviour on deterrence initiatives aimed at managing local government workplace compliance. However, in the review of the two theories, shortcomings were identified with the TPB, answering only the objective of how these human behavioural factors can be identified and falling short on how compliance will be instilled in the culture of the organisation, and hence the introduction of the DT, which focuses fundamentally on consequences of non-compliance with work procedures. Therefore, in essence, these two theories supplement each other in the sense that TPB focuses on studying and influencing human behaviour and DT provides strengthening mechanisms that influence the already studied human behaviour by TPB. Thus, this study employed a mixed model of the DT and the TPB as a way to ensure that designed work procedures are cognisant of the social and behavioural factors of municipal officials.
This study focused on three variables: DT, TPB and Intention to Comply (ITC). The study examined the influence of deterrence on ITC and the TPB was used as an intervening variable that intended to test if the influence of deterrence on ITC was persistent with the inclusion of TPB. Each of the two theories was composed of three antecedents: DT (intimidation, education and reinforcement) and TPB (attitude, SNs and PBC). In this regard, a hypothetical model was developed to test the relationship between deterrence and ITC and the effect of planned behaviour on that relationship.

In this case, the ITC with legislative and regulatory frameworks will be influenced by attitude, SNs and PBC. However, the study strongly argues that the TPB lacks in terms of what may prevent or deter a negative behaviour once the antecedents of the theory have been stimulated or enhanced. Therefore, the DT proposes that unwanted behaviour can be prevented through deterrent effect (intimidation), strengthening of moral inhibitions (education) and stimulation of habitual law-abiding conduct (reinforcement) (Williams & Hawkins, 1986). The following hypotheses were made in the context of work procedure compliance:

- **H1a**: Attitude towards compliance with work procedures influences the intention to comply with legislation and regulation.
- **H1b**: Subjective norms with work procedures influence the ITC with legislation and regulation.
- **H1c**: Perceived behavioural control with work procedures influences the intention to comply with legislation and regulation.

Deterrence theory is mostly used in the discipline of criminology. Peace, Galletta and Thong (2003), in their examination of organisational software piracy, found that the severity of punishment influences piracy attitudes in organisational software. The study also found that imposing penalties on organisational software piracy can lead to prevention of certain behaviour. Thus, Herath and Rao (2009) suggest that if actions of an employee result in the breach of work procedures, the organisation must investigate the offence and the employee should be punished through imposing a penalty. Thus, the employee will perceive the severity of punishment for non-compliance to be high, and their intention to commit undesired behaviours is likely to decline as a result. Therefore, the study hypothesised that:

- **H2a**: The deterrent effect (intimidation) influences attitude towards compliance with work procedures.
- **H2b**: The deterrent (intimidation) influences SNs towards compliance with work procedures.
- **H2c**: The deterrent effect (intimidation) influences PBC to comply with work procedures.

Wikström (2010) argues that, without fear of punishment and moral constraints, individuals are most likely to display a higher prospect of offending in any given scenario. Therefore, his study intended to answer the following questions: what influences people to break moral rules? Do these individuals view the behaviour as a viable alternative? (Wikström, 2010). In this regard, if the individual perceives monitoring to be effective and sanction thereof to be severe, this may create deterrence. Thus, out of fear of consequence, which acts as a factor in any thought over whether or not to perform a motivation and break a moral rule or law, deterrence is created (Wikström & Treiber, 2007, p. 245). This study therefore hypothesised that:

- **H3a**: Strengthening moral inhibition (education) influences attitude towards compliance with work procedures.
- **H3b**: Strengthening moral inhibition (education) influences SNs regarding compliance with work procedures.
- **H3c**: Strengthening moral inhibition (education) influences perceived behavioural control over compliance with work procedures.
Shoham, Beck and Kett (2008, p. 352) state that for habitual law-abiding conduct to occur, strengthening of moral education becomes pivotal in this regard. Therefore, if an individual is taught morals that respond to what is stated in the law and to what degree compliance is rewarded and breaches punished, the individual is most likely to develop morality that leads to the birth of a culture of moral habits that promote law-abiding conduct.

In essence, an individual who has internalised and developed moral habits that promote law-abiding conduct will not see non-compliance as an alternative action, and therefore, will habitually behave in line with the law (Loughran, Piquero, Fagan, & Mulvey, 2012). Such individuals have built a culture of morality and moral habits that support compliance. Hence, the fear of consequence for non-compliance will play a significant role in their choice of action. Therefore, this study hypothesised the following:

- **H4a**: The stimulation of habitual law-abiding conduct (reinforcement) influences attitude towards compliance with work procedures.
- **H4b**: The stimulation of habitual law-abiding conduct (reinforcement) influences SNs regarding compliance with work procedures.
- **H4c**: The stimulation of habitual law-abiding conduct (reinforcement) influences PBC over compliance with procedures.

To this end, Figure 1 represents the developed hypothetical model.

---

**Figure 4: A Proposed Theory of Planned Behaviour And Deterrence Theory Hypothetical Model for Managing Workplace Compliance**

*Source: Authors’ own work*
Methodology

Research Design

In this study, an exploratory cross-sectional survey research design was employed. According to Manerikar and Manerikar (2014, p. 95), 'exploratory research is the initial research conducted to clarify and define the nature of the problem'. The goal of exploratory research design is to formulate problems, clarify concepts and form hypotheses. Human behaviour in the development and design of work procedures in the field of local government have been barely researched (Nzewi, 2017). This study intended to clarify and define work procedures in local government as a tool to improve the level of compliance with legislation and regulation.

Population and Sampling

The Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality has 672 municipal officials (IDP, 2016/2021) and O.R Tambo District Municipality has 555 municipal officials (Republic of South Africa, O.R Tambo District Municipality, IDP Review, 2016b). The target population of this study was derived from three departments, namely corporate services, infrastructure services, and budget and treasury. The total number of employees in the three departments was 220 for the Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality and 195 for the O.R. Tambo District Municipality. All employees from senior managers to line officials were targeted in the study as work procedures need to be followed by everyone in an organisation.

This study sampled employees from the municipalities using non-probability sampling methods. According to Kumar (2014, p. 242), these are designs that are used when either the number of elements in a population is unknown or the elements cannot be individually identified. This research used snowball sampling technique. Two main issues informed this choice: the first is the nature of local government operations in the chosen municipalities, where there is a marked difficulty in accessing respondents. The second is that snowball sampling augurs well for this research which is exploratory and where there is more focus on testing the relationship between variables than making generalisations. The directorates of the three departments identified for the study were required to provide information on suitable respondents for the study. In essence, they were asked to identify other people in their respective departments to become part of the sample. Then the selected individuals of whom most were divisional and project heads were further asked to identify other suitable members within the departments. In turn, the identified individuals became the basis for further data collection.

Sample Size

The Raosoft sample size calculator (2004) was used for the purposes of this study. The combined number of municipal officials of the two respective municipalities is 415. The population targeted by the study were municipal workers of O.R Tambo District Municipality and Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality. The response distribution was set at 50% for each question because the researchers did not know how the response rate would turn out. As the researchers had no way of knowing the skewness of either the population or sample prior, the 50% mark, which gives the largest sample size, was used. The margin of error was set at a minimum of 5% as any value lower than that would have required a significantly larger sample size. The confidence level was at a maximum of 95% because higher confidence levels would have required a larger sample size.

Furthermore, the sample size for this study was estimated based on sample size required for factor analysis. Despite the seemingly known standards regarding reasonable absolute minimum sample size required for factor
analysis, lack of consensus still persists in the literature. In some situations, practical conditions preclude a study from having sample size of up 100, 200, 500 and so on. Based on simulation models, it was found that some conditions are more critical in determining the right sample size. These conditions relate to a number of factors: factor loadings, number of variables and size of communalities. While Pearson and Mundform (2010) faulted the general rule of thumb regarding the reasonable absolute minimum sample size required to yield quality results, some scholars have argued that exploratory factor analysis (EFA) can produce results even from sample sizes below 50, provided that the factor loadings are high, the number of factors is low and the number of variables is high (De-Winter, Dodou, & Wieringa, 2009). Therefore, the sample of 119 was considered adequate, given that the number of factors was low (seven factors); factor loadings were high, ranging from 0.62 to 0.99; and the number of variables involved were as high as 22. The 119 questionnaires out of the 200 questionnaires administered represent a 60% response rate.

Data Analysis

Data were entered and analysed in Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 25. The first step was to conduct data cleaning by screening cases and variables in the data set. This was performed to ensure that a clean data set for data analysis was generated. In the process of case screening, two participants were removed from the data set because they had over 13% missing values across the 22 indicators of latent variables. Other missing data less than 13% were replaced with near-point median values. Three missing values on the demographic variables were replaced with probable values deduced from contingency analyses performed. Thus, the sample size became 117. The possibility of participants ticking options at random leads to unengaged responses that could dilute the normality and validity of the data set. We therefore used standard deviation to check for this. Any standard deviation equals to 0 or close to 0.5, potentially shows that the participant probably had not fully engaged in the survey and was therefore removed. A total of 11 cases whose standard deviations were less than 0.5 were thus removed. This further brought down the sample size to 106. A number of latent indicators violate the strict normality rule of ±1 in terms of kurtosis and skewness, although these values are within the more relaxed range recommended by Sposito, Hand and Skarpness (1983) who put the upper threshold at 3.3.

Exploration

Exploratory factor analysis was conducted to determine which of the 22 latent indicators adequately explained variation in the seven latent constructs involved in this study. Maximum likelihood method was used for extraction of factors, while Promax rotation was used for the model optimisation with Kappa set at 4. Other criteria include: eigen-values > 1; suppression of small coefficients was set at <0.3; loading factor >0.6. From the EFA results, the factor model obtained extracted factors with minimum eigenvalue of 1.052 which is greater than 1. The extracted factors explain 63.607% of the total variance having only 9% non-redundant residuals with absolute values greater than 0.05. The retained items were considered adequate based on the Kaiser–Meyer–Olkin measure of sampling adequacy higher than 0.5 (0.774) and a statistically significant Bartlett sphericity test (<0.001).

Validity and Reliability

Given that the questionnaire for this study was adopted from the study of Hadadgar et al. (2016), it became imperative to conduct confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). The aim of CFA was to ensure that the latent
constructs, as measured by the questionnaire, satisfy construct, discriminant and convergent validity standards. IBM SPSS Amos version 25 was used to perform CFA and results are presented in the next sections.

Construct Validity

The CFA model fit indices show evidence of good construct validity (Hooper, Coughlan, & Mullen, 2008). The CFA model has the following fit indices: relative chi-square = 1.245; chi-square = 69.723; DF = 56; P = 0.103; comparative fit index (CFI) = 0.977; incremental fit index (IFI) = 0.979; Tucker Lewis index (TLI) = 0.963; root mean square error of approximation (RMSEA) = 0.048; p of Close Fit (PCLOSE) = 0.506; standard root mean residual (SRMR) = 0.0503.

Discriminant Validity

To satisfy theory-testing criteria, discriminant validity was also tested. This idea is to ensure that a latent construct is not better explained by some other variables than by its own observed variables. Hair, Black, Babin and Anderson (2010) state that discriminant validity criterion must ensure that the maximum shared variance (MSV) for the latent constructs must be less than the corresponding average variance extracted (AVE) estimates. From tables provided in Appendix 1, the criterion for discriminant validity was met for the six remaining constructs.

Convergent Validity

Malhotra and Dash (2011) recommend that convergent validity be measured in a stricter way using AVE. They set the criterion that AVE should be greater than 0.5, implying that less than 50% of the variance should be because of error. Results showing that all AVE estimates are greater than 0.5 prove that our CFA models have good convergent validity.

Reliability

Composite reliability (CR) was estimated to ascertain the internal consistency for all the seven latent constructs. The criterion is that CR score above 0.7 is considered acceptable. From the results presented in Appendix 1, the CR scores range from 0.70 to 0.91, thereby showing that items reliably measure the constructs involved in the study.

Multivariate Assumptions

Multivariate assumptions were addressed by estimating Cook’s distance, tolerance values and variable inflation factor (VIF) using IBM SPSS version 25. We ran a Cook’s distance analysis to determine if there were outliers and influential. Based on the threshold of Cook’s distance greater than 1, we observed that there were no influential observations as the highest Cook’s distance is less than 0.53. As there was no persistently high Cook’s distance in any case, no participant was removed. Tolerance and VIF were estimated to evaluate multicollinearity assumption. The least tolerance value obtained of 0.309 was greater than the required threshold of 0.1, while
most obtained VIF value hovered around 1.54. This value is less than the threshold of 3.00. These criteria being met indicate good multicollinearity.

**Figure 5: Scatter Graph Showing Non-significant Outliers and Influential**

*Source: Authors’ own work*

**Structural Equation Model**

Having obtained good validity and reliability, a structural equation model (see Figure 3) was developed to include the latent constructs indicated in the theoretical framework (see Figure 2). As a critical requirement, the structural model was tested for fitness with data set. As set by Hooper et al. (2008), the following indices show good fit: relative chi-square ($\chi^2$/df) = 1.234; CFI = 0.976; TLI = 0.965; IFI = 0.977; RMSEA = 0.047; PCLOSE = 0.529; SRMR = 0.0579.

**Figure 6: Structural model of theory of planned behaviour and deterrence theory on managing workplace compliance. SN, subjective norm; PBC, Perceived Behavioural Control**
Demographics and Descriptive Analysis

Out of 106 participants, there were 42 male participants and 64 female participants representing approximately 40% and 60%, respectively. A total of 58% of the respondents were supervisors, 16% were assistant managers, and 10% were managers, while 15% were senior managers. In terms of age, 43% of the respondents were below 25 years, while 35% were between ages 25 and 35 years. The remaining 22% were between ages 36 and 45 years. About 54% had either a diploma or a bachelor’s degree, while 23% had either honours or master’s degree. Another 23% had only matriculation (see Appendix 2 for details).

On a scale of 56, intimation (I) has the lowest mean composite score at 2.40 (standard deviation = 1.11), while reinforcement (R) has the highest at 4.28 (standard deviation = 1.27). Furthermore, all constructs were correlated to show their associations by performing a two-tailed bivariate correlation analysis. Results (see Table 1) show that all correlation coefficients were statistically significant at either $\alpha = 0.05$ or $\alpha = 0.01$.

Table 2: Matrix of Correlation Coefficients among Study Constructs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SN</th>
<th>PBC</th>
<th>ITC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>0.512**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>0.558**</td>
<td>0.815**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>0.307**</td>
<td>0.512**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>0.264**</td>
<td>0.458**</td>
<td>0.659**</td>
<td>0.468**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBC</td>
<td>0.226*</td>
<td>0.496**</td>
<td>0.627**</td>
<td>0.522**</td>
<td>0.412**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC</td>
<td>0.323**</td>
<td>0.628**</td>
<td>0.703**</td>
<td>0.468**</td>
<td>0.544**</td>
<td>0.746**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I, intimation; E, estimate; R, reinforcement; A, attitude; SN, subjective norm; PBC, perceived behavioural control; ITC, intention to comply.

*Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (two-tailed).

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (two-tailed).

Hypotheses Testing

There were 12 sub-hypotheses involved in this explorative study. The structural equation model was used to estimate the regression weights of each path involved in the model and the $p$-value was computed (with $\alpha < 0.05$) to determine statistical significance of each regression weight. The results are presented in Table 2.

Table 3: Standardised Regression Weights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regression paths</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Standard error</th>
<th>Critical ratio</th>
<th>$P$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>-0.301</td>
<td>0.152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>-0.086</td>
<td>0.123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBC</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>-0.144</td>
<td>0.136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>-0.179</td>
<td>0.197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>-0.325</td>
<td>0.241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBC</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>-0.092</td>
<td>0.213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>0.921</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The results presented in Table 2 show that only 6 out of 12 regression weights have statistical significance. From Table 2, the results indicate that intimidation (I) has significantly negative influence on attitude (a component of TPB), $A \ (r = -0.301, \ p = 0.049)$. The implication is that attitude towards compliance with work procedure will decrease by an estimated 30% because of a proportionate increase in the use of intimidation. Intimidation therefore is not a good tool for fostering the right and ethical attitude towards workplace procedures compliance.

Results also show that reinforcement, $R$, has significantly positive impact on attitude, $A \ (r = 0.921, \ p = 0.002)$, SN $\ (r = 0.807, \ p = 0.002)$ and $PBC \ (r = 0.792, \ p < 0.001)$. These imply that attitude will increase by 92%, SN by 81% and PBC by 80% as reinforcement increases by 100%. Reinforcement therefore is a very significant deterrence factor having high impact on TPB.

Similarly, SN $\ (r = 0.246, \ p = 0.033)$ and PBC $\ (r = 0.548, \ p < 0.001)$ have a significantly positive impact on ITC with work procedures. This implies that as SN increases by 100%, there will be a corresponding increase in ITC by 25%; while 100% increase in PBC will result in a corresponding 55% increase in ITC with work procedures.

**Table 4: Standardised Regression Weights**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mediated paths</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Lower</th>
<th>Upper</th>
<th>$p$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow A \rightarrow I$</td>
<td>-0.008</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td>0.653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow A \rightarrow E$</td>
<td>-0.008</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.172</td>
<td>0.396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow A \rightarrow R$</td>
<td>0.022</td>
<td>-2.515</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.702</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow SN \rightarrow I$</td>
<td>-0.021</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.048</td>
<td>0.204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow SN \rightarrow E$</td>
<td>-0.040</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.089</td>
<td>0.172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow SN \rightarrow R$</td>
<td>0.170</td>
<td>-0.056</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow PBC \rightarrow I$</td>
<td>-0.078</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.634</td>
<td>0.285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow PBC \rightarrow E$</td>
<td>-0.046</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.432</td>
<td>0.531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC $\rightarrow PBC \rightarrow R$</td>
<td>0.370</td>
<td>-2.938</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>0.035</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I, intimation; E, estimate; R, reinforcement; A, attitude; SN, subjective norms; PBC, perceived behavioural control; ITC, intention to comply.

From the structural model, nine mediated paths were tested and the results are presented in Table 3. The results show that only two mediated paths are statistically significant at $p < 0.05$. In other words, SN significantly mediates between reinforcement and ITC with work procedures at $r = 0.170$ and $p = 0.045$. Thus, SN has a 17% mediating effect between reinforcement and ITC. Similarly, PBC has a 37% mediating effect between ITC with work procedures significantly at $p = 0.035$. 

---

SN $\rightarrow$ R

PBC $\rightarrow$ R

ITC $\rightarrow$ A

ITC $\rightarrow$ SN

ITC $\rightarrow$ PBC

I, intimation; E, estimate; R, reinforcement; A, attitude; SN, subjective norm; PBC, perceived behavioural control; ITC, intention to comply.

*** means $p < 0.001$ in Amos.
Findings and Discussion

The findings of the study reveal that a positive attitude towards compliance to work procedures cannot be achieved through intimidation. In contrast to the deterrent effect (intimidation) that is largely regarded as an essential tenet of the DT that can be adopted to foster compliance to work procedures, the results of this study show that intimidation cannot always bear positive results on employee attitude. The study by Bates et al. (2015) on the use of deterrence to explain provisional drivers’ non-compliance found that drivers exposed to higher levels of enforcement for traffic and speeding offences were less compliant. This is in a similar vein to Havov and Putri’s (2016) assertion that employees’ compliance with ethical conduct is to a greater extent influenced by the employees’ personal norms and moral standards rather than intimidation. This finding is in contrast with the doctrine of DT which states that punishing an individual for a crime should discourage them from committing it again. The insinuation presented here is that the use or the threat of punishment or sanctions with the intention to deter employees breaking the law at workplace has a negative bearing on employee attitude; hence, it cannot be considered a good practice in establishing an organisational culture of compliance to work procedures. The implication for municipal practice is that enforcing employee ethical codes of conduct through intimidation as a means to deterrence can result in employees having a negative attitude towards work procedures and hence non-compliance. This can result in negative consequences on the general performance of municipalities. This is further elucidated by Bireswari (2013) who asserts that negative employee attitude is a contributing variable to poor organisational performance. In this regard, the study suggests that the application of intimidation at managerial levels may stifle efforts towards the establishment of a positive attitude on compliance to work procedures.

Reinforcement has a positive effect on attitude, SN and PBC. This supports the notion that the stimulation of a habitual law-abiding conduct (reinforcement) in organisations can be adopted and used as a condition sine-qua-non for the establishment of positive compliant behaviour and control. In other terms, the absence of reinforcement may dwarf an organisation’s efforts that are geared towards the establishment of these dependent variables. To obtain desirable results for organisations (municipalities in this study context), managers need to increase reinforcement through monitoring compliance with work procedures, communication of work procedures and review of work procedures after a reasonable period. Other studies (Maritim, 2016; Wei & Yazdanifard, 2014) also reflect a significant contribution of positive reinforcement in changing attitude, SNs and PBC at the workplace. The implication for municipal managerial practice is that workplace motivation, attitude and SNs can be subdued if positive reinforcement is not taken into consideration.

This study also finds that PBC is the only aspect of TPB that significantly affects ITC with work procedures. The study by Herath and Rao (2009) on information systems security compliance revealed that evidence from many contexts shows greater PBC influence on behaviour than measures of attitude and SN. This is in line with the research that found that intent to comply could be limited by factors beyond the individuals’ control, such as time, cost, resistance from others (interference) and skill to perform such task. For instance, Dzansi, Chipunza and Monnapula-Mapesela (2016) found a positive relationship between political interference and how employees perceive fairness in HRM practices. According to Nzewi (2017), within the context of local government in South Africa, intentions or motivations to behave cannot be sufficient. This is because municipalities in South Africa have become the locus of capacity and skills dearth and political tensions. These are conditions that limit the ability and capability to behave in terms of volitional control. From this perspective, PBC can be useful in predicting compliance behaviour. Therefore, this implies that municipalities must give
consideration to the perceived difficulties or barriers directly limiting one from carrying out a behavioural intent and the confidence one has regardless of internal or external environment.

The above implies that there is only a partial mediation between DT and ITC involving SN, PBC and reinforcement. The principal variables that will most likely result in the ITC therefore is the interaction between reinforcement and PBC. This suggests that reinforcement from managers is boosted by employees’ positive perceptions of their ability and capability to carry out the particular compliance task.

**Conclusion**

This study used empirically based literature on the TPB and DT to develop a hypothetical model for local government compliance. The model was tested to find the mediating role of planned behaviour on deterrence initiatives aimed at compliance behaviour. In answering the two research questions, the results show that a positive attitude towards compliance to work procedures cannot be achieved through intimidation mechanisms of sanctions and punishment of municipal employees. This result is in contrast to the deterrent effect that is generally regarded as essential to foster in compliance. Indeed, the results reveal that reinforcement has a positive effect on attitude, SN and PBC. This makes reinforcement a pivotal and important instrument that municipalities and similar organisations can adopt and use to establish a culture of compliance with work procedures. Furthermore, the results reveal PBC to be the only antecedent of TPB to significantly affect the ITC with work procedures. What this says in terms of the mediating role of planned behaviour on ITC is that where there is reinforcement or habitual stimulation of law-abiding conduct, the negative impact of employees’ perceptions of conditions which limit their ability and capability to behave (PBC) is curtailed. This improves employees’ likelihood to comply. The importance of these findings is that they inform municipalities to consider reinforcement measures that grow compliance behaviour and measures to increase employees’ perceived lack of ability or capability to perform a task (e.g. training). These measures will limit the perceived difficulties or barriers that directly limit employees from carrying out tasks and duties related to compliance.

**References**


## Appendix 1

### Table A1: Validity and Reliability Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
<th>MSV</th>
<th>MaxR (H)</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SN</th>
<th>PBC</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>ITC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.735</td>
<td>0.737</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.353</td>
<td>0.969</td>
<td>0.404**</td>
<td>0.880</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBC</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.424</td>
<td>0.938</td>
<td>0.448***</td>
<td>0.394**</td>
<td>0.915</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.257</td>
<td>0.989</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.258*</td>
<td>0.218†</td>
<td>0.849</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.499</td>
<td>0.769</td>
<td>0.239†</td>
<td>0.406**</td>
<td>0.435***</td>
<td>0.459**</td>
<td>0.788</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.499</td>
<td>0.744</td>
<td>0.424**</td>
<td>0.594***</td>
<td>0.560***</td>
<td>0.507**</td>
<td>0.706***</td>
<td>0.742</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.424</td>
<td>0.719</td>
<td>0.364*</td>
<td>0.475**</td>
<td>0.651***</td>
<td>0.284*</td>
<td>0.517***</td>
<td>0.576***</td>
<td>0.740</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AVE, average variance extracted; MSV, maximum shared variance; A, attitude; ITC, intention to comply; I, intimation; E, estimate; R, reinforcement; SN, subjective norm; PBC, perceived behavioural control.

Significance of correlations: †p < 0.100, *p < 0.050, **p < 0.010, ***p < 0.001.

## Appendix 2

### Table A2: Demographic Details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job position</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior manager (sec 53 and 56)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant manager</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human resources</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O.R Tambo District Municipality</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buffalo City Metropolitan Municipality</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age bracket</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 25 years old</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25–35 years old</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36–45 years old</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matric certificate</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma–bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honours–master’s degree</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Student’s perspectives on Postgraduate Training in Monitoring and Evaluation: A case of Post Graduate Diploma in M&E participants at Uganda Management Institute

1David Ssekamatte, 2Mary Gorret Wanyese, 3Florence Abesigye, 4Emily Florence Akia Oteeni & 5Hilda Syahuka
1,2,4Uganda Management Institute
3Women Organization Network for Human Rights Advocacy
Corresponding E-mail: dmssekamatte@gmail.com

Abstract
Globally, training in Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) has been a key aspect for development work mainly in form of short term capacity building training for development practitioners. Of recent some universities and institutions of higher education have developed short term and long term training programmes on M&E. The long term training programmes have been developed up to the level of Masters and PhD illustrating professionalization of the M&E discipline. Uganda Management Institute (UMI) offers a Post graduate diploma in Monitoring and Evaluation that continues to attract a huge number of practitioners looking for skills and knowledge in M&E. The researchers were interested in gaining insights into the diverse perspectives, experiences and challenges of the postgraduate diploma in M&E students during their training programmes at the Uganda Management Institute. These insights would support the UMI management as well as other practitioners in M&E capacity building programmes, with information to effectively design, and deliver relevant and customer focused training programmes. The researchers adopted a qualitative approach. Data was collected using focus group discussions. The collected data was then analysed using thematic analysis method. The findings indicate the passion for M&E and the need for M&E qualification as key motivators for many participants to join the training programme. The practical modules delivered, assessment modalities and the flexible delivery modes were seen as positive experiences during the programme. They however reported poor internet connection, limited facilities and e-learning resources on M&E as key challenges. The students generally appreciate the content and flexible delivery modalities of the programme and continue to be passionate about the structured training.

Key words: Students Perspectives, M&E Training, Capacity Building, Professionalization of M&E

Introduction
Globally, training in Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) has been a key aspect for development work mainly in form of short-term capacity building training for development practitioners. Of recent, some universities and institutions of higher education have developed short term and long-term training programmes on M&E. The long-term training programmes have been developed up to the level of Masters and PhD, illustrating professionalization of the M&E discipline. This is because Monitoring and Evaluation as a discipline has emerged as a critical aspect in the development world. It is incorporated throughout the entire project management cycle to provide a unique practical opportunity for learning and corrective action. Therefore, the uptake for M&E within institutions has steered a demand for practitioners and non-practitioners to acquire the best practices in this field. The selected universities providing this programme run both part-time and full-time. The part-time programmes are for the working class. This gives room for a learning and sharing platform between the trainers and trainees – experiential learning. Hence, trainers often expect to possess greater skills in recognizing the work, family and life constraints on postgraduate students(Brain, 2002).

Students enrol for M&E within institutions of higher education at post graduate level. Post graduate students are those that are building an academic career path after their Bachelor degree. Training and preparation at this level is of vital importance and it culminates into writing of thesis or dissertation(Oredein, 2008). The postgraduate training grounds students with knowledge, skills and practices to enhance effectiveness and efficiency, as well as performance of public and private projects in communities. However, a student’s experience at this level
depends on the good supervisor-student relationship. This serves as a key factor in the success or failure of the students’ scholarship or research work. It draws more inclusion and sense of ownership within the course; and may build a students’ need to professionalize in that field. But, despite the increased uptake of M&E at postgraduate level, students experience a number of challenges that constraint ability to effectively perform or complete the course.

These challenges include; cross-cutting purposes with supervisors, the existence of limited supporting structures for research, lack of access to ICT services, and the international exposure that can shape them for the current debates and discourse in their disciplines. This can be a motivating factor for students to embrace innovation within research. Besides, the low level of national funding of universities has taken heed into the low uptake of postgraduate research, training and capacity building. Therefore, much work needs to be done on post graduate programme, to ensure that there is a shift in administering postgraduate programmes in institutions of higher learning. This paper explores students’ perspectives, and views and regarding their motivation for joining the course, experiences (positive and negative) and challenges while undertaking the postgraduate diploma in Monitoring and Evaluation at Uganda Management Institute. This begins with the review of literature on Motivation for students joining postgraduate, positive and negative experiences while on the postgraduate programme, and the challenges they face, and the methodology followed. It also presents the key findings per theme, as well as discussion and conclusion.

**Literature Review**

**Motivators for Students Joining Postgraduate**

The concept of motivation is a key factor towards enticing a student to pursue their academic career. It plays a key role towards acquiring additional knowledge for them to achieve their aspirations in life. Motivation of students to join postgraduate level positions is mainly the demand to learn and enhance their skills. However, joining postgraduate requires persistence to learn, effort to devote oneself to hard work, and cope with obstacles they may encounter in the learning process. Student motivation is often viewed in two forms; intrinsic motivation and extrinsic motivation.

With intrinsic motivation, a student is self-motivated. Students keenly engage themselves in learning out of interest, and enjoyment, in order to achieve their own scholarly or personal goals. So, an intrinsically motivated student will not need any form of incentive or reward to complete a task (Dev, 1997). On the other hand, with extrinsic motivation, a student engages in learning so as to attain a reward or avoid any form of punishment. It may also mean the need to attain some form of reward or avoid some punishment external to the activity itself such as grades, or teacher approval. Thus, intrinsic motivation is self-driven, challenging, and more enthusiastic; students feel pleasure in their studies. Unlike, extrinsic motivation where a student has to drag themselves with academic assignments, feel compelled to learn and always put minimal efforts to achieve maximum appreciations.

Therefore, for a student to engage in any learning situation, motivation is triggered by answering three fundamental questions: ‘Can I do this activity?’, ‘Do I want to do this activity and why?’, and ‘What do I need to do to succeed?’(Wigfield & Eccles, 2001). Students that respond to the question “Can I do this activity?” have expectations relating to their capability to perform a certain activity in different areas. That is, individuals judge their ability to execute a particular course or assignment – self-efficacy.
Then, the question: “Do I want to do this activity and why?” is an intrinsic end extrinsic motivation aspect. Intrinsically motivated students engage in an assignment so that they can attain an opportunity to learn and enrich their knowledge in unknown aspects to them. On the other hand, extrinsically motivated students engage in an activity with an intention of attaining a desirable outcome (for example; reward, good grade, parents’ and teachers’ approval, avoidance of punishment). Intrinsic end extrinsic motivation fulfills the passion to acquire more cognitive engagement with an end goal of attaining a reward. However, the relationships between intrinsic and extrinsic motivation, engagement and achievement are complex. It is better to think about intrinsic and extrinsic motivation as two separate dimensions than extreme ends of one, because students can be low in one and high in the other, low in both or high in both (Pintrich & Schunk, 2002).

Then, the question, “What do I need to be successful in an activity?” positions the use of cognitive and metacognitive strategies in a learning activity. Cognitive in response to rehearsal, elaboration, organization; and metacognitive strategies responding to planning, monitoring, and evaluation. Therefore, Student motivation is the element that leads students’ attitude towards learning process. In academic institutions, the role of teacher is very vital to help students to develop an attitude towards learning. It is ascertained that beliefs of teachers about themselves, and their nature of teaching nature towards students, has powerful influence on students’ behaviour towards learning. So, teachers need to view themselves as ‘active socialization agents capable of stimulating students’ motivation to learn.

Therefore, to keep students motivated, they should be encouraged to explore interests outside their usual routine of work. For instance, students are highly motivated by opportunities to travel to meetings, or seat in workshops to meet others in their field, particularly the experts. Such opportunities can greatly increase the student's enthusiasm and self-esteem; allow the development of research and social contacts; and reduce the awe that the student may have of the subject. In general, it would seem that students who perform well should be rewarded with greater opportunities to accomplish their dreams. The normal method of rewarding excellence is a complex scenario in relation to postgraduates. Nevertheless, it is clear that even for highly motivated individuals, there is need to create a framework which will awaken the flame of their enthusiasm (O’Kennedy, 1990).

**Positive and Negative Experiences while on Post Graduate Programmes**

Exploring the experience of students varies from individual to individual. This can be based on a practical occurrence or event of an incidence. These experiences could be positive or negative based on one's attitude and knowledge about a circumstance. Therefore, positive experiences include the following; opportunities to meet and develop relationships with other students, broadened understanding and improved skills in independent thinking, and improved language skills (Lillyman & Bennett, 2014). In addition, the blended learning, that is, combining the strength of face-to-face and eLearning (video conferencing, and learning management systems) to create an efficient and effective learning environment has greatly evolved within learning institutions (Joel & Raphael, 2013). This has taken practice in both instructional worlds hence instructors use a variety of instructional techniques to achieve effective learning outcomes.

However, despite the fact that positive experiences have contributed to the uptake of post graduate programmes, there are difficulties faced by students. These difficulties include; difficulty in adapting to academic conventions (for example poor understanding of plagiarism) (Emma, 2017); stress relating to alternative teaching and learning styles; language difficulties; and financial struggles among others. Furthermore, an individual’s prior learning experiences and personal background have a great influence on the lived experience under postgraduate.
Challenges faced by Students on Post Graduate Programmes

Students on post graduate programmes are faced with several challenges that have been influenced by a number of social, political and environmental factors. For instance, inadequate funding takes heed in tertiary education, especially studies beyond post graduate level. Most public institutions of learning in Africa are poorly funded by their national governments. This transits to low research uptake, and low research capacity development; unlike their counterparts in the United States, Australia government and several countries in Europe and Asia that extensively provide research funding in academic institutions. Poor or low funding may delay the completion of research work (Adebisi, 2014). Another major challenge is the failure to effectively compete for international research. There is a stagnant placement for a competitive and dynamic knowledge-based economy; therefore, there tends to be limited avenues for higher education. This could be as a result of inadequately organized programmes for higher learning in developing countries that fail to compete with developed countries (Salako, 2014). Some countries and institutions have realized this gap and tried to solve it by introducing collaborative research. Furthermore, another well know challenge is failure to know how to write good proposals to access grants. Although, research is individual based, successful research is team-based, blended with other factors such as the nature and quality of the research environment, mentored supervision, facilities at the disposal of the researcher, and access to prior work by other researchers in related field are also contributory (Mutala, 2009).

An additional challenge is the learning style. For instance, a learning style that is focused on surface learning is more concerned with memorization and reproduction with need to achieve results. This trait of education puts forward a teacher-centred approach vis-à-vis a student-centred approach. The teacher-centred approach is a traditional teaching and learning process where knowledge is transmitted to students by a ‘spoon-feeding’ method. This can result in students being too dependent on teachers to provide all the information to them. This style has merit to enable students to academically outperform others in a traditional classroom setting. However, a purely student-centred approach builds a need to learn and explore new findings. Therefore, it takes a process for students to transition from teacher-centred to student-centred learning (Wei Yeoh & Terry, 2013). They need to become more self-directed and more critical; thus, research students need time to change and adapt to an independent learning style in a new environment.

Research Design and Methodology

Research Design

Phenomenology research design was used during the study. It describes experiences of participants in DME class as they were lived. It further examines individuals’ lived situations and their own reality about the post graduate course (Mayoh & Onwuegbuzie, 2015). In this study, purposive sampling was used to select to select the available postgraduate DME students. Focus group discussions were conducted to obtain information from respondents. The focus group discussion guide contained questions on seeking responses on students’ perspectives on postgraduate training in M&E such as motivation towards joining the course, positive and negative experiences and challenges they faced.

Sampling and Recruitment

For the current group, researchers announced in M&E classes (DME Evening and DME Weekend) inviting students to participate in the study. The announcement was also circulated through online platforms of students,
calling for students who are enrolled on the postgraduate diploma in M&E at UMI. For the students who graduated from the programme, invitations were sent through the alumni platforms and online what’s-App and Google groups including a brief information about the study. Purposive sampling was used to select interested participants for the study. Purposive sampling involves selecting participants based on the researchers’ knowledge and judgement about the participants and their ability to provide data for the study (Yin, 2011). For the current group who participated in focus group discussions, the researchers purposively selected eight (8) participants from the evening class and eight (8) participants from the weekend class. Making a total of sixteen (16) participants. For the graduated group, twelve (12) participants were purposively selected to participate in the focus group discussions to inform the study. The focus groups participants were provided with detailed information about the study and asked to sign consent forms.

Data Collection

The researchers collected qualitative data using focus group discussions among the participants. Two focus groups (one from evening class and the other from the weekend class) were conducted for a period of an hour after their classes at the institute. The researchers secured convenient rooms at the institute from which focus groups were conducted. Each group had a facilitator and a note taker and all discussions were recorded using a tape recorder to enable effective capture of the data (Wilkinson, 2009). The facilitators ensured a free environment for discussion and encouraged each member of the group to share their views. For the graduates of the programme, the researchers asked the selected participants to come to the institute on a weekend for an hour to participate. From the twelve (12) participants that were selected, eight (8) turned up for the focus group discussions. These were given detailed information sheets about the study and consent forms. They were later briefed about the methodology.

Data Analysis

The researchers used thematic analysis based on Braun and Clarke (2006) to analyse the data. According to the authors, audio recordings have to be transcribed and checked before thematic analysis. The researchers therefore did transcription of all recordings and scanned all the drawings and organized them for analysis. The analysts then read through all transcripts to immerse themselves into the material as recommended by the authors. Initial coding was done and later categorization of the codes. The analysts then developed candidate themes from the categories which were discussed, and quotations captured through the lived experiences within the course. Memos were developed and reports were generated from the interviews and focus group discussions.

Presentation of Key Findings

Participant Characteristics

A total of twenty-eight post graduate diploma students at Uganda Management Institute (n=28) participated in this qualitative study. Of these, 16 students were purposively selected from the current evening and weekend intakes for the academic year 2017/2018. Eight (8) students were selected from the evening study intake while eight (8) were from the weekend study intake. These were engaged in two (2) focus group discussions. Of these, ten (10) were females while the six (6) were males. About 60% of these were working as M&E officers in both government and NGOs in Uganda. The 30% of the current group were employed in other roles other than M&E with a few self-employed while the remaining 10% were unemployed. The researchers also purposively selected 12 students who already graduated and completed their post graduate diploma in M&E. These were contacted
through the alumni structures since they had already left the institute. Ten (10) of these had work experience as M&E officers and managers while the two (2) were self-employed.

**Thematic Analysis**

The findings of the study revealed three major themes. These are shown in the box below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme 1: The motivators for students joining the programme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Having passion for M&amp;E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The need for a qualification in M&amp;E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Preparation for promotions at the place of work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Influence from friends and relatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Preparation to explore new job opportunities on M&amp;E related work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme 2: The experiences of students during the programme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Positive and negative experiences while on the postgraduate programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Theme 3: The challenges faced by students while on the programme |

**Theme 1: The Motivators for Students Joining the Programme**

This theme explores the student’s views, opinions and perspectives regarding the key factors that motivated them to join the postgraduate diploma in M&E at the Uganda Management Institute. Participants from both focus group discussions and drawings reported various motivators including; having passion for M&E, the need for a qualification in M&E, preparation for promotions at the place of work, influence from friends and relatives and preparation to explore new job opportunities on M&E related work.

**Having Passion for M&E**

Participants reported that one of the key motivators for their joining the programme was having passion for M&E. Some of them said:

“I don’t think there were any other factors apart from the fact that I am an environment analyst who is inclined to Environment Impact assessment. Environment Impact assessment is also monitoring so I just wanted to build it a little.” *(Participant A in DME, evening)*

Some reported that they fell in love with some of the modules taught on the programme and therefore decided to enrol for the programme. One of them said:

“I am someone in love with impact evaluations - Public Administration. But the new phenomenon has come into the system; so, I have this idea that I will understand about impact evaluation better than I do.” *(Participant K in DME, weekend)*

In the above excerpt, both participants were passionate about M&E given their previous and current engagements. One of them is passionate about environmental impact assessment while the other adores impact evaluations generally; of which, both areas are covered in the post graduate diploma in M&E at the institute. This implies that some of the participants who apply to join M&E training are not necessarily engaged in M&E work but have a passion for learning and acquiring knowledge and skills in the discipline.
The Need for a Qualification in M&E

Participants revealed that the other motivator for joining the programme was the need for a qualification in M&E. One of them said:

“I have been doing M&E for the last four years and suddenly the need for a paper arose so am at UMI.”

(Participant G in DME, Weekend).

In the above quote, the participant realized the need for the paper due to the increasing job competition. Despite the fact that the participant had the skills, he or she realized the significance for an academic qualification to back up their existing knowledge and skills in M&E. This implies that, there is need for career advancement and knowledge gain, and skills to fit into the current competitive job market.

Preparation for Promotions at the Place of Work

Participants further revealed that the need to be promoted at their workplaces was a key motivator for pursuing the course. One of them argued that:

“I have been working as an M&E officer for about 2 years and for me to be promoted, I need to have a qualification in M&E. This prompted me to come and enrol for the course so that I am able to qualify when promotions come.”

(Participant I in DME Weekend)

This implies that often, participants often enrol for courses in preparation for promotions at their places of work since additional qualifications are a requirement for the promotion.

Influence from Friends and Relatives

Parents and relatives were viewed as a key influence in motivating the participants to pursue M&E is concerned. One of the participants indicated that;

“I actually didn’t know about it. My aim was to come and do a master’s course in Management sciences. But, when I reached, I got the papers and asked colleagues that I had been looking for employment, and everywhere I go, colleagues are like add something to your qualifications, go back to school (....) so on. Getting the paper from here, I asked them what course I go for. So, I was advised that M&E is a good course”

Weekend DME

In the above citation, a participant made a decision to pursue M&E based on advice from friends and relatives. In life, we are normally influenced by people who have experienced similar circumstances or observed similar scenarios. Therefore, this implies that, participants should be handled appropriated and given the best practices, so that they can recommend other individuals to pursue this course.

Preparation to Explore New Job Opportunities on M&E Related Work

Participants reported that one of the motivations behind joining the programme was preparation to explore new job opportunities on M&E related work. They reported that often there are job adverts in the newspapers calling for M&E officers, experts and specialists and the requirement is that one ought to have a postgraduate qualification in M&E. One of them said:

“Every time I read papers, I see job opportunities in the area of M&E. therefore even when am currently working as an administer with a logistics company, I see myself being able to apply for an M&E job
given that I will have a qualification in M&E. This is why I applied for the course to prepare myself for that." (Participant L in DME weekend)

Theme 2: The Experiences of Students during the Programme

This theme explores participants’ experiences from the time they applied for the course to the time they sat for their examinations. During their time at postgraduate level, participants from focus groups encountered positive and negative experiences. Positive experiences included strictness, good exam setting and management, practical modules, a routine classroom register regular cleaning of classes among others. The negative experiences included: poor Wi-Fi connection; the ever locked classrooms and toilets; poor working condition of the computers in the resource centre; opening hours for the classrooms are not convenient for evening participants and; unclear administrative communication channels to students. Other negative experiences were: a mixed-up timetable; less practical sessions; lack of a medical facility; disorganised notes, poor hygiene in the toilets; classrooms especially during examination time, and; outdated literature in the libraries.

Positive Experiences of Participants

Strictness at UMI by the Facilitators and the System at UMI

When asked about their positive experiences, participants were quick to say strictness. Participants indicated that strictness made them attend every class. They noted that strictness applied to both participants and facilitators. Some of them noted:

“Yeah and when I came, I found they walked the talk. You have to attend. They are strict, the facilitators come. There is nothing like; “it’s the first time they are not around let’s go home”. At 7:00, we shall not study. No…. someone will come and fill in.” (Participant L in DME, evening).

“I think am one of those people who think they should maintain the register. It is really good, it monitors people.” Participant DME weekend

In this excerpt, we note that there is consistency between what UMI promises and what it delivers. Unlike other institutions of higher learning where students and facilitators attend class when they feel like attending. With UMI, you have to attend class, and this is monitored using a daily register. Failure to attend class means failure to meet the 70% attendance rule- a requirement for one to be allowed to sit for exams. While strictness may be seen as inconveniencing on the side of the participant, they, on the other hand see it as value for money. UMI should strive to maintain this principle.

Good Exam Setting and Management

Participants revealed that one of the positive aspects they have experienced at UMI is good exam setting and management. One of them said:

“For me, I appreciate the way they manage exams. You can’t hear of any cases of malpractices that I got this, or so and so got this paper before the actual day. That is so sweet, I am going to get my clean first class. “(Participant F in M&E weekend)

In this citation, we realize that participants have confidence in the way the exams are managed. This is viewed in two perspectives which are integrity and quality. Integrity in a way that there is not sign of examination
malpractice. This implies that grades attained by the graduates are genuine and therefore employers can rely on UMI for producing quality graduates.

**Practical Modules Taught at UMI**

Participants further revealed that UMI modules are practical and that the institution offers practical lectures. Some participants pointed out that:

“It is not really about my job because am not working; but to be honest, I have been given much more than I received even with my masters. There is a way they don’t give you too much notes but then they give you practical things. So, I think, by the time am ready to work I will be a different person.” (Participant K in DME Weekend)

“Two things, the MSI module was I think my best module. I don’t know whether it will be my best module in the exam but. It communicated a lot. Then, the whole management module that is PPM has helped me to appreciate. I have been through a number of projects and I can now see that that one might fail because of xyz so there is a lot of thinking going on in my mind especially, yeah it has impacted on my life.” (Participant E in DME, weekend)

From the quotations above, we realized that participants preferred practical sessions. Having practical sessions helps students acquire skills that help them become better professionals. This, therefore, means UMI facilitators ought to embrace a theory and practical approach to teaching.

**Modules that have impacted on them before Completion of the Course**

Participants indicated that the course has already impacted on them before they could even complete the modules. One noted that:

“I control my emotions. I am good at getting angry, but I can now control myself. I can give a smile even when I am angry. Before I would just (……) but now.” (Participant A in DME, weekend)

In the quote above, we point out a testimony of how a module like management skills improvement has impacted on the participants. The impact has not only been felt at work but even in the way they interact with people outside work.

**Regular Cleaning of Classes**

The findings further reveal cleaning of classes as one of the positive experiences by the participants. Studying under a clean environment guarantees good health of both the participants and the facilitators.

“To have the classes cleaned in time literary in some institutions like Makerere, cleaning your class is hard, they are really different. So, they should have the cleaning on time so that people can use the facility.” (Participant D in DME weekend)

In the excerpt above, the participant appreciates the fact that classes are regularly cleaned which is a rare trait in institutions of learning. This, therefore, implies that class hygiene should be maintained at all times.

**The Class Notes are availed on Time**

Another key experience is that the module notes are availed on time and with expected detail as one participant noted that;
“I think UMI is doing that very well. The notes are available everything is there. Everything to do with academics is there and I really appreciate. When I was coming, I looked at the 4 million as a lot, but they have given me value for money.” (Participant B in DME weekend)

In the excerpt above, the participant appreciates class notes that are normally availed on time. Availing class notes on time helps the participant to review and compare notes for easy comprehension. The participant further appreciates the detail of the notes which to them means value for money, which should be maintained by UMI.

**Negative Experiences**

**Poor working Condition of the Computers in the Resource Centre**

One of the negative experiences reported by participants was the poor working conditions of the computers in the resource centre. One of them reported;

“The other one is concerning the resource centre. I like using that place but sometimes internet goes down. That is not a big deal but most of the computers are not working. They are just there you go sit on it but it’s not working. So that is the other issue,” (Participant F in DME evening)

From the above quotation, a participant is complaining about computers that are in a poor working state. Having computers in a good working condition, means the students are able to put them to use whenever need arises. It is therefore important that computers are well maintained.

**Opening hours are not convenient for Evening Participants**

Another negative experience that the participants raised was the opening hours that do not favour evening participants. One of them said;

“It gives us hard time to say that by 5 we shall be closing. As an evening student at least, there should be adjustment of time, say, when it comes to the time of examination cards, they should go up to 7 or even 8:00 for people to be able to pick their cards. Here comes a point you go to pick your card it’s not there they are telling you to come the next day. That inconvenience should be streamlined,” (Participant A in DME Evening).

From the above quotation, a participant was complaining about the working hours which do not favor the evening participants since offices have to be closed at 5:00 when participants are just leaving their workplaces. This means that they have to leave their workstations early to make it to UMI before the offices close at 5:00 or attain services over the weekend. UMI management therefore needs to extend the working hours to favor evening students.

**Poor Hygiene especially during Examination Time**

Another key negative experience that the participants raised was poor hygiene- this was said to worsen during examination time as one participant noted;

“You must have noticed that during examinations there was an overwhelming number of people and toilets were terrible, so, perhaps, we need to have more. Not only more, the first day we did exams, when we came to the toilets had they closed the ladies side. On the day of exams and the ladies were coming
to the men’s side. And toilets are a public right why do you lock them?” (Participant F in DME, Weekend)

From the above excerpt, a participant is complaining about the poor hygiene of the toilet. In addition, the toilets are closed. Furthermore, having unhygienic toilets might lead to contraction of UTI’ by the participants, and more so, female participants since they have to cross over to the men’s side. It is therefore important that UMI leaves the toilets open and makes sure they are cleaned.

Lack of a Medical Facility

Participants further raised lack of a medical facility as a key negative experience. One participant said;

“A hospital first aid. One time my student, I am a vice president collapsed from class you guys remember (…) He was sweating so I thought they had poured on him water. What’s wrong with him and he is actually dripping sweat and looking around we didn’t have like a first aid place. It is really key” (Participant E in DME, Weekend).

From the above quotation, the participant is raising the fact that UMI as an institution does not have a health facility where participants can be rushed to in case of an emergency. UMI should therefore consider setting up a healthy facility to guarantee safety of the participants.

Some Sessions are Not Practical

While it is true that weekend participants are exposed to more practical sessions, this was rare with the evening students. One participant noted that;

“Me too, I expected Monitoring and evaluation to be more practical, bringing engagement like not coming with slides. I expected it to be more practical; someone comes and gives you a real thing. Like you fully participate. That one is missed out,” (Participant L in DME evening)

From the above quotation, the participant is of the view that practical sessions were lacking. This implies that participants will not acquire and develop more practical skills that will help them do work better. Both evening and weekend programs should be exposed to practical sessions.

Poor Communication Channels

Among the negative experience raised was lack of unclear communication channels as one participant said that;

“They pinned it on the side of the library. Some people don’t use that library because it is in most cases full and packed you don’t find space. So, when my colleagues were like the timetable for exams is out, I was like where? Because I had not seen it anywhere. In most cases am in Madhvan, I do use this section of the library there was nothing. In my class there was nothing. So, I was like where do you process everything from. Me, I have not seen, so the person tells me it’s the other side of the library. Now you go to look for the timetable and fail to read it. It is mixed up,” (Participant B in DME, EVENING).

The participant is complaining about information that is passed on without using clear and well-defined channels of communication. This means that some participant’s participant are likely to miss out on the information or receive information that has been altered. Having clearly defined channels of communication would help to solve such a challenge.
Sometimes the notes are not well Organized with Outdated References

Participants decry the challenge of having some notes that are not well organized with outdated references. One of them said:

“…We have some notes is it research methods or what, I spent the whole time reorganizing the notes and I still have. May be to add on the notes there is a time we were doing, I don’t know which module it was and they told us to give references for the last ten or five years but then the facilitator was referencing 1987 but the references were way, way outdated,“ (Participant C in DME weekend)

In the above excerpt, a participant is complaining about unorganized notes with outdated references. Having unorganized notes makes it very hard very hard for the participants to comprehend notes that are not well organized. Facilitators therefore have to ensure that their notes are well organized for easy comprehension by the participants.

Theme 3: The Challenges faced by Students while on the Programme

Setting things that were not Taught in Class

Participants noted that one of the challenges they face during the course of their programme in M&E at UMI was a few instances when some examination questions are set when they were not taught. One of them noted;

“Because you find that in a paper, I have been given to design a work plan but actually in the lecture I was not taught how to design it,” (Participant A in DME evening)

In the excerpt above, the participant reports that sometimes examiners require them to apply concepts with illustrations when they were not practically taught on how to apply them. One example in point is being required to design a work plan in an examination when they were not taught how to design it during class. This implies that examiners should ensure that areas being examined have been taught and practically illustrated in class, though being a post graduate course, it is expected that not all is covered in class. The participant is expected to do some personal reading and learning outside the classroom.

Another participant called for practical teaching in class and said;

“It should be taught to me practically and I also go and do it practically to see whether what I was taught is what I did because am here to learn am not hear to look for what I don’t know. Then, in the long run, you say you wanted me to teach myself and learn. Meaning to teach myself which is not valid,” (Participant C in DME, evening)

Giving Practical Course Work Assignment without Showing Participants how to do it

The other challenge reported by the participants was being given practical course work assignments without telling them how to do it. One of them said;

“In addition, like the presentations we get. It’s also a challenge. Reason being, you are not involving me to do practical things and you have not fully engaged me to do it with you practically. Then, you are giving me to do it practically without your engagement. But you are giving it to me as a coursework to go and do it; that you would do with me. Practically, I don’t know what am doing and then I go and look for a better (........) to see how you have done it better and how you have involved me. Don’t give
In the above excerpt, the participant expressed displeasure over being given a practical course work assignment, without showing him how to do it. The participant expects that any practical course work assignment should be on what they practically did in class and where they were involved in doing rather than expecting them to find out by themselves on how to do it during the assessment.

**Limited Preparation Time for Exams**

The other challenge highlighted by participants was the limited time to prepare for examinations. One of them said;

“Yes time and what he has said. You work from 8 to 5:00 sometimes you can even leave at 6:00pm. You come to class tired. We have families, you are a married woman or married man and you have responsibilities like parents and now, in all that, it is hard for me to say that during the day, I will sneak and read a certain module. So, if the semester ends and you give me only two weeks bearing in mind that I also have work to do. It is really challenging,” (Participant B in DME, evening)

The participant in the excerpt above decries the limited time given to them to prepare for the examinations at the end of the semester. She argues that for the evening group, they often come to class after a hectic day and therefore tired. They also have family responsibilities and therefore during the semester it is difficult for them to read and prepare for the examinations. Therefore, the limited time of usually one to two weeks given to them between the last module and examinations is too short for them to adequately prepare for examinations. This is challenging to them.

**Crossing the road on the side of Jinja road is hard**

The other challenge mentioned by the participants was that of crossing the road to come to UMI especially by those who don’t have vehicles. One of them noted;

“Am always so scared of crossing Jinja road to enter UMI because there is no zebra crossing and vehicles are so fast. One has to wait for several minutes until there are no vehicles moving very fast. Even when the number of vehicles reduce, you have to run very fast as you cross the road. This is a very serious challenge and needs to be addressed,” (Participant C in DME Weekend)

In the excerpt above, the participant decries the unsafe passage for them while crossing the Jinja road to enter UMI. Currently there is no zebra crossing or a fly over to connect to UMI Jinja road main gate which makes it difficult for participants who move by public means to cross to UMI for classes. The participant calls for the management action to address this issue.

**Discussion and Conclusions**

Findings presented here serve addition evidence towards students’ perspectives on postgraduate training in Monitoring and Evaluation. The study considered the views and experiences of students. The findings noted the importance of utilizing practical methodologies while training. This is related to critical thinking as a determinant to deep learning rather than superficial learning. However, critical self-evaluation is a gradual process with different learning curves. In addition, giving coursework to participants without guiding them on an appropriate approach to responding to it, was challenging to the participants. However, coursework feedback can be
considered as a trigger event for participants to appraise and develop critical thinking. Therefore, the need to further research and investigate builds an interaction in class (Fakunle, Allison, & Fordyce, 2016).

Participants echoed that examinations set did not align to the content in the notes. This stands true, as research students face a challenge in research methodology at different levels; as a way to advance their capacity in advanced research. Therefore, there is important mainstream workshops, capacity building and mentoring programmes into the curriculum of students. Furthermore, expose them to basic research infrastructure to enhance their ability towards competitive proposal and institutional research (Desmennu & Owoa, 2017).

Furthermore, participants, particularly in DME evening noted the need for facilitators to expose the several practical sessions; to enhance the practice of M&E in the real world. For example, placing students to interactively work in small groups broadly enhances their personal and social experiences to learn from one another (Emma, 2017). The study also showed that participants were motivated to further the need to seek educational research skills. In the long run, this has contributed the uptake of research studies such as postgraduate, masters and PhD studies (Omar & Aburezeq, 2018).

The researchers conclude that there is need to expose postgraduate students to practical or experiential learning. This will develop their ability to inculcate similar learning to their workspaces. The study identifies the need to exposure students to workshops, capacity building, mentorship and coaching programmes. This aspect of learning will motivate (intrinsic motivation) participants to research and adapt new ideas or innovation. Findings are also important for postgraduate students, their trainers and or supervisors and academic institutions. Academic institutions need to strengthen the ability to mentor postgraduate students so as to encourage self-efficacy, and develop a strong research culture toward preparation for Masters and PhD studies. For the successful completion of postgraduate studies, postgraduate research students have to depend more on their academic self-efficacy to enhance their performance (Noor & Muhammad, 2019).

**Limitations and Potential Further Research**

The research was a qualitative study and therefore the findings cannot be generalized but could be transferable to institutions of similar context. Future research needs to expound on the contribution of mentorship, capacity building, and seminars towards improving postgraduate students’ M&E competencies. Finally, it is strongly suggested to consider the moderating and mediating role of other factors in future studies.

**References**


An Evaluation of Critical Success Factors in a Multi-International Partnership

Maria Kaguhangire-Barifaijo, James L. Nkata & Seppo Holta

Uganda Management Institute

Tampere University

Abstract

The paper discusses critical success factors in a partnership of education institutions from different countries, institutions, cultures and regulatory frameworks since 2007. The project was a partnership between Uganda, Ethiopia and Finland to develop leadership and management capacity in Ugandan Universities. An “appreciative inquiry approach” was adopted to evaluate the project using partnering institutions, project leaders, and partnership documents. The paper describes the approach to management of the project, and discusses specific challenges and critical success factors that contributed to the project’s success. The evaluators’ major focus was on how partners gained consensus on key decisions. Practical examples and outputs from the project are highlighted to illustrate the project’s critical success factors. The discussion was guided by the Collaborative Leadership Theory by David Chrislip and Carl Larson (1994) who proposed that a mutually beneficial relationship should work towards common goals by sharing responsibility, authority and accountability for achieving desired results, and that the collaboration does not only achieve “tangibles” but also intangibles such as the dignity that comes with the ability of individuals to start a new venture and see it to success. This evaluation found that the project’s success was attributed to partner institutions’ innovation, caution and collaboration with each assembling a competent team to detect and mitigate threats to their collaboration. The study concluded that the project’s critical success factors were; emotional intelligence of the project leaders and participants, involvement of key stakeholders, honesty and equal participation. For any partnership to succeed, leadership demands a structure that enables all levels within each institution to contribute to the partnership objectives, and respect each other, because each comes with peculiar expertise, skills and attributes. Inevitable shortcomings in every project notwithstanding, partners successfully navigated the different cultures, security issues, legal and political environment, economic factors and infrastructure limitations.

Key words: Collaborative Leadership, Multi-Institutional Collaboration, Partnership, Success Factors

Introduction

With a tenuous, global economy, quality concerns and a plethora of global complexities that outpace any empirical advancement, there is an essential demand for institutional collaborations to confront the grand challenges Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) are facing today (Brew, et al 2013). Funding aside, networking and benchmarking are compulsory in order HEIs to strengthen quality in every endeavor of HE activities, not only the known mandate of teaching, research and community work, but also, the quality desired for the success of a collaboration. Higher education institutions, thus need to embrace and recognize the great potential within a cooperation that not only yields tangible benefits, but also, its power in facilitating positive change to enable individual institutions excel in their mandate (Tagg, 2012). Consequently, the importance of collaborations is not contested. However, for a strong partnership, it is fundamental to develop friendship and trust first, as it is considered the most important thing in a lasting cooperation (Tierney et al, 2013). In fact, Lau et al (2014), finds friendship and trust the two most critical aspects that institutions can hold on to, in order to succeed. In fact, Altbach and Knight (2007), augments that openness and honesty in a partnership are critical aspects, especially in a trans-national collaboration with different structures, different cultures, different economic power, different levels of development and expertise. Regardless of such differences, the common goal should bring the actors to same level ground in order to neutralize such differences (Austin, 2000). He argues that commitment to the
goal and respect for one another have a significant role in the success of a collaboration. Miller (2013), cautions actors in a partnership to be cognitive of the laws and regulations of academic programs at foreign universities which most time differ significantly, which actually has the potential to destroy the trust if such issues do not come out early enough in the initiative. Yet, such information was often concealed if it had the potential to jeopardize the initiative (Barifaijo and Namara (2013), yet such dishonesty was found to be dangerous not only for a successful and survival of the partnership but also it can be the source of dysfunctional conflicts (Barifaijo and Namara, 2013).

Background

The University of Tampere in Finland, Uganda Management Institute and Makerere University, in Uganda started an initiative to address leadership challenges in Higher Education Institutions in 2007. In an informal discussion, the two university professors in Tampere and Makerere (then) were concerned with emerging higher education challenges in Africa. Specific attention closed in on Uganda, with persistent students and staff unrests, degenerating mandates, lost endeavors, continuous blame games on the issue of quality, and institutional competition rather than cooperation. The initiative turned into reality in 2011 – leading to two countries (Finland and Uganda), and two Ugandan Higher Education Institutions (HEIs); Makerere University and Uganda Management Institute (UMI) establishing a cooperation and entering into a formal partnership in 2011. Although the first intervention was to build Leadership and Management capacity of University Leaders in Uganda, it was deemed necessary to develop capacity among the trainers through a “Training of Trainers” Course that lasted nine (9) months – from March, 2011 to January, 2012. Participants in the collaboration included faculty from Miserere University and Uganda Management Institute, and staff from the Ministry of Education. The training was facilitated by professors from the Universities of Tampere and Helsinki in Finland.

The nine (9) months Training of Trainers Course, culminated into a Postgraduate Diploma in Higher Education Leadership and Management housed at Uganda Management Institute. From 2012 to 2013, a Master’s Program in Higher Education Leadership and Management by the same group, and housed at Makerere University. In 2014, the University of Kwazulu Natal had its PhD in Higher Education Leadership and Management developed, and doctoral students from partner institutions took the advantage to participate in the training. From 2014 to-date, staff and students from the three (3) African HEIs; Makerere University, Uganda Management Institute and Kwazulu Natal have enjoyed the partnership through exchange program.

The Problem

The past two decades have seen an explosion of interest on funding education and research partnerships, often between institutions in high-income and low- and middle-income (North to South) countries, North to North and sometimes South to South, depending on the goal of the cooperation. However, although some collaborations have miraculously succeeded, others have conspicuously failed, yet, the actors have limited practical information about what factors specifically that lead to a successful partnership (Cummings et al 2009). In fact, according to de-Graft-Atkins et al (2012), for HEIs to thrive in the 21st century they require interdisciplinary work, partnership and global cooperation (Altbach, 2005). Similarly, Brew (2013) also found that collaborations are at the core of HE activities and provide the platform to engage in ambitious projects, address global challenges, advance and transfer knowledge, foster mobility, increase institutional visibility and quality. Nonetheless, globally, African in general and Uganda in particular, most collaborations do not survive to see their second
birthday (if they try to push on), majority have been terminated prematurely, yet others have suffered setbacks because of various reasons – thereby destroying the relationships (Barifaijo and Karyeija, 2016). Whether such failures are masterminded or otherwise, the consequences are undesirable and detrimental not only for individual departments, but for institutions as well as the host countries. With the success of the cerebrated Uganda achievement, Universities in Ethiopia have been brought on board. This inquiry therefore, was set out to establish success factors that have sustained a multi-institutional collaboration in order to help other institutions and countries. To unravel success factors required in a collaboration, the following objectives were advanced: (1) to establish how participation contributes successful partnership and (2) to assess the role of project leaders in sustaining partnership.

Literature Review

From flat, to round, back to flat, and now even considered hyper-connected, the world has evolved to become a prolific pitch rife with collaborative ideas and practices - opportunistically aimed at improving circumstances for humanity while systematically defying physical borders (Echavarria, 2015). Collaboration between entities in different countries has steadily increased over the past two decades to improved mobility of information, ideas, and people across the globe (De Man, and Ard-Pieter, 2013). There is vast literature on what actually can sustain a partnership. Different scholars, perhaps using their experience have advanced success factors as; strategic leadership (e.g emotional intelligence, strategic objectives, strategic communication, team building spirit, visionary, transparent etc.); long term goals, clear goals and concrete purpose, participation, respect for institutional frameworks, mutual respect, understanding and trust, ownership and co-existence, homogeneous disciplines and a conducive and quality of work environment (de-Graft Aikins et al 2012; Echavarria, 2015; Hanson, 2015; Tierney, 2013). Nonetheless, literature and theories have contradicted some of the findings, prior knowledge and beliefs. The theories and literature in the next section will align the discussion on the success factors of a collaboration.

Theoretical Orientation

There are plentiful theories that perhaps scholars would adopt to explain success factors in a collaboration. Cogently, the theory of Collaborative Leadership was adopted to explain success factors in a partnership. A Collaborative Leadership Theory was developed by David Chrislip and Carl Larson through their research on civic leadership and collaboration in the 1980s and early 90s. The theory assumes that by cooperating and coordinating efforts, actors should transcend personal interests to pursue common goals for a collaboration to succeed. They argue that in a leadership context, collaborations should emphasize shared vision and joint strategies to address public concerns that go beyond the purview of any particular party or even an individual. Hence, they proposed that a mutually beneficial relationship should work towards common goals by sharing responsibility, authority and accountability for achieving desired results (Randall, 2012). The theory espouses that for any partnership to succeed, leadership should create a structure from the top that enables all levels within each institution to contribute to the goals of the relationship and, must respect one another, because each one comes with the best skills, peculiar expertise, unique attributes and have distinctive abilities, competencies as well as passion (Schneier, 2016). The theory further proposes, that to succeed, the collaboration does not just achieve “tangibles” but also the intangibles such as the dignity that comes with the ability of individuals to start a new venture and see it to success.
Consequently, Chrislip and Larson (1994), view a successful collaboration to meet four conditions; should be broadly inclusive of all stakeholders (including those considered “troublesome”); should provide credible and open collaborative process that give participants the confidence that their views will be heard and considered without predetermined outcomes; there must be visible support from high-level, well-known and trustworthy leaders in the community to provide the credibility necessary to assure participants that their efforts may lead to tangible results and should gain the support or acquiescence of “established authorities” or institutions either at the beginning or as a result of the collaborations success (MacKenzie and Meyers, 2012). Therefore, given that the project leaders negotiate and agree on the partnership details, chose those to work with, and communicate with all the actors, they actually play an important role in sustaining a collaboration.

Literature Review

Colleges and universities collaborate on initiatives that individual institutions might not be able to accomplish alone, including infrastructure projects, course offerings, and new educational models (McBride, 2010). In many cases, collaboration results in the creation of a formal entity with its own staff, budget, and governance. Colleges and universities can use the collaboration to grow their influence with commercial providers and, in this way, benefit the development of learning ecosystems (Lau et al 2014). Collaboration is a synchronized and coordinated activity in which the participants continuously try to develop and sustain the solution of the problem shared between them. Collaboration is a collective activity that works like the parts of an old machine which priorites to work in the group instead of individually (Hanson, 2015). They also encourage other participants to be united and use a common identity to achieve the goal shared with them. Collaboration, if done with good intention, can help in building pyramids of authority and power because it is collective activity. As you go up with a collective activity you will be able to shape your own identity and will be able to direct the efforts of the group in your own interests (Egron-Polak and Hudsun, 2014).

Although, the discussion adopted the term ‘partnership’, there are other terms often used interchangeably, which in fact have been used throughout the discussion. In no specific order, the terms include; cooperation, collaboration, partnership, alliances, networks, linkages, initiatives, agreements etc. According to Elsemary, 2012), a cooperation is accomplished by the division of labor among participants as an activity where each person is responsible for solving a portion of the problem. Cooperation between educational institutions therefore is aimed at encouraging educators and all other subjects of educational process of continuous exchange of their professional expertise, insights and knowledge, as the basis of their mutual learning and development (Daim, Tet al 2012). On the other hand, networking within your own institution or organization can be essential to your career advancement path. When you reach out to colleagues in different offices you have the opportunity to collaborate on new programs and initiatives, discover new areas of interest, learn more about office procedures and cultures, and create new relationships with people who have the potential to become mentors – perhaps through networking (Austin, 2000). In fact, through networking, individuals or institutions, for one reason or the other meet, interact or enter into a relationship through such communication and networking that culminates into cooperation (Archer and Cameron, 2008). Similarly, linkages exist when there is some development or forming of a connection between two or more groups so that one changes in a group depends on the other changing (Altbach, 2005). Correspondingly, joint ventures clearly state limits on their purposes. The purpose of entering a joint venture is often times to make a product that neither partner can afford to make on her own, such developing new software or a project where information cannot be monopolized by an individual partner (Almansour and Kempner, 2015). Hence, in a joint venture; you share the profits and expenses, but not giving up half of the product or business (Brew, 2013). Equally, an alliance is formed when partners agree to collaborate
without giving up their independent status. Although not so much different from a joint venture, a collaboration is a purposeful relationship in which all parties strategically choose to cooperate in order to accomplish a shared outcome (De Man and Ard-Pieter, 2013). Because of its voluntary nature, the success of a collaboration is dependent upon one or more collaborative leader’s ability to maintain these relationships. This definition could match the project under discussion, given that the partner government has taken to fund a number of initiatives in the on-going partnership. Therefore, partnerships are voluntary and collaborative relationships among various parties, in which all participants agree to work together to achieve a common purpose or undertake a specific task and, as mutually agreed, to share risks, responsibilities, resources and benefits” (Barifaijo and Namara; Brew, 2013). In fact, relationships and interactions between tasks, functions, departments, and organizations, that promote flow of information, ideas, and integration in achievement of shared objectives (Duim, 2012; Echavarria, 2015 and Egron-Polak and Hudsun, 2014).

Although expertise, trust and honesty were found to be key a successful partnership, Farquhar and Fitzsimons, (2011), found “negotiation skills” to be critical especially at the initial stages of the collaboration. In fact, partners with a critical eye that analyze and interpret the documentation were more likely to sustain a partnership than those who had premeditated motives – sometimes for personal benefits (Alejandro et al. 2008). Although Lau et al (2014), found negotiation skills vital at the initiation stages, leader expertise and emotional intelligence were extremely important for sustaining collaborative considering that having a champion or professional on the project was best for successful collaboration. In fact, MacKenzie and Meyers (2012), found that possession of professional expertise is critical in achieving the project’s goals, which actually increases trust among stakeholders. Although Hank (2009), does not refute Alejandro’ et al (2008), assertion, he found generic competencies such as emotional intelligence, communication skills and interpersonal skills to benefit both institutions and industries or sectors alike. He argues, that with good interpersonal relationship specific expertise is imparted to the rest of team members. Hence, even when the project leader leaves the institution, a replacement should be found quickly and easily, and will curtail projects from drifting. Otherwise, team members might reduce their engagement, and continuity will be a mayhem – which is essentially, the worst of all possible outcomes (Schneider, 2016).

In order to avert drifting of collaborative relationship or partnership, Almansour and Kempner (2015), recommends feasibility assessment to ascertain not only whether the collaboration is really necessary, but also whether the conditions for success can be created. Secondly, sustainability strategies must be established, and third, strategies for transition in case funding ends, stopped or withdrawn. In fact, Barifaijo and Namara (2015), found that although, higher education institutions glorify international collaborations because of their ability to leverage a competitive edge, Raue and Wieland (2015), found that actually for many, it was out of personal gains and selfish reasons – which is why most collaborations flop just hardly before cerebrating their first anniversary. On the contrary, however, Lunnan, et al (2008), found that some joint ventures fail due to lack of focus and overlapping motivation among the participants, which finding was supported by Lowndes and Skelcher (1998), on the overlaps of motivation, especially if the cooperation partners juggle a bunch of goals. Consequently, MacKenzie and Meyers (2012), caution institutions to always let the idea incubate in order to benefit from such collaborations - taking into consideration issues of quality and interest. Consequently, since some institutions may not mind about quality, Kraus and Sultana (2008), recommends close scrutiny regarding the quality and intended product of the collaboration, for future benefits, sustainability and competitive advantage. Hence, quality will determine stakeholders’ trust.
Methodology

The discussion was guided by the ethnographic approach, which is grounded in qualitative approach, which is encouraged by Krueger and Casey (2009), especially in trying to establish successful stories, both past and ongoing. Although literature played a bigger part in informing the discussion, the on-going collaboration was compared with projects in Ugandan higher education institutions. Project documents, Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), Agreements, guiding policies and corresponding documents were reviewed. Closed, failed and on-going collaborations were of great interest to the ethnographers. Communication and reactions during meetings to discuss collaborations were recorded and documented. Conducted unstructured interviews with Makerere University and UMI staff. Krueger and Casey (2009) recommend an institutional ethnographic inquiry specially to solicit participants’ personal experiences. Staff and students who benefitted from the mobility programs were invited to share their experiences. The paper discusses a number of strategies developed as well as lessons learnt in the twelve-year venture (April, 2007 – to-date). The inquiry involved only those who had participated in the study.

Findings and Discussion on Success Factors

Participation in a partnership is core considering that the term even means “working together”. Therefore, successful partnerships have largely depended on how institutions have involved other stakeholders in the project. Most projects have brought the rest of the members (especially) with expertise on board, for buy in and ownership. Although there are diverse types of partnerships, there are two major ones in which higher education institutions fall: Cross-sector partnerships (between nonprofits and the business, government, and/or academic sectors) and partnerships between donor organizations and recipients (Madigan and Schroth-Cavatalo, 2011). Although cross-sector partnerships are fairly simple to initiate but they are challenging to maintain. The biggest challenge however is, that regardless of the goodwill of the participants, two varying cultures must come together to produce results. This demands commitment, and efforts to establish a common ground and use shared goals that underscores the vision of the partners (Linden, 2002).

Although most collaborations are established to benefit institutions and people found there, majority of staff did not have sufficient grasp of cooperation in the institutions. This divergent finding was defended by Vazquez-Brust (2014), about institutional structures and issues of departmentalization where, only the concerned departments and sometimes individuals would understand such ventures. Yet, when members in the same institution participate, it leads to long-term benefits and sustainability. In fact, studies by (e.g. Kraus and Sultana, 2008; Lau, 2014 and Armitage, 2007), have explained that institutions manage the complexity of partnership by adopting a long-term, flexible approach, given that partnerships evolve and institutions learn effective management, build capacity, and gain valuable experiences. Therefore, a partnership can serve as a learning mechanism that teaches you to be better at what you do and enables you to achieve your institutional goals. Given such benefits therefore, participation of every member is critical to enable everyone become familiar with what a true partnership entails and how members in the partnership behave.

In fact, there were so many camps in these institutions, and each camp had its own arrangements – perhaps only known to them. The personalized projects included research projects, joint ventures, joint degrees, mobility programs, and they seem to be only for a few individuals in the department. Sadly, this kind of segregation was found by Gillett, et al (2016), to bleed excessive competition, hatred and sometimes sabotage. In fact, Lunnan
and Haugland (2008), found that this omission often happens at formation stages, when the input of other members is not considered, yet it proceeds through partnership development processes up to implementation. Although partnerships have to be developed and nurtured in ways that respect and recognize all individuals, most institutions did not allow everyone to participate—often with a misconception that they had no ‘useful contribution to make’ for the partnership. Yet, according to Armitage (2007), partnership is not just the responsibility of institutional leaders, but of everyone in the institution. Ground rules for the partnership are important at the initial stages yet, very few leaders perform this fundamental requirement necessary for valuing and respecting the individual partners. Individuals who initiated the ventures and a few friends were found to be in full control of the project. Whereas it may seem that all is well for those enjoying the partnership, individuals left out of such ventures had caused mayhem as they had “nothing to lose” (Hank, 2009).

Ideally, project leaders are responsible for ensuring that the partnership is sustained, most leaders have been found to overturn the success of the collaborations (McBride, 2010). Yet, partnering institutions have lost trust in each other because of perceived dishonesty due to poor or dictatorial leadership (Riviello, et al 2010). By implication, there should be common understanding among members in the partnership; should understand each other’s organizational framework, culture, values, and approach. Partners also need a clear understanding of individual members’ roles, responsibilities, and what the partnership’s division of labor will be, through effective communication of leaders. However, most leaders were found to conceal key goals or even the actual benefits. Yet, partnerships must be guided by a shared vision and purpose that builds trust and recognizes the value and contribution of all members. They should be guided by shared “can-do” values, mutual understanding, and an acceptance of differences (e.g., norms, ways of working) are essential to successful partnerships. Unless the leader is consultative and involving, members in the project may not respect each other’s contributions and regard each other as equals (Jacobson, 2001). Although a single project with multiple institutions often leads to each with their own agendas, desires and to-do lists (personal and institutional interests); Unclear delineation of responsibilities between these various leaders; Ownership issues, such obstacles did not affect the collaboration in question. Instead, through the training of trainers that culminated into a postgraduate program brought almost everyone on board. This approach worked so well for the involved institutions.

Similarly, scholars (e.g. Armitage, et al 2007; Eisingerich, et al 2008; Jacobson, 2001), have made the process of managing collaborations seem rosy and a ‘walk-over’. Yet, Barifaijo and Namara (2013), found that six out of ten collaborations never survive to celebrate their life-cycle. While the descriptions in literature, institutional frameworks and partnership guidelines are often acknowledged and used like a cook-book, Gillett and Scott, (2016), found that their availability was cosmetic since a number of partners use them and still fail. Madigan and Schroth-Cavatalo (2011), for example articulate factors that lead to success to include; an initial face-to-face interaction in order to build relational strength. He encourages partner members to embrace face-to-face meetings to ensure that things run smoothly, because “time is a big part of the investment”. In fact, Lago and D’Souza (2008) argue that the primary success in a collaboration is based on relationships, and not programs or organizations. Therefore, it was not simply a transactional arrangement, but each partner must have something to offer since expertise in the area of collaboration management is at all times sought even before accepting to discuss the venture.

Irrefutably, successful collaborations typically require support from political leaders, opinion-makers and others who control valuable resources and thus give legitimacy to the collaborative initiative (Mayfield and
Lucas, 2000). This support from higher levels however, does not deter the lower cadre to join the team. Archer and Cameron (2008), identify the basic task of the collaborative leader as the delivery of results across boundaries between different organizations. They say “Getting value from difference is at the heart of the collaborative leader's task... they have to learn to share control, and to trust a partner to deliver, even though that partner may operate very differently from themselves. Further, Echavarria argues that Collaborative Leadership is not only the result of individual collaborative leadership capability but group leadership. In this respect, he argues that individuals can support and contribute to collaboration and do so from a leadership point of view, but it is at the level of the group where collaboration can be behaviorally experienced.

According to Echavarria (2015), the best thing a collaborative leader can do is to lead by example, ‘walk the talk’, and be seen to model the right behaviors. Hence, leaders must show a willingness to take risks, continually question their own ideas, and reward others for their clear communication and valuable insights. In fact, Austin (2000), argues that if leaders are not alert, some minute aspects in the collaboration could affect the long-term success of the partnership. Hence, inability to analyze the depth of the alliance; lack of shared aspirations and strategies; lack of unified governance; and the failure to deploy shared talent. Consequently, a partnership that fails to offer a clue to a successful arrangement will not succeed (Riviello, 2010). It can even be more fruitful if the leader shared mandate and strategy aimed squarely at addressing the joint issues faced by the two nations, institutions or departments - through a model that shares talent. Hence, the partnership can be unique for at least four reasons: a unique focus on industry challenges; a highly multidisciplinary problem set; its physical scale; and; its focus on postgraduate training and mobility (Mirvis, 2013). Emotional intelligence of leaders, was found to lead to successful collaborations especially, if the goal was to create high impact global visibility, instead of focusing on individual institutions and benefits. It actually becomes more useful if the aim is to tackle complex issues of major importance to the two nations, where the partnership of the two universities’ capabilities is greater than the individual parts. Specifically, such collaborations should physically combine the best scholars from both institutions and actively engage them in particular areas of their expertise. Unlike most traditional international collaborative models, a partnership should have a large-scale joint physical presence that primarily focuses on capacity development in areas such as PhD training and collaborative research (Cloet, 2016). Hence, effective leadership is setting up successful international collaborations to level the field, especially with partners in developing countries (Jacobson, 2001).

Researchers such as; (Egron-Polak and Hudsun, 2014; Hanson, 2015 and McBride, 2010), found some key lessons for collaborative leaders with six distinguishing characteristics. They include; balanced motivations, transferable skills, contextual intelligence, integrated networks, prepared mind, intellectual thread. Nonetheless, although Tierney, et al 2013) finds these characteristics to be exciting, they are not a given attribute, and it may be extremely difficult to find all of them in a singly leader. By way of being realistic, Carter (2013), provides five qualities of what a collaborative leader should possess. They include; willingness to take risks, eager to listen, passion for the cause, optimistic about the future, able to share knowledge, power and credit. Although the author finds such attributes to be realistic and sometimes easy to measure, they may not all be found in one person.

Similarly, Almansour and Kempner (2015), listed ten key lessons for a successful collaborative leader, as personal motive for collaborating; strategies for simplifying complex situations, anticipate conflicts and they will address them, recognizing that some people are quite too difficult partner with, courage to act for the long term, managing tension between the means and the end, investing in strong personal relationships at all levels,
injecting energy, passion and drive into leadership style and develop the confidence to share the credit generously, develop one’s interpersonal skills, in particular. By contrast, collaboration requires managers to achieve success through people and resources outside their control and for this they have had no preparation”. In fact, Armitage, et al 2007), provides four major key leadership traits all highly collaborative leaders should possess. They include; authentic leadership by placing the goals of the institution ahead of their own self-interest and following through on their commitments, relentlessly pursue transparent decision making clear on how their decisions are made and who is accountable for the outcomes, view resources as instruments of action; realizing shared goals through the flexible use of shared resources, clarify the relationship between decisions, rights, accountability and rewards; taking time to establish decision paths and a common vocabulary that everyone can comprehend for successful collaborations. Although language barrier, financial stability, good will of governments, faculty resistance and attitude was a key precursor, in the on-going collaboration, all the potential barriers were minimized at the initials stages.

In order to gain state support, all the activities in the collaboration included government officials from the Ministry of Education and Sports. There was also buy-in of the Institution top authority; equal involvement in deciding the areas of the collaboration; sensitization of those participating in the collaboration. At the initial stage, the key partners synthesized and sought clarity of agreement documents and interpretation of each other’s guidelines; especially financial. Common grounds and language were established at the initial stages. Such clarity eased communication within the team (intergroup and intra-group). Further, all members were encouraged to participate in proportional magnitudes. Clear structures, leadership roles and strategy for continuity were established. After the closure of the initial projects, interaction continued with other project activities, such as mobility or staff and students. All members were carried through the etiquettes of international collaborations. This enabled member to learn to appreciate, developed intellectual humility and communicate purposefully.

Conclusion and Recommendations

At the start, two years ago, things looked a lot more promising. The partnership slowly fizzled as the two collaborators' interests diverged. Then conflict arose over who owned the samples. “Collaborations always start off in a woolly way, failure makes one feel like has been hit by a truck – able to get up and become very circumspect in newer cooperation. According to Cumming, the key is not to break up collaborations but to allow more time and money for management. It's another to spell out who's going to do what and how you're going to do it. You can't lock two strangers in the room and expect them to get along. The overhead of setting up a productive relationship is very high. Therefore, goals are essential to success but should take cognitive of when individual goals don’t align with the goals of the collaboration. It was concluded that structural factors and economic status; Cultural environment is closely linked to the three above-mentioned factors and would be difficult to present independently; Partners' Objectives, motivations and Characteristics of each institution. Although the collaboration in question endeavoured to mitigate anticipated challenges by involving everybody, there are always be “Clever-clog” individuals, who claim to know it all – whether true or not. Such individuals never appreciate anything, anybody, any effort – others’ culture, method of work, philosophies. They are often suspicious of everyone, every initiative, are loud and in constant habit of criticizing initiatives by others and the unfortunate part is that the clever-clogs never modify their behavior for you or for anyone yet, are self-inflated. With good leadership, the challenges were minimized.
References


Factors Affecting Development of Gender-sensitive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems in Humanitarian NGOs in Uganda. A case of IRC Uganda

1Grace William Maiso, 2David Ssekamatte, & 3Rose B. Namara
1African Community Empowerment and Development Initiative (ACEDI)
2,3Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
This study sought to examine the factors that affect the development of gender-sensitive monitoring and evaluation systems in humanitarian NGOs in Uganda. The study assessed the effect of organizational and programme factors. The organizational factors assessed included; organizational structure, organizational culture and leadership while the programme factors were; staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and how these affect the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in a humanitarian NGO in Uganda. Using a cross sectional survey design and quantitative methods to data collection, with a sample of 147 respondents, the study found out that; organizational factors had a negative and insignificant effect on gender sensitive M&E systems while programme factors had a strong and significant effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. Therefore, programme factors were a strong predictor of gender mainstreaming in M&E and organizational factors were not. The study recommends skills training gender mainstreaming to programme staff and investments in organizational changes may be necessary over the long term.

Key words: Gender-sensitive M&E systems, Organizational Factors, Programme Factors, Humanitarian NGOs

Introduction
Gender equality has been a concern for development practitioners for centuries. This study examined gender concerns within the Monitoring and Evaluation systems among NGOs in Humanitarian work. The development of gender sensitive M&E systems falls within the rubric of gender mainstreaming- a concept that gained currency after the Beijing 1995 Fourth World Conference for Women and the adoption of the Platform for Action (PfA). The call for all actors to mainstream gender in all their programmes and projects including policies at Beijing 1995 stemmed from the realization of the short comings of the Women in Development(WID) approach to gender that was prominent in the 1970’s. This approach had noted that development programmes had ignored and worsened the conditions of women. It sought to change the women conditions by integrating women into economic development processes through separate women offices, women projects and units separate from the mainstream. Although this approach led to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) legislation which Uganda is a signatory, it was not sufficient to address gender inequalities as it ignored among others the role of men in decision making (KFW, 2006) and had little application to Africa (Beetham, & Dimitriades, 2007).

To enhance accountability to the international treaties and national legal and policy frameworks, it is clear that understanding of the link between gender and M&E is important for the understanding of how gender sensitive M&E systems can be developed (Rensburg, & Blaser Mapitsa, C. 2017). It is often assumed that M&E systems should be able to measure the issues of gender as impacts may differ across different targeted categories of people whom the project or programme aims to address, and programmes are never gender neutral (FAO, 2014). Gender sensitive M&E systems are thus assumed to help in the measurement of the gender equality goals in themselves (FAO, 2014). Although Resnburg and Mapista (2017) have shown, the linkage between M&E and gender, this linkage is still unclear in humanitarian programming.
This study was undertaken in a humanitarian NGO in Uganda – the International Rescue committee that started operations in Uganda in 1998. It is a humanitarian organization that responds to humanitarian crises and helps people recover their lives and livelihoods that have been affected by conflict and disaster. The International Rescue Committee (IRC) operates nationwide serving Internally Displaced People (IDPs) and conflict affected populations. The organization was chosen because it has a full gender programme that has been put in place to deal with issues of gender mainstreaming and also its long history in humanitarian and M&E systems development as shown from its literature. Since 2011, the organization has articulated its commitment to gender mainstreaming and promised to follow the SPHERE minimum standards for humanitarian action by conducting gender analysis on all their programme activities (SPHERE project, 2011). It thus provided a good basis for the study on the effect of organizational and programme factors have on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. In this study, gender-sensitive M&E systems is conceptualized in terms of; planning measuring gender analysis, budget allocation, and strategy/work plan; data collection and management measuring gender sensitive indicators, gendered teams, tools development, and gender information management system and; reporting measuring gender responsive reporting, dissemination and use of M&E findings. Particularly the study set out to test the following hypotheses;

- **H1**: Organizational factors have no effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in NGO
- **H2**: Programme factors have no effect on the development of gender responsive M&E systems in NGO

The article explains the methodology of the study, highlights existing literature on the key variables including theoretical considerations. The paper presents the key findings and discusses the results before stating conclusions and recommendations.

**Research Design and Methodology**

**Research design**: A cross sectional study design was adopted using quantitative methods of data collection and analysis. The selection of the design was informed by the need to test hypotheses regarding organizational and programme factors and their effect on gender sensitive M&E development, providing an appropriate opportunity to study the M&E systems in its natural real-life context (Pickard, 2013).

**Sampling and sample size determination**: The study population comprised of the M&E officers, SGV and WPE managers, Finance, HR staff, gender focal persons, project officers, and programme officials, senior management staff of IRC at both head office and field staff in the Yumbe humanitarian programme. From the population of 264, a sample of 147 respondents were selected for the study using proportionate stratified sampling technique across the stratum of the employees at IRC. The sample size was determined using the Yamane (1967) formula for calculating sample size.

**Data collection and analysis**: Quantitative data was collected using a survey questionnaire. A self-administered questionnaire was used to collect data from the finance and HR staff, senior managers, programme staff, and administration staff at IRC. The questionnaire was structured collecting data on demographic characteristics of respondents, a Likert scale measuring attitudes of employees regarding programme and organizational factors (organizational structure, organizational culture, leadership, staff gender competences, project methods and tools as well as programme context) and how these affect the development of a gender-sensitive M&E system.

Questionnaires were scrutinised for usability – consistence and accuracy and then cleaned, edited and assigned identification numbers and coded for data entry (Kothari 2004:123). Quantitative data analysis was done using SPSS IBM 20 to generate frequencies, measures of central tendency as well as measures of dispersion on study
variables. These include; organizational factors including; the organizational structure in terms of M&E Unit, staffing and, governance; the organizational culture in terms of Values, attitudes, commitment, models, practices and; the leadership in terms of vision, accountability, capacity, and commitment within the organization; The programme factors including; Staff gender competencies in terms of the Methods they use, integration skills, self-image, and training; the project methods and tools in terms of gender mainstreaming tools, participation, and capacity and; the programme context conceptualized as the socio-economic conditions, attitudes, laws, and partners). The gender-sensitive M&E systems including; planning measuring gender analysis, budget allocation, and strategy/work plan; data collection and management measuring gender sensitive indicators, gendered teams, tools development, and gender information management system and; reporting measuring gender responsive reporting, dissemination and use of M&E findings. The relationship shown is a linear dependence one.

Literature Review

Theoretical Review

The study uses the Gendered Organizational Theory attributed to Aker (1990) who examined the subtle ways that gender was established and reproduced in organizations such as overt and covert practices and processes that in themselves perpetuate gender inequalities such as “concrete activities, what people do and say, and how they think about these activities” (Aker, 1992: 420). According to Aker (1992) there are five processes through which to examine gender in an organization and these are: analysis of “production of gender divisions,” and “the gender patterning of jobs, wages and hierarchies, power and subordination” (Aker, 1992, p. 252). This involves examining the processes that produce them and those that resist their formation and practices. The second process to examine is “the creation of symbols, images, and forms of consciousness that explicate, justify, and, more rarely, oppose gender divisions” (Aker, 1992:253) such as “language, ideology, popular and high culture, dress, the press, television” (Aker, 1992:146) in other words organizational culture and processes. Third need to examine “interactions between individuals that enact dominance and subordination and create alliances and exclusion” (Acker, 1992: 253) within the organization and outside it. The fourth process is the impact of the gendered organization on the identity of the individual (presentation of self-etc). The fifth is the processes of creating and conceptualizing social structures such as race, ethnicity and relationships with other structures or analytically different processes (Aker 2012).

While Aker(1990) is credited with this theory the perspectives of the theory that emerge are that it consists of three distinct attributes or perspectives (Makarem n.d) namely, First, Inter-sectionality- how the organization interacts with the disadvantaged (women, minority groups etc) and how structure, culture, class and self -image of participants interface to create new meanings and experiences (Acker, 2012) that can perpetuate gender inequalities including linkage to other forms of inequality processes and practices in existence. The second perspective of understanding gendered organizations relates to examine gender, ethnicity and culture. It could relate to how gender and ethnicity affects leadership experiences (Showunmi, Atewologun, and Bebbington, 2015), or how culture (in such forms as gender scripts, stereo typing etc) and influence leadership (Ayman & Korabik, 2010) and how the leadership is affected by the three perspectives of how gender inequality can be established- intrapsychic, the social structural, and the interpersonal perspectives (Korabik and Ayman (2007). The third perspective to understanding gendered organizations is to examine leadership- focusing on the intersections of leadership and those that are led, organizational context(policies, HRM practices, laws and strategies(Budgets, Plans etc) that are formulated for change to take place (Britton and Logan,2008). Thus identifying the inequalities is not sufficient but there is need to examine the organizational structures, processes and culture and how they interact to perpetuate inequality and also linkage to socio economic factors in/outside
the organization (Metcalfe, 2006). Makarem notes that in gendered research it is important to understand how gender inequalities are built in and reproduced by social structures in order to develop appropriate and adequate gender-bias free policies.

Aker (1990) and the gendered organizational theorists have been criticized for assuming that organizations are inherently designed for male domination which is not correct. In addition any structure that exists often is a reflection of what the society or situation is like and so gender inequalities outside will often reproduce themselves within the organization. Despite these shortcomings the theory helps us to examine gendered practices and processes in the development of M&E such as proposed by the theory such as organizational structure, culture, leadership and these are key components of organizational factors whilst organizational context, staff self-images seen in their competencies to identify gender inequalities, and project methods that determine inter-sectionality between internal and external conditions of gender inequality form programme factors in the study.

**Organizational Factors and Gender-Sensitive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems**

**Organizational structure and development of gender sensitive M&E systems**

Caroline Moser, 2016 demonstrate and argue that organizational structures can be determinants of gender transformation or pathways in which gender relations and power can be exercised. The structure of an organization can cause an autocratic structural change- where technical staff determine changes (UN Women, 2013), or a participatory and more engaging approach that enables demands from women and communities for gender transformation advocated by organizations such as Oxfam (Sweetman, 2013). USAID (2016) notes that an organizational structure plays an important role in the integration of gender in M&E systems basically through two major pathways: the human resource management pathway through staff placement, gender unit establishment and gender responsive organizational policies and procedures pathway which provides the framework for the functionality of the staff positions and units created.

Studies show that an organizational structure influences the way change occurs, especially if the change is radical in nature such as may be introduced by the feminization of M&E systems, as this challenges the power relations and the infrastructure that supports it with implications for staff at all levels(Aruna, 2005, Caroline Moser, 2016). Batliwala (2011) has argued that an organizational structure has a direct link to the effectiveness of the M&E system to address gender issues. Nasambu (2016) has noted that an organizational structure has a positive and significant correlation to M&E performance. Mary Njenga et al (2008) have noted that issues of access to resources and control, decision making, division of labour and knowledge which are critical in reduction of gender inequalities are directly linked and affected by the organizational structure. Thus for an organization to make the necessary changes such as in the development of gender sensitive M&E systems it must have the views of all staff taken into consideration in a participatory way and thus create space for a gendered organizational structure that also needs to be accountable.

**Organizational culture and development of gender sensitive M&E systems**

The European Institute for Gender Equality (2016) cautions that organizations are not static or fixed and often have unwritten rules and undocumented behaviors that potentially affect the gender mainstreaming process. These are embedded in the organizational culture and relate to the behavior of staff and their outlook of issues especially that regard to organizational change. Individuals learn the organizational culture in a socialization process and many of the stereotypical behavior towards gender issues is learnt this way too. So they do note that
gender transformation can only take place if organizational culture is taken into account in the process of change. Kadam, and Acuner, (2018) writing on public sector regarding National women machinery mechanisms in Turkey have averred that gender mainstreaming is a political process that requires a shift in organizational culture. Accordingly it requires a shift of mindset and structures where budgets, staff, incentives, tools and methods and policy making are all shifted and brought on board to support gender mainstreaming and transformation. The linkage to the development of M&E systems in general is seen from the institutional processes crafted within the organization and how these can be supported by existence of National women machineries.

USAID (2010) notes that it’s the cardinal duty of all staff within an organization to reflect and question the cultural norms and practices within the organization and see how they affect their workplaces in terms of how they can integrate gender in the processes including M&E often guided by organizational policy. Policies are major instruments used to ensure gender concerns are well integrated into the culture and operations of an organization (Mergaert and Lombardo, 2014). Resource allocation for gender mainstreaming affects the response and commitment to developing gender sensitive systems. Franklina Mantilla (2012) argues that gender mainstreaming should be provided for with a non-discretionary, fixed budget line and not depend on extra-budgetary resources that is common in gender integration processes. Espinosa (2011) cited in Espinosa, (2013) argues that the failure to allocate resources and insufficient institutional capabilities stems from lack of political will in an organization’s leadership.

Studies in organizational management show that deliberate recruitment of women and the closing of gender gaps in countries like New Zealand has led to the rise in GDP by 10% (Borkin, 2011) and where the gender gap is reduced at the senior management level cases of increased and better performance have been realized (Desvaux, Devillard, Sancier-Sultan, 2010; Whelan & Wood, 2012) and in other cases increased organizational efficiency, profitability and effectiveness, (Borkin, 2011; Desvaux, Devillard Hoellinger & Meaney, 2008; Fitzpatrick, 2011). How this can be linked to M&E is still a grey area

Indeed Taylor-Powell & Boyd (2008) show that several motivators such as leadership opportunities, professional development in the career path and recognition by peers can be strong motivators for increased engagement in evaluation practices. Thus the attitudes of people regarding gender in itself is critical to ensure gender sensitive M&E systems are developed. In the case of the growth of EvalPartners and the eventual resolution on gender equity in evaluation processes in the UN in December 2014, the past experience of Mr. Segone in UNICEF and the amiable support from his mentor ensured that gender concerns were integrated into UNICEF work (Catsambas, 2015), but also led to donors such as Finland to adopt gender sensitive M&E systems that were considered a risk, triggering a movement that today has a membership of more 140,000 (Catsambas, 2015).

Staff who have residual knowledge on how to tackle gender inequalities gained from previous experiences or practices within organizations often are an important strategy for effective gender mainstreaming (Hankivski, 2008; Squires, 2007) in M&E processes. Hoole and Patterson (2008) have argued that the process of building evaluation capacity in organizations requires infrastructure to support it and a learning culture. The learning culture is established through strategic learning- a process which is “the integration of evaluation and other feedback into decision making about strategy…using evaluation and evaluative thinking to learn in real-time and adapt their strategies to the changing circumstances about them” (Coffman & Beer, 2011). According to Hoole and Patterson (2008) feedback that consists of stakeholder input and incorporation of external evaluation expertise is critical in the development of a learning organization.
Leadership and development of gender sensitive M&E systems

In the development of gender integrated and responsive systems the successful story of the development of the EvalPartners a network of evaluators globally clearly shows that leadership is central. Segone and Oksanen are credited with providing the leadership that not only led to the Chiang Mai declaration on evaluation but also adopting a resolution on evaluation by the UN in December 2014 and declaring 2015 a year of evaluation (Catsambas, 2015). Scholars (Brennan & Major, 2011, Carman & Fredericks, 2010; Taylor-Powell & Boyd, 2008) show that leadership, organizational culture, including support for evaluation are important pillars in developing evaluation culture and that sharing of gendered evaluation experiences among Key leaders (Preskill & Boyle, 2008) helps build capacity to enhance the uptake of gender mainstreaming.

Where organizations may not have gender specialists to direct or lead the process of causing gender sensitive M&E systems, Taylor-Powell and Boyd (2008) and Oxfam Canada (2012) suggest that leadership can champion new policies and resources and provide ability to withstand setbacks to the development of M&E processes that could be caused by the absence of a champion or model through influence over peers and possession of particular skills and interests. The bolstering of champions within organizations can be reinforced by the formation of networks of role models and committed staff to catalyse change (DANIDA, 2008) such as in the case of EvalPartners (Tessie Tzavaras Catsambas, 2015). There is need to understand how Leadership for example influences uptake of gender approaches, tools and practices among staff and lead to an ethos that is reinforced and voluntarily taken on by all M&E staff within an organization.

Ivankovich & Faramand (2015) argue that whereas organizational gender strategies, tools and policies can be in place but once not well communicated effectively and perceived as mission critical by the leadership, then gender mainstreaming can have considerable challenges. For example the lack of women representatives in leadership positions can affect the effectiveness of the gender mainstreaming process. According to these scholars, gender mainstreaming requires to be given the due space and support and prioritized in all organizational activities by the leadership. This can be through communication to all staff, providing support in terms of resources, time, commitment, participation (Harvey, 2010) and policy reform to enhance gender sensitive M&E systems.

Canyon, (2017) found in his research that organizational structure, culture and leadership are intertwined in the development of gender inclusion within the security sector. He notes that erstwhile positions that were earmarked for women within the armed forces were open to women as a result of leadership and transformation of the structure of the organization. But this could only be done with the reorientation of the culture of the organization and not just toeing the line. The leadership of any organization plays a crucial role in changing the culture of an organization and also initiating policies that help to restructure the organization and shape the attitudes of those for and against gender inclusion in all processes including M&E systems.

Programme Factors and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems

Staff gender competencies and development of gender sensitive M&E systems

McNairn (2011) cited in Ivankovich and Faramand (2015) in studying gender inequalities that exacerbate food insecurity and under nutrition has averred that building capacity in gender and behavior change communication can enable gender transformation take place. In light of the fact that most project staff have their own experience and attitudes towards gender, it’s important that they are trained in principles of gender integration in projects to help them develop competencies sufficient to enable integration of gender in programmatic processes.
(Ivankovich and Faramand, 2015). Newly recruited project staff, require training in order to enhance their skills and competencies to understand gender issues and apply appropriate approaches/* for gender mainstreaming. In addition to building the capacity there is need for commitment of staff on integration of gender into processes. USAID (2010) has argued that in order to successfully ensure integration of gender into program activities, project staff at all levels need to have skills in gender mainstreaming and be responsible for gender integration in addition with staff having access to rebuilding their skills through training. However, how these skills can be sustained in cases of humanitarian aid that are often transitional in nature is still poorly researched.

**Project methods, tools and development of gender sensitive M&E systems**

Glaister Leslie and Nathalie Holvoet (2013) note that the adoption of appropriate M&E approaches, should be able to show what changes must take place in the organization and the results of those changes that ought to be realized as premised on the theory of change. Scholars show that the majority of capacity building interventions focus on one off trainings and workshops and in some cases technical assistance in terms of project management expertise (Datta et al., 2012) and advise often leaving the higher intangibles of organizational change such as power, incentives unaffected and not even measured due to difficulty in indicator identification and measurement (Ubbels, 2010). Gender mainstreaming has often be done in workshops and one off trainings or sometime payment of salaries for gender specialists who are expatriates and thus leaving many projects and organizations with limited capacity and desired change at the organizational level.

Funders of projects are one of the major stakeholders to affect the development of M&E. The rigor with which organizations mainstream gender in M&E processes is determined in many respects by the perceptions and interests of the donors who sponsor or fund projects. For instance a study by GEO (2012) showed that evaluations served internal audiences as demanded by donors and concluded that funders were not living up to their promises of ensuring that evaluation results should be communicated and used as a platform for learning in the gender process. The power relations between grantee and grantor have had serious implications on the conduct of evaluations and affected the mainstreaming of gender in evaluation processes.

The challenge with mainstreaming is partly affected by the perception that organizations attach to the evaluation process. A study by The Center for Effective Philanthropy found that grantees of funding perceived evaluations as a wastage of resources and a distraction (Buteau & Chu, 2011) rather than a helpful learning exercise. Participation of stakeholders such as women in M&E activities have an impact on what outcomes emerge from the exercises as a gender evaluation of World Bank programmes shows (IEG, 2010). The evaluation found that when women participate less in project design or evaluation exercise then they benefit less from the project. Similarly according to two studies in Bangladesh (Tabassum Naved, 2006) the disregard of women in the project processes soon gave way to men controlling project activities. Harvey (2010) argues that however good a policy change or shift may be often resistance may emerge and it requires the participation of people to enhance reception and understand the purpose and benefits of a gender mainstreaming process. Multi stakeholder participation requires tools and methods that utilize and enhance the spaces for participation. How tools and methods can be effectively applied seems to be a grey area in the literature reviewed.

**Programme context and development of gender sensitive M&E systems**

The level of gender integration in M&E systems is determined by donor conditions as most NGO’s M&E systems are established to provide accountability to donors or sometimes designed with support of peer organizations (Szper and Prakash 2011) to meet society requirements or regulations of government that now require transparency to counter the growing concerns of the quality of NGO work (Murtaza, 2011). Thus in such
scenarios gender if not budgeted for or emphasized by the donor then gender responsive M&E systems are hard to develop given the financial constraints. Evaluations are often done but as part of contract compliance for the donors and even when there are lessons to learn such as the challenges of gender mainstreaming, the lessons are not taken as it has implications for the fundraising for the organization if the weaknesses have a significant impact on their reputation. According to Gulrajani (2013) the demand for gender mainstreaming by donors in funding or aid modalities is more emphasized and used in project selection than in implementation or results/outcomes as a whole.

Mainstreaming of gender including in M&E systems would require sufficient resources, building capacities among others but like Ogden et al. (2008) notes mainstreaming ends up as ‘gender as usual,’ a scenario where commitments to address gender equality are not supported with processes of staff capacity development, allocation of adequate financing, and adequate monitoring and evaluation of results. According to Sen and Östlin (2010) the failure of gender mainstreaming is among others caused by organizational plaqueness where they are traditionally encrusted by usually male dominated organizational relationships, values and approaches to work while on the part of African Development Bank (2011) it is the problem of looking at gender mainstreaming as more of a process than targeting outcomes of the process.

According to Caren Grown (2014) the other reason for the difficulty in attaining effective gender mainstreaming stems from the multi dimensionality of the gender equality concept and the fact that there is mismatch between different donors in approaches across different sectors and resources allocated for the exercise in relation to policy commitments. Financing of gender mainstreaming is crucial and Caren Grown (2014) has noted that whereas there has been no agreed amount of the budget to be allocated to gender mainstreaming they suggest that 15% of budget should be ideal allocation but unfortunately that has not been the case as many donors have only emphasized gender mainstreaming without budget allocations for gender mainstreaming (Grown et al., 2005). So the efforts to Mainstream Gender In M&E Systems Become Difficult.

**Summary of the Literature Review and Gaps**

The literature is largely fragmented either addressing issues of gender mainstreaming in general but little on M&E systems development specifically and limited study on development of gender responsive M&E systems in Uganda. In addition, much of the literature is not within the humanitarian action sphere presenting a limited understanding and appreciation of how gender sensitive M&E systems ought to be developed, a grey area that needs to be researched upon. This is why this research became cardinal to provide new insights into the whole process contributing new knowledge to the field of M&E.

**Study Findings**

**Response Rate**

The researchers distributed 147 questionnaires to respondents and a total of 120 questionnaires were returned. The response rate is presented in the table 4.1 below:

**Table 1: Response Rate for the Study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instruments</th>
<th>Targeted</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Response Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaires</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>81.6 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>81.6 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Nulty (2008) a response rate above 50% is acceptable in social research and thus the rate attained was sufficient to subject the data to analysis.

**Background Characteristics of Respondents**

The following were the background characteristics of respondents as presented in Table 4.2 below:

**Table 2: Respondents Background Characteristics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age of respondent</strong></td>
<td>Below 30 years</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>61.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Between 30 and 40 years</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over 40 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex of respondent</strong></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>61.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>38.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital Status</strong></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>62.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Widowed/widower</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic qualification</strong></td>
<td>Bachelors</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Time of service in the</strong></td>
<td>Below five years</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>90.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organization</td>
<td>Between five and Ten years</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Over ten years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in table 2 above shows that majority of respondents (61.9%) were below the age of 30 while 36.4% were between the ages of 30 and 40 while 1.7% were above 40 years. This shows that IRC had a young staff profile in its humanitarian programmes. The majority of the staff interviewed were male constituting 61.9% while the females were 38.1%. In addition, 62.7 % of the staff interviewed were married while 34.4% were single. Also, to note is that 2.5% were widowed. The large number of married shows the respondents consisted of persons having the appropriate background experience to respond to a gender study. Also given that the majority of respondents were below 30 years and many married it shows that marriages could have been nascent and therefore provide lessons to learn on issues of gender as these respondents were likely to be sensitive to the gender concerns at the workplace and organization (KII, 2018).

In terms of academic qualifications 69.5% of the respondents had a bachelor’s degree, 25.4% had diploma and 5.1% had a masters. This means the respondents had the requisite knowledge and competencies to comprehend the questionnaire and thus take part in the study. The majority (90.7%) of the staff interviewed had spent less than five years in the organization while 7.6% had spent between five to ten years in the organization and 1.7% having spent over ten years in the organization. The time spent in the organization was sufficient for respondents
to be able to recollect organizational issues that were relevant to the answering of questions posed in the study especially that most emergency projects last between one to three years in duration.

Description of Dependent Variable: Gender Sensitive M&E System

The questionnaire used measured the dependent variable (DV) - gender sensitive M&E system using 18 items scaled using the five-point Likert scale where, 1 = Strongly Disagree 2 = Disagree, 3 = Not Sure, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree. It consisted of three constructs namely Planning (PN), Data collection and Management (DCM) and Reporting (RP).

Gender Sensitive M&E System Index

In order to analyse further gender sensitive M&E system variable, an average measure of GSME was derived from the three components (PN, DCM, and RP) in order to get an overall picture of how the respondents rated GSM, an average index was computed for the 18 items that constituted 7 items for PL, 7 items for DCM and 4 items for RP.

Table 3: Summary Descriptive Statistics for Gender Sensitive M&E System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.6560</td>
<td>.06559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</td>
<td>Lower Bound 3.5258</td>
<td>Upper Bound 3.7862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Trimmed Mean</td>
<td>3.6990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>3.7460</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>.409</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.63925</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interquartile Range</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-1.107</td>
<td>.247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.761</td>
<td>.490</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in table 3 above show that the mean = 3.66 was close to the median = 3.72 Therefore, despite the negative skew (skew -1.107), the results were normally distributed. The mean and median close to 4 suggested that gender sensitive M&E system was realizable basing on the scale used that shows that the code 4 corresponded to agree. It also showed that the respondents were certain about the gender mainstreaming process in M&E systems in IRC in the emergency and recovery phases of humanitarian aid. Thus it seemed plausible to note that the ingredients of a gender sensitive M&E system were in place.

Description of independent Variable: Organizational Factors

The independent variable (IV) organizational factors consisted of and was measured using three constructs namely; Organizational structure, organizational culture and leadership. These items were derived from the first objective of the study that sought to establish the effect of organizational factors on development of gender sensitive M&E systems. Organizational structure was measured using 6 items, Organizational culture was
measured using 7 items and leadership measured using 6 items on a five-point Likert scale where, 1 = Strongly Disagree, 2 = Disagree, 3 = Not Sure, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree. In order to regress a composite mean for variable of Organizational Factors was computed and results are presented below. The table 4.10 below summarizes the statistics for the variable of organizational factors.

Table 4: Summary Statistics for Organizational Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.9313</td>
<td>.05853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
<td>3.8149</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Bound</td>
<td>4.0476</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Trimmed Mean</td>
<td>3.9608</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>4.0159</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.54908</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>2.70</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interquartile Range</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-.800</td>
<td>.257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.208</td>
<td>.508</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in Table 4 show that the mean = 3.93 was almost close to the median = 4.02 Therefore, despite the negative skew (skew -.800), the results were normally distributed. The mean and median close to code 4 used in the scale showed agreed and thus suggested that there was a general agreement across the organization that the factors analysed were important to gender mainstreaming in the organization.

Description of Independent Variable: Programme Factors versus Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems

The independent variable (IV) Programme factors consisted of and was measured using three constructs namely; staff gender competencies, Project methods and tools and Programme context. Staff gender competencies was measured using 5 items, project methods and tools was measured using 5 items and programme was measured using 4 items on the five-point Likert scale where, 1 = Strongly Disagree, 2 = Disagree, 3 = Not Sure, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree. In order to find out the overall view of how the respondents rated the variable of programme factors in the development of gender sensitive M&E system, a composite mean of programme factors was computed for all the three sub constructs of the variable; staff gender competencies (5 items), project methods and tools (5 items) and programme Context (4 items). The summary of the statistics on programme factors are presented in Table 4.14 below.

Table 5 Summary Statistics for Programme factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statistic</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Programme Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.4594</td>
<td>.05773</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95% Confidence Interval for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
<td>3.3450</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>3.5739</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Bound</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5% Trimmed Mean</td>
<td>3.4903</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>3.5333</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>.353</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Deviation</td>
<td>.59433</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
<td>4.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interquartile Range</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skewness</td>
<td>-.925</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurtosis</td>
<td>1.629</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data

The results in Table 5 show that the mean = 3.46 was almost the same with the median = 3.53 and so despite the negative skew (skew = -0.925), the results were normally distributed. The mean close to 3 which is neutral and median close to Code 4 that in the scale represented agree suggested that programme factors were moderately positive in the process of gender mainstreaming.

Inferential Analyses

In order to determine whether a relationship existed between organizational and programme factors on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems inferential analyses namely in the form of correlation and regression were undertaken and the results are presented in the sub sections below:

Correlation of Organizational Factors and Development of Gender Responsive M&E system

In order to establish whether the organizational factors namely; Organizational structure, organizational culture and leadership had a relationship with development of gender sensitive M&E system, correlation analysis was carried out using Pearson product Correlation coefficient and the results are presented in table 4.15 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Gender Sensitive M&amp;E systems</th>
<th>Organizational Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender sensitive M&amp;E systems</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation 1</td>
<td>N 95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.695**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Factors</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation .000</td>
<td>N 78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.465</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The results from table 6 show that organizational factors had a strong positive and significant relationship with the development of gender sensitive M&E systems (p = 0.00 < 0.05). This therefore led the Hypothesis 1 to be supported and the alternative hypothesis to be rejected.

Regression model of organizational factors and development of gender responsive M&E System
At the confirmatory level, to establish whether organizational factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems a regression analysis was carried out and the results are presented below:

### Table 7: Regression model for organizational factors and gender sensitive M&E systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Significance (p)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Factors</td>
<td>.695</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted $R^2 = 0.477$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$F = 71.166, p = .000$</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**a. Dependent Variable: Gender Sensitive M&E Systems**

The regression results from table 4.16 above shows that organizational factors only account for 47.7% (adjusted $R^2 = 0.477$) of the variation in gender sensitive M&E System variable and 43.3% is accounted for by other factors. The standardized coefficient ($\beta$) of 0.695 ($p = 0.000$) shows that organizational factors have a strong positive and significant relationship with the development of gender sensitive M&E Systems and thus we accept Hypothesis 1 and reject the alternative hypothesis.

### Correlation of Programme Factors and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E System

In order to establish whether the programme factors namely; staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and programme context have a relationship with development of gender sensitive M&E system, correlation analysis was carried out using Pearson product Correlation coefficient and the results are presented in table 4.17 below

**Table 8: Correlation Matrix for Programme Factors and Gender Sensitive M&E System**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Gender Sensitive M&amp;E Systems</th>
<th>Programme Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender Sensitive M&amp;E Systems</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.796**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme Factors</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**.** Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

The results from table 8 above shows that programme factors have a positive and significant relationship with the development of gender sensitive M&E system. Thus Hypothesis 2 is supported and the null hypothesis not supported.

### Regression model of Programme Factors and Development of Gender Sensitive M&E System

At the confirmatory level, to establish whether programme factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems a regression analysis was carried out and the results are presented below:
Table 9: Regression Model for Programme Factors and Gender Sensitive M&E systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beta(β)</td>
<td>(p)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme Factors</td>
<td>.796</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R² = .628</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F = 144.800, p = .000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b. Dependent Variable: Gender Sensitive M&E systems

Results from table 9 show that programme factors account for 62.8% (Adjusted R² = .628) of the variation in gender sensitive M&E systems variable and the remaining 31.2% explained by other factors. The standardized coefficient (β) of .796 (p = 0.000) shows that programme factors have a positive strong and significant relationship with gender sensitive M&E systems. Thus Hypothesis 2 is accepted, and the null hypothesis rejected.

Discussions of Findings

Research hypothesis 1: Organizational factors have an effect on the Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems in a Humanitarian NGO

The descriptive results on organizational factors showed that the mean was 3.93 thus suggesting that the relationship between organizational factors and development of gender sensitive M&E system was good. Results from regression analysis showed that organizational factors had a positive and significant relationship to the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. The hypothesis that organizational factors have an effect on development of gender sensitive M&E system was therefore accepted and the alternative hypothesis not supported.

The findings revealed that the first hypothesis (H1) to the effect that organizational factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems was supported and thus accepted and the alternative hypothesis (H0) rejected. This could be because of leadership and structure matching with what Mukhopadhyay(2014) found in a study on theoretical exploration of gender mainstreaming approaches in which the author found that the absence of institutional mechanisms had led to the failure to attain gender mainstreaming in all processes and also what Neumann, Jan (2014) found in a PhD study in developing a framework for monitoring critical success factors to enhance strategic change within organization.

The findings of organizational structure, culture and leadership as critical organizational factors in the development of gender sensitive M&E systems also matches what Canyon, D(2017) found in his research that organizational structure, culture and leadership are intertwined in the development of gender inclusion within the security sector. What however seems unclear and what the current study also fails short is the fact that a combination of culture, structure and leadership often produce an organizational climate that can lead to gender inequalities including non-gender sensitive M&E systems. This is what Aker (1992) notes as the subtle manifestations of gendered issues that eventually lead to self-identity. So how organizational climate leads to gender sensitive M&E systems is not fully understood and needs further exploration, whether as a mediating or intervening variable.

Findings show that organizational structure was favourably rated among the constructs of organizational factors and this matches with UNU World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU-WIDER, 2014) study on gender equality in Aid which found that for mainstreaming
of gender to be effective then it has to be embedded in the institutional processes and the organization should take it as a business. The study concluded that gender mainstreaming has to be an organizational culture and ethos to get effective results. The high rating of organizational structure for the development of gender sensitive M&E resonances with the conclusions of USAID (2016) and Batliwala (2011) who have argued that an organizational structure plays an important role in the integration of gender in M&E systems either through a structured process such as in human resource management practices in terms of competencies or pooling skills or through an organizational ethos that is articulated in the mission or vision statement of the organization and confirms theoretically what Aker(1992) recommends that one way to study gender in an organization is to examine its mission statements and other processes that define its structure.

Evidence within IRC showed that while gender training had been undertaken there was limited use of the training as staff lacked confidence and also no evidence existed to show the use of gender findings for social justice as recommended by Aker (2012), Batliwala (2011), Van Eerdewijk and Dubel (2012) and Wong (2012). Indeed IRC seemed to fall into the one off trainings that scholars such as Datta et al., (2012) and Ubels, (2010) warn about. These trainings have limited empowerment effect as they are not directly linked to organizational change in the long term. This partly explained why IRC staff seemed not confident on gender analysis although acknowledged that the practice was common place.

It was also found that the existence of a gender focal person among senior management was an important driver of change in the organization especially in the process of gender mainstreaming in M&E. This finding agrees with what DANIDA (2008) and Catsambas, (2015) found out that champions or models are important to ensure that the gender mainstreaming agenda takes place and is effective. Indeed as Cho & Perry, (2012) have noted the existence of these technical persons allows the articulation of the vision of gender mainstreaming within the organization that in turn builds the tempo for the development of gender sensitive M&E systems.

The study findings of organizational culture being crucial in gender mainstreaming echo what the European Institute for Gender Equality (2016) notes viz that organizations are not static or fixed and have organizational cultures that often display unwritten rules and undocumented behaviors that potentially affect the gender mainstreaming process. While in IRC it was seen that the culture promotes gender mainstreaming, the researcher was unable to investigate further the inter staff relations and socializations processes that Aker (1992) recommends in her theory of gendered organizations. Thus how the socialization process within the organizations as a mediating or moderating variable could be a good area of further investigation.

Leadership in IRC has played a crucial role in promoting gender mainstreaming in being accountable and participatorily encouraging staff and sharing their vision for gender mainstreaming. This finding is in line with what studies by Brennan & Major, (2011), Carman & Fredericks (2010); Catsambs, (2015) Taylor-Powell & Boyd, (2008) have found namely that leadership when combined with other factors becomes a pillar in the development of gender integration within the M&E systems. However on leadership this study findings of leadership being crucial in gender sensitive M&E systems does not resonant with the findings of ADB (2012) study that undertook synthesis of gender mainstreaming in evaluations done between 1990 and 2010 and made a number of conclusions that show leadership was not providing the impetus for gender mainstreaming in evaluations by the multilateral agencies or even donors or organizations. It also concluded that in the absence of accountability (a key aspect of organizational culture) and sufficient resources made it difficult to undertake integration of gender into organizational activities becomes.
Research Hypothesis 2: Programme factors have an effect on the Development of Gender Sensitive M&E Systems in a Humanitarian NGO

The summary descriptive results of programme factors showed that the mean was = 3.46 thus suggesting that the relationship between programme factors and development of gender sensitive M&E system was not good. Results from regression analysis showed that programme factors had a strong positive and significant relationship to the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. The hypothesis that programme factors have an effect on development of gender sensitive M&E system was therefore accepted and the alternative hypothesis rejected.

The findings revealed that the second hypothesis ($H_2$) to the effect that programme factors have an effect on the development of gender sensitive M&E systems was supported and thus accepted and the alternative hypothesis ($H_0$) rejected. Findings from respondents during interviews also show results of moderately to high level of appreciation for the linkage between programme factors and gender sensitive M&E systems. The sub constructs of programme factors included staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and programme context. These findings are in tandem with the findings of other scholars such as Kenny and O’Donnell (2016) who found in their study of World Bank projects that gender integration varied and largely depended on clearly defined objectives and targets. The approaches used determine to a large extent the level of gender integration including processes of determining the outcomes needed in programmes.

The findings of programme factors having an effect on gender sensitive M&E systems also match those of FAO(2014) who in their assessment of factors crucial to gender sensitive M&E found that programme factors particularly participatorily engaging stakeholders in M&E was more important in addition to a reflective and learning M&E process. It also agrees with findings from other studies by SIDA (2015), Sudarshan and Sharma (2012), who found programme factors important in developing gender sensitive evaluations.

Findings from the study show that IRC Staff were not familiar with methods and tools for gender analysis and were not able to integrate them into project activities as the mean was 3.03. This contradicts another finding within the same study where they noted that gender analysis was always done. This could point to the use of consultants as findings showed that the organization often conducted independent gender studies. These findings contradict with SIDA (2015), and USAID (2016) findings that show that staff competencies are very important requisites if gender sensitive M&E systems are to be attained. While the staff skills were low, findings show that IRC had been able to attain a high level of developing gender sensitive M&E systems which could be as a result of other factors. It is important to continuously build capacity of both men and women to ensure that both genders meaningfully participate in project M&E processes and programmes.

Findings from qualitative data analysis of stakeholders outside the organization not effectively provided with capacity to gender mainstream, had implications on the overall attainment and sustainability of gender mainstreaming in M&E systems. These findings show and contradict with what Espinosa(2013), Catsambas (2015), USAID(2016), World Bank (2010), have shown that the success to gender mainstreaming in M&E processes among others needs a holistic approach that also considers the building of capacity of those outside the organization. Thus it can be pointed out that there was less utilization of gender data and findings within IRC to attain social justice within the communities as demanded by feminists advocating for taking gender beyond just statistics (Espinosa, 2013). It is important to include in further analysis those gender impacts anticipated by the project and thus correlate these with the M&E systems to examine the linkages.
In programme context donors play the biggest role in ensuring that an organization’s M&E system gender-sensitive such as in humanitarian setting. DFID funding to IRC in 2013-2017 had clear demands on gender disaggregated data reporting. This finding corresponds to what scholars (Caren Grown, 2014 Gulrajani, 2013, Szper and Prakash, 2011) have found that the approach to gender mainstreaming is a donor driven process and the many approaches that organizations take to gender mainstream are often dictated by the donors themselves. In some instances, as Catsambas (2015) has shown, donors can completely transform an organization’s gender mainstreaming approach and pathway. However, in the case of IRC there was little evidence to suggest that the donor approach would be sustainable given the transitional nature of the served communities and also the attitudes of the communities who saw gender equality as not an essential ingredient of development according to the respondents. In addition, given the transitional nature of the workforce being recruited largely in emergencies it shows that gender sensitive approaches in M&E may take time to take root.

Conclusions and Recommendations for Practice

The findings clearly showed that organizational factors particularly organizational structure, culture and leadership as sub constructs are not significant predictors of the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in emergency and recovery phases of humanitarian aid in NGOs in Uganda. More practical and hands on experience and support is more important to the development of gender mainstreaming in M&E systems than just an articulation of policy and guidelines although these are also crucial to the process as they determine budget allocations and lines of accountability. It also emerged that programme factors specifically staff gender competencies, project methods and tools and programme context are predictors of the development of gender sensitive M&E systems in emergency and recovery phases of humanitarian aid in NGOs in Uganda. It is clear that there are other factors that contribute to the development of gender sensitive M&E systems within the humanitarian context that are not of organizational or programmatic nature. This is because both organizational and programme factors explain not more than 65% variation in gender sensitive M&E systems according to the findings.

Findings show that organizational aspects of gender mainstreaming though crucial, have less significance on gender mainstreaming in emergencies and recovery aspects of humanitarian aid and so, researchers recommend paying more attention to building programme factors as they easily enhance gender mainstreaming in M&E. there is a need to provide more field based and hands on training on how to integrate gender into project activities. More investment should be made on enhancing staff competencies in gender mainstreaming and also training them on project methods and tools that enhance gender mainstreaming in M&E. Evaluators and other specialists in M&E should be keen on contextual issues and how they affect the development of gender sensitive M&E systems. These issues include how donors, partners and other stakeholders perceive gender mainstreaming. Efforts are needed to develop ownership of gender mainstreaming efforts by all stakeholders at all levels of project design and implementation especially in humanitarian work.

References


African Development Bank (2012) Mainstreaming Gender Equality: A Road to Results or a Road to Nowhere? Tunisia


Caren Grown (2014)”Aid and Gender Equality” Position paper, Helsinki: UNU-WIDER.


Franklina Mantilla (2012) Review of Gender Mainstreaming in UNEP, UNEP evaluation office


IRC (2017) Family Planning & Post Abortion Care in Emergencies Program bi annual report, Kampala


USAID (2010) Gender integration index, Washington Dc

USAID (2016) Guidelines for integrating gender in Monitoring and Evaluation systems and policies, Washington Dc


The Role of Leadership in Establishment of Results Based Monitoring and Evaluation Systems in Humanitarian Organisations in Uganda: A Case of Action Africa Help-Uganda (AAH-U)

Norbert Amuli Anyidi & Rose B. Namara
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract

M&E systems are important for evidence/results based programing. Its absence in humanitarian organizations affects their performance, hence lowers public confidence and little donor support for them. This study examined the extent to which existence of leadership support affects establishment of RBM&E system at AAH-U. Research among 84 AAH-U staff demonstrate that leadership support strongly affect establishment of RBME system in AAH-U. Leaders approve required policies, plan, and resources and promote a culture where RBME can thrive. However, attitudinal change among workers to demand for RBME is also depended on having a strong education programme and recruiting personal with expertise in Monitoring and evaluation. There is need for AAH-U to put in place RBME promotional programmes and recruit technically competent M&E staff to support organisational leaders in establishment of RBME systems.

Key Words: RBME System, Leadership Championship, AAH-U, Humanitarian Organizations

Introduction

Although there has been a steady improvement in the adoption of M&E in project management among organizations for better and successful project management, research has shown that M&E system establishment is still low among humanitarian organizations as a result of; insecurity, poor infrastructure, short implementation timing, difficulty in accessing populations and high staff turnover. ALNAP (2003), IFRC M&E guide (2011), and Frerks and Hilhorst (2002). But Imas and Rist (2009); Kusek and Rist (2004); Zhou and Hardlife (2013); Ernest (2013) and the World Bank identified low capacity, poor M&E culture, low demand for M&E information and, compromised political will from highly placed leaders as challenges affecting RBME system establishment in stable circumstances.

Results Based Management (RBM) took root in United States of America (USA), Australia, Finland and the United Kingdom (UK) in 1970s and RBME crept in through the gradual introduction of the logical framework approach (Cousins, 2005). With the 2005 Paris declaration, humanitarian and development organizations and governments in Africa and world over embraced Results Based Management (Mackay, 2006). In the humanitarian realm, the Rwandan genocide and other humanitarian situations in the 1990s popularized M&E through establishment of the SPHERE project and the Humanitarian Accountability Partnership (HAP). (Evaluating Humanitarian Action, an ALNAP guide, September 2003). Though RBME was embraced fully, the humanitarian context characterised by insecurity and methodological challenges especially limited use of scientific rigour in conducting studies in emergency situations affected the spread (Frerks & Hilhorst, 2002); (UN assembly; 63 session, 2008); (IFRC M&E guide, 2011); (UNWFP RBM Review, 2008) as stated above, hence most reports of Lead humanitarian agencies like ALNAP, IFRC, and American Relief committee and the United Nations agencies indicate most humanitarians developing and using M&E guides, not establishing complete M&E systems.
Though AAH-U has been a critical organisation in both emergency and stable refugee caseload management in Kyangwali Refugee Settlement in Hoima, AAH-U\(^{163}\) has not established an RBME system in decades yet they have had M&E department and staff since 2011. AAH-U developed a PM&E guide to guide and improve management systems for participatory implementation and results demonstrability. The above was done to enable the organisation remain competitive in the ever-changing socio-economic and political environment in their program areas of emergency and refugee service delivery. (Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation Practice for AAH-I, 2011). Unfortunately, the PM&E guide does not have M&E plan nor does it include M&E policy much as it has superficial elements of the M&E plan, M&E policy and tools and frameworks. The guide has not been fully operationalized. In 2015, a Monitoring/Evaluation and Learning Officer was recruited to spear head M&E activities but the position was short-lived for only a year, then removed from budget, leaving M&E role to be played by program managers.

Leadership Championship in establishment of RBME system

While there could be many reasons why AAH-I may not have managed to establish a robust M&E system, it is closely linked to leadership championship. Leadership is the process of influencing a group of people in order to achieve a given goal (Esmer and Dayi, 2018). It is the ability of creating support and confidence required to achieve organizational goals among the people (Dubrin, 2012). So generally it is influencing a group of people and guiding them to the right direction (Esmer & Dayi, 2018). The concept of leadership championship here is a high level figure with strong political will, good technical knowledge and an excellent networker who can influence and advocate for innovation agenda across partners. These champions provide the vision and the strategy to achieve the desired change.

Twende mbele (2018), attributes success institutionalisation of Monitoring and evaluation systems in some countries to leadership support. In a report about collection of country experiences to inform improvement in M&E efforts, Twende mbele also concurred that to build demand and support for M&E systems, and ensure their successful implementation, countries require leaders with technical, political and social network championship skills. (Using M&E to improve Government Performance and Accountability; Twende mbele 2018). Hence, leadership support and having leaders who understand M&E process is critical to the successful establishment of RBME system. (Imas & Rist, 2009), (Epstein & Olsen, 1996). Görgens et al., (2009) add that such leaders go even further to neutralize members of the team opposed to innovation. Busjeet (2012) in a readiness assessment report concluded that leadership support has a positive significant relationship with RBME system establishment. He states that lack of leadership support in Bangladesh failed their efforts for Monitoring and evaluation.

According to Burn 1978, the leadership personalities should be that of transformational leaders who can champion change with their personality and ability through an articulate vision. Yukl, (1989), cited in (Crawford, Gould and Scott, 2003) elucidates that transformational leadership is about change, innovation and entrepreneurship, and it operates both at the micro and macro level of the social system. Görgens and Kusek, (2009) advice that substantial knowledge of RBME among the leaders can positively improve M&E efforts. Knowledgeable leaders become chamignons and advocates of monitoring and evaluation. Little knowledge of M&E tools, methods and processes significantly affects the success of advocacy for establishing an RBME system. According to Kusek and Rist (2004), experience from Rumania reveals that one of the challenges in

\(^{163}\) AAH-U has been a key implementing partner of United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) from the early 1990s. Its operations are a mix of both emergency and stable refugee caseload management. Currently, its main operation is in Kyangwali Refugee settlement in Hoima District with a country office in Kampala in Ntinda.
moving towards RBME system establishment was, the would-be champions in the government did not understand what entails the orientation into a performance management culture although there existed government interest and capacity in the work force. Knowledge in M&E is an incentive for leadership champions to lead by example and speak from knowledge point of view so that they command authority and respect during supervision and advocacy.

Demand for M&E information by leaders enables organisations to set in place systems to gather such information. Mackay (2007) notes that motivation and incentive for M&E precisely points at demand for M&E information. He therefore advises leaders of organizations to create a sense of demand for M&E through their decision making systems. The World Bank and African Development Bank, in a study on RBME implementation also concurred by revealing that lack of demand for M&E information is a constraint factor to M&E initiatives. (Building Country M&E Systems— Lessons from Experience, volume 10).

As above, literature does not specifically mention the establishment of M&E Plan and Policy and tools. But still, the components seem to be inherent since RBME authorities like Kusek et al., (2004) strongly recommend the above components as key attributes of the RBME system design. Literature from the humanitarian coordination bodies like ALNAP study general leadership qualities that affect operations and found out that lack of leadership support is still a challenge for effective results. (Leadership Literature Review, ALNAP, 2013); (Leadership in Action, ALNAP, 2011). Similarly, in other realms, most writers either studied leadership and organizational performance or transformational leadership in technological innovations.

As above, most leadership researchers make the explicit or implicit assumption that leadership is an important determinant of organizational effectiveness. However, some writers question this assumption. Pfeffer (1977) argues that organizational effectiveness majorly dependent on the economic conditions, market conditions, governmental policies, and level of technological change. To augment, in specific contribution to establishment of RBM&E systems, Zvoushe and Zho (as cited in Lennie & Tacchi, 2015); Brian (2011) and the (ECD No. 8, 2001) studied financial capacity in general management terms. They all agree that sufficient finances ultimately account for better performance but should be augmented by human and logistical capacities. Thomas (1998); Caiden (1998) also re-echo that establishing RBME system is costly. Hence not all organizations may have the capacity for it even when there are good leaders. Further still, Yukl (1989) argues that if leadership is the main determinant in organizational performance, changes in top leadership would always yield better performance. But (Crawford, Gould & Scott, 2003) insists that leadership championship is more pivotal to building a strong vision-based organization. They actually advises leadership trainers to prepare transformational leaders to assume positions and produce results without technical skills in a given field. While the humanitarian scholars agree to a larger extent, factors such as dangerous humanitarian situations, short turn-around time for planning, lack of baseline data and high staff turnover affect elaborate planning in humanitarian settings, literature above reveal that leadership championship takes a more centre stage in the success of RBM&E system establishment. Therefore this paper establishes the extent to which existence of leadership champions affect establishment of RBM&E system at AAH-U.

Research Question

To what extent does existence of leadership support affect establishment of RBME system in AAHU?

Scope wise, the article is limited to M&E system establishment with its dimensions conceived as M&E plan, M&E policy and M&E tools. Influential events in AAH-U from 2009-2016 were considered. In the article, attributes of leadership championship for M&E was seen from aspects of; leaders’ level of technical knowledge
in M&E, leaders’ level of support for M&E cause and, leaders’ level of commitment to motivate and incentivise M&E cause.

Theoretical Review

This study was anchored on the transformational leadership theory (Burns, 1978) which posits that leaders and their followers help each other to champion their objectives to a higher level of morale and motivation as far as creating a significant change in organisations. It further views leaders as champions of change through their personality and ability to cause change through an articulate vision. (Kaupi et al. n.d.). This theory aided in understanding how leaders influence others through trust, loyalty, admiration and respect. The study accentuates the transformational leadership as it shows how leaders transform and motivate followers through their influence, vision, values, long term goals and commitment to work through intellectual stimulation (leadership knowledge), inspirational motivation (leadership motivation) and individual consideration (leadership support).

The theory has been widely used and hailed by various scholars including, (Crawford, 2001), (Crawford, Gould & Scott 2003) and (Sehal, 2015), in explaining influence of leadership in adoption of innovation. Transformative leadership is also instrumental in influencing the culture of the entire organisation to focus on the desired objectives. Bass (1985) used the transformative theory to study leadership behaviour like charisma and intellectual stimulation but it yielded intervening outcomes. (Yukl, 1989); (Bass & Bass 2008). Still, although Intellectual stimulation, Individual consideration and Inspirational motivation have a direct strong influence on followers, it is not clear how they influence core managerial behaviours like planning, monitoring and evaluation to easily give rise to M&E planning, M&E policy design and development of M&E tools.

Methodology

This article on the role of leadership in establishment of RBME is based on the study conducted by the authors in fulments of Master’s degree at Uganda Management Institute and tries to ascertain the extent to which leadership support affect establishment of RBME system in AAH-U. The study utilised self-administered-semi structured questionnaire to obtain quantitative data from the 85 selected employees of AAH-U who included section heads, sub section heads and other operations staff. Also 4 senior management team members of AAH-U and 01 staff of UNHCR were purposively selected and interviewed. Annual and quarterly work plans, quarterly review minutes, and performance reports, HR and the finance policy documents as well as the strategic plan and data collection tools were reviewed to enable understanding of the contextual situation in line with leadership championship. Information is presented in this paper using descriptive statistics and content analysis for qualitative data.

Study Findings

RBME System Establishment

The study sought to ascertain whether AAH-U has an established M&E system especially appropriate policies, strategies, plans, tools and whether these tools are used to generate required information to aid decision making. Table below describes respondent’s opinions;

**Table 2: RBME System Establishment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>DA</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std.Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organization has an M&amp;E policy</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>28.8%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>13.8%</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.225</td>
<td>1.211</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The M&E policy is being used to guide M&E activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Organization has developed M&E plan for all its projects

| Percentage | |
|------------|
| 3.75%      |
| 3.8%       |
| 25%        |
| 46%        |
| 21.3%      |
| 80         |

The M&E plan has clear set targets and time frame for its activities

| Percentage | |
|------------|
| 2.5%       |
| 5%         |
| 23.8%      |
| 48%        |
| 21.3%      |
| 80         |

Organization has M&E tools for all programs

| Percentage | |
|------------|
| 1.25%      |
| 14%        |
| 17.5%      |
| 44%        |
| 23.8%      |
| 80         |

The tools are appropriate for the measurement of the program activities

| Percentage | |
|------------|
| 1.25%      |
| 7.5%       |
| 31.3%      |
| 45%        |
| 15%        |
| 80         |

M&E tools are used to collect data for reporting purposes

| Percentage | |
|------------|
| 0%         |
| 7.5%       |
| 20%        |
| 51%        |
| 21.3%      |
| 80         |

M&E data are used to generate information to aid decision making

| Percentage | |
|------------|
| 7.5%       |
| 5%         |
| 35%        |
| 36%        |
| 16.3%      |
| 80         |

Source: Primary data (2017)

Although 46.8% of the respondents agreed that AAH-U has an M&E policy, 25.5% disagreed and 30.7% were not sure an indication that majority of respondents were not versed with the availability of M&E policy in the organisation. Review of the M&E strategy document of the organisation show that AAH-U does not have an M&E policy in place much as there is an M&E strategy that was designed by the AAH-I Nairobi headquarters for Africa-wide rollout (AAH-I M&E strategy, 2014-2018). AAH-U has no clear policy to guide the establishment of the RBME system possibly because the staff are not aware that a policy is required for such a set up. Respondents who thought there is an M&E policy possibly could not differentiate between an M&E policy and other policies like the human resource one.

The findings revealed that 67.5% of the respondents agreed that AAH-U developed M&E plan for all its projects. Only 7.5% disagreed while 25% of them were not sure. However, since document review shows that AAH-U does not have an M&E plan in place, this means that staff are aware that plans are made for activity implementation and follow up e.g. Monthly, quarterly and annual plans. AAH-U has project monitoring plans for specific UNHCR implementation areas like Kyangwali in Hoima and Adjumani operations (AAH-U Kwangwali project monitoring plan, 2017). This is an initiative of UNHCR to facilitate tracking of implementation in specific areas but not an AAH-U own initiated arrangement. The AAH-I 2014-2018 M&E strategy and the 2011 AAH-I PME guide could have somehow substituted the M&E plan as dubbed in this study however, they were developed by AAH-I and they have not yet even been localised by AAH-U. The lack of M&E plan for AAH-U project demonstrate that there is no RBME system in the organisation and management is not aware of its importance.

AAH-U has M&E tools for all program as agreed to by 67.5% of the respondents, 15% of them disagreed while 17.5% were not sure. AAH-U has rich tools for data collection on routine activities to facilitate periodic reporting for every sector. For instance, community services sector has over ten data collection tools for different refugee community protection needs. UNHCR also augments these with their generic tools for planning, monitoring and reporting progress e.g. the project work plan and reporting templates. However, the tools or frameworks that
connect the collected data to analysis and later meaningful sharing are limited. This makes data storage, analysis, interpretation and information sharing haphazard. When asked if tools are appropriate for the measurement of the program activities, 60% of the respondents agreed and only 8.8% of them disagreed while 31.3% were not sure. Document reviews to a good extend agrees with this. The AAH-I PME guide outlines several tools that are to be used by staff but it is unlikely that the guidelines are implemented since it was not even operationalized. Much as some of the tools recommended in it are the traditional ones that were and are still being used, they are mostly limited to activity monitoring and others are developed by donors. As one of the Key informants noted:

“AAH activity outcome measurement is still infant but we do periodic staff evaluation. OPM is instituting an M&E system, so it may help improve some of these things...I saw evaluation done for the EU funded project in 2013. For UNHCR projects, I see some assessment in WASH sector and Nutrition but they are spearheaded by WFP and UNHCR. [KI.01]

Detailed proper results assessment tools are limited e.g. tools for KAP survey used in WASH and health sectors. Some of the sectors do not have evaluation tools. There are also tools developed by donor agencies like UNHCR and WFP that are appropriate.

On the question whether tools are used by staff and senior management, 61.3% of the respondents agree, 15% of them disagreed and 23.8% were not sure. As stated above, this high agreement implies that AAH-U cherishes evidence informed decision making but also, it means that staff are practically using some tools for data collection and reporting as evidenced by the next 72.5% respondents agreeing that M&E tools are used to collect data for reporting purposes and only 7.5% disagreed. When asked if M&E data is used to generate information to aid decision making, 52.5% of the respondents agreed, only 12.5% of them disagreed and 35% said they were not sure. However, from document review results, even if there AAH-U was to have good M&E reports, it was noticed that finance and human resource departments are not linked to M&E results through their policies although HR decisions on promotions are based on data from staff appraisal reports and recommendations from supervisors. Likewise, evidence from interview with a key informer indicates that finance decisions are not based on performance as one of them had this to say; “Budgeting does not depend on sectoral or individual staff performance but mostly on needs of beneficiaries” [KI 02]. Aware that the policies of the two main departments do not have clear mention about M&E recommendations, it means decision making is mostly based on information from periodic reports and good memory of managers.

In summary, the above inadequacy in tools and their inappropriateness for proper measurement of result indicates that RBME system is not in place. Besides, non-utilization of M&E data for decision making as reflected, affects demand for M&E which also affects RBME system establishment.

Leadership support and RBME System Establishment

The study sought to know if AAH-U leadership supports establishment of RBM&E system. Table below describes respondent’s opinions:

Table 3: Leadership support and RBME System Establishment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top management support budget votes for M&amp;E activities</th>
<th>S D</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>S A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 (2.5%)</td>
<td>9 (11.3%)</td>
<td>28 (35%)</td>
<td>27 (33.8%)</td>
<td>14 (17.5%)</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.525</td>
<td>0.993</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings above show that 51.3% of the respondents agreed that top Management support budget votes for M&E activities while 13.8% disagreed and an equally high 35% were not sure. On the other hand, interview results with key informants revealed that there is no budget allocated by top management to M&E activities and staffing. AAH-U staff feel that UNHCR is the root cause as expressed by the respondents as below; “UNHCR has not yet embraced M&E. They are more willing to facilitate than fund it” [KI 03]. Another one said, “UNHCR does not appreciate M&E so, the position was removed from the budget. Donor seems not to see the importance of spending money on an M&E officer hence removed the position from the budget” [KI 02].

The above statements imply that UNHCR was not convinced of the relevance of the M&E officer position. This could explain why it is the managers currently shoulder the role of M&E. Having no budget for M&E means that M&E activities have to be done alongside other programme activities thus attracting secondary priority.

On the question whether the M&E function has the support of senior management, 57.5% of the respondents agreed that while 12.6% disagreed and 30% were not sure. A member of management argues that AAH-U’s acceptance to remove M&E position shows no support for M&E initiatives. He added by saying; “New ideas that were brought in by the then M&E officer was not supported. Even his presentations were rubbished, hence not motivated”. [KI 04]. Another one echoed that, “The then Country Director would have supported M&E initiatives but he has been transferred to Nairobi office. He had more interest in it” [KI 02].

There is no significant support and willingness by the current management to build a robust M&E system. It is not surprising therefore that M&E position on organisational chart are not filled. Even if 32.6% of the respondents agreed that the positions are filled, this could be because staff could be having limited information regarding the organisational chart and budgets of the organisation.
Concerning if there is good working relationship between the M&E department and others, findings indicated that 65.1% of the respondents agreed while 17% disagree and only 12% were not sure. This is supported by the cordial relationship seen during data collection although staff complained about difficulty in data collection. Lastly on this, on the question if each new staff gets orientation on M&E activities, results revealed that 37.6% of the respondents agreed while 43.8% disagreed and only 8.8% were not sure. In support of this disagreement, a respondent states that; “staff orientation is done but not specifically on M&E activities. It is just a general orientation for the organizational environment and on specific tasks of each staff at sector level”. [KI 01]. Likewise, during document review, there was no policy document which stresses staff orientation on M&E specific activities. The HR policy on staff capacity and development says; “The purpose of staff orientation will be to provide new staff with suitable information on the history, objectives and activities of AAH-I”. [pg. 24].

Knowledge of M&E by Leaders and RBME System Establishment

This section presents the level of agreement of respondents on leaders’ M&E knowledge

Table 4: M&E Knowledge and RBME System Establishment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>S</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Devn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The head of program has technical knowledge to support M&amp;E work</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.525</td>
<td>0.940</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E tools are understood by senior management</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>0.954</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff know the benefit of having RBM&amp;E System</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.5625</td>
<td>0.978</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management and coordinators have acquired M&amp;E knowledge</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.4375</td>
<td>1.053</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E tools and guide reflect organizational mission and vision</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>3.6875</td>
<td>0.820</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data 2017

Empirical findings revealed that 48.8% of the respondents agreed that the head of program has technical knowledge to support M&E work while 10% disagreed. Respondents from key informants support the above but confessed that they only have general knowledge in M&E.

“Leaders have ordinary M&E knowledge except the M&E system establishment has not been prioritized for reasons I cannot explain, but maybe because it is a new concept”. [KI 05]. Another
staff echoes that “Leaders are knowledgeable about M&E but lack interest in M&E. They always hire external specialists for assessments” [KI 01]. Furthermore, another key informant adds that; “I see leaders knowledgeable but I have not seen it articulated and translated into a built system” [KI 03].

Leaders at AAH-U have ample knowledge about M&E though this has not been translated into establishment of M&E system. This means that having knowledge is not enough to have the system established. There is need for interest, prioritising the activity of establishing the system and enrolling other members of the organisation towards M&E. The skilled staff seem to have focused their efforts on program coordination work but not technical M&E.

Similarly results indicate that 47.6% of the respondents agreed that M&E tools are understood by support staff while 11.3% disagreed. Findings from document review support this result because the researcher was able to see each sector having data collection tools that have been used periodically. When asked if staff know the benefit of having RBM&E system 50.1% of the respondents agreed while 15.1% disagreed that and a high 37.5% were not sure. This means that there is limited appreciation of the function of M&E in the organisation and possibly there is lack of knowledge about M&E among staff members. Concerning the question if Management and coordinators have acquired M&E knowledge, results reveal that 50.1% of the respondents agreed that while 18.8% disagreed and 31.3% were not sure. Staff members seem to have high confidence in their supervisor’s competencies. However, this knowledge as stated before is a general knowledge which may not translate into creation of an RBME system.

Meanwhile 62.6% of the respondents agreed that M&E tools and guide reflect organizational mission and vision while only 6.3% disagreed and 31.3% were not sure. Majority of the staff are aware of their mission and vision statements and appreciate that the tools used are in line with the business of the organisation. Those who were not sure could be lower operational staff that have not even read such documents.

Motivation for M&E and RBME System Establishment
This section presents the level of agreement of respondents on motivation for M&E

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5: Motivation for M&amp;E and RBME System Establishment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Management Team demands for M&amp;E Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Organization utilizes M&amp;E reports for decision making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary and allowances for M&amp;E staff encourages performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial system of the organization is linked to M&amp;E reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data
Results reveal that 67.6% of the respondents also agreed that Management Team demands for M&E Reports while 17.5% disagreed and 15% not sure. Following the removal of the M&E position, it implies that most staff have been submitting M&E reports individually to management and this signify that management demand M&E reports. Again 50% of the respondents agreed that the Organization utilizes M&E reports for decision making while 15.1% disagreed and 35% were not sure. This is in support with the earlier finding that financial inputs are linked to performance outcomes. This implies that management values evidence informed decision making and that they have confidence in the M&E reports submitted. However, this confidence is contestable since senior management confessed that accurate documentation is a challenge because of lack of a database that could link M&E reports to finance and HR departments. And the question is, how does this happen when there is no M&E specific report since no M&E position? This implies that this “M&E report” is just implied from the usual reports.

Meanwhile, about salary and allowances for M&E encouraging performance, a slight majority of respondents, 36.5% disagreed. 36.1 agreed to the question and with 27.5% not being sure, the staff seem to be unsatisfied with the general remuneration. In agreement with the above, interview results from members of management had this to say:

“Finance affects recruitment and focus to monitoring and evaluation because AAH does not have adequate funds to hire and motivate the right people. Lack of suitable budget for M&E affects establishment of RBM&E system. AAH does not have money to properly fund M&E activities” [KI 03].

Meanwhile, still in support with the earlier finding that financial inputs are linked to performance outcomes. Empirical results from the study indicates that 38.8% of the respondents agreed that financial system of the organization is linked to M&E reports while 22.6% disagreed and but also a slightly high, 38.8% were not sure. This implies that staff believe that financial decisions are motivated by performance. However, a good percentage are also not informed about how financial decisions are arrived to. Possibly they also don’t know what financial system means. However, the finance officer and the humanitarian program coordinator disagree. To them, financial input is determined by the level of need of the population.

**Correlation analysis between Leadership Champion and RBME System Establishment**

Table 5 shows the findings of the Pearson (r) correlation analysis to establish the direction of relationship between leadership and RBME system establishment.

**Table 6: Correlation**
Leadership support  Pearson Correlation  
Sig. (2-tailed)  N  
M&E Knowledge  Pearson Correlation  
Sig. (2-tailed)  N  
Motivation  Pearson Correlation  
Sig. (2-tailed)  N  
RBME system establishment  Pearson Correlation  
Sig. (2-tailed)  N  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Models</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.736a</td>
<td>.542</td>
<td>.536</td>
<td>.46400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

**Source: Primary data**

From the table above, Pearson correlation coefficients; 0.325, 0.523 and 0.359 (P< 0.03, 0.01) are lesser than 0.05. Implying that any change in leadership championship leads to a change in RBME system establishment. The negative nature means that even if AAH-U changes their leadership support, motivation and leadership knowledge in M&E, the organization may register better results for impact and become more relevant and sustainable as, is the focus of RBME system establishment.

Regression analysis to assess the impact of leadership championship on RBME system establishment

Table 7: Model summary of existence of Leadership Champions and RBME System Establishment

Model R R Square Adjusted R Square Std. Error of the Estimate
1 .736a .542 .536 .46400

a. Predictors: (Constant), Existence of leadership champions

**Source: Primary data 2016**

The model summary in table 6 above shows adjusted R² value of 0.536 between existence of leadership champions and RBME system establishment which is suggesting that the mentioned factor predicted 53.6% of the variance in RBME system establishment. The adjusted R² = 0.536 and the standard error of the estimate 0.46400 suggested that leadership support, leadership knowledge in M&E and leadership motivation were significant predictors of RBME system establishment in AAH-U.

Basing on the above adjusted R² value of 0.536 and the Pearson correlation coefficients; 0.325, 0.523 and 0.359 (P< 0.03, 0.01) being less than 0.05, the null hypothesis is accepted and reject the alternative that there is a significant linear relationship between leadership championship and RBME system establishment.
Discussion of Findings

No RBM&E system in place. What exists is characterised by a programme activity monitoring plan, a PM&E guide that is not implemented, and some basic tools to collect data from daily activities.

Leadership Championship and RBME system establishment

Findings revealed that senior management had the support of M&E function and that they had also supported budget for the same but the support dwindled, evidenced by removal of the M&E position. This followed transfer of one of the champions to Nairobi regional office. The failure to see relevance of M&E position by the management staff, coupled with poor attitudes from the donor towards funding M&E position worsened the situation further as opined in the transformational leadership theory. Bass (1985). This means that leaders and their followers do not help each other to champion their objectives to a higher level of morale and motivation to the extent of creating a significant change in organisations. (Kaupi et al. n.d.). During an interview with UNHCR staff, they said they did not see the difference made by the M&E staff hence reluctant to support budget for such a position. As of now management is reluctant in requesting and defending funds for M&E positions. Hence no M&E person to spearhead M&E work because results revealed that the available AAH-U staff have general basic M&E knowledge and each staff is focused on their respective primary departmental work. This is a huge disincentive for establishment of RBME system. Zhou et al., (2013) concurs that this kind of environment cripples efforts for RBME utilization. Busjeet, (2012) states that lack of leadership support in Bangladesh failed their efforts in monitoring and evaluation. The above revelation indicates that establishment of the system could not have suffered to the current extent if the then director who was seen to have interest in M&E had not been shifted to Nairobi office. He could have employed intellectual stimulation, inspirational motivation and individual consideration in AAH-U to encourage and motivate for RBME system establishment. (Kaupi et al. n.d.). The establishment of M&E system in humanitarian NGOs is embedded in their political economy i.e. their ability of the leaders to mobilise funding for the M&E function and the demand of M&E reports by the donors.

The senior management and sector coordinators acquired M&E knowledge and now have general knowledge but it does not suffice to guide the team to establish RBME system. Although, generally, the staff claim to understand the benefit of having a functional M&E system in place, deficiency in technical M&E knowledge for champions does not provide a good environment for establishing a results based system. According to Kusek et al., (2004) a champion has to have technical knowledge in RBME to be able to effectively lead and guide for RBME system establishment. He shares that lack of knowledge in M&E among the-would-be Romanian champions failed the establishment. Gorgens et al., (2009) also agrees that knowledgeable champions impact positively on M&E efforts but he cautions that it has to be institutionalized to avoid sabotage by malicious middle officers. This fouls AAH-U because the study revealed that that HR and finance systems are not synchronized with M&E efforts. It’s already clear that lack of leadership champions has significantly affected M&E efforts at AAH-U as seen in the previous paragraph. It can only be added that the level of M&E knowledge of the AAH-U leaders also seems to have contributed to the non-establishment of the RBME system. The push for the establishment of M&E system in the organisation does not only happen because of the existence of knowledgeable leaders in an organisation. Monitoring and evaluation is a technical field and therefore requires technical input into the design and operationalisation of the system.

Managers motivate the staff well in M&E related work. This includes delivering positive messages towards good performance and also through demand for reports although financial incentives does not offer positive motivation for M&E work. In a similar unfortunate way, findings revealed that AAH-U did not utilize the few
M&E reports produced by the short-lived office for financial and HR decision making. This is contrary to guidance from RBME authorities like Kusek and Gorgens who emphasize the importance of financial motivation. Generally, findings also revealed that a good percentage of staff are not aware in management processes and monitoring and evaluation issues, indicated by the high frequency of “Not sure” responses. This implies the level of empowerment and capacity building in those areas is weak.

Conclusions

In line with the findings of the study, the study question has been answered, that existence of leadership champions positively and significantly affects establishment of RBME system. The study therefore concludes that once AAH-U ensures that leaders are technically knowledgeable about M&E, they continue to motivate their supervisees and support M&E efforts, building an RBME system will be successful.

Recommendations

Basing on the revelation from the study, the researcher recommends the members of the senior management undergo M&E training to be able to champion RBME efforts with appreciation and guided interest based on the acquired knowledge. As stated above, as management maintains the good non-financial ways of motivation, the financial motivation should be stepped up to competitively attract and retain competent M&E staff. For this, AAH-U needs to find a different source of money since UNHCR is not yet pro M&E budget.

References


Mpirirwe, J. (2004). *Monitoring and evaluation system and service delivery at Uganda Red Cross society*.


OECD/DAC. (2002). *Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results Based Management*.


ANAP.Knox, P. C (2013) Who is in charge here. Approaches to leadership in Humanitarian operations


The Conundrum of Decentralised Public Service Delivery and the Human Rights perspective in Uganda

Julius Wabwire

Abstract

The purpose of this study is premised on Action Aid Uganda’s notion that despite concerted interventions by government, donors and civil society to improve delivery of public services in a decentralised system, there is little or no effect, instead increased poverty and public disenfranchisement with central and local governments are evident. The decentralised framework under which different players relate has changed in shape, form, perceptions and image, distorting programmatic orientations and jostations for power. A concurrent mixed approaches were used to collect data in April 2019, analysed in SPSS and content analysis. Findings indicate that central government has absolute power on decentralised service delivery, while the human rights based approached (HRBA) employed by CSOs to empower individuals in communities alienated from civil and local interests. Citizen participation in governance is a hoax and rhetorical; Ugandans remain essentially communal and subjects not citizens to government. Increased districtinisation of the country and wanton corruption in decentralised local governments is precipitating re-centralization of service delivery. Small economically and politically unviable local governments, lacking in technical and fiscal capacity are waste and a mechanism for recentralising service delivery. I commend regional devolution of power remains the viable tool of balancing the boat.

Key words: Local Government, Governance, Localism, Community Communalism, Human Rights Based Approach

Introduction

Organisations and institutions like Action Aid Uganda (AAU) are invoking and using the Human Rights Based Approach or strategy to promote social and economic development. The RBA through dichotomizing power using the demand and supply theory, to induce government responsiveness and accountability to deliver public goods and services. However, the optimal levels in demand and supply theory is attained in a perfectly competitive situation where there is free flow of information. Contrary to constitutional realities of “all power belongs to the people”; the rights based theory presumes existence of possessors and non-possessors of power in spheres of public services delivery. Those with power are assumed to have a discretionary ability to produce or cause a public good or service to be delivered, while the non-possessors of power can ably exert influence on those with power to act in their interest. Central and local government are the suppliers of public goods under a legislated mandate, while the citizens as tax payers should demand for better services. Citizens in Uganda expected their local governments to be democratic and efficient (Stoker and King, 1996) in delivering services. The constitutional (1995) and legislated (LG Act 1997) aims of local governments was for autonomous self-government, while the rhetorical purposes manifest as self-identification under the tutelage of common superior general in the names of central government.

As elsewhere, in Uganda central government refers to the offices of the President, Prime Minister, and Ministries, Departments, and Agencies (MDAs) (Meshemeza, 2019). Published and printed documents indicate that the aims for decentralisation were among other to transfer real power; take political and administrative over services; free locally elected and appointed duty bearers from central control; improve accountability of local governments (Meshemeza, 2019).

Legal Changes for Decentralisation

Supportive legislation for decentralisation began in 1987 with local government Statute, followed by the Local Governments (Resistance Council) Statute, 1993. The 1995 Constitution entrenched these laws and were later operationalised by the Local Governments Act, 1997 and eventually Local Governments Act CAP 243.
Mushemeza (2019) opines that the district is the unit of local government or sub-government, assigned with certain functions well spelt out. The local government Act CAP 243, section 3 (1) and (2) recognises sub-counties, city councils, city divisions, municipalities, municipal divisions, and town councils. According the Local Government act (1997) local governments are given measured political, fiscal, administrative, planning, legislative and judicial powers to enable service delivery functions.

**Fiscal Enactments for Decentralisation**

The Local Governments Act 1997 (Cap 243) and Uganda Constitution 1995 gave local governments autonomy to formulate and approve own budgets and budgeting started in 1994/95 with the first batch of the 13 districts receiving a vote system. Local governments are mandated to collect varied taxes and rates, fees, licenses and may also receive donations and contributions. Scholars and researchers such a Green, (2008), urge that fiscal decentralisation concentrated a lot of power at the district level to the detriment of lower sub-national governments. Once, lower local governments depended on graduated tax collections for their revenues, but which has since then been abolished; thus incapacitating their relevancy and functionality by central government (Conyers, 2007). In practice local governments are inhibited to introduce any new tax and the tax rate must be approved by the line ministry (LoG Act 1997 243).

In answering the contractual question of why are interventions not working despite what seems like everything has been done but people’s lives are not changing, the researcher had to posse two other questions in relation to decentralised service delivery. (i) What is the nature of local governments in Uganda? (ii) Do local governments have autonomy in the sense that their existence and activities have independent impacts on anything important in the districts of their location? To begin with what is important is the well-being of the citizen under the jurisdiction of local governments.

Uganda decentralised its governance system twenty two years ago when there were sixty seven districts compared to the current one hundred thirty nine districts, exponentially increasing in direct relationship with regime maturation. In 1997 districts, which are the territorial definitions of local governments were expansively resourced, transcended tribal boundaries, moderately populated and economically viable, but presently the reverse is true.

**Central- Local Government Relationship in Service Delivery**

Central government is the government that occupies the centers of constitutionally created power positions of Uganda with Local government and political party structures are strongly related to the sub national administrative structure (Ingemar Elander and Stig Montin). The distinction drawn is that the later are mainly elective while the latter are appointive positions.

**Methodology**

The study combined both qualitative and quantitative approaches (Glogowska, 2011, Zhang and Creswell, 2013) to collect and analyse narratives and experiential data (Hayes et al., 2013). A total of 806 questionnaires were administered in throughout, with an average 102 from two different sub-counties for each of the selected eight districts (Bulisa, Pakwach, Gulu, Pader, Lira, Katakwi, Kumi, Palisa and Kampala). Various documents were reviewed and many key informant interviewed who included duty bearers and officials of civil society organisations. The survey respondents and focused group discussants were the citizens. While the key informants were the LGs officials, MDA officials, and partnering CSOs staffs. The study focused on the current state of service delivery, the interaction between citizen and government on accountability, transparency and responsive
governance. The study questions were why is service delivery failing in the country and what share does local government have in the total of all governmental decision making?

**Findings**

The questionnaire response rate was 98.8% (806) were collected from the field. Mugenda and Mugenda (2009); recommends this as excellently adequate for analysis, reporting and generalization of findings.

**Table 8: Showing Districts where Primary Data was collected**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District</th>
<th>Targeted number of respondents</th>
<th>Actual respondents</th>
<th>Response rate (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kumi</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buliisa</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lira</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pader</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>94.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gulu</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakwach</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pallisa</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katakwi</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>816</strong></td>
<td><strong>806</strong></td>
<td><strong>98.8</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Primary Data*

**Background Characteristics**

Data was disaggregated according to the following characteristics like gender, age, migratory status, disability status and education as shown in table 2 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background Characteristics (n=806)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>464</td>
<td>57.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>42.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Below 35 years</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>49.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 - 59 years</td>
<td>340</td>
<td>42.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 years and above</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Migratory status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Born and living in this district</td>
<td>672</td>
<td>83.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Born elsewhere, but living in this district</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occasionally come to this district for business</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Born in another country but living in this district</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Disability status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>86.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaf</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Men constituted majority respondents 57.6%; while those below 35 and between 35-59 years formed 49.1% and 42.2% respectively. These age groups the most productive with responsibilities of providing health care, education and food, thus validating and provides credible and reliable findings. In regard to migratory status, the majority of the respondents, 83.5% are living in their districts of birth; signifying that the study participants in community setting and not just locally located. This implies that Uganda is a traditionally uninterrupted by modernity and depends on the extraction of natural resources for survival and livelihoods. Persons with disabilities averaged 13 % is significant in relation to the sustainable development goals, development agenda which seeks to leave no one behind for apparent neglect or discrimination. In respect to levels of education, 12.4% possessed no formal education while 38.6% had primary level education, indicating a persistent state of poor education delivery systems, which indicate inaccessibility, high dropout rates and failure to proceed for secondary education.

### Citizen’s Engagement with Duty Bearers

Finding reveal a significant gender difference of 5.5% where men dominate in demanding for social and economic rights; even then at 20.7% participation level of engagement is far below average, due to citizen apathetic attitude of indifference towards government. Proportionally the age range between 35 – 59 years were more actively engaged at 21.2% with duty bearers than those below 35 years at 16.7% and 60 years at 14.3%. The researcher found that the level of engagement in the rural districts is very low, ranging from 6% to 39% for varying reasons. Existence of extractives and heightened mobilisation for exploratory and exploitation activities makes Bulisa district to have the highest engagement levels at 39.2%. The clustered settlement partner, high numbers of emigrants from neighboring countries and districts contribute to high engagements by citizen.

Rural districts like Katakwi being majorly unobstructed by migration and extractives experience low levels (6%) of citizen engagement. Living in communal settings, dependence on government services is relatively unlike urban dwellers who depend more on government services. It was also revealed that migrants (22.2%) engage more with local government that natives (18.6%) who are born and living in the same district. Overall the average non participation level of citizen in government business is 81%, which raises critical questions on governance, accountability, participation and responsiveness.

Central and local governments mostly engage with the citizen through CSOs and lower sub national administrative structure of sub county, parish and village local councils system. These are the centers with diminishing decentralised fiscal, administrative and political power, in direct contact with citizens. Barazas being the commonest tool in planning and budgeting process to elicit citizen engage with local governments through CSOs to represent citizen’s view and concerns were infrequent and waning out. The voluntaristic nature of civil society organisations puts their representation in doubt, for lack of downward accountability and democratic
systems, hence lacking *locus standi* to represent citizens. This generates questions about the democratic credentials and governance styles of the CSOs themselves. An earlier study, (Larok, 2013) had called for downward accountability by CSOs to the citizens as a means of improving citizen participation and democracy. The study understood the CSO-citizen relationships to be that of benefactor-beneficiary affair, rather than agent-principal mechanics to engage in state affairs (Cornwall & Coelho, 2007). CSOs are voluntarists in practice, executing Samaritan charity to citizens not concerned with government or governance issues.

Citizens’– elected and appointed officials’ tensions and conflicts arising from Barazas have thrust CSOs into greater role of representation into modified barazas with greater assumption of locus standi. The liasonic approach affords CSOs direct engagement on citizens’ behalf with duty bearers to respond with concrete actionable plans.

**Citizen Satisfaction with Public Service Delivery**

The disaggregated gender difference of service delivery satisfaction is 4% in direct relation with 5% difference in engagement level between men and women; implying that females lack opportunities to, express their desires and issues. Demographically the most satisfied are the most active population in the age range of (35 -59 years-28.5%), while the lower and upper percentiles report less satisfaction at 25% and 25.7% respectively. The upper category tends to be largely afflicted by health concerns of old age, which services are unlikely to be available in health facilities, while the lower percentile is afflicted by high levels of youth unemployment and lack of opportunities.

Districts’ wide satisfaction with public service levels average 26.6%, ranging from 45.1% in Gulu to 12% in both Kumi and Katakwi districts. Rural – urban dynamics, developed –undeveloped administrative structures reflect in the statistics. Evidence of communitarian satisfaction is apparently low compared to migrants (localists) found to be more satisfied (36%) than natives (24.9%) retrospectively.

**Table 9: Citizen's Satisfaction Levels Public Services**

![Bar Chart Showing Citizen's Satisfaction Levels Public Services](chart.png)

**Primary Education**

Primary education is essentially affected by quality in terms of lack of qualified teachers, high pupil-teacher ratio, low books-pupil ratio, class room-pupil ratio, inadequate instructional materials, and high-pupil furniture ratio. Ministry of Education and Sports report 2016/2017 acknowledges most the challenges facing the primary education system in the country. School face numerous challenges including lack of accommodation for the
teachers, inadequate and pathetic pit latrines shared among teachers and pupils, leading to 83.7% girls to abandon learning. Automatic dropout rates, low school survival rates and failure to meet minimum number of pupils to register for by for primary leaving national exams diminish the quality of primary education.

Parental attitudes undermine access, availability, affordability and the quality of primary education in schools, deliberately disown and show indifference to the education system and detach value from learning. Empirical observation discovered over 100 school going age children loitering near a community school; whose parents blamed local government officials for negligence and poor education services at the facility; though none had ever reported or given information on the state of school. Communal assumptions relied on civil society organisations to rely their grievances to government for action. This state of powerlessness and inaction to engage duty bearers by the assumed rights holders depicts a greater citizen-government gulf in governance matters.

The demise and abolition of Parents Teachers Association (PTA) in primary schools affected the management relationships from a school owned and run by communities in which government gets involved, into schools owned by government where parents are required to get involved (Brehony, 2000). Government usurpation of the roles of planning, development, funding and management through the school management committees; which essentially rendered communal participation to very minimum levels, at the inception of universal primary education, has wide ranging ramifications for education service delivery and citizens’ participation. Declaring UPE as completely free of cost (Deininge, 2003) seem to have disempowered and disowned (Cooke & Kothari, 2001) parents of a right to indulge in a meaningful way into the affairs of theses schools.

Burkey (1993) point out that community participation was seen as a way of citizens taking responsibility for their own development, which could have led to greater effectiveness of government support. Apparently as it stands local governments, CSO, central government see community participation through planned, designed and funded for them, in some way with the community but in many others designed for them. Further interactions revealed that parental participation in running of the schools is not genuine (Oakley, 1991), since it’s majorly in rhetorical policy documents.

Health Services
Citizens’ health satisfaction stands at 40.2% due to adequate numbers and easy proximity of health facilities especially health centers two and three. An earlier finding by UBOS (UNHS 2016/17) established that the major concerns of the citizens in accessing health services at the public health facilities were; unavailability of medicines/supplies (23%), long waiting time (13%), long distance (12%), limited range of services (14%) and understaffing (10%). Complaints were cited about lack of drugs, unavailability of health workers, unethical conduct by health workers and lack of medical equipment. Gender inequality in health services requires women to purchase own health supplies like cotton wool, razor blades, polythene, gloves and meeting the entire cost of ambulance services during delivery.

In Gulu district according to Graph 3 where health services are better compared to the other districts, maternal mortality and HIV/AIDS prevalence rate were, 310:100,000 against the national average of 113:100,000; and 8.4% against the national average of 6.2% prevalence respectively. Health professionals are largely un-available during weekends, where apathetic communal timidity is high not to voice their concerns, for fear of reprisals; in situations of inelastic health services scarcity exacerbated by poverty. In addition to inadequate health staffs, health facilities persistently lack essential medical equipment’s, testing and screening kits for cervical cancer, hepatitis B and malaria. Drug short shelf life, stock outs, limited quantities were all a grave citizenry concern, where the disproportionality of medicines and drugs supplied to current population levels are critical. Delivery of health services is based on usage of static statistical data bases and inhibitive budget planning.

This study established that 76% of districts and Municipal Councils, had not accounted for drugs and health supplies amounting to UGX. 4,525,356,395 (Auditor General Report, 2017). Mismanagement or poor record keeping are blamed for the unaccounted for medicines and Health supplies. Secondly the report emphasize persistent stock-outs of the 11 sampled Tracer drugs. Noticeably, mama kits were out of stock for 320 days and coartem for 285 days eroding public confidence in the health systems. Thirdly, of 118 health facilities, 98 (83%) were highly understaffed to levels of 80% including critical positions in medicine management in major government hospitals; attributable to limited wage bill and ban on recruitments by government.

Agricultural Services

Of the three services investigated citizen’s dissatisfaction with agriculture was highest at 65% before health and education services. Accounting for this state are the poor and costly extension services, lack of training programmes and disaster unpreparedness in the face climatic change. The agricultural staffing framework at local governments has gapping quantitative and skills gaps, which include unavailability of logistics to hard-to-reach farming places; and lack of capacity to recruit, motivate, maintain and retain extension staff. Local Governments are unable to attract specialist professionals like in veterinary, entomologists, and agriculture Engineers (Auditor General Report, 2017). In some of the districts, the ratio of extension workers to the farming population is 1:1800 while the ideal ratio should be 1:500; (Auditors General Report, 2017) implying that in a district like Pakwach which requires six extension workers has a gap for 5 extension workers. Auditor General (2018), reports that, of the total established government staffing of 469,216 positions, 157,229 (34%) are vacant posts across MDAs/LGs; affecting effectiveness of service delivery and the supply of critical specialised health services like gynecologists, dentists, entomologists, soil experts and agriculturalists.

The National Agriculture advisory Services (NAADS) and Operation Wealth Creation (OWC), the central government agencies for enhancing agricultural output in the country, have exacerbated the situation through late deliveries of agricultural inputs, supply of unwanted inputs, confounded by unreliable rain falls that limit further the effectiveness of agricultural services in absence irrigation option. In respect of all the services
understudy in this paper the mechanisms of service delivery follow a reverse demand–supply model, in violation of the rights based theoretical underpinning. Distribution of planting materials and seedlings un-demanded has distorted programmatic arrangements as outcomes and impacts become hard to realise. Farmers for skepticism against adoption of new technologies, military phobia and noncompliance to best practices confound public service delivery.

**Discussion**

**Human Rights Based Paradigm in Promoting and Delivery of Public Services**

Kittay, Jennings & Wasunna, (2005) posited that “People need to be cared for and nurtured throughout their lives by other people. Who is available to do the labor of care and who gets the care they require is contingent on political and social organization. Similarly, norms surrounding both the giving and receiving of care, while dictated in part by the nature of human need, is also conditioned by cultural and ethical understandings and by economic and political circumstances. The distribution of care therefore is a question of justice and the interactions between carer, cared for, and the larger community”.

Mohan & Holland, (2001), have put up an interesting argument, how the idea of human rights paradigm came into being as a tool for opposing democracy. Hence, it is oriented towards social and economic welfarism for the vulnerable. Basing on the notion of the human rights agenda, donors and CSO are championing the rights based development as an appropriate means of improving governance and participation in Africa by putting an obligation on the state to provide a minimum level of wellbeing for their peoples (Mohan & Holland, 2001). The better way to attain an equitable and just system of care is to establish a democratic and justice public service delivery system, engaged in redistribution of social, and economic needs of the cared for society (Fraser, 1995). The challenges towards this goal lie in the conundrums found in the delivery mechanisms which negate the very principles and values of good governance.

Kittay et al’s (2005), contextualization of “care” meant ‘support and assistance to citizen who require another (duty bearer) where the one in need of care is “inevitably dependent” that is, dependent because they are too poor, illiterate, young, ill or impaired, or too frail, to manage on their own. If I frame Kittay’s perspective in the rights based framework the ‘care is the public services’, while the ‘cared for’ constitute the citizens, and the ‘carer’ represent the duty bearers the central and local governments. However, the description of the ‘carer for’ as poor, illiterate, young, ill, impaired all are portrays of conditions of powerlessness.

The perspective of care giving or delivering of services involves according to Kittay’s intimate relationship between rights holders and duty bearers born on trust. Service delivery occurs in an ideological and social context that has shaped, and shapes the experiences of both duty bearers and citizens in the responsive or unresponsive practice. Service delivery therefore, is a practice that comprises certain fundamental moral virtues and humanist aspects. Kittay et al (2005) contend that service delivery, “can be done well or badly; in a way that enriches or alienates, dignifies or humiliates” either duty bearer or the citizens. Service delivery intimately affects both elected and appointed officials and the citizens receiving services. Hence the ethics of good governance pertain to deliverers of services and citizen recipients alike, which should rest upon responsiveness, participation, accountability and constant engagements.

The human rights based approach has developed from two strands of international legal human rights framework and myriads of social, cultural and political struggles and debates (Eyben, 2003). The human rights perspective on poverty, illiteracy, ill health, hunger, disabilities as conditions of deprivation, exploitation, discrimination
and outcomes of mal administration and bad governance. Theoretically the human rights perspective, claims to remedy the conditions of powerlessness through the use of the demand-supply model to lay claiming on power for self or groups. Though in real world situations, the model does not recognise that markets are differently structured as perfectly competitive, monopolistic, oligopolistic or duopolistic conditions. It assumes a perfectly competitive power structure in a country. It can be envisaged that the human rights based approach assumes a perfectly competitive situation of free flow of information from governments; and rational choices and actions by citizens. Although empirical governance and public administration in Uganda; portray power in a monopolistic skewness towards central government and local governments, with no power for citizens to freely exercise power or participate in making decisions in the way and manner under which services are delivered. Evidently the supply side of service delivery wields monopolistic power in all interactive aspects like engagement, participation, accountability and responsiveness of governance in Uganda.

A non-engagement response rate of 81.6% out 806 with the local and central government for accountable and responsive public services significantly debase the human rights approach assumptions of a transaction power balance in the demand-supply model. Although there is minority engagement of central and local governments through Local councils meetings, personal meetings with LC1, raising of complaints and demonstrations, even that group acknowledge as one respondent noted that:

“I do not have power to talk to government officials”.

Eyben, (2003) avers that the human rights based development is about claims for services and entitlements and not to share or exercise power to enable meaningful participation and engagement. The transactional perspectives in the HRBA leaves the demand side perpetually powerless and the supply side monopolistically powerful. The consultative meetings, complaints airing, selective barazas invitations are in the human rights approach deemed participation and engagement. However, development practioners and scholars, are increasingly critical of the substantivity of citizen participation (Cooke & Kothari, 2001) and its effect on both quantity and quality of delivering public services. As findings show the citizen-government engagements are mainly through radio talk shows, barazas, and budget planning meetings, in most cases cosmetically and ritualistically designed to appease and assuage the citizen’s dissatisfaction; although duty bearers usually intend to secure public endorsement for planned activities. In such foras and in budget conferences participation is by invitation and not by expression of interest; limiting citizens’ power to engage government at will. The supply side initiates and is vantaged to determine the agenda, manage proceedings and possesses power to sieve out issues for consideration. Complaints and grievances of failed projects and inadequate services delivered, can be censored out.

According to Guijt, (1998) in Cooke and Kothari, 2001; Participation: The new tyranny?), “the broad aim of participation in development is to increase the involvement of socially and economically marginalised peoples in decision making over their own lives”. i.e. make them present and involved not present and uninvolved; as is the case with barazas in government business. Similarly the World Bank and development partners see participation as a process through which citizens can influence and share control over development initiatives, decisions and resources.

**CSO and HRBA**

In the human rights development framework, CSOs pursue an anti-poverty social-economic agenda underpinned by neo-liberal market logic (Mohan & Holland, 2001). Fundamentally the demand-supply mechanisms in the rights based development, has reduced the scope of the state to support marketization with questionable
outcomes, since the era of adjustments in the 1980’s. Human rights per se is a contested concept around which governments and CSO disagree given its fluidity in understanding. Mohan & Holland, 2001 urge that the indivisibility between political rights and economic, social and cultural rights is the likely cause for tensions and distrustful relationship between CSO engaged in anti-poverty and anti-corruption campaigns and local and central government. The HR agenda connotes important implications for democracy and sovereignty especially in African context. The human rights agenda has established a conflict of purposes and intentions regarding citizen’s power outcomes. Whereas government’s interest is in permissive publics; the CSOs want to see more assertiveness and vigilance among citizens capable of threatening the power base of the sitting government in subsequent election as the case is in Europe. In the show of power it has become habitual for government to threaten administrative de-licensing and de-registration to coerce CSO such as Action Aid and Anti-Corruption Coalition Uganda to relent on rights promotion. In the CSO’s quest for creating and maintaining a strong citizenry, they can rely on public managers to play a role in maintaining the CSO’s ability to make such contributions. But given the antagonistic relationship has shaken the spirit of CSOs to play their role with lots of precautionary and tacit approaches that front citizens on the frontline to demand for economic and social rights. They have resorted to awakening the latent citizenry power through training and education to demand for services and accountability from public administrators.

Empirically societies in Uganda are characteristically agrarian communities in villages regulated by customary laws Mamdani (1996) as cited in (Mohan and Holland, 2001). The continuum of citizenship wanes as one moves from urban areas into villages. Citizenship is felt more among the elite and urban dwellers than in illiterate and village dwellers, due to a symbiotic fiscal interdependence between the government and urban dwellers. The idea of citizenship hardly arises among the individuals in communities who prefer to take a laid back apathetic approach. Fundamental about communities and government is a high sense of not owning governmental projects and programmes. Tentatively withdrawing consent and active participation, consequently affecting the quality of service delivery and illegitimating the decisions made on their behalf (Barnes, Newman, Knops, & Sullivan, 2003).

Phenomenological observations show that communal attitudes have affected the universal primary education in terms of access, availability, affordability and quality. Data on two of the sampled districts prove that communities exhibited no sense of ownership of the education system nor attached greater value to the learning of their children. In most districts parents vehemently resist attempts to provide school lunch for their children. Contrast between citizenship and communalism displayed in Ongino and Panyimur sub counties in polar ends of the study areas. On a normal schooling day, the study team observed over 100 children not in school but loitering around in Panyimur; reasons given for non-attendance was its limited capacity to admit more learners. Indifference to own children’s plight was astounding, and blamed on local government, yet no effort to report or work on the problem had been made. Although no individual had ever taken action about the state of school to authorities. The community did not know the number of pupils in the school and had not discussed the issue of big numbers and unregistered children with relevant authorities for a solution. The youthful group of parents exhibited powerlessness of inaction to engage duty bearers on the obvious issues affecting them; instead waited on CSOs to convey communal grievances to government for action. Contrasting Panyimur and Ongino community in Kumi district, where the latter is registering improvement in service delivery on assumption of ownership of education and health programmes is indicative that some societies of individuals are communal in their localities than citizen with civil responsibilities and duties.

Local Government Nature and Autonomy
Uganda’s local government system mixes both Dillon’s and ultra vires principles. Dillon’s rule states that local governments are creatures of the state and not expected to engage in unauthorised activities (Wolman and Goldsmith, 1992), at the same time it renders such activities inconsequential and of no effect. These principles underscore the nature and power available to local governments in exercise of the administrative, fiscal and political responsibilities in their docket. Local government’s legislative and fiscal powers are greatly prescribed and proscribed by central government undercutting their elective power to administer basing on the local needs. Bye laws can only come into effect upon assent by the attorney general; and no new tax can be levied unless passed by parliament. A big percentage (95%) of the local governments’ fiscal expenditure is conditioned, while budgeting process rolls from previous expenditure items, limiting locally generated expenditure desires to 5 percent. Local government structures pre date the colonial times, that even in the era of development administration, new public management; restructuring and deregulation little effort has been made to reform them to fit the new desired functionalities.

The point am trying put forward is that local governments, despite allowing people to participate in electing political officials they essentially remain structures for purposes of the centre, under their control and wishes. Individuals and groups see no difference between central government and local governments. After elections local governments turn into tools of the centre and not vehicles for the wishes and desires of electorate. This explains the limited engagements, none participation, and apathetic response among the citizens across the board. Fundamentally decentralised power is over concentrated at district governments which are nearer to the centre and behave like the centre; controlling relatively 90% of fiscal and administrative powers (Green, 2008), which alienates the lower level local governments which are nearer to the heart and mind of electorate. Fund from central government are sent to district government, where most of the it is spent without reciprocating the decentralisation gesture down wards. Individuals can ably identify with proximal local governments than with districts governments. Effective participation can ably be done using local dialects with high resemblance to particular norms and cultures. Hence, ownership of programmes and projects remain too remote to adopt. Stoker, (2002 p160) urges that local democracy must allow people to express their diverse views and values to shape local government decisions. This dictum can be realised with a high degree of precision as you descend the lower local government levels. Implying that ownership and participation is high at LC 1 level and decreases as the levels ascend, since individuals acquire the ability to access and exercise a degree of influence over decision makers (stocker, 2002).

Local Government or Community Government

Over reliance on Dillon’s principle in local governance has de valued and vitiated the constitutionally acclaimed ‘sovereignty of the people’ under the constitutional dictum of “power belongs to the people” Constitution, 1995). What the constitution gives the constitution and local government act takes away. Resulting in the low level of engagement and participation the part of ‘citizens’ and limited accountability and non-responsiveness on the part of the both central and district governments. This gap prompted the CSO to devise RBA empowerment programmes in recognition that although power belongs to the people, the people have no power. The realisation of the fact that local democracy and participation can hardly be attained in the present form of local governments, people have resorted back to communitism. Not sufficient power has been decentralised to enable individual claims to rights, but under the circumstances communal collective claims can be possible.

In Uganda there is perfect identity with ethnic groupings than with citizenship groups usually referred to as groups for development. Communities are living a century old tradition with 81% average non participation level in government business which raises many question of localists’ claims and local governance and
democracy. Dahl in Stoker and King (2002), urges that conditions of local democracy can be achieved only when groups access resources and can influence political processes on issues they feel strongly. In Uganda’s case the reverse is true that resources are very hard to come by and politics influences groups to negate what they strongly feel about. Voices of dissent on localist’s subjugation are apparent across communities, calling for alternative local administrative forms. Preference of alternative forms of local administration with strong communal undertones which could be community rather than local governments. The agitation and return to traditional ruler ship across the country are not isolated incidents, but empirical expressions of dissatisfaction and a vote of no confidence in localist democracy. These traditional rulers represent a communal voices, and are taking over service delivery to prove their worth.

Run away Decentralised Corruption and Re-Centralising Service Delivery

Hardly can scholars and researchers on decentralisation and local governments complete their writing without castigating embezzlements of funds, malpractices, maladministration and nepotism. The level of corruption in local governments has become more sophisticated, syndicated and daring to the level of establishing parallel administrative systems for purposes of facilitating graft. Perception of corruption manifests in diverse forms, including but not limited to— bribery, embezzlement, nepotism, influence peddling, fraud, forgery, causing financial or property loss, corruptly procuring tenders, diversion of public resources, conflict of interest, illicit enrichment, false accounting, false assumption of authority and political patronage. In various Auditor Generals’, (2018) reports unearthed corruption in MDAs and statutory Authorities in form of overriding financial controls like, mischarge of expenditures (Shs 369.8 bn), unaccounted for expenditure (Shs 21.7 bn), wasteful expenditure (Shs 66.9 bn) and expenditure on undisclosed domestic arrears( Shs 377.1 bn).

Corruption has changed from a mere event (spot embezzlement of funds) into a process practice conceptualized well in advance, planned at budgeting, spans more than one Ministry, department or agency, draws in a good number of career public officials and executed with excessive impunity. The study established that as corruption intensifies, the centre is re-centralizing the delivery of services in the districts. Substantial number of projects worth over Ugx 2.2 trillion are centralised at the center, managed by the mother ministries while implementation is done in the districts. Corruption has become a systemic phenomenon aligned to political and ethnic groups which seize control of the political and administrative powers at the districts. The over 18 member Inter Agency Forum; which constitute IG, OAG, DEI, Office of the president, DPP, IOC, URA, CID, FIA and various commissions are themselves a disservice to the anti- corruption campaign. It is widely believed that, it may not be true that Uganda lacks value systems or ethical standards but rather the ‘god fathering of the corrupt’ and clumsy rhetoric in support of the vice.

The Districtisation Phenomena

For over three decades of the NRM rule, the country has moved from having 32 districts to over 137 districts. Scholars and practitioners urge that sub dividing large entities in the framework of decentralisation, central and local governments increase their response to the needs of the poor, and thus are more likely to conceive and implement pro-poor policies (Crook, 2003). Green, (2010) observed that creation of new districts has provided a platform for political patronage rather than increasing service delivery. Several other governments in African (Nigeria, Sudan, Burkina Faso, Malawi, DRC) have used the creation of sub national units for incumbent presidents to soar their re-election chances as in Uganda. In all respects of administrative capacities, district governments are dependent on the centre, economically unviable and unable to plan for their communities, incapable of mobilising local resources for social and economic growth. Mushemeza, (2019) has observed that
as districts increase, correspondingly sub county local governments and town councils’ roles reduce in importance coupled with dismal funding from the center. With more divisions to create sub national districts, the capacity to delivery services wanes, and gets pushed to the center since they depend on center for both financial and human resources to survive. Certain local government functions get extinct or abandoned (Mushemeza, 2019) like extension services, internal audit and specialist services like entomology etc.

**Conclusion**

Public service delivery in Uganda is occurring in an ideological and social context shaping experiences of both duty bearers and rights holders in the responsive and non –responsive terms. This has negatively affected both elected and appointed officials and the citizens receiving services. There is animosity between CSOs and governments in the practice of HRBA. The indivisibility between political rights and economic, social and cultural rights is causing tensions and distrustful relationship between CSO engaged in anti-poverty and anti-corruption campaigns and local and central government.

Different development practitioners are touting the rights based approach as tool to democratize governance and enhancement of local democracy in Uganda. In consonance with marketinising philanthropic activities, the demand–supply theory underpins the dichotomous power relations between duty bearers and rights holders. The empirical structure of power in the rights based model, evidence a definitive power hold by duty bearers or center and local government to deliver public services. Although the RBA encourages participation through citizens interfacing with governments, the study found this to be far below average. Participation in budget conferences is by invitation and not by expression of interest; so citizens’ power to engage government are curtailed in as far as government is vantaged in determining the agenda, proceedings and ability to sieve issues for consideration. The practice of the human rights development’s claim to remedy the conditions of powerlessness has proved otherwise. HRBA leaves the demand side perpetually powerless and the supply side monopolistically powerful.

After introduction of UPE government took over the functions of planning, development, funding and management through management committees; rendering community participation to dismal levels, affecting UPE performance and satisfaction. Free education disempowered and disowned (Cooke & Kothari, 2001) parents of a right to influence the education affairs in UPE schools, as he who pays the piper calls the tune. Nationally health service deliveries is based static statistical data bases and inhibitive budgeting, and suffers from multiple systemic mal-functions. Of the three services investigated citizen’s dissatisfaction with agriculture was highest at 65% before health and education services. Accounting for this state are the poor and costly extension services, lack of training programmes and disaster unpreparedness in the face climatic change.

Ugandan societies are maintain their agrarian communal character in villages regulated by customary laws. The sense of citizenship is felt more among the urban elite due to a symbiotic fiscal interdependence, than among the illiterate and village dwellers. Hardly do individuals in communities feel like citizens, which informs their laid back apathetic approach service delivery. This leads to non ownment government projects and programmes. Local government’s legislative and fiscal powers are greatly prescribed and proscribed by central government undercutting their elective power to administer basing on the local needs. In all respects of administrative capacities, district governments are dependent on the centre, economically unviable and unable to plan for their communities, incapable of mobilising local resources for social and economic growth.

**References**

Auditor Generals, (2017); annual report of the auditor general on the results of audits for the year 2017
Auditor Generals, (2018); report of the auditor general to parliament for the financial year ended 30th June 2018
PART D: E-GOVERNANCE

Factors Influencing the Coherent Digitization of Government Processes across all Policy Areas and Levels of Government to Enhance an Efficient Public Service Delivery in Kenya

Jim Gitonga Kauma & Willy Nyaga Ireri
County Assembly of Embu, Kenya
Corresponding E-Mail: jimkauma@gmail.com / nyagawillie@gmail.com

Abstract
The Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) target 17.14 urges all countries to enhance Policy Coherence for Sustainable Development (PCSD) as an integral part of the implementation of a coherent digital strategy. The PCSD implementation framework module 2 offers a guidance for strengthening the existing coherence mechanisms by recognizing the need to break out institutional and policy incoherence and realize the benefits of synergetic actions. This research proposes the adoption of a coherent e-government system to integrate strategic choices on digital technology investment across all policy areas. The system aims at eliminating the duplication and overlapping of government processes across all the government departments hence subsequently reducing government wastage. Additionally, the research presents an analysis of effective case studies of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries which have successfully implemented coherent e-government systems in the public sector. The study will benefit the government of Kenya and other countries globally in appreciating the factors influencing coherent digitization of government processes, ensuring efficient service delivery and reduction of government wastage. The research design will be descriptive in nature focusing on the national government of Kenya. Moreover, a stratified sampling technique will be used where respondents will be chosen from the national government, the ministries and departments involved and the active citizenry of Kenya. Further survey will be done in selected OECD countries to act as a benchmark for the digital strategy application and operation. Survey questionnaires will be administered to the sampled respondents through the drop-and-pick method. The data collected during the research will be analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). Furthermore, the analyzed results will be presented in tables and bar graphs. Policy coherence facilitates a constructive dialogue between all government policy makers and key stakeholders to enhance co-operation among interacting policy domains vital for the achievement of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

Key Words: Sustainable Development, Policy Coherence, Synergetic, E-government, Co-operation, Stakeholders

Introduction
The chapter will be an indication of what the study is aiming to achieve in the long run. It will provide the background of the study and the statement of the problem. Additionally, research objectives will be clearly stated to enable better understanding of the importance of carrying out the study. The study’s significance, scope and limitations will be adequately provided and discussed.

Background of the Study
Kenya, a member of the United Nations, has adopted the Agenda 2030 which is in line with vision 2030-the Kenyan economic blueprint. The vision consists of three pillars: The Economic pillar aimed at ensuring a 10% economic growth by 2030, the social pillar seeking to build a cohesive society and the Political pillar aimed at realizing a democratic political system for Kenya. One of the key enablers that will help in the realization of all the flagship projects under vision 2030 is the Information and Communications Technology (ICT). The commencement of the SDGs implementation found it necessary to align sustainable development goals with the vision 2030 economic development goals. Consequently, the Kenyan government constituted the first and second Medium Term Plans (2008-2012, and 2013-2017 respectively) which mapped the 17 SDGs with vision 2030 (Ministry of Devolution and Planning, 2017, p. 12). However, the report cited challenges that the Kenya
is likely to face during her implementation of sustainable development goals. They include; inadequate co-
ordination between the national and county governments, high political turnovers and poor engagement and

As at 2016, the fixed internet broadband subscription per 100 inhabitants stood at 69.4% while the proportion
of all individuals subscribed to internet stood at 86.7%. In order to increase these statistics, the Kenyan
government has strengthened the Kenya National Bureau of Statistics by establishing offices in each of the 47
counties to co-ordinate statistical capacity building at the county level. In 2014, the Kenyan government is rolled
out National Integrated Monitoring and Evaluation Systems (NIMES) and the County Integrated Monitoring
and Evaluation System (CIMES) for fast-tracking the coherent digital strategy implementation at the national
and sub-national levels respectively. Furthermore, the report proposes the mainstreaming of SDGs into the MTP
III (2018-2022), County Integrated Development Plans and the national development agenda. Additionally, it
proposes a capacity assessment accompanied by the preparation of an engagement framework both at the

Kenyan government has taken a major step towards the achievement of a digital public sector by adopting
Huduma Centers, a one stop shop for all public services, and the implementation of the Integrated Financial
Management Information System(IFMIS), an automated public financial system launched in 2003 (ICPAK,
2017). The introduction of these digital platforms has increased the efficiency of service delivery, public
accountability, transparency and strengthened internal government control units. According to Hassan, et al.,
2017, for a successful delivery of services by the Huduma centers is pegged on the ability of various government
computing systems to interact seamlessly across all the line ministries. As such, there is need for all
heterogeneous computing systems to share information and integrate all processes to implement a homogenous
digital strategy. Additionally, for the government to implement a coherent digital strategy for the both the
national and county governments, a collaborative network-based governance framework should be created. This
strategy should consist of a common technology infrastructure with a central policy management framework to
foster a coherent e-government (Maweu & Karani, 2016).

In 2014 Denmark launched “A Shared Agenda –Denmark’s Action Plan for Policy Coherence for
Development”. The Danish Government highlighted on 3 strategic development agendas: Trade and Finance,
Food security and Climate Change, Peace and Security. The Danish action plan was aided by coherent
government systems. There is inter-ministerial Committee composed of all the relevant ministries. This co-
ordination is aimed at fostering coherence on all the earmarked policy areas. Likewise, in 2012 Finland adopted
a new development policy program which supported greater coherence as well as provision of quality and
efficient public services. The Finnish government prioritized on five areas: food security, trade, migration,
security and taxation. The involved line ministries worked in tandem to achieve optimal digital coherence. The
ministry of Foreign affairs is tasked with the co-ordination of the ministries at a focal point. Consequently, the
country has achieved tremendous improvements on food security and taxation (OECD, 2015). Similarly, the
Kenyan government has prioritized on four key pillars: Manufacturing, food and nutritional security, affordable
housing and universal health that will act as a catalyst to economic growth and development by 2022. This
agenda can be achieved faster if a coherent digital strategy is fully implemented (Ministry of Public Service,
Youth and Gender Affairs, 2017).
Policy Coherence for Sustainable Development

The adoption of 2030 Agenda and Addis Ababa Action Agenda initiated a commitment from all UN members to implement Policy Coherence for Sustainable Development (PCSD) at all government levels and actors. The commitment on the policy is contained in The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) target 17.14. Enhancing policy coherence is a persistent challenge of effective public sector governance. Member countries of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) have taken a lead in implementing the policy coherence through setting up institutional mechanisms and processes to integrate and manage all competing development policy objectives and policies. These mechanisms also referred to as the ‘PSD building blocks’ include: commitment to multi-sectorial engagement, policy coherence co-ordination in the governance framework and enhancement of systems for monitoring, analysis and reporting (OECD, 2017). These mechanisms form a structural basis of harmonizing domestic and foreign policies without undermining the country’s development agendas (OECD, 2018). The 2012 OECD recommendations strategy on Development identified three on two key challenges namely: food security, green growth and illicit financial flows faced when implementing coherent policies within the government. Moreover, the report called for an analysis of costs of incoherence of public service and benefits of adopting coherent policies in order to deduce the impact of incorporating integrated policy approaches to the government (OECD, 2016). According to the report, ensuring sustainable food security calls for a coherent approach among all stakeholders across all levels of government. This effort is aimed at promoting cross-sectorial synergies hence eliminating the silos that separate policy sectors. Another challenge identified by the report is Illicit Financial Flows (IFF) which is a significant hindrance to sustainable development. The IFF stems from corruption, crime and tax evasion with money lost each fiscal year exceeding the Official Development Assistance (ODA). These illicit flows exhaust resources meant for public service delivery. The cross-cutting natures of the IFFs necessitates the application of development policies in a coherent and cost effective way. According to the OECD data and indicators, there is a need for governments to adopt a coherence monitor to track progress of the SDG 17.14 based on specified national priorities and interests. As such, countries should enhance policy coherence further by harmonizing their national strategies with the 2030 Agenda through the application of integrated policy approaches (OECD, 2016). Additionally, a review of nineteen OECD countries indicates that this coherent alignment can be achieved by conducting multi-sectorial policy co-ordination, setting up coherent institutional frameworks and instituting strategic monitoring and reporting mechanisms for the diverse elements of coherence for sustainable development (OECD, 2018). According to the 2017 Voluntary National Reviews synthesis report, policy coherence and multi-sectorial coordination still presents a major challenge in achieving progress on the implementation of the SDGs to majority of countries (DSD, DESA &UN, 2018).

Statement of the Problem

This project seeks to reduce the government wastages and eliminate service delivery inefficiencies brought about by incoherent government structures and processes. These incoherencies are caused by inadequate multi-stakeholder engagement, limitations in the coherent digitization of government processes and shortcomings in the co-ordination governance frameworks. The ICPAK report on the progress IFMIS articulated various challenges that should be addressed to increase the system’s efficiency. Moreover, the Ministry of devolution and Planning proposes the mainstreaming of SDGs into the MTP III (2018-2022), County Integrated Development Plans and the 2030 Development Agenda. Additionally, it proposes a capacity assessment accompanied by the preparation of an engagement framework both at the national and county levels (Ministry of Devolution and Planning, 2017, p. 49). Firstly, there’s a need for a multi-stakeholder engagement to formulate a common legal framework for the implementation of the coherent digital policy. Secondly, there should be an
establishment of coherent administrative and organizational structures with a common vision hence reducing
government wastage as a result of overlapping and duplication of roles responsibilities. Thirdly, ICPAK
proposes a coherent digital strategy to enable resource sharing, interoperability within the public sector and
hence eliminating all the redundant administration strategies (ICPAK, 2017).

An independent assessment of the voluntary national review reports submitted to the United Nations High-level
Political Forum on Sustainable Development in 2017, only 11 countries included Policy coherence for
sustainable development in their 2017 VNR report. Further, the report asserts that, countries should assess
domestic and global dimensions of sustainable development in a goal-by-goal analysis with the aim of
supporting policy coherence for sustainable development (CCIC, 2018). The Kenyan Voluntary National Review
submitted to the United Nations High-level Political Forum (HLPF) 2017 indicates that policy coherence for
sustainable development has not yet been fully discussed. However, the report notes that Kenya will take an
integrated approach to ensure local-national linkages are coherently implemented (Ministry of Devolution and
Planning, 2017, pp. 46-47) Therefore, it is evident that there is a gap between the need for digital coherence and
the capacity to attain it in Kenya. As such, this paper proposes a coherent e-government framework that promotes
policy coherence in the public sector to increase efficiency of public service delivery and reduce the government
wastages.

Objectives of the Study

The General Objective

The general objective of the study is to evaluate the coherent digitization of government processes across all
policy areas and levels of government to enhance efficient public service delivery in Kenya.

Specific Objectives

a) To examine the impact of coherent engagement of relevant stakeholders across all government
   levels of government on the efficiency of public service delivery.

b) To determine the effect of effective organization and governance frameworks to implement coherent
digitization on the efficiency of public service delivery.

c) To determine the impact of the existing monitoring, analysis and reporting systems on the efficiency
   of public service delivery.

Research Questions

a) What is the effect of coherent engagement of relevant stakeholders across all government levels of
government on the efficiency of public service delivery?

b) What is impact of effective organization and governance frameworks of implementing coherent
digitization on the efficiency of public service delivery?

c) What is the impact of the existing monitoring, analysis and reporting systems on the efficiency of public
service delivery?

Significance of the Study

The findings of the research will be a basis upon which the government, future researchers and investors will
use in decision making;
The Government: The research findings may be used by the government to establish coherent governance policies and frameworks to implement the digital strategy across all the policy areas across all the government levels. This proposal forms a structural framework for implementing of a coherent digital policy within and across the public sector.

Future Researchers: The study is expected to be of great importance to the researchers since the researchers will be able to use this research’s findings as a reference on future research as well as a source of literature review to their studies. The results may also prompt further research work, to expand understanding of the research topic.

Investors: The study will greatly assist the potential investors in planning on the issues of the performance standards as the potential investors will be made aware of the impacts of strategic communication, whereby the awareness will be given on both sides, which is, the negative impact and the positive side of it. This will assist to create a good understanding of how to keep a coherent digital strategy across all the government departments.

Scope of the Study

The study will focus on the effect of coherent use of digital technologies across all policy areas and levels of the government of Kenya. The study will be conducted in the various government ministries and the 47 county governments. The study will focus on both the management and the operational staff.

Conceptual Framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent Variables</th>
<th>Dependent Variables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multi-Stakeholder Engagement</td>
<td>• Efficient Public Service Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficient Organization of Governance Frameworks</td>
<td>• Reduction of Government Wastage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring, Analysis and Reporting System</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Coherent Digitization

Implementation of a coherent use of ICT across all policy areas entails aligning broad national objectives with realistic outcomes. This implementation should be guided by a common vision statement with a unit responsible for coordinating the digital strategy across all users of the public services. All the relevant stakeholders (citizens, businesses, sector ministries and agencies, NGOs and private sector players) should be comprehensively engaged when preparing the digital government strategy. Consequently, the overarching vision should form a guide for integrating the digital government agenda with the overall public reform agendas and other relevant sector strategies. To achieve coherence, governments have established central government co-ordination units equipped with policies and mechanisms of aligning strategic development choices across all government levels. This coherent approach eliminates silos in the national policy integration and data management both at the
national and county levels (OECD, 2017, pp. 94-98). According to the (UNDAF Kenya, 2018, p. 17) coherent support is crucial for the alignment of MTP III, Big 4 Agenda, Agenda 2063 and the SDGs. This can be achieved by enhancing vertical coherence and encouraging multi-departmental co-operation approaches. Table 1.0 outlines the Comparison of Strategic of E-Government Development of the Nordic Nations based on different attributes (Joseph & Avdic, 2016).

**Multi-Stakeholder Engagement**

The 2030 Agenda Emphasizes that all countries the plan should be implemented by all countries and stakeholders, acting in collaborative partnership. This requires mechanisms for dialogues and engagement whereby key stakeholders in government identify challenges, set priorities, align policies and actions and mobilize resources for sustainable development (OECD, 2018, pp. 98-99).

The OECD report of 2014 outlines the Finnish government’s systematic and participatory stakeholder engagement. Finland consults a wide range of stakeholders; research institutions, scientific panel, active citizenry and active civil society. In addition, there is an annual reporting of the progress of 2030 Agenda implementation to the parliament. In order to ensure a coherent implementation of SDGs, Finland developed a follow up and review system anchored in the eight objective agenda of its strategic framework (IISD, 2017).

According to the Voluntary National Reviews (VNR) from 45 countries that submitted to the United Nations High-level Political Forum (HLPF) 2017 there is a need to have a multi-sectorial engagement strategy. According to the report, six countries did not indicate whether non-state actors were consulted, three countries-Argentina, Denmark and Honduras limited their consultations to state actors only while thirty-one countries engaged non-state actors through use of online and offline forms. Nine countries among then Kenya, reported that they faced the challenge of lack of multi-sectorial participation. The Kenyan Voluntary National Review asserted that non-state actors were consulted during the process of identifying national priorities for SDGs. The report further affirms that there was a pressing need to initiate a multi-stakeholder platform in the implementation of policy coherence to avoid duplication of policy efforts occurring across the involved stakeholders (CCIC, 2018, pp. 27-29).

**Efficient Organization of Governance Frameworks**

The strategic and coherent use of new technologies within the government is determined by the governance and co-ordination of organizational frameworks put in place by that government. Effective e-government frameworks require clear and articulated roles and responsibilities in the development, implementation, co-ordination and oversight of coherent digital government policies. According to the recommendations of the OECD council on digital government strategies in 2014, a coherent e-government framework should establish a single unit or department that with a clearly stipulated mandate of steering and coordinating the government’s ICT policy. As a result, the centralized unit should manage information systems, digital services and enable user-driven digital approaches to digital government (OECD, 2014). A comprehensive assessment of government ministries and departments entails identifying and eliminating all overlapping processes and duplicated functions. This elimination reduces government wastages and optimizes the digital strategy by determining the optimal staffing levels, carrying out job evaluations and introducing of a new government appraisal system for the coherent digital policy (OECD, 2014).

A commanding 92.5 % of OECD countries has established single government units for the co-ordination of the e-government strategies (see table 1.0). These units ensure there is a coherent articulation across all policy
sectors, champions the technical interoperability of policies and frameworks within the public sector. The coordination mechanisms should be regularly reviewed based on the dynamic technological environments and trends to ensure that the coherence policy is attuned to the changing global digital government strategies (OECD, 2017). Denmark, a member of the OECD and a beneficiary of coherent e-government strategy, has demonstrated that these principles of a coherent framework can be applied optimally to promote coherence of structures and processes in the public sector. The ‘Danish Digital Strategy 2016-2020’ has promoted constant collaboration of central, regional and local governments by setting up ambitious goals for a continued digitally coherent public sector. The Danish public sector has worked coherently for several years bound by a common management of digital solutions. The digital and automated processes have increased the confidence of the citizens in the public sector (SCDA, 2017).

In the same light, policy coherence in the Netherlands is implemented by the council of ministers through initiated laws and policies that take into account the inter-sectorial development goals. Additionally, the Dutch government has given the ministries of Economic Affairs and Climate Policy and of Foreign Trade and Development Co-operation cross-cutting mandates to accelerate policy coherence. The ministries are further tasked with the SDG implementation in accordance with the existing responsibilities. However, this approach requires co-ordination and thorough policy proposal assessments in order to avoid conflicts and overlapping of responsibilities (OECD, 2014).

**Efficient Monitoring, Analysis and Reporting System**

According to the 2017 UNDP report on institutional and coordination mechanisms, the National Monitoring System should consist of the National Statistics Office (NSO) and Local Government Units (LGUs) whose function is to collect, process and ensure a joint dissemination of official statistics. An effective national monitoring system should provide adequate statistical legislations and ensure data consistency and reliability of data. Further, it should coordinate the overall data collection and analysis in response to development policies and strategies. The report further asserts that there is lack of communication and coordination among nation data producers and within the National Statistical Systems (NSS). It also recommends that countries should adopt a periodic monitoring system to enhance regular reporting and tracking of policy implementation over time (UNDP, 2017, pp. 21-25).

The Finnish Government Implementation Plan foresees that reporting on SDG implementation will lay emphasis on identifying groups, both from within and outside their boarders that are at risk of falling short or behind in their sustainable development. In addition, the German Sustainable Development Strategy includes transboundary consequences of national policies in their national targets and 30 indicators. On the other hand, Netherlands’s annual report on policy coherence for development monitors progress in eight themes set in their PCD Action Plan presented to parliament in 2016. The 2017 report highlights in details the trade-off and synergies of three of these themes (Access to medicines, tax avoidance and remittance costs) and illustrates how the Dutch government pursues a concerted effort on the said three themes (OECD, 2018, pp. 100-101).

According to the Kenyan Voluntary National Review submitted to the HLPF 2017, there are 128 indicators put in place to monitor the Kenyan progress on SDGs. However, it is unclear as to whether the report refers to national or global indicators. Moreover, the review indicates that all the sustainable development goals will be tracked at both the national and sub-national levels through a result-based monitoring framework and evaluation of development policies and programmes outlined in the Second Medium Term Plan. Besides, the SDG
indicators will be integrated into regular national surveys (CCIC, 2018, p. 29). Table 1.1 outlines the challenges and opportunities in working with both government and non-government actors.

Research Gap

The Kenyan public service transformation framework aims at transforming the public service into an efficient and effective service delivery organization. In addition, the framework provides guidance for all government agencies both at the national and the county levels in implementing the public sector digital strategy (KIPPRA 2018). Under pillar two, three and four, the framework advocates for committed political leadership, dynamic and inclusive organizational framework and enhancing an efficient public service delivery based on citizen-centricity (Ministry of Public Service, Youth and Gender Affairs, 2017). In the same light, the Jubilee Government has prioritized on four sectors, the ‘Big Four’ to guide in the development agenda in the period of 2018-2022. The prioritized sectors include affordable and decent housing, food and nutritional security, manufacturing and affordable healthcare all aimed at achieving the vision 2030 economic development blueprint. In order to achieve this development agenda, it is important that the government adopts a coherent digital strategy. Various studies carried out in Kenya has pointed out the lack of coherence in the public sector as the leading challenge of e-government implementation in Kenya (ICPAK, 2017). Further literature review of the OECD region reveals how a coherent digital framework has increased the efficiency of public service delivery in the chosen countries. It is for this reason that the study will be carried out to fill the gaps of coherent digitization in Kenya.

Research Methodology

Research Design

This research shall adopt a mixed methodology by use of descriptive survey design to investigate the effect of duration of working hours on the performance of the employees. To enable triangulation, both quantitative and qualitative approaches will be applied. To collect quantitative data, a sample survey will be conducted and will cover a representative sample of targeted population adopting a stratified cluster random sampling technique. For qualitative data, rapid assessments will be employed which will include Key Informant Interviews (KII), Group Interviews, Focus Group Discussions (FGD), Direct Observation where applicable. According to Gentles, et al., 2015, descriptive design is a description of state of affairs, as it exists. Additionally, descriptive studies are not only restricted to fact findings but may often result in the formation of important principles of knowledge and a solution to a significant problem. According to Noble & Smith 2015, descriptive research design is a method of collecting information by interviewing or administering a questionnaire to a sample of individuals. Descriptive research information shall be clearly defined information and its conclusive findings will be given. It shall also determine the frequency with which the variables will be conveyed (GDE, 2018).

Target Population

Noble and Smith (2015) articulate that population is a group of individuals, objects or items from which samples are taken for measurement or it is an entire group of persons, or elements that is common. The researchers will target top management, middle management and lower level employees in 21 ministries in the national government and 47 county government ministries. The following sections of the selected ministries will be picked: top level management, middle level management and the support staff. The target population will be top level management, middle level management and the support staff employees of the selected ministries in both national and county governments in Kenya.
Table 1: Target Population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Ministry</th>
<th>County</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Government</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Ministry</td>
<td>County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County Government</td>
<td>47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>68</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sample Design and Procedure

Multi-stage Stratified random sampling design will be used to select participants whereby participant will be stratified on the basis of national ministries. Within the ministry, simple random sampling will be used to select 20% of participants. On the same note, participant will be stratified on the basis of counties whereby 20 percent of the counties will be randomly selected and further randomly selecting 20% of the already selected county ministries employees. (The Gentles, et al. (2015) points out that it involves dividing your population into homogenous sub groups and then taking a simple random sample in each sub group. This method will be appropriate because it will be able to represent not only the overall population but also the key sub groups in the population. The sampling design will be best suited since it minimizes bias. The general procedure for taking a stratified random sample will be to stratify population, defining a number of separate partitions using sample size, and then combining the results to obtain the stratified random sample (GDE, 2018). Therefore, the sample will be drawn from each stratum from which respondents will be selected from at least 80% of the target population under each category.

Table 2: Multi Stage Sampling Frame

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>1st Stage Sampling-stratified</th>
<th>2nd Stage Sampling - 20%</th>
<th>3rd Stage Sampling-20% Simple random</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Government</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Ministry</td>
<td>4 Ministries</td>
<td>Top level employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Middle level employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower level employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County Government</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>County</td>
<td>9 Counties’ X 4 Ministries= 36</td>
<td>Top level employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Middle level employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower level employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>40</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Convenience sampling (also known as Haphazard Sampling or Accidental Sampling) will be used to select various key stakeholders who will participate in this study. Convenience sampling is a type of nonprobability or nonrandom sampling where members of the target population that meet certain practical criteria, such as easy accessibility, geographical proximity, availability at a given time, or the willingness to participate are included for the purpose of the study (Dörnyei, 2007).

According to Mugenda and Mugenda, (2003) a sample size of between 10% and 30 % is a good representation of the total population therefore a total of 40 ministries (both 4 national and 36 county) will form the sample of the population. Therefore, respondents will be selected randomly representing Top level, Middle level, and Lower level employees from sample of 40 ministries and will be utilized in this study as showed in table 3.2.
Data Collection Techniques

On the process of data collection, primary data as well as secondary data will be best suited. The primary sources of data collection methods shall be used in the study include use of questionnaires that will be used to source for crucial information from departmental heads across all levels of government. In addition, the researcher will pre state the questionnaire before the actual data collection will be carried out. The questionnaires will be made up of several questions which will be prepared by the researcher. They will be sent to the respondents to seek for detailed information from them whereby later the data will be tabulated and subjected to a statistical manipulation under the study (Gentles, et al., 2015). Semi structured questionnaires will also be used by the researcher since the researcher finds it easy to compute and also it allows the respondents to give out clearly their opinions about the research (problem under study). For qualitative data, rapid assessment will be conducted which will include Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), and Key Informants Information (KII).

Data Validity and Reliability

Mugenda and Mugenda (2003) asserted that, the accuracy of data to be collected largely depend on the data collection instruments in terms of validity and reliability. Validity is the degree to which result obtained from the analysis of the data actually represents the phenomenon under study. Validity will be ensured by having objective questions included in the questionnaire. This will be achieved by pre-testing the instrument used to identify and change any ambiguous, awkward, or offensive questions and technique. Reliability on the other hand refers to a measure of the degree to which research instruments yield consistent results (Mugenda & Mugenda, 2003). In this study, reliability will be ensured by pre-testing the questionnaire with a selected sample. To test the internal consistency of the instruments, the study used Cronbach’s Alpha, which ranges between 0 and 1. Thus the closer the value of Alpha to 1, the more reliable the results would be and the more it nears 0, the more unreliable the instrument or tool. The recommended value of 0.7 will be used as a cut-off of reliability.

Data Analysis

The questionnaire schedules will be check adequately for reliability and clarification. Additionally, the data collected will be analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). Moreover, descriptive methods will be employed by researcher and data will be preserved in the form of frequency distribution tables which will facilitate description and explanation of the study findings. Finally, the researcher shall present the findings by use of graphs and tables together with detailed interpretation of the data will be outlined below the tables and charts used. Qualitative data will be analyzed using content analysis and findings presented according to the research objectives thematically.

Bibliography


# Annex A. Policy levers of digital government co-ordinating units in the OECD

### Responsibilities of function/unit leading and co-ordinating digital government or e-government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Advising strategy development</th>
<th>Monitoring strategy implementation</th>
<th>Prioritisation of ICT projects across the government</th>
<th>Reviewing ICT projects across the government as needed</th>
<th>Mandating external reviews of ICT projects across the government</th>
<th>Approve - or stop - ICT projects across the government as needed</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD25</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: OECD.org*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Sweden</th>
<th>Denmark</th>
<th>Norway</th>
<th>Finland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Main Actors: Regional And Local Levels</td>
<td>County councils and municipalities.</td>
<td>Strategic Committee for joint government cooperation; Local authorities.</td>
<td>Regional and local authorities.</td>
<td>Regional councils and Advisory Committee on Information Management in Public Administration (JUHTA).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Government information portals for citizens and single point portal for businesses. Secure information exchange network between government agencies and EU bodies through an IP-based network.</td>
<td>Single Internet entry point for citizens with self-service and mobile platforms. E-service channel for businesses. Also, online trading portal and educational materials website with special design for digital illiterates.</td>
<td>One-stop service portal to citizens with secured interaction point, Point of single contact for businesses, standardization portal, and portal for geo-spatial infrastructure.</td>
<td>Citizen service portal with single access point for e-Services, enterprise services portal, geo-data portal.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 1.1: Challenges and Opportunities in Working with Government Actors and Non-Government Actors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actor</th>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Head of State’s Office | Has numerous priorities to deal with May face conflicting interests | • Turn this actor into an SDG champion  
• Have it take a leading role in coordinating the implementation of the SDGs |
| Parliament | • Often not involved in all stages of national development planning  
• May have limited awareness of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development  
• May face conflicting interests | • Leverage its legislative role  
• Foster its advocacy role, especially for budgeting |
| Judicial System | • May have limited awareness of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development  
• Enforcement of laws may be lacking  
• May face conflicting interests | • Develop synergies with laws related to good governance (e.g., corruption, tax evasion, illegal trade) as well as those necessary for the achievement of the SDGs |
| Finance and planning bodies | • Linkages with sector ministries and subnational bodies may be weak  
• Addressing all three dimensions of sustainable development may not be seen as a priority for economic development and poverty reduction | • Turn these bodies into SDG champions  
• Have them play a key role in coordinating implementation of the SDGs  
• Develop synergies with revenue collection measures (e.g., fight corruption, tax evasion) |
| Sector Ministries and Subnational Bodies | • May have weak capacities  
• Lack of funding of subnational bodies can impede implementation of the SDGs  
• Some sector ministries are not well connected to development planning | • Support them in fulfilling their roles in development planning  
• Encourage them to integrate sustainable development objectives into plans/budgets |
| National Statistics Office | • Data collection and management often weak  
• Data not generally captured by regular surveys  
• Capacity to produce policy-relevant information may be weak | • Increase investments in data and national statistical systems  
• Build statistical capacity to monitor the SDGs, including capacity to collect, manage and analyze data on a regular basis |
| Civil Society Organizations | • Capacities may be weak, especially with respect to engagement in national development planning  
• Often not involved in all stages of development planning | • Engage them as SDG Champions  
• Involve them in all stages of development planning  
• Encourage them in their watchdog role (i.e., in promoting transparency and accountability)  
• Foster their role in information collection, information-sharing and awareness-raising (from policymakers to local communities) |
| **Business and Industry** | • Mitigate the effect of their activities that have a negative impact on sustainable development  
• Engage them in the development planning process to provide effective and innovative solutions to achieve sustainable development and reduce poverty  
• Make use of this major source for financing the SDGs |
| --- | --- |
| May perceive sustainable development (specifically environment management and legislation) as a barrier to their activities  
Often not involved in development planning | |
| **Academic and Research Institutions** | • Leverage their innovative ideas, including new scientific approaches, to deploy sustainable solutions and appropriate technologies for achieving the SDGs  
• Work with them to enhance the science-policy link to find sustainable solutions to development problems |
| May be disconnected from the development planning process  
Capacity to produce policy-relevant information may be weak | |
| **Media** | • Make use of their role in shaping the opinions of decision-makers and the general public  
• Work with them to encourage public involvement in national development planning  
• Provide them with policy-related information  
• Work to enhance their advocacy role in achieving the SDGs |
| May lack knowledge of and attention to sustainable development issues  
May lack freedom of expression | |

The Citizen Support Portal

Bilkiss Rajahbalee-Cader & Suraj Ramgolam
Citizen Support Unit, Prime Minister’s Office, Republic of Mauritius

Abstract
In August 2015, Government of Mauritius developed ‘Vision 2030’ which is a key policy document that charts out the path to transform Mauritius into a high-income, sustainable, innovative and inclusive economy with modern infrastructure, global connectivity and advanced skills and technology. In line with Vision 2030, Government has elaborated, with the assistance of the Commonwealth Secretariat, a Public Sector Business Transformation Strategy which is built around ten (10) implementation pillars and which has as main objective to promote and implement a holistic reform and business transformation framework for the Public Service in Mauritius in order to ensure timely, efficient and citizen-centric services to the population. It is in this context that the Citizen Support Unit (CSU) of the Prime Minister’s Office has implemented a Citizen Support Portal (CSP) in April 2017 in its endeavor to place the Citizen at the centre of Government Services delivery by bringing a radical transformation in the process of managing complaints and suggestions received from the Public. The Citizen Support Portal enables the citizens to register their complaints/suggestions/general inquiries online on the web address www.csu.mu which are subsequently dealt with in a transparent, rule-based, efficient and timely manner. Such a novel approach in Government-to-Citizen interaction has earned the CSU recognition by the Commonwealth Association of Public Administration and Management (CAPAM), the African Association of Public Administration and Management (AAPAM) and at local level with the conferment of the Silver Award at the Public Sector Excellence Awards 2018 amongst others. Besides providing a platform for registering complaints and suggestions, the Citizen Support Portal, through its inbuilt data analytics tool, enables detailed analysis of complaints and suggestions in order to ensure the production of statistics for Government and the Public, monitoring and evaluation, planning, informed decisions as well as policy formulation. Backed by regular media campaigns and in view of its wide acceptability from all stakeholders, the initiative of the CSU has been a resounding success with 83% of cases resolved to the satisfaction of the citizens out of a total of around 91,000 tickets received to date.

Key words: Citizen Centric, Empowerment, All-Inclusive, Sustainable, Transparency, Accountability

Introduction
The Public sector remains the bed rock for the socio-economic development and prosperity of a country. As a matter of fact, the role played by Government machinery in implementing the objectives set out in the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals and Agenda 2063 of the African Union cannot be underestimated. However, it is observed that Public Reforms programmes and initiatives in the African Continent and undertaken under the Structural Adjustment Programme of World Bank since the 1980s have had a mitigated effect in sustaining the socio-economic development of the continent. The performance of such reforms in Africa remains hindered by a myriad of factors including lack of efficiency, lack of accountability, ineffective management practices, and corruption.

Whilst the benefits of Structural adjustment programmes brought by Government of Mauritius has enabled the country to be elevated from a mono-crop low income economy in the ‘70s to a vibrant, resilient and diversified services based economy, such strategy has proven its own limitations. As a matter of fact, Mauritius has for the past decades remained in what economic experts term as a ‘middle-income economy’ trap situation. It has become therefore crucial for Government of Mauritius to bring about a paradigm shift in strategies adopted in various sectors of socio-economic activities to meet the ambition of the country in joining the league of high income economies in the next years. The reform initiative which is presently unfolding and in line with the

New Public Management (NPM) is a label used to describe a management culture that emphasizes the centrality of the citizen or customer underpinned by the accountability for results. It is a set of broadly similar administrative doctrines, which dominated the public administration reform agenda of most OECD countries from the late 1970s (Hood, 1991; Pollitt, 1993; Ridley, 1996). It captures most of the structural, organizational and managerial changes taking place in the public services of these countries, and a bundle of management approaches and techniques borrowed from the private-for-profit sector. The implementation of the CSP by the Citizen Support Unit is a true reflection of the NPM model which is in direct opposition to the traditional model of organization and delivery of public services, based on the principles of bureaucratic hierarchy, centralized planning and direct control. The NPM modelled by the CSU provides for smaller, faster-moving service delivery organizations that is kept nimble and lean and that would need to be user-responsive and outcome-oriented in order to succeed. Such set up has developed flatter internal structures (i.e. fewer layers) and devolve operational authority to front-line managers across more than 300 Government entities connecting to the CSP. With a downsized number of staff, many services are contracted out’ instead of assuming that in-house provision is best.

Rationale of the Citizen Support Portal
In February 2017, a survey was conducted across all the twenty-four (24) Ministries of Government in order to gauge how complaints and suggestions were being handled in the public sector. Ministries responded with outcomes clustered around a system riddled with bureaucracy wherein complaints were recorded and processed manually relying on a paper intensive method and out of date business processes. It was also observed that the processing of certain complaints was taking undue time with the occurrence of lost/misplaced files or documents.

Against such a bleak situation, Government was called upon to take a bold stand and strive to establish a high standard in public service delivery system and process for people seeking Government services irrespective of their social position, geographical location, race and other differences. However, in order to build an all-inclusive society, it is primordial to hear the voices of the poorest and the most vulnerable and take the right step to enable them join the mainstream of socio-economic development.

Objectives of the Citizen Support Portal
- Evaluate how CSP can contribute in efficient, round the clock and timely citizen centric public service delivery by adopting innovative technologies
- Explore how participatory development connected the citizens and state for more informed decision making at the highest echelon of the government
- Analyze to what extent CSP has reinforced organizational learning, accountability, transparency and efficiency in the public system
- Analyze how CSP has created a single window for Operations, Monitoring and Evaluation, Reporting, Communication and IT operations to examine citizens needs and for policy formulation in Government Service Delivery

Advent of the Citizen Support Portal
The Citizen Support Portal which is operational since April 2017 has been developed and hosted by Mauritius Telecom, the largest telecommunication provider of the island. It is based on open source and extremely
affordable technologies (i.e. PHP, MySQL database) which has been customized in accordance to the requirements of the government in regards to complaints/suggestions management. The online CSP platform allows any citizen to register their complaints/suggestions/general inquiries online on the web address www.csu.mu through their smartphones/laptops/tablet. Once a citizen registers his/her complaint/general inquiry/suggestion, a ticketing system operates to provide the end user with a unique ticket number for tracking and reference purposes through SMS notification.

Any Citizen can avail of this facility even for those who do not have the means to register a complaint/suggestion on their own. They can simply approach one of the 35 offices of the Citizen Advice Bureau (CAB) located across different regions of the island. There is a dedicated CAB Officer who provides assistance and advice to the citizens and coordinates with the various government agencies to get the status of the ticket being processed. Also, citizens can use this internet-based platform across the 95 post offices of the island. As for those visually impaired, the CSP has inbuilt features to allow them to use the platform comfortably. CSP is indeed an indispensable support for the citizens as it is operational on a 24/7 basis. CSP has also been launched in Rodrigues, a dependency Island of the Republic of Mauritius. The system is managed by the Rodrigues Regional Assembly and customized in its local context.

The Citizen Support Unit
The Citizen Support Unit operates under the aegis of the Prime Minister’s Office and is the central body which manages the Citizen Support Portal and ensures that complaints and suggestions received are handled in an efficient and timely manner. The Unit comprises of different sections having their share of responsibility to meet the desired objectives and these are namely the Operation and Training, Monitoring and Evaluation, Marketing and Communication, Technical (IT) and Statistics sections. In all there are fourteen (14) officers who work at the CSU with different professional backgrounds and expertise.

How the Citizen Support Portal Operates?
The process of registering complaints/suggestions/general inquiries is markedly different from what it used to be prior to launching the CSP. There has been a radical change in the business processes, organizational arrangement and resource management. How users register their complaints on the online platform www.csu.mu to how complaints are processed and feedback obtained from customers is clearly depicted in Figure 1.

![Figure 1: Process of Complaint Management of the Citizen Support Portal (Source: CSU) Registering the Complaint/General Inquiry/Suggestion](image-url)
The Citizen makes a new request on the CSU Website www.csu.mu or walks in to 1 of the 35 CAB or 95 post offices to register his/her complaint/general inquiry/suggestion online. Once the online form is filled and the nearest CAB specified, a unique ticket number is provided to him/her by email or on his mobile phone.

**Processing of the ticket by CAB**

Based on the CAB specified in the online application form, the complaint/general inquiry/suggestion is subsequently automatically transferred to the CAB office. Thereon, the CAB will direct the ticket to the relevant Government body for necessary actions at their end. There are 300 participating government entities/departments on the CSP.

**Processing by the Government Body**

When a complaint or suggestion has been duly transferred to a Government Body, a high ranking officer, the Department Supervisor, who is responsible for handling of complaints or suggestions takes ownership of same. The Department Supervisor can personally address the complaint or suggestion or he / she can assign the complaint to one of his subordinates, the Department Officer. The suggestion or complaint can be reassigned to another Department Officer or transferred electronically to another Government body where the same process as described above is adhered to. During processing the Citizen may be contacted by phone or notified by email. Once the complaint or suggestion has been dealt with, the ticket is closed and the Citizen is automatically notified.

**Internal Follow Up**

The Citizen Advice Bureau and CSU Officers as well as officers of a given Government organisation have the possibility to monitor, query officers or post an internal note on the CSP during the processing of complaints or suggestions. The Citizen Support Unit of the Prime Minister’s Office has dedicated officers to follow up on all complaints received on the portal and intervene promptly to ensure that citizens are provided with the quality Government services at all times.

**Keeping the Citizen Informed at all Times**

The CSP provides for the citizen to be informed by email during the processing phase of the complaint or suggestion. The Citizen receives an email when his ticket has been closed by the Government body dealing with the complaint or suggestion.

**Checking Status**

The Citizen can at any time check the status of his / her complaint by providing the ticket number received when the post was first made.

**Feedback**

Once a ticket is closed, the Citizen is invited to fill in a feedback form where he / she will have the opportunity to provide relevant comments and rate the level of service obtained.
Benefits of the Citizen Support Portal

Round the Clock and Inclusive Service

Making complaints used to be a stressful, tedious and unwelcoming activity in the earlier days. But now by putting Digital government at the forefront, the CSP has encouraged citizens to use a service available at the click of a button without any time or physical constraint. Also, there are citizens approaching the CABs to avail of this service and during this interaction rapport is built with the citizens. They are informed about the public services and procedures, encouraged to share their issues and overcome the fear of consequences.

Accountability and Transparency

Tickets registered are treated on a first come first serve basis. Updates on the status of the ticket can be tracked by the citizen through the ticketing number and even officials can monitor progress and the efficiency of a service they provide. Through this approach, effective delegation and accountability is now a reality.

Upholding Confidentiality

The protection of personal data handled by the CSP is an essential condition in upholding trust and confidence among users. The CSU, therefore, ensures that complaints and suggestions that are received on the CSP are treated in strict confidentiality by authorized officers in strict compliance with the Data Protection Act. Moreover, the CSP has been developed to include strong and resilient protective security features which comply with internationally benchmarked Cyber security standards.

Organisational learning and Upgrading the Skills of Officers

It is remarkable how CSP has been able to drive radical change in behavior and working culture of the public sector. By having onboard all the government entities and creating the sense of belonging and responsibility, CSU has put organisational learning at the forefront. Public officers are continually trained and are made to accept and recognise the importance of adapting to changes. CSU ensure that their skills are upgraded and in line with the objective of the CSP which is aligned with that of the government. The public institutions are well coordinated and communication flow across government entities for informed decisions.

Public Trust and Reduced Scope of Nepotism

The CSP enables every citizen to be treated indiscriminately irrespective of his origin, social status, locality or creed. This is a key factor in creating a trustful environment for an enhanced Government-citizen interaction. Furthermore, the citizen has now an opportunity to be aware at all times about the status of his / her complaint or suggestion as well as obtaining an update from the officer handling the case while in process.

Methodology

It is an undeniable fact on how the CSP has generated actionable, accurate and strategic insights since its coming into operation in 2017. The implementation of the much awaited change was underpinned by the lean yet strong organizational setup of the CSU as has been illustrated in figure 2.
Unleashing innovation and transformation efforts in the public sector has yielded results which are beyond expectations. Through the rigorous tasks and endeavours of the knowledgeable, experienced and competent teams at CSU, research pertaining to the broad spectrum of CSP’s influence in citizens’ lives are undertaken. Both quantitative and qualitative data are generated to gauge the achievements of its set objectives. Different methods have been explored to add value to the monitoring and evaluation of its social, organisational and economic obligations.

**Reports from CSU Dashboard and Kibana Data Analytic Tool**

The complaints registered on the online platform are captured in the CSU databases namely CSU Dashboard and Kibana Dashboard. The data filled in the form by the citizens are distilled in informative and comprehensible data fields. In this way, the number of tickets pertaining to each Ministry, Constituency and/or Department are extracted and sorted as per timeframe, ticket status/types and according to the needs of the relevant stakeholders. Recently, CSP was upgraded with 254 complaint Categories (main and sub) so that each ticket registered could be classified according to the nature of the issue. These help CSU and Government entities to derive detailed information and steer actions towards the identified problem areas.

From the data on dashboards, statistical reports are prepared by CSU to identify the different issues affecting citizens’ lives, examining the priority areas, making recommendations on how to tackle those issues and improving public service delivery. Quarterly reports are submitted by CSU to the Cabinet of Ministers comprising of in-depth analysis and recommendations. Hence, monitoring and evaluation is done at the highest echelon of the government. Ministries are also encouraged to submit monthly reports to the Cabinet. The statistics become the fundament for decision making. Framing the problem areas of citizens is in fact the vital base for policy making, budget allocation and defining programmes and activities for the government.

**Investigative Research through the Right Mix of Communication Strategies**

Fending for participatory development and for the needs, safety and happiness of the population require the outgrowth of open and responsive communication practices. The right mix of impactful communication and
marketing strategies have undeniably supported this major project in being accepted, used and continuously upgraded. The communication campaigns have helped enormously in building up credibility and comprise of the following:

- Since April 2017, the CSU has embarked on a vast communication campaign in order to cover the whole population and to ensure that the citizens are made aware of their rights and benefits provided by Government;
- Radio programmes twice per week (Tuesdays and Saturdays) which comprise interaction with citizens to resolve their complaints and sensitize the population and procedures and policies of the Government in all sectors;
- Weekly TV programmer every Thursdays broadcasted on MBC TV channel during peak time to bring solutions to the problems faced by vulnerable persons;
- Sensitization campaigns by the Task Forces live on radio in each region across the island and in shopping malls to ensure more proximity with the citizens;
- Broadcasting of video clips showing new and innovative features on the portal on the national television for more awareness and video clip on CSU song;
- Active on social media platform namely Facebook and YouTube.

Creating platforms to encourage citizens to come and share vital information has aided CSU in delving into realities which might not have gained so much attention previously and which require quick intervention even if they affect only minority groups in particular regions. In fact, the face to face interaction during CSU campaigns contributed immensely in finding out the kind of expectations citizens have from the government, their opinions on the quality of public services then and now and creating greater proximity than ever before.

In the same vein, since July 2018, the government has set up Task Force Meetings chaired by Parliamentary Private Secretaries to monitor closely the issues prevalent in their respective electoral constituencies and finding out viable solutions. The representatives from different government entities attend the meetings to monitor progress and undertake discussions to sort out intricate matters. Till date, more than 190 Task Force Meetings have been conducted pointing towards the positive impact it is having on matters reported.

**Document review of Different Activities of CSU**

Orchestrating the interaction with more than 300 government departments and coordinating efforts towards resolving the tickets have been one of the most significant aspect of the operation team of CSU. Embedding the use of innovative technologies required the mobilization of savvy talents with the right skills set and attitude. Documenting on the training needs of the public officers to use the portal and efficiently handle issues was implemented. Till date, more than 1200 public officers have been provided with the necessary ongoing training to acquire the right and upgraded skills in using the platform and for effective service delivery. Meetings and workshops are held from time to time challenging public officers to break through the conventional way of functioning and pushing them beyond the boundaries of their comfort zones. Emphasis is being laid on building greater connectivity, ensuring effective communication and lifting up the notion of accountability, transparency and efficiency through close monitoring of tickets.

**System Analysis for the Upgrading of Service Provision**

Besides, the CSU has made an informed choice to use free and affordable open source software (PhP and MySQL) development platform for the implementation of the Citizen Support Portal. Through the technical expertise of staff and coordinated efforts with Mauritius Telecom (MT) this project was successfully completed.
with a short time frame while at the same time opening avenues for the harnessing of innovation in other areas of Public administration. Through regular meetings with MT, discussions are undertaken on how to innovate further to meet the requirements of different stakeholders and any trouble shooting issues are tabled.

**Findings**

**Reports on Citizen Support Portal and Recommendations**
Since the inception of CSP, due consideration has been given for the relief in the life of citizens through the provision of efficient delivery of public services by adhering to the principles of good governance. The task of CSP was not bounded only by just developing a one click transaction system, receiving and closing tickets, but the impact of the whole process on the society that matters. Against the backdrop of its vision and objectives, CSP has been tapping on the real time data for an impact-based evaluation on how successful it has been in creating the desired outcomes. On a monthly basis, statistics of the CSP is prepared by the Business Information Unit and uploaded on the CSU website highlighting on the cases resolved, percentage of cases in each constituency, top categories of problem areas and representation of age and gender. The statistics as at 31st July 2019 has been illustrated in Figure.

![Figure 3: Statistics of Citizen Support Portal as at 31 July 2019 (Source: CSU)](image-url)
As can be seen in Figure 3, a total of 91,323 tickets were received on the CSP with 83% cases resolved. This pinpoints to the extent of CSP being embraced and used by the Mauritian Population across different regions of the island. Efforts are being harnessed to help citizens find solutions and pare down scourging situations. By identifying the top categories of complaints, crucial issues are reported to higher levels of the government for decision taking and better execution of responsibilities. Further investigations are conducted to scrutinize the causes of issues pertaining for instance to consumer affairs, water, national housing development council matters amongst others, probe into the segments of the population being affected, what actions are required and the different stakeholders concerned.

In view of the quarterly reports which are prepared by the Monitoring and Evaluation team of CSU and submitted to Cabinet of Ministers, in-depth analysis was done to have an insight into not just pertinent issues affecting the lives of citizens but systemic concerns as well. For instance, following more than 190 Task Force Meetings across the 20 constituencies of the island, the 2nd Task Force Meeting Report was prepared for the period July 2018 till May 2019. The positive impact of the Task Force Meetings has been remarkable; the number of total resolved tickets on CSP soared from 70% to 80%. This novel government tactic of reporting these matters have unlocked possibilities of improving service delivery. Government entities are made to investigate on the constraints they are facing in addressing issues which can emanate from areas like human resources, financial or legal.

Additionally, recommendations were made on how to improve the existing system and devising strategies to fill in the gaps. The report highlighted on crucial areas like the quality of service and process to reinstate the trust of each and every citizen. It was pertinent to explain to the citizens the complaint handling process and providing them with clear feedback once a particular investigation was completed. Besides, it was proposed to have a community welfare plan at the level of each constituency for the development of essential programmes and activities region-wised fostering a harmonious society. Also, 254 complaint categories have already been integrated in the system for detailed statistics. In furtherance to this latest development, a new exercise is currently in progress to obtain the Service Level Agreements for each category from Ministries/Departments. This will help establish a pre-defined and reasonable timeframe to handle and resolve a particular category of complaint. To stay in the fast track lane and for sweeping advances, each and every public officer will have to be encouraged, motivated and trained to realize the call of his/her responsibility.

As far as participatory development is concerned, gender equity is a requisite and it is commendable that CSP has become a platform which has sparked the participation of women in the public sphere. In its catapult for wider outreach, the CSP has been engaging in such communication and marketing strategies that has helped to bridge the gap not only between the state and the citizens but also, derive a fair representation of women in using the CSP as has been illustrated in figure 4.
As can be seen from the diagram, the representation of male varies from 57% to 61% compared to female which is between 39% to 43%. Based on the latest data pertaining to the period as at July 2019, the difference between male and female complainants extended to around 11%. Hence, participatory development has been promoted with an all-inclusive approach. The information/data gathered from the Kibana Dashboard pertaining to the period 01 January 2019 to 31 May 2019 sheds light on the context-specific differences that exist between gender relations and their social and economic conditions as can be seen in Table 1.

**Table 1: Top 10 Categories of Issues for Male and Female Complainants (Source: CSU)**

For the period 01 January 2019 to 31 May 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Male</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Street Lighting</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Water</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drains &amp; Road Infrastructure</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>SRM Empowerment Scheme</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Affairs Unit</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Cleaning of bare lands &amp; derelict buildings</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning of bare lands &amp; derelict buildings</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Consumer Affairs Unit</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building and Permits &amp; Planning &amp; Trade Fee</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>Drains &amp; Road Infrastructure</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Street Lighting</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Health Issues</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Building and Permits &amp; Planning &amp; Trade Fee</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Public Health Issues</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Road Development Authority</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>Employment &amp; Job Seeking</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These statistics provide insights on the Division of work, responsibilities and power and the interlock patterns of opportunities, disadvantage or deprivation which can help in defining policies, budgets and programmes from
gender lens. Besides, the Citizen Support Portal is operated under a robust, reliable and secure ICT Infrastructure which is a key condition for a project of this scale. The implementation of the CSP across all Government entities has been possible as the necessary infrastructure such as the MT Data Centre, the Government Intranet System and necessary computing tools at the level of users were readily acquired by the CSU. Reports comprising log in information of public officers and enquiry on how tickets are processed clearly indicate the level of commitment that they are showing. The focus is transforming from just the routine administrative tasks to coordinating to achieve national targets through communication that cuts across ministries and departments.

Discussion

The spectacular growth of CSP has been fueled not just by the restricted vision of delivering citizen centric services but has gone well beyond that motive. CSU has challenged its own limit by collaborating with various stakeholders and meticulously devising new ways to nurture the self-development of a citizen as a whole in a harmonious society. Figure 5 shows the different stakeholders of CSU.

Figure 5: Stakeholders of Citizen Support Unit (Source: CSU)

A crucial step was made by CSU in being part of the National Emergency Operations Command for disaster risk reduction. The Portal is used to facilitate lifesaving communications in reaching appropriate bodies for prompt actions. In addition, CSU has been collaborating with NGO’s to combat societal afflictions and help vulnerable groups find cogent solutions. Through the media, the citizens are sensitized and bold steps taken for result oriented interaction and setting the trail for others to follow. All these have been possible through the joint work of various stakeholders. A thick demarcation line has been created for CSU from being an entity prevalent just for complaints management to englobing the all-round development of a citizen. CSU is involved in major projects of the country like:

- ‘Moris Nou Zoli Pei’ (Mauritius my beautiful country) - In collaboration with the Ministry of Local Government and Outer Islands, National Cleaning and Embellishment Campaigns were carried out across different regions to spark the concept of cleanliness and sustainability and is still an ongoing project.
‘Active Mauritius Debark Kot Twa’ (Active Mauritius comes to you) – In collaboration with the Ministry of Youth and Sports, various activities will be held across the island encouraging people of different age groups to participate and seeding the notion of healthy activities, eating and ageing.

Domestic Violence – In collaboration with the Ministry of Gender, Child Development and Family Welfare efforts are being directed to help victims, educate citizens and combat violence through training of CAB officers, video clips and workshops.

With regard to the journey CSP has accomplished so far, it is undeniable how it has successfully innovated in different areas which have been depicted in Figure 6.

![Figure 6: Areas of Innovation (Source: CSU)](image)

It can be rightfully said that the scope of expanse of the CSP has been indeed remarkable since its emergence and in fact, it is progressing at lightning speed. The project has won the Bronze Award at the African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM) Award. Hence, even at international level CSP is inspiring nations. The African Development Bank has shown interest to replicate this type of project in African countries. CSU will be participating in the 2nd International Conference in Uganda revolving around the concept of Good Governance and public service delivery.

**Conclusion**

The culture of continuous improvement is deeply ingrained in this project. Navigating new frontiers to unleash both economic and social values will always be a top priority for CSP. It is important to understand that when a project at the level of the government is undertaken for the citizens, there has to be the right blend of economic, social and holistic perspectives throughout which responsive strategies are devised and implemented. This is not about competition with others but all about competing with the current difficult situations to shape a better tomorrow. There is more to explore for CSP and elevate its level higher by reaching out the most vulnerable groups and making the society free from hunger, poverty, pollution, crimes and problems affecting the lives of citizens. The battle against hard core realities will be ongoing and this requires a consolidated nation. More projects and collaboration will be needed for effective community building not just whereby authorities are resolving citizens’ issues but creating a society where citizens help themselves. The growing delivery capabilities of CSP has no bound if each stakeholder strives for optimum performance in a connected world.
Acknowledgement
The Citizen Support Portal Project became a reality due to the unfaltering belief and efforts of the whole CSU Team and the support of each and every stakeholder. The well balanced CSU Team has made excellence a habit in every task being undertaken to move towards the vision set for the country. The journey till so far has been enriching and revitalizing in the quest of continual innovation and progress. The initiation of the Project, keeping and working together to realize a dream came true was all thanks to the vision of the Prime Minister’s Office, hard work of the CSU, CABs and Government agencies, expertise contribution of Mauritius Telecom, support of the Media, NGO’s, Trade Unions, Parastatal bodies and the expectations and hope of the Citizens. Thank you for the knowledge sharing interaction.
E-Learning for Personalized Learning in Tertiary Institutions

Rodnie Mafa
Institute of Development Management, Botswana

Abstract
E-learning has supposed other methods of teaching and learning in both developing, developed and underdeveloped countries. The ever-increasing lack of use of available technology in teaching and learning has resulted in learning not to cover the majority of participants. The use of traditional methods lo learning and teacher centered pedagogies have led to back log on completion and performance of the participants. E-Learning for personalized learning is the centre in academia in high institutions. The objective of this study was to investigate if learners use e-learning for personalized learning outside classroom contacts to support and enhance their teaching and learning. The Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) theoretical framework was adopted for this study. A across sectional descriptive study using mixed method approaches was used to collect data, both quantitative and qualitative research methodologies were used. A random sample of leaners in tertiary institutions was used to select participants in each stratum. All statistical modelling were carried out using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS). The results of the study concluded that e-learning is a very important aspect for personalized learning since learning goes beyond classroom contacts.

Keywords: E-learning, technology, Personalized, Learning, Pedagogy, Learning

Introduction
Education is one of the main corner-stones for economic development and improvement of human welfare. Since 1990, many governments have been promoting the use of Information Communication Technologies (ICT) in education, particularly to expand access to and improve the quality of education. At the same time, globalization and shift to a knowledge-based economy requires that education institutions develop use this technologies to improve learning. ICTs have been identified as a means to attain these objectives (School Net Africa 2003). Although ICT is now at the center of education reform efforts, not all countries are currently able to benefit from this development and advances that technology can offer, this the purpose of this paper to try to investigate if e-learning can help with personalized learning. Electronic learning (e-Learning), is interactive learning in which learning content is available online and provides automatic feedback to the learner's learning activities (Paulsen, 2003). This is also known as computer assisted learning where one has to be online to have access to learning. Learning facilitated through this platform usually means that learners can communicate with their lecturers through the internet where classroom post, assignments and announcements can be made. This enables access to classroom content materials and makes sure that the class is aware of what is to be expected from their facilitators. The focus is not only on communicating online; organization of and access to the learning content are more central to e-learning. Now day’s e-learning has emerged as a respectable content delivery reaching all across the world (Mafa and Govender, 2018).

One advantages of e-learning is that it can be more adaptive than conventional learning. Traditional or formal context learning has adopted the model, “one size fits all”, which tends to have only one way of communication where the students are not able to express themselves, because in a typical classroom situation a lecturer often has to deal with several students at the same time and there is not much time
for discussion. This forces students to just take the note during lectures even if they do not understand what is being taught. These makes it difficult for the facilitator to know which students have problems in understanding his/her class materials.

E-Learning has many interpretations but in short it stands for learning by electronic means which is also referred to as online learning which requires internet connectivity. This means learning not directly from lecture notes, books or face-to-face from teacher but through electronic means. There are different types of e-learning known as; computer-based learning and web based or web assisted online learning. With e-learning and good advances in technology, learning can take place anytime controlled by the learner. The learner has access to learning materials using mobile technology applications and any other tools which can be used to connect online and attend lesson thereof.

Literature
E-learning is learning that is enabled or supported by the use of digital tools and content. It typically involves some form of interactivity, which may include online interaction between the learner and their teacher or peers. E-learning is one of the tools which emerged from information technology has shifted the education sector from the traditional way to the electronic environment where learning occurs online. Traditional learning is a method of learning that is conducted by a teacher gathering students in classes, labs or any other place to study and learn about different subjects. In Traditional learning environment, teachers and professors have various teaching styles but the most popular traditional teaching style is teaching by telling (Schroeder, 1993).

E-Learning environments can be rich, interactive, dynamic and customizable, connecting learners with information across the globe. According to Labay and Comm (2003), e-learning produces the better learning outcomes than the traditional methods. E-learning environments can offer a number of learning tools like; chat rooms, learning management systems (Google Classroom, Moodle, Blackboard and others), discussion groups, online bulletin boards, and e-mail. This support access to instructors and online web 2.0 groups and above, but they all essentially pertain to asynchronous mode of learning. The most sophisticated and the most interactive environments provide tools for synchronous mode of training and learning where course facilitators organizes and guides learning (Kenan. et, al, 2013). With such environments, the learners log in and can communicate directly with the course facilitator and their peers online interactively. In addition to Internet Web sites, supporting tools include audio and/or video-conferencing, Internet telephony, or even two-way live broadcasts to students in a classroom (Obringer and Coffey, 2007)).

There are barriers which hinder good implementation of e-learning; this is supported by Rhema & Miliszewska, (2010) who have classified the challenges linked to the implementation and use of e-learning and ICT into three categories: lack of ICT infrastructure; lack of qualified personnel, and resistance to change. If this can be eliminated, then online classroom will bear good results.

Problem Statement
Although it is perceived that learning takes place during the classroom contacts, most learners learn outside the classroom. This is because, in classroom contacts where there are scheduled classes periods
and laboratories where the facilitator delivers a lecture and learners passively participate. Most of the times learners reflect on what has been learnt outside classroom contacts where they begin to realize some problems and want to consult their instructors. The problem is that during the time when the student want to consult, the facilitators are not there and it is always difficult for learners to have access to information. There are web technology tools and above which can be used and taken advantage of to improve teaching and learning, thus the focus on e-learning in this paper.

**Research Questions**

1. How does e-learning enhance teaching and learning?
2. What are available e-learning platforms which are used outside classroom contacts for personalized learning?
3. How does learning and teaching supported by e-learning differ from formal classroom contacts?

**Methodology**

**Theoretical Framework**

This study adopted and used the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM), a well-known model of Information Technology (IT)-adoption and use. This is an information systems theory that models how users come to accept and use a technology. The model suggests that when users are presented with a new technology, a number of factors influence their decision about how and when they will use it. The TAM is gaining popularity for understanding the relationship between humans and technology through Perceived Usefulness (PU) and Perceived Ease of Use (PEU). The rationale for adopting the TAM in this study was to present a foundation for ascertaining the impact of variables on internal beliefs, personal abilities, attitude, mind-set and intention to adopt and use the IPMS. The TAM is an information system theory that has stages on how to adopt and use any information system to achieve the desired results.

![Figure 1: The Technology Acceptance Model](image)

The Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) is an expansion of Ajzen and Fishbein’s Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) (Priyanka and Kumar, 2013) which was a theory initiated by Fred Davis in 1986 and since then has gone through several modifications and validation. The aim of the theory is to describe factors that determine technology acceptance, information technology usage behavior and to provide a parsimonious theoretical explanatory model (Bertrand & Bouchard, 2008). Ducey (2013) explained that the TAM includes; perceived ease of use and perceived usefulness which are the important determinants of technology acceptance and user behavior.
This study adopted the quantitative and qualitative research methodologies; analysis was done using statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). The results were presented using charts in order to make the analysis easier to understand and interpret. Random sampling methodology was used in selecting the participants of the study. All the participants were given the chance to participate in the study. In order to address the problem statement and the research questions under study, a questionnaire was designed and given to the learners in order to get their perceptions on the use of e-learning for personalized learning to enhance their teaching and learning. Informed consent forms were sent to participants selected in order for them to consent in taking part in the study. Data was be collected through a survey using self-administered questionnaires, focus group discussions.

**Findings and Discussion**

The following section discusses the results of the study:

**Table 1: Gender participation in the study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 shows that mostly males participated in the study than females. The reason might be because males are more interested in technology than females. The study had a 100 percent response rate.

**Figure 1: Access to Computer use by Students**

Figure 2 evident that majority of the students have access to a computer every day. Only a small percentage, 4 percent of the total respondents rarely have access to the computer and some have reported to have access to a computer a few times a week. This might be that most students do not have computers of their own; they rely mostly on mobile devices than desktop computers. Most of the learning takes place using mobile technology devices.
For one to access e-learning platforms, they need to have access to the internet. Most respondents have access to the internet connection at the University or college than any other place. This makes it easier for student to connect to any e-learning platform provided by their institution or any other platform used for learning. A small percentage has access to internet at home. This is due to the fact that broadband internet connection in Botswana is still a challenge and costs more, that’s why many home steads do not have access to internet connection.

Majority of students as seen in figure 4 have responded to using e-learning platforms every day. Some use them occasionally than rarely. The reason to using e-learning platforms is that students have access to internet connection at the college or University (as discussed in figure 3) and they go to school every day where they have access to internet.

**Table 2: Responses to Research Question 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research question 1: How does e-learning enhance teaching and learning?</th>
<th>Researchers conclusions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student responses</td>
<td>- The researcher concludes that students value education online than physical contact. The</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- it enables one to be able to communicate with class mates to get notes after class.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- if the lecturer is not around physically, one can be contacted using online learning tools or social media.
- I am able to download notes at my own time.
- lectures posts updates using web 2.0 tools.
- we have formed educational groups in which we keep each other informed and updated all the time.
- learning is made easier since one learns through e-learning at the comfort of their homes.

responses arrives one at the conclusion that e-learning is a very important tool for learning which learners use at the comfort of their own even when their lecturers are not present for consultations.

Figure 4: Use of E-Learning by Students

Majority of the students have reported to use e-learning (92 percent) for their teaching and learning. This shows that majority of learners value e-learning as a very important aspect of learning.

Table 3: E-Learning Platforms used by Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E-learning Platforms</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Google classroom</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WhatsApp</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 shows that most students have reported to be using Google classroom e-learning platform than the other learning platforms followed by WhatsApp and email and FaceBook respectively. Most lectures in Colleges and Universities use different e-learning platforms of their choice to disseminate instructions and education content materials.

Research question 3: How does Tearning and Teaching supported by E-learning differ from Formal Classroom Contacts?

The responses to address and answer research question 4 follows:
Learning from Formal Classroom Contacts

- We normally do not understand when the lecture is in class
- There is no time to interact with the lecturer in class
- Lecturers mostly use the projector to read what they have prepared for the class and they take the whole time reading until the class ends

Learning supported by E-Learning

- We are able to learn among ourselves
- We ask questions relating to particular topics
- Most of the students are able to interact and comment on the questions and comments asked by their peers.

Conclusion

The researchers concludes that e-learning is an important tool which helps enhance the teaching and learning of students across all sectors. It has spread worldwide and most learning institutions have adopted it to support the teaching and learning of their students. A variety of reasons as seen in the results have led to students’ adopting and using different e-learning platforms. It is also concluded that, for an effective e-learning system, the following should be in place: 1: interaction and feedback between learners and facilitators, and 2: technological infrastructure problems such as Internet speed and bandwidth should be eliminated as most e-learning platform rely heavely on the internet.

Recommendations

The researchers recommends that learning be supplemented through e-learning platforms. Internet connection with high bandwidth and access to computers should be made available to learners at all times so that learning can be continous beyond classroom physical contacts. The study also recommends that institutions should help learners acquire a computer to be used with e-learning. Evaluations should be done timeously as this tell if e-learning is a profitable tool or not. Tests and examinations should be set and administered through this form of learning. This will reduce cases where students did not show up for tests and examinations because of various reasons and it will ensure that all, even the absent have access to writing test and examinations on different locations.

Acknowledgements

The researcher acknowledges commendable contribution of all those who participated in making this article a success. Without your valuable contribution this paper wouldn’t be complete, with that I salute you. Special thanks goes to the Almighty Lord who makes all things possible. My family, you contribution is recognized, I heartily thank you. The sponsors (IDM Botswana campus) who made it a success that I present this paper at Uganda Management Institute Conference in 2019 are also recognized and thanked rightfully so. God bless you all.

References

Health Remedy Fallacies Strike the Social Media as Medical Practitioners just watch: What is the role of Development Education? A Critical-Analytical Paper

Maria Kaguhangire-Barifaijo & Peter Kibazo
Uganda Management Institute
Corresponding E-mail: mbkaguhangire@umi.ac.ug / pkibazo@umi.ac.ug

Abstract
The advent of social media has come with unequalled excitement, but also risks, especially when postings are health-related, and not supported by scientific evidence. Unfortunately, majority of Social Media users tend to embrace and utilize every health remedy (alternative medicines) posted on social media, without questioning their authenticity or even authors’ credibility, since these “information creators” never display their addresses of even their identities, but the users proceed and ingest these remedies. The paper further discusses, why social media users become receptive and passive with unsubstantiated information, thereby exposing more harm to their health. The authors adopted “The Uses and Gratifications Theory” and “The Theory of Social Media Interaction” to explain the increased fallacies hitting social media, while the masses continue to get duped. Through an interactive approach, most users, although educated, were found to get excited the first time they land on “useful information” which hinders most of them from applying logic and critical thinking skills, which presumably, ‘development education’ should ably address at every level of education. Secondly, the power and popular appeals of social media which quickly convinces and sways the users has affected the users’ questioning stance. The paper hence, concludes that human challenges are diverse, hence they respond differently, especially with health circumstances, that was found to serious affect their ‘critical analyses’ faculty. Consequently, the reason medical professionals do not participate in fallacious arguments in the social media, is that one, they make assumptions that the users are logical enough, and will only use such remedies after consulting with physicians and perhaps doing some research, and two, their medical professional ethics do not allow them to publicly discuss unfounded claims related to medicine.

Key words: Development Education, Health Fallacies, Medical Practitioners, Social Media

Introduction
The recent few decades have witnessed social media dominating the other forms of media in the world, and has gained unmatched prominence, with its endless provision of opportunities for users who act as both consumers and creators of media (Thompson, Dawson and Ferdig, 2008). This interactivity on social media therefore, has come with both opportunities and challenges, thereby plunging users into serious medical conditions (Fox, 2011). Commonly used Social Media (SM) avenues include; Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube, which are actually powerful symbols of a new generation of online tools and applications that fosters user-generated content, social interaction, and real-time collaboration (Merchant, Elmer and Lurie, 2011). These technologies encompass blogs, social networks, video and photo-sharing sites, wikis, and a myriad other media, and are pervasive around the world (Elmer et al, 2011). As espoused by Yamout (2011), Facebook has become so popular and has in fact surpassed a billion users worldwide. Invariably however, although social media are positively shaping peoples’ personal lives, it is steadily distorting health-related information as well. This is because, a growing majority of modern patients – particularly those with chronic conditions – are fast responding to social media and other online sources – not only to acquire health information but alternative medicine (health remedies) and this avenue is considered extremely useful because it enables the users connect with others affected by similar conditions, and play a more active role in their healthcare decisions (George, 2011).

Nonetheless, even with the level of education as well as well as development achieved so far, social media users continue to adopt and utilize health related remedies posted in the social media, with no evidence of authenticity
at all - thereby plunging thousands of lives in jeopardy. Yet, the advancement and promotion of ‘development education’ currently ‘preached’ is intended to promote human emancipation, by curbing dominance and passivity. In fact, as efforts in the field of ‘development education’ are being proliferated especially in developing countries like Uganda for the last two (2) decades, there has been little or no awareness created among the beneficiaries, which has perhaps resulted to populaces become passive recipients of information – with little attempt to critically evaluate their authenticity. In particular, the system seems to have lost the quality and nature of learning that takes place in schools which has resulted in ‘a need to recapture the broad understanding of education and its purpose in future goals and frameworks’ (UN, 2013). It would make sense if the consumers of façade information were exclusive the ‘baby boomers’, but in fact, all categories of social media users have fallen prey of fallacious ‘health-related arguments’ and discussions. Surprising, this fallacy has affected even the professors - the promoters of ‘critical thinking and research’ and even medical practitioners – who preach “the importance of conventional treatment’ and only ‘alternative treatment such exercises and diet’. Considering such challenges therefore, Dudková, (2008), emphasizes a ‘learning process’ and the quality pedagogy in the provision of at all education levels, rather than concentrating on ‘equity, access and outcomes’, which Jefferess (2008), attributes to passive reading that has affected critical thinking capacity of the populace. Consequently, Greysen and Chretien (2010) argue that whereas the emergent of technology has eased information creation and transfer, there was need to develop skills for the users for appropriate utilization.

Nonetheless, while there are signs that these technologies are being used to enhance self-directed lifelong learning, professional networking, communication and improve efficiency and effectiveness of health systems, they are a danger to human species because they promote self-medication (Greysen and Chretien, 2010), which has largely distorted the ‘would be’ health remedies especially, because the posted remedies often display incomplete or sometimes wrong information to the users. The authors are not concerned with traditional herbalists whose outlets are known, but rather, unidentified “self-acclaimed professionals” who post conflicting medical remedies using technologies, with no address to enable the users seek further clarification. While most of the time medical professionals are in agreement with information published as medical remedies, sometimes they are not. Yet, the users are often kept in darkness because the competent professionals remain silent (Mostaghimi and Crotty, 2011). That’s perfectly okay, although oftentimes these herbalists decline to meet up with medical professionals to engage in more productive conversation (Shrank et al. 2011). Clearly, social medial has to some extent become perilous not only for health professionals and users, but the community as a whole. Yet, academic literature replete with admonishments of how social media are dangerously breeching the old “boundary markers” of medicine - enabling all manner of distasteful content to be publically posted health remedies (Mostaghimi and Crotty, 2011).

Nevertheless, in a time of fake news, “alternative facts,” newspeak and attacks on credible publications, it is high time users recognized genuine or fallacies in what they see, hear and read (Atherton and Majeed, 2011). Although such fallacies sometimes carry useful information, most times, the information is either conflicting or incomplete, as some postings lack scientific evidence. Key of these include; appeal to ignorance by using the lack of evidence on a topic as support for the conclusion, confirmation bias – where people notice, seek out, select and share evidence that confirms their own standpoint and beliefs, as opposed to contrary evidence (Hawn, 2017). Other fallacies include; ‘hasty generalization’, where the publisher makes assumptions about a whole group or range of cases based on a small or inadequate sample – sometimes called stereotypes; ‘slippery slope’ – a claim that one thing inevitably leads to another,” without stating evidence for the assumption. As users embark on remedies, ‘straw men’ and seriously characterizes the claim as phony, weak, extreme or ridiculous,
and then knocking it down or reducing it to absurdity (Flew and Smith, 2011; Ramos, 2017 & West and Turner, 2007).

The Context and Problem

There has been information bombardment on social media full of all sorts of information for every type of user - including health-related remedies. The mass information has made it difficult for the users to decipher how much of this information is simply spurious assertions, conspiracy theories, misinterpreted information or genuine. In fact, Bustamente, et al (2015), found that the problem was not the type of information, but rather, the users’ ability to navigate and appropriately process the information which requires not only analytical abilities, but adaptability and critical thinking. In fact, critical thinking is necessary for information processing and making decisions on the legitimacy of numerous assertions in social media. Instead, the users are getting more confused as more "cognitive load" increases (Sweller, 2010). Many designers and policymakers found social media harmless and, in fact believe that its associated risks are minor and ignorable (Boudry, 2017). However, because health information technology is designed, built, and implemented by humans, it will invariably have ‘bugs’ and latent failure modes that may be detrimental to health. Fallible humans have learned to build generally reliable complex physical systems (e.g., bridges, buildings, cars), but it took more than a century to understand and mitigate the myriad of hazards of these systems. In contrast, we cannot yet design and deploy complex software systems that are on time, within budget, meet the specified requirements, satisfy their users, are reliable, maintainable and safe (Walton, 2010).

Whereas majority of users of social media are educated and enlightened, many fail to distinguish genuine from façade, complete from partial, researched from opinion information. Secondly, although the debate on information credibility has been on-going, users continue to rely on social media for health related remedies, perhaps because they fail to respond to conventional treatment. The problem of relying on face book however has remained the concealed identities and contacts of the sources of information, which Bahendeka (2015) called deception since the publishers often use other devices of argumentation to sway thinking, such as logical fallacies. The fallacious postings have nonetheless caused more harm as users continue to degenerate into worse health as a result of relying on false and incomplete information (Bustamente, et al 2015). In order to explore implications for users, three objectives were formulated; (1) to establish why information creators on social media conceal their identities? (2) to evaluate some of the conflicting health-related remedies posted in social media and (3) to explore causes of receptive usage of social media information.

Literature Review

As medical professionals turn their heads away amidst mind-blowing information that has struck social media, we cannot stop interrogating the role of ‘development education’, which presumably promotes self-efficacy and critical perspectives. Questions about how individuals can use information without processing and ascertaining its authenticity need explanation. Development education has become one of the key current debates within international education policy that has immensely contributed to other forms of development that have attempted to promote emancipation and critical thinking (Freire, 1972). Although the field of development education has majorly focused on international education policy, it could as well become pertinent on the quality of education quality, the process of learning and teaching to enable the actors think and act critically and creatively, as opposed to the current preoccupation with education access, equity and outcomes (Dudková, 2008).
Similarly, Bourn (2011), argues that development education came to overturn the early practices that used an uncritical view of development and economic growth to educate what was perceived to be a largely ignorant or disinterested public, with the goal of ‘opening up hearts and minds, as well as the purses, to the problem of poverty in countries overseas’ (Cascant and Kelbert, 2012). As a creation to promote a strong critical pedagogy within development education, it was premised to emancipate actors to overcome the ‘mentality of passivity’, which includes, developing partnerships between educators and learners in the Global North and Global South; the promotion of social justice, empathy and solidarity; a commitment to participatory and transformative learning processes, with an emphasis on dialogue and experience; and a critique of dominant power relations and media messages about development that portray peoples from the Global South as helpless victims (Damtew, 2012).

Health is defined as the state of equilibrium of the mind and body, and research has found that health is managed through effective transfer of knowledge to individuals, clients, and families (van Eemeren, 2009). Social media has also become an integral tool for medical societies, professional groups, and advocacy groups. These groups are using social media to engage, teach, and connect, and they play an important role in providing accurate, vetted health information. Additionally, organizations have realized that encouraging live-tweeting or blogging of conferences provides opportunities for wide dissemination of content that far surpasses in-person attendance (Carroll, Bruno, Bosslet & Ramachandran, 2015). Given that social media is a recent development (Walton, 2010), there has not been concrete theory to clearly explain the consequences of social media. Hence, some scholars have attempted to patch up some models and theories which are still being tested. The authors adopted three theories to explain some fallacies and reasons users embrace medical remedies that are provided through social medial postings, indiscriminately. Hence, although the authors adopted some of the theories, they are cognizant of their recency. In recognition of the challenges, many researchers and theorists use typologies and classification systems to describe types of theories in the context of purpose, functions, boundaries, and goals, especially in the area of technology (Gay and Weaver, 2011).

Need for Theory to Extend to Health Behaviors

Against the backdrop of these theories, most of them based on the communication field, researchers have called for theory to be more specific to understand influence or behavior change in the setting of a type of media in which users were both creators and consumers (Collins, Martino, and Shaw, 2011). Moreno et al (2013) argued that existing theories of media and behavior may be able to stretch to cover these factors under broad conceptual labels, but the development of new theory may also be warranted. However, the perspective of how social media may be perceived as influential to its users, has left a gap in the interpretation (Henderikus, 2007). Further, the representation of users’ views in the development of theory was also missing. Consequently, the authors sought to review existing theories, that are specific to social media and networking platforms such as Facebook and Twitter.

Uses and Gratifications Theory

Uses and Gratifications Theory (UGT) discusses how people actively seek out specific media content for particular purposes and intentional goals (Atherton and Majeed, 2011). The theory establishes an active, rather than passive audience member who has the ability to consciously examine and evaluate social media sources in order to accomplish specific outcomes (Wang, Fine, & Cai, 2008). The theory embodied a functional shift of communications scholarship, from examining not what media did to people, but to what people could do with media. In fact, the theory of Uses and Gratifications initially grew out of the needs and motivation theory, by
Maslow (1970), which suggests that people act in line with a specific personal hierarchy of needs. Communications scholars quickly caught on to this notion and sought to determine typologies of needs for media consumption. There are many versions of these typologies. Therefore, Darling-Hammond (2008) suggest a variety of categories of purposeful media consumption that people may engage in, especially, usage of a critical lens to be able to live a ‘healthy life’ or to ‘free from disease’. Therefore, the theory “provides a framework for understanding when and how individual media consumers become more or less active and the consequences of that increased or decreased involvement” (West & Turner, 2007). The theory proposed five main assumptions: (1) an audience is active and goal-oriented in their media consumption, (2) media are used for gratifications, (3) media are in competition with other means of need satisfaction, (4) people understand their personal media use, interests, and motives enough to communicate with researchers about their choices, (5) the audience members are the only people who can make judgments regarding the value of the media content. The authors find assumptions four and five to be more relevant for this paper, especially when “the would-be enlightened” users of information from the social media, surprisingly adopt it, sometimes without a critical stance. Hence, whereas the first three assumptions are relevant especially the existence need for users with health conditions, the theory also articulates interests of majority of social media users (Kahneman, 2011). Consequently, the fourth assumption, that people are self-aware of their media usages, and the fifth assumption which assumes that researchers make a concerted effort to remove their personal value judgments from the study of media content become very contributory to this discussion, because whereas both assumptions are logical, in reality the practice defies these two assumptions, because in reality, most users do not evaluate the value of the given media content.

In support of persuasive argument, Fox (2011), identified some forms of persuasion techniques, illogical argumentation and fallacious reasoning which users commonly encounter in my use of social media. By learning about these devices, you will be more likely to recognize their use, avoid using them yourself, and better assess arguments presented to you (Shrank et al 2011). They include: Ad hominem, anecdotal evidence, an appeal to authority, an appeal to emotion, the bandwagon argument, appeal to popularity, appeal to tradition, appeal to ignorance, appeals to emotion, begging the question, false dilemma or false dichotomy, decision point fallacy or the sorites paradox, the slippery slope fallacy, hasty generalizations and faulty analogies (Fox, 2009). One reason fallacies are common is that they can be quite effective and the publishers extremely convincing. Unfortunately, we often get convinced by a fallacious argument we will not be acting as good logical and critical thinkers.

The Theory of Social Media Interaction

The Theory of Social Media Interaction was formulated to explain how stable social media interactions legitimize particular thoughts and practices regarding issues such as health and illness, and help to transform individuals through effective transfer of knowledge through social media (Carroll, et al 2015). Hence, the theory of social media health interaction, potentially that provides a valuable contribution to social media health research, offers a new theory-based approach for studying how the media and citizens represent personal and social agenda colors according to age or situational frames (Gay and Weaver, 2011). Fundamental communicative mechanisms therefore, such as social media exchange, social media interaction, and personal integration are posited in this theory. Social media and the internet have fundamentally transformed not only the way we communicate and interact, but also the way we comprehend and make decisions on the content published on social media (Hawn, 2017). Similarly, with all the required information, knowledge and experiences readily available with just a click of the mouse. Information is easily accessible and free to anyone with a computer, and communication across continents is as easy as e-mailing someone next door. As the Internet expanded into our
homes, there was a growing expectation of free and open access to information (Bosslet et al, 2011). Since information was easily accessible on so many sites, there developed an expectation that all information should be free and reliable. Social media are broadly defined as the use of platforms of electronic communication through which users create online communities (Social Networking Fact Sheet, 2015). Social media use is common: 74% of Internet users spend time on social networking sites, with 71% of online adults using Facebook and 23% using Twitter (Deuze, 2007).

The Theory of Social Media Interaction was formulated to explain how stable social media interactions legitimatize particular thoughts and practices regarding issues such as health and illness, and help to transform individuals through effective transfer of knowledge through social media. The key concepts of the theory are defined accordingly; personal health agenda, social media transaction, social exchange and social integration (Meleis, 2007). The theory of Social Media Interaction has four underlying assumptions: (1) Social Media is a means of accessing and gaining information (2) Social media creates a virtual community where interaction occurs, (3), Different groups may have diverse cultural practices regarding the acquisition and dissemination of information and (4) People who engage in interaction are rationally seeking to maximize their health. Similarly, the theory of Social Media Interaction has four fundamental propositions: (1) Interaction changes over a period of time (2) Social media promotes wellness (3) Successful interaction leads to active participation and (4) Social media proliferates information quickly. Social media has both intensive and extensive influences on individuals and groups (Ramos, 2017). Therefore, the theory of Social Media Interaction conceptualizes how health interaction can be influential in social media - both positively and negatively (Katz, 1974). Hence, effective usage can help people understand the role of social media in disseminating health information and influence personal health agendas and behaviors.

Related Literature

A fallacy is the use of invalid or otherwise faulty reasoning, or "wrong moves" in the construction of an argument. A fallacious argument may be deceptive by appearing to be better than it really is (Walton, 2010). On the other hand, medical fallacies connote the ways in which arguments may be used and abused in medicine and health. The central claim is that a group of arguments known as the informal fallacies – including slippery slope arguments, fear appeal, and the argument from ignorance – undertake considerable work in medical and health contexts, and that they can in fact be rationally warranted ways of understanding complex topics, contrary to the views of many earlier philosophers and logicians (Frans, 2009). Consequently, modern medicine and healthcare require lay people to engage with increasingly complex decisions in areas such as immunization, lifestyle and dietary choices, and health screening (Damer, 2009). Many of the so-called fallacies of reasoning can also be viewed as cognitive heuristics or short-cuts which help individuals make decisions in these contexts (West, et al 2007). Therefore, one wonders why despite the levels of education of the users, they still lack critical thinking, reasoning, logic, counter-argumentation and rhetoric.

Whereas the current discussion demonstrates that social media can make numerous contributions, such as job advertisements, missing and found people and property, medical experts from overseas to hand complex ailments, sometimes the quality of the information especially the medical remedies has confused social media users, thereby placing them in hazardous circumstances (Bustamente, et al 2015). Consequently, the fallacy of health-related information on social media has been consistent across the globe and popularity of social media usage uncontested. However, what has not been clear is the passive reading and usage of information that has
put users in unfamiliar situation. The authors therefore attributed passive usage of social media to be the lack of development education competencies by the users. Yet, it reinforces social media efficacy and promotes critical thinking of the users to enable them examine a series of misguided beliefs about social media (West and Turner, 2007). The implications of these health related fallacies on social media and their usage need to be acknowledged and addressed in order social media to attain its predicted benefits.

Social media is many things: announcements, whistle blowing, entertainment, education, networking, health interventions, just to name a few. Unfortunately, it is also a vehicle for promoting faulty thinking, and may actually lead to more detrimental consequences (Moreno, et al, 2013). West and Turner (2007), identified some forms of persuasion techniques, illogical argumentation and fallacious reasoning which users commonly encounter in my use of social media. By learning about these devices, you will be more likely to recognize their use, avoid using them yourself, and better assess arguments presented to you (van Eemeren, et al 2009). They include; Ad hominem, anecdotal evidence, an appeal to authority, an appeal to emotion, the bandwagon argument, and Social media is many things: announcements, whistle blowing, entertainment, education, networking, health interventions, just to name a few (van Eemeren, et al 2009). Unfortunately, it is also a vehicle for promoting faulty thinking, and may actually lead to more detrimental consequences. Considering that new media are digital, they inevitably have the characteristics of being manipulatable, networkable, dense, compressible, and interactive, which aids any information posted on social media spread like a “bush fire” (Flew and Smith, 2011). The emergence of new, digital technologies actually raises numerous questions of who is in control of information, sources, experience and resources” (Boudry, 2017).

Methodology

This paper majorly employed an ethnography inquiry and interactive synthesis as advocated by Creswell (2011). Considering the enigmatic nature of the topic, this design enabled summarization of existing research, which became confirmatory to behavior observed. Integrative synthesis provided more evidence that made comparison possible. In fact, an integrative synthesis was found to be the most suitable mode of inquiry for investigating social media usage patterns among the masses. Integrative synthesis also compensates for single-study weaknesses in research design according to Gall (1994). Further, it was also useful in improving internal and external validity of the various research findings, as supported by Kothari (2006). For this matter therefore, observation and documentary analyses were used to comprehend reasons social media users fail to employ logic before adopting the misinformation published. The analysis was guided by content and narrative analyses as well as histories and storytelling. Mugenda and Mugenda (1999) recommends this analysis especially when there isn’t much that has been scientifically proven. Histories and story-telling also were helpful in generating rejoinders that helped the authors arrive at the causes of passive reading. Although Creswell, (2013) recommends triangulation for quality purposes, quantitative approach was deemed inexpedient. Instead, the author resorted to more analytical and interactive techniques to unravel the reasons social media users do not employ a critical approach to analyze information published on social media.

Findings and Discussion

According to a survey conducted by Pew Research in 2018, Facebook and YouTube dominate the social media landscape for both the young and old, where, adults resort to social media for fast information, the young for employment, relationships and fun, whereas the sick resort to social media mostly for health remedies (West and
Turner, 2007). During the rapid growth of technology, social media seems to have overtaken other forms of media such as television, radio stations and newspapers, thereby causing so much excitement that has affected critical thinking of some users. Similarly, according to Flew and Smith (2011), 71% of the people around the world have adopted social media, especially; Facebook, Twitter and YouTube, for various reasons.

Nonetheless, although many times information on social media is useful, sources are often concealed, they use codes or fake names, they use pictorials instead of photos etc. Yet, Social media is about putting a personal face to promote one’s intentions and products. Although many “creators” of information have found Social media handy, especially in sharing useful information, others use face book with the intention to deceive them people, which surprisingly gives them pleasure. Walton (2010), also found that by deceiving people, they get more satisfaction by thinking they are so clever. However, Lieing (2018), found that the reason this deception goes on unabated, it is because it is easy to post information on social media and get away with it, because the chances of getting caught are quite small. Nonetheless, the authors found that most idlers enjoy this attention and sometimes sadism to watch users get into trouble especially as users try to save their lives. Considering that life so precious and with no “spare parts”, it can be understood that the users do it out of desperacy, because ‘health’ is extremely valued by everyone. What is confusing however, is that whereas the young and perhaps semi-illiterate can consume the information with little questioning, the highly educated too have been duped by such fallacy. Similarly, Frans, et al (2009), found that such fallacy had affected the area of unemployment, where the masqueraders post-employment opportunities abroad, on social media, where thousands of unsuspecting social media users have been duped.

Chronic diseases such as; diabetes, high blood pressure, gout, treatment, etc. have become a nightmare to the sufferers, leading them to resort to alternative remedies available. Maintaining blood sugar levels is part of managing diabetes (Advertising, 2009). Doctors often prescribe traditional treatments, like insulin injections to keep blood sugar levels normal. Some people with diabetes also use complementary and alternative therapies (Atherton and Majeed, 2011). Alternative treatments for diabetes include; herbs, supplements, diet, exercise and relaxation techniques among others. Similarly, it is no secret that exercise and a healthy diet are among the key ways to lower blood pressure. Incidentally, we found that after using conventional medication with no visible improvement, patients with chronic ailments resort to remedies published on social media which includes; face book, twitter, you tube etc. (Bustamente, et al 2015). Hence, the remedies with conflicting information is discussed in the following sub-section.

Consumption of Sugars

Sugar consumption has been widely acknowledging for being a danger to human species, although social media has exaggerated its hazards. The mainstream media can’t stop demonizing sugars, and this trickles down to general fear of sugars among the broader population, which is often expressed via social media (Chretien et al 2011). Often, misinformed statements regarding sugars, and how they are the cause of all ailments in the world, and in fact, blamed for causing obesity, diabetes, high blood pressure, cancer, ulcers etc. Oddly, whether the claims about the sentiments of sugar are valid or not, not many have bothered to seek clarification from medical practitioners in order to get the correct version of the actual benefits and dangers. Yet, majority of the users believe that sugars alone cause chronic disease - a belief that runs counter to the volumes of published literature on the subject, especially in social media (Dwyer, 2011). Comment after comment, have mentioned ‘unidentified studies’ that purportedly “proved” the dangers of sugars in and of themselves and how they cause diabetes,
hypertension, weight gain or obesity, among other adverse health effects (George, 2011). Nonetheless, as to whether sugar consumption is solely responsible for ill-health, has not been proven by any scientific investigation. In fact, Hawn, (2017), concluded that sugar can be consumed in moderate and balanced quantities, but does not call for total elimination. When it comes to social media, it’s easy to disagree without a second thought, although, we cannot find the right persons to argue with.

**Consumption of Water**

Consumption of water is the most controversial discussion on social media. Water is important for our overall health and wellness because hydration is essential for our organs and other bodily functions (Jones and Treiber, 2010). In fact, research has found that drinking adequate amount of water each day will benefit your body in ways you may not be aware of (Merchant et al 2011). Although drinking water has been found to be the healthiest habit you can have, some postings on social media have discouraged excessive consumption of water but with no clear measurements of how much is excessive. Nonetheless, Moreno, et al (2013), found that water has become the second most popular drink. However, social media recently published hard news that the benefits of drinking water may have been oversold (Ramos, 2017). Apparently, the old suggestion to drink eight glasses a day was nothing more than a guideline, not based on scientific evidence (Shrank, et al 2011). Issues of containers are often discussed in social media, such storing hot water in a plastic bottle or drinking left overs of water previously opened and left in the car. While we may not need eight glasses, there are plenty of reasons to drink water. In fact, drinking water (either plain or in the form of other fluids or foods) is essential to one’s health (Thompson, et al. 2008). The explain how water is a nutrient anybody desires present in liquids, plain water, and foods, and are essential for daily usage to replace the large amounts of water lost each day. Given that fluid losses occurs continuously, from skin evaporation, breathing, urine, and stool, and these losses must be replaced daily for good health, it is essential to consume adequate amounts of water on a daily basis (Walton, 2010). Nonetheless, although the source of information that gives us the upside, is the same that publishes the downside – sometimes with different codes instead of names. The postings often caution the consumers that “drinking too much of it (overhydration) can lead to water intoxication, and even results in hyponatremia, impaired brain function, and sometimes death (Yamout et al 2011). Whereas both unidentified publishers had genuine concerns and valid arguments, the ideal amount of water that should be consumed was never suggested. Often, doctors and dietitians advise that since 50% of adults are dehydrated, they should endeavour to keep hydrated by drinking ‘enough water’. This information too, is often misconstrued, and people end up drinking more water than their body actually needs. Further, often, the postings never provide symptoms of water intoxication and how it can be reversed. Surprisingly though, with all the users being enlightened and some medical professionals, no expert comes out to clear the confusion or conflicting information.

**Usage of Ginger**

Although not scientifically proven, there is some evidence that ginger can lower blood sugar levels, because it is the type of herb that people have used for thousands of years in traditional medicine systems (Damer, et al 2009). Ginger was found to help treat digestive and inflammatory issues. Yet, according to a study conducted by (Chou, et al 2009) in 2015, ginger was found to help in treating diabetes. According to this research, although ginger lowered blood sugar levels, but did not lower blood insulin levels. Whereas the published information on social media strongly recommends usage of ginger in every meal to treat digestive and inflammatory issues, other sources suggested that actually “ginger was dangerous to the stomach lining and had high potential of
destroying enzymes, thereby causing ulcers (August, 2017). Although evidently, information on the usage of ginger from different sources conflicts, users never consulted healthcare professional for the correct information. Nonetheless, although complementary medicine is used with conventional treatments, alternative medicine is used instead of conventional medicine. Another contradiction is that the dosage for alternative remedies is never prescribed, but users never even bother the implication of ‘open treatment’ (Bosslet et al 2012). Hence, although majority of users are enlightened or more so ‘educated’ the users rarely consult their physicians whether with complementary or alternative medicine.

**Honey Consumption**

World-wide, honey has been found to be a wonder drug which has been used for generations. The naturally sweet substance has so many benefits, ranging from cleansing the gut, soothing an irritated throat, working wonders for the skin, relieving sinus symptoms among many other benefits (Atherton and Majeed, 2011). Some publishers have advised that honey mixed with a glass of warm water right after waking up has numerous benefits (Bustamente, et al 2015). It is believed that this mixture keeps the body fresh, free from toxins and a healthy mind (Face Book, June, 2018). However, another publication on Face Book in February, 2019, cautions consumers of honey with the habit of drinking honey in hot beverages, to stop doing so as soon as possible. In fact, Jithin (2018), equates drinking honey in hot water or any hot substance to poison. Therefore, honey was beneficial in its natural goodness or in its raw form, because warm honey causes "ama" in the body - a kind of toxic substance which causes indigestion. Consequently, as honey slowly gets digested in the body, its properties turn similar to that of a poison, which in turn can lead to many different diseases (Chretien et al 2011; Ayurveda, 2018). This can be possible if consumers buy or extract honey from the source. The most dangerous honey, is honey imported from found in supermarkets. This honey bought from the supermarket, is usually preheated under extreme temperatures, heavily processed and mostly stored in plastic containers, which in itself makes it toxic to consume (Chou, et al 2009). Yet, social media keeps suggesting that honey is the “thing” and should be part of our everyday lives, without explaining the quantities, quality and packaging concerns.

**Lemon Water Consumption**

A glass of water with fresh lemon juice is for many people the perfect way to start the day. However, it really has health-related challenges. Many restaurants serve it routinely, and some people start their day with lemon water instead of coffee or tea, which is okay, because there are no doubt lemons are delicious. However, Damer, et al (2009), doubts whether adding lemon in water makes one healthier. Yet, much of the evidence supporting lemon water’s health benefits is anecdotal. The only information available therefore is what is posted in Social Media by unknown “scholars”. The origin of the concoction of lemon and hot water, has continued to be a mystery since there is no scientific claim to support this information. Literature can be the only remedy since postings on social media can only be substantiated by empirical research. Also expresses his concern about the lack of scientific research done specifically on lemon and hot water, yet, there is enormous health benefits of lemon and water separately. According to research, lemons are a source of vitamin C. In fact, studies have shown that vitamin C strengthens the immune system and protects against skin aging, infections and heart disease.

Lemon checks the excessive flow of bile and cleanses the mouth, helps in digestion and removes constipation, prevents vomiting, throat trouble, acidity and rheumatism, and destroys intestinal worms. Similarly, lemon-
juice is a powerful antibacterial that cures the bacteria of malaria, cholera, diphtheria, typhoid and other deadly diseases which get destroyed in lemon-juice (Deuze, 2007).

**Usage of Garlic**

Garlic is best had in its raw state, because consuming garlic on a daily basis (in food or raw) helps to lower cholesterol levels because of the anti-oxidant properties of Allicin. It is also immensely beneficial to regulate blood pressure and blood sugar levels (Fox, 2009). Garlic is used for many conditions related to the heart and blood system, which conditions include high blood pressure, low blood pressure, high cholesterol, inherited high cholesterol, coronary heart disease, heart attack, reduced blood flow due to narrowed arteries, and "hardening of the arteries" (atherosclerosis) (Darling-Hammond, 2008). Garlic can also be used to prevent colon cancer, rectal cancer, stomach cancer, breast cancer, prostate cancer, multiple myeloma, and lung cancer. It is also used to treat prostate cancer and bladder cancer. Garlic has been tried for treating an enlarged prostate, cystic fibrosis, diabetes, metabolic syndrome, osteoarthritis, hayfever (allergic rhinitis), traveler's diarrhea, high blood pressure late in pregnancy (pre-eclampsia), yeast infection, flu, and swine flu. It is also used to prevent tick bites, as a mosquito repellant, and for preventing the common cold, and treating and preventing bacterial and fungal infections. Garlic is also used for earaches, chronic fatigue syndrome, menstrual disorders, abnormal cholesterol levels caused by HIV drugs, hepatitis, shortness of breath related to liver disease. Others uses include; treatment of fever, coughs, headache, stomach ache, sinus congestion, gout, joint pain, hemorrhoids, asthma, bronchitis, shortness of breath, low blood sugar, snakebites, diarrhea and bloody diarrhea, tuberculosis, bloody urine, a serious nose and throat infection called diphtheria, whooping cough, tooth sensitivity, stomach inflammation (gastritis), scalp ringworm, and a sexually transmitted disease called vaginal trichomoniasis, fighting stress and fatigue, treating skin and nails, warts, and corns (Dwyer, 2011). Nonetheless, with all the health benefits mentioned above, eating too much garlic can also have adverse effects such as ulcers, cancer of the stomach, gastrointestinal discomfort, bloating, diarrhea, indigestion and pain in the stomach. Yet, these claims are not supported by empirical evidence, which makes it difficult to adopt it wholesale. While the available information does not suggest an upper limit of garlic consumption, it takes cognizant of the side effects that may exist from eating raw garlic such as an upset stomach (Fox and Purcell 2009). Other users of course resent garlic because of bad breath if you continue to eat more garlic. According to Frans, et al (2009), garlic increases the potential of developing skin lesions where you came in contact with the garlic, they recommend wearing protective gloves. George (2011), further identified garlic as a potential trigger for headaches. Therefore, people who suffer from frequent headaches may want to avoid using garlic. By possibly lowering blood pressure, cholesterol and the initial effects of atherosclerosis, garlic can contribute to a heart-healthy diet much as the lowering or burning of fat may.

**Consumption of Aloe Vera**

Aloe Vera juice might cause your blood sugar levels to drop. It has laxative effects, which may up the chances of electrolyte imbalance in diabetics. Stomach discomfort is one of the most common side effects of drinking aloe vera juice. The latex can cause excessive cramps and pain in the tummy (Flew and Smith, 2011). Aloe vera is an ingredient that barely needs an introduction. It is a rage in the beauty and health world, and all thanks to the presence of numerous medicinal properties. There is no denying the fact that it is loaded with nutrients, and there are chances that aloe vera may not suit your body, skin or hair, which can further lead to side effects. Many people are allergic to the wonder plant (Jones and Treiber, 2010). Whereas aloe vera may have numerous
benefits, it has diverse implications which include; latex which comes from underneath the plant's skin, it causes skin allergies, redness in the eyes, skin rashes, irritation and burning sensation (Kahneman, 2011). Aloe vera also leads to the drop of blood sugar levels, lead to dehydration, lowers the levels of potassium in the body, further causing irregular heartbeat, weakness and fatigue, especially in the elderly and sick people. Aloe vera is further discouraged among pregnant women and lactating mothers due to its irritant qualities that stimulates uterine contractions in pregnant women, which may lead to birth complications. Similarly, the bio-active compounds in aloe vera might interfere with liver's detoxification process, further causing health complications. With all these health related challenges, such information is never packaged together for the user, yet even users never bother to consult competent professionals.

**Consumption of Green Tea**

Although there are little to no known side effects or contraindications to drinking green tea for adults, the dosage is never provided. However, green tea has the following risks or complications should be made clear: Caffeine sensitivity - those with severe caffeine sensitivities could experience insomnia, anxiety, irritability, nausea, or upset stomach (Katz, 1974). Green team is “suspected” to lower cancer prevalence rates. Yet, it is impossible to ascertain such claims since there could be other variables responsible for reduced cancer occurrences. Researchers found that it is the high level of polyphenols in tea that helps kill cancerous cells and stop them from growing. However, the exact mechanisms by which tea interacts with cancerous cells is unknown. Nonetheless, other studies have not found that tea can reduce cancer risk. The amount of tea required for cancer-preventive effects also varies widely in studies (Walton, 2010).

**General Discussion**

Wrong medication can lead to permanent ailments or even death. Currently, research has found that 12% of wrong medication are due to misuse because of lack of information or sometimes wrong information (Tomas, et al 2012). Whereas most beneficiaries of health remedies posted on Facebook are at the same time permanently of conventional treatment, they receive little or no information of combining the two remedies or even other types of prescription in case one is taking both. Similarly, Walton (2010), found that even those on one type of treatment sometimes get frustrated and either practice ‘self-medication’ or ‘take. Yet, taking the wrong medication or taking the right medication but in wrong dozes or timing can also lead to harmful side effects (Boudry, 2017 & Tomas, et al. 2012). Research has shown that whichever mismanagement or wrong dosage with medication – herbal accessed on social media or conventional from hospital, can lead to organ failure, and even death (Jones and Treiber, 2010). Unfortunately, although Facebook is blamed for wrong medication, we found mishaps even among those on conventional medication. Nonetheless, wrong or inconclusive health-related information has been found to pause challenges among the users (Tomas, et al. 2012). This is because taking the wrong medication can exacerbate one’s health conditions. Sometimes medication mistakes are not mistakes at all, but are actually administered incorrectly on purpose. This happens when caregivers are trying to improperly sedate a patient and when nursing home staff is trying to illegally steal or reallocate medication. In fact, Culberson and Ziska (2008), found that error in medication does not always stem from wrong information, but even concealment of previous history and current medical status can lead to undesired consequences. Further, there are many reasons why mistakes occur among the health challenged persons. This may include, but not limited to; over-the-counter drugs, food and vitamin interactions, or timing and dosage (Jones and Treiber, 2010).
Generally, although information on social media spreads like a bush fire, surpassing sometimes the creators, recent articles have implicated medical professionals as especially nurses and para-medics for being responsible (Tomas, et al 2012). Notably, stories invoking the “dangers” of social media have particularly been condemned for the misjudgments of errant health professionals; however, they also often implicate the privacy control problems that have dogged social media, especially hazardous to users from the health professions (Walton, 2010). Academic literature has also been found to replete with admonishments of how social media are dangerously breaching the old “boundary markers” of medicine, which has enabled all manner of distasteful content to be publically posted sometimes by healthcare providers - leading to disastrous consequences (Culberson and Ziska, 2008). Consequently, the overall tone and content has focused on the risks rather than the benefits of social media and concentrated on the misuse rather than consideration of how technologies might be used in a positive manner (Jones and Treiber, 2010). Regardless the approach, the implications of posting wrong, misguided or inconclusive information have had diverse negative implications to the unsuspecting users of social media.

**Conclusion and Recommendation**

While users hastily embrace such remedies, genuine medical professionals remain adamant to such claims, yet such information is often conflicting. Nonetheless, the remedies are quickly embraced on conviction of their popular appeals. Yet, without any scientific method, it is difficult to discourage such. Unfortunately, most victims lack deep-seated psychological and effective logical and critical analysis. Nonetheless, human challenges are diverse, and that human beings respond to some of the health remedies differently. We therefore conclude that the reason medical practitioners do not respond to the fallacies, it because they make assumptions that the users are intelligible enough to apply logical reasoning and can only use such remedies in consultation with physicians. Similarly, the reason the users never critique such information is because they possess superior skills in their arguments and can really persuade the users to ‘see their side’ of the argument. Whereas there is nothing wrong with trying to persuade someone else to look at a topic from their perspective, it would be more trusted and believed if there was credible evidence to support their claims or assertions. The lack of strong emphasis on ‘Development Education’ in Ugandan educational system, that lacks a focus on critical pedagogy and processes of learning that would have made major contribution to these debates is unfortunately weak. Yet, ‘education’ is pivotal for development in a rapidly changing world’ and the need to place greater emphasis on the social role of education in enabling ‘people to fulfill their individual potential and to contribute to the economic, political and social transformation of their countries. Consequently, development education as a form of emancipatory and dialogical learning is based on “critical humanist pedagogy” – which unfortunately, most social media users lack. Such dialogical education, therefore, is where learners should ideally pose problems, enquire and seek solutions - collaboratively. Although this approach is an open and ongoing enquiry, aimed at liberating us from servitude and instilling mutual respect and trust, social media users who seek alternative healthy remedies have not applied critical thinking.

**References**


Modahl, M., Tompsett, L., Moorhead, T. (2011). Doctors, Patients & Social Media. QuantiaMD,


E-Government and Public Administration- initiatives and challenges facing Malawi’s Public Sector

Mustafa Kennedy Hussein  
Associate Professor, Department of Political and Administrative Studies,  
University of Malawi, Chancellor College  
E-mail: Mkhussein2012@gmail.com or mhussein@cc.ac.mw

Abstract  
The advancements in information and communication technologies have spurred the integration of e-government initiatives into public administration to achieve national development. Over the years development blueprints in Malawi have highlighted the adoption of e-government as a means to strengthen public service delivery and democratic Read Technology Acceptance Model indices. This study which is based on literature review and key informant interviews analyses e-government initiatives undertaken and the implementation challenges facing Malawi’s public sector. The paper contends that although e-government initiatives have been undertaken in various government ministries and departments, pragmatic capacity building strategies are required in order to address challenges such as the lack of political will, inadequate qualified personnel and digital divide for efficient and effective e-government services. It is concluded e-government projects should be introduced in the broader context of promoting governance. The major concerns must include entrenching efficiency, transparency and accountability in public service delivery as well as effective interaction between government, citizens and businesses through website sites and personalised information services.  

Key words: E-Government, Information and Communication Technologies, Transparency, Accountability

Introduction  
This paper analyses the various initiatives and challenges of E-Government. The rapid advancements in Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) have led to the growth of e-government (electronic government) practices. There is increasing recognition by both the developed and developing countries regarding the need for the public sector reforms to integrate electronic government (E-government) to achieve national development agendas. In Malawi, almost every development blueprint including the Malawi Growth and Development Strategy II and the public sector reform report—Public Service Reforms: Making Malawi Work—point to the need for utilization of ICT and E-Government in the delivery of public goods and services and in strengthening democracy through citizen participation. Despite all these efforts, the United Nations E-Government Survey 2016 ranks Malawi low in many fronts. For example, it ranks 166 in E-Government Index Development, 127 in E-Participation, and shows poorly on telecommunication infrastructure index. This raises question which include: what is the significance of e-government, what are the major e-government initiatives in Malawi? Why does Malawi rank so low e-government infrastructure index? These questions motivated this study whose findings are presented in this paper, which is divided into seven parts. The paper starts with the introduction in part one. This followed by a review of the theoretical and conceptual underpinnings relating to e-government in part two. In part three, an overview of the significance of e-government in public administration is presented. In part four, the policy and legal framework for e-government in in Malawi is highlighted. In part five, the methodology adopted in this study is presented. This is followed by part six where the finding of study relating to the various e-government initiatives in Malawi and the challenges facing the promotion of effective e-government are discussed. Finally pat seven presents the concluding remarks.
Theoretical Framework and Conceptual Underpinnings

There is a wide variety of definitions of e-government (Electronic government). These include the use of information and communication technology (ICT) such as internet and satellite in public sector organisations to deliver efficient and cost effective public services, information and knowledge (ITU, 2017). According to Kumar et al., (2007) e-government is about the use of information and communication technologies in government to provide public services to improve managerial effectiveness and to promote democratic values and mechanisms and a regulatory framework that facilitates information intensive initiatives and fosters the knowledge society. Henry (2013) argues that it is an introduction of government’s website and portals that furnish information and facilitate services for users. According to Dada(2006) it is the use of ICT especially web-based application to enhance access to and efficiently deliver government information and services use of information and communication technologies with the aim of improving information and service delivery, encourage citizen participation in decision making process and making government accountable, transparent and effective (Nyondo, 2013). E government is also defined as the use of electronic processes by citizens, businesses, and the government to communicate, disseminate and gather information, to facilitate payments, and to carry out permitting in an online environment and the use by government agencies of information technologies such as Wide Area Networks, the Internet, and mobile computing that have the ability to transform relations with citizens, businesses, and other branches of government (Makoza, 2012). Despite the differences in definitions of e-government it boils down to the use of information technology, and especially the internet, to improve the delivery of government services to citizens, businesses, and other government agencies, allow greater public access to information, and make government more accountable and transparent.

Significance of E-Government in Public Administration

The emergence of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) has provided means for faster and better communication, efficient storage, retrieval and processing of data and exchange and utilisation of information to its users which include individuals, groups, businesses, organizations or governments. E-government leads to faster and more equitable development with a wider reach; raises awareness among citizens about their rights and openness and transparency and accountability regarding government activities. One of the benefits of e-government is that it simplifies the process of information gathering for citizens and businesses and it empowers people to gather information regarding any department of government and get involved in the process of decision making (Bichler, 2008). Gartner (2000) argues that e-government transforms the way government agencies engage with citizens, businesses and other governments. ; improved good governance Similarly, ITU (2008) states that e-Government improves the utilization of scarce resources, enhances accountability and transparency, expands the role of markets, and restores citizen trust and faith in government. Governments across the globe are employing Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) to improve delivery of public services, inclusion of stakeholders in decision making and reducing administrative costs (Bwalya & Healey, 2010). In public administration, ICT is recognized as a powerful tool of ensuring transparency through open information and simplified work processes (Song, 2004). It eliminates paperwork (Printing) to electronic and digitized transactions; increases access to information through websites developed by ministries and departments which enables citizens to have access to documents such as publications, reports and updates on government activities and important information from the government. Thus e-government is significant in public administration since it improves administrative efficiency in delivery of services, promote public participation in decisions and actions for government, and encourage political accountability and policy effectiveness.
Policy and Institutional Framework for E-Government in Malawi

The legal and policy framework of E-Government is provided by the Science and Technology Act of 2008, the National ICT Policy, the amended Communications Act 2016 as well as the Electronic Transactions and Cybercrime Act 2016. However, the main policy document is the National ICT Policy that states that the use of ICT in government is critical for the enhancement of accountability and promotion of equitable allocation and distribution of public resources. It recognizes the crucial role ICT plays in government particularly in improving the efficiency in the delivery of quality public services to the general public. In 2011 Government of Malawi established the E-Government Department of Information Systems and Technology Management Services (DISTMS) under the Office of the President and Cabinet two divisions namely, policy planning and programmes and information system and technology management service According to Nyondo (2013) the department is in all ministries and departments through Information and Communication Technology units and it works closely with the Ministry of Local Government which has Management Information Systems Officers (MISos) in all District Councils). Its mandate is to improve delivery of public services and to lead, coordinate and manage information and communication Technology (ICT) for modern and improved efficiency of public services.

The Malawi’s National ICT Policy (2013: 9) confirms that “the use of ICTs enhances accountability, promotes equitable allocation and distribution of public resources and improves the efficiency and the delivery of quality service to the general public”. According to the Public Service Reform Commission (2015: 30), E-Government is important in to Malawi due to among others reasons, that it helps create an efficient civil service, enable citizens access services far away from the capital by using technology-efficient centres and improve the transparency of government, making it responsive and more accountable, and even reduce corruption.

Methodology

The study adopted a qualitative approach in order to gain an in-depth understanding of the narratives in the area of e-government. The existing literature which included journal papers, conference papers, books, official reports and internet was systematically reviewed to collate all empirical evidence to answer questions relating to significance of e-government as well as initiatives and challenges facing e-government. This was supplemented by key informant interviews which was conducted with purposively selected experts to solicit their views on the on the questions relating to e-government. This methodology was adopted with a view to minimise bias and provide reliable findings from which conclusion can be drawn. It was deemed the most appropriate method for the research area since it required a comprehensive understanding of practical dimensions relating to e-government.

Findings and Discussion

The e-government initiatives in Malawi revealed by this study are presented following Gartner (2000)’s four stage model which describes the models starting with digital interaction between government and other government agencies, between government to customer, government and businesses, and government to employees (IST- Africa, 2015).

Government to government (G2G)

The Government to Government (G2G) involves sharing information and conducting electronic transactions between governmental actors. As such, information is shared between these three departments to ensure transparent transactions are made, hence, minimizing fraud. These are e government initiatives that involve digital interaction between government agencies, or using internet technologies between and among government agencies. In 2004 implementation of e-government came to its peak at national level when government
implemented it in the nine priority areas of health, agriculture, transport and communication. The Ministry of Information is in charge of laying out of ICT infrastructure in the Telecommunication sector for successful exploitation in all sectors of the economy to obtain better results. Network to connect all government buildings was also implemented forming a network that provides internet and email services as well as highway for information sharing and online transaction within government((Mtingwi & Van Belle, 2012). The overall goal is to provide a good environment for electronic government in the promotion of transparency and accountability. The initiatives include:

**Integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS)**

This is a computer software system established in the ministry of finance which provides timely and accurate financial information and comprehensive data on ministerial and departmental activities, expenditures and policies while enforcing standardised integrated financial management reporting system for government (Deloitte, 2012: 79). All of the government ministries with the exception of local government are on the IFMIS and the majority of the government budget is processed through the system. This system presents the activities and expenditures done by government for easier and faster reporting among other things. According to Deloitte (2012: 80) the improved reporting capability contributes to greater accountability, transparency, fiscal discipline and minimized fraud as every transaction together with the authorization of the transaction made by the departments linked to the system is clearly shown.

**Government to Customer (G2C)**

The Government to customer (C2G) model constitutes the areas where a customer (citizen, consumer or client) interacts with the government electronically, providing them with updated information, process documents for them or advertise tender notices, and other services online. This is a telecommunication infrastructure development through the establishment of telecentres in several rural areas of the country through International Telecommunication Union (ITU), World Bank and Malawi Post Office support. The ICT enabled applications such as e-education, e-agriculture and e-health (IST-Africa, 2015). The Malawi Police Service website allows for citizens to report crime information anonymously. Similarly, the Office of the Ombudsman also allows people to lodge complaints through their web page against any government department for the suffering of administrative injustice. This form of exchange of information is effective for both citizens and government because citizens can report cases faster and the government minimizes risk of losing vital papers such as report archives.

**E-Health Projects**

Baobab Health Trust, a Malawian Non-Governmental organisation (NGO) is working with the Ministry of Health to design and utilise medical informatics to replace traditional paper based systems to help healthcare workers to register patients and aggregating essential data for improved healthcare management to facilitate efficient patient care. They supplementing traditional delivery of services and channels of communication in ways that extend the healthcare organization's ability to meet the needs of its patients. Electronic Medical Records System, Health Management Information and Mobile e-health projects under the ministry of health System (Malanga, 2017). This aims at transforming advances in e-Health and empower computer-literate public and to increase health partnership electronic systems; health portals, physician web pages and e-mail were devised to breed new consumers and redefining the physician/patient relationship. The Health sector also use Mobile Health through the use of mobile devises such as phones for the collection, analysis and sharing of
information with the patient. The tele-healthcare allows the use of ICTs in providing health care from a distance. E-Health in Malawi has enhanced access to information and resources, empowerment of patients to make informed healthcare decisions, streamlined organizational processes and transactions, and improved quality, value, and patient satisfaction.

**Education and e-Learning projects/The Pan African e-Network**

It is a Tele education connectivity which enables 5 African regional Universities including the University of Malawi (Chancellor College) to be connected to a hub through satellite to 53 remote virtual classes distributed in all 53 countries. 7 Universities from India are connected to the hub located in Africa. The Government of India has established the e-Network through 3 centres in Malawi – eLearning at Chancellor College, Telemedicine at Kamuzu Central Hospital and e-VVIP at the State House. This project includes the promotion of ICT in education system in order to improve both the access and the quality of education, improve management of education systems and improve ICT literacy. It also promotes integrated library and information services and networks in both academic and public libraries. Computer for African Schools implemented by British Council and Ministry of Education by providing training in ICT to teachers, and providing computers and printers to schools and develop ICT Curriculum for schools.

**E-Immigration**

The Malawi Immigration Department has introduced a computer based system machine readable passport issuing system which is a fully integrated turnkey passport issuing system incorporating state-of-the-art biometric enrolment, issuing software, and Toppan digital passport printers. In addition, the Department has launched a new ICT innovation border control system in at its international airports and major boarders, called the Integrated Border Control System, as part of its objective for computerize all its border posts and currently implementing the e-Permit project with the aim to automate the permit issuance system as a way to ease the way of doing business in Malawi among others (IST- Africa, 2015). It includes national registration and identification system, sharable geographic information system, electronic document management system.

**Government to Businesses (G2B)**

The Government to businesses (G2B) initiatives are include the one stop service centre under the Ministry of Industry and Trade where approvals, permits and registration, are provided within a single shelter to enhance efficiency and product security. On October 22, 2015, Malawi joined the Extractives Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI) which according to [https://eiti.org](https://eiti.org) is a global standard that promotes open and accountable management of extractive industries. However the major initiatives are discussed below:-

**Malawi Revenue Authority**

This is the country’s major revenue collection body which in June this year (2017), launched three E-Government innovations—ASYCUDA World, E-Payment, an electronic system called ASYCUDA that enables customers issue their payment online which immediately update on customers tax account (MRA Annual Report, 2016). This innovation reduces time spent by tax payers, queueing in banks and save many from punitive penalty as they can pay tax from anywhere at any time and Quick Response (QR) Codes—as part of public service modernization. Automated System for Customs Data (ASYCUDA) World and E-Payment will enable importers, clearing agents and taxpayers to commence and complete tax and customs transactions online (Malanga, 2017).

**Malawi Traffic Management Information System (MalTIS)**
The road traffic directorate under ministry of Transport and Public Works introduced a system called Malawi Traffic Information System (MalTIS). This system is used for capturing, processing, storage of traffic information. It is also used for the issuance of driver’s license, motor vehicle license and permits, road permits and weigh bridge data (DRTSS Annual Report, 2016). MalTIS is also used to register vehicle electronically with an integration of three government agency; Malawi Revenue Authority, Directorate of Road Traffic and Safety Services and the Malawi Police Services. It facilitates motor vehicle registration, issuing of driving license and road permits. (IST- Malawi, 2015). The system reduces operational costs, improves record keeping and improved quality of business environment and reduces the possibility of corruption and bribery.

Electronic Legislation
This project aims at supporting policy and legislative reforms and provide affordable Internet capacity to the nation and the Judiciary Case Management Systems (JCMIS) under the ministry of Justice and Constitutional Affairs. It is managed by Private Public Partnership Commission in partnership with MACRA and the e-Government Department. Pan African e-Network), aimed at setting up a responsive ICT Legal framework to facilitate competition, development and participation of Malawi in the Information Society and more particularly the legislation (IST- Africa, 2015). In a similar initiative, the citizens will also be able to use mobile phone facility to access the justice system in the country, and this follows the launch in April this year of Open Trial Smartphone Application.

Government to Employees (G2E)

The Payroll and Human Resource Management System purchased by the Government which aims to overhaul the locally developed government establishment, personnel, payroll, pensions, loans management (PPPAI) that was initiated in 1998-99. The notable example is the introduction the human resources payroll system. The presence of internet in government offices improves administrative efficiency by enhancing transparency and accountability as well as creating fast and cost effective communication system (Gondwe, 2012).

Challenges of E-Government in Malawi

Despite all these efforts, the United Nations E-Government Survey 2016 ranks Malawi low in in e-government. For example, it ranks 166 in E-Government Index Development, 127 in E-Participation, and shows poorly on telecommunication infrastructure index. The study established that the major challenges facing the promotion of e-government in public administration include the lack of political will, legal constraints due to the lack of proper policies and Laws in the ICT Industry; lack of strong political and bureaucratic leadership, lack of proper ICT skills; digital divide due to low literacy levels and accessibility of the ICT services and inadequate finance for the high cost of the ICT infrastructure. These are discussed below:-

The legal constraints is the first challenge facing the implementation of e- government initiatives. E- Government does not have a very clear legal structure and frame work to work on. The Internet is guided by three different types of laws: access laws; security laws; and content protection or intellectual property law. The lack of harmonised legal structure and frame work to protect the privacy and security of data, to balance free access with society’s expectations creates conflict among different pieces of legislation practiced by different government agencies. Hence, one of the challenges of integration of the e-government services is that of privacy. Mtingwi (2012) observes that Malawians are concerned with privacy when their information is shared and organisations have the duty to ensure that the information is shared with high security because failure of which would result in loss of confidentiality.
The political and bureaucratic leadership regards E-government initiative as secondary activity evidenced by inadequate funding allocated to e-government. According to Bwalya and Healy (2010) the leadership is biased in its budget allocation towards development activities which enable ruling parties gain political millage for instance construction of roads, bridges, schools. There is lack of a champion or someone prominent, holding a higher position in leadership (political leadership) to lead in the promotion of an E-Government. This is compounded by the nature of bureaucracy characterised by red tape, and low management autonomy which affects in policy implementation such as in E-Government initiatives. The bureaucracy shows resistance to embrace change from a tradition way of doing things to a modern one has proved to be a challenge nearly in all societies and find it is very hard to believe in machines (National ICT policy, 2009).

Another challenge is the lack of adequate qualified staff and inadequate human resources training, ICT skills and professional ICT officers in the civil service affects the provision of technical support system (ICT Policy; 2013). This is evident in the lack of technical expertise equipped with skills and knowledge to maintain installed systems. The skills and knowledge of workers are not well managed in terms of trainings and other courses to impart ICT skills and knowledge to new blood to succeed the old workers (National ICT policy, 2009). The inability to manage and maintain human skills and knowledge makes sustainability of E-government initiative difficult to be realized due to improper transition of work force hence impede implementation of E-government in Malawi. Bwalya (2000) confirms that the lack of human, technological and management capacities has affected the successful e-government implementation. The websites for government departments are not updated regularly which gives the citizens old information.

The digital divide and disparity in access to Information and Communication Technologies (ICTS) leads to uneven distribution and accessed by all parties (Mtingwi & Belle 2002). The disparity in the way people access ICT service lower the levels civic engagement by citizens. The digital divide is made worse by relatively high levels of illiteracy. Malawi has a population of 17,215,000 in which adult literacy rate is 62.14 (Gondwe, 2012). Such a fabric is worrisome because the basics of IT require some basic literacy. This is aggravated by low budgetary allocation to research and development, and poor ICT infrastructure also aggravate the problem of the digital divide. Not all citizens in Malawi have equal access to computers and internet, whether due to a lack of financial resources, necessary skills, and lack of awareness by the public about e-government projects especially in the rural areas which affects the capability of citizens to use ICT is also a challenge in Malawi (Makoza, 2013: 270), those who do not have access to the internet might not be able to benefit from the information posted online.

Finally, the lack of adequate finances is another challenge evident low budgets allocation to e-government initiatives and ICT infrastructure and dependence on development partners such as the World Bank for IFMIS and Chinese government. Thus there is the lack of heavy infrastructure investment to implement the system. For instance, the IFMIS initiative and the Road Traffic linkage with MRA and Malawi Police Service required substantial capital investment in order to connect centers that are not currently connected to the system. The intermittent Power Supply affecting Malawi currently affects the effective functioning of electronic systems since they are dependent on stable power supply (Gondwe, 2012).

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, effective e-government in public administration and management are contingent not only on structural changes but also on the available capacity in terms of infrastructure (office equipment), quality and quantity of human resources, and financial resources. In order to ensure provision of tangible e-government development projects and quality services intensive capacity development is paramount. Although e-government
initiatives have been undertaken in various government ministries and departments, pragmatic capacity building strategies are required in order to address challenges such as the lack of political will, inadequate qualified personnel and digital divide for efficient and effective e-government services. The various e-government projects should be introduced with particular focus on e-democracy. The major concerns must include entrenching efficiency, transparency and accountability in public service delivery as well as effective interaction between government, citizens and businesses through website sites and personalised information services.

References


Mtingwi J and J.P.V Belle: The state of E-Government and M-Government Readiness in Malawi, South Africa; University of Cape Town from http://oen.uct.ac.z.bilstream/item12267 accessed on 12 Oct 2017


E-Governance and Service Delivery in Uganda: Lessons from Selected Districts in Northern Uganda

Etuka Isaac Joakino, Stella Kyohairwe & Godfrey Mbabazi
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
This study investigated the influence of e-Government on service delivery in four selected districts in Northern Uganda. The study was guided by three objectives, namely; to assess the influence of e-government strategies on access to services by the citizens, to assess the influence of e-government strategies on the quality of service delivery and to examine the influence e-government strategies in enhancing accountability in service delivery in Northern Uganda. The study employed a cross-sectional study design which was both quantitative and qualitative in nature. The study was done among 148 technocrats and 12 political leaders from four districts in Northern Uganda. Technocrats were selected using simple random sampling while political leaders were selected using purposive sampling technique. Data was collected using questionnaire and interview guide. The findings of the study indicate that access to e-government services in the selected districts is still low. Although they have well-functioning websites, they do not deliver most services electronically. Despite the low access, the study found out that the implementation of e-government has reduced the time taken to process transactions. It also shows that e-government has improved the quality of service in selected districts. Electronic governance has increased the speed with which citizens are served. The study also found out that e-government has improved public accountability since annual and quarterly accountability of local government are made electronically and the public have access all financial transactions of their local government. The study identifies unstable power supply, poor network, limited capacity and shortage of computers as major hindrances to adoption and use of e-government. The study findings point to the needs for capacity building, increased power supply, network improvement and supply of more computers to district local governments to improve the performance of e-government.

Key words: E-Governance, Access to Services, Service Delivery

Introduction
E-government denotes the use of information and communication technologies (ICT), in particular, the Internet technology as a tool to achieve clear, transparent and efficient government (OECD, 2003). Electronic government has been a priority throughout the world for more than 25 years, viewed as a critical tool for efficient and effective public services. Evidence in the developed world reveals a number of successes; various reports demonstrate that this form of governance has led to improvements in economic development, services, and the quality of governance. However, studies also indicate that more than 85% of e-government projects in developing countries can be classified as partial or total failures (Harfouche & Robbin, 2015). Majority of citizens in developing countries do not use the Internet and thus e-services, although an infrastructure exists. Heeks and others contend, however, that these failures derive from the gap between design of the technology and its implementation context. There is no doubt that the digital revolution which has its roots in the developed world is spreading hastily across the developing world.

E-government gained triumph in Uganda after the final feasibility study report for the National ICT Action plan and e-government network by MEGA TECH, inc. in collaboration with techno brain – Uganda Limited. A draft Uganda e-government strategy framework of January 2007 that was initiated by NPA then in bid to adhere to the EAC e-government regional initiative recommendation that each of the member states of the community had to develop their national level e-government strategies (National e-government frame work; June 2010:4). Some of the Uganda’s e-government projects include; the Uganda e-government strategy (March
Uganda’s positive impression of E-government is based on her desire to continuously improve the efficiency of, and access to government information and services to meet citizens’ expectations. According to the National e-government framework (June 2010:11), some of the challenges facing e-government include; cyber-crime and cyber terrorism; undefined cross-border jurisdiction for cyber litigation, reliance on imported hardware and software; reliance on foreign funding, un-harmonized ICT policies and strategies, inadequate infrastructure, adverse cultural beliefs and languages; inadequate funding, inadequate human resources and inadequate Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) framework (National e-Government framework-Uganda, 2010).

Countries worldwide, Uganda inclusive have continued to invest in e-governance on the premise that it is associated with greater efficiency and effectiveness in service delivery (Schiavetta, 2005) and allows government to interact and communicate with the public, businesses and others (Wimmer and Traunmuller, 2004). However, it is not obvious for e-government to improve service delivery in district local government due to numerous limitations such as illiteracy, access to ICT, lack of skills and low economic status of citizens. Besides, there is very little information on the extent to which e-governance has improved on service delivery to citizens in district local government including Arua (Heeks, 2003).

E-governance has been adopted by Uganda as an essence of good governance. On its inception, Uganda Government developed strategic documents to embrace e – government among which include the final feasibility study report for the National ICT Action Plan and e – Government Net Work (2006), Uganda National ICT Policy Frame Work (2003) and the National Information Technology Policy (2009). Under this arrangement, District Local Government should be able to recruit on-line, procure on-line, provide information on all services and report on line. Despite the increasing efforts, investments and numerous projects initiated by the government of Uganda to promote e-government, the extent to which implementation of e-government has improved access, quality of service and accountability in District Local Governments remains a matter of debate. This study therefore seeks to answer these questions Uganda using lessons from four selected districts in Northern Uganda.

**Methodology**

This study utilized data sourced from a cross-sectional study conducted among 148 Local Government staffs from four districts selected randomly from Northern Uganda. Simple random technique was used to select 148 technical staffs from four districts in Northern Uganda, namely; Abim, Lira, Gulu and Zombo. Respondents were selected from different departments including Health department, Finance, Administration, District Service Commission, Information department, Education and Sports, procurement, works and transport and Community Based Services department. Purposive sampling was used to choose 3 political leaders from each of the four districts making a total of 12 respondents. Structured questionnaire and interview guide were used to collect data from technical staff and political leaders respectively. Before data collection, four graduate research assistants were trained for 4 days, research instruments were pre-tested and improved prior to use in the target population. Quantitative data analysis was done using SPSS version 16 understand the influence of e-government on service delivery in Northern Uganda.

**Findings of the Study**

This section of the study presents findings of characteristics of respondents, access to e-governance services, quality of service delivery and accountability in four selected in District Local Governments. Further, the
association between access to e-government and access, quality of service delivery and accountability are assessed.

Table 1: Characteristics of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Frequency (N=148)</th>
<th>Percentage (100%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Districts of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abim</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>24.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lira</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>27.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gulu</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>23.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zombo</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>24.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>65.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>34.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-24</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>35.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>39.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 and above</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highest Qualification of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-graduate</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>33.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's Degree</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>40.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>17.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Department of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Service Commission</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>22.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and sports</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Based Services</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production and Marketing</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works and Transport</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procurement</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Years of Experience of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than one year</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-3 years</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>29.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 3 years</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>61.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The findings indicate that majority respondents (27.7%) are from Lira district and the minority respondents (23.6%) were from Gulu district. The majority (65.5%) of the respondents are male and only (34.5%) are female. Most of the respondents (39.2%) are found in between 35-44 years of age and the minority (8.1%) between 15-24 years of age. Majority of the respondents’ (40.5%) highest qualification was a Bachelor’s Degree and the least (8.8%) with a Certificate. Majority (22.3%) of the respondents work in Administration and the least (3.4%) in Education and Sports, Community Based Services and Procurement. Most of the respondents (61.5%) have more than 3 years of experience and the least (8.8%) with less than one year of experience.

**Accessibility of E-Government Services**

Respondents were asked indicate whether information on the following services were provided online to the public. The findings of the study are presented in table 2 below;

**Table 2: Accessibility of E-Government Services**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Some Information</th>
<th>All Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides information on health services on-line</td>
<td>14 (9.5%)</td>
<td>103 (69.6%)</td>
<td>31 (20.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all information on education on-line</td>
<td>23 (15.5%)</td>
<td>96 (64.9%)</td>
<td>29 (19.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all information on infrastructure on-line</td>
<td>47 (31.8%)</td>
<td>84 (56.8%)</td>
<td>17 (11.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all political information on-line</td>
<td>86 (58.1%)</td>
<td>54 (36.5%)</td>
<td>8 (5.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all information on agriculture on-line</td>
<td>18 (12.2%)</td>
<td>104 (70.3%)</td>
<td>26 (17.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all information on procurement on-line</td>
<td>19 (12.8%)</td>
<td>91 (61.5%)</td>
<td>38 (25.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all information on recruitment on-line</td>
<td>26 (17.6%)</td>
<td>93 (62.8%)</td>
<td>29 (19.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Local government provides all information on finances on-line</td>
<td>51 (34.5%)</td>
<td>74 (50%)</td>
<td>23 (15.5%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The findings indicate that majority respondents (69.6%) reported that their local governments provide some information on health services on-line. When asked about information on education on-line, the majority respondents (64.9%) reported their local governments providing some information. Most of the respondents (56.8%) reported provision of some information on infrastructure on-line by their local governments. However, (58.1%) respondents’ local governments provided no political information at all on-line. When asked about information on agriculture on-line, the majority respondents (70.3%) reported their local governments provide some information on agriculture on-line. About information on procurement on-line, majority (61.6%) respondents reported some information being provided by their local governments. The majority (62.8%) respondents reported that their local governments have provided some information on recruitment on-line. Also, majority (50%) respondents’ local governments only provided some information on finances on-line.

**4.2 Rating accessibility to e-government services**

Respondents were asked to rate access to e-government services in their districts and the findings are presented in figure below according to the districts;
Figure 1: rating access to e-government services

Results in figure above indicate that majority of respondents from Abim (44.4%) and Gulu (65.7%) districts rated that access to e-government services as fairly accessible. Majority of respondents in Zombo reported that e-government services are poorly accessible (40.5%) while majority of respondents in Lira districts indicated that e-government services are very accessible (36.6%)

4.3 Awareness of e-government systems

Respondents were asked to mention all the e-government systems available in their districts and the findings of the study are presented in figure 2 below;

Figure 2: Respondent’s awareness of E-Government Services Available in the District
Results in figure above indicate that the most mentioned e-government systems among the respondents was Integrated Financial Management System (98%), followed by Health Information Management System (73.6%) while the least mentioned system was Electronic Records Management System (45.9%).

4.4 Influence of e-governance on quality of service delivery

This was one of the objectives of this study which was aimed at examining the relationships between e-government strategies and quality in service delivery. In order to achieve this objective, respondents were asked to indicate their agreement or disagreements with numerous statements related to the relationship between e-government strategies and quality in service delivery. The findings of the study are presented in below;

Table 2: e-government strategies and quality of service delivery in Northern Uganda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements E-Government Strategies and Quality Of Service Delivery</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our citizens are satisfied with delivery of education, health, agricultural and other services at the district</td>
<td>14(9.5%)</td>
<td>34(23%)</td>
<td>26(17.6%)</td>
<td>60(40.5%)</td>
<td>14(9.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of e-government has improved record Management</td>
<td>5(3.4%)</td>
<td>50(33.8%)</td>
<td>26(17.6%)</td>
<td>44(29.7%)</td>
<td>23(15.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of e-government has enabled citizens to access some facilities online</td>
<td>31(20.9%)</td>
<td>18(12.2%)</td>
<td>36(24.3%)</td>
<td>49(33.1%)</td>
<td>14(9.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of e-government has increased the speed with which citizens are served</td>
<td>15(10.1%)</td>
<td>43(29.1%)</td>
<td>26(17.6%)</td>
<td>41(27.7%)</td>
<td>23(15.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e-services has led to user satisfaction in our local government</td>
<td>14(9.5%)</td>
<td>37(25%)</td>
<td>30(20.3%)</td>
<td>46(31.1%)</td>
<td>21(14.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-government has improved quality of service delivery in this district</td>
<td>16(10.8%)</td>
<td>32(21.6%)</td>
<td>30(20.2)</td>
<td>49(33.1%)</td>
<td>21(14.2%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results from table above show that when respondents were asked whether their citizens are satisfied with delivery of education, health, agricultural and other services at the district, majority of the respondents agreed (50%) compared to about 32.5% who disagreed. On whether implementation of e-government has improved record Management at the district, about 45.2% agreed with statement while about 37.8% disagreed. About 40% of the respondents agreed with the view that implementation of e-government has enabled citizens to access some facilities online.

The findings also indicate that implementation of e-government has increased the speed with which citizens are served represented by 43.2% of the total responses. Similarly e-services have led to user satisfaction in our local government. In general, findings indicate majority of the respondents are in agreement with the view that e-government has improved quality of service delivery in this district.
Rating of Quality of Service Delivery

In order to understand the quality of service delivery in different districts, respondents were asked to rate the quality of service delivery in their districts and the findings are presented below:

![Figure 3: Rating Quality of Service Delivery in the District](image)

Respondents were also asked to rate the quality of service delivery in their district, other than Zombo, respondents from all districts indicated that the quality of service delivery is fair (55.6% in Abim, 73.2% in Lira and 82.9% in Gulu). In general, 53.4% of the total number of respondents indicated that the quality of service delivery is poor in their districts.

Effectiveness of E-Governance in Promoting Accountability

This was also aimed at examining the effectiveness of e-governance in enhancing public accountability. Respondents were asked to show their agreement or disagreement with numerous statements related to the effectiveness of e-governance in enhancing public accountability. The findings are presented in table indicated below;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements on E-Government and Accountability</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The public is able to access all financial transactions of your local government</td>
<td>19(12.8%)</td>
<td>53(35.8%)</td>
<td>32(21.6%)</td>
<td>26(17.6%)</td>
<td>18(12.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your pay roll is managed electronically</td>
<td>3(2.0%)</td>
<td>9(6.1%)</td>
<td>18(12.2%)</td>
<td>53(35.8%)</td>
<td>65(41.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual and quarterly accountability of your local government is done electronically</td>
<td>5(3.4%)</td>
<td>21(14.2%)</td>
<td>32(21.6%)</td>
<td>65(43.9%)</td>
<td>25(16.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgets and accountability is available for public view and comments</td>
<td>22(14.9%)</td>
<td>40(27%)</td>
<td>29(19.6%)</td>
<td>42(28.4%)</td>
<td>15(10.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-government has led to transparency in your local government</td>
<td>12(8.1%)</td>
<td>64(43.2%)</td>
<td>34(23%)</td>
<td>35(23.6%)</td>
<td>3(2%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Statements on E-Government and Accountability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>e-government has increased community involvement in your local government</td>
<td>19(27.1%)</td>
<td>18(25.7%)</td>
<td>26(37.1%)</td>
<td>7(10%)</td>
<td>0(0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e-government has led to timely accountability in your local government</td>
<td>7(4.7%)</td>
<td>25(16.9%)</td>
<td>57(38.5%)</td>
<td>38(25.7%)</td>
<td>21(14.2%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The findings presented in table above indicate that majority (48.6%) of the respondents disagreed with the statement that e-governance has enabled public to access all financial transactions of their local government. However, the findings report almost universal acceptance that local government payroll is managed electronically since about 75% of the respondents agreed with the statements.

The findings also indicate that majority of respondents, about 60% agreed with statement that annual and quarterly accountability of local government is done electronically. Similarly, majority of respondents agreed with the view that budgets and accountability are available for public views and comments. However, majority of the respondents disagreed with the view that e-governance has led to transparency in local government. When asked whether e-governance has increased community involvement in local governance, majority of the respondents disagreed with the view. The findings of this study also show that majority of the respondents (39%) agreed with the view that e-governance has led to timely accountability in local government.

5.0 Challenges of E-Governance in Northern Uganda

Respondents were asked to mention challenges facing e-governance in their districts and the findings are presented in figure below;

![Figure 4: Challenges of E-Governance in N. Uganda](image)

Results in table above indicate that the most mentioned challenges of e-governance in Northern Uganda are unstable network, power shortage, restricted use and shortage of computers at the district offices.

710 |
Suggested Solutions

In relation to the challenges, respondents were asked to suggest ways through which the challenges of e-governance can be addressed and the findings are presented in figure below;

![Strategies to overcome challenges of e-governance and service delivery](image)

**Figure 5: Strategies to Overcome Challenges of E-Governance**

The findings presented in figure above indicate that building the capacity of user was mentioned more times as a strategy for overcoming challenges of e-governance and service delivery in local government represented by 52.9% of the total number of responses. The respondents also suggested use of alternative sources of power other than electricity represented 51.4% of the total number of responses. The respondents also suggested improvement in internet connection (21.4%), reducing cost of computers and internet (14.3%), providing e-governance equipment (12.9%), reporting system failure to Central government (7.1%), budgeting and spending according to cash limit (7.1%), recruitment of ICT personnel (4.3%) and improving the E-Systems (4.3%).

**Discussions**

This study examines the influence of e-governance on service delivery in Northern Uganda. The study holds the view that adoption of e-governance is critical in promoting access, quality and accountability in government’s service delivery. Despite its importance, this study finds that access to e-government services in Northern Uganda is still low. The District Local Government staffs are aware of the e-government systems such as Integrated Financial Management Systems, Integrated Personnel Management System and Health Management Information System. However, the systems have not been fully used to deliver services to the people because of several limitations such as unreliable internet, shortage of computers, shortage of skills among staffs and citizens. This finding is in line with the findings of Matavire et al., (2010) who identifies access problems such as mental access, skills access, material access and usage. Besides, use of electronic services such as integrated financial management system, integrated personnel management system, health management information system, e-procurement and performance monitoring management information system was recorded.

In relation to the access challenges to e-government services such as unstable network, power shortage, lack of knowledge, high cost of maintaining machines, shortage of computers, congestion in the system, negative
attitudes towards the system and lack of control by user departments; Braa, Monteiro & Sahay, (2004) noted that ICT’s in the developing world are often naively adopted without sufficient consideration of the social, cultural and historical context in which implementation occurs. Kitaw (2006) goes on to add literacy levels to the list of challenges, stating that low literacy levels hinder the types of media available for e-Government implementations.

From the four selected districts, the finds that e-governance allows citizens to access services on-line, leaders to user satisfaction and increases the speed at which citizens are served. This finding point to the fact that e-governance has improved the quality of service delivery Northern Uganda based on the level of adoption. This findings concur with findings of Ndou (2004) who pointed out that Application of ICT allows a government’s internal and external communication to gain speed, precision, simplicity, outreach and networking capacity, which can then be converted into cost reductions and increased effectiveness.

This study point to the fact that e-government is effective in enhancing accountability among local governments. The findings of this of this study also indicate that e-governance has improves public accountability it has enabled public to access all financial transactions of their local government. The local government pay roll is now managed electronically. Annual and quarterly accountability of local government is also done electronically. The e-governance has enabled budgets and accountability to be available for public views and comments. The findings of this study is in line with Sharma, (2007) who asserted that e-government is an inclusion of all applications of information and communication technologies that improve efficiency, effectiveness, transparency and accountability of daily administration of government. However, majority of the respondents disagreed with the view that e-governance has led to transparency in local government and that e-governance has increased community involvement in local governance, majority of the respondents.

Conclusions

Based on the findings, the study concludes that access to e-government services in Northern Uganda is still low. Although the districts have well-functioning websites, they do not deliver most services electronically and besides, access to internet remains a major barrier. Although access to e-government services is still low, the electronic governance has increased the speed with which citizens are served and generally the quality of service delivery. The study also found out that e-governance has improved public accountability since annual and quarterly accountability of local government are made electronically and the public have access all financial transactions of their local government. Unstable network, power shortage, limited capacity and shortage of computers are major barriers to adoption of e-governance in Northern Uganda. Training of Local Government Staff, improving power supply and provision of e-equipment to district offices will go a long ways in accelerating adoption of e-governance in districts local governments in Uganda.

References


Harindranath and Jonathan Liebenau (1993); Information technology policies and applications in


Suandi and Chong (1989); The HDB experience in automation. Information Technology for Development.

Fukumaya (1999); Social capital and civil society; the Institute of public policy, George Mason University; (Washington D.C; IMF).


Lau (2003); Challenges for e-Government development, 5th global forum reinventing government, Mexico City, 5th November 2003, OECD e-Government project.


Matavire and Brown (2008); Investigating the use of “Grounded Theory” in Information Systems Research., In Proceedings of the 2008 annual research conference of the South African Institute of Computer Scientists and Information Technologists.


Gupta (1990); IT Initiatives in South East Asia in Information Technology for development.


Karla and Stiglitz (2009); Modern Economic Theory and Development. India


Towards Social Media Ethical Standards for Information Professionals in Kenya

Lucy Kibe & Tom Kwanya
Department of Information and Knowledge Management
The Technical University of Kenya
Corresponding E-mail: kibelucy871@gmail.com or tom.kwanya@gmail.com

Abstract

This paper analyses the social media ethical issues information professionals should deal with and proposes ethical standards for their consideration. This study was conducted as an exploratory research because social media is a new phenomenon. Primary data was collected through structured interviews with registered members of the Kenya Library Association (KLA) and Kenya Archives and Records Management Association (KARMA). Secondary data on the integration of issues relating to social media into existing ethical standards of information professional associations was collected through documentary analysis. Data was analysed and presented using descriptive statistics. The findings reveal that the majority of the information professionals in Kenya use WhatsApp and Facebook platforms for either current awareness or information sharing. The ethical issues they encounter include fake news, lack of authenticity of content, and vulgarism. To deal with the ethical issues most of the professionals tend to filter the content online while others do not just take social media seriously. The authors propose a set of standards to provide guidance on ethical issues such as confidentiality, defamation, privacy, disclosure, honesty, professionalism, intellectual property, accountability, impartiality and decency. The findings of this study may be used by information professional associations in Kenya to develop a code of ethics to guide their members on the use of social media to design and deliver information services and products.

Keywords: Social Media, Deliver Information Services, Information Professionals

Introduction

According to Kidder (2003), ethics are moral principles that govern a person’s behaviour for conducting an activity. The principles deal with human characters and behaviours. Paul and Elder (2006) define ethics as a set of concepts and principles that guide people in determining what behaviour helps or harms perceptive creatures. Ethics can also be perceived as well-founded standards of right and wrong that prescribe what humans ought to do, usually in terms of rights, obligations, benefits to society, fairness, or specific virtues.

Ethical standards are values that promote good behaviour, fairness, and/or kindness. There is not one consistent set of standards that all professions follow. Therefore, each profession usually develops standards that are meaningful for the practitioners therein (Kakabadse, Korac-Kakabadse & Kouzmin, 2003). According to Reamer (2013) ethical standards also include the characters that enjoin virtues of honesty, compassion, and loyalty. Ethical standards relate to rights such as the right to life, the right to freedom from injury, and the right to privacy. Such standards must be supported by consistent and well-founded reasons to be useful to the professionals.

According to Nperez (2013) social media is the collective set of online communication channels dedicated to community-based input, interaction, content-sharing, and collaboration. Examples of social media platforms include micro-blogging, social networks, social curation, social bookmarking and wiki tools. Social media is constantly changing and has created an ethical grey area for information professionals. Given that professionals need to stay current with new technologies to foster skills and appreciate professional advancement, they should be careful when using social media so as to avoid advancing any personal interest and to avoid invading into anyone’s privacy. According to Jason (2010) social media tools can be categorised as 1) communication tools
such as blogs, micro-blogs, social networking and events; 2) collaboration tools like wikis, social news and bookmarking/tagging; 3) multimedia platforms including video, photography, music/audio sharing and presentation sharing and live casting; and 4) entertainment sites such as media platforms, virtual worlds and game sharing.

Social media exhibit unique characteristics when compared to traditional media. These characteristics include:

- Its speed and scope of reach implying that once content is published it is available instantaneously to a potentially global audience.
- Social media tools tend to be free or available at a very low cost compared to other forms of media. Similarly, they do not require users to have advanced technical knowledge because they are simple and easy to use. This feature enables social media to attract larger numbers of users to access and publish material than is the case with traditional media.
- Social media is usually interactive in a way that traditional media is not. So, users can comment on and edit published materials thereby making it difficult to control its content.
- Social media blurs private/public boundaries when individuals’ personal information and opinions enter the public domain. The boundaries between personal and work life also become blurred as companies make use of social media (originally designed for personal use) for business purposes, and likewise employees access personal sites while at work.

2 Ethical Challenges emanating from the use of Social Media

The following issues are encountered by social media users and need to be addressed to enable them to make ethical use of the tools:

Integrity Risk

According to Picazo-Vela, Gutiérrez-Martínez and Luna-Reyes (2012), the use of social media brings about issues relating to honesty and trustworthiness. If a user applies social media in an irresponsible way either on behalf of the organisation they work for or through their personal social media account, it can undermine the organisation’s commitment to ethical practice and expose it to integrity risks. It is upon professionals to provide reasonable and suitable information and service quality consistent with the level of importance of the information. Attaining this may involve clearly identifying the limitations inherent in the information dissemination product such as the possibility of errors, degree of reliability, and validity as well as taking reasonable steps to remove the same.

Invasion of Privacy

The actions that break the law or terms of privacy of any user of social network harm that individual’s personal or professional credibility. Such actions should be considered unethical. The invasion of privacy may include any non-permissive approach taken to get any kind of personal or any other kind of information about an individual which can harm him or affect him in any sense (Sánchez, Levin & Del, 2012). While discussing social media ethics, behavioural targeting is also an area of concern. Behavioural targeting involves advertisers tracking people’s shopping behaviours and click through patterns which they use to retarget campaigns. The positive point is that the viewers may appreciate the relevance of the material being advertised to them but this is a kind of invasion of privacy. A similar breach of privacy occurs when marketers give their email lists to Facebook which matches those lists to the emails which are registered with them for targeting.
Spamming

Over-publicising unasked promotional messages is also considered as an unethical act based on how this is being done. In spamming, users are usually bombarded with a kind of information which does not interest them. Spamming may also involve disseminating high volumes of information to the extent that the information is no longer useful (Bowen, 2013). In this situation, information which the user may require gets under the pile and may get ignored because of that useless pile of spam. From the user’s perspective, this is obviously unethical.

Public Bashing

Solis and Breakenridge (2009) explain that while using social networks, people think that they are private and that they can express anything they want to but they are not as private as they think. Disapproving one’s competitors in social networking sites is considered unethical because of its broad range of negative impacts. Once a user posts something, it is not theirs anymore and it can go viral as fast as a fire in the forest without their control. Such posts may not only affect the poster’s organisational reputation but can also affect the person or company being disparaged. This kind of behaviour can also raise a risk for legal lawsuits.

Dishonesty and Distortion

There is no fair enough method to validate the honesty and authenticity of social media activities of users. It is unethical to be dishonest about anything on social media. So, making dishonest claims about oneself or anything else or commenting on offensive material is unethical. By engaging in such activities one stands a risk of denting their own personal reputation and their organisations.

Improper Anonymity and Distorted Endorsements

According to Christie and Dill (2016), if one represents himself using wrong affiliations, credentials or expertise, it is unethical. Similarly, hiring people to comment favourably or using fabricated stories about one’s company or one’s products is also considered unethical. Exaggerating competitive deficiencies is also unethical.

Misuse of Free Expertise and Contests

With the increasing extensive use of Facebook contests and other crowd-sourcing methods for soliciting design ideas, the participants stand the risk of giving their secrets away with no reward. Most of the times, only the design ideas of the most profitable partners of the social network sponsor are rewarded leaving many others with unrewarded work. This abuse is especially unethical if the sponsor knowingly gathers superior design ideas from contestants they have no intention of compensating.

Rationale and Methodology of Study

The world has become more interactive through increased access and use of the Internet and social media tools. Web 2.0 has pushed the Internet beyond information storage to a place where dialogue takes precedence (Sawmiller, 2010). Social media and other Internet tools that facilitate online interactions have the potential to further expand such dialogues. Information professionals use social media tools to report information, present opinions, and solicit conversations in their own knowledge domains. This online interaction, enabled further by an increase in the access to smart-phones and networked tablet devices, poses the risk of personal and professional lives crossing in social media spaces. Literature exists on ethical challenges of social media in professional practices with patrons as well as the use of social media as an expansion of research and online
learning (Eccles, 2010; Giffords, 2009). However, literature around ethical use of social media by information professionals is scanty. Areas in which greater discussion is needed include ethical uses of social media and the effects of personal use of social media among professionals. This study advocates social media ethical standards for information professionals. The specific objectives of the study were to 1) explore the different types of social media tools used by information professionals; 2) examine the different uses of social media tools among information professionals; 3) analyse the ethical challenges faced by information professionals during the use of the social media tools and 4) explore the ethical standards they follow in the course of their social media use.

This study was designed as a qualitative survey to assess the ethical issues surrounding the use of social media platforms by information professionals in Kenya. Primary data was collected through online interviews using questionnaires hosted on Google Forms. The study targeted the information professionals that are registered members of either Kenya Library Association (KLA) or Kenya Association of Records Managers and Archivists (KARMA). At the time of the study, KLA membership stood at 118 while KARMA had 420 registered members. Therefore, the total population of the study was 538. Using the concept of “information power” proposed by Malterud, Siersma and Guassora (2016), the authors focused less on the numerical input of the participants. Conversely, they considered the new knowledge contributed by each participant more than the volume of the contribution. Information power indicates that the more information the sample holds, relevant for the actual study, the lower the number of participants is needed. Consequently, the authors initially targeted 10% of the population which was 54 participants. The actual respondents were selected from the population using information-oriented purposive sampling. The researchers distributed the questionnaires to all the selected respondents using email. The data was analysed using SPSS and presented using descriptive statistics. Additional data about challenges faced using social media platforms was collected through documentary analysis.

**Findings and Discussions**

A total of 48 respondents completed the questionnaire. The findings from the questionnaires are presented and discussed hereunder.

**Social Media Platforms**

The findings indicate that the majority of the respondents use WhatsApp (94%) and Facebook (90%) platforms for their personal and professional communication. The other social media platforms used by at least 50% of the information professionals in Kenya include LinkedIn (69%), Wikipedia (69%) and twitter (67%). Table 1 presents the complete list of the social media platforms used by information professionals in Kenya. These findings reveal a social media usage pattern which is similar to the general trends in Kenya identified by other researchers (Ogaji et al., 2017; Sindani, 2017; Gichora & Kwanya, 2015; Jännti, 2015; Musakali and Nyamasege, 2015).
Table 1: Social media platforms used by information professionals in Kenya

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Media Platforms</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WhatsApp</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facebook</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LinkedIn</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wikipedia</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twitter</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academia.edu</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ResearchGate</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blogs</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wikis</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>48</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research data

Use of the Social Media Platforms

Information professionals in Kenya use social media platforms for current awareness, sharing information, networking, academics, content access, social mobilisation, document storage, marketing, publishing, and content creation. Table 2 summarises these findings.

Table 2: How Information Professionals in Kenya use Social Media

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uses of the Social Media Platforms</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current awareness</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing information</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networking</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic work</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content access</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social mobilisation</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document storage</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishing</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content creation</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>48</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research data

From Table 2, it is evident that most information professionals use social media platforms for current awareness and information sharing. Given that content creation (17%) and publishing (25%) are the least uses of social media, it implies that the information shared by the majority (90%) of the information professionals is from other sources. Thus, on social media, information professionals are largely consumers rather than creators of content. Nonetheless, all the uses of social media are prone to unethical behaviour hence the need of ethical standards.
**Ethical issues Experienced in Social Media**

The ethical issues information professionals experience in the course of their social media use include fake news, lack of authenticity of content, vulgarism, ethnic and religious bias, copyright infringement, impersonation, privacy infringement, spamming, violence, security violation, lack of integrity, cyber bullying, and cybercrime. Table 3 summarises these findings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical issues in using Social Media Platforms</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fake news</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of authenticity</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vulgarism</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic/religious bias</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copyright infringement</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impersonation</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Privacy infringement</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spamming</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security violation</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of integrity</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyber bullying</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyber crime</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>N= 48</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research data

It is clear from Table 3 that fake news is the most prevalent ethical issue information professionals in Kenya encounter. Prevalence of fake news has grown in the recent past especially as a consequence of political competition exemplified by the 2017 presidential elections in the country (Ouma, 2018; Kamau, 2017; Mutahi & Kimari, 2017). The second most prevalent ethical issue encountered by information professionals in Kenya is lack of authenticity of content. These findings reveal that the greatest ethical challenge the use of social media portends is low credibility of its content. This affects the believability of the information circulating on social media. The value of social media for personal or professional communication is dependent on the credibility of its content. There is urgent need to address these authenticity challenges through ethical standards.

**Managing the Ethical Issues**

Information professionals in Kenya cope with the ethical issues emerging from their social media use by being indifferent to social media; filtering content; using ethical standards; acknowledging sources of information used; espousing informed consent; using creative commons licences; embracing anonymity; avoiding social media; and using legislation. Table 4 summarises these findings.
Table 4: How information professionals in Kenya cope with Ethical Issues on Social Media

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coping with Ethical Issues in Social Media</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Apathy</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content filtration</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of ethical standards</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgement</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informed consent</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of creative commons</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymity</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoidance of social media</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>N= 48</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research data

Ethical Standard for Social Media use amongst Information Professionals in Kenya

Based on the findings and discussions presented above, the authors propose ethical social media standards consisting of the elements highlighted in Table 5 for consideration by information professionals in Kenya:

Table 5: Proposed Social Media Ethical Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Issue</th>
<th>Standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confidentiality</td>
<td>No reference or disclosure of users and employer’s confidential information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defamation</td>
<td>Social media should not be used as a way of disclosing for wider scrutiny a concern within a professional context, such as in a “whistle blowing” scenario.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Privacy</td>
<td>Only collect and share information which is useful to the purpose(s) for which informed consent has been obtained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure/informed consent</td>
<td>Make sure that all users and professionals know who they are conversing with; the users should be informed early and requested to sign a suitable disclosure agreement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty/transparency</td>
<td>When commenting in a personal capacity about any other persons or organisations; be transparent about who you are working for, representing or speaking on behalf of.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy</td>
<td>Social media posts should be accurate, fact-checked and capable of evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionalism</td>
<td>Always act in a professional and constructive manner and use sound judgment before posting anything on social media.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respectful/reputation</td>
<td>Never post malicious, misleading or unfair content about your organisation, colleagues, competitors or other stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intellectual property/copyright</td>
<td>Respect other people’s intellectual property including trademarked names and slogans as well as other copyrighted material. Make sure you have permission to post copyrighted items; properly attribute the work to the copyright owner where required; and never use someone else’s work as if it is your own.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility/accountability</td>
<td>Always abide by the terms of use of the social media platform you use and adhere to the cultural and behavioural norms on the particular platform.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impartiality</td>
<td>Be neutral when dealing with the users online; let there be no biasness when providing information or serving the users.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decency</td>
<td>Use trade language in social media; do not post content that is obscene, threatening or discriminatory of an individual or organisation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusion**

Social media is the new wave in the communication universe. Information professionals are not left behind in using this new technology. Most of them use platforms such as WhatsApp and Facebook for either current awareness or information sharing. However, the same platforms have brought about ethical issues such as emergent fake news, lack of authenticity, and vulgarism. To deal with these ethical issues most of the information professionals tend to be indifferent to social media or attempt to filter its content. Despite the numerous ethical concerns brought about by the emergence of social media, most information professionals cannot afford to ignore this technology and its potential for increasing their capacity to serve and engage with their clients better. Information professionals can use ethical standards safeguarding confidentiality, privacy, informed consent, transparency, accuracy, professionalism, respect, copyrights, and decency. They must also be cognisant to the fact that a digital footprint affects their reputation within the profession and beyond. They should shape their social media presence by engaging and using a professional tone which upholds ethical standards while also protecting user communities.

**References**


Determinants of E-Marketing Adoption by Small and Medium Enterprises in African Countries: A Literature Review

Margareth Amon Mapunda
Assistant Lecturer, Department of Marketing, College of Business Education, P. O. Box 1968, Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania, Email: m.mapunda@cbe.ac.tz

Abstract
Electronic-marketing (e-marketing) is one of the fastest growing forms of digital marketing in both developed and developing countries including Africa. Most of the Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) adopted e-marketing to enhance business performance and competitiveness. However, e-marketing adoption rate by SMEs in African countries has been very low. This study, therefore, intended to synthesize determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries. Specifically, it assesses the kinds of e-marketing adopted by SMEs in African countries; and examines the determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries. A comprehensive review of e-marketing related empirical literature in Africa and data were analyzed using Microsoft Excel. The findings revealed that (14) African countries adopted e-marketing with four kinds of e-marketing which includes: ICT in 9 countries (64%); e-marketing in 3 countries (22%); online marketing and web marketing in 1 country (7%) each respectively. Similarly, three significant determinants of e-marketing adoption in African countries were identified which include: IT skills, knowledge, and education (64%); IT infrastructure and facilities (57); and e-marketing awareness (50). The study implies that, the SMEs sector in African countries needs to focus on these key significant determinants of e-marketing to enhance their competitiveness and business performance as a whole.

Keywords: Adoption, E-Marketing, digital marketing, online marketing, ICT, SMEs, Africa

Introduction
Electronic-marketing (e-marketing) is one of the fastest growing forms of digital marketing in both developed and developing countries (Kalu, Nto, & Nwadighoha, 2017). It provides opportunities for business enterprises to attract new customers and reach the existing ones more effectively (Taiminen & Karjaluoto, 2015). E-marketing has been defined by various scholars, for example, Iddris and Ibrahim, (2015) described e-marketing as the integration of electronic communication technology and traditional marketing media to acquire and deliver services to customers. According to Shaltoni, West, Alnawas, and Shatnawi, (2018), the term e-marketing includes, but not limited to: digital marketing, internet marketing, online marketing, and social media marketing. In various business enterprises including Small and Medium and Enterprises (SMEs) e-marketing appears to be one of the most significant aspect for achieving competitive advantage through business efficiency and marketing improvement (Chong, Man, & Kim, 2018). Studies show that, in developing countries, particularly Africa, SMEs makes more than 90% of the businesses and employs about 60% of the workers’ population (ITC report, 2018). Despite the importance of e-marketing to SMEs, the number of SMEs adopted e-marketing is still low leading to limited application of the technology (Eze and CO, 2017).

E-marketing application by SMEs is very important for enhancing marketing practices in order to gain and sustain competitiveness. However, this technology seems to be new for the SMEs in the developing countries where lack knowledge of proper implementation is a great setback (Sheikh, Shahzad, & Ishak, 2016). Thus leading to its limited application. Njau and Karugu (2014) supplement that, limited application of e-marketing by the majority of SMEs in Kenya is due to the high development costs, and lack of knowledge on how it improves business performance. In addition, El-Gohary (2012) identified that, limited resources, bad infrastructure, stiff competition, readiness of the owners to take risky investment and the newness of e-
marketing are the main obstacles limiting the application of e-marketing by SMEs in the developing countries. Since SMEs are the main employer in African countries, the use modern technologies like e-marketing cannot be escaped. Therefore, SMEs need to apply e-marketing technology in order to improve the adoption rate, gain competitiveness, as well as to explore various business opportunities.

Previous studies reveal that e-marketing is playing a vital role regarding the SMEs’ performance and competitiveness. For instance, Chong et al. (2018) found that e-marketing has a significant impact on business performance and marketing improvement among SMEs in Asian countries. Similarly, Eid and El-Gohary (2013) findings revealed that, e-marketing tools positively influence pre-sale and after sales activities, marketing performance as well as effectiveness among SMEs in the United Kingdom. On the other hand, Odimmega, Udegbunam, Ile, and Azu, (2016) found that inadequate communication infrastructures, high internet connectivity expenses, and inadequate power supply were the main obstacles to e-marketing adoption by SMEs in the Nigerian context. In the same situation, Nkosana, Skinner, and Goodier (2016) revealed that, set up costs, owners’ lack of IT knowledge and employees’ lack of IT skills were the challenges in adoption and utilization of e-marketing on SMEs at KwaZulu Natal Midlands in South Africa.

Collectively, these studies highlight the benefits and challenges in e-marketing adoption by SMEs in developed and developing countries, particularly United Kingdom, Asia and Africa. Despite the benefits and potential of e-marketing, its adoption rate by SMEs in African countries is still low (Chube, 2015; Maduku, 2015; Wilson & Makau, 2018). In addition, few studies have been done to assess e-marketing implementation in SMEs (Iddris & Ibrahim, 2015). Given this situation, this study aimed to synthesize determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries by reviewing the relevant empirical literature. The study used the following specific objectives:

i. To assess the kinds of e-marketing adopted by SMEs in African countries;

ii. To examine the determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries.

Review of Related Empirical Studies on E-Marketing Adoption
Several studies have been conducted worldwide regarding the determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs. For instance, Leeflang, Verhoef, Dahl trom, and Freundt, (2014) carried out a survey to assess the digital era challenges and solutions in marketing across the world. They found that, customer insights, digital metrics, intimidating power of social media, and increasing the talent gap were the main challenges in adopting digital marketing by firms from multiple industries in Europe and North America. Similarly, Fan (2016) conducted a study to investigate factors affecting adoption of digital business in Australia. The study findings revealed that, lack of understanding on the relevance of digital business by SMEs, absence of digital strategies, lack of skills and perceived cost, and risk of change were the main issues affecting adoption of digital business in the country.

In addition, Teixeira, et al. (2018) conducted a literature review to identify the determinants of digital marketing adoption by Portuguese SMEs. The results revealed that, limited knowledge on digital marketing, difficulty in recruiting and training skilled professional, as well as the existing decrease of the price associated with outstanding digital marketing service, are perceived to be the obstacles in the implementation of digital marketing by SMEs in the country.

Kurian, Asokan, and Dham, (2019) undertook a study to analyse the combination of social media marketing and SMEs in Singapore. They found that, lack of training and lack of knowledge to the SMEs’ employees, were
some of the factors affecting the adoption of social media marketing in their enterprises which results to the underutilization of business potentials in the country.

Yaseen, Al-Adwan, and Al-Madadha, (2019) carried a research to determine the level of digital marketing adoption among SMEs in Jordan. Their findings revealed that, limited usage of social media and email, lack of human skills, lack of awareness on digital marketing, and lack of technological tools were the main factors affecting the adoption the technology in the country.

Dahnil, Marzuki, Langkat, and Fabeil, (2014) reviewed academic literature on factors that drive social media marketing adoption in SMEs and organizations. Their results were categorized under internal and external factors. Under internal factors, end users influence, top management decisions, limited resources, and lack of understanding on technology were the main determinants in the adoption of social media marketing. On the other hand, external factors were grouped under business environment which include; government influence, policy, market trend, and globalization.

Bakari, Jongur, and Kanire, (2014) conducted an empirical study to understand how e-marketing can improve the strategic marketing in SMEs in the manufacturing sector in Tanzania. Their findings revealed that, there is low adoption rate of e-marketing by SMEs in their operations due to: lack of technology awareness, scarce resources, as well as the culture to fear risks and change.

Based on the reviewed empirical studies related to e-marketing, various scholars (Kurian, et al., 2019; Yaseen, et al., 2019; Fan, 2016; Bakari, et al., 2014; Leeflang, et al., 2014) examined various factors related to e-marketing adoption using empirical literature in developed as well as in developing countries. However, limited studies have been done using literature review which include those of Teixeira, et al. (2018) and Dahnil, et al. (2014). Thus, this study is an attempt to fill this research gap by conducting a literature search on the determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries.

Research Methodology
This article is based on a specified literature review with the objective to synthesize significant literature related to determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries. The inclusion and exclusion criteria for selecting the articles were set. This paper adopted a quantitative approach in which descriptive analysis was used. A literature review was conducted with the aim to extract the most frequently mentioned determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in Africa. Variables in this study were identified from fourteen (14) selected literature in an African business environment. In order to measure the magnitude of the determinants of e-marketing, adoption, the literature was selected based on their relevance and suitability of the topic under the study.

Data Sources
The main source of data for this study was scholarly articles accessed through the following search engines: Google Scholars, Google Search Engine, Google Books, Sage Publications, Emerald Insights, Taylor and Francis, Wiley online, Science Direct, Dissertations Reports, and Conference Proceedings.

Search Key Words
The following set of keywords was used to search determinants for e-marketing adoption among SMEs in African countries. (“E-marketing” OR “Internet marketing” “intranet” OR “extranet” “Mobile marketing” OR “Web-marketing” OR “Email-marketing” OR “Social media marketing” OR “Online-marketing” OR “ICT” OR
“Digital marketing”) and ("Small and Medium Enterprises” OR "Microenterprises” OR " Small Businesses”) AND ("Africa” OR “North Africa” OR “East Africa” OR “ West Africa” OR “ Developing Countries” OR “Ethiopia” OR “ Tunisia” OR “ Egypt” OR “ Nigeria” OR “Ghana” and other African countries).

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria
The search was limited to e-marketing research papers written in English, otherwise they were excluded. The literature was bounded to the SMEs that adopted e-marketing or ICT in African countries. The study included the e-marketing/ICT papers written since 2014 because during this time internet penetration rate was the lowest in Africa based on the International Telecommunication Union Report (ITU, 2014). In addition, the study was restricted to 5 years (2014-2018) as it is the most common timeline since Rumanyika and Mashenene, (2014) applied the same approach.

3.4 Sample size and Study variables
A sample of 14 kinds of literature was regarded as adequate for statistical analysis as (Mohammed et al., 2013; Rumanyika & Mashenene, 2014) used 12 literature to draw up their conclusion. On the other hand, the study variables were selected from the reviewed literature, based on the rule that, they must appear more than once.

Data Analysis
The study used descriptive statistics to analyze data from the reviewed literature. The determinants of e-marketing adoption mentioned more than once were tabulated and assigned frequencies. Then, the total frequencies of each e-marketing determinant were divided by fourteen (number of countries) and times by a hundred to get the percentage. The determinants which scored 50% or above were considered to be significant (Magasi, 2016; Rumanyika & Mashenene, 2014). Finally, the results were summarized using clustered column charts.

Results and Discussions
To assess the kinds of E-Marketing adopted by SMEs in African Countries
The results are presented based on study objectives and analyzed data. From the reviewed literature the study revealed that between 2014 and 2018 e-marketing has been adopted by SMEs in fourteen African countries. However, the number of countries that adopted e-marketing is small as expected by the author since the continent has 54 countries. In addition, four e-marketing kinds were revealed by the author during the literature review. These include ICT, e-marketing, online marketing, and web marketing. The e-marketing appeared itself as a kind, due to some scholars who researched e-marketing generally without specifying the kind. Table 1.0 summarizes the list of African countries and Figure 1.0 summarizes the kinds of e-marketing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>E-marketing project</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>El-Gohary and El-Gohary (2016)</td>
<td>E-marketing</td>
<td>Egypt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson and Makau (2018)</td>
<td>Online marketing</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nkosana, Skinner, and Goodier (2016)</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gyamfi (2016)</td>
<td>E-marketing</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ding (2016)</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
<td>South Sudan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazungu, Panga, and Mchopa (2015)</td>
<td>E-marketing</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanyakibaki (2014)</td>
<td>Web-marketing</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makiwa and Steyn (2016)</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ntwoku, Negash, and Meso (2017)</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
<td>Cameroon</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Under ICT, the results indicate 9 countries adopted the technology which is equivalent to 64%; similarly, e-marketing was adopted by 3 countries which is equal to 22%; furthermore, online marketing and web marketing were adopted by one country thus representing 7% each. From the findings, it can be observed that, there is a need for more empirical research projects to be conducted on e-marketing adoption in African countries. The findings are supported by those of Manley (2015) from South Africa, which revealed that a few studies focused on the adoption of e-marketing by SMEs in the developing economy. Also, the findings of El-Gohary (2012) of Egypt showed that there is inadequate empirical research concerning e-marketing adoption which has been done in the developing countries.

**4.2 To examine the Determinants of E-Marketing adoption by SMEs in African Countries**

The results revealed ten determinants of e-marketing adoption by African countries which include: size and type of the firm, type of the product, availability of resources, IT Skills, knowledge, and education, government policies, IT experts, set up costs, e-marketing awareness, IT infrastructure and facilities, and perception of the owners. Table 2.0 summarizes determinants of e-marketing adoption.
### Table 2.0 Summary of Determinants of E-Marketing adoption in African Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Findings/ Determinants</th>
<th>E-Marketing Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>El-Gohary &amp; El-Gohary (2016)</td>
<td>i) The size of the business, ii) type of the product, iii) availability of resources, iv) knowledge of the owners, v) e-marketing awareness, and vi) government support</td>
<td>E-marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson &amp; Makau (2018)</td>
<td>i) Lack of financial resource ii) lack of IT infrastructures, iii) lack of awareness of technology, and iv) cost of IT experts</td>
<td>Online marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nkosana, et. al. (2016)</td>
<td>i) Set up costs, ii) ICT awareness, iii) lack of ICT skills, iv) failure to import software</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gyamfi (2016)</td>
<td>i) Managers skills ii) owner’s lack of awareness of the technology, iii) competition in the industry; and iv) the type of industry and iv) the type of product/service they produce.</td>
<td>E-marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diing (2016)</td>
<td>i) Availability of resources, ii) type and size of the firm, iii) government regulations, iv) IT experts</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazungu et al. (2015)</td>
<td>i) Lack of e-marketing knowledge, ii) high technology cost, iii) inaccessibility of internet facilities and iv) absence of a regulatory framework to guide e-marketing</td>
<td>E-marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanyabikali (2014)</td>
<td>i) The high cost of web implementation, ii) lack of infrastructure, iii) IT skills and knowledge, iv) perceived benefits, v) lack of top management supports, v) web-marketing awareness</td>
<td>Web-marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makiwa &amp; Steyn (2016)</td>
<td>i) Lack of ICT knowledge and skills, ii) poor infrastructure, iii) lack of Government support and v) negative perception of managers and owners towards ICT</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ntwoku, Negash, &amp; Meso (2017)</td>
<td>i) Firm size and ii) owners' education</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachidi &amp; El Mohajir (2016)</td>
<td>i) Lack of financial resources, ii) education level and iii) lack of IT training</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chube (2015)</td>
<td>i) Set up costs, ii) IT experts costs, iii) lack of IT skills and knowledge, iv) owners’ resistance to change, and v) security of IT tools</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mulatu (2017)</td>
<td>i) Adoption costs, ii) lack of IT experts, and iii) lack of owners/managers awareness</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mumba (2014)</td>
<td>i) Lack of financial resources, ii) high cost of ICTs, iii) poor networks, iv) poor government policies, v) lack of IT skills among women business owners.</td>
<td>ICT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ten determinants of e-marketing adoption were selected based on the rule that, they must appear more than once. Then, a table was created and each determinant was used as a heading. Under each heading, the findings from fourteen countries were placed according to similarities. Thus, Table 3.0 summarizes determinants of e-marketing based on their similarities.
Table 3.0 Summary of determinants of E-Marketing adoption Grouped Based on Similarities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>STF</th>
<th>TP</th>
<th>AR</th>
<th>ITS</th>
<th>GP</th>
<th>ITE</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>EA</th>
<th>ITI</th>
<th>OP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>El-Gohary &amp; El-Gohary (2016)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nkosana, et al. (2016)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gyamfi (2016)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diing (2016)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazungu, et al. (2015)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanyabikali (2014)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makiwa &amp; Steyn, (2016)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ntwoku, et al. (2017)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachidi &amp; El Mohajir (2016)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chube (2015)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mulatu (2017)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mumba (2014)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: (1) STF - Size and Type of the Firm, (2) TP – Type of the Product, (3) AR – Availability of Resources, (4) ITS – IT Skills, Knowledge, and Education, (5) GP – Government Support, (6) ITE – IT Experts, (7) SC – Set up Costs, (8) EA – E-marketing Awareness (9) ITI – IT Infrastructure, and (10) OP – Owners’ Perception.

Furthermore, based on the findings of Table 3.0, the frequencies of the determinants of e-marketing adoption were formed, and the percentage was calculated. Out of ten determinants of e-marketing adoption, three of them were significant due to the score of 50% and above, while, the rest were insignificant. Therefore, IT skills, knowledge, and education (64%); IT infrastructure and facilities (57%); and e-marketing awareness (50%) were the critical determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries. Table 4.0 summarizes frequencies and percentage for determinants of e-marketing and Figure 2.0 which is a 3-D clustered column chart, depicts determinants of e-marketing adoption and their percentages.

Table 4.0 Frequencies and percentage of Determinants for E-Marketing Adoption

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sn</th>
<th>Determinants</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Size and type of the firm</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Type of the product</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Availability of resources</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>IT Skills, Knowledge, and education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>64*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Government policies</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>IT experts</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Set up costs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>E-marketing awareness</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>50 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>IT infrastructure and facilities</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>57*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Perception of the owners</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
With regards to IT skills, knowledge, and education it can be clarified that, if the SMEs owners and their employees are well trained on e-marketing, its adoption will be easier. The findings are supported by that of Maduku, Mpinganjira, and Duh, (2016) which revealed that entrepreneurs' IT skills and knowledge was among other factors influencing adoption of mobile marketing in the SMEs sector in a South African context. Also, Babalola and Babalola, (2015) suggested that technology investors should capitalize more on e-Marketing tools through the training of skilled labor regularly to improve the SMEs sector in Nigeria.

Similarly, well developed IT infrastructure and facilities in a particular country would simplify and influence a positive adoption of e-marketing by SMEs. These include hardware, software, servers, and network connectivity. The findings are supported by that of Iddris and Ibrahim (2015) which revealed that internet infrastructure has a significant impact on e-marketing adoption by SMEs in the Ghanaian context. Similarly, the findings of Kenneth et al. (2012) showed that internet infrastructure was among other factors influencing the adoption of Electronic Commerce among SMEs in Kenya.

Furthermore, e-marketing awareness has been spotted to have significant influence in the adoption of e-marketing. It means that, SMEs needs to be informed of this technology and its importance. It includes customers, SMEs owners, and employees. By doing this, creates awareness of this technology to a wide range of people. The findings are supported by that of Gyamfi (2016) which recommended that e-marketing awareness should be done at a national level to increase its adoption by SMEs in Ghana. Similarly, the findings corroborate those of Eze, et al. (2015) which suggested that ICT awareness creation to SMEs in Nigeria should be a priority.

The study implies that SMEs in African countries need to focus on the key significant determinants of e-marketing adoption in order to increase its application which will enhance their competitiveness as well as business performance. In addition to that, there is an opportunity for African scholars to do empirical research in this area.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

The purpose of this paper was to synthesize the determinants of e-marketing by SMEs in African countries. Based on the empirical literature review, the conclusion and recommendations are centered on the following specific objectives.
Assessing the kinds of E-Marketing adopted by SMEs in African Countries
The e-marketing has been adopted by SMEs in fourteen African countries. In addition, four e-marketing kinds have been revealed which including ICT in 9 countries (64%), e-marketing in 3 countries (22%), online marketing in 1 country (7%), and web marketing in 1 country (7%). It is recommended that more empirical research should be conducted in African countries and the focus should be on other kinds of e-marketing. The study also recommends to the policy makers and IT experts in African countries to work together with SMEs and explore what limit the trend of adopting various kinds of e-marketing.

Examining the determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries
The IT skills, knowledge, and education (64%); IT infrastructure and facilities (57); and e-marketing awareness (50) are the critical determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries. The study recommends that measures should be taken by the policy makers and ICT experts to improve e-marketing adoption using the key determinants in their respective countries, which in turn can positively increase its implementations by the SMEs sector in African countries.

Limitations of the Study and Areas for Further Studies
This study reviewed the past studies to synthesize the determinants of e-marketing adoption by SMEs in African countries. In that case, it was difficult to establish the reliability and validity of the data. Another limitation was a restricted database to view the empirical literature that could have relevant information to the current study. Thus, further study can be done by collecting primary data related to other kinds of e-marketing adoption by SMEs to complement the literature review presented.

References


The Prospects and Challenges of e-Classroom as a tool to improve Students Assessment and Comprehension in Higher Education Institutions

Abdul Ddumba Yawe¹ & Yusuf Nsanja²
University of Rwanda. Kigali, Rwanda

¹,² Lecturer University of Rwanda, Department of Creative Design
E-mail: ajyawe@gmail.com / nsanjex@yahoo.com / vnsanja@gmail.com

Abstract

Traditional learning where face to face interaction of learners and instructors take centre stage in classrooms has been the mode of knowledge delivery. This kind of learning calls for the physical presence of both the instructor and learner. It is however threatened by constraints which include among others distance from the institutions to where learners and lecturers might be coming from to meet. There is a possibility that technology can be used to create more influential learning and teaching opportunities whereby such constraints can be overcome. In this regard E-Classroom is seen as a means to reduce the physical presence of both the instructor and learner. The system is perceived to be a platform to give learners chance to reflect on what they might have not understood or missed. Whereas traditional learning has produced considerable learning outcomes, e-classroom has established continuity of learning, discussion and evaluation regardless of learner and instructor location. The main objective of the study was to determine how e-Classroom improve students’ participation comprehension and personalized timely feedback of taught courses in tertiary institutions. The study was carried out in e-Classroom at the Department of Creative Design in University of Rwanda. The knowledge delivery strategy was carried out in the e-Classroom for all students of environmental and product design. Student’s weekly design projects were submitted, evaluated and feedback was instantly sent to the learners. The study found out that a lecturer is never detached from students. Design involves making modifications towards perfection. The e-discussions were found to facilitate all this and by the time physical prototypes are made all the necessary changes are incorporated without necessarily meeting with the student. The full design process is achieved like it where a face to face discussion. The study recommended that e-classroom training programs for higher institutions of learning be launched, instructors should be trained and content for the modules be developed; then build digital modules to border that particular module program and transform to e-classroom environment.

Key words: E-Learning, E-Classroom, Traditional Learning, E-Discussion

Introduction

This study was concerned with introduction of e-classroom and e-learning at the Department of Creative Design to supplement on what traditional art can offer. The study investigated prospects and challenges of e-classroom management as a tool to improve student’s assessment and comprehension of course content in environmental and product design for higher institutions. Providing knowledge in the department has always been known to be a situation when learners and instructors congregate in a classroom with a purpose of learning. In this kind of teaching method, learners are usually at the receiving end. This is what Tularam& Machisella (2018) call traditional learning. This kind of learning is a teacher centered, the teacher is the conduit of knowledge and that the students are the recipients.

According to Duong (2016), the different models of e-learning, are outlined as synchronous and asynchronous and blended learning. Synchronous learning model involves the association of participants with E-instructor by means of the virtual platform in real time. The parties do video conferencing or do study in chartrooms in an e-classroom. Doung makes this study learn that, Asynchronous on the other hand involves e-classroom learning not in real time. Discussions can be held among students and their peers. Instant comments from instructors, their fellow learners are not got at that moment. A mixture of synchronous and asynchronous is what the author
calls blended learning. There is employment of traditional learning method and e-learning towards learners mastering the curriculum, Doung concludes.

The study is also a vital investigation done by the authors and fellow lecturers regarding the teaching of environmental and product design in the department of creative design. Environmental design is a way of thinking about the design of buildings and landscapes that focuses on improving both the built and natural environments as well as product design focuses on Fashion, textiles, user centered designs and accessories. Apparently, there is lack satisfactory information about the relationship between learning environmental design in a traditional setting and studying it in e-classroom. This undertaking is an effort to establish to what extent knowledge delivery, evaluation and feedback could be attained using technological advancement.

The teaching of design requires a participatory kind of knowledge delivery. Design is to understand concepts and execute them. It is a process which needs constant contact for advice and evaluation. Whereas there might be smooth flow of knowledge in traditional learning style, the learner and instructor get detached after a learning process. Worse still learning is antagonized by distance of locations each partner comes from. Some learners in a traditional setting appear to be timid in some cases, when learners are exposed to e-classroom they appear to freely participate in discussions. There is confidence displayed possibly because no one is eying them and that these learners might be shy to express themselves in a traditional learning setting. However, directing editing of a design might not be well understood by some students when in e-classroom setting. This appears to call for use of both traditional learning and e-learning. Further to this, the design process involves ideation (Jefferson, 2005). This requires freehand drawing (Snyman, 2015). This kind of process would require physical presence of the instructor and the learner in order to make instant amendments which would be hard in an e-classroom setting. In an e-classroom setting it would be that the instructor comments on already drawn images. This means that the learner can only do changes after the digital feedback from the instructor who is not there. If the instructor is of line, then it becomes an affair of waiting.

However, designing e-learning in a virtual space is an innovation which is seen as a supplement to traditional learning. Mousazadeh et al (2016:88) have a belief that learning is a constant and long-term process, and e-learning has become a bridge between education and work. That is why its promotion is an inevitable innovation towards educating students in this ICT era. Environmental design too will seemingly benefit from this mode of teaching despite being purely practical studio subject.

**Literature Review**

Teaching has always been dominated by teacher centered approach which is traditional. The trend now is that traditional education methods are being supplemented or replaced by e-learning. E-learning is defined as acquisition of knowledge and skill using electronic technologies such as computer and Internet-based courseware at local and wide area networks. E-learning was first given names like “online learning” and “virtual learning” (LLC, 2014). In this kind of innovation, it is the shifting of classroom environment from traditional towards use of technological advancement (Liu & Long, 2014). The instructor’s role now is seemingly taking another direction. Opportunities brought about by e-learning and teaching are that the learning process can now occur in any place regardless of where each beneficiary might be (Goyal, 2012).

Learning in an e-classroom involves learners and lecturers interacting in real time. Further to this there is an e-classroom where learners discuss with themselves plus instructor but not in real time. It has been argued by many authors that e-learning is an innovation suitable to replace traditional methods. Environmental design is within studio subjects whose instruction this study needs to investigate. Studio subjects are mostly dominated
by practice as such; they are the axis of this review. It creates debates whether such practical subjects could be instructed using e-learning mode of teaching or both traditional and e-learning should all be utilized for effective knowledge delivery.

Environmental Design and Appropriate Teaching Methods

It has always been known that Environmental design like all practical subjects and studio based modules need hands-on method when knowledge is being delivered. This is what FAO (2011) calls psychomotor skills. Eye contact and instant evaluation on student conduct always follows in a rather action based fashion (Tularam & Machisella, 2018). Such modules have components which are teacher centered, participatory on both the learner and the instructor (Dimitrios et al, 2013). E-classrooms as an intervention in studio based modules are apparently appropriate when the theoretical component is the subject of discussion (Garrison, 2007). On the other hand, the practical component in the instruction in modules for example environmental could possibly be done using traditional methods. FAO (2011:10) sees learning in an e-classroom as a means of training learners to build cognitive skills rather than psychomotor skills. Psychomotor skills as outlined by Hoque (2016) and Widyartono et al (2017) are those skills where one uses hands physically in a guided activity. When it comes to environmental design the psychomotor skills seem to take centre stage as learners use hands predominantly to output a series of visual statements. Presence of an instructor in form of traditional instruction then actualises comprehension through instant evaluation (Balliu & Belshi, 2017). E-learning on the other hand, appears to keep the learning process on-going even if instructors are away. This is usually up to the time learners reap good results basing on the study objectives (Goyal, 2012).

An E-classroom is within e-learning which is defined as attainment of knowledge and skill by utilising ICT and Internet-based courseware at local and wide area networks (Arkorful & Abaidoo, 2014; Balliu & Belshi, 2017; Goyal, 2012). Various authors have written about methods of learning, traditional and e-learning. Which one is most appropriate remains a dispute. There are challenges and prospects associated with both methods of learning; there seems to be no consensus on the matter as to which teaching method is most appropriate. Liu & Long (2014) for example are of a view that traditional and e-learning should be used hand in hand. These authors as well as (Tularam & Machisella, 2018) are in agreement and contend that no method is superior to another. Whereas e-learning maintains constant contact of learners with the instructor, traditional learning has what the authors call superiority in face to face communication. This communication is a stimulative factor for students’ comprehensive quality (Liu & Long, 2014:32).

Much as the authors believe that no method is superior (Liu & Long, 2014; Tularam & Machisella, 2018), they again posit that the traditional teaching is the most direct and effective method. In this submission however, Liu & Long (2014) fall short of not highlighting superiority of traditional methods over other methods. They simply highlight effectiveness of traditional methods. The effectiveness they are talking about is that traditional learning is a flexible teaching method where content can be adjusted according to actual condition under the broad-spectrum of the teaching arrangement. The debate is further widened by authors claiming that teachers’ action become the target imitated by learners, whose outlook towards right and wrong, attitude, value orientation and academic level have great impact on students (Liu & Long, 2014:32).

Balliu & Belshi (2017:20) adds more to this debate by asserting that methods working for some students might not work for others; students apparently have their needs and some methods might not be effective. Coming up with a notion that a particular method of teaching is most appropriate becomes a fallacy. Balliu and Belshi argue
that E-classroom method may be used in the knowledge delivery in the contemporary learning environment, but teachers for unknown reasons fall back into traditional methods.

It is apparent that employing both traditional and modern methods in form of e-learning makes the lesson process more effective (Balliu & Belshi, 2017). They conclude by giving credit to e-learning when they say that it stimulates even the most “sleepy” pupil and raise whole class participation in the learning process. Other studies done before such as (Garrison, 2007) attest that a comparison between e-education with a more traditional education have shown no notable difference between the two models.

To link the users in Ballui & Belshi (2017) assertion, Mousazadeh et al (2016) have observed that the community is changing. As such, traditional methods of education which are used presently are not appropriate to provide knowledge effectively that satisfies the constantly changing needs of communities in the world of informatics. There is need therefore to integrate both methods of teaching. Mousazadeh and partners enrich the whole debate by elevating the position of E-learning in knowledge delivery. They refer to it as a platform which gives all learners opportunity to learn by equalizing educational opportunities. E-learning makes learners to learn how to learn (Mousazadeh et al 2016). Whilst it gives learners prospects to learning, its viewed by the authors that it is student-centered. Actors in the important educational components (teacher and student) are separated. Mapesos (2017) boldly waters down (Liu & Long 2014; Tularam & Machisella, 2018) submission about the effectiveness of traditional method of instruction by asserting that traditional is inferior to e-learning mode and that it’s the most inefficient solution for education. Goyal (2012:241) appears to echo the same notion when he alleges that E-learning has an advantage to traditional learning mode in nearly every area, including efficiency and velocity. The debate leaves this study with an option of trying out all modes of instruction and come up with an opinion.

Environmental design like all practical modules, accounting, Graphic design, architecture, fine art among others have always been taught using traditional methods of learning were the instructor is the fountain of knowledge and learners are receptacles. Knowledge flow has been done using lectures, demonstrations and discussions which calls for both the learner and the instructor to be present (Dimitrios et al, 2013). Arkorful & Abaidoo (2014) affirm that fields with practical lineage cannot be properly studied through e-learning. Such researchers have argued that e-learning is more suitable in humanities and social science. Environmental design is also practical as such it appears that e-learning cannot suppress traditional model of knowledge delivery.

Dimitrios and partners appear not to take e-classroom as a replacement of the traditional classroom; they still think that there are issues that are unclear regarding the effectiveness of e-learning in such practice based studio modules. The authors conclude by saying that many students prefer personalized teacher centred learning and that e-learning be used as ancillary tools, only. By e-learning becoming and ancillary tool of traditional teaching, the learning process becomes more effective and interesting while students will be able to broaden their knowledge (Dimitrios et al, 2013:95).

The Nature of E-Learning in Environmental Design

Environmental design falls under Design Education and according to Yildirum et al (2012:02) knowledge delivery in such modules involve information directly being transferred to the student and new solutions requested. Design education is characterised by coming up with proposals of a design solution where during the design process the student is criticized one-on-one by the supervisor. This development follows a series of changes until a design consensus is reached. The trend leads to making products like drawing and models. All these happenings need traditional methods where eye contact is a must and one-on-one interaction (Yildirum et al, 2012). Yildirum and partners suggest that other classrooms like e-classrooms where there is no physical
presence of the instructor should be used for follow-up and evaluation. Demonstration and instant criticism needs the physical presence of the instructor (Goyal, 2012; Yildirim et al., 2012).

**Information Technology as an Enabler**

In traditional teaching method, there is sort of a live broadcast of information from the instructor to the learners. This is characterized by questions and answers in a participatory method. Usually students in such a setting are shy to even ask questions. Shyness according to (Gocmen, 2012) is the tendency to hold opinion to one’s self. In a classroom setting it is the inability to interact freely, ask questions and contribute to the issues in a learning process. He further adds that self-concept and self-esteem have a significant position in the academic and social development of a student. Shyness is predominantly the attribute of traditional education mode of instruction. E-learning appears to overcome shyness among students. In an e-classroom technology acts as an enabler in the sense that even the dull student who cannot express himself orally can at least point out something in writing (Balliu & Belshi, 2017).

(Brioso, 2017) comes out clearly to mention that e-learning reinforces the affective domain of learners by developing an affirmative attitude towards main subject areas and gaining confidence towards learning. Affective domain deals with the mind according to (Widyartono et al. 2017). E-learning has also made possible joint learning, which has been found to effectively enhance, advance knowledge attainment and helpful learning behavioral change (Oluwatumbi, 2015). E-learning enables information to reach to a sizeable number of learners at an instant and in a short time (Goal, 2012). However, Goal points out that although technology is seen as an enabler in knowledge dissemination, some students feel bored or intimidated in front of computer (Goal, 2012:241). Such boredom and intimidation by ICT materials remain a challenge. It basically appears that, a mixture of traditional instruction would possibly depress boredom.

**Content Retention**

Content retention is the ability to recall what was taught and be able to use that knowledge to solve a problem and achieve measurable educational outcomes. E-learning is said to assist students who might have not understood concepts in a traditional learning setting to get a chance to revisit what they might have missed. (Dimitrios et al., 2013; Goyal, 2012; Balliu & Belshi, 2017). This notion tends to suggest that e-learning surpasses traditional learning in aiding knowledge retention among learners. Garrison (2007) has a contrasting finding which indicates that the traditional model of teaching has no difference in results of knowledge attainment and retention. This leaves a mystery as to which model should be promoted in the learning environment. It calls for employment all models of learning to find what the most appropriate scenario in knowledge delivery is.

**Challenges of E-Learning**

Much as the e-learning mode is convenient in gathering actors in a learning undertaking, employers in universities appear not to recommend it. This is because they want to pay a lecturer basing on the physical attendance. In so doing, clocking machines have been installed (Adewole et al., 2004). According to Adewole and partners, these machines are called biometric data machines. It is apparent that these clocking machines force lecturers to be present during knowledge delivery. It is arranged in such a way that clocking in affects lecturer’s salary because the physical clocking is used to compute the amount of money one gets (Kisame, 2016). The situation appears not to favour e-classroom where the lecturer in such a teaching mode is in another location. This is an antagonizing arrangement to e-learning innovation. Much as the biometric machine is seen as
introducing efficiency, it de-motivates those trying to promote e-learning. Goyal (2012) adds on the other item antagonising e-learning by pointing out the issue of internet security which is an escalating challenge because the lessons are done on a common network. Further to this he points out high bandwidth network is a necessity for proficient content access. There is still a challenge in that computer illiteracy is still high amongst lecturers, instructors and students. Studies show that this kind of setback will be a huddle in incorporating ICT in their teaching. There are instructors who appear to know computers but it’s not known if can convert this use of ICT resources in instructional delivery (Oluwatumbi, 2015).

**Prospects**

Arkorful & Abaidoo (2014) cites Zhang *et al* (2006), who alleges that e-learning, gives chance for learners to watch and listen to the lecture so many times. Any item they have missed could be revisited. Further to this, the authors allege that the model addresses the scarcity of instructors on top of that e-learning provides chance for learners to interact through discussion forums. Barriers like fear which hinders participation are reduced. The practical studio module like environmental design needs constant engagement to trace progress and evaluate. It gives an insight of what a student is doing. Traditional methods can then be employed to actualise the design process. It was found that e-learning in instruction regarding environmental design has a considerable contribution to learning and teaching. It should be incorporated into the knowledge dispensation programs. It is also evident that the traditional and E-classrooms should be used hand in hand. Instructor involvement is so important. A large number of learners could be addressed at one setting.

**Methodology**

The study was carried out in e-Classroom at the Department of Creative Design in University of Rwanda. The knowledge delivery strategy was carried out in the e-Classroom for all students of Instrumental Drawing (73 Students; 23 Female and 50 Male respectively), Environmental Design (13 Students; 4 Female and 9 Male respectively) and product design (8 Students; 6 female and 2 male respectively). A total of 94 Student’s weekly design projects were submitted, evaluated and feedback was instantly sent to the learners. Majority of the respondents in this study were male (65 %), indicating that more male than female apply to join Creative Design Department.

**Findings**

On comparison, students on both traditional and e-learning mode (mixed learning) performed highly as compared to those on conventional only, of the students who scored A’s, 83% were on the mixed learning system, those on traditional learning program was only 17% of the total A’s scored. Conversely, majority of the students who scored C’s were those on traditional (74%) mode of study. The results of employing both traditional and e-learning mode were in agreement with Balliu & Belshi (2017) who in the literature review allege that using both strategies is very effective. It was revealed that gender was a factor that influenced the number of hours the respondents studied. Majority (65 %) of those who studied for 5–9 hours were male while the majority (50 %) of those who studied for 3–5 hours were female. It was revealed that male who studied for 3–5 hours were only 14 % of the population.

On comparing the study hours students under mixed learning and those only traditional program spent studying per day, it was found that majority of 44% of the student on traditional mode studied for less than 2 hours a day while the majority (74%) of those under the mixed learning program spent between 5–9 hours studying a day. It was further revealed that study hours per day significantly influenced the academic performance of students. Students who spent between 5–9 hours a day accounted for 83 % of the total A’s scored.
To measure the impact of prior computer skills on academic performance, the study sought to know whether the students were anxious while using computers, 1% of the respondents indicated that they were somewhat anxious, 10% of the respondents were found to be a little anxious, the majority 89% however indicated that they were very anxious while using computers.

As for the extent of anxiety, only 2% of the respondents indicated that they are somewhat anxious, however 10 respondents are a little anxious whereby out of this 10, 9 scored an average score of B representing 9% of the total respondent who are a little anxious the remaining respondents scored an average score of C, hence all the 12 respondents who scored an average score of A were the very anxious, and 40 and 37 respondents who are very anxious scored an average score of B and C respectively. The findings can be deduced to mean that the more anxious a student gets while using computers the higher the chances of performing well for the students on e-learning mode.

The study sought to know whether students dramatized computer situation in their mind even when not using computers. This was intended to know whether the students had prior computer skill or not. 2% and 7% of the respondents indicated they sometimes, and occasionally respectively dramatized computer situations in their mind, 91% of the respondents always dramatized computer situations in their minds, this indicated that the majority were comfortable with computers reflecting that they had previously used computers.

Further to this, the study sought to know whether the respondents had any difficulty in using computers, 2% of the respondents indicated they had difficulty in using computers all the time, a similar percentage indicated they sometime had difficulty in using computers. 21% of the respondents indicated that they had a little difficulty using computers. The majority (75%) of the respondents indicated that they never experience any difficulty using computers.

Majority of respondents never find it difficult using a computer giving a total count of 75 of the respondents which gives a % age of 75% of the respondent, however breaking this down to the average score, 37% respondents scored B’s 28% scored C’s and 10% scored A’s. out of the total of 94 respondents, 21 responded representing 22% of the total number of respondents found it a little difficult using computers breaking this down to scores we find that 22% scored B’s 21% scored C’s and 2% scored A’s.

It was found out that assessment of students was easier in e-learning as compared to the traditional way of instruction. In the traditional assessment method assessment mostly was dominated by mini-pin up of work which took long to have outcomes. It is so challenging given the fact that some students’ expression physically was hampered by language barrier. Clearly, there was slow progress at having each student’s submission being evaluated. With e-learning mode submission of students work in the e-classroom got instant response.

The oral presentation during the final pinup of the practical assignment revealed that there was improved comprehension of design concepts compared to the previous years when the mode of instruction was predominantly traditional. All participants were able to recall the entire design concept, the design process and implementation.

Despite all this it was further learnt that some students were not satisfied with e-learning, this was evidenced in the complaints they made through their class representatives. They are used to being at the receiving end. The
university policy of the lecturer signing in on the students’ attendance list meant that implementing e-learning where the lecturer was not in close contact would be viewed as absence. There is still a satisfaction among students that learning only takes place with physical presence of the lecturer. They saw absence of the lecturer as skipping class. Whereas this impediment took centre stage their peers who treasured technology influenced them. Computer literacy was found to be a function in the e-learning innovation otherwise those who had problems in IT found it hard to cope up.

Discussion

Computer literacy is so crucial in actualizing e-learning. ICT knowledge will always be influential in the e-classroom, this because computer knowledge enables positive participation without shyness (Balliu & Belshi, 2017). It is evident that those who find computers a problem, need to be assisted using the traditional means. According to this study the learning outcomes are stronger when all methods are used e-learning and traditional mode of instruction. It clearly echoes Balliu & Belshi (2017). E-learning improves comprehension of design concepts because of the constant touch the students had with the instructor; this reflected in the way learners explained their design innovations. Much as e-learning showed strength in instruction and students’ comprehension, the upcoming learners still has the mentality of being in physical contact with their lecturer they want to do the practicals with the lecturer around to give them instant feedback. The hands on part therefore require a traditional learning approach. This will contrast (Brioso, 2017) assertion that e-learning reinforces the affective domain. Brioso says that learners gain confidence towards learning but for this study confidence has to be spiced up with a hands-on tendency.

Prospects and Challenges

As mentioned in the literature, students self esteem in communicating with the lecturer will be elevated through the e-learning approach. We shall see the level of shyness dwindle in this kind of learning strategy. The language barrier which would hinder student participation in a traditional learning setting is now taken lightly. The students shyness in participating in a virtual classroom is reduced because of the fact that he /she is contributing without being looked at. The challenging part of e-learning will always be the University attendance system which requires physical presence of the lecturer at the learning centre. This is echoed in the electronic attendance devices and the physical signatures. Such documents as outlined in the literature impact lecturers pay. The students tend to think they’ve been cheated.

Conclusion

This short study highlights the impact of electronic learning on academic performance of students. Many students with the digital age of mobile computers among others were well prepared to take the challenge of studying through e-learning, because of simplicities through the application of IT as a learning tool that information, instructions and guidance can be delivered anytime and timely as there is no strict rules on the learning times. The perception is that the world has become smaller as a result of the immense progress made in the field of information and communication technologies. IT is accessible to all across the continents and the oceans through the satellites, cables, and other such devices that have made man more independent and have increased his mobility by making distances shorter and communication faster.

As the analysis of data gathered on a small sample of a ninety four people, has shown that, e-learning and other related learning methods have contributed to the enhancement of the performance of students at the higher levels of our education system, irrespective of individual differences due to heredity and/or environment. It can be confidently said that this is the time we can make the whole world harvest the benefits from the progress of
science and technology. A mixture of both traditional and e-learning makes learning a valuable experience. In order e-learning to be a success, learners need to be educated in computer literacy. This will make them better learners on an e-learning environment.

**Recommendations for Further Reading**

This research elicited and examined a number of extreme points of views about the impact of E-learning on academic achievement in the Department of creative Design in university of Rwanda. Although it was discovered that certain issues have not yet been properly addressed to E-Learning implementation processes, as the prime focus of the research was on prior computer skills, number of hours individual spend studying and socio-demographic characteristics. The following are the recommendations of this study:

- Critical factors such as institutional issue, management issue, pedagogical factors, technological issue, user interface design issue, evaluation issue, and resource support issue and the factors within each issue have not yet been investigated with detail coverage.
- The need to carry out detail research involving case studies based on survey questionnaires involving various learning institutions which will ultimately give a better understanding of impact of e-learning aspects within implementation process.

**References**


Duong, T. V. (2016). The Role of E-learning. duongvan.tinh@kgk.uni-obuda.hu. Óbuda University, Keleti Faculty of Business and Management.


PART E: ADDRESSING PERSISTENT CORRUPTION

Assessing The Anti-Corruption Strategies: The Case of Malawi’s Public Service

Mustafa Kennedy Hussein
University of Malawi

Abstract
Malawi’s political transition from the single party rule to multi-party dispensation in 1994 gave hope for good governance but corruption in the public service has emerged as a major hurdle. The prevalence of corrupt practices amidst anti-corruption initiatives by government raises questions regarding the efficacy of anti-corruption efforts. This paper is based on literature review and key informant interviews. It contends that corrupt practices continue to increase in the public service due to among other factors the gap between the law and practice, unethical leadership and politicisation of the public service, greed and administrative inefficiencies caused by shortage of resources. The study concludes that the fight against corruption require a holistic approach for enhancing good governance. Thus, capacity building for ethical and accountable leadership and management and active involvement of the citizens in governance must be implemented.

Keywords: Capacity Building, Corruption, Development, Governance, Public Service, Malawi

Introduction

This paper assesses the anti-corruption strategies with the aim to determine the factors which militate against the effective fight against corruption in Malawi. In the 1990s, combating corruption has taken centre stage and attracted attention of public officials and development partners due to the threat it is poses to democratic governance and sustainable socio-economic development, among others things (OECD, 2014). According to World Bank (2010), the cost of corruption equals more than 5% of global GDP ($ 2.6 trillion) with over US$ 1 trillion paid in bribes each year. In Africa, anticorruption initiatives have been underlined by the African Union’s adoption of the AU Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption (AU CPCC). The Convention seeks to promote and strengthen the development of mechanisms required to prevent, detect, punish and eradicate corruption and related offences in the public and private sector in Africa (OSISA, 2017). In Malawi, anti-corruption initiatives have been undertaken by almost all political regimes in the multi-party dispensation in order to overcome the threats posed by corruption. However, the prevalence of corruption has emerged as a major hurdle facing development efforts in most African countries including Malawi.

The media and Corruption Survey Reports have exposed the various types of corruption prevailing in Malawi’s Public Service interpreted as the totality of services that are organised under public authority to render services to the public through public officers. It encompasses the civil service, local government, security organs such as the police and military, parastatals or quasi-governmental organisations. The corrupt practices include including high profile cases of bribery, fraud, and embezzlement of public resources amidst anti-corruption policies, strategies and initiatives implemented by government (Chinsinga, Dulani, Mvula, & Chunga, Chinsinga, 2014). This raises questions regarding the effectiveness of strategies for combating corruption. This paper which is divided into six parts starts with this introductory section followed by a review of the conceptual underpinnings relating to corruption in part two. In part three, an assessment of the anti-corruption strategies is undertaken followed by a review of the status of corruption in Malawi in part four. In part five, which is the crux of this paper the findings of this study relating to the factors contributing to the prevalence of corruption in Malawi are presented. Finally, in part six, concluding reflections are presented.
Theoretical and Conceptual Underpinnings

For a meaningful assessment of the anticorruption strategies it is important from the outset to clarify theoretical and conceptual underpinnings of this analysis. Therefore, corruption and its categories, causes and effects and critical factors for effective implementation of policies and strategies including anticorruption strategies are discussed below.

Corruption

As argued by Syed-Hussein (1990:1) there is no standard definition of corruption partly due to its complex nature and the changing context in which it occurs. The World Bank defines corruption as ‘the abuse of publicly entrusted power for private gain’ (World Bank, 1997:34). It is also defined as the ‘behaviour which deviates from the formal duties of a public role because of private (personal, close family, private clique) pecuniary or status gains’ (Ssonko, 2010:9). Most versions of the definition of corruption include similar basic elements. For example, it is defined as ‘behaviour that deviates from formal rules of conduct governing the actions in a position of public authority because of private-regarding motives such as wealth, power or status (Khan, 1997:12); ‘behaviour of public officials which violates their duties and responsibilities and a deviant behaviour and an illicit form of influence associated with private gain exacted at public expense Johnston, 2005). In Malawi, the Corrupt Practices Act No. 18 of 1995, does not define corruption. It rather it defines ‘corrupt practices’ as ‘the act of offering, giving, receiving, obtaining or soliciting of any advantage to influence the action of any public officer. Despite the differences in the definitions, corruption in the public sector boils down to the deviation from the norms and regulations that are binding to public office holders.

Categories of corruption

The categories of corruption in terms of type of transaction, frequency, and amounts of money involved are well documented by the Transparency International and the World Bank (World Bank, 1997:34). This paper does not intent to duplicate the details and therefore only highlights are presented. Firstly, in terms of the type of transaction, corruption is categorised as bribery, theft, extortion or nepotisms. Bribery involves payment to public officials in order to influence administrative behavior, action or decision while theft involves unilateral embezzlement of government resources such as authority, money and property for private gain. Extortion entails demand or receipt of a fee for services, which should be provided freely while nepotism involves giving preferential treatment to certain individuals or firms in transactions such as appointments and contract awards. Secondly, in terms of frequency, corruption is categorised into occasional corruption, which refers to corruption that occurs rarely and systemic corruption, which involves everyday abuse of entrusted power (World Bank, 1997:34).

Finally, in terms of amounts of money involved, corruption is categorised into petty corruption and grand corruption. While petty corruption involves low value amounts such as small bribes in return for service provision, grand corruption involves high value amounts and a high-level network of politicians, public officials and leaders of the private sector. Grand corruption is also called political or bureaucratic corruption where political office bearers and public officials abuse their positions for private benefits. Examples of the abuses include manipulation of policies, institutions and rules of procedure in the allocation of resources, nepotism, extortion, transferring of public funds to foreign countries, patronage, speed money, payments to ‘ghost’ workers, duty evasion, embezzlement or bribes in the bidding and implementation of large-scale government projects (Hutchinson, 2005:102).
Causes of Corruption

There is lack of consensus on the causes of corruption in the public service partly due to different contexts in which corruption occurs (Syed-Hussein, 1990:1). However, the common propositions are greed; unclear and contradictory laws and regulations; complacency in law enforcement; arbitrary and self-serving decisions; failure to ensure transparency and accountability; poor design of institutions; ineffective induction or poor communication of core values and standards; poor economic conditions and rewards for bureaucrats; and the lack of awareness of rights and obligations by citizens in the fight against corruption (Musila, 2010:129; Ssonko, 2020:9). According to Syed-Hussein (1990:1) the root causes of corruption can be categorized into individual and institutional factors. The individual factors relate to individual personalities and motivations to abuse public resources for private gains. Thus, corrupt practices are perpetuated by a materialistic and self-loathing culture among the elites who are willing to get rich by any means. The institutional causes of corruption relate to the political and social-cultural norms and the organisational bottlenecks in the administration systems which encourage corrupt practices. These include extensive patronage networks, administrative inefficiency compounded by the ineffective leadership, lack of capacity and financial resources as well as high levels of poverty and inequality (TI, 2017). According to Hope and Chikulo (2000:100), the lack of exemplary political and bureaucratic leadership and the compression of the salary scales of public service are the major factors that trigger corruption in most public institution in Africa.

Effects of Corruption

The fight against corruption has taken centre stage due to the adverse effects corruption has on the political, economic and social development (Gray and Kaufmann, 1998:7). Politically, corruption undermines democratic values of good governance, political stability, and the rule of law. It erodes public confidence in all the three branches of government, namely, the executive, legislature and the judiciary. In Malawi, poor governance practices such as the weak public accountability and transparency, and unethical political and bureaucratic leadership are attributed to corruption (Chambliss, 1977:306). Furthermore, corruption leads to violation of the right to development as public officers use public resources meant for development projects for private gains. Economically, corruption adversely impacts the provision of public services. It leads to misallocation of resources, harms the private sector development and hurts the poor. Corrupt practices discourages investment and impedes economic growth as it makes investment both domestic and foreign expensive due to bribes and kickbacks. For example, the cost of paying off corrupt officials to acquire land, business licenses, or the necessary work permits makes investment initiative expensive for potential investors. According to Myint (2000:33), corruption also affects the government budget both on the revenue and expenditure sides. On the revenue side, corrupt practices reduce tax revenues as public finances are siphoned for private gains through illegal deals. On the expenditure side, the composition of government expenditure is affected by costly purchases through inflated prices for tender and procurement and contracts.

Theoretical Frameworks

There is controversy relating to the theoretical frameworks for the analysis of anti-corruption strategies and the factors which militate against the effective fight against corruption. The task of promoting ethical principles and values as argued by Kernaghan and Langford (1990), is complex and challenging because there is no single strategy capable of eliminating unethical behaviour in the public service. However, the general approach adopted by countries include formulation of a legal and policy framework which includes laws, policies and
rules/regulation and adoption of the code of conduct; and institutional and administrative reforms to provide hospitable organizational environment.

Overview of the Strategies for Combating Corruption in Malawi’s Public Service

Several strategies have been undertaken by almost all political regimes in the multi-party dispensation with the aim to combat corruption in Malawi. These include the legal and policy, institutional and administrative systems.

Legal and Policy Frame Work

The fight against corruption largely depends on what happens within the political-legal environment. Therefore, it is important to highlight the legal and policy framework, which creates the environment within which public officials operate. Malawi ratified the United Nations Convention Against Corruption (UNCAC) on 4 December 2007, the Africa Union Convention on Combating and Preventing Corruption (AUCCPC) on 26 November 2007, and the SADC Protocol Against Corruption on 2 September 2002. These legal instruments seek to, among other things, promote the development of anti-corruption mechanisms, cooperation in the fight against corruption and harmonisation of anti-corruption national legislations (OSISA, 2017:26). In Malawi, the Constitution, national legislation, the Malawi Public Service Regulations, Code of Ethics and Conduct, and Public Service domesticate the conventions and protocol. For example, Sections 12 (iii), and 13 of the Constitution provide for increased accountability, transparency, integrity and financial probity. Regarding Statutes, the Corrupt Practices Act (CPA) No. 18 of 1995 criminalises various corrupt practices, including attempted corruption, extortion, active and passive bribery, bribing a foreign official, and abuse of office. Similarly, Section 90 of the Malawi’s Penal Code also criminalises active and passive bribery. In Section 25, the CPA provides for the protection of whistle blowers in order to encourage reporting of corrupt practices. The safeguards against corruption are also provided in the Public Procurement Act No. 8 of 2003, the Public Audit Act No. 12 (2003) and Public Finance and Management Act No. 7 of 2003 and the Money Laundering, Proceeds of Serious Crime and Terrorist Financing Act No. VII of 2010, the Declaration of Assets, Liabilities and Business Interests Act No. 21 of 2013; Malawi Public Service Public Service Regulation (MPSR), Malawi Public Service Code of Ethics and Conduct (MPSCEC) and the Public Service Charter (PSC). These statutes, policies, and legislation outline principles, values and standards for correct behaviour expected of public officers such as work ethics, and personal behaviour and acts of misconduct including corrupt practices.

Institutional and Administrative Systems

The fight against corruption is seen as the primary responsibility of the Anti-Corruption Bureau (ACB) which was established by the Corrupt Practices Act of 1995. The ACB became operational in 1998 with the mandate to prevent corruption, investigate and prosecute persons suspected to be involved in corrupt practices. However, there are several institutions, which deal with corruption as one of their many activities. Hussein (2005:91) provides an account of the roles played by various institutions including watchdog bodies- constitutional bodies, civil society organisations, non-government organisations, and the media. The major institutions include the Office of Ombudsman, which has been operational since 1995. The Office investigates practices of maladministration including corrupt practices and makes the findings known to the public. It operates independently and answerable only to Parliament. The National Audit Office (NAO) carries out surprise audits relating to efficiency and effectiveness of internal control and management systems and resource utilisation at the various levels of government. Other institutions established to fight corruption include the Directorate of
Public Prosecutions (DPP), Office of the Director of Public Procurement (ODPP) and the Financial Intelligence Unit (FIU), the Judiciary, the Malawi Chapter of the African Parliamentarians Network against Corruption (APNAC), the Business Action Against Corruption (BAAC), and the Civil Society Action Against Corruption (CSAAC). Furthermore, the National Anti-Corruption Strategy (NACS) was launched in 2008 to enhance government’s zero tolerance policy towards corruption. The main thrust of NACS is the establishment of ‘Integrity Committees’ in public institutions and eight pillars to spearhead a national anti-corruption drive. The pillars are the Executive, Legislature, and Judiciary, Private sector, Civil Society, Faith Based Organizations, Traditional leaders and the Media (GoM, 2008). However, despite the existence of the legal and policy framework and institution of the various watchdog bodies and anticorruption strategies the section below shows a sordid picture of the status of corruption in Malawi.

The Status of Corruption in Malawi’s Multi-Party Dispensation

Malawi’s political transition from the single party rule to multi-party dispensation in 1994 gave hope for combating corruption. However, as noted by Nawaz (2012) there is controversy regarding the status of corruption in Malawi. Strasser (2016) argues that corruption is entrenched, systemic, and getting worse in Malawi. OSISA (2017) argues that some of the corruption measurement metrics indicate that Malawi is making progress on the anti-corruption front in recent years, but it also admits that the country is still marred by high levels of corruption. The Transparency International (TI) Corruption Perception Index (CPI) and the Afro barometer, (2017) surveys reveal the trend that Malawi is not doing well in the fight against corruption. For example, in 2011, Malawi was ranked as the 14th most corrupt country out of 48 countries in the sub-Saharan Africa and 100 out of 183 countries worldwide based on the Corruption Perceptions Index. It dropped in the ranking from 100 to 88 in 2012 and to 91 in 2013. In 2014, Malawi dropped to 110 in 2014 which is the worst ranking the country has attained on the index in the past five years (TI, 2017). Kainja (2016) argues that Malawians have allowed corruption to flourish at every level, and that corrupt practices have become systemic due to among other factors, the lack of personal integrity, greed and ambition to get rich. Similarly, Chimjeka (2017) observes that various types of corruption, ranging from high level political corruption, patronage, and nepotism to petty bribery are on the increase and impeding service delivery and exacerbating inequality and poverty. The Capital Hill Cashgate Scandal-the plunder of over MK14.5 billion (US$20 million) by high ranking public officials in the first quarter of the 2013/14 financial year through payments to non-existing suppliers, deletion of transactions, procurement done without the knowledge of the Office of the Director for Public Procurement (ODPP) and inflation of prices has been the reference point of grand corruption for the past six years. In summary, the incidence and magnitude of corrupt acts are increasing despite political rhetoric regarding commitment to combat corruption. Thus, the prevalence of corrupt practices raises questions that have motivated this study.

Methodology

The study adopted a qualitative approach in order to gain an in-depth understanding of the narratives in the area of anti-corruption strategies and why corruption continues to prevail in Malawi despite many efforts to fight it. The existing literature which included journal papers, conference papers, books, official reports and internet was systematic reviewed to collate all empirical evidence to answer questions relating to causes and consequences of corruption and the factors which militate against anticorruption strategies in Malawi and other countries. This was supplemented by key informant interviews which was conducted with purposively selected ten senior public officials from the Office the President and Cabinet, Anti-Corruption Bureau, Office of the Ombudsman, Auditor General, Accountant General and Department of Human resources Management and Development and to seek
expert views on the questions relating to corruption in the public service. This methodology was adopted with a view to minimise bias and provide reliable findings from which conclusion can be drawn. It was deemed the most appropriate method for the research area since it required a comprehensive understanding of expert views and practical dimensions relating to the fight against corruption.

Findings and Discussion

The study revealed several factors affecting the anti-corruption efforts in Malawi. These include divergent interests of the stakeholders in the fight against corruption, structural constraints inherent in the political system and the weaknesses in the formal and informal institutions in the fight against corruption adversely affect the outcome of the anticorruption initiatives. These are discussed below.

Bureaucratic Structure

The study revealed that ineffective leadership and the divergence and multiplicity of interests among the stakeholders such as the government, donors, civil society organisations, public servants, media, and the general public complicate coordination, collaboration and collective action in the fight against corruption. The majority of respondents during interviews attributed the difficulty to harness efforts and coordinated courses of action with focus towards the fight against corruption to ineffective political and bureaucratic leadership and the lack of political will. Although each successive political regime has proclaimed commitment to combat corruption there has been a lack of exemplary leadership. For example, Muluzi, the first President in the multiparty dispensation was implicated in the siphoning of donor money amounting to MK1.7 billion (US$22.3 million) into his personal account (Chitsulo 2017). In the second political regime President Bingu was Mutharika was associated with the disappearance of MK 577 billion (US$795 million) of public funds later revised to MK 236 billion (US$325 million) (Gwede, 2016). Furthermore, Malawi Kwacha 20 billion (USD 30 million) was plundered through pilferage and payments to companies that did not supply any goods or services, dubbed Cashgate Scandal under President Joyce Banda (Gwede, 2016).

However, according to Phiri (2018) the divergence and multiplicity of interests among the stakeholders is the major factors which contributes to disjointed efforts towards the fight against corruption. For instance the foreign donors and civil society organisation pursue different agendas while the general public lacks the capacity in terms of knowledge on issues concerning corruption. In short, the fight against corruption is complicated by the lack of a single strategy capable of eliminating corruption in Malawi’s public service. Furthermore, the weaknesses in the formal and informal institutions within the bureaucratic structure specifically the law and practice of Corrupt Practices Act (CPA) of 1995 undermine the effectiveness of anticorruption drive. The CPA does not adequately serve as a deterrent to corrupt practices by individuals. The fight against corruption is constrained the CPA’s provision relating to appointment and consent to prosecute corruption cases. For example, the Act gives the President the appointing power of the Director of ACB and it also gives the power to the Director of Public Prosecution (DPP) without whose consent corruption cases cannot be taken to court. Section 42 (1) of the Act underlines that no prosecution for an offence under part IV of the Act shall be instituted except by or with the written consent of the DPP. Several cases have been dropped after the ACB had completed investigations while others await DPP’s consent which was never given. The key institutions in the drive against corruption are predominantly controlled by politicians who ultimately wield enormous influence. Furthermore, the enormous presidential powers which include appointment and dismissal of the chief executives of the institutions including the Director of the ACB erode the institutions’ independence (Matonga, 2015). Thus, the
ACB is constrained by political influence to effectively deal with high level corruption cases as it lacks the functional independence with the President as the appointing authority.

Overall political and policy environment has not been sufficiently conducive to the success of the measures partly attributed to neopatrimonialism and politicisation of the Public service. Despite the adoption of multiparty democracy strong patronage networks exist in Malawi’s bureaucracy and political party circles. Scholars have used terms such as personal rule and neopatrimonialism for ‘patrimonialism’, a concept developed by Weber which referred to political power characterised by rule based on personal prestige and patronage (Leonard and Straus, 2003: 1-3). Most senior public officials are political appointees and their deployment is influenced by ‘political connections and networks’ based on political affiliation, gender and ethnicity, religion and family ties rather than merit (MNISAR,2013:27; Kainja, 2016). The bureaucracy is vulnerable to the ruling party’s directions and removal from their post on political consideration. The practice is compounded the requirement that public servants must be loyal to the government of the day (often confused with ruling party). As a result, public officials tend to give more control rights to politicians and serve in a manner to retain the patrimonial authority and status of the executive (Kainja, 2016). In practice, perceptions of lack of sympathy to the ruling party by the bureaucracy has led to demotions or dismissal. Thus, the politically neutrality and integrity of Malawi public service is eroded. This generates a political ethos which attaches a relatively low value to ethics behavior.

Resources

The inadequate resources in terms of quality and quantity of staff and skills; material and financial resources and physical facilities and equipment results in weak institutional and individual capacity, authority and sanctions which undermine the fight against corruption. Most institutions are characterised by inadequate human, technical and financial resources. For instance, inadequate financial resources in institutions such as the ACB, the National Audit Office and the media translate into weak human resource capacity, high staff turnover and lack of career development opportunities for staff (OSISA, 2017). For example, Phiri (2018) notes that the ACB experiences a high staff turnover due to unfavourable conditions of service. Between 2016 and 2017, thirteen (13) officers have left the ACB to join other rewarding institutions. The respondents remarked during interviews that: the ACB is a toothless bulldog that does not bite’ because it lacks adequate people with the required technical skills in areas of investigation and prosecution. Similarly, the Ombudsman does not possess adequate capacity to fulfill its mandate due declining funding over the years barely adequate not only for the operations but also for public officers’ remuneration (UNDP, 2016:16).

Disposition

The disposition or behavioural aspects of the public officials such as interests, attitudes, discretion, motivation and commitment or sympathy, neutrality, or hostility affected the anticorruption strategy implementation. The study established that while there are a number of dedicated public servants in position of power who are genuinely striving for combating corruption some have strong vested interest in ensuring that the fight against corruption is hardly successful. The loss of public resources is of little concern to them. The politicisation of the public service degenerates into partisan and other narrow, particularistic interests undermine the power and independence in executing their duties particularly to prosecute high-level corrupt officials (MNISAR, 2013:29). The greedy and materialistic culture among the political elites and their cronies perpetuate political ethos of kudyerera (translated as sharing the spoils) while poverty and inequality provides fertile ground for rent seeking,
patronage and private gains through accumulation of power and wealth. According to Phiri (2018), there is a small and dormant middle class with only 16.3% of the population living in the urban areas as well as a general culture of silence as citizens do not readily report corruption even when they witness it. Therefore, there is lack of a critical mass and vibrant middle class in Malawi which can speak against corruption.

Conclusions

In conclusion, the study shows that despite efforts put in place to combat corruption, structural and systemic factors undermine the effectiveness of the anticorruption strategies. Despite the legal, policy and institutional frameworks the consequences of corruption continue to threaten human, political, social and economic development. The fight against corruption is complicated by the lack of a single strategy capable of eliminating corruption in the public service. In practice, there are no quick fixes and no short answers for the elimination of corrupt practices and unethical behaviour in the public service. Nonetheless, there is need for multi-dimensional strategies and diversified approaches directed towards combating corruption effectively in the broader context of enhancing good governance. Attention must be paid to merit based human resource processes, leadership and management development issues – capacity development and enforcement, compliance and motivation aspects and active involvement of the citizens in governance and incentivizing the reporting of corrupt practices.

The points of action should include conducting tailor-made courses to inculcate ethical values in public servants; strict enforcement of the code of ethics and conduct and any violation should be met by appropriate sanctions and punishment; government auditors should forecast areas where inefficiency could occur, report timeously to Parliament, and ensure that remedial steps are taken to prevent such inefficiencies from occurring. The human resource management systems must be strengthened through among others institutionalization of meritocracy and transparency in the recruitment, selection process and reward systems, compulsory ethics training, regular performance appraisals, and monitoring and evaluation of public resource use. Furthermore, watch dog bodies and public institutions should encourage client groups and the members of the public to report unethical practices by issuing guarantees of anonymity, setting up hotlines, and encouraging citizen groups to act against maladministration. In short, there is a need for pragmatic approaches which places premium on ethical leadership, enforcement of a code of conduct, capacity development and giving more resources and independence to investigative and watchdog bodies and establishment of a hospitable organisational environment for effective promotion of ethics behaviour the Public service.

References


Chimjeka, R., CSOs Decry Nepotism and Other ills, Nation on Sunday, 23 April 2017.


World Bank, (2010)., *Social Development Notes: Demand for Good Governance*, the 2010. pp1-3

Corruption in Public Procurement in Uganda: What to Do?

Robert Agwot Komakech*
University of Nairobi / Uganda Management Institute
E-mail: kagwot@gmail.com

Abstract

Public procurement corruption in Uganda is high, according to global standards and public opinion. It takes a substantial amount of the national budget and is increasingly considered as a barrier in reducing the country’s levels of poverty. Despite the existing legal and institutional framework to fight corruption in public procurement in Uganda, the government seems to have lost track. While most studies looked at causes, consequences and remedies of corruption in general with little attention on public procurement, this study filled the knowledge gaps by examining the systemic drivers that enable corrupt practices to thrive and reproduce in government procurement. The researcher used documentary review and interviewed Heads of Procurement and Disposal Units from local and central governments as well as other district technocrats and politicians. The finding showed that; informal power network, weak contracting expertise, Old Boys’ Network, regulatory and institutional framework as systemic drivers of corruption in public procurement. The study concludes that the citizens, government and civil society organizations with support from development partners should take drastic action to shake up the already build-up system that systematised corruption at every stage of procurement cycle in Uganda.

Key Words: Corruption, Public Procurement, Public Procurement Corruption, Old Boys’ Network

Introduction

The main challenge of public procurement globally is corruption. A study by OECD (2016) shows that public procurement is most vulnerable to corruption due to complexity of the procurement process, the close interaction between public officials and businesses, and the multitude of stakeholders. Early studies by Coolidge & Rose-Ackerman (1997) revealed that corruption in public procurement is often caused by top officials. These officials overrule the Evaluation Committee/ Contracts Committee decisions and disregard the existing procurement laws. Various types of corrupt acts may exploit these vulnerabilities, such as embezzlement, undue influence in the needs assessment, bribery of public officials involved in the award process, or fraud in bid evaluations, invoices or contract obligations. In Bulgarian, Balsevich & Podkolzina (2014) discovered that a large share of contracts are still awarded to a few large companies. Consequently, it prevents efficient firms from participating in public procurement procedures.

Globally, experts in economic development, political science, management, procurement, public financial management, economics and criminology agree on several consequences of public procurement corruption. Strand of literature indicates that public procurement corruption lead to low economic growth, reduced public revenues and increased poverty. Due to the negative effects and widespread existence of corruption, many countries implemented anti-corruption policies. For instance, China, the Philippines and South Korea have all strengthened detection and punishment of corrupt activities in recent years. This is contrary to Finland. In Finland, despite the absence of comprehensive anti-corruption procurement strategy, level of corruption is low. Between 2012 and 2017, TI ranked Finland in 3rd position out of 180 countries with 88.6 out of 100 as the least corrupt country in the world. Notably, even the Action Plan to Reduce Economic Crime and the Shadow Economy does not identify procurement anti-corruption measures in Finland. The absence of these measures in Finland were due to three related factors; (1) high level of public confidence in institutions, good administration and self-control of civil servants; (2) a functioning control environment facilitated by the decentralized legislative framework, tight financial monitoring and professional peer-control; and (3) heavy regulated and
strong legalistic tradition of administrative culture at the frontline of the fight against corruption. Elsewhere in the world corruption is real and cost governments in both the fight against and service delivery.

By 2016, International Monetary Fund (IMF) reported that corruption induced annual global losses of 2 trillion US dollars. Similarly, CoST (2012) estimated 10-30% of the investment in publicly funded construction projects to have been lost due to mismanagement and corruption. In words of CoST, it is estimated that the value of global construction (bridges, dams, railways and airport) output will reach US $ 17.5 trillion per annum by 2030; of which about US$ 6 trillion could be stolen through procurement corruption annually. Passas (2007) attributed this to government’s increased dependence on private contractors; increased tolerance of conflict of interest in the procurement processes; inadequate insistence on and monitoring of contractor performance; and hostility to procurement controls. This finding is supported by OECD (2016) which found that significant corruption risks in most OECD countries like France, South Korea and Denmark also arise from conflict of interest in decision-making.

It is also worth to note that, corruption in public procurement is at all levels of government (national and sub-national levels). OECD (2016) suggested that decentralizing public procurement narrows the scope for corruption. The assumption to this is that politicians and civil servants at subnational levels are more accountable to the citizens they serve; they are more in touch with specific needs and contexts of their constituencies; and have pressure from the electorates on quality services. This assertion is consistent with President YK Museveni statement made during 25th anniversary of Transparency International (TI) held at Imperial Royale Hotel in Kampala. The President said:

“I made a miscalculation when I trusted the elected people to fight corruption. We thought there was corruption because civil servants were not elected. We decided to elect leaders from among the people, and we thought they would not be the same.”

Furthermore, Chen, Schneider & Sun (2018) studied corruption in China’s Provinces and found that the level of corruption significantly increases with the expansion of government units and public investment. Similarly, the African Governance Report IV (2016) noted that public procurement corruption thrive in institutions with inadequate structures and processes. The report highlighted three main factors that have led to increase in procurement corruption; (1) the level of institutional weakness which makes it possible for political leaders and public servants to misuse national resources and abuse their power without being checked; (2) the continued decline in the living standards of public servants associated with poor incentives which makes corruption a very attractive and viable means of social livelihood; and (3) the blind eye often turned to corruptors by western countries.

Historical Background of Corruption in Public Procurement in Uganda

The history of public procurement corruption in Uganda can be explained in three phases. Phase one included the decade (1993-2002) towards public procurement reforms; second phase is first decade (2003-2012) of procurement reforms and the last phase includes the second half of decayed of procurement (2013 to date).

Phase One: From 1993-2002

In the early 1990s, corruption in public procurement was known to only the parties involved in the contract (principal and agent). The public had no idea about procurement or contractors and though contractors were giving free services. According to Basheka (2013) the beneficiaries were not consulted on what they need and there were no standard guidelines. These resulted into air supply and purchase of obsolete items. The practice...
was high in defense since army shops were established to supply army staff with subsidized items and procurement was non-competitive. Quite often, the army purchases were termed as ‘Classified Purchases’ meaning information or document about the procurement is officially stated to be secret. However, the classified items like the four (4) Mi-24 helicopters unearthed the level of corruption in procurement in Uganda especially defense. Out of the four helicopters two (2) of them could not fly, $800,000 was paid as kick back. According to Tangri & Mwenda (2003), the fuel tanks for the helicopters were too small for purposes of flying from Gulu airbase to as far as Juba in Southern Sudan and return to base without refueling. These helicopters were also procured without any tendering or bidding process.

The major reason for this conduct is monopoly and discretionary power. Tangri & Mwenda (2003) opined that, top leaders were using their virtually unfettered discretionary authority to manipulate tenders for private. Heggstad, Froystad & Isaksen (2010) observed that, the more a procurement officer have ability to influence demand and preferences, the greater the corruption opportunity in procurement. The conduct have serious consequences on competition and value for money. Munzhedzi (2016) cited Klitgaard, Maclean-Abaroa & Lindsey-Parris (2000) remark that successful prevention of corruption requires public official’s discretion to be limited and clarified, monopoly power to be reduced and transparency to be increased. Contributing to the same debate, Basheka (2013) revealed the lack of harmonized legal and institutional frameworks to guide the 1992 Military Tender Board (MTB), 1993 National Medical Stores (NMS), 1994 Police Tender Board (PTB) and 1994 District Tender Board (DTB) created by the Central Tender Board (CTB) to regulate government procurement. The frameworks had several limitations ranging from over centralization of procurement, lack of transparency and accountability, inefficiency, high emergency procurement, lack of procurement plans, lack of standardize procurement documents (guidelines, laws and regulations), lack of competition, air supply and purchase of obsolete items due to non-involvement of user departments (PPDA 2007 Report; Sabiti & Muhumuza, 2013; Basheka & Kabatereine, 2013; Komakech, 2016). These challenges paved way for procurement reforms in 2003.

Phase Two: From 2003-2012

This was a period in which African countries like Ghana, South Africa, Kenya, Rwanda and Tunisia among others were responding to donor’s conditions to foreign aids. The donors wanted clear institutional and regulatory frameworks on how their money will be spent in countries development and mechanism of accountability. As a result Uganda reformed its procurement system in 2003 following the 2001 recommendations made by World Bank in Country Procurement Assessment Report (CPAR). These recommendations were termed as the four pillars of sound procurement and they include:

a) Legislative and Regulatory Framework;
b) Central Institutional Capacity (institutional framework and procurement capacity);
c) Procurement Operations and Market Practice; and
d) Integrity of Public Procurement System

The key stakeholders for the implementations were; Public Procurement & Disposal of Public Assets Authority (PPDA), Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development (MoFPED), Ministry of Local Governments (MoLG), Ministry of Public Service (MPS), Uganda Revenue Authority (URA), Auditor General (AG), Parliament, Procuring and Disposing Entities (PDEs), procurement professionals if facilitated by PPDA and donors. With high stakeholders involvement, its’ assumed when the four recommendations are fulfilled; the Government of Uganda will be able to provide valuable feedback to the donors in regard to its procurement
spend. To this effect, there has been improvement in procurement practices in terms of transparency and competition through:

- Advertisement of tenders and issuing of good quality Standard Bidding Documents (SBDs) to bidders;
- Introduction of unambiguous and neutral technical specifications;
- Introduction of objective evaluation criteria;
- Separation of evaluation of bidder’s qualification from technical and financial evaluation;
- Conducting bid opening the same day as the deadline for bid submission;
- Allowing adequate bid preparation time to bidders;
- Removal of barriers to participation by foreign bidders;
- Conduct of due diligence / post-qualification in the absence of pre-qualification;
- Recognition of procurement as a distinct profession;
- Provision of Code of Ethics for procurement professionals;
- Establishment of clear administrative review procedures among others

However, the PPDA Report for 2003/2014 and 2014/2015 showed non-compliance to the reforms in several areas, for instance, most entities conducted procurement without procurement plans, interference of procurement process by senior officials, lack of suppliers records and evaluations reports, several retrospective approvals of contracts in all entities and inadequate staff in the department both Procuring and Disposing Entities (PDEs) and the Authority. Between these two periods, the Authority conducted training to 7620 among central governments, statutory bodies, local governments, media, civil society organisations, contractors/ service providers, procurement professionals and the Authority staff in areas of; public procurement and disposal frameworks, principles of public procurement, procurement planning, preparation of statements of requirements, pre-qualifications and bidding, disposal of public assets, bid evaluation and contract management (PPDA Report, 2005). These trainings were aimed to improve the capacity of procurement stakeholders in order to comply with the regulations and guidelines. These results are not different from the 2011 PPDA procurement audit report 84 PDEs (39 central governments and 45 local governments). The report indicated that most entities were still using direct procurement method without sufficient justification and conducted procurement outside the plan. Poor records keeping, delayed completion of works, high rate of administrative review applications and poor contract supervision and corruption were also indicated in the report. In support Sabiiti & Muhumuza (2013) stated that the high rate of administrative review signifies the level of confidence providers have in the adjudication process of public procurement and transparency level against the assertion that procurement is getting worse.

During the period, several high level procurement corruption were also committed and these include: (1) influence-peddling in the procurement of CHOGM cars, road construction and repairs, and the renovation of Entebbe Airport; (2) air supply of 70,000 bicycles to Ministry of Local Government; and (3) incomplete delivery of National Identity Cards in 2011 to Ministry of Internal Affairs. According to Booth & Mutebi (2009) the authors reported that officials on the technical evaluation committees sometimes have interest or major stake in the contracts on the table; hence it’s very easy to influence the whole process for the contractors they prefer. Contributing to the same debate, the Uganda’s leading daily Newspaper reported that World Bank influenced the international biding exercise that selected China Road and Bridge Cooperation (CRBC) and Parkman Ltd as the project contractors’ and consultant respectively in the construction of Pakwach-Nebei road (53kms) where an estimate of UGX shillings 22 billion was lost through shoddy work (New Vision, Tuesday, October 2, 2015).
By 2012, 27% procurement contracts were satisfactory as compared to 20% in 2010. The underlying reasons to the unsatisfactory performance were: in some Entities were: political interference in the procurement process; failure to respect procurement structures; understaffing of the PDUs; fraudulent and corruption tendencies leading to the award of tenders to firms without sufficient capacity; collusion of bidders in the tendering process; failure to develop procurement specifications; weak internal controls; and failure to appoint contract managers (PPDA Report, 2013; Komakech & Machyo, 2015). This report result is consistent with the Inspectorate of Government (2008) 3rd National Integrity Survey Report which found the existence of corruption in public procurement as reported by 71.8% surveyed respondents. The report also revealed that contracts were paying bribes over 10% of the contracted value. These have a bearing effect to contractors and quality work.

**Phase Three: From 2013-todate**

In 2014, the Authority amended PPDA Act 2003 and PPDA Regulations 2006. The amendments included inclusion of Contract Management, review of procurement thresholds and preference scheme among key amendments in order to improve the procurement performance. Accordingly, the amendments resulted to huge strides in procurement performance in Uganda. For instance, of the 114 (48 Central Governments and 66 Local Governments) entities with procurement value of UGX 3.73 Trillion audited by the Authority, 89.5% of them at least registered satisfactory compliance level as compared to 27% compliance rate 5 years ago. However, of 36 Procuring and Disposing Entities (PDEs) in both Central and Local Government Entities as of June 2016, less than 10% of entities have achieved above 80% compliance rate (Komakech & Machyo, 2015; PPDA, 2017). These compliance rates were determined using four different classifications that is Unsatisfactory (Below 50%), Moderately Satisfactory (50-60%), Satisfactory (61-80%) and Highly Satisfactory (81-100%). According to (the Bulter Group cited by Komakech & Machyo, 2015) defined compliance as adhering to the law, regulations and standards that apply in a given procurement setting.

This study therefore adopted the Bulter Group definitions and found the notable compliance level in public procurement in the audited entities were in the functional areas of; PDUs, Contracts Committee, Evaluation Committees and Internal Controls which resulted to use of appropriate procurement methods, timely initiation of procurement and following the bidding processes (PPDA, 2017). However, procurement planning, contract management and records keeping remains the major challenge in entities; and complaints worth UGX. 970 Billion were investigated. The major grounds for investigations were in relation to corrupt practices in procurement such as; segregation of bidders, abuse of office, deliberate omission of procurement procedures, changing specifications during the bidding process, misleading and restrictive specification of requirements, and conflict of interest.

Despite the Procurement Act, Regulations and Guidelines supported with institutions like the Inspectorate of Government mandated to fight corruption and any kind of maladministration in public offices and Ministry of Ethics and Integrity as well as Budget Act 2003, Access to Information Act 2005, Auditor General Act 2008, Anti-Corruption Act 2009 and Whistle Blower Act 2010 that have contributed to high level of compliance in procurement systems in the country; there are claims of high level of corruption in public procurement especially in procurement of works and supplies/goods. Langseth (1999) commented that, the existing anti-corruption action has only produced a mountains of words with little results in terms of positive change. Sabiti, & Muhumuza (2013) reported collusion between bidders and PDEs and non-adherence to the principle of confidentiality. It is in this regard that, the researcher took a critical analysis some works projects that were heavily protested by the civil society organization, tax payers and political leaders. The analysis of literature revealed that; Uganda’s roads are highly priced as compared to Zambia and the rest of East African countries.
The cost is attributed to re-tendering the contracts due to conflict of interest, administrative review, influence peddling, poor market research and poor planning where works delay for years. For instance Kawempe-Kafu road (166kms) was initially budgeted at UGX. 30 billion but the UNRA management made a number of variations in prices citing the rise in prices of things like cement, fuel, bitumen, dollars among others leading to additional sum of UGX. 14 billion (New Vision, Wednesday, August 19, 2015). This situation also happened in the National ID first tender in 2011 and the work delayed for seven years and the project cost tripled; the Bujagali Power Dam where the project delayed for ten years and the project sum doubled; rehabilitation of Mukono – Kayunga (59 kms) and Kayunga–Njeru (45 kms) contract award was expected in October 2009 and this was never effected due to repeated administrative challenges to the bidding process by bidders; funds were unavailable to sustain procurement and procurement was delayed (Luyimbazi, 2014; The Independent, September 05-11, 2014). Furthermore, administrative challenges to the bidding process by bidders also caused a delay in the project commencement.

Similarly, the rehabilitation of Tororo–Mbale–Soroti (152kms) road was initially expected to commence by October 2009 but the contract was awarded in September 2010 which was 11 months behind the programme date. Despite the award, the project has completed more than 50 months instead of 18 months as per the contract and the road was commissioned in December 07, 2015 before some section of the road being completed. The delay was attributed to delayed issue of the road designs to the contractor at the time the contraction work was tendered. This led to a financial loss of UGX. 30 billion of tax payer’s money which was paid to the contractor in compensation for time lost since their equipment was lying idle for about two years with not even a single kilometer of the road made (The New vision, Friday, October 2, 2015). From this report, the cost of Tororo–Mbale–Soroti shifted from shillings 77 billion to 171 billion because there were mismatches in the contract due to changes made in the scope of works. This situation is in tandem with Arrowsmith & Trybus, (2003) who opined that procurement of works broadly consist of civil and building works, roads and waterways works as well as maintenance works carried out using public funds always need extreme care in procurement since they are of; high value, complex, potential to errors and unethical behavior. The underlying reasons to failure were:

**Influence Peddling**

Influence peddling is one of the major reasons of contract delay and failure in Uganda. According to Booth & Mutebi (2009), the authors point out that Officials on the technical evaluation committees sometimes have an interest or major stake in the contracts on the table and it’s very easy to influence the whole process for the contractors they prefer. Contributing to the same debate, the Uganda’s leading daily Newspaper reported that World Bank influenced the international biding exercise that selected China Road and Bridge Cooperation (CRBC) and Parkman Ltd as the project contractors’ and consultant respectively in the construction of Pakwach-Nebbi road (53kms) where an estimate of UGX shillings 22 billion was lost through shoddy work, (New Vision, Tuesday, October 2, 2015). The action by Works Minister on Mukono-Katosi road where the minister directs Eutaws’ Contract and puts his position in writing to the UNRAs’ Executive Director as a result the minister conned UNRA UGX shillings 24.8 billion, caused a financial loss of 24 confirms that, The Independent, September 05-11, 2014. The probed committee reported that, the Works Minister influenced the changes of Tororo-Mbale-Soroti road from 9.3 meters to 6 meters contrary to the contract. Interestingly, the minister acknowledged his action saying, “Maintaining a six meter width, stating that the priority was to build a usable road since a better road project funded by development partners was in the pipeline,” while for Kampala-Entebbe expressway, the minister again changed the terms of reference for the contractor and even paid his own money for the photographs urging that he performed his in good faith and saved the government huge sums of money on several projects, (New Vision, Wednesday, October 14, 2015). According to Andvig & Fjeldstad,
(2001), the authors state that; “It is fraud when politicians and state agents take a share for closing their eyes on economic crimes, and it is serious fraud when they have an active role in it.”

**Poor Planning and Design by the Relevant Authority**
The contracts are sometimes awarded to the contractor(s) before the commencement date and scope of work has been approved for instance Tororo–Mbale–Soroti road was awarded to Dott Services Ltd before the Consultant, GIB International reviews the detailed design. As a result, the work is delayed due to non-issuance of the Bills of Quantities (BOQs) and detailed drawings by the consultant leading to financial loss and shoddy work. Okigbo, (2012) says, most of the roads in the country are designed in the ministries or by consultants some of who are not within the environment of the road work. This leads to poor understanding of the road environment which subsequently leads to poor road design and construction. It’s also important to note that, although Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets (PPDA) approves the variations, exorbitant contract variations of more than 100% shows inadequate planning on behalf of UNRA.

**Incompetence of Staff**
The technical staff from both the contractor and the buyer plays a great role in the construction works especially road works. Thus, because of incompetence of staff, there is differing quality of works on the same road by the same contractor, too many humps on a very long stretch of over 8kms causing incontinences to the road users. These are indication of incompetence of staff or lack of close quality control by the supervising consultant. Okigbo, (2012) laments that, even the multinational construction companies in the country their workers display inadequate knowledge of the process of road construction. In contrary, the Auditor General Report, (2010) postulates that; the UNRA staff both at Head Quarters and at the District stations is stretched with increased workload due to increased network length and increased budgets. The District offices have a lean structure with few engineers and few technicians to be able to supervise many works at the same time.

**Poor Supervision of Works**
Some of these supervisors who have low knowledge of the work find it difficult to deliver adequate supervision at the site. Some of the faults on the roadway like depressions, cracks and even pothole can occur due to improper workmanship that resulted from wrong supervision. Wrong supervision could result to improper application of the material and operation of the works. The Auditor General Report, (2010) shows, that most of the supervision of works was done in-house by UNRA staff. For instance in some projects, project consultant was not posted while in projects where the consultant was posted, the consultant contribution to the project in relation to the terms of reference was not clear as in the case of Rakai/ Mbarara Border-Rakai road contracted at UGX. 1,125,549,700=/. Here, the consultant was posted after the commencement of work without any terms of reference.

**Poor Quality of the Construction Materials**
Okigbo, (2012) asserts that, the use of low quality aggregate adversely affects the quality of the roads in Nigeria. This sometimes occurs in the form of the improper grading of aggregates for sub base and poor sub grade soil. The use of extreme cohesive and expansive soil as sub grade soil results in prolonged consolidation and unnecessary settlement of the roadway, Okigbo, (2012). Therefore, most of the construction companies in the country do not have adequate laboratory facilities for testing the construction materials.

**Lack of Cost Control**
The unexpected or sudden increases in the cost of fuel, construction materials and other inputs; have affected roads project implementation; and this has resulted in reducing the scope or dropping of some project
components. This compromises the quality of work to be done since the contractor will squeeze the planned budget to cover the entire scope of work and at worst where the same type of road has sharp discrepancy in price as in the case of Kyapa-Kasensero road where the cost per kilometre is UGX shillings 29 million while that of Masaka-Bukakata -Lambu is UGX shillings 50 million yet these roads are in the same locality as highlighted in the Auditors’ General Report, (2010). This is an indication that there is lack of cost control during tendering and award of contracts. Furthermore, some works are erroneously called periodic maintenance works when they were more related to rehabilitation or new construction works. The above cases of non-compliances, will provide clear understanding on the concepts of corruption, public procurement corruption in the context of Uganda, levels of procurement corruption, and finally conclusions and policy implications. This article focuses its analysis on the national and international publications in regards to procurement. Secondary data involved detailed review of existing literature and government reports on public procurement and implementation progress. Key among government reports were the Auditor General Reports and Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets (PPDA) reports.

Understanding of Concepts
In this section, the researcher briefly described the concept of public procurement, corruption and procurement corruption within the context of public sectors.

Public Procurement

Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority defined procurement as; “the acquisition by purchase, rental, lease, hire purchase, license, tenancy, franchise, or any other contractual means of any type of works, services, goods/ supplies or any combination.” In 2015, OECD also defined public procurement as the process of identifying what is needed; determining who the best person or organisation is to supply this need; and ensuring what is needed is delivered to the right place, at the right time, for the best price and that all this is done in a fair and open manner. The definition points that efficient and effective public procurement of goods/ supplies, services and works is vital to the delivery of essential services to citizens hence fulfilling the core purposes of government. In Uganda, the National Development Plan II put public procurement at a center in delivering goods and services like education, health, defense, tourism and infrastructures (like energy, roads and railway) necessary to accomplish government mission in a timely, economical and efficient manner.

Basheka and & Kabatereine (2013) opined that public procurement has effectively contributed to economic development of Uganda. It has created several business opportunities along the supply chain; promoted Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs); encouraged innovations; build public trusts in government; created programmes for educational institutions; promoted competition among service providers; maximized value for money for public sector expenditure; improved service delivery level to the buyers; enhanced well-beings of citizens; and promoted accountability and transparency in public sector. As a government pillars in service delivery, procurement spending in Uganda is higher than the average 19.3% share of GDP in South Asia and 14.9% in Sub-Saharan Africa. Given the magnitude of government expenditures on goods and services, (Hoekman & Sanfilippo, 2018) noted that public procurement systems incorporate procedures that aim to ensure that contracts are awarded to the lowest cost suppliers that satisfy the technical specifications that need to be met. The large spending also makes it vulnerable to corruption which is against the expectations from governments and development partners’ world over.
Corruption and Public Procurement Corruption

The word “Corruption” has a root in the Latin Corrumpere meaning to spoil or destroy. The concept is difficult to define precisely because of its dynamics. Corruption means different things to different people and manifest everywhere including in family, Church, Mosque, school, Civil Society Organisations (CSOs), government, private organisations and international agencies. Strand of literature demonstrate that corruption is a term of many meanings (Rose-Ackerman, 2004; Ogbeidi, 2012; Klitgaard, 2015; IMF, 2016). Rose-Ackerman (2004) added that the meaning of corruption shifts with the speaker to cover a range of action that they find undesirable. It is the most discussed topic by the public; ahead of unemployment, poverty, politics and terrorism in both local and world news. The many meanings of the word is what Argandona (2006) explained (corruption) as polyvalent and changeable term. Researcher therefore presents the different definitions and opinions from different authors as to what corruption is, what it covers and measurements then specified public procurement corruption.

To many politicians in Kenya and Uganda, they describe corruption as ‘stealing of public funds’ and those involved in the act should be called ‘Thieves’ instead of ‘Corrupt Officials’. By this therefore, Africans understand the terms ‘Theft’ and ‘Thief’ and regard corruption as a modern and ambiguous concept to many Africans. However, the most used and widely acceptable definition of corruption by World Bank, International Monetary Fund (IMF), Anti-Corruption Organisations, Civil Society Organisations and public institutions is “the abuse of public office/ power for private (unofficial / political) gain,” (World Bank, 1997; Langseth, 1999; Myint, 2000; Rose-Ackerman, 2004; Ogbeidi, 2012; Kaufmann & Vicente, 2005; Klitgaard, 2015). On the other hand, Transparency International defines corruption as “the abuse of entrusted power for private gain”. Where abuse implies a breach of regulations.

According to Thornhill (2012) corruption means offering or granting, directly or indirectly to a public official or any other person, of any goods of monetary value, or other benefit, such as a gift, favour, promise or advantage for himself or herself or for any other person or entity, in exchange for any acts or omission in the performance of his/ her public functions. In this case, public office is abused for private gain when an official accepts, solicits, or extorts a bribe; and when private agents actively offer bribes to circumvent public policies and processes for competitive advantage and profit.

Public Procurement Corruption

Public procurement corruption was revealed in the first Japan tender announcement of 1678 for the construction of a bridge at Reiganjima and Minamikayabacho in Edo and repair work of trunk road in Edo (Isohata, 2009 cited by Komakech, 2018). Later in 1775, it became rampant in US army procurement. By the time, receiving kickbacks from contractors was normal since it was the only way of compensation for civil servants (Royal Navy Clerk and currently known as Contracting Officer) in charge of procurement (Komakech, 2018; Keeney, 2007; Nuxoll, 2006). The driver to this was absence of regulations to protect tax payers money for instance agents would use public money to finance private ventures and only pay the money back if the private investment was successful. In most case Keeney (2007) noted that contractors would drive prices up and quality down for the contracted works, services and supplies especially in roads, foodstuffs, army uniforms and equipment. The nature is not different from Uganda except the time. In Uganda, public procurement corruption became more pronounced in early 1990s in defense till it widely spread in all sectors of the governments. The government and development partners looked at the existing public procurement procedures as a tax adding to the cost of providing public services.
According to World Bank (2004), Public Procurement refers to the giving, receiving or soliciting directly / indirectly of anything of value to influence the action of public official in the procurement process or contract execution. Procurement corruption is committed once procurement laws and regulations are broken for the benefit of an individual or group involved (contractor, public officials and politicians) in procurement against the interest of the tax payers (users). Basheka & Tumutegyereize (2013) added that public procurement corruption is a deliberate failure to follow the expected minimum standard behavior in managing procurement process of pre-tendering, tendering and post-tendering phases. Since there are few studies in the topic in Uganda, some of the national studies showed that public procurement corruption is more prevalent at the procurement planning stage, bid evaluation, contract award and contract management stages (Basheka, 2011; Oluka and Ssennoga, 2008).

Contributing to the same debate Schöberlein (2019) also revealed that corruption in public procurement is at all stages of the procurement process (planning, bidding, bid evaluation, implementation and monitoring) and ranges from bribery and kickbacks to embezzlement and collusion. This manifestation is similar to countries in Asia and Africa for instance, ESAAMLG (2019) study in selected countries in Africa in which Uganda was inclusive found that tender award was more rampant to corruption due to political influence and abuse of power. Surprisingly in 2008, Oluka and Ssennoga (2008) empirical study found that bid evaluation stage was least prone to corruption as the choice of procurement method, notification of award and contract award by the contracts committee in Uganda. The major consequences is reduced quality of goods and services and waste of public funds. As a result several reforms were put in place to prevent procurement corrupt practices. This study also identified the various corruption practices in public procurement in Uganda. Procurement corrupt practices can be committed by the user department, an engineer, a contractor and / sub-contractors or suppliers down the contractual chain. UNODC (2004) defined corrupt practices as, “offering, giving, receiving, or soliciting, directly or indirectly, anything of value to influence the action of a public official in the selection process or in contract execution.” The forms in which they are committed include; bribery, influence peddling, procurement fraud and favoritism:

**Bribery**

This is the major form of corruption in public procurement. It can occur before, during, or after (kickbacks) award of a contract. It refers to the offering of gifts to another individual, in order to try and influence their opinions or types of behaviour. In public procurement, bribes can occur in order to speed the procurement process. It can be inform of kickbacks, facilitation payment, payment of expenses (like school fees, construction material, and medical bills), and cooperate hospitality (gifts, entertainment and travel). IMF, (2016) revealed that bribe money is recovered by inflating prices, reducing the quality of work by using inferior materials, and billing of works not performed / air delivery. In local governments in Uganda, Oluka & Ssennoga found that the bribe money is often included in the bid price. Surprisingly, although hugged amount (Soreide, 2002) is lost through bribe worldwide, of the more than 50% contractors admitted to have paid bribe; new contractors have to pay more bribes and meet corrupt demands than the established firms / contractors (Soreide, 2002). In addition, small companies are more exposed to bribe payment that large ones.

According to Rose-Ackerman (2004), the author reported that corrupt firms had lower average growth rates than others. This is because bribery imposes different costs on different firms especially on government policies and regulations. These practice is not different from Uganda contractors because since they have confidence that after paying bribe they will get contract as promised. This is consistent with the PPDA 2nd Public Procurement Integrity Survey 2016 reported that 81.1% of service providers acknowledged the presence of corruption in
public procurement in Uganda with 40% agreeing to have offered bribes of 10 to 20% of value contract to procuring and disposing entity team which includes; procurement officials, engineers, accounting officers, members in finance department, political leaders, Resident District Commissioner (RDC), user department team, and members of the evaluation and contract committees. The variation in the amount of bribe is due to contractor’s different bargaining power and people involved. Bribing for works and soliciting for bribes can lead to serious reputational damage and collusion between bidders among others. However, in Uganda, some bidders pay bribe because they thing that their competitors are doing likewise. Some of the major form of bribery in public procurement include:

- **Kickback**: This is a form of bribe referring to an illegal secret payment made in return for a favour or service rendered. The term is often used to describe returns from a corrupt or illegal transaction or the gains from rendering a special service. Rose-Ackerman (2004) attributed kickback payment to over regulations of the procurement; hence bribe is paid to bypass the red-tape. However, the amount of kickbacks is determined by the number of decision making centers; hence the fewer officials involved the less amount paid. A study by Rose-Ackerman (2004) found that majority of bidders would pay bribe if asked. Why? Bidders perceive that their competitors are also paying.

- **Speed Money (Facilitation Payment)**: Is money paid by the contractor to the procuring and disposing entity key stakeholders paid to quicken processes caused by bureaucratic delays and shortage of resources. It normally paid to support the evaluation and contracts committee sittings, clearance by the Solicitor General especially for work contracts of UGX. 100 million and above, and to get approval from technical officers like finance officer, engineer and accounting officer, and contract management team.

- **Speed Corruption**: This involves the capacity to harass, delay or withhold decisions handed down by procurement officials unless a bribe is given. Basheka & Tumutegyereize (2013) observed that in Uganda, officials especially in finance and accounts departments tend to delay or fail to process the payment for providers until a bribe is paid or promised. It may also involve engineers in case of construction projects failing to issue a certificate of completion or issuing them when the works have not been completed. The most forms of corruption in Uganda include violations of procurement procedures, the use of high-ranking officials to influence procurement decision making and bribery-induced violations of procurement procedures by government officials in collaboration with providers.

**Influence Peddling**

This occurs when an individual solicits benefits in exchange for using his/her influence to unfairly advance the interests of a particular person or party. In Uganda, some of the procurement requirements could be written to favour or disfavor certain suppliers. In addition, some of the procurement budget are overstated so that excess allocations are shared among user departments and procurement officials; and sometimes the PDU amend the evaluation criteria after receipt of bids to suit their preferred bidder. Booth & Mutebi, (2009) noted that some officials on the technical evaluation committees sometimes have an interest or major stake in the contracts on the table and it’s very easy to influence the whole process for the contractors they prefer. Furthermore, Komakech (2020) also found that some politicians always influence the community to accept items they (community) rejected earlier from the contractor because of poor quality. The community are sometimes intimidated either by mafia or politicians to accept what is being delivered without questions or else they will
miss it out. This approach reduces trust practice reduces transparency and competition hence poor service delivery since the entity excluded the qualified and experienced bidders in favour the bidder willing to give them kickbacks.

**Procurement Fraud**

This is a misrepresentation done to obtain unfair advantage by giving or receiving false or misleading information or facts. Procurement fraud includes intentional submission of false or inflated invoices by service provider(s); substantial change in contract conditions to allow more time and higher prices for the bidder; product substitution or sub-standard work or service not meeting contract specifications; and theft of new assets before being delivered to end-user. Komakech (2020) study in local government’s contract management in Uganda high level of fraud in procurement entities. For instance, most of the contracts at the districts were taken up by politicians and civil servants and these cause dilemma during bids evaluation and award, contract monitoring and evaluation, and payment challenges. In addition, substantial number of contracts were renegotiated hence leaving the user department, contractor, council and PDU having varying information.

**Favouritism**

This is a mechanism of power abuse that favours friends and close associates, and may include exempting the favoured persons from the application of certain laws or regulations or giving them undue preference in the allocation of scarce public resources. The favours in Uganda procurement are in form of bid rigging and manipulation of procurement process; collusion between the staff in the procuring entity and suppliers; providing inside information in order to enable the preferred bidder to position their bids successfully since the have information like price reserve, required qualifications and skills which other bidders do not have; and tailoring evaluation criteria to the preferred bidder. What should be noted that in Uganda, whenever, accounting officer is transferred to a new procuring and disposing entity; a number of contractors come along with them and they are given business with the very period and when the ‘godfather’ leaves the entity, you will not find them in the next financial year as well. This confirms to the claims by majority taxpayers that more than 55% of the contracts in Uganda are owned by either politicians or civil servants. This could be the reason why there is decry from the population reading the service delivery in all sectors and region of Uganda.

**Drivers of Public Procurement Corruption**

While public procurement process is most vulnerable to corruption, the following are the main drivers of corruption in Uganda public procurement:

a) **Complexity of the procurement:** Procurement of works like roads, railways, dams and bridges are most vulnerable to corruption because of designed nature and difficulty in measuring costs by ordinary citizen. A good number of works contracts in Uganda have not met the expectations of the tax payers either due to shoddy work or delays. These is because some entities delay to appoint appointment of consultants, amend designs after contract signing; and appoint contract supervisors with limited skills in order not to question the process.

b) **Opportunity of Bid Collusion:** This occurs when businesses that would otherwise be expected to compete, secretly conspire to raise prices or lower the quality of goods / services for purchasers who wish to acquire products or services through a bidding process. It manifest at several levels of procurement decisions: (1) Between line ministries and political leaders of implementing entities (Local
(2) Between contractors where contractors within the network agree in advance on who should submit a winning bid to the advertised competitive bidding; or who should submit a losing bids and then wait for compensation in terms cash or be subcontracted. The intention is to increase the chance of winning and inflate contract prices. It is always common in procurement where there are few number of service providers/ contractors of goods or services. The ultimate reason is that the fewer the number of providers, the easier to reach agreement and vize vise. (3) Collusion with citizens who benefit from the thieving public officers. This chain of collusion shows how widespread corruption is in public procurement in Uganda.

c) **Discretionary power**: Having authority and capability steer up corruption during the procurement process. For instance, the technical team like procurement officer and user department may use their discretion to draft procurement specifications and contractor’s requirements in terms of qualification without breaching the procurement regulations.

d) **Data on Procurement Spend**: Since regulation of public procurement in 2003, there has been no verified data on procurement spend in Uganda. The available data are all based on estimates both at local, regional and national level. This has made it identify areas that need improvement in terms of cost, compliance, performance, or whether to centralize the procurement in order to have economies of scales. Surprisingly, entities deny people who seek such information by making the process of acquisition cumbersome so that one gives up. This is done by asking the reason for which information is requested which sounds intimidating hence it discourages people from exercising their rights to information as provided in Uganda Constitution.

e) **Informal Network**: For the purpose of this study, an informal network refers to informal circle of people with the same goal and willing to help each other whenever there is opportunity to meet the goal. The common informal network is coiled among the politicians and their political sponsors and / agents. The network used all the available means either by intimidation or promise for promotion to influence public officials to act contrary to the law.

f) **Old Boys’ Network**: Most corruption in public procurement is committed through old boys’ network. For instance, in Uganda Accounting Officer in entity A may not bid any contract in the area of his / her jurisdiction but will network with Accounting Officer in entity K or Y and they do cross bidding where A bid to K and vise vize. In such a scenario, each party will fight for the other to ensure that the contract is awarded at whatever cost. Their action is very smart since the mandates public officials to participate in procurement contracts provided is not within their entity. Therefore, Old Boys’ Network refers to an organization of people or groups governed by personal contact with the aim to protect each other goal without disclosing it to non-members. The bond to the network are trust, commitment, influence level and loyalty.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

Corruption in public procurement is at average rate of 8.2% as compared to 10-30% the global rate. The manifestation vary from one entity to another; procurement method; type of procurement; and internal control systems in each procuring and disposing entities. Bribery is more pronounced during the contract evaluation,
award and contract management and the cost vary between 15-25% per contract. Ending this in the procurement process seems to be a difficult task because of strategies technical team use to seal corruption. These strategies among others include; (a) avoiding competition by using unjustified procurement method like direct sourcing or sole sourcing as well as intimidating bidders; (b) favoring abider willing to give the kickbacks by tailoring specifications; and (c) excluding qualified bidders from participation by ring-fencing procurement, plucking out critical pages like bid data sheet, bidding forms from the bidding document or having biased evaluation. The study finally concludes that the criticality of citizens, government and civil society organizations with support from development partners in shaking up the already build-up system that systematised corruption at every stage of procurement cycle in Uganda.

However, Agaba & Shipman (2007) acknowledged the difficulty in eradicating corruption from public procurement. Borrowing from IMF (2016), corruption is an extraordinary complex phenomenon and tends to persist over time. International Monetary Fund echoed that, the strategy to fight corruption will only be effective when it manages to convince key players that the rules of the game have indeed changed. This study therefore recommends the uptake of the following strategies to reduce the prevailing corruption level in the public sector procurement in Uganda:

- Many districts and government parastatals for years demonstrated low progress in improving their procurement due to weak governance and corruption issues. This study therefore recommends the government to take punitive action by; (1) Suspend money transfer to entities found to have abused / flouted their procurement till when they present effort to invigorate their procurement functions and; (2) Mandate each Procuring and Dispensing Entities (PDEs) to develop its own anti-corruption measures in addition to national and international standards that fits within the society in which they operate since corruption is a societal problem not government.

- There is need to recruit and promote women at top positions in the entities because of their passion in serving people all equally. Women fear to break procurement laws like accepting late submitted bids, tampering with the bids received in order to disqualify the bidder or influence the evaluation and contracts committee during procurement process.

- With education system being under criticism for not providing employees with right attitude, knowledge and skills; the university degree therefore does not guarantee everyone to make progress in ones’ career through personal merit. Therefore, the government through Ministry of Public Service-Uganda should use merit based recruitment and selection that give equal employment opportunity to all applicants without regard to political affiliation, religion, color, cadre /veteran status, age and race but should be solely on job related criteria of knowledge, skills, capability and attitude. This will instill discipline among civil servants since they will be responsible for their actions. The current political influence in the appointment of accounting officers have led to breached of procurement rules (favoring cadres in contractors) in the name of working for the interest of the party.

- Develop an application software for screening suspicious bids either print or online submissions. The software should be able to generate data for the lowest bidder, geographical location of winning bidder, bidders that withdraw from bidding unexpectedly, and the companies that always submit bids and never win. This will help the entity in making decision in regards to winning bidders that does not accept contracts and a bidder that subcontract most of its works to unsuccessful bidders.
PPDA should ensure that each entity have provide actual procurement spend before submitting the following year procurement plans. This will help in determining the national procurement spend and will guide the government in planning other than relying on the estimated procurement value by development partners and non-validated data.

There is need to strengthen political will to confront corruption from either top-down (from the president to the grass-root) or bottom-up approach. The bottom-up approach is initiated by public officials at the frontlines of service delivery or representatives of the civil society organizations. This approach is more likely to yield greater results since it builds on top government support in terms of governance structures, will and action. The action of political will is manifested by; application of credible sanctions, mobilization of stakeholders, learning and adaptation, choice of programme / policy, public commitment and allocation of resources, and government initiatives.

The author also recommends PPDA to amend the procurement regulation to cut the long administrative review process which limits bidders to lodged complaints because of delayed decisions. Since the bid collusion is associated with hand delivery and paper work, it’s prudent for the authority to transform from seal bids to negotiated bids in order to eliminate the collusion between bidders and will enable entities to identify the rigged bids because of the partners in presentations. This will also reduce the cost and time for bid preparations since submission will be electronics. The system will also reduce communication among bidders and entities.

References


ESAAMLG (2019). Procurement Corruption in Public Sector and Associated Money Laundering in the ESAAMLG Region, ESAAMLG, Dar es Salaam

Evans, B.R (No date). The cost of Corruption. Tearfund Christian action with the Worlds’ poor. Teddington, UK


Corruption and Nigeria’s Development Conundrum: The Need for a Benevolent Dictator
Akamere F.A.C & Osuagwu Cajetan
Department of Public Administration
Imo State Polytechnic, Umuagwo, Nigeria

Abstract

Nigeria is a country blessed with abundant human and material resources. Inspite of this however, the country which at independence was perceived as having the potentials to lead Africa in technology and other aspects of development, is today described as the poverty capital of the world. The social services sector, critical infrastructure including electricity, water, roads etc have almost collapsed, no thanks to virulent corruption. Foreign manufacturing companies hitherto operating in the country have over time relocated to neighbouring Ghana and other countries within the West African sub-region owing to epileptic supply of electricity despite huge sums of money yearly allocated to the power sector. This has complicated the unemployment problem in the country. Despite being among the world’s biggest crude oil producers, Nigeria today relies on imported refined patrol for domestic use as the four refineries in the country are in varying degrees of dilapidation despite the huge sums of money allotted annually for their turn around maintenance. This paper examines and analysis the issue of corruption and its consequences in Nigeria. It argues that there is a correlation between corruption, the country’s poverty and it’s current state of underdevelopment. It posits that the country’s political office holders hide under the protection of the immunity clause in the constitution to rob the country to a state of stupor. The paper states that corruption thrives in Nigeria not because there are no laws in the country’s legal system to deal with cases of corruption but because those laws are either not enforced or enforced in the breach. It asserts that the fight against corruption in Nigeria is often targeted at the opposition. Cases involving members of the ruling party are instead treated as a family affair. The rule of law is far from being observed. The paper therefore concludes that the solution to this problem lies in the emergence of a benevolent dictator who will ensure that laws are enforced not minding whose ox is gored.

Key Words: Corruption, Benevolent dictator, National Development

Introduction

At independence in 1960, Nigeria was seen by the world as having the human and material resources to emerge as an economic giant in Africa and beyond. She earned for herself, the sobriquet of “giant of Africa”. Other African countries looked up to her to provide leadership and serve as a model in their own aspirations for independence and national development. In terms of material resources, the country is blessed, not only with crude oil in prodigious amount, but solid minerals including coal, columbite, uranium, gold, bitumen, lead and zinc among others.

Inspite of this however, a good percentage of Nigerians are among the poorest humans on planet earth; living in extreme poverty (the cable 2019). The World Bank (2018) reported that 92.1% of Nigerians live on less than 5.5 dollars a day, describing it as the worst in the world. QUARTZAFRICA (2018) also reported that 86.9 Million Nigerians, representing about 50% of her estimated 180 Million population, now live in extreme poverty. The Human Development Index (HDI) for 2017, valued Nigeria at 0.532, which placed the country within the low human development category, positioning her at 157 out of 189 countries and territories captured.

Critical infrastructure, which the World Bank said is fundamental to increased GDP and hence, national development, are in varying degrees of dilapidation. According to the World Bank, every 1% investment in infrastructure leads to 1% increase in GDP, and this promotes national development. In Nigeria however, this critical sector including roads, electricity, water, rail ways, airports etc, lies comatose. The oil and gas sector is also not spared. The four refineries in the country are in a state of decrepitude, as a result of which the country now relies on imported patrol for domestic use, inspite of being Africa’s largest oil producer and 6th in the world (Gwaambuka 2018). The result is the exodus of major multinational companies to Ghana.
The Group Managing Director (GMD) of Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Dr. Maikanti Baru, revealed that Nigeria is the only member of OPEC that imports petrol and is currently the largest importer of premium motor spirit. In his words; “we actually import one million tonnes of PMS every month into a country that produces oil and gas and has refinery. It is a shameful thing, it doesn’t make sense (The African Exponent March 3, 2018). According to Tatenda Gwaambuka, it is indeed shameful that a resource rich country like Nigeria would be importing the products of its resources (Ibid). While huge sums of money are yearly mapped out for turn around maintenance of these refineries, budgetary allocations running into billions of naira are also made annually to fix infrastructure. Yet the sector lies prostrate as these monies are corruptly misappropriated. The culprits go scot free as political leaders lack the commitment and the political will to bring them to justice, just as the judicial system itself is mired in corruption.

This paper addresses the issue of corruption in Nigeria and argues among other things, that the country’s current state of underdevelopment is the direct consequence of virulent corruption, seemingly condoned by the political leadership. The political leaders inserted an immunity clause in the constitution, under which they enjoy immunity from prosecution for any crime they may commit while in office. It strongly argues that the persistence of corruption in Nigeria is not due to absence of laws, but because the laws are not strictly and sincerely enforced as the political leaders treat corruption cases involving members of the ruling party and, or ethnic group with kid’s gloves. The paper strongly argues that what Nigeria needs to eradicate corruption, realize her full potentials and move along the path of development, is a benevolent dictator.

Conceptual Analysis

Corruption

One problem with the issue of corruption is that there is no one best, and universally accepted definition of corruption. This makes corruption and what constitutes it, somehow country specific. This is the reason behind the different pseudo names used to refer to corrupt practices in Nigeria that make the act less offensive. Such slangs as kick back, public relations, 419, yahoo yahoo etc, are common in Nigeria.

To start with, the English Dictionary defines corruption as the “act of corrupting or of impairing integrity, virtue or moral principle”. Both World Bank and Transparency International, referred to corruption as the abuse of public office for private gains, for the benefit of the holder of the office or some third party (Ogbedi 2012). Public office is abused for private gain when an official accepts, solicits or extorts a bribe. It is also abused when private agents actively offer bribe, to circumvent public policies and processes for competitive advantage and profit. Public office can also be abused for personal benefit even if no bribery occurs through patronage, nepotism, the theft of state assets or diversion of state revenue (Omenka 2013).

Transparency International’s Corruption Perception Index, cited by PricewaterhouseCoopers PWC (2016), categorises Corruption, into three parts: Grand corruption, which refers to “Acts committed at a high level of government that distort policies or the central functioning of the state, enabling leaders to benefit at the expense of the public good”. Petty corruption. This involves “Everyday abuse of entrusted power by low and mid-level public officials in their interaction with ordinary citizens often trying to access basic public goods and services. Political corruption. This is the “Manipulation of policies, institutions and rules of procedure in the allocation of resources and financing by political decision makers, who abuse their position to sustain their power, status and wealth.
Political corruption often involves abuses by political office holders or government officials such as embezzlement or misappropriation, cronism and nepotism, including such other abuses that link public and private sectors in bribery, extortion, influence peddling, fraud etc (Ogbeidi 2012). This goes to show that corruption is antithetical to good governance, sustainable development, democratic processes and fair business practices (Ibid). PWC (2016), asserted that corruption is associated with poor public finance management and provision of goods. This according to it, is because:

- Corruption encourages tax avoidance, resulting in a lower tax base for government revenue collection.
- Corruption allows for government expenditure in vested interests rather than public interest. This results in a lack of provision for public goods such as infrastructure for businesses, education and health for households.

Corruption is also associated with erosion of talent in public institutions and therefore, government effectiveness. This happens as:

- Corruption encourages hiring based on nepotism, cronism and patronage, not merit. It therefore reduces the quality of the public institutions
- It puts in place unnecessary bureaucracy, thereby creating further opportunities for bribe.
- Thus, it weakens enforcement of contracts and property rights (ibid).

PWC further posited that corruption is associated with lower investment, and higher prices and barriers to entry for business. This is explained as follows:

Big companies are able to access public goods by leveraging their balance sheets. These include stable electricity and water pipes among others. Small firms cannot afford these and have to rely on the government for provision but corruption weakens public fund management and public goods provision. Therefore, it makes it more difficult for SMEs to compete. Furthermore, it states that corruption is associated with lower property rights and investment especially, Foreign Direct Investment (FDI). Corruption threatens property rights, discouraging investment that requires high capital expenditures as businesses are unwilling to place high capital at risk. This is why government policies aimed at creating SMEs, to grow the economy and mitigate unemployment has not made any significant progress. Many of the youths who have received training as welders, hairdressers, berbers, etc are still unable to start their own businesses because of their inability to raise money to buy generators, since the public power source cannot be relied on for any meaningful business.

Development

The term development is a many-sided concept. It is a multi-dimentional process that entails change from less to more desirable state (Omenka 2013). Development goes beyond economic indicators as it is both a physical process and a state of mind. While transformation of institutions is one aspect of development, the other is that it must be accompanied by change in the thinking of the people (Ujo 1995). Harden (2018) posits that development goes beyond growth. It includes growth as well as other aspects of improvement. The difference between them according to him is that growth is usually quantitative whereas development is usually qualitative.
Walter Rodney (1982) defined development in terms of capacity. As it applies to man, development became unique when man used his intellect and rationality to discover the laws of nature, and his skill to make tools so as to contain the increasing challenges posed by his environment. It is thus a many sided concept which can be economic, social, technological or scientific.

According to Rodney (1982:10) “A society develops economically as its members increase jointly, their capacity for dealing with the environment. This capacity for dealing with the environment is dependent on the extent to which they understand the laws of nature (Science), on the extent to which they put that understanding into practice by dividing tools (technology) and on the manner in which work is organized”.

**Benevolent Dictator**

When the word benevolent dictator or benevolent autocrat is mentioned, many people don’t want to heart of it, not minding the attachment of benevolence to it. They conclude that a dictator remains a dictator and cannot have anything positive to recommend it. What, actually is a benevolent dictator? Douglas Anele (2010), wrote that a benevolent dictator is “*a dictator who combines decisiveness with benevolence, discipline with fairness, incorruptibility, with incomparable desire to help the poor and the oppressed*”. According to him, a benevolent dictator is a leviathan or strong transformational figure (ibid). The major reason why people are not comfortable at the mention of the word “benevolent dictator” is the spectre of horror perpetrated by such dictators as; Benito Mussolini, Adolf Hitler, Joseph Stalin, Idi Amin, Mobutu Seseseko, Sani Abacha.

These and other dictators in history were, according to Anele, despicable and no serious society should celebrate their deplorable legacies. But who would condemn transformational figures such as Lee Kwan yew of Singapore and Jerry Rawlings of Ghana even though they were dictatorial (ibid). Wikipedia referred to benevolent dictatorship as a government in which an authoritarian leader exercises absolute political power over the state but is perceived to do so with regard for benefit of the population as a whole, standing in contrast to the decidedly malevolent stereotype of a dictator. According to it, a benevolent dictator may allow for some economic liberalization or democratic decision making to exist such as through public referenda or elected representatives with limited power and often makes preparation for a transition to genuine democracy during or after their term. It might be seen as a republican form of enlightened despotism. This is why they are seen as transformational leaders.

**How Institutionalization of Corruption by Nigerian Leaders affects the Economy and Stalls National Development**

This section discusses the entrenchment of corruption by political leaders at all levels in Nigeria since independence. It explains how these leaders, using their political positions and access to state power, raised corruption to the level of state policy.

Nigeria obtained her political independence from Britain on October 1, 1960. Going by the amount of human and material resources at her disposal, Nigerian’s were optimistic that the Euphoria that greeted the achievement of political independence would herald a new era of prosperity as they imagined Nigeria standing tall in the comity of nations.

Unfortunately, however, their hopes and aspirations were soon to be blighted by corruption unleashed upon the country by those they looked up to for direction. Corruption among political leaders began as soon as the drums
heralding independence died down. It did not take long before the Nigerian populace realized that they had merely elected wolves to take care of their flock.

The government under the leadership of Prime Minister Abubakar Tafawa Balewa and president Nnamdi Azikiwe, perceived their privileged positions as opportunity to enrich themselves and enlarge their coasts. The legislators were not left out in the looting spree. This stirred up the disappointment and anger of soldiers who watched from their barracks as the politicians arrogantly and ostentatiously displayed their ill-gotten wealth. This eventually led to the military intervention of January 15, 1966. Major Chukwuma Kaduna Nzeogu who led the coup, expressed this in his post coup broadcast: “Our enemies are the political profiteers, the swindlers, the men in high and low places that seek bribes and demand ten percent; those that seek to keep the country divided permanently so that they can remain in office as ministers or VIPs at least; the tribalists, the nepotists; those that have corrupted our society and put the Nigerian political calendar back by their words and deeds” (Ademayega 1981:89).

General Aguiyi Ironsi who took over powers as the head of state, in an attempt to sanitize the system instituted commissions of enquiry to investigate cases of corruption in the public sector of the ousted regime, including the Nigerian Ports Authority, Nigerian Railway Corporation and the then electricity corporation of Nigeria. The Commission found some ministers and other senior public servants guilty of misappropriation and unwholesome practices in the award of contracts (Okonkwo 2000).

While they were still in detention, General Yakubu Gowon took over power following the July 29, 1966 coup which toppled Ironsi regime and released the politicians found guilty of corruption by the ousted Ironsi regime. Not long after taking over, the Gowon’s regime became neck deep in corruption and cunningly devised the strategy of white elephant projects as a means of concealing its corrupt and dubious activities. Few years after the civil war, the country experienced the famous oil boom. The regime, as a result, had enough money to play with as even ministers and military governors became supper rich and arrogant.

As Nigerians were wondering what hit them, some soldiers on July 29, 1975, overthrew the Yakubu Gowon regime and Murtala Mohammed took over as the new head of state. Murtala immediately moved to sanitize the system by setting up panels of inquiry to try the officials of the Gowon regime. He was however killed in a bloody coup on the 13th of Feb. 1976.

General Obasanjo who inherited power following the assassination of Murtala Mohammed, did not display the same level of commitment to fighting corruption as Murtala Mohammed, but he initiated and implemented a transition programe that led to the hand over of power to the civilian regime of Alhaji Shehu Shagari on October 1, 1979. Under Shagari, Ministers, governors and senior government officials took corruption as a right, particularly, as president Shagari appeared too weak to place them under any check. With the funds at their disposal, they embarked on the importation of all manner of items.

Hiding under the presidential rice import policy which he superintended, as minister of transport, Alhaji Umaru Diko made so much money for himself and resorted to ostentatious lifestyle. He was alleged to have misappropriated over 4 billion naira through the importation of rice. Shagari’s regime was said to have squandered over 16 billion oil revenue before his government was toppled by General Muhammad Buhari on 31st December, 1983. (ibid)
As soon as it came to power, Buhari’s regime announced its Commitment to bringing all the fleeing politicians before the long arm of the law. Tribunals were later set up to try them. Those found guilty of corruption were given long years of imprisonment. Buhari initiated a currency change exercise which was intended to alter the colour of the National Currency (the Naira). This was targeted at politicians that stashed large quantities of Naira abroad.

On August 27, 1983, Buhari’s regime was toppled by General Ibrahim Babangida. The initial euphoria that greeted his coming to power was later blighted by his compromising attitude towards corruption. As Maduagwu cited in Gboyega (1996:5) summed it, “not only did the regime encourage corruption by pardoning corrupt officials convicted by his predecessors and returning their seized properties, the regime officially sanctioned corruption in the country and made it difficult to apply the only potent measures, long prison terms and seizure of ill-gotten wealth for fighting corruption in Nigeria in the Future”. After wasting the country’s resources in a transition rigmarole, babangida hurriedly handed over powers to an interim government headed by Chief Ernest Shonekan, following violent protests that followed his annulment of the June 12,1993 election, adjudged the freest and fairest election in the history of Nigeria.

The interim government, was soon overthrown by General Sanni Abacha. Abacha and his family robbed the country blind. According to the international centre for Asset Recovery, 2009, Abacha and his family were estimated to have embezzled about $4 billion. Following his sudden death on June 8, 1998, General Adusalam Abubabakar took over as Head of State. Though he began a subtle probe of the Abacha family, his main pre-occupation was to implement a transition programme to hand over power to a democratically elected government within one year. This he accomplished on May 29, 1999 when Olusegun Obasanjo took oath of office as the president of Nigeria. However, in 1999, the Christopher Kolade Panel indicted General Abdusalam Abubabakar Regime for awarding massively inflated contracts, licences awards, etc usually to firms in which top echelon of the regime had substantial interests, causing a sharp drop in the country’s external reserve (the news, Lagos May 3,1999).

Obasanjo vowed to fight corruption in whatever guise it may be, but monumental corruption still went on under his watch. He committed $16 billion, purportedly to revamp the electricity sector, yet as at the time he left office in 2007, the sector remained the way he met it. But World Bank Report (2005) estimated that $10 billion was enough to ensure that at least 75% of Nigerian population got access to constant electricity. His failure or refusal to release the Okigbo panel report which indicted the regimes of General Ibrahim Babangida, and Abacha of billions of dollars remains a big stain on his claims to integrity. When Goodluck Jonathan took over in 2011, he also channeled billions of dollars into the electricity sector. Yet no tangible improvement was recorded.

Electricity has certainly become the alibi used by successive administrations, in Nigeria for swindling the country of billions of dollars. The privatization of the sector, seen as the ultimate solution to the problem of electricity did not make a differences. This is because according to stiglitz (2002), corruption is systematic. It is a continuous cycle of deliberate initiative erected by those in authority and beneficial to politically structured groups. This group authors market liberation and privatization. Privatization, in Nigerian and the way it has always played out can best be described as a process through which, those who were in government, use the money they stolen while in government to buy up those things they could not steal while in government. Joseph Ajefu (2019), opined that the privatization of Nigeria’s power sector has not met expectations, largely because of the dominance of politically connected companies in both the generation and distribution value chain. This makes it difficult to create incentives for genuine investors to enter the sector.
President Muhammed Buhari came to power with the mantra of fight against corruption, yet monumental corruption goes on under his watch. Prominent members of his APC led government have been indicted in corruption cases, but the president and his government have continued to shield them from prosecution. When the former secretary to government of the Federation (SGF) Babachir Lawal was on January 24, 2017 alleged by the Senate adhoc committee on humanitarian situation in the North East, to have been involved in N200m contract scam, president Buhari roundly defended Lawal, claiming that the Senate never invited him (Lawal) for fair hearing. The Senate, after proving that Babachir Lawal was indeed invited and given opportunity for fair hearing, wrote a letter to the president that he (Lawal) be sacked or asked to resign from his position as SGF, Buhari refused to do so. It took several months and pressure from well meaning Nigerians and civil society organizations before Buhari reluctantly allowed him to resign.

When the video of the Kano state Governor, Abdullahi Ganduje collecting $5million bribe from a contractor went viral in the social media, Buhari defended him, even when the contractor behind the video expressed his readiness to testify before the house (https://Punch.com, 9/11/2018). When criticism against the president refused to comment on the issue kept increasing, he defended himself by saying that Gaanduje was under immunity from prosecution. On December 6, 2018, a high court in Kano, presided over by Justice A. T. Baadamasi, granted an order of injunction restraining the Kano State House of Assembly Investigation Committee from further investigating the $5million bribery allegation involving Ganduje (https://punch.com,6/12/18).

Nepotism is an aspect of corruption, but Buhari who claims to be waging war against corruption in its entire ramification evidently falls short of fairness in his appointment in the first four years as the president of Nigeria.

Seun opejobi (2017), quoting business day newspaper reported that 81 out of 100 appointments Buhari made since 2015, went to people from Northern region where he hails from. His refusal or failure to take a decisive action against armed Fulani herdsmen terrorizing communities in the middle belt and southern parts of the country, leaves people with the conclusion that he is tacitly supporting them, being a Fulani himself.

Politics of Anti-Corruption Crusade in Nigeria

The fact that each political leader that has ever ruled this country either as president, prime minister, or head of state, vowed to wage war against corruption, is a proof that corruption is a well known menace in the country. It is however surprising that everyone condemns corruption, yet it continues to manifest in the everyday interaction of Nigerians either with themselves or with the state. Nigerian’s performance in TI’s Annual Corruption Perception Index (CPI), indicates that the country remains neck-deep in corruption, despite the noise about fighting corruption. This section examines the anti-corruption efforts of the different Nigerian leaders referred to earlier, to know how sincere and committed each has been in the fight against corruption. Since the level of sincerity or otherwise of each leader can already be inferred from the accounts of the previous sections, only a few instances will be re-stated here just for emphasis.

Let us assume that by 1966 when the army over throw the Belewa regime, citing high level of corruption, the menace was yet to become the pandemic which it has turned out to be. However, it is right to say that the crusade against corruption began with the regime of late General Aguiyi Ironsi. As soon as he took over as the head of state, he set up a commission of inquiry which investigated officials of the Busted Belewa regime which implicated many of them. Those implicated in the investigation were still in prison, when Gowon staged a coup, took over as head of state and subsequently released them. Gowon ruled the country between 1966 and 1975.
It was during his regime that Nigeria experienced oil boom which saw Nigeria earning so much money from oil sales. He was not known to be keen about fighting corruption. Following his overthrow in 1975, Murtala Muhammed took over as Head of State. Murtala demonstrated in words and in action that he had zero tolerance for corruption. First, he declared his assets and compelled all government officials to do same. He set up the asset investigation panel in 1975 which found 10 out of the 12 military governors guilty of corrupt enrichment. They were dismissed from the military after returning the properties they corruptly acquired.

Like Murtala Mohammed, General Muhammed Buhari, who over threw the government of Alhaji Shehu Shagari, also vowed to fight corruption to a standstill. As mentioned earlier, he set up tribunals which found some members of Shagari’s government guilty of corruption. But one incident that has continued to raise question over his level of commitment or sincerity in his corruption crusade then as a soldier, was the issue of what came to be known as the 53 suitcases. The incident took place in 1984 during the currency change exercise ordered by the Buhari Junta, which instructed that every case or box arriving the country must be inspected irrespective of the status of the owner.

The said 53 suitcases were however ferried through the Murtala Mohammed Airport without customs check, by soldiers, allegedly at the behest of major Mustapha Jokolo, the then Aid decamp (ADC), to General Buhari (Azikem, March 20, 2011). Atiku Abubakar, who later contested against Buhari in the 2019 presidential election, was at that time, the Area comptroller of customs in charge of the Murtala Mohammed Airport (Emmanuel Azikem, Vanguard, March 21, 2011). The question is, who owned those 53 suitcases and why were they prevented from being inspected by soldiers acting on the orders of Buhari’s ADC?

Buhari was overthrown by General banbangida, who took over and brought a completely new approach to corruption, as can be seen from the report of the Okigbo commission. The Okigbo commission was instituted by General Sanni Abacha who took over as head of state on November 17, 1993, but could not have time to act on the report as he was pre-occupied with strategies to perpertuate himself in power for life.

After his death in 1998, abdusalam Abubarkar took over as Head of State. Although he began the process that led to the recovery of monies looted by Abacha family, he bowed out at the conclusion of his transition to civil rule programme which produced Chief Olusegun Obasanjo as president. Obasanjo also vowed to fight corruption. To that effect, he put in place institutions like ICPC, EFCC etc. but the fraud that was his power sector reform puts a big question mark to his integrity. His unwillingness to unravel the misery behind the disappearance of the Okigbo panel report that grossly indicted General Babangida spoke a lot of his sincerity or lack of it.

The revelation by a leaked confidential United States (US) diplomatic cable published by a whistleblower Wikileaks, stating that Obasanjo used EFCC under the chairmanship of Nuhu-Ribadu to witchhunt his perceived enemies within the ruling PDP especially anti-third term governors opposed to the amendment of the constitution to give him a third term in office, confirmed the allegation that his anticorruption fight was a charade.

Umaru Musa Yaradua who took over from Obasanjo, had a running battle with health challenges between 2007 when he came to power till 2010 when he died. He was however aware of the imperfections of the elections that brought him to power as president and promised to improve the electoral processes in Nigeria.

Wikileaks also revealed that supreme court Justices were bribed to Legitimize the corrupt election that saw to his emergence as president through massive rigging (Akintayo Eribake Vanguard, Sept. 8, 2011). It was also
revealed that Yaradua knew that Aondoaka, the then Attorney General and Minister of Justice, was corrupt but could not sack him (Ibid).

A strong campaign mounted by the opposition All Progressives Congress (APC), during the regime of Goodluck Jonathan, to the effect that his administration was grossly corrupt, led to his defeat in 2015 by Mohamed Buhari, who many still saw as a symbol of integrity and an anti-corruption champion. However, in 2014, Nigeria’s ranking in Transparency International’s Corruption Perception Index (CPI), improved from 143rd to the 136th position (Chima Obinna, Dec. 4, 2014). Jonathan was known to have sacked some of his appointees involved in corruption scandals.

They include Abdulrasheed Maina, Chairman of Presidential Task Force on pension reform, Stella Oduah, Aviation Minister; Godsday Orubebe, Minister for Niger Delta affairs; Caleb Olubolade, police affairs Minister and Yerima Ngama, finance ministry (Premium Times, February 12, 2014). When Buhari came to power as already stated, he vowed to fight corruption with all his powers and was ready to step on toes if need be, while doing so. He promised he was going to be fair to all, irrespective of party affiliation, ethnicity or religion. As he put it, “I belong to nobody, I belong to everybody (Daily Post May 29, 2015)

He went after those suspected of having corruptly enriched themselves, mainly those who served under Jonathan’s government. Out of the many clamped into cell, only few prosecutions have been secured, raising concerns that the president was out for a witch hunt. Besides the instances that have so far cast doubts about his fight against corruption, mentioned earlier, there is reason to believe that in the run up to the 2019 general elections, some of the people accused by the APC government of Buhari, had their charges dropped as soon as they decamped to APC. The National Chairman of APC, Adams Oshomhole made this clear when he publicly proclaimed that the easiest way of having your sins forgiven, is for you to join the APC. In his words, “I am told that there are a lot of very senior people from PDP who have decided to join forces with president Buhari to use the broom to sweep away PDP. We have quite a number of other leaders who have come. Infact, once you have joined APC, all your sins are forgiven” (Sahara Reporters, Jan 18, 2019).

Also, Abdulrashed Maina who was sacked by Goodluck Jonathan was secretary recalled by Buhari’s government from his hideout abroad and re-instated into the Federal Civil Service. Writing on the effects of corruption in Nigeria, Okwuagbala Uzochukwu Mike (2019) pondered: “But the question Nigerians have been asking since the Leadership of President Buhari till 2019 is this “is President Buhari’s government fighting corruption as he promised during his campaign” according to him, Nigerians are tired as they found out that the government is not really fighting corruption. There are incidences where the man that said he strongly believes and practices transparency failed, he said (Ibid).

Atiku Abubarkar the Presidential candidate of the People’s Democratic Party (PDP) said that much in December 2018, when he said to Buhari; “Mr. President, the problem with your anti-corruption war is not with the system. You are the problem! The system allows you to arrest and convict your former Secretary to the Government of the federation, who was fingered in a major corruption case, but you choose to let him go scot free and you demonstrated your tolerance for his corruption by giving him a prominent role in your re-election campaign, and recently welcoming him to the Presidential villa with open arms” (vanguard Dec 26, 2018)

Buhari’s anti-corruption crusade received a very big blow when Transparency International reported that perception of corruption worsened in Nigeria between 2016 and 2017 (Premium Times, April 3, 2019). According to the report, Nigeria ranked 148 out of 180 countries assessed in 2017 on the perception of
corruption. And in 2018, Corruption Perception Index (CPI) revealed that Nigeria has neither improved nor progressed in the perception of corruption in the public administration.

According to Civil Society Legislative, Advocacy Centre (CISLAC), Transparency International’s chapter in Nigeria, lack of progress in the fight against corruption as attested to by this year’s (2018) edition of (CPI) is a consequence of partial or non-implementation of recommendation issued by corruption experts and activists. CISLAC notes that “there were recommendations that accompanied the launch of the CPI 2007, one of which was for the immediate appointment and prompt inauguration of the National Procurement Council (NPC), as provided in the Public Procurement Act…. despite corruption in procurement which is responsible for around 70% of the aggregated corruption in public administration, the NPC has still not been inaugurated” (Ibid).

One thing that is clear from the ongoing analysis is that it was only during the short regime of late General Aguiyi Ironsi and that of late Gen. Murtala Mohammed that genuine efforts were made to fight corruption. After that, sincerity and commitment to combating corruption nose dived. All subsequent regimes that claimed to be fighting corruption have continued to do so as a sure means of gaining personal, political or primordial interests. That explains why laws and institutions created to prosecute corruption offences are manipulated for the aforesaid reasons. It is a clear indication that the war against corruption can never be won using the present political establishment. The present ruling elites are neck deep in corruption and can do whatever it takes to remain in power, including compromising the fight against corruption on the alter of politics.

The Need for a Benevolent Dictator

The foregoing discussions and analysis has so far centered on corruption in Nigeria, attempts made to tame it since 1966, and how it has robbed the country of opportunity for growth and development. We have seen how the war against corruption was waged during the military era and how it is being prosecuted under a “democratic” dispensation.

To fight the menace, institutional frameworks for the war has been put in place by setting up the Independent Corrupt Practices and other Related Offences Commission (ICPC) in 2000, the Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC) in 2004, as well as the Public Procurement Act (2007) etc, to demonstrate commitment to fighting corruption in whatever form or guise. Besides conventions and treaties Nigeria signed at the continental level, the country signed the United Nations (UN) Convention against corruption which was adopted in 2004. The convention is a framework put in place by the world body for criminalizing, preventing, and enforcing laws against corruption. She is also among other countries in the UN’s Global Compact against corruption, and which have committed to abide by the TI’s principles for countering bribery or the World Economic Forum Partnership against corruption Initiative (Webb 2005, Cockcraft 2000, quoted in Aiyede 2016). At the continental level, Nigeria is also signatory to many other conventions and declarations aimed at improving political and economic governance regimes so as to reduce poverty and achieve sustainable development. These include the New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD), Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), the Africa Peer Review Mechanism (APRM) among others. In addition, Nigeria signed the AU Convention on preventing and combating corruption and the AU declaration on democracy, political and cooperate governance. With all these institutional frameworks in place, why is corruption still a hard nut to crack in Nigeria?

Some years back, the Nigerian people were blackmailed by the political elites to believe that the ultimate solution to all the problems confronting Nigeria as it has to do with poverty, lack of development, corruption, unemployment, bad roads, epileptic supply of electricity etc, was for the country to return to democratic rule.
They were therefore enjoined to join the fight against military rule to pave way for the restoration of democracy. They were made to see democracy as the elixir.

When democracy was restored, with the election of Olesugun Obasanjo, and the problems still refused to retreat, the alibi changed. Some said that since 1960 when Nigeria got independence, no graduate had ruled the country at the level of president or head of state. That, they argued, was the reason why the country has continued to totter. Good enough, in 2011, Goodluck Jonathan Ph.D, was elected president of Nigeria. When his administration of the country could not meet the expectation of many or wipe out all their problems, they accused him of incompetence and of being too weak to confront the country’s challenges. It was on the basis of this that he was voted out in 2015 in preference for Muhammed Buhari. The rest they say, is history.

With twenty years of unbroken democracy, why is Nigeria rather retrogressing. This brings in the crux of my argument. What Nigeria needs at this her present level of development, to eradicate poverty and pave the way for sustainable development is not Western democracy. Nigeria is not yet matured enough for a full blown Western Democracy. What she needs is a benevolent dictator. A transformational leader who will be encumbered, neither by personal interest and political considerations nor by primordial sentiments in taking difficult decisions necessary to end corruption and sanitize the country to pave way for sustainable development.

As I said earlier, Nigeria is not yet matured enough for a full blown Western democracy. This much was corroborated by Samuel Huntington (1991:271), when he wrote that... “A high correlation exists between level of economic development and the existence of democratic regimes. A more industrialized, modern economy and educated people it entails are more conducive to inauguration of democratic regimes than their opposites” It is in recognition of this that David Tucker (Halle Germany) made his famous quote:

“Benevolent Dictatorship for developing countries; democracy for developed nations; direct democracy for advanced nations”

Moses Ochonu (2010), commenting on the failures of Nigerian Democracy asserted that, it is unrealistic to expect that in a developmentally-challenged country where poverty is an inescapable companion, citizens would perceive democratic governance from a non-materialistic perspective. Their needs are starkly material, so are their expectations from democracy. According to him, Nigerians should not be expected to muster the idealism and patience required for long-drawn process of democratic maturity when their bellies are empty. William Easterly (2011) attested to the fact that “some of the largest successes in development, such as China, Singapore, South Korea, Taiwan and Hong Kong are associated with autocrats” In his view, the plausible interpretations of these successes are that countries at low levels of education and income are not ready for democracy, that (benevolent) autocrats are necessary to take difficult decisions that pay off in the long run but democrats would not choose in the short run. What Nigeria is practicing in the name of democracy is nothing but the democratization of corruption. Since Nigerians consider it right for public officials of their tribe and religion to amass wealth through corrupt means (Okonkwo 2016). Nigerian Legislators, the elected representatives of the people at both national and state levels use legislative processes to approve outrageous allowances and life pension for themselves, while the masses they claim to represent live below poverty line. And it is all legal, as the act is perfectly within the procedural norms of our democracy (Ochonu 2010). This is the spirit propelling the clamour for zoning of political offices in a country that lays claim to democratic practice.

Before the emergence of Jerry Rawlings, Ghana was in a complete mess. Her economy was in shambles. Her citizens were treated as second class humans in Nigeria. On January 17th 1983, the then president of Nigeria, Alhaji Shehu Usman Shagari, ordered the expulsion of over two million Ghanaians labeled illegal aliens. There
was no hope for the country as the future of Ghana looked bleak. The turning point came the way of the country when Jerry Rawlings emerged on the scene. Without looking back, he dealt ruthlessly with corrupt politicians and other people with questionable means of livelihood. Rawlings sanitized Ghana, restored confidence in the country’s economy and attracted Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) into the country. Having restored hope and confidence in the country’s electoral process, he initiated a program of transition to democratic rule.

Today, Ghana is working. Electricity is fairly constant, education is qualitative, the manufacturing sector is active, having absorbed companies that left Nigeria. Nigerian elites are today proud to send their children to Ghanaian Universities.

On Wednesday, April 24th 2019, Ghana launched the World Largest Medical Drone Delivery Service in the world, tagged Fly-To-Save-A-Life Project. It is meant to provide a rapid response to medical emergencies, especially in hard to reach areas through the flying of unmanned drones, explained the Vice President, who performed the official launch of the programme (Ghana/myjoyonline.com, 25th April, 2019).

**Conclusion**

In conclusion therefore, Nigeria is in dire need of such a transformational figure with the zeal, the will and uncompromising determination “to break with our odious past and perform the painful surgical operation required to heal Nigeria (Anele Ibid). Nigeria urgently needs such a leader now, if the country is to survive the present onslaught by depraved, bestial, debauched and morally bankrupt gangsters masquerading as guardians. There is need for a strong willed person with the courage to maximize the use of political power, step really hard on the corruption-infested toes of sacred cows and implement hard decisions that will propel all round national development (Ibid). Such a leader must possess such fundamental attributes as being intellectually sound and charismatic, with the desire to know. He must exude magnetic personality that will attract people to him. More importantly, he must be spiritually cultivated, with a healthy disdain for material possession. He must also have compassion for the poor and the less privileged (Ibid). I concur with Anele that Nigeria’s Festering corruption is draped in hollow religiosity and idolatry of wealth.

It is only such a transformational leader that can sanitize Nigeria, strengthen institutions, restore confidence in the system, and painstakingly engrave into the people’s psyche, the penchant for adhering to rules. With this, the country will experience steady progress, giving rise to sustained development. With time, a new Nigeria will emerge where rule of law will become a way of life. Nigeria will become reach as children grow up to see corrupt and criminal tendencies as abomination. Equity, justice and fairness will take route. Merit will replace the current patronage system. The assurance of reward for hard work, and dire consequences for criminality will change the attitude of youths to wealth. Politics as a quick route to sudden stupendous wealth will become less attractive. This will lead to a reduction in politically induced crimes and crises. It is then, and only then that Nigeria can genuinely talk of true democracy.

**References**


Corruption Perception Index (2018), Issued by Transparency International


Impact of Corruption on Nigeria Economy Published by PricewaterwuseCoopers Limited (PWC) 2016 at www.pwc.com/ng.


Mainstreaming a Multifaceted Approach to the War against Corruption in Africa

Ifeolu John Koni, PhD
Senior Lecturer & Technical Aid Corps (TAC) Volunteer from Nigeria, School of Law,
Kampala International University (KIU), Kampala, Uganda

Abstract
The problem of corruption in Africa has continued to attract great concerns across the continent following the region’s abysmal performance in the global ranking of least corrupt nations by the Transparency International (TI) for two consecutive years (2016 and 2017). If the regional analysis of over 170 countries assessed by the TI in its Corruption Perception Index (CPI) released for the years 2016 and 2017 is anything to go by, the African region would unfortunately be rated as the most corrupt continent in the world. According to the report for the year 2016, no African country could be found among the top ten least corrupt nations whereas no fewer than seven of the ten most corrupt States are from the continent. The figures released for 2017 did not show any improvement in the performance of African nations. While seven of the best ten came from Europe, as in the previous year, seven of the worst ten, namely, Somalia, South Sudan, Syria, Libya, Yemen, Sudan and Guinea-Bissau, are African countries. This persistently poor performance has expectedly set tongues wagging as to whether Africa is serious about fighting corruption. On the other hand, there insinuations that the strategies hitherto adopted by African nations in combating corruption are either insufficient or are simply not working. It is intended in this study to examine the legal and institutional frameworks of selected African States on the anti-graft war. Four countries, Nigeria, Uganda, South Africa and Libya, representing the West African, East African, South African and North African sub-regions respectively, have been selected for the study. The main objective of this paper is to analyse the existing strategies, legal and institutional, for fighting corruption with a view to determining whether indeed there is need for a reform of same or for the adoption of new strategies. Being a largely descriptive research, the doctrinal analysis methodology will be adopted, with case law as well as the legal and institutional instruments of the selected nations serving as the primary source of data. The secondary source will include books, journal articles, case reviews and the internet. The data obtained from these sources shall be subjected to content analysis. It is expected at the end of the study that fresh and workable strategies for combating the scourge of corruption in Africa will be unfolded.

Key words: Corruption, Corruption Perception Index, Legal and Institutional Frameworks

Introduction

Aside from terrorism, there is probably no other crime that has generated as much concern in Africa as corruption and abuse of office. When it is considered that the menace of terrorism is more felt in some parts of Africa than the others, it may not even be an exaggeration to say that the continent’s leading challenge for now is corruption. The statistics from an online publication (The Guardian of London) released in 2016 lend great credence to this assertion. According to the report, excerpts of which were contained in an editorial comment by the Punch Newspaper of Nigeria in its edition of 31 May, 2016 at page 28, Africa loses 50 billion Dollars annually to illicit financial outflow as a result of wicked collusion between the governments of African States and multinationals. The report further states that Africa lost about 850 billion Dollars between 1970 and 2008, out of which an estimated 217 billion Dollars was illegally transferred from Nigeria, followed by Egypt and South Africa, which respectively lost 105.2 billion Dollars and 81.8 billion Dollars.

Between 2006 and 2018, the performance of Africa with respect to the fight against corruption did not experience any improvement as the Corruption Perception Index (CPI) of the Transparency International for the year 2018 clearly revealed. According to the report released by Rubio (2018) out of the 180 countries and territories sampled by the Transparency International in the year 2018 no African country made the list of the top ten (10)
countries perceived as least corrupt globally. On the other hand, the report revealed that out of the ten (10) countries adjudged as most corrupt not less than eight (8), representing 80 percent, are from the African continent. As a matter of fact, the country ranked as the most corrupt of the 180 States assessed (Somalia) belongs to Sub-Saharan Africa.

In another survey on the scale of corruption in Africa, the *Economist Newspaper*, quoting the Transparency International, reported that 22 percent of Africans who had contact with public services admitted to having paid a bribe in the past year. The report states further:

In Liberia the figure was 69 percent. In Kenya and Nigeria, two of the most important African economies, it was 37 percent and 43 percent respectively. Across the region, a majority of respondents said that they thought corruption had got worse in their country in the past year. In South-Africa the figure was 83 percent. The type of bribe most commonly paid were to the police officers and court officials. Half of those forced to pay such bribes had done so more than once.

The fact that some of the figures quoted above could have been exaggerated to demonize Africa, and to give the impression that the malfeasance called corruption is largely an African challenge, cannot be ruled out. This however does not detract from one grim reality: that corruption has become a big problem to Africa. This assertion can be corroborated by the comment of Annan (2004) in his foreword to the *United Nations Convention against Corruption*. The late former United Nations Secretary-General, who was a senior citizen of Africa, noted as follows, on the devastating effect of corruption:

This evil phenomenon is found in all countries- big and small, rich and poor-but it is in the developing world that its effects are most destructive. Corruption hurts the poor disproportionately by diverting funds intended for development, undermining a Government’s ability to provide basic services, feeding inequality and injustice and discouraging foreign aid and investment. Corruption is a key element in economic under performance and a major obstacle to poverty alleviation and development.

Annan may not have mentioned Africa specifically in the above statement. However when it is considered that Africa houses most of the world’s poor the comment can be interpreted to apply most especially to the continent of Africa.

It is intended in this paper to analyze the legal, institutional and other measures adopted by Africa in fighting the scourge of corruption on the continent. The overriding objective of the study is to determine whether the extant legal and institutional frameworks are adequate to address the multifarious challenges posed by the menace of corruption. As it is practically impossible, owing to constraints of space and time, to analyze the legislative and other measures adopted by all the 55 countries in Africa with respect to this subject, four countries, namely, Nigeria, Uganda, South Africa and Libya, representing the West African, East African, South African and North African sub-regions respectively, have been selected for this study. This delimitation notwithstanding, illustrations shall be made from time to time from other African countries.

**Background to the Study**

Whenever the issue of corruption is being discussed at the global level special attention is usually paid to the African region- unfortunately in a negative sense. The reason for this of course is that Africa is perceived as one of the most corrupt continents in the world. Lending what seems like a convincing credence to this perception is a regional analysis of the 180 countries assessed by Transparency International in its Corruption Perception Index (CPI) released early this year for the year 2018. As already noted in the introductory part of this paper, no
African country could be found among the top ten (10) least corrupt countries whereas no fewer than eight (8) of the most corrupt countries come from the continent. Leading the pack of the least corrupt countries were Denmark (Europe) and New Zealand (Asia Pacific) which scored 88 points and 87 points respectively. Another European country, Finland, came third with 85 points while Singapore (Asia Pacific), Sweden (Europe) and Switzerland (Europe) also came third with 85 points. The seventh position went to Norway (Europe) with 84 points while Netherlands (Europe) came eighth with 82 points. The ninth position went to both Canada (North America) and Luxembourg (Europe) with 81 points each. Out of the ten (10) top countries seven (7) are from Europe while none is from Africa.

Bringing up the ladder of the ten (10) most corrupt countries, on the other hand, is Somalia of Sub-Saharan Africa which scored 10 points. Syria, from Middle East and North Africa, and South Sudan, from Sub-Saharan Africa, came second from behind with 13 points each. Another African country, Yemen occupied the same fourth position from behind with North Korea (Asia Pacific) with 14 points each. Three Sub-Saharan African countries, namely, Sudan, Guinea-Bissau and Equatorial Guinea, occupied the 6th position from behind with 16 points each, same as that of Afghanistan of Asia Pacific. The tenth position from behind went to another African country, Libya, with 17 points. The foregoing statistics also shows that eight of the ten most corrupt countries of the world are either from North Africa or Sub-Saharan Africa.

Conceptual Definitions

In this paper some terminologies will be used frequently as part of the overall effort to achieve its main objective. The key terms are “multifaceted approach”, “corruption”, and “war against corruption”. As these terms are capable of being interpreted in a diversity of ways, they will now be defined so that the context in which they are to be understood in this paper can be unfolded.

Multifaceted Approach

To explain the term “multifaceted approach”, it is important to first define what the word “approach” means. According to the Concise Oxford Dictionary, the word “approach” means “a way of dealing with a person or thing”. On the other hand the word “multifaceted” has been defined by the same dictionary as “having several facets”. The term “multifaceted approach”, for the purpose of this study, therefore, refers to the different methods and methodologies that can be adopted by African countries in arresting the scourge of corruption on the continent. It also refers to the amalgamation of legal, quasi-legal and other measures, including extraordinary measures, which can be adopted to tackle the problem of corruption in Africa.

Corruption

Corruption has been defined by the Black’s Law Dictionary as “depravity, perversion, taint; and impairment of integrity, virtue or moral principle, especially the impairment of public official’s duties by bribery.” The Dictionary further defines it more elaborately as follows:

The act of doing something with an intent to give some advantage inconsistent with official duty and the rights of others; a fiduciary’s or official’s use of a station or office to procure some benefits either personally or for someone else, contrary to the rights of others (p.397).

It is clear from the above definition that the offence of corruption covers a wide range of unlawful activities of which bribery is key. The basic ingredients of corruption deducible from the foregoing are (1) there must be
depravity (2) the act must be perverse or cause taint (3) it must lead to impairment or weakening of integrity, and (4) it must give undue advantage to the person doing the act or making the omission or to someone else.

**War Against Corruption**

Having given an idea of what is meant by corruption the next question is, what kind of war is Africa waging against it? This can be answered through an explanation of what is meant by the term “war”. In the context of this study, a war means “a dispute or competition between adversaries” (Garner: 2009 P. 1720). Still adopting the *Black’s Law Dictionary*, it means “a struggle to solve a pervasive problem”. It need be stated that the “pervasive problem” in the extant case is corruption. The adversaries in this study are well known. At one end there are those who are sincere about ending corruption in Africa with a view to making life more meaningful to the less privileged citizens who are vastly in the majority. Some of these patriots are in government; some are private citizens who have developed a perfect hatred for corruption. Though these patriotic Africans may be in the minority the fact remains that they will live above aboard if entrusted with State money.

At the other end are the thieving majority who see any privilege to superintend over State resources as an opportunity to commit massive looting. There is therefore a raging battle between those who want to stop the plundering of the treasury and those who are resisting the fight. In fact, the belief in many African countries today is that corruption is not only fighting back but it appears to be gaining an upper hand in the battle as the culprits have so financially empowered themselves that they have gained control of some of the supposed anti graft institutions like the media (both conventional and social media), the judiciary and even the police. The war being referred to in this paper therefore is the struggle or dispute between genuine anti corruption crusaders / fighters and the unrepentant treasury looters.

**Evolution of Corruption in Africa**

One pertinent question to ask at this juncture is: is there a genetic code that predisposes Africans to corruption? This was the question posed by Chikafor (2017) in an incisive and insightful article titled “Origin of Corruption in Africa and the Way Forward. In the view of this scholar, “when specifically viewed with Africa’s history in mind, administrative corruption, though rampant across Africa today, is an alien culture.” He argues, rightly in our view, that pre-colonial Africa, for the most part, was built on strong ethical values “sometimes packaged in spiritual terms, but with the end result of ensuring social justice and compliance.”

It is the view of Chikafor that it was colonialism that introduced systemic corruption on a grand scale across sub Saharan Africa. According to him:

> The repudiation of indigenous values, standards, checks and balances and the pretentions of superimposing western structures destabilized the well run bureaucratic machinery previously in existence across pre-colonial Africa. The end result is rampant across Africa today; conspicuous consumption, absence of loyalty to the State, oppressive and corrupt State institutions, to mention a few.

Chikafor attempts a review of the state of governance in pre-colonial Africa and submits that in both centralised and decentralised pre-colonial African communities, governance was conducted with utmost seriousness. In his words, “as the laws were mostly unwritten in nature and therefore prone to being easily forgotten, they were often couched in supernatural terms to instill fear and be instilled in the subconscious.”
Chikafor gives practical illustrations, across some ethnic groups in Africa, of the great importance often attached to accountability and good governance in pre-colonial Africa. He takes his first example from Asante confederation kingdom in Ghana, which he notes was a kingdom that thrived on strict rules and regulations. He reports that with strong cooperation from all groups the leadership of Asante Kingdom, held together by the symbolic Golden Stool of Asante-Hene, was known to have implemented several modernization policies in administration, including promoting advancement by merit and developing state enterprise through public investment.

He also cites the phenomenal influence that Oyo-mesi used to have on the Alaafin, one of the leading traditional rulers in Yoruba land, South West Nigeria. The Alaafin, he recalls, was constrained to rule with caution and respect for his subjects, noting that whenever the traditional ruler overstepped his bounds through perpetrating miscarriage of justice for private gains, the Oyo-mesi would give him an empty calabash or parrot’s eggs, meaning he must commit suicide as the tradition forbade his deposition. In the same Yoruba land, if we may recall also, it used to be a taboo for a villager to commit the offence of stealing. Whenever a case of theft or stealing was established against an accused person, he could be banished from the village or the front of his father’s house could be turned to a heap where the entire villagers would dump refuse for 30 days, depending on the seriousness of the offence. Consequently, people in pre-colonial Yoruba region of Nigeria used to comport themselves with great rectitude so as not to bring shame or disgrace to their family names.

Reflecting also on pre-colonial Rwanda, Chikafor notes that the community used to have a highly organized, efficient and centralised system of administration. In his analysis, even though the central administration was autocratic, systems of checks and balances did exist at the clan level. He cites as an example the custom of land ownership through the Ubukonde which encouraged mutually beneficial exchange of labour between the Hutu, Tutsi and Twa, based on agreed principles. According to him, Ubukonde was accepted by all parties involved while those who attempted to corruptly amass land wealth outside the Ubukonde system usually incurred the wrath of the King.

If we assume, as we are tempted to, that African communities were largely “clean” prior to the advent of colonialism, the relevant question then would be, in what ways has colonialism contributed to the prevalence of corruption in Africa? In answering this question, attention again shall be turned to Chikafor’s thesis under reference. He identifies four major factors as being the “colonial origins” of corruption in Africa. These, according to him, are; Direct and Indirect Rule, Taxation, The Police and Military, and Conspicuous Consumption.

With respect to the first factor Chikafor believes that indirect rule turned leadership in Africa into a “corrupted enterprise where instead of holding power in trust for the people, the rulers held power in trust for the colonial authorities.” Government, in his views, became a platform for coercively extracting obedience from the people. According to him, “the dregs of the society, the rejects, the ones that hitherto had no say in the community were promoted as warrant chiefs by British authorities.” The result, he says further, was that “individuals without character who demanded money in exchange for manipulating the colonial masters enthroned corruption at the highest echelon of governance.”

The origin of corruption, Chikafor further argues, can also be traced to the idea of colonial masters imposing flat rate taxes known as “hut tax” on the colonies, recalling that the mode of tax payment was often steeped in violence with district commissioners or warrant chiefs vested with the power to arrest defaulters. He states that as the hut tax was used mainly to pay the salaries of colonial officers with no direct benefit to the people in form
of social services, the system of taxation became patently corrupt and was devoid of accountability and probity, thus pitching the citizens against themselves and against their leaders.

The third point, according to Chikafor, was the use or misuse that military and para-military formations were put to under the colonial regime. He laments that whereas in other climes military formations were set up to protect citizens and territorial integrity, in Africa they were established primarily to crush civilian opposition to colonialism. The result of this, according to him, was that many newly independent governments inherited security agencies that had imbibed the culture of extortion and oppression of the citizens.

Lastly, Chikafor opines that colonialism, it was, that destabilised the erstwhile culture of rectitude and self contentment for which Africans were reputed. In his words, “colonialism destabilized the prevailing pre-colonial system, uprooted men from the farms to work for the white man as houseboys, miners, clerks and in other menial capacities. The monetization occasioned by this exercise introduced a form of greed, unknown in the culture of most pre-colonial African societies. It can be inferred from the foregoing analysis that much of the evolution of the menace of corruption that African countries are fighting today, which, of course, has led the continent to being ranked as one of the most corrupt regions in the world, is attributable to their colonial experiences. It is somewhat ironic that the same Europe that colonized these African countries and knowingly or inadvertently introduced corruption to them are today leading the pack of nations that are adjudged, by the Transparency International, to be relatively free of corrupt practices.

Regional Coalition against Corruption

Apparently disturbed and dismayed by the abysmal performance of countries in the region in the global fight against corruption and related offences, the continent of Africa has adopted legislative and other measures designed to combat the challenge. These measures are contained in the African Union Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption which was adopted by the Heads of State and Government of the African Union (AU) at the 2nd Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the Union at Maputo, Mozambique on 11 July 2003. The Convention was adopted as a follow up action to resolution AHG-Dec 126 (XXXIV) adopted by the Thirty-fourth ordinary session of the Assembly of Heads of State and Government in June 1998 in Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, requesting the Secretary General to convene, in cooperation with the African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights, a high level meeting of experts to consider ways and means of removing obstacles to the employment of economic, social and cultural rights, including the fight against corruption and impunity, and propose appropriate legislative and other measures. Another prelude to the Convention was the decision of the 37th Ordinary Session of the Assembly which took place in Lusaka, Zambia, in July 2001 as well as the Declaration adopted by the First Session of the Assembly of the Union held in Durban, South Africa in July 2002, relating to the New Partnership for Africa’s Development (NEPAD) which called for the setting up of a coordinated mechanism to combat corruption effectively.

In what was clearly a response to this call, the AU Leaders met in Maputo, Mozambique, in July 2003, and adopted this historic regional instrument to tackle head long the menace of corruption on the continent. According to article 2 of the instrument, the objectives of the Convention are to:

Promote and strengthen the development in Africa by each State Party, of mechanisms required to prevent, detect, punish and eradicate corruption and related offences in the public and private sectors.

Promote, facilitate and regulate cooperation among the State Parties to ensure the effectiveness of measures and actions, to prevent, detect, punish and eradicate corruption and related offences in Africa.
Coordinate and harmonize the policies and legislations between State Parties for the purposes of prevention, detection, punishment and eradication of corruption on the continent.

Promote socio-economic development by removing obstacles to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights as well as civil and political rights.

Establish the necessary conditions to foster transparency and accountability in the management of public affairs.

By virtue of article 4, the Convention applies to a variety of acts of corruption and related offences such as the solicitation, acceptance, directly or in directly, by a public official or any other person, of any goods or monetary value or other benefits such as gift, favour, promise or advantage for himself or herself or for another person or entity in exchange for any act or omission in the performance of his or her public functions. It also applies to the offering or granting, directly or indirectly, to a public official or any other person of any goods of monetary value, or other benefit, such as a gift, favour, promise or advantage for himself or herself or for other person or entity, in exchange for any act or omission in the performance of his or her public functions.

Article 5 of the Convention embodies a commitment by State Parties to adopt legislative and other measures that are required to establish as offences acts and omissions mentioned in article 4, paragraph 1, of the Convention. By article 5, paragraph 2, of the Convention, the State Parties also undertake to strengthen national control measures to ensure that the setting up and operation of foreign companies in the territory of a State Party shall be subject to the respect of the national legislation in force. By paragraph 3 of article 5, the State Parties also undertake to establish, maintain and strengthen independent national anti-corruption authorities or agencies and to adopt legislative and other measures to create, maintain and strengthen internal accounting, auditing and follow up systems in the procurement and management of public goods and services.

Other key provisions of the Convention are: article 6, which criminalizes laundering of the proceeds of corruption; article 7 embodying a commitment by State Parties to require all designated public officials to declare their assets at the time of assumption of office, during and after their term of office in the public service; article 8 in which State Parties undertake to adopt necessary measures to establish under their laws an offence of illicit enrichment; and article 9 in which the State Parties undertake to adopt such legislative and other measures to give effect to the right of access to any information that is required to assist in the fight against corruption and related offences. The Convention, which entered into force on 5 August, 2006, has since been ratified by all the 55 African countries, with Sudan, the last country to ratify the instrument, depositing its instrument of ratification with the Chairperson of the Commission on 26 December 2018. (African Union Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption: https://www.au.int. accessed 29 May 2019). That Africa has persistently performed poorly in the global ranking of least corrupt nations is an indication that the robust measures contained in this Convention have not been effectively implemented by African States. It is no exaggeration that even where the recommended legislative measures have been adopted the commitment of the leaders (particularly in the executive arms of governments) to same leaves much to be desired.

Legal and Institutional Frameworks to Combat Corruption

Apparently in response to the commitment they made under the AU Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption practically all the African countries have adopted legislative and other measures to fight corruption in their territories. In this part of the paper we shall be focusing on the legal and institutional frameworks instituted by the selected African countries in their war against corruption. The purpose of this analysis is to
determine whether indeed the laws and the institutions are adequate to combat the hydra-headed malfeasance called corruption in Africa and shore up the continent’s rating in the Transparency International Corruption Perceptions Index. It should be stated here that the review of the legal frameworks shall be founded basically on legislative measures adopted by the selected countries.

Institutional Framework

Practically all the African countries selected for this study have created institutions ranging from the regular law enforcement agencies like the police and custom service, to the special agencies, like the Nigeria’s Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC), South Africa’s Anti-Corruption Unit (ACU) and Ugandan’s Anti-Corruption Unit (UACU) to fight corruption. In Nigeria, with the largest population of Africans, for example, the administration of former President Olusegun Obansanjo in 2002 and 2004 respectively established the Independent Corrupt Practices and other Related Offences Commission (ICPC) and the Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC). The ICPC, according to section 6 of the enabling Act, was created to receive and investigate complaints bordering on official corruption and to prosecute those alleged to have committed the offences under the Act. Also pursuant to section 6 of the EFCC Act, the Commission is empowered to enforce and administer the provisions of the Act and to prosecute anyone alleged to have violated any of the financial crimes created by the Act or any other enactment embodying criminal law.

It need be stated that apart from these two main anti-graft agencies, there are other institutions set up to fight corruption in Nigeria. These include: the Public Complaints Bureau (PCB); Corrupt Practices Investigation Bureau (PBIB); and the Code of Conduct Bureau (CCB).

In South Africa, “realizing that apartheid and other discriminating laws and practices of the past lent itself to the abuse of governmental powers and corrupt activities of public officials” (see the Preamble to the Anti-Corruption Act 1996 of South Africa) the country in 1996 set up the Anti-corruption Unit (ACU) based on the founding values of prevention, deterrence and education. The Unit is empowered to receive complaints and investigate instances of corruption, prevent future corruption and educate inhabitants of South Africa of the effects of corruption. This is contained under section 2 of South Africa’s Anti-Corruption Act, 1996 (as amended).

Similarly in Uganda, the Anti-Corruption Unit was established as one stop center specialized office under the State House charged with the responsibility of receiving corruption information from Ugandan citizens over a secure and confidential online platform. The Uganda’s ACU is currently led by Lt. Col. Edith Nakalema and its mandate is to ensure that the fight against corruption is effective in a dynamic world where corruption has morphed and taken on new forms, thereby making the old conventional methods not effective. It is also part of the functions of the UACU to receive complaints and initiate investigation and prosecution if need be of persons involved in corruption within public sector. The Unit also gathers information on corruption occurring in government and the public sector from a variety of sources such as members of the public, heads of government departments and agencies, officials working in both the public and private sectors and the media. (Source: https://report-corruption.go.ug). It is important to add that in Uganda, apart from the ACU, two other bodies vested with prosecutorial powers are the Inspector General of Government (IGG) and the Director of Public Prosecution (DPP). Part IV (sections 36-50) of the Anti-Corruption Act 2009 (as amended) in fact vests extensive powers in these entities to combat corrupt practices as are contained in the ACA.
In Libya, one institution that has played a major role in the war against corruption both in the pre- and post-Gaddafi era, is the Audit Bureau. Although government institutions, as reported by Mzioudet (2014) in a report published by SADEQ INSTITUTE, have had little impact on reducing corruption in the oil-rich country, the Bureau has made exceptional contribution to the anti-graft crusade, serving as corruption watchdogs.

**Analysis of the Legal Frameworks**

Under this subheading, we shall be examining the main legislative enactments dealing with corruption and related offences in the selected countries. This is with a view to determining whether indeed there are enough laws to deal with the problem of corruption in our countries of study and by extension on the African continent.

**The Nigerian Approach**

In Nigeria, the law on corruption and abuse of office is embodied in chapter 12 of the Criminal Code, one of the two main instruments, embodying criminal law in Nigeria. Besides the Criminal Code and Penal Code the Nigerian Government also in 2002 and 2004 respectively enacted the ICPC Act and the EFCC Act. These two instruments were made to deal specifically with the problem of corruption which the Supreme Court of Nigeria in the case of *Nyame v FRN* (2010) 7 NWLR (pt 1193) 344 at 429 described as the bane of the Nigerian society.

The relevant laws on corruption in Nigeria are scattered in different enactments, the major ones being the Criminal Code, Penal Code, Code of Conduct Bureau & Tribunal Act, the EFCC Act and the ICPC Act. However, as the war against corruption took a more pronounced dimension at the onset of democratic rule in 1999, till date, it is the last two instruments (the EFCC and ICPC Acts) that have been frequently invoked in prosecuting anti-graft cases. Our focus therefore will be on these two instruments in this review.

The major offences created under the ICPC Act are contained under sections 8 to 26 of the Act. These include fraudulent receipt of properties (section 13), doing of some acts with intent to frustrate investigation by the Commission (section 15), Offering or receiving bribe as an inducement for voting or abstaining from voting at any meeting of a public body (section 18), soliciting any advantage offered to or by any person as an inducement or reward for or on account of his refraining from bidding at any auction conducted by or on behalf of a public body (section 21), offering or accepting bribe or gratification to or by a public servant as an inducement or reward for such public servant giving assistance or using his influence in the promotion, execution or procuring of contracts, (section 22) and failure on the part of a public official to report bribery transactions to the Commission or a police officer (section 23) of the Act.

Part IV of the EFCC Act deals with specific offences and the penalties therefor. These include offences relating to financial malpractices involving officers of a bank or other financial institutions (section 14), promoting or funding of terrorists activities (section 15), giving false and misleading information to a public officer who is to take decision in the discharge of his duty under the Act (section 16), retaining, acquiring or using the proceeds of a criminal conduct (section 17) and offences relating to economic and financial crimes under the Act (section 18).

One observation that must be made at this juncture is that the Nigerian law on corruption has become unnecessarily duplicative. A review of the major enactments prohibiting corruption in the country revealed that many of the offences contained in the ICPC Act & the CCBT Act are basically the same as those in the Criminal Code and the Penal Code while the penalties for those offences are in most cases not the same. It is also regrettable to note that notwithstanding the duplicity of the country’s anti-graft jurisprudence the war against corruption has not been very successful, as will be shown later in the paper.
The Ugandan Approach

In Uganda, the relevant law on corruption is basically the Anti-corruption Act, Act No 6, 2009, which was enacted 25 July 2009 and came into force 25 August 2009. The approach adopted by Uganda is to amend the relevant provisions of the Penal Code Act dealing with corruption while creating a separate instrument to deal frontally with the subject of corruption According to the Long Title to the ACA, the main objective of this instrument is to provide for the effectual prevention of corruption in both the public and private sectors. Parts II and III of the Act contain a long list of acts that will constitute offences under the instrument. These include solicitation or acceptance of by a public official of any goods or benefits or any other form of gratification for himself or another person in exchange for any act or omission in the performance of his public functions (section 2), corrupt transactions with agents (section 3), bribery of a public official (section 5), diversion of public funds & resources for purposes unrelated to which the resources or funds were intended (section 6), loss of public property (section10), abuse of office (section 11), impersonating public officers (section 17), embezzlement (section 19) and causing financial loss (section 20).

The other major offences include: fraudulent disposal of trust property (section 21); fraudulent false accounting (section 23); false certificates by public officials (section 25); and false claims by public officials (section 24). Perhaps, one of the most interesting provisions of the Uganda’s ACA is the criminalization of nepotism under section 13. By this provision, a person who being the holder of an office does any act in connection with the office for the purpose of doing favors to any person on the basis of blood relation between that person & the other person commits an offence and by virtue of section 26 of the Act such an offender is liable to an imprisonment for a term of 10 years.

The South African Approach

Like most other countries on the continent, the Government of South Africa has also taken steps to create law to deal specifically with the problem of corruption. The country in 2004 enacted the Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act 12 of 2004. The Act was enacted 27 April 2004 and came into force on 31 July 2004. The intention of the Act, according to the Long Title thereto, is to provide for the offence of corruption and offences relating to corrupt activities; to provide for investigative measure in respect of corruption and related corrupt activities; to provide for the establishment and the endorsement of a Register in order to place certain restrictions on persons and enterprises convicted of corrupt activities relating to tenders and contracts; to place a duty on certain persons holding position of authority to report certain corrupt transactions; to provide for extra-territorial jurisdiction in respect of the offence of corruption and offences related to corrupt activities; and to provide for matters connected therewith.

Chapter 2 of the Act embodies a long list of offences created under the instrument. The major offences created by the Act include, accepting or offering to accept gratification from any other person whether for the benefit of himself or herself or any other person (section 3), offences in respect of corrupt activities relating to public officers (section 4), offences in respect of corrupt activities relating to foreign public officials (section 5), offences of corrupt activities relating to agents (section 6), offences in respect of corrupt activities relating to members of legislative body (section 7) and offences in respect of corrupt activities relating to judicial officers & members of prosecuting authority (sections 8 and 9 respectively).

Others are: offences of receiving or offering of unauthorized gratification by or to party to an employment relationship (section 10); offences in respect of corrupt activities relating to witnesses and evidential materials during certain proceedings (section 11); offences of unacceptable conducts relating to witnesses (section 18);
offences relating to acquisition of private interest in contract, agreement or investment of public body (section 17); offences of intentional interference with, hindering or obstruction of investigation of offence (section 19); and the offence of accessory to or after offence (section 20). The preliminary offences of attempt, conspiracy and inducing another person to commit offence are contained under section 21.

The Libyan Approach
The major challenge to the anti-graft war in Libya is the fact that the country does not have a permanent Constitution in place. The current organic/supreme law is the Constitutional Declaration introduced following the 2011 overthrow of the Gadaffi regime. According to an online report on corruption updates in Libya (https://www.business-anti-corruption/country-profile-Libya/) published by Business Anti-Corruption Portal, Libya also lacks a general anti-corruption law but merely relies on the Libya Criminal Code and a specialized anti-corruption law – the Law for the High Authority for the Application of National Standard of Integrity – passed during the post-revolution period. This law established the High Commission on the Application of Standards of Integrity and Patriotism.

Although bribery, abuse of office, and nepotism are criminalized under this law yet the Government has failed to implement the law effectively due to the inefficacy of the institutional framework responsible for its implementation. According to the report of the Business Anti-Corruption Portal (BAP), institutional safeguard for the prevention of corruption and financial control as well as effective integrity mechanisms are generally absent. The report further indicates that government officials are not subjected to any disclosure law and are often engaged in corruption with impunity. Budget planning and implementation, the report further says, lacks transparency and are not subject to independent audit while whistle blowers do not enjoy legal protection.

The foregoing notwithstanding, the post-Gadaffi Libyan Constitution appears to embody very comprehensive anti-graft provisions. It is instructive to note that the Preamble to the Draft Constitution emphasizes, inter alia, the desire of the citizens to establish a total departure from autocracy and to build the state of rule of law. In keeping with this spirit, article 28 of the Draft Constitution provides that the state shall take necessary measures to combat administrative and financial corruption, adding any person who is sentenced in a corruption related offences shall be barred from public office for life. Under article 200 of the Draft Constitution, it is provided that the state shall take necessary measures to pursue and recover public funds including real properties that were subject to actions which contravened effective legislations, as well as confiscate funds emanating from corruption-related crimes through direct or indirect means and under article 25 it is provided that public monies shall be safeguarded and it shall not be permissible to seize them. This section further states that the statute of limitation shall not apply to crimes involving public funds and that it shall not be permissible to pardon these crimes.

Research Methodology
The primary objective of this study was to analyze the legal and institutional frameworks put in place by the continent of Africa on the war against corruption, using the four selected countries as case studies. This was with a view to determining whether the legislative and institutional measures adopted by African countries are indeed adequate to combat the scourge of corruption on the continent. In achieving this objective, the study adopted the qualitative research method the focal point of which was the state of the extant legislative instruments and the agencies established to enforce or implement same. The countries selected for the study cut cross the four wings of Africa. Nigeria representing the West African sub-region, and with a population of about 200 million people, has one of the biggest economies in Africa. South Africa, with probably the second biggest economy in Africa,
represents the South African sub-region while North Africa and East Africa are represented respectively by Libya and Uganda. From the happenings at these four wings of Africa, some assumptions can be made that will be fairly representative of the continental approach with respect to the anti-graft campaigns. Accordingly, the study collected data from both primary and secondary sources. The primary sources include the various Anti-Corruption Acts enacted by the four countries selected for the study and the organic laws of these countries as well as the instruments setting up the various anti-corruption agencies. The secondary sources include books, journal articles, case reviews, internet materials and periodicals (newspaper reports and comments). The data obtained from these sources were subjected to content analysis to determine the impact of the legislative and other measures adopted by the selected countries on the campaign against corruption and abuse of office in the affected territories.

Summary of Findings

The results of this study show that apart from Libya which does not seem to have very stable law against graft, there are sufficient legal bulwarks against corruption in the countries sampled. In Nigeria, for example, apart from the two main legislative enactments on criminal law i.e Criminal Code and the Penal Code, there are a plethora of other instruments dealing specifically with corruption and related crimes. The most prominent of these, as earlier noted in this paper, are the ICPC Act and the EFCC Act. In addition, the Government of Nigeria in 2000 and 2004 respectively, established two agencies, namely, the Independent Corrupt Practices and other Related Offences Commission and the Economic and Financial Crimes Commission, charged with the responsibility of investigating and prosecuting all corruption related cases.

In South Africa, the Government of the Republic in 2004 enacted the Prevention and Combating of Corrupt Activities Act 12 of 2004 in its attempt to, inter alia, strengthen the measures to prevent and combat corrupt practices in the Republic. The country also set up a special agency known as South Africa’s Anti-Corruption Unit (ACU) based on the values of prevention, deterrence and education of the citizenry. The primary assignment of this Unit, as stated earlier, is to receive complaints, investigate instances of corruption and prevent future corruption in South Africa.

This study also shows that the Government of Uganda has taken some proactive steps to combat the menace of corruption. This could be seen in the enactment of the Anti-Corruption Act, Act 6, 2009 which aims at providing for the effectual prevention of corruption in both the public and private sectors in Uganda. It will be recalled that prior to the enactment of the Uganda’s Act cases bordering on corruption and abuse of office were dealt with by some provisions of the Penal Code Act (PCA), namely, sections 55-93, 268, 269, 323, 325 and 326 which have since been amended. Apparently to demonstrate a greater commitment to the war against corruption, the Government of Uganda came up with the Anti-Corruption Act which contains no fewer than 70 provisions dealing with corruption and related offences. In addition to the above, the country has also demonstrated a spirited desire to fight corruption by establishing at the State House an Anti-Corruption Unit charged with the responsibility of ensuring that the war against corruption is successfully prosecuted.

In Libyan, even though there is lack of a stable constitutional jurisprudence, as earlier mentioned, the post-Gadaff Libyan Draft Constitution notably embodies very comprehensive anti graft provisions apparently because the country has just emerged from one of the most repressive regimes in Africa. For example, established by the Draft Constitution is an Audit Bureau charged with the duty of exercising financial control and audit of the state funds. Article 176 of the Draft Libyan Constitution establishes a public treasury into which all state
revenues should be paid and no part of the treasury funds shall be allocated for any purpose unless prescribed by law. The problem in Libya therefore is not the lack of adequate laws but the failure of the new regime to sign the Draft Constitution into law, thereby jeopardizing the fight against corruption in that country.

In the three other countries sampled in this study, the results have also shown that the challenge is not lack of adequate laws but the institutions set up to implement these laws do not appear to be strong in that they are not completely independent of the governments that set them up. In Uganda, for example, the special unit set up to fight corruption is domiciled in the State House. How does one expect this agency to act impartially when high-ranking government officials are involved in corruption cases? The leaders of the other two authorities charged with power to prosecute cases of corruption in Uganda, namely the IGG and DPP, are also appointees of the State.

In Nigeria, the chairpersons and full time members of the two major agencies set up to fight corruption are appointed by the President of the Federal Republic of Nigeria and it is to the President that they owe allegiance. Although the appointment of these officers is subject to the confirmation of the Nigerian Senate (see eg section 2(3) EFCC Act) yet where such appointments, especially of the Chairperson, are not confirmed by the Senate, the affected officers can function in acting capacity as it is the case for about two years in Nigeria with respect to the EFCC Chairman.

This study has also revealed that most of the legislative and institutional measures adopted by the African countries are in response to the provisions of the AU Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption which was adopted in Maputo, Mozambique in 2003. The AU, through this instrument, has set a regional agenda for a concerted war against corruption on the African continent. It is observed that most of the acts criminalized as corruption and abuse of office substantially reflected the provisions of article 4 of the AU Convention while the laws, institutions, authorities and agencies set up by these countries are largely a response to the call for the adoption of legislative and other measures to combat the scourge of corruption as contained under article 5 of the AU Convention. In a nutshell, both at the continental and domestic levels, it does appear that Africa has enough laws to deal with the problem of corruption but the institutions and agencies set up to implement or enforce these laws are not sufficiently equipped to do so.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

The solution to the challenges that Africa is facing in redeeming its battered image with respect to corruption and abuse of office appears to lie in the strengthening of the institutions and agencies set up by countries of the continent to combat the scourge of corruption. This can be achieved in two major ways.

The first is that the agencies should be made truly independent of the executive arms of governments that set them up in order to guarantee their efficiency and impartiality. The Nigerian example has earlier been cited in this paper. By the law creating the EFCC, the Chairman of the anti-graft body is appointable by the President of the Republic, subject to the confirmation of the upper chamber of the National Assembly i.e the Senate. There is however a lacuna in the law to the effect that where a nominee of the President is rejected by the legislature such a person is allowed to function in acting capacity and there is no limitation of time within which he can so act. The Nigerian Government has exploited this lacuna to keep the EFCC Chairman in office for more than two years notwithstanding that his appointment has twice been rejected by the Nigerian Senate. The effect of this lacuna is that the Chairman of an anti-graft agency can act in perpetuity in the event of his nomination being
rejected by the Parliament. To correct this misnomer, it is humbly suggested that the law establishing an anti-
graft agency should make his appointment subject to the approval of the legislature and where such approval is
refused such a candidate will not have the power to function in acting capacity in the case of a fresh appointment
and where an appointment is to be renewed and the parliamentary confirmation of the renewal has been refused
the officer should only be allowed to continue to function in acting capacity for a maximum period of three (3)
months pending the appointment of another substantive Chairman.

The second way of strengthening the agencies is to sufficiently fund them and make sure that only qualified
personnel are engaged to carry out the functions of these bodies. What is being suggested here is that appointment
into different positions within the rank and file of these agencies should be based on merit and not nepotism or
other extraneous criteria. African countries are also enjoined to take proactive steps to implement the provisions
of article 12 of the AU Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption. This article deals with the
engagement of civil society and the media in a collaborative effort to tackle corruption and related offences. The
article actually embodies the multifaceted approach being strongly recommended in this paper and it is germane
to reproduce it at this juncture, for emphasis and ease of reference:

**Article 12.**

State Parties undertake to:

- Be fully engaged in the fight against corruption and related offences and the popularisation of this
corruption with the full participation of the media and civil society at large;
- Create an enabling environment that will enable civil society and the media to hold governments to
the highest level of transparency and accountability in the management of public affairs;
- Ensure and provide for the participation of civil society in the monitoring process and consult civil
society in the monitoring process and consult civil society in the implementation of this Convention;
- Ensure that the media is given access to information in cases of corruption and related offences on
condition that the dissemination of such information does not adversely affect the investigation
process and the right to a fair trial.

As noted in the Preamble to the AU Convention, there is no doubt that corruption and impunity have negative
effects on the political, economic, social and cultural stability of African States. They also have devastating
effects on the economic and social development of the African peoples. As the economic and social challenges
posed by corruption are no respecters of anybody, it is important for African leaders to mainstream a
collaborative and multifaceted approach to the fight against the scourge. In this connection, it is humbly
suggested that all segments of the society such as professional bodies like the Bar Association/Law Society,
academic staff of universities, labour unions, religious and faith-based organizations and even the student bodies
should be fully engaged in the prosecution of this war. It is further suggested that the war against corruption
should not be politicized as the social and security challenges often thrown up by corrupt practices are no
respecters of political affiliations.

Opposition political parties should therefore team up with the ruling parties, the media and the civil society in
the effort to address the root causes of corruption in Africa with a view to stamping out the scourge from the
continent. As stated in the Preamble to the AU Convention, Heads of State and Government of African countries
must equally be willing to demonstrate their commitments to building partnerships with other segments of the
society like women, youths and the private sectors if the continent of Africa hopes to shore up its rating in the
Global Corruption Perception Index by the Transparency International. The political leaders must show good examples in prosecuting this war by not only living above board but avoiding selective prosecution of suspects.

It should be stated, importantly, that if the support of the civil society and that of the professional and non-governmental organizations is to be earned in mainstreaming a multifaceted approach to fighting this challenge, the impression must not be created in the minds of the people that it is only members of the opposition parties or perceived adversaries within the corridors of power that are being targeted. In effect, stamping out corruption from Africa is a task requiring all hands to be on the deck. To borrow a statement once credited to the Nigerian President, Muhammadu Buhari, when he first assumed office on 29 May 2015, “if we fail to kill corruption then corruption will kill all of us”. This should underscore the seriousness with which African leaders must prosecute the ongoing campaign against the scourge of corruption and abuse of office on the continent.

Acknowledgements

I appreciate the organizers of this conference for giving me the opportunity to make my modest contribution to knowledge through participation in the programme. I want to specially thank all my anonymous reviewers of both the abstract and the full paper for their observations and suggestions that have gone a long way to improve the quality of this paper. I also owe my family members, especially my wife, a debt of gratitude for their moral support during the course of putting this paper together. I thank every other person whose efforts contributed to the conduct of this study. May the Good Lord bless you all.

References

Anti Corruption Act, Act No 6, 2009 of Uganda.
Draft Libya Constitution, yet to enter into force.


South African Anti Corruption Unit, 1996.


Ugandan Anti Corruption Unit 2009.
Effectiveness of Anti-corruption Measures in Uganda

1Pius Gumisiriza & 2Robert Mukobi
1School of civil service, Public Policy and Governance, Uganda Management Institute, Kampala, Uganda.
2Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development

Corresponding E-mail: piusgumisiriza@yahoo.com / mukrobb@gmail.com

Abstract
The government of Uganda has put in place and is implementing different home grown and internationally proven anti-corruption measures such as rescission of contracts obtained through corrupt means, monetary fines for those implicated in corruption, debarment/blacklisting of companies or individuals know to have been corrupt in the past, asset declaration by leaders and government officials to detect and minimise corrupt accumulation of assets, whistleblowing to expose corruption by those who know about it, criminalising money laundering to stem the flow of illegally or corruptly acquired money, confiscation of assets or proceeds obtained through corruption all aimed at curbing endemic corruption in the country. Nevertheless, corruption both petty and grand is still widespread in government institutions at all levels. This article uses secondary data sources to critically explain why these anti-corruption measures have not been effective in the fight against corruption in Uganda. The main argument made in this article is that anti-corruption measures in Uganda have not been effective because they are inherently weak; a challenge that is compounded by political interferences in anti-corruption prosecutions and a dysfunction anti-corruption institutional framework. This article recommends that anti-corruption measures should be fine-tuned to confront sophisticated corruption and be applied to all impartially.

Key words: Anti-Corruption; Petty Corruption, Grand Corruption, Whistleblowing, Debarment, Monetary Fines

Introduction
Over the last two decades, the government of Uganda has instituted both homegrown and internationally recommended anticorruption measures such as rescission of contracts, monetary fines, debarment, asset declaration, whistleblowing, imprisonment of corruption culprits, criminalising money laundering among others in order to curb rampant corruption in the country. Different parameters used to gage the effectiveness of anticorruption measures indicate that some success has been registered. For example the Inspectorate of Government (IG) which is the lead national anti-corruption agency with power to investigate, inspect, and freeze bank accounts; search, arrest, and order for production of documents; enforce asset declaration and prosecute public officials involved in corruption indicated in its report covering July – December 2017 that it registered 1,399 complaints on corruption and maladministration across the country and 4,817 investigations were ongoing. Of all the complaints received, 947 were investigated and concluded, 15 cases out of 105 prosecuted corruption cases were concluded with 11 convictions, two acquittals, and two dismissals. More than UgShs 15 billion was saved through Court Fines, Awards and Orders while UgShs 267,191,558 was made from administrative recovery sanctions imposed on officials in the MDAs and Local Governments. 14 cases of grand and syndicated corruption involving 20 high-ranking public officials were completed, arrests were made and culprits were prosecuted. Seven Judicial Review cases were concluded under Civil Litigation and all the judgments were in favor of the IG. The 2nd phase of the Inspectorate of Government Online Declaration System (IG-ODS) commenced during this period and mechanisms for availing the previous Declarations as a baseline/benchmark for subsequent Declarations were also created.

The IG also concluded Verification of Declarations of 10 (15%) leaders while verifications of 102 leaders were ongoing (Inspectorate of Government, 2018). Despite of these achievements, corruption in Uganda is still pervasive and most people including top ranking anti-corruption officials seem resigned to corruption rather than stand up against it (see Kazibwe, 2018). In 2017, Transparency International ranked Uganda 151 out of 176 countries in the Corruption Perception Index of 2016, placing it among 25 most corrupt countries in the world (see Transparency International, 2017). The overall purpose of this article is to critically examine why different
anticorruption measures as mentioned before have achieved very limited success in combating endemic corruption in Uganda. The main argument made in this article is that most anticorruption measures in Uganda are internally weak and cannot effectively deal with complex grand and syndicated corruption scandals.

**Rescission (Nullity) of Contracts**

Rescission (nullity) of contracts happens when a contract is cancelled, annulled, or abrogated by the parties, or one of them, thereby restoring the parties to the positions they would have occupied if no contract had ever been formed (see McGowan and Brisendine, 2001; Sherwin, 2003). Contracts obtained with the influence of corruption can be entirely or partly rescinded/annulled from the very beginning or at any time once discovered and this measure has been hailed by different scholars and anti-corruption practitioners as one of the effective measures that governments can use to curb corruption in a country because it entails substantial costs and risks for the parties involved (see Nell, 2008; Lambsdorff, 2013).

In Uganda, the conditions for rescission of contracts are provided for in Article 2 Clause 119 (5) of the Uganda Constitution, which stipulates the conditions to be fulfilled in contract management and failure of which would render such a contract or contracts null and void (Uganda Constitution, 1995). The Constitution provisions are operationalized using the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Act (PPDA) 2003, which stipulates the guidelines and the conditions to be fulfilled under public procurement and the conditions for nullification of contracts. Section 45 of the PPDA Act 2003 requires that Procuring and Disposing Entities (PDE), bidders and providers observe the highest standards of ethics during procurement and the execution of contracts. Also section 55 of the same Act emphasizes the application of rules, guideline, and regulation set out by relevant bodies. Section 93(1) of the same act requires public officers as well as expert engaged to deliver specific service to sign the code of ethical conduct.

Therefore, noncompliance with these provisions of PPDA Act 2003 renders a contract illegal, null, and void. According to Sub-Clause 3.1 of the procurement guidelines, the Procuring and Disposing Entity (PDE) may terminate a contract for Supplies if it at any time determines that representatives of the PDE or of a provider engaged in corrupt or fraudulent practices during the procurement or the execution of that contract (see PPDA, 2015). Many public contracts that have been discovered to be secured through corruption or illegal both at central and local government level have been annulled. However, in most cases the usefulness of nullity of contract as a deterrent to corruption in Uganda remains ineffective because of political interference, collusion between corrupt government technocrats and companies to approval or conceal contracts that should be annulled, renegotiation of contracts that become more expensive than the previous ones, failure to recover the already spent public money once a contract has been annulled, costly compensation and most renegotiated contracts are also prone to more corruption because the entire system is corrupt. For example, in 1996, the Ugandan Parliament Accounts Committee (PAC) recommended the termination of Swiss Procurement Company (SWIPCO) on the ground of incompetency, irregularities in procurement process, and political interference. However, in 1999, through bribery and connivance with Ministry of Finance officials, the same PAC produced a report that commented favorably on SWIPCO’s experience and credentials and recommended them to render services to government (Badru and Muhumuza, 2017). In 2013, the Karuma Hydro Electric Dam was initially terminated but later renegotiated, costing Uganda US$ 2.2 billion instead of the initial US$ 1.2 billion. In 2014, EATAW an alleged American Company was awarded a contract to construct 75 km road; however, because of fraud in the procurement process, the contract was cancelled and the government lost 24 billion shillings. The renegotiated Kyetume-Katosi Road cost UgShs 254 billion instead of the initial 165 billion (Sabiiti et al., 2014).
Decisions to nullify or staying nullified public contracts secured through corruption in Uganda are susceptible to political influence peddling. For instance, in 2014, the Parliament of Uganda recommended the termination of the contracts awarded to two electric power distribution companies (Eskom and Umeme) due to gross manipulations encountered in the procurement of Umeme concessions and scandalous provisions of the power distribution agreements signed between Uganda and Umeme Ltd. However, the President revoked parliament resolutions and ordered the contracts approval (Bukenya and Muhumuza, 2017).

In 2011, Members of Parliament wanted to nullify the contract agreements of an oil exploration and extraction company (Tullow) on the ground that there was no transparency and accountability in the procurement process, and government officials had taken kickbacks. However, the President ordered the Minister of Energy to sign and uphold the Tullow production sharing agreement with Uganda (Tangri and Mwenda, 2013). In 2008, Inspectorate of Government cancelled the tender for the UgShs 312 billion second phase of the National Social Security Fund (NSSF) pension towers due to corruption. In the process, the government lost US$ 16 million in compensation and up to now the construction of the NSSF pension towers has not progressed. In the National Population Data Bank Identification Solution project, the government lost UgShs 205 billion, which had already been used in procurement (UDN, 2013).

In 2006, the National Enterprises Corporation (NEC), which is the trading arm of the Uganda People’s Defence Force, signed a mining contract with Dura Cement to mine limestone from the 473-hectare land owned by NEC in Kamwenge and nearby districts. However, President Museveni later ordered the cancellation of this contract because the directors and address of Dura Cement Company were not known. Dura sued the government for loss of business after their contract was given to Hima Cement and demanded $103 million but was paid more than $16 million after negotiations. In 2010, Haba Group of Companies belonging to Mr. Hassan Basajjabalaba: a well-known financier of the ruling NRM election campaigns and its business league chairperson had their contract to lease and manage three Kampala markets of Nakasero, Shauriyako and St Balikuddembe rescinded by President Museveni after market vendors and parliament opposed the lease. Basajjabalaba used forged presidential signatures among other irregularities to demand and was compensated UgShs 142 billions (US$ 61 millions) which the then Minister of Finance Syda Bbumba, Attorney General Khiddu Makubuya, Governor Bank of Uganda Tumusiime Mutebile and President Museveni knew about. An audit by the Office of the Auditor General determined that there was no basis for the compensation and Basajjabalaba was subsequently arrested and charged with forgery of the documents relating to the payment and tax evasion. However, he never returned the taxpayer’s money and this has led many commentators to suspect that there could have been collusion to siphon off tax payers money and use it to finance the 2011 presidential elections (Inspectorate of Government, 2012; Bukenya and Muhumuza, 2017).

In Uganda, the law clearly states that falsification of documents, signatures, academic or tax verification certificates will earn an individual a loss of contract and some jail time; the same apply to an individual involved in big contracts like road construction. However, it has also been documented that companies may become victims of such laws even when they are not corrupt but find themselves in a joint venture with corrupt partners and end up suffering from nullity of contract (Lambsdorff, 2011, 2013).

Monetary Fines

Monetary fines are charges imposed on individuals or entities that have been convicted of a crime. A fine is an amount of money an offender must pay to the offended or for compensation of breach of contracts, rules, or violation of codes of conduct or nonconformity to agreed procedures (Zucker, 2004). The size of the penalty is sometimes linked to the contract value or reflects the gravity of an offence, taking into account an enterprise’s size, culpability, and other factors such as the harm caused by an offence (UNIDOC, 2013). Monetary fines also
provide a conflict resolution where there is a less stringent burden of proof and they can be revoked without substantially disadvantaging the contractor, the risk of a wrong judgment is thus more fairly shared among the contracting parties. Monetary fines encourage self-reporting as companies strive for leniency.

Through monetary fines, resources are shifted from one party to another without further social costs. They are penal in nature, designed to punish misconduct and deter future offences by a defendant. Legislation sets out either a maximum fine or base penalty level and the actual fine will be determined upon consideration of aggravating or mitigating factors (see Lambsdorff, 2013). In Uganda, the use of monetary fines as a punishment for corruption has been embraced in different laws spread throughout various statutes. The Anti-Corruption Act 2009 stipulates the punishment for the corruption offences committed. A person convicted of an offence under sections 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 12, and 13 is liable on conviction to a term of imprisonment not exceeding 10 years or a fine not exceeding two hundred and forty currency points (240), or both. In monetary terms, a month of imprisonment is roughly equal to 2 currency points and each currency unit is Uganda Shillings 20,000 (US$ 6). The PPDA Act 2003 prescribes a jail sentence of 5 years and a minimum fine of 5 million Uganda Shillings (US$ 1,700) upon conviction for accounting officers who collude with a firm and award a contract by fraudulent means. New financial penalties have been added in the legislation, and quite often, these have been used as deterrent in engaging in fraudulent practices and committing crimes.

According to Anti-Money Laundering Act 2013, an individual who commits a crime under the Act faces between 5 and 15 years in prison or be liable to a fine ranging from UgShs 660,000,000 (six hundred sixty million Uganda shillings only) to 2,000,000,000 (two billion Uganda shillings) (approximately US$ 2,575–780,340). For a legal person, the fine imposed on the entity will range from UgShs 1,400,000,000 (Uganda Shillings One billion four hundred million) to UgShs 4,000,000,000 (Uganda shillings four billion only) (approximately US$ 546,240–1,560,680). The use of monetary fines as corruption deterrent tool comes with several advantages such as easy implementation. In Uganda, police and courts of law are mandated to give out fines for people who commit offences for instance corruption, embezzlement, misuse of public resources, and neglect of duty. Fines collected under this arrangement are then used to improve the welfare of these public institutions (JLOS, 2014).

Despite of the legal provisions for the use of monetary fines and their continued applications in courts law, various reports indicate that these penalties have not been effective in deterring bribes and corruption prevalence in Uganda. In fact, in some instances, they seem to accelerate corruption because most monetary fines laws are outdated. Monetary fines provided in the anticorruption laws are weak and just a fraction of what is embezzled, for example, a person who embezzle UgShs 18 billion (US$ 5 million), is not required to pay back the money but rather jailed for 3–5 years and sometimes get out on bail. In some cases, individuals and companies who have been fined are left in business and continue with their vices. The financial penalties are scattered throughout various statutes and are not consolidated in any one place and each of them is looked at in isolation of the other. Therefore, it becomes very difficult to track and assess the total impact of such financial penalties on an individual or company. The different anticorruption laws give judicial officers powers to order for compensation or repayment of the money to the owner, but this power can be misused when rules are vague and hardly enforced; officials then obtain sovereignty in interpreting them and may take a bribe. In addition, it is hard to estimate accurately the amount of fines that is sufficiently punitive to deter corruption. If the penalties are not severe enough and applied each time that inappropriate behavior is detected, they will not be effective in reducing corruption. While it can be argued one should raise the amount of fines and penalties against companies to draconian levels, the intended purpose of fines is forgotten in the process. Sometimes, lack of enforcement of fines has accelerated bribery in Uganda. Cases of asking and accepting a bribe in form of a cash payment in
order not to issue a speed fine or reduce the fine are very common in Uganda. Even the fines as prescribed by the current legislations have not kept pace with inflation. Many of the minimum and maximum are now absurdly low, and consequently, it is difficult to assess the total impact of financial penalties on an individual or company (JLOS, 2014).

Debarment
Debarment happens when company or an individual is formally prohibited from tendering or participating in a project that a government or multinational agency is funding following a finding that the company or individual was involved in the use of corruption to obtain contracts on past or present projects with that agency or government (Moran et al. 2004; Baghir-Zada, 2010). Under cross-debarment, when one agency debars a contractor, the other institutions automatically debar that very contractor. This improves anti-corruption efforts by multiplying the impact of debarment actions; thus, contractors could potentially face exclusion from many systems and this would mark a significant change in fraud and corruption practices (Yukins, 2013).

Debarment has gained momentum and many governments/international institutions have developed their own debarment systems to exclude contractors that have committed bribery or fraud or more broadly to exclude contractors that pose unacceptable performance or reputational risks because of bad acts or broken internal controls. In 2005, Transparency International published a list of recommended minimum standards to be applied in creating lists of untrustworthy, unreliable, and irresponsible companies and individuals proven that they participated in acts of corruption and preventing their participation in public contracting (see Transparency International, 2006). In Uganda, debarment is provided for in the laws and adopted in practice. Section 94 of the PPDA Act and Regulation 351 of the PPDA Regulations empower the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Asset Authority (PPDA) to suspend providers who do not comply with procurement regulations or guidelines. After conducting thorough investigations, the PPDA may suspend a provider (company) from engaging in any public procurement and disposal process for a period ranging from 1 to 10 years before being allowed to reapply.

There are many grounds for suspension including breach of the Code of Ethics of providers, submission of fogged documents, bid security, sheer negligence, bribery, corruption, shoddy work, abuse of office, general flouting of procurement procedures and debarment from the procurement process of an international agency of which Uganda is a member. However, debarment and cross debarment practices have been criticized for being unfair, inefficient paper tigers pretty to look at but not to be feared, poorly publicized, fail to include big companies with proven involvement in corrupt deals, subjected to technicalities such as unwillingness to debar for many reasons such as lack of strong evidence or lack of a court order and resistance to giving the public access to blacklists. At the same time, there is also a risk that a parent or subsidiary company, an agent, a joint venture, a consortium partner, or a subcontractor of the other company can be debarred for the actions of another company over which they had no control and in situations where they were not involved in corrupt conduct (Schooner, 2004). Well-established companies that have been known to violate anti-corruption regulations and are legally supposed to be prohibited from participating in public bids, sometimes bid again using their influence particularly if those companies are politically well connected (Global Integrity 2011). Although debarment is provided for in Ugandan laws, the measure has not been effectively utilised because the process involved in getting a firm debarred is quite long and complicated, and many debarred firms have sometimes been able to circumvent disciplinary measures, including bribing their way back into bidding processes and the government is very careful not to implement such measures on for example Chinese state owned companies that usually get
contracts using the influence of the government that provides the money to execute those contracts in the first place.

**Confiscation**

Confiscation of corruption proceeds constitutes another deterrent that makes corruption less attractive (OECD, 2008a). In Uganda, the Leadership Code Act 2002, Anti-Corruption Act 2009, and Anti-Money Laundering Act 2013 confer power to Inspectorate of Government and Directorate of Public Prosecution to freeze, seize, and confiscate proceeds of corruption and make recoveries. Money recovered from investigations and prosecution of corrupt officials or companies is paid directly to the institutions or local governments that had sustained the losses while some money is kept on the Asset Recovery Account maintained by the Inspectorate of Government. However, a critical analysis of the implementation of asset recovery laws shows little progress in making recoveries. This is mainly because corrupt officials register their assets in the names of their spouses, children, associates, relatives, or friends. Investigation of such cases is hard, as it is not provided in the law. This loophole is often taken advantage of by many corrupt public officials who amass illicit wealth and register it in other people’s names.

Furthermore, the law is not strong enough to criminalize those living beyond their known sources of income. The sanctions provided for under the same laws are so weak to deter someone to be involved in corruption for example, the confiscation of assets under the current anticorruption legal regime occurs only after conviction at the discretion of the court yet prosecutions leading to convictions are difficult. The value of recovered funds has been low compared to the value of public resources that are misappropriated. In 2007, out of US$ 43,676,471 lost in fraudulent procurement during CHOGM, less than US$ 2,941,176 was recovered. Between 2008 and 2011, only US$ 252,920 was recovered while US$ 4,275,499 was saved as the result of investigation (UDN, 2013; Inspectorate of Government, 2014). In December 2017, it was reported that the Government of Uganda had only recovered Sh71.4 billion (US$ 18.9 million) from corrupt officials through plea bargaining and post-conviction orders since the inception of the Anti-Corruption Court in 2008 (Odeng, 2017) which is an extremely low figure given that Uganda loses over US$ 300 million a year (see Mugerwa, 2016).

**Imprisonment**

There are those who argue that in cases where corrupt officials are not reimbursing stolen money or assets, imprisonment serves as a good deterrent and has worked in many countries (Humboldt-Viadrina School of Governance, 2012). However, in Uganda, giving prison sentences to culprits as an anti-corruption measure has many loopholes. Convicted public officials continue enjoying corruptly acquired wealth after serving their jail sentences, which does not reflect the seriousness of their crime or the magnitude of the losses suffered by the state. In many other instances, high-ranking government officials have used their political connections and affiliations to evade prison. For example, in August 2018, Anti-Corruption court judge, Lawrence Gidudu concluded the case and the outcome was as follows: First, the former minister for works Eng. Abraham Byandala, former Uganda National Roads Authority (UNRA) acting Executive Director, Eng. Benurado Kimeze Ssebugga, and the former UNRA legal counsel Marvin Byaruha were all acquitted of the charges in the Shs 24.7 billion Katosi road scam. Joe Ssemugooma, the former UNRA director of Finance and Administration and Wilberforce Senjako, the former UNRA regional accountant were each handed a 5 years jail term for abuse of office. Ssemugooma was given another 5 years for negligence of duty. Businessman Apollo Senkeeto alias Mark Kalyesubula the chief architect of the entire scam and acted as the country representative of Eutaw, the fictitious firm that was awarded the contract was handed a 10 years prison sentence for theft of public funds. He was also sentenced to 3 years for 6 counts of uttering false documents and 5 years for obtaining documents by false
pretense. Justice Gidudu, however, ruled that there was no financial loss caused since no evaluation of the works was done before the Inspector General of Government stopped the contract thus the accused are not obliged to pay back the taxpayers money (Kasule, 2018). These outcomes are not surprising for any observer that has been following anti-corruption practices in the country because they almost follow a well-established pattern that is: high ranking government officials are rarely convicted and sentenced to prison for corruption and this is well documented (see Human Rights Watch, 2013).

In very few cases where prison sentences have been secured, they are very short compared to the amount of money lost and perpetrators are rarely required to pay back the stolen money which explains where very little money has been recovered by the government as discussed earlier. In cities like La Paz in Bolivia and Hong Kong in China or countries such as Singapore that effectively reduced corruption and South Korea, Brazil and Rwanda that are now trying very hard to achieve the same, the formula was and is the opposite of what is happening in Uganda. Whenever prison sentences have been used as a punishment, they have made them severe in terms of years one has to serve for corruption including people that are very wealthy and those that have served government at the highest level including presidents (see Klitgaard et al., 2000; Lee, 2011; Romero, 2016; McCurry, 2017). Thus, if imprisonment is to be used as an effective anti-corruption measure in Uganda, it has to be made commensurate with the magnitude of corruption committed and be handed to every one with out fear or favor especially at the very top of government where most grand corruption scandals are happening (see Human Rights Watch, 2013).

Whistleblowing
Whistleblowing and whistleblower protection if well implemented can also be one of the most effective tools in detecting and combating corruption, safeguarding public interest, and promoting a culture of public accountability and integrity (Goel and Nelson, 2013). In Uganda, the Whistleblowers Protection Act 2010 was enacted to encourage individuals to blow the whistle on corruption cases, provides protection and monetary incentives for whistle blowing. The Inspectorate of Government (IG) established a hotline where individuals can report corruption anonymously. However, the whistleblowers protection law remains largely on paper or poorly enforced, thus allowing continued cases of retaliation against whistleblowers. Consequently, most whistleblowers are reluctant to cooperate after receiving threats or fear losing their lives, jobs, and properties yet without testimony of those who can identify high-level officials as the orchestrators of corruption, prosecutors are left with little evidence to convict corrupt officials (Mahoney, 2010). For example, in 2012, out of intimidation and fear, all the key 11 prosecution witnesses denied any knowledge of the 3 ministers involvement in CHOGM scandal where UgShs 14 billion was lost to corruption and as a result, the Anti-Corruption Court acquitted the 3 ministers. The lack of a clear system to protect witnesses and insulate prosecutors from bribery and intimidation means that whistleblowers protection law cannot be effective and anticorruption institutions in Uganda have ended up focusing on low-level corruption involving small sums of money, while the big fish have continued to accumulate wealth and power (UDN, 2013). There is need for government to strengthen whistleblowers and witness protection not only in law but also in real life by strengthening the Inspectorate of Government to receive and investigate complaints of retaliatory, discriminatory, or disciplinary action taken against whistleblowers and witnesses.

Asset Declaration
Asset declaration provides valuable information that helps uncover misconduct and illicit enrichment and ensures that leaders are accountable and that the acquisition of their assets is not through corruption. Successful
enforcement requires an effective asset declaration monitoring body with clear mandate, powers, capacity, resource, and authority to receive, process public officials’ asset declarations, as well as assess their authenticity, completeness, inaccuracies, and inconsistencies (OECD, 2011). In Uganda, it constitutes a corruption act for a leader to be found in possession of assets and income which is disproportionate to the known source of income, and penalty is confiscation or forfeiture to government any excess or undeclared property (Inspectorate of Government, 2014).

The Uganda Leadership Code Act 2002 mandates the Inspectorate of Government to verify the accuracy of incomes, assets, and liabilities of leaders, their spouses, children, and dependents less than 18 years after every 2 years. The implementation of the Leadership Code Act 2002 has yielded marginal success in Uganda due to lack of capacity in the enforcement agencies and weaknesses within the law. The Leadership tribunal required by the law to implement and enforce the Leadership Code Act has not been constituted leaving the law a mere paper tiger subject to challenge on occasions that the Inspector General of Government has attempted to implement it. In 2014, over 40% of eligible leaders failed to declare their income, assets, liability and got away with it. Even for those who declared, it was reported that many falsified their declarations. Private individuals who are not leaders within the meaning of the law such as presidential appointees, and low staff who may amass a lot of wealth through corruption offences are not required to declare their wealth and this loophole has allowed such people to enjoy their ill-gotten wealth unchecked.

Since the Access to Information Law came into force in 2005, the law cannot be applied to release asset declarations to the public for scrutiny and therefore lacks the potency to prevent illicit enrichment. The Inspectorate of Government lacks sufficient finance, staff, expertise, and equipment to enforce and verify all the declaration. Annually, only 50 of declared assets are sampled for verification and the rest are kept without confirmation for any inaccuracy and inconsistency. Leaders take advantage of this loophole to under or over declare their assets in anticipation of a future embezzlement because they know that the probability of getting them is too low (see Carson, 2015). As a matter of urgency, the Parliament should expeditiously put in place a legal framework for establishing a Leadership Code Tribunal for arbitration of corruption cases. Amend the law to ensure that all leaders at all levels and public officials become eligible to declare and provide more financial resources, equipment, and training to people working in anti-corruption agencies such as the Inspectorate of Government to allow them cope with the ever changing tricks and sophistication of corruption perpetrators.

**Criminalizing Money Laundering**

Money laundering can severely accelerate corruption and organized crime; thus, criminalizing it provides the possibility of courts to hold persons involved in it liable (Schneider, 2010). In Uganda, the enforcement of the Anti-Money Laundering Act 2013 has not achieved the desired outcomes because the Financial Intelligence Authority that is responsible for its enforcement is hampered by technical and operational challenges such as limited capacity (finance, human resource, technology, and equipment) and lack of an effective framework to foster collaboration among the different stakeholders. As a result, there are very few successful convictions of money launderers given the rising money laundering activities in the country. The effective enforcement is further hampered by the large informal sector that makes it difficult to track and monitor informal financial transactions, widespread use of cash rather than other means of exchange, confidentiality rules in banks and fear to lose customers, poor remuneration which makes officials responsible for detecting and controlling money laundering vulnerable to bribery and lack or poor record keeping (Edopu, 2010; Kulabako, 2013). As regards to effective enforcement of anti-money laundering, there is need to develop legislative measures to address co-operation in
tracing requests, transfer of such property or proceeds and provide resources to improve the capacity of enforcement agencies.

The government must also refrain from using the Anti-Money Laundering Act 2013 to hunt down political opponents and thwart the legitimate activities of NGOs, especially those involved in issues relating with the rule of law, governance, and human rights many of whom are now being portrayed as sympathizers of political opposition and companies whose owners may be political threats to government heavyweights as it was happening in the recent past for example on April 1 1999, Greenland Bank, the biggest indigenous commercial bank in Uganda at the time lost its license because it had a joint partnership with a company (Divinity Union) that was supposedly involved in money laundering scandals and its owner, Dr. Suleiman Kiggundu was arrested and charged with lending big sums of money in violation of the Financial Institutions Statute. However, in a written memorandum that Dr. Kiggundu submitted to the Judicial Commission of Inquiry into the Closure of Banks on August 7, 2000, he stated that his bank was a victim of politics and not bad economics which are well documented (Observer, 2008).

**Exogenous Factors**

Besides the above-discussed measures having internal challenges, there are also societal challenges, institution, and political weakness that make the fight against corruption very difficult in Uganda. For instance, civil society organizations that should play a very active role in trying to ensure that there is better accountability and proper use of public resources lack capacity in terms of resources, skills, and insider information of what happens inside the corridors of corruption deal making and have thus not effectively provided enough oversight and held government accountable. There is also a problem of serious corruption with the key anticorruption agencies, especially the police and judiciary that makes investigation, prosecution and conviction of corrupt actors very difficult (see Kato, 2016). Besides being corrupt, anti-corruption agencies face other challenges of their own such as understaffing, inadequate funding, lack of political support and ridicule from the political establishment (see Kazibwe, 2018). Other commentators have even argued that no anti-corruption measures can succeed as long as corruption is still used not only as a way for self-enrichment but also used as a tool for political power consolidation (Tangri and Mwenda, 2013; Badru and Muhumuza, 2017).

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

From the discussion above, this article concludes that while the government of Uganda has gone an extra mile in establishing several would be effective an corruption measures, they have not been able to effectively curb corruption because they are not stringent enough to severely punish corrupt actors and deter them especially those engaged in grand corruption where the public is losing an enormous amount of money. Special attention should be taken to ensure that they are robust, fairly applied, make culprits accountable, transparently applied, well publicized, and unbiased. Therefore, it is hereby recommended that the already existing measures should be strengthened further to make corruption a very costly and prohibitive practice. There is also need to walk the talk when it comes to fighting corruption from the government. There is need for serious awareness and sensitization campaign to the general public to stand up and castigate corruption and its perpetuators.

**References**


corruption.


will-be-swallowed.


president-park-geun-hye-c.


The Uganda Anti Corruption Act 2009.

The Uganda Anti Money Laundering Act 2013.


When the Guards are Vultures: The case of DIPF and CSOs in Uganda

Jane Ayeko- Küemmeth
Corresponding E-Mail: e-Mail: Jayeko-Kuemmeth@t-online.de

Abstract
In a bid to increase accountability and transparency in Local Governments in Uganda, the Directorate of Ethics and Integrity established District Integrity Promotion Forums (DIPF). Located on the grassroots, DIFPs are to act as watchdog to identify corruption tendencies at an early stage and act immediately. This paper explores the effectiveness of DIPFs. Its findings show that among the many shortfalls, members of the DIPFs themselves are corrupt and often compromised. This works against the very essence of their creation. It argues that creating several accountability mechanisms is not a viable strategy to curb corruption but rather inculcating moral integrity among citizens. Integrity often compels people to do things right.

Key words: Decentralisation, Corruption, DIPF, Local Government, Soilisation, Accountability

Introduction

Uganda has made great efforts at establishing systems to fight corruption and intensify accountability. Both formal and informal mechanisms exist as well horizontal and vertical accountability mechanisms. Formal mechanisms include government institutions such as Inspectorate of Government (IG), Office of the Auditor General (OAG), Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (PPDA), the Leadership Code, ‘The Zero tolerance to corruption’ policy and the Anti-Corruption Act and the recently established State House Anti-Corruption Monitoring Unit among others. These mainly operate at national level. These offices also have representation at Local Government level (LG). Over the past years, representatives from these were brought together to create what came to be called the District Integrity Promotion Forum (DIPF).

In addition to representatives from these anti-corruption institutions the DIPF also has members from district institutions e.g the council, District Service Commission, Chief Accounting Officer (CAO), magistrate courts, state attorney, and Civil Society Organisations (CSOs). Established by the Directorate of Ethics and Integrity (DEI) under the president’s office, the DIPF is a government initiative aimed at improving coordination of anti-corruption efforts, promote effective leadership, accountability, and good governance at district level. It is a mirror of the national forum on anti-corruption that brings together anti-corruption to discuss policy and district operations. The main objective is to detect mal-practices, abuse of office and/or corruption at an early stage. On the other hand, civil society organisations are equally steering citizen participation in social accountability. However, the implementation of corruption prevention and detection and of anti-corruption enforcement has been predominantly weak at both local and national levels Mbabazi Godfrey & Pyeong Jun Yu (2015).

At district level, DIPF were created to act as watch dog to detect corruption tendencies at an early stage. Unfortunately, as shall be seen in the empirical section, since their establishment, DIPFs have not achieved much in most districts. Many of them have failed to conduct regular sittings nor report on any corruption related cases. The main thrust of this paper is thus to explore why this initiative has failed. It starts by providing a brief insight into LG in Uganda (1.1), this is followed by mechanisms of accountability in Uganda, their achievements and failures, (2) followed by methodology (3) and a discussion of the research findings (4).

Local Government in Uganda

Local Government (LG) refers to formal agencies within the state (Johnston and Pattie, 1996: 672). It is the level of government that is closest to the people and a system of public administration whereby, locally elected
members represent their communities and make policy decisions on their behalf. Local governments often act within powers delegated to them by legislation or government. Since 1995, Uganda operates a decentralized system of LG. This study defines decentralization as the restructuring or reorganisation of authority so that there is a system of co-responsibility between institutions of governance at the central, regional and local levels according to the principle of subsidiarity, thus increasing the overall quality and effectiveness of the system of governance, while increasing the authority and capacities of sub-national levels’ (UNDP, 1999). The policy (decentralization) is rooted in article 178 of the 1995 constitution. This establishes a five tier structure with the district being the highest unit under, which there are LGs and administrative units as parliament may by law provide. The five tiers are known as Local Councils (LC) and range from one-five (LC I-V). The main operational centers are LCIII and LCV. Actors in these tiers are categorised in two groups—political and technocrats. The politicians are directly elected while technocrats acquire office by virtue of their professional qualification.

The most enthusiastic promise of this policy was devolution which the country has practiced since the enactment of the decentralisation Act. Devolution gave LG power, autonomy and authority to make governance decisions at local level, hence was well received and seen as a ‘promise’ that would redeem LG from the wrath of central government. It contained a number of broad prospects such as promoting good governance, democracy, increased political participation and above all, promote accountability and transparency. In other words, it would pave way for a functional, efficient and effective LG and all the institutions therein.

Devolution embedded the principle of subsidiarity which holds that decisions should be made at the most appropriate lowest level. In essence subsidiarity aims to redistribute authority and responsibility for the planning, financing and management of certain public functions from the government to LG. Shifting decision-making responsibility to LG means redistributing power among various groups/actors within. This implies that local leaders have significant discretionary power necessary to create infrastructure that makes decentralisation effective, but at the same time remain accountable to local communities (Ribot, 2004:1). Despite the several achievements that the policy ushered in, it is based on a complex set of institutional arrangements which must work in harmony for it to achieve its stated objectives (Nakanyike, 2007:3). Whereas devolution empowered the current LGs in different areas, it also led integration of more actors, making it a more multifaceted affair. In the context of this study, it stifled accountability mechanisms. This being the case, the DIPF as an accountability mechanism integrated within the LG does not offer an optimal alternative to increase accountability.

In terms of good governance, there has been an increase in advocacy for greater openness and transparency in bureaucratic procedures, processes, appointments, contracts, investment decisions as well as seeking to strengthen accountability; but despite all these, authoritarianism, arbitrariness, patronage and other manifestations of corruption have remained prevalent in Uganda. As Grindle notes, patronage for political leadership have subverted accountability (Grindle, 2007). This observation rhymes with (Mwenda and Tangri, 2005) who equally observe that continuing abuse of power in institutions of weak transparency and limited accountability has enabled those in positions of power and possess considerable authority and autonomy to make decisions to their personal as well as partisan advantage.

**Accountability:** Without providing a clear distinction between the different types of accountability, simply put, it is the relationship between two parties, an actor and a forum in which the actor has the obligation to explain and to justify his or her conduct, the forum can pose questions and pass judgement and the actor is/can be sanctioned. In the public domain accountability can be instituted as a mechanism for social relations in a public
service delivery system, providing roles and obligations to both rights holders and duty bearers. A party can be described as highly accountable in a relationship or lacking in accountability.

In the field of governance accountability refers to the relationship between public and private actors. It is not just about the isolate relationships, or even individual institutions operating on their own, but a system of relationships. Rob Jenkins describes accountability as a relationship of power—denotes a specific variety of power: the capacity to demand that someone justifies his or her behaviour and the capacity to impose a penalty for poor performance (in Anwar Shah, 2007:135). He adds that in democracies, accountability implies that governments account for their actions to voters and be punished at the ballot box if deemed to have failed in their public duty.

The two key elements of accountability are thus answerability and enforceability (Hudson, 2007). This implies that political organisations are principally responsible for their citizens on whose behalf they act and this applies to both elected leaders and the bureaucratic office bearers. In the context of LG in Uganda, these would imply politicians and technocrats some of whom are members of the DIPF. Specifically, political accountability refers to a situation where an individual or corporate body is subject to another’s oversight or direction in the course of discharging their duties. It is about checking political power—checks and balances to ensure that political leaders do not rule in an arbitrary way and/or abuse office on one hand and on the other hand, help government operate efficiently and effectively (Chawatama, 2009:2). Nevertheless, it is important to note that political accountability is shaped by the political culture in a given society. The ongoing academic discourse on accountability especially in developing countries is mainly stirred by the seemingly endless debate on corruption in the public sector. Following the Structural Adjustment Programme in which several countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America decentralised their local government systems on the premise of better governance, better service delivery and improved accountability, countries equally put in place several accountability mechanisms.

In Uganda for example, in addition to national accountability institutions (see first part of the introduction), new approaches like the DIPF meant to serve at district level were also introduced. This was guided by the impression that national accountability entities did more of a post mortem job. The rampant corruption cases at LG paved way for the creation of DIPF which is the gist of this paper. DIPF would do a better job in diagnosing corruption which has become institutionalised (Wilson B. Asea, 2018) at an early stage. Asea argues that corruption in Uganda is uniformly political & bureaucratic. According to him, bureaucratic corruption takes place in service delivery and rule enforcement. It can be induced by demand or supply. Political corruption on the other hand occurs at high levels of politics (‘political untouchables' and businessmen who are above the law and above institutional control mechanisms). According to Transparency International (TI) corruption index, Uganda is one of the most corrupt countries in the world taking on position number 149 from 180 of the most corrupt countries. DIPFs were to be the LG watchdogs and would actively steer financial audits within government departments, routing out collusion between actors at LG and in the end minimising corruption.

To address the endemic corruption, Uganda has put in place a number of accountability mechanisms while there are also informal ones created by either CSOs or ordinary citizens. Formal mechanisms include presidential directives such as DIPFS, State House Anti-Corruption Monitoring Unit and public institutions as listed in the introduction. At district level budget conferences and a reflection of the same agencies are some of the accountability mechanisms. Others include management committees for schools, health, water, road users and hospital boards. These are all established to ensure citizen participation and to enhance accountability.
Accountability Mechanisms in Uganda

In 1998, Uganda adopted the Sector Wide Approach to planning paving the way for the establishment of the Accountability Sector. The sector provides an enabling environment for the efficient performance of the primary sectors of the economy. It was created to spearhead promotion, supervision and implementation of accountability systems in a coordinated manner. The accountability sector’s vision is transparency and accountability in public service delivery, while its mission is to promote efficiency and effectiveness in mobilization and utilization of public resources. The core values of the accountability sector are integrity; transparency and accountability; value for money; professionalism; commitment and teamwork; gender equality and equity. The goal on the other hand is to achieve a transparent, responsive and accountable public sector that delivers value for money services in a timely and effective manner.

In line with this Uganda has both formal and informal accountability mechanisms. The sector brings together state and non-state actors for the purpose of planning, developing, and implementing policies and regulations for a stable macroeconomic environment, transparent and accountable systems to facilitate economic growth. Broadly stated, the sector aims to fight menace of corruption. In Uganda, corruption manifests itself as bribery, financial leakages, conflict of interest, embezzlement, false accounting, fraud, influence peddling, nepotism, theft of public funds or theft of public assets. The many anti-corruption institutions are meant to check these manifestations. Uganda mostly suffers five types of corruption including; bureaucratic i.e. bribery and nepotism, political corruption mostly executed through patronage, corruption in procurement, taxation and in the police. According the World Bank (WB IFC enterprise survey, 2006), 80% of companies in Uganda reported making losses due to bribery, while the country loses approximately 15.2 million dollars to corruption in procurement (APRM Report 2007).

Because corruption remains an impediment to development and a barrier to poverty reduction in Uganda (IGG Report, 2011), government of Uganda established several institutions purposely to combat the vice. In addition to those already mentioned above, (IG, OAG, PPDA) are also the Criminal Investigation Directorate (CID), the Anti-Corruption Court, Directorate of Ethics and Integrity (DEI), Parliament (Accountability Committees) Civil Society (anti-corruption coalition Uganda), Media and African Peer Review Mechanism, District Integrity Promotion Forum (DIPF) which operate at district level and the barazas. Each of these institutions have representation and/ or district arms that operate within LGs. The DIPF which is the subject of this study is a coordinating mechanism whose members come from each of the above institutions. In 2018, another anti-corruption organ under the office of the president was created— State House Anti-Corruption Monitoring Unit. In addition to these formal institutions also exist informal mechanisms. This study is however limited to the IGG, PPDA, OAG and above all, the DIPF because these are the institutions whose core role is to combat/ check corruption.

Formal Mechanisms
This section presents the key anti-corruption institutions in Uganda and concludes with a general discussion on their achievements/ challenges.

Office of the Auditor General (OAG)

The creation of the Office of the Auditor-General (OAG), also known as the Supreme Audit Institution of Uganda, is based on the National Audit Act of 2008 of Constitution of Uganda. The OAG was created to act on behalf of the citizens of Uganda, in providing an independent assurance on the use of public resources (Article
163 of the Constitution). It envisions to be an effective and efficient Supreme Audit Institution in Promoting Public Accountability. In the context of this study, OAG is responsible for promoting integrity, objectivity and professional competence. The Office of the Auditor General is a crucial component of the overall accountability and governance framework as it is responsible for carrying out audits, and investigations to assess the efficiency, effectiveness, and accountability of public sector agencies and their programs. Enhancing and strengthening accountability is the central objective of OAG's audit of public expenditure. No wonder an officer from the OAG at district level is a member of the DIPF.

**Inspectorate of Government (IG)**

Like the OAG, the establishment of the Inspectorate of Government is equally founded in the 195 constitution of Uganda and was initially established by the Inspector General of Government (IGG) statute in 1988. It is mandated to promote proper utilization of public resources and to promote good governance, accountability and the rule of law. The IG is an independent institution charged with the responsibility of eliminating corruption, abuse of authority and of public office. It is a legal body with powers ‘to; investigate or cause investigation, arrest or cause arrest, prosecute or cause prosecution, make orders and give directions during investigations; access and search – enter and inspect premises or property or search a person or bank account or safe deposit box among others.

**Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (PPDA)**

The Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Act 1 of 2003 set up the PPDA as the principal regulatory body for public procurement and disposal of public assets in Uganda. Its main mission is to promote the achievement of value for money in public procurement. PPDA is very relevant in LG since most corruption happens in contracting processes. Like the OAG and the IG, PPDA also strives to promote among others reliability, integrity, professionalism, transparency and accountability and commitment.

**DIPFs**

These were established by the DEI in partnership with the LGs. It is a coordinating mechanism that aims to bring the leadership of a district together to discuss issues of accountability and effective leadership. They act as a watchdog/ whistleblowers of corruption. They are composed of representatives of public agencies within the district (see sec 1). Whereas the above organs operated at national level, DIPF were specifically meant to address the corruption issue within the LG. Located the local level, they are meant to detect corruption tendencies before it occurs. In addition, being at local level meant involving local communities in the fight against corruption. Ordinary citizens would bring such cases to the attention of the DIPF which would then take up the issue immediately. A DIPF is headed by the Resident District Commissioner (RDC) who is in-charge of monitoring government projects at LG, while the CAO is the secretary. Districts with fully established and operational DIPFs have seen some level of consciousness among district leaders and technocrats to effectively utilize resources and provide as much information as possible to citizens. The PPDA, IGG and USAID survey (2007) however, identifies lack of effective reporting systems, poor record management by state organs, the weakness of the judiciary, the poor investigation of corruption cases, and the lack of effective systems to punish corrupt officials, as major factors contributing to the high prevalence of corruption in public procurement. This also impacts on the work and performance of the DIPF.
State House Anti-Corruption Monitoring Unit

Created in 2018 as a presidential directive. On creating the unit, the present (Yoweri Museveni) noted that; ‘the institutions to fight corruption are there, but the people manning them are the problem. These departments have been infiltrated by weevils’. The unit is headed by a military person, but like DIPFs, it does not have authority to arrest suspects, despite the significantly huge amount of resources it receives. Some see this as an indication of lack of trust in a non-military person by the president, adding that it could also be a strategy to cling to power. This is what Kagoro (2015) describes as militarisation of the state, where people are forced to believe that the military is the only powerful institution. Militarisation of the state forces ordinary citizens too, to want to associate or be like military officials.

Barazas

A Kiswahili word meaning a public meeting(s). Barazas were initially run by ordinary citizens who were interested in discussing issues affecting them within their societies. They were later taken on by the Office of the Prime Minister (OPM), which runs a monitoring unit under which the barazas are managed. The unit, however, does not have the capacity to conduct barazas throughout the country, moreover they operate under a very minimal budget. Barazas are a platform for creating awareness, responding to issues affecting a given community, sharing vital information, providing citizens with the opportunity to identify & propose solutions to concerns. At the same time, they are an avenue for information dissemination to the community as well as a quick means of getting feedback on the critical issues affecting that community (UNDP, 2011). Through the barazas, people can directly link with public officers including politicians. The existence of the above institutions and several others demonstrates that there has been tangible progress in establishing the required legal and institutional framework to counter corruption, but as discussed in the next section, these efforts have not yet yielded, much success.

Achievements and Challenges Hampering Ant-Corruption Institutions

The legal and institutional framework on fighting corruption has enabled anti-corruption institutions make some strides. Some of the success stories include increased citizen awareness. The three anti-corruption institutions conduct joint activities that enhance awareness on corruption related issues e.g what constitutes corruption, the public procurement process, where to report corruption related cases etc. The annual anti-corruption week is an example of a joint activity conducted by the three organs. It aims to reach out on citizens country wide, to educate them on the subject. During this week, the three organs conduct barazas from where they also receive complaints from citizens and hold radio talk shows at community level. The collaboration among the three organs as well as with other agencies Justice Law and Order sector has resulted in increased citizen awareness about the subject and possible causes of action.

Success can also be seen in the number of corrupt officers impeached, the money recovered and possible corruption scandals that were prevented. In 2015, the IG reported recovery of UGX 632.000.000 (apprx $171.000) and prevented a loss of another UGX 7 billion (apprx $1.900.000). The IG website is equally awash with news of a number of arrests and recovered monies since it intensified its fight against corruption164. Despite these achievements, the institutions’ work as well as that of other organs is hampered by several factors hereunder discussed.

164 https://www.igg.go.ug/
Political interference

Whereas the IG has been instrumental in enforcing the Leadership Code, little political will coupled with political patronage has hampered greater success. As the guardian of the Code, the IG has for instance often called on political leaders to declare their incomes, assets and liabilities, those of their spouses and children under 18 years; to put in place an effective enforcement mechanism and to provide for other related matters. To date very little has been achieved on this front. The Inspectorate finds it difficult to enforce the Leadership Code as most of those affected have ‘god fathers’ within the political circles making its work difficult. Often times the IGG has reported facing threats. In her complaints the IGG alleges that other institutions threaten her to stop carrying out prosecutions and that those accused often run to high ranking politicians who then issue letters directing her to stop the investigations. In addition, the accused are often not willing to provide the required information. Such behaviour goes against the 2005 Access to Information Act, which provides for the public demand for information from government to enhance transparency. Without adequate and accurate information, the IG stands to have no basis to impeach a public officer or politician accused of corruption, abuse of office or any other practice perceived as wrongdoing.

In addition to political interference at both national and sub-national levels, the fight against corruption has been hampered by delay in the judicial process due to case backlogs, lack of proper training for investigative agencies like the Police, understaffing in the enforcement agencies and above all using the corrupt to fight corruption. These factors affect nearly all anti-corruption institutions in the country. For example, the National Audit Act, 2008: Section 14 spells out the independence of Auditor General. Section 13(2) states that, the Auditor General, in performing his or her functions under this Act, shall not be under the direction or control of any person or authority. This however has not always been the case as some auditors have complained of receiving threats as well as being bribed. In 2018, the president himself acknowledge the existence of corruption within anti-corruption institutions—‘the institutions to fight corruption are there, but the people manning them are the problem. These departments have been infiltrated by weevils’ (Yoweri Museveni, 2018). The president then used this as reason to create an anti-corruption monitoring unit within state house.

Lack of accurate information

For any person to be impeached there is need for accurate evidence. The challenge however is that not many people are willing to testify against corrupt officers who most times are ‘big men’ due to lack of adequate witness protection. In 2018, the three anti-corruption institutions (IG, OAG, PPDA) run an anti-corruption campaign with a week of activities nationwide. Among the activities was a road trip with random audit checks in public institutions such as schools and barazas. In nearly all the barazas, citizens complained of being tracked after they reported an officer—‘sometimes, you go to the office of the IG to report someone and before you even reach home, you get a call from the accused person telling you he knows what you just did and assuring you that you won’t get away with it’. Despite the existence of the Whistleblowers Protection Act, 2010, protection of witnesses is still deserving. Such instances have made most people to withdraw from exposing corrupt officers.

Lack of technical expertise

During my interaction with OAG, PPDA and the IG, it came out that the institutions were in dire need of technical expertise i.e technical officers with the capacity to investigate corruption e.g. cyber corruption, budget tracking etc. A few staff available are overwhelmed with the amount of work given the level of corruption in the

country and the areas of coverage. The OAG for example is responsible for auditing all government institutions in the country i.e at national and sub national level. In addition to few personnel, the institutions are yet to build systems that can ease work e.g reporting and tracking and follow up of cases. Given the country’s political history, it is inevitable to say that the institutions are faced with a back load of work due to a period of relapse when institutions of governance were dysfunctional.

**Inadequate funding**

This is yet another hindrance to the performance of the anti-corruption institutions. Given the size of country’s national budget and government priorities, the fight against corruption is not sufficiently funded. Anti-corruption institutions mostly depend on donor funding. The challenge with this is the conditions that come with donor funds. This implies that the institutions do not have much flexibility to do what they want as the funds are tied to specific activities. In the next section, I shall provide a brief discussion on the informal anti-corruption mechanisms before discussing the methodology.

**Informal mechanisms**

These are often an initiative of the civil society or local persons. They include; community monitoring groups also known as neighbourhood assemblies. These are platforms started and managed by local citizens with the aim of monitoring public officers, public contracts and/or execution of public contracts within their vicinity. Compared to formal mechanisms, they are re a little more viable and sometimes sustainable because they at village level and members are committed to a common cause. The only requirement is to follow the channels. These are not popular with technocrats and politicians. Neighbourhood assemblies have been successful because they mostly monitor community projects and if something goes wrong, the entire community agrees to hold the responsible person to account. Furthermore, they are not scared of confronting the person in question since they have nothing to lose as would be the case with LG employees who fear for their jobs. The increased awareness resulting from the concerted efforts from the anti-corruption organs have empowered local communities and made them aware of possible causes of action. Youth parliaments are created by young people within a given LG. They concentrate on deliberating on social, economic and political developments in their district or region. They may or may not involve politicians.

**Integrity clubs**

Are mostly run at university level and schools. Their aim is to incorporate a spirit of integrity among students and pupils at an early level. The main activity conducted by the integrity clubs is mostly school debates in which students and/or pupils discuss matters related to corruption and its implications on society. Success of these clubs is to be measured.

**Methodology**

This is a case study and qualitative in nature. Multi-sited and multi-level approaches were used to gather data in three municipal councils namely Kira in Wakiso district, Makindye and Kawempe in Kampala. In all these places, ten face to face interviews were conducted among political actors and technocrats with LGs and ministry level. A few interviews were also conducted with informed participants—those with experience working with LGs and some civil servants outside LG. The selection was informed by convenience as all are located within the researcher’s reach. Moreover, the three provide a balanced representation of both urban and rural municipalities. In addition to the data from in-depth interviews, a period of work related interface with LG actors and participation in seminars and workshops involving LGs provided insights LG operations, processes and
challenges. Secondary data is taken from media publications, academic works and other publications directly discussing accountability in LG in Uganda. It aims to examine the factors that have hindered DIPFs from performing their job and yielding the results expected of them. Finding are presented and discussed concurrently. It is important to note that not all the data collected during the research is presented here.

Research Findings
The study set out to explore why DIPF—a joint monitoring mechanism on accountability at LG has failed to achieve its purpose and has virtually become desolate. The findings reveal that despite the good intentions behind the creation of DIPFs, structural, institutional and moral factors plague the existence and functionality of DIPF. They include the following

- Abstract in nature and legal status (not a legal body)
- Un-defined sources of funding/ ‘lack of funding’
- Soilisation/ Musevenism and
- Corruption among the members themselves (Guards who are vultures)

Not a Legal Body
This study observes that the failure of DIPF to deliver is partly due to the design of the system—designed to benefit certain actors within the government apparatus because those supposed to enforce the law are the beneficiaries of these malpractices, hence policies remain on paper without proper implementation mechanisms. The District Integrity Promotion Forum was established to foster accountability within LG. Grounded at the district it would be the watchdog at all LG levels namely district and sub-county and since it is a replica of national bodies, one would expect it to have the authority to arrest/ hold suspects and/ or hand them over to law enforcement offices. This however is not the case. The Forum is founded on the principle of integrity and is guided by principles of mutual respect, honesty and commitment. Institutionally, DIPF does not have the legal basis to arrest wrong doers, corrupt officers and office bearers who abuse their office.

If accountability is connected to democratic praxis, this already limits what Uganda’s DIPFs can achieve hence have failed in this line. In the context of governance, institutions of accountability have discretion to check power of political leaders to prevent them from exercising arbitrary leadership. This is a task they can perform only when they have legal status (corporate body). Because DIFP depend on moral integrity makes it difficult for them to execute their duties. Since it is not a legal body, members do not feel obliged to conduct the duties expected of it. In the event that the forum does not perform any activity, citizens have no basis to demand accountability—thus failing in responsibility and answerability which are a prerequisite for accountability to be (O’Neill, Foresti & Hudson, 2007). Again even if DIPF was a legal entity, it is on record that even at national level, Uganda is weak in implementing its laws and as already discussed, Uganda has been less successful in implementing its laws and regulations and this has given the country the distinction of having the largest implementation gap in the world. In settings in which institutions are weak, the links between government performance and mechanisms of local accountability are not strong.

Whereas this is the case, one respondent argued that irrespective of the status of the Forum, ‘today when people settle in office all they want is money. It is not about what brought them in or to serve people. Their focus is on

——

166 Most of the work was taken from the researcher’s previous work on decision making in LG
how to make money fast’ (Int 011. 2019). At the conception of decentralisation, such attitudes were not anticipated. The conviction was that people would be able to hold their local leaders accountable and punish wrong doers. However, due to lack of adequate information sharing between the citizens and their leaders citizens do not know how DIPF should function, who is who and its duty. Coupled with inadequate mobilisation citizens are not able to hold their leaders accountable. This is further compounded by fear. People reported that they rarely interacted with their leaders save for communal gatherings such as burials. ‘District leaders fear to face the people because they will be tasked to explain certain projects’ (Int 005.2019).

In addition, DIPF do not have a clear strategy to guide the effective implementation & sustainability of the forums; that is in the event of change and/ or transfer of office bearers. As noted by several respondents, one of the challenges that hampered DIPFs was the frequent transfer of members such as the RDC (chair to the forum), CAO (secretary) etc. ‘At the beginning, DIPFs seemed to be efficient and they did a good job in highlighting corruption tendencies said one respondent (Int 001.2019). He added that ‘the problem accrued with the short term of officers like the RDC who is the central government monitoring officer without a constituency and with the CAO being the secretary—‘these two were transferred regularly such that the Forum could not keep up. Anything they had started eventually died’. The DPCs too were being moved so frequently. This affected the continuity of the programme and weakened the ideas that were being developed. In instances were officers stayed longer, sustainability still depends on personalities and their commitment to account and improve service delivery. The problem is further compounded by the fact that enforcement of legal social accountability is generally an uphill task. It is easy to tell LGs what to do, but often times, implementation is far from theoretical provisions. Operating under such circumstances, accountability as meant to help government operate effectively and efficiently (Chawatawa, 2009) cannot be attained or promoted by DIPF.

In countries with highly developed democracies, accountability implies that governments account for their actions to voters and be punished at the ballot box if deemed to have failed in their public duty. This is difficult to implement in countries like Uganda which are known for using money to buy votes and/ or engage in electoral mal-practices. As such politics has become commercialized. The DIFP being a non-legal body, its failure cannot not be used to measure the performance of district officials such that they can be punished at the ballot paper. This is further compounded with soilisation168 coupled with the perception that those who use their office to enrich themselves are brave and successful. ‘Some of these accountability mechanisms/ groups are simply created to please the powers that be. They are often active at the time of establishment and slowly die off’ (Int 006. 2019). This observation was shared by another respondent (Int 011. 2019) who said ‘government is interested in showing that it is keen in fighting corruption, but anti-corruption institutions are only to create jobs for people within government circles. These observations demonstrate the socio-political and economic context in which LGs operate in Uganda, making DIPF one of the many default government (anti-corruption) agencies.

Indeed, Manyak and Katono (2010) using data from LG attribute corruption to the social political context of decentralisation in Uganda. They affirm that continued social conflicts fuelled by poverty, illiteracy, ethnic differences, dishonest and ineffective government undermine value for money. This has created a general feeling of the existence of moral decadence where the new generation of public servants promote selfish interests (in Ntayi et al 2013: 5-6). This observation suggests that the problem goes beyond the status of the Forum—legal or not. The main problem lies in moral decay. Hannah et al (2005) describe this as the shaping of behaviour through life’s experiences. According to Hannah et al morality is a function of one’s memories as encoded and stored in one’s moral experiences and reflections. Individuals develop a system of learned attitudes about social

168For a detailed discussion on soilisation, see Ayeko-Kümmeth 2014 and 2015
practices and individual behaviour used to evaluate behaviour as good or bad, right or wrong. As noted above, personal construct responsible for corruption is embedded within the social degraded system with multiple agents and social relations. Since people’s behaviour is shaped by rewards or punishment this study observes that the absence of this renders members of the DIPF non enthusiastic to ensure efficient performance.

**Un-defined Source of Funding (Lack of Funding)**

Continued politicised economic resource allocation and state sector corruption have an impact on the operation and performance LG. By politicised resource allocation, I mean allocation of resources depending on what political interests are served. In as far as DIPF is concerned and considering that some of its members are part of LG while others represent national entities, such corrupt practices trickle down to LG thus diminishing even the little interest in the work of the Forum. This is manifested in the refusal to allocate funds for the Forum’s activities or the claim of lack of funding.

Due to lack of clarity, district officials (RDC and the LCV) have failed to agree on which docket funds the DIPF hence often times, lack of funding is advanced as the key reason as to why DIPF are not functioning. Interviews with district officials suggest that LGs do not allocate funds to ensure that the Forums are integrated in the routine district business processes. According to the Anti-Corruption Coalition of Uganda (ACCU, 2014), many district leaders do not allocate adequate budget allocations to ensure that the forum gets integrated in the routine district business processes. Whereas this may be the case, a counter argument by DEI which is the mother ministry suggests that the Forum’s activities are grounded on the everyday activities of LG hence no need for extra funding. According to DIE, ‘it is easy to blame everything on lack of funds, but the reality is that they don’t want their evil activities to be uncovered; the finance claim is therefore diversionary’ (Int 001.2019). This is compounded within the endemic act of political peddling where technical persons and the politicians, some of whom are members of the Forum fight over district projects. In the process, much money is spent on bribes to win contracts. DIFP meetings would be the place to expose such practices. To avoid this, members simply don’t conduct any meetings. As such, no work is done. Resources aside, the findings of this study demonstrate that the success of mechanisms to combat corruption such as DIPF depended on actors’ prudence to execute strategies. It entails developmental, transactional and transformational attitudes.

**Soilisation/ Musevenism**

DIPFs operate in a highly ‘soilised’ environment and one in which actors use the name of the president for personal gains—musevenism. Ayeko (2014) urges that musevenism is used by individuals and groups of people, and practiced by both actors within and outside government apparatus to justify their decisions. It is the practice of referring to the president (Museveni) in an attempt to influence policy decisions or in the advancement of directives on policy decisions and/ or policy implementation. Musevenism is thus a metaphoric expression that connotes power hence its practice grants the user some sort of power which he/ she can exert on often unsuspecting people. A soilised environment on the other hand has reduced human identity to smaller environs in which people know and trust each other. This then determines how resources are allocated for instance recruitments and tendering processes are conducted on the basis of soilisation, in other words everything must remain within the ‘soil’. Soilisation therefore promotes the spirit on oneness making it difficult to point fingers on any one person.

As one interviewee noted, ‘it is mostly based on who is whose child, the same applies to procurement and many other processes at district level’ (Int 001.2019). If a son/ daughter of the soil is involved in corrupt practices,
he/she will not be condemned because after all the monies remained with the soil. The practice is mostly advanced by political patronage enhanced by powerful actors in government apparatus who want to place especially children from their localities in particular places.’ When such people are implicated in wrong doing, it is difficult for DIPFs to take action. Moreover, some of them may have acquired their position as a result of soilisation. Because of this, technocrats find it difficult to do their job and worse still DIPFs. Because of soilisation and/or musevenism, public officers are reluctant to release information on contracts, recruitments etc. Without adequate information, citizens and/or CSOs that are often highlighting corruption cases are not able to do so. Therefore, like one councillor argued, ‘whether there is money or not. DIPF are not the solution to ending corruption in this country. The moral decay is way too much.’

Decentralisation of LG led to the creation of more centres of power and the emergence of soilisation (Ayeko-Kümmerth, 2015). The exercise of power by those holding public offices has in the long run led to the use of public enterprises as centres of reward for political patronage and/or as sources of profit in one way or another. In the context of LG in Uganda, those who command power mostly include the LCV, RDC, LCIII and other heads of department at district level. These are the very people who constitute membership of the DIPF. As such it is very unlikely that they will act should some of them be involved in corrupt practices. This study observes that it is hard to implement corruption-related laws in an environment characterised by political patronage and economic uncertainty. In fact, they will find all reason to avoid Forum sittings. The observation is that power centres and patronage for political office have subverted accountability.

**Corruption among Members of the DIPFs- when the Guards are Vulture**

At a glance Uganda’s decentralisation policy seems to be working within the bounds of formal rules. More importantly because devolution strengthened the rational-legal functioning of LG and this seems, at times to be successful, partially at least. In the context of the fight against corruption, it is necessary to take a close look at the key actors. Corruption is as old as the world (Dirk, 2005 in Ntayi et al 2013). It is an old practice that has and continues to straddle nations world over. The 2018 Transparency International Corruption Perception Index puts Uganda at position 149 of the least corrupt nation out of 175 countries. Corruption Rank in Uganda averaged 115.45 from 1996 until 2018, reaching an all time high of 151 in 2016 and a record low of 43 in 1996. This shows a consistent increase in corruption despite several attempts and/or mechanisms to fight the phenomenon.

Indeed, this position is well captured in the following statement; ‘Corrupt officials within the forum kill the spirit of fighting corruption and the very essence of establishing DIPFs & undermines the integrity of the Forum (Int 001:2019). Civil society organisations that engage in anti-corruption work equally observe that ‘high ranking officers, those very ones appointed to deal with corruption are the worst at it, they are not concerned with service delivery but getting rich’ (Int 005.2019). This feeling was expressed by several respondents most of whom insinuated that whereas the Forum started off as a good initiative most of its members had become compromised. Again, this could clearly signify lack of integrity which is the cradle of the Forum, without which it cannot function. Lack of integrity easily fosters systematic corruption. According Ntayi et al (2013:4) systematic corruption occurs within an institutionalised environment and is characterised by extensive corrupt activities such as bribery and embezzlement ranging from petty to grand corruption. In such environs, corruption becomes the rule rather than the exception.

During the several barazas conducted by civil society and sometimes accountability institutions (OAG, IG, PPDA), locals criticise the very officers who are supposed to fight corruption. In one particular incident in Njeru town in eastern Uganda, during a baraza lead by IG, one person reported that, ‘much as we want to report these
corrupt officers, we fear for our lives, there are times when you have reported the person and before you reach home the person is calling you, informing you that he knows what you have just done and warns you’. The local whose observation was seconded by several others went on to claim that these people were ‘loaded and dangerous’ and were capable of doing anything. Such sentiments could be observed country wide. In such instances, the locals as well as other officers are silenced or are forced to become part of the band wagon. Claudia B Camargo and Lucy Kocchlin (2018) describe this as co-optation and see it as a pattern of governance. It implies construction of networks and constant recruitment of people into these networks. Co-optation is transactional and involves establishing a relationship and strong bonds of trust, reciprocity and loyalty which enable and sustain a system of mutually beneficial exchange. Members of the network are responsible for keeping others abreast with what concerns them hence when one member is implicated, they will not miss the information. This gives the accused a chance to confront the whistle blower who most often is in a weaker position. In a country where formal institutions are not reliable people find it difficult to imagine that they will find justice in case of any attack. Besides the state cannot provide security for such people. At the same time protection of sources is far from reality in Uganda. This kind of environment does not favour institutions like the DIPF.

‘Way of life’—A local councillor remarked that corruption in Uganda was a way of life. ‘Corruption has been normalised in Uganda. If MPs are bribed to make changes in the constitution and national policies, ministers are bribed to okay projects what do you expect with local councillors—they too have to survive and they think it is a way of life (Int 002.2019). Another stated that ‘a lot of corruption is in appointments where people either buy their jobs or big people bring their own—it is mostly based on who is whose child. The same applies to procurement etc’. According to my respondents, the vice was evident the entire public sector. ‘Look at traffic officers on the road, have you observed what happens during back to school season, there are many of them on the road and they are very tough and insist on taking bribes. It is because the bosses have demanded that they bring back a certain amount of money….’(Int 002.2019). The District Police Commander (DPC) is a member of the DIPF. If he is the one demanding that his traffic officers extract money from traffic offenders, he is being corrupt and would have very little interest if any in fighting the vice. It is therefore reasonable to say that members of the DIPF pretend to be honest and work within stipulated laws but in reality they do not.

In 2005, Ugandan members of parliament were reported to have accepted a bribe of 5 million shillings (approx. $1500) to amend the constitution in favour of removing term limits. There have also been several allegations of MPs being involved in corrupt practices. It is also common to hear Ugandans lament that ‘fish begins to rot from the head’, implying that corruption starts from the top leadership and is scaled down to LGs. This explains why national anti-corruption institutions have failed to achieve much. The ‘normalisation’ of such practices has an impact on the young generation of leaders in that it leads to the formation of cognitive structures and behavioural patterns that shape their behaviour even at the workplace. When these people come to office, they find it ok to engage in corrupt practices. Given this kind of political environment, creating DIPF as a mechanism to identify corruption in LG at an early stage and eventually weave it out is a dream far from reality.

In another incident, a district education officer went on asking public schools to contribute for the LCV’s trip to Ireland without his knowledge. He threatened the head teachers that whoever did not contribute would be blacklisted (Int 002.2019). This case was unveiled when the head teachers who failed to contribute approached the LCV with an apology for having not met his request of which he knew nothing about. Such practices are common and some of the persons involved are also members of the DIPF. In this case, they will work hard to avoid any DIPF meetings as this would reveal their wrongdoing.
In its study of LGs in Uganda, Action Aid observed that,

‘In eastern region we have had a case in which the entire committee were arrested over bribery. Several other members of the committee have been accused of promoting corruption and worst of it when doing the committee work. This is very sad because we expect members of this committee to be of high integrity’ (Action Aid, 2018).

This is not far from what happens to anti-corruption institutions that operate at national level. One of the interviewees, who himself is an auditor claimed that he would have trouble finding one auditor who was not corrupt—‘show me one auditor here or anywhere else, be it in OAG or LG, all these people are bribed day and night that is why you see all of them driving expensive cars and are very rich’ (Int 004.2019). In addition to the issue of co-optation discussed above, the current socioeconomic set up in the country could explain why public servants become complaisant. Salaries for public servants remain very low while at the same time social demands are high. Society expects to see public officers excel and glorifies those that become wealth within a short time in office without questioning their source of wealth. The example of the police officer above confirms this assumption.

As already noted, most corruption in LG occurs in procurement. The establishment of the district contracts committee was to ensure that the process of public procurement in LG is conducted within formal provisions. However, as this study found out, the use of power dominates this sector too. Ayeko (2015:78) describes this as application of micro-hegemony in public procurements. Citing a case in Pallisa district where the district chairperson used a disguised company to award himself a contract to collect revenue from a landing site, Ayeko observes that senior actors within the LG often use their positions for personal gain. Efforts by the CAO to terminate the contract were futile due to heavy political interference. In such instances, the district chairperson is very likely to prevail DIPF by simply rendering it dysfunctional. Therefor institutional and structural construction of LG does not favour corruption fighting strategies like the DIPF. This is well captured in the following statement

‘The laws are clearly defined but you see given the trend of events in the country now were by the big shots mostly the political wing of government has shown no interest in fighting this corruption, there is a tendency by even the administrators to succumb to their pressure’ (ibid).

Most LG experience similar cases were the relationship between the political and technical wing of LG are not at per. Gordon Tregold (2017) founder and CEO, of Leadership Principles argues that ‘leadership defines culture, and if you want to create a culture of accountability, then it starts with you. He adds that as a leader you need to model the behaviours that you want to see in your organization. If you want people to take ownership, then you have to be seen to take ownership, when you make commitments you have to be seen to meet those commitments. If you don't, then why should anyone else be interested in doing so. You have to walk the talk if you want others to follow you in the accountability path. However, the above case tells a different story. This is the case of LG and one of the many reasons as to why DIPFs cannot make any difference in promoting accountability. The above highlights do not exhibit accountability practices as argued by Tregold.

**Conclusion**

The legal status of the DIPF, lack of a proper source of funding, the soilised environment and officers who are vultures are the four main reasons failing the effective and efficient performance of the DIPFs in LG in Uganda. Based on the above findings, this paper observes that, if the DIPFs were effective the initiative would have been
useful in advancing some of the objectives of decentralisation. This however is not the case thus questioning their continued existence and the establishment of more accountability mechanisms. Considering the current socio-political and economic environment in which Uganda’s local government operates, accountability mechanisms designed to curb corruption have very little chances if any to achieve their objective. The enormously high loss of morals, lack of commitment ethics and integrity all compound the four major factors. It is therefore paramount that a spirit of integrity is inculcated among people at an early stage. Achieving a culture of integrity requires collaborated efforts among public officials, CSOs and development partners and above all coherent efforts to update standards, provide guidance, and monitor with enforcement. Integrity is the cornerstone of good governance, therefore fostering integrity to prevent corruption in the public sector is essential in maintaining trust in government and government institutions.

On the account of the above, in as far as combating corruption is concerned, Uganda has all the requisite laws and institutions in place. The challenge however lies in their enforcement. This study therefore concludes that whereas fighting corruption is a concerted effort of all arms of government it the corresponding anti-corruption institutions, all actors therein need to have a common objective and zeal. Above all there is need for functional institutions and structural adjustments to minimise conflict among the different actors therein. In the words of Gordon Tregold, accountability does not happen just by chance, it has to be implemented.

**Recommendations**

*Legalise the forum:* The first step to strengthen the forum should be changing its legal status to a legal body to ensure its institutional functionality. By so doing its members will feel more obliged to perform their duties. At the same time locals will have a starting point to hold public officers to account. When this is done, DIPF should be legalised and tasked to collaborate with informal platforms like neighbourhood assemblies for information exchange.

*System overhaul:* This was a point suggested by several participants during the course of my data collection. The observation being that developing new policies/ strategies with the same people on guard will not yield the much needed success in improving accountability. There is need for a whole new system with new actors. These new actors need to be constantly reminded of commitment as a core to their job. Therefore, actors need to commit themselves to work with the resources they have.

*DIPF could partner with informal platforms:* Informal mechanisms have been successful because of members’ commitment. Collaboration would provide learning opportunities. Besides this, the role of CSOs within the DIPF should be advanced to more of leadership.

*Formalisation of informal platforms:* Since these platforms are appreciated by the government formalising them would add more value. As already noted, some officers do not like them, there is also little political will to formalise them. Nevertheless, continued citizen empowerment and engaging duty bearers is necessary. This is how countries like Venezuela, Cuba, Indonesia and India were able to promote social accountability.

**References**


DIPF promoting corruption in LGs. https://www.ntungamo.go.ug/%C2%A0-%C2%A0-integrity-committees-promoting-corruption-lgsofficial


Uganda Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (PPDA) [https://www.ppda.go.ug/about us/role-of-ppda/] accessed 19.06.2019

Uganda Corruption Rank: [https://tradingeconomics.com/uganda/corruption-rank] accessed 19.06.2019


New Vision (21.01.2015), IGG recovers sh632m from corrupt officials [https://www.newvision.co.ug/new_vision/news/1319971/igg-recovers-sh632m-corrupt-officials]

Inspectorate of Government: News: [https://www.igg.go.ug/] accessed 29.08.2019
Competition in Public Procurement: Barriers Hindering Participation in Bidding for Government Contracts in Uganda

Faith Mbabazi
Senior Research Officer, at the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority, Uganda.

Abstract

The paper attempts to build knowledge from the experiences of service providers in participating in bidding for government contracts within the current public procurement system in Uganda. The procurement law in Uganda provides that all procurement and disposal shall be conducted in a manner that maximizes competition and achieves value for money. In addition the Public Procurement Oversight body’s (PPDA) strategic plan objective targeted to increase the average number of bids received per procurement from three bids to five bids by the end of financial year 2018/19. However, a review of procurement audit reports issued by the oversight body for the financial year 2016/17 revealed that 63% of the entities reported unsatisfactory performance in terms of compliance to at least 3 bids per procurement. This paper presents the findings from a survey of the private sector on the barriers hindering participation in bidding for government contracts and recommend mechanisms that can enhance competition in public procurement. The findings suggest a number of challenges facing the bidding community and the need to address these barriers if the country wants to achieve competition in public procurement.

Key words: Competition, Public Procurement, Government Contracts, Bidding, PPDA

Introduction

In every country, the government plays a major role in the marketplace through the procurement of goods, services and works. According to a report by World Bank in 2017 on benchmarking public procurement, Governments in developing countries are significant purchasers of good and services, and these markets represent large opportunities to enhance competition and development. Low-income countries have the highest share of public procurement in their economies, at 14.5 percent of GDP, followed by upper-middle income countries, at 13.6 percent (World Bank, 2017). In Uganda, public procurement is estimated at 60% of the total on-budget resources (excluding wages but including on-budget donor financing). Because of the magnitude of the spending involved, public procurement is a source of business opportunities for the private sector and therefore can be used as a policy tool to make markets more competitive and thus improve the quality of government services (World Bank, 2016). Public procurement can therefore impact the structure and functioning of the market beyond the mere quantities of goods and services purchased. In the short-term, public procurement can impact competition among potential suppliers; in the long-term, public procurement can affect investment, innovation and the competitiveness of the market. (OECD, 2013).

Since Government is a major buyer of goods and services, its own actions greatly influence how the market operates and therefore impact on competition and on the long-term value for money it can secure. Genuine competition leads to low prices and better products which results in resources either being saved or freed up for use on other goods and services. Competition is also instrumental in preventing bid collusion, corruption and also increases the confidence of bidders while promoting local business development. To ensure there is competition in the public procurement system in the country, the Procurement law in Uganda stipulates that all procurement and disposal shall be conducted in a manner that maximizes competition and achieves value for money. In addition to the open bidding methods, the PPDA (rules and methods for procurement of supplies, works and non-consultancy services) regulations provides that a Procuring and Disposing Entity shall obtain at
least three bidders for the restricted bidding, request for quotations and micro procurement methods, (PPDA Act, 2003).

**Problem Statement**

In addition to the regulations that are in place to guide procuring Entities achieve competition in public procurement, the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (the regulatory body for public procurement) included in its strategic plan, an objective to increase competition and hence contribute to domestic industry development. The target outcome for this objective is to increase the average number of bids received from three to five by the end of financial year 2018/19. However a report on the performance of the public procurement system for the financial year 2017/18 revealed that an average of only two bids was received per procurement. Furthermore the procurement audit reports further indicated that 63% of the entities audited were rated unsatisfactory in the financial year 2016/17 in terms of compliance to at least three bids per procurement. This was an increase from 52% of the entities for audits conducted in 2015/16. This low level of competition in government procurement means that Government does not benefit from lower costs of purchase and other benefits of competition that would result if several bidders were involved. Therefore, in this paper, a survey was conducted to establish the barriers hindering participation in bidding for government contracts and recommend mechanisms that can enhance competition in public procurement.

**Literature Review**

Competition is one of the procurement canons central is attracting high quality national and international suppliers/contractors. Komakech (2016) defined it as a situation where public bidders compete with one another for procurement contract under the same terms and conditions for the provision of goods, works or services. Competitive tendering provide opportunities to all interested providers; sufficient time offered to the bidders or contractors or suppliers and all bidders or service providers are evaluated under the same criteria stipulated in the bidding documents. According to Ware et al., 2007, competitive tendering procedures limit discretion on the part of procurement officials facilitate maximizing “value for money” and minimize corruption in procurement. Transparency in public procurement means that procurement information is widely accessible, and there are complaints mechanisms and auditing procedures that establish accountability for procurement decisions. These are believed to encourage participation of more firms and deter “kickbacks” and other forms of fraud and corruption (Ware et al., 2007). This suggests that any feature of public procurement processes that limits participation has a negative impact on competition in the short-term.

Open procurement markets foster competitiveness by reducing purchasing costs, encouraging innovation and entrepreneurship. This leads higher productivity, more incentives to innovate, faster economic growth (OECD, 2003). Competition enables the participating firms to learn from one another and thereby to continuously improve their products in addition to their marketing and production techniques. Despite the fact that competition is a core principle of public procurement, its promotion has not received high-level attention as an aspect of international governance (Schooner, 2002). Public procurement is often said to restrict participation unnecessarily and to increase participation costs, in particular for smaller bidders, thus discriminating in favor of larger firms who regularly take part in public tenders (OFT, 2004; Komakech, 2016). Factors that unnecessarily increase participation costs and discriminate against smaller firms include: restricted communication and publication of contract opportunities, excessive information requirements, and overly narrow pre-qualification criteria, placing too much emphasis on past experience or firm size.
According Tomáš Hanák and Petra Muchová, 2015 in their study on the “impact of competition on prices in public sector procurement”, the number of bids in a tender plays a significant role in the overall efficiency of a project as the prices achieved in the tender will decrease with the increase of the number of bids submitted. However the authors further noted that the number of bidders depends on a variety of aspects, for example the type of the subject matter (type of structure) or the volume of the project.

**Methodology**

To obtain the opinions of respondents on the causes of low bidder participation, a survey was conducted. The survey targeted the service providers for all the categories of procurement including supplies, services and works. The respondents were required to complete a semi-structured questionnaire that was administered physically and in some cases by email. A total of 1,200 participants were invited to participate and 737 (61%) responded to the survey. Out of the 737 respondents, 61% dealt in supplies, 44% of the respondents dealt in works, 28% dealt in consultancy services and 17% dealt in non-consultancy services. According to the category of age of business, 5% of the respondents have been in existence for less than 1 year, 44% for between 1 and 5 years, 28% for between 6 and 10 years, 23% have been in existence for over 10 years. To increase validity of the study findings, face to face interviews were conducted with 12 key informants from competent institutions including head procurement and disposal units, Private Sector Foundation Uganda, Uganda Manufacturers Association and PPDA. The insights from these informants were significant in exploring practical recommendations for improving competition in public procurement. For the survey data, we use descriptives within Microsoft Excel for data analysis while for the face-to-face interview data, we adopt the content analysis method. We used concurrent analyses and complemented this information with the other secondary data including the PPDA annual audit reports for the financial years 2016/17 and 2017/18.

**Findings and Discussion**

**Prequalification of Potential Bidders**

The Procurement Law provides for the prequalification method of procurement that is used specifically to obtain a shortlist of bidders, with the particular intention of ensuring that the bids are confined to potential bidders. The method is beneficial where the works, services or supplies to be acquired are highly complex, specialized or requires detailed design or methodology, the costs of preparing a detailed bid would discourage competition; or the evaluation is particularly detailed and the evaluation of a large number of bids would require excessive time and resources from a PDE (PPDA Act, 2003). The study sought to establish whether the respondents had been prequalified with at least one Government entity. 72% of the respondents had been prequalified with at least one government entity while 28% were not prequalified with any Government entity.

**Familiarity with Public Procurement Procedures**

The study sought to establish whether the service providers were familiar with the public procurement procedures to assess whether they were knowledgeable in participating in public procurement. 94% of the respondents were familiar with preparation of bids, 86% of the respondents were familiar with the bid submission methods. 68% were familiar with the procurement methods and only 40% were familiar with the administrative review process (complaints handling mechanism).
Barriers Affecting Participation in Public Procurement

The study sought to establish the barriers hindering the business community from participating in public procurement. 67% of the respondents reported more than one barrier hindering their participation in bidding for government contracts.

Overall, 54% cited delays in payments, 53% cited corruption, 46% reported high cost of bidding, 41% reported ambiguous/unclear specifications, 36% reported inadequate knowledge of the available opportunities, 35% reported lack of finances and 14% reported lack of technical capacity to meet procurement demands.

Figure 7: Barriers Hindering the Private Sector from Bidding for Government Contracts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Delays in Payments</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High cost of bidding</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear Specifications</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate knowledge on the available opportunities</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of finances</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of technical capacity to meet the procurement demands</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Delays in Payments

The findings revealed delayed payments as a major barrier to participation in bidding for Government contracts as illustrated in the figure above. To compliment these findings, the annual procurement audit reports for the last 2 financial years (FY 2015/16 and FY 2016/17) revealed that an average of only 40% of the entities audited had a satisfactory performance under the payment ratio indicator. The procurement law provides that the period for payment shall be thirty days from certification of invoices however respondents reported that in most cases the payments by Government are beyond the required time and could even go up to beyond six months. Delays in payments lead to increase on the cost of capital where the service providers have used borrowed money to execute the contracts. With the high interest rates in the country, some bidders have fallen out of business. “The business community has no problem borrowing from the banks only if they are assured of timely payments” reported a respondent.

Interviews with key informants revealed that delays in payments are caused by a number of factors including delays in approvals by the respective entity staff, poor planning and budgeting especially in the local governments that have unprotected votes. This means that entities are committing government without securing funds for payments of the delivered goods, services or works. In other instances the entities experienced budget cuts by the Ministry of Finance Planning and Economic Development and are therefore not able to pay the providers in time.

Corruption
Corruption was reported as a key barrier to competition in public procurement. Respondents reported that there was no transparency in the entire procurement process as sometimes the contracts are awarded to companies owned mostly by the government employees and politicians or their relatives in the respective entities. An example is case where the procurement officers leaked the information to favored bidders “The advertising process is just a formality to comply with the PPDA requirements” reported a respondent.

According to the 3rd Public Procurement Integrity Survey conducted in 2015, 71.8% of respondents believed there to be corruption in public procurement. The survey further revealed that 60% of service providers reported that they had bribed public officials to influence tenders and 54% of respondents reported that the value of bribes was over 10 per cent of the contracted procurement value. It is because of these perceptions that the bidders are discouraged from bidding for government contracts. “It is a waste of money to spend on the bidding process yet the best bidders are already determined” reported a respondent.

Corruption has an impact on the cost of delivering services, as firms anticipate paying bribes, they increase the contract price by an amount corresponding to the anticipated bribe resulting in high public spending and therefore fewer services are provided with the available resources. If tendering processes are rigged, “competition cannot play its role of driving the prices down and the quality up” (World Bank, 2016).

**High Cost of Bidding**

Respondents further reported that the bidding process involves unregulated high costs of bidding that discourage potential bidders from bidding for government contracts. Some of the direct costs incurred by providers include:

- The non refundable bidding fee
- Printing and photocopying of bidding documents,
- The cost of obtaining bid securities from the bank,
- Cost of obtaining the eligibility documents from the different institutions for example the certificate of incorporation, trading license, PPDA certificate
- Cost of preparing the bidding documents (some bidders hire consultants to prepare the documents)

The PPDA Regulations (2014) provide that the bidding documents may be sold in order to recover the cost of printing, copying and distribution and the price shall be calculated to cover only the costs and shall not include any profit. However the survey noted that some entities are using the bidding fees as a source of revenue for the entity leading to the increased costs. The transactions costs incurred in fulfilling bidding requirements is more burdensome for mostly the smaller firms as the larger firms are more likely to have the necessary expertise and connections to meet bidding requirements. In some entities, costs are paid before and after prequalification processes. To a bidder who participated in bidding for more than one procurement to broaden their chances, these costs are higher. Respondents further reported that some entities still request for bid securities even when the PPDA law was amended to provide for the bid securing declaration for quotations and restricted domestic bidding.

**Vague and Unclear Requirements**

Respondents reported that sometimes the requirements stated in the bidding requirements are vague. In addition, in some cases the amount of experience and amount of turnover rates required are not necessary for the procurements stated. This discourages potential bidders as it favors only the few large firms. An example is requiring equipment such as motor grader, bulldozer, and roller when bidding for a classroom block. The
setting of restrictive criteria is questionable as the specifications indicated are in some cases exaggerated for
the procurement and hence limits the participation of many bidders.

**Inadequate Knowledge on Available Procurement Opportunities**

Respondents reported that the bidding opportunities have not been publicized enough and sometimes they miss
out on participating because of lack of knowledge on the available opportunities. In some cases the knowledge
about the opportunities is obtained when it’s already too late to prepare and submit responsive bid documents,
in other instances providers that are prequalified are not contacted to participate in the bidding for contracts. The
survey sought to establish the medium through which respondents access the tender information. 89% of the
providers have accessed the tender advertisement through News papers, 31% through the entity notice boards,
15% through entity websites and 16% through the Government procurement portal.

**Figure 8: Accessibility to Government Procurement Opportunities**

Lack of Access to Capital

Respondents reported that challenges of lack of access to capital/funds to enable them boost and sustain their
businesses is a barrier to their participation in public procurement. The cost of doing business in the country is
high with Uganda ranking as 122 out of 190 surveyed countries in terms of costs (hardships) of doing business
(World Bank, 2018). This implies that most companies did not have the financial strength to deal in government
contracts.

**Responsiveness of Bids**

58% of the respondents had not been awarded at least one government contract in the last 3 years while 42%
have been awarded at least one contract in the last 3 years. The study sought to establish the reasons for the
unsuccessful bids. 71% of the respondents reported that they had not given the reason for failure, 36% reported
high bid price, 31% reported lack of experience, 19% reported incomplete documentation and 14% reported lack
of technical capacity to meet the procurement demand. Majority of the respondents did not know why their bids
were not successful and were therefore not aware on where they should improve when participating in the next
opportunity. Because of this lack of feedback, bidders were bound to believe that the process was not transparent.
Conclusion and Recommendations

The survey findings suggest that there are a number of challenges affecting competition in public procurement. Some of these challenges are internal to the procuring organisation but a number of factors are external and may therefore require the Government’s intervention. There are ongoing reforms in the procurement law that will mitigate some of the challenges. These include the introduction of E-government to promote transparency in public procurement and the promotion of participation of local companies in government procurement. According to Ardwell et al, 2005, Strategic procurement should put into consideration the factors hindering the participation of bidders for Government contracts. The importance of competition for cost-effective public procurement is validated by the efforts that firms typically devote, in their business transactions, to ensure that they make effective use of competition to reduce the cost and increase the quality of inputs. In order to ensure competitive markets, there is need to incentivize suppliers to suit broader public sector requirements.

There is need to strengthen the compliance by the procuring organizations to the payment terms as stipulated in the procurement law. This can be achieved by establishing an effective monitoring system on the use of the Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS) during the payment of providers and identify the officers in charge of the delays in payment. Once the points of delays are identified then the responsible organizations can employ sanctions against the non-compliant staff. To reduce the space for negotiating corruption, the Government plans to roll out an E-procurement system to reduce physical interface between service providers and the officials responsible for procurement. Other benefits of the E-procurement system include foster easier and faster access to information, lower transaction costs, participation of a larger pool of firms from broader markets, and a faster bidding process.

There is need for increased awareness, sensitization and trainings of the procurement practitioners simplify bidding requirements so as to enhance competition. The bidding documents should be customized to allow for participation of the local and the upcoming small and medium enterprises. In addition, the oversight body should develop common specifications standards for commonly procured items.

The costs of bidding should be regulated for example the costs of selling the bidding documents as this will allow more bidders to participate at the prequalification stage. The oversight body should monitor the compliance of implementing the bid securing declaration instead of bid security for the quotation and restrictive methods as stipulated in the law.

Improved feedback mechanisms from procurement officers will motivate bidders to participate in public procurement for example a bidder should be given feedback on reasons why the bids were not successful. Procuring organisations should conduct regular pre-bid meetings and bidders’ forums that will improve the relationships and perceptions of the providers towards the personnel in the procuring organisations. Other motivating strategies include appraising bidders and issuing certificates of good performance to bidders that have executed good work and put in place mechanisms to promote new bidders.

Acknowledgement
The research project was conducted by the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority (PPDA). The authors are grateful to the various practitioners and PPDA staff for the comments and suggestions on the content.
References


PPDA (2015). The 3rd Public Procurement Integrity Survey Report

Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Assets Authority, Regulations 2014.


836 |
Factors behind Consistent Decline in UCE Performance: A Comparison of Secondary Schools in Eastern Regions in Uganda

Nyenje Aida Lubwama, Peter Michael Owiny & Lyadda Baker
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
This study aimed at determining the factor affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda in relation to Central Region. The study was specifically conducted to establish four objectives including, assessing the trend analysis of performance of UCE in Eastern region in comparison to Central Region in Uganda, examining the family factors affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda, establishing the environmental and cultural factors affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda and assessing the school based factors affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda. The study was conducted as a cross section employing both qualitative and quantitative approaches. The study targeted 4874 individual including students and parents of respondents, former students, class teachers and head teachers and district local leaders in both Mukono and Iganga District. The study employed structured questionnaires, interviews and documentary review in collecting data. Thematic analysis of qualitative data was done by identifying common themes based on the objectives of the study, while quantitative data were analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). Most of the factors that were identified applied to both regions as the central region has a significant number or people from other parts of the country. However, some factors were more prevalent in the Eastern region. Among the factors that were found to bring about consistent decline in academic performance in eastern region included gender-based inequality, low government financing, family economic status and policy related factors. Overall, the study concluded that the central region is better equipped to offer quality education due to availability of a better infrastructure and staff remuneration. There is thus a need to ensure that Eastern Region is equipped with the required resources in terms of physical infrastructure, competent and enough teachers, increased funding, increased supervision of USE and technological innovations required in improving quality of USE.

Key words: Educational Inequality; Gender; Quality of Life; Secondary Schools, Comparative Study

Introduction
World over education is considered a strong pillar to development and as such every individual Nations strive to ensure quality education is achieved through increased students’ performance. Government of Uganda conscious of different actors in the provision of secondary introduced Universal Secondary Program in mid-2000. The program with corresponding policies provided leverage to the actors to take their roles that would translate to good performance at all levels of secondary education. For instance the program policy documents put responsibility areas for the family especially the parents to support their children basic school requirements including moral uprightness. Equally the individual schools drew programs that would support learners to achieve academically. External and internal supervision as means to create everlasting conducive learning environment have been ensured through creating independent quality assurance directorate of Education almost at the same time when USE was introduced. Despite Universal Secondary Education (USE) in public schools in Uganda, some children of school-going age are not accessing education at all (Kasente, 2013). Those who have accessed it have experienced educational inequalities due to a number of factors and the drop-out rate has been noted to be high in many schools around Eastern region compared to central part of the country (UNESCO, 2015).
Objectives of the Study
The study aimed at assessing the determinants of consistent decline in UCE performance and education quality in Eastern Uganda and specifically investigated the following.

i) To examine the family factors affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda

ii) To establish the environmental factors affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda

iii) To assess the school based factors affecting UCE performance in Eastern Uganda

Review of Related Literature
Several authors have regeneratd determinants to students performance and linked them to family school and physical learning environment. For instance South African literature discusses a number of different determinants of dropout of school factors such as family structure, financial constraints, and shocks including loss of employment, death and pregnancy among others (Grant & Behrman, 2010). High levels of inequality and dropout rates being registered in a number of schools around the country, contradicts the UNESCO report, which suggests that there is hope that fewer young women in Uganda will be left lacking skills for work in the future because of having attained education (UNESCO, 2015). In Uganda, according to the education system, after primary education one is supposed to continue to secondary education as no skills can be attained at this level, thus the introduction of USE. It is after secondary education that one can enroll for a practical course such as carpentry, hairdressing or tailoring depending on one’s’ interest and ability. The Ugandan education system follows a 7-4, 2-4 patterns: seven years of primary education, followed by four years of lower secondary or “Ordinary” level, two years of upper secondary or “Advanced” level, and four more years of tertiary education for those who can afford (MOES, 2016). However, due to factors such as financial constraints, or early marriage, many students drop out of school along the way in Eastern Uganda than central Part of the country (Kasente, 2013).

Further, poor educational outcomes at the school level are a result of a series of complex and interrelated factors, both within and outside the school system. For those students who have attained secondary education, but have experienced inequality in education while at school, getting employment after school has been hard, resulting into a poor quality of life which is highly observed among students from Eastern region of Uganda which demotivates others from going on with education to higher levels (Mulongo, 2012). The socio-economic backgrounds of the students and parents contribute significantly to underperformance leading to inequality (Novelli, 2016). Research has established a base of knowledge about the harmful effects of disadvantageous circumstances on education and health (Novelli, 2016). Therefore it is disheartening if a student completes school and fails to get employment having incurred a lot of costs.

Moreover, families in Eastern Uganda tend to have a number of children as the fertility rate stands at 5.8 whereas Central at 5.2%, Northern at 4.8% and Western Uganda at 5.4% (UBOS, 2016). Just like in other parts of Uganda, employers, when screening potential candidates for vacant positions, are more interested in their educational qualification and skills and not any other characteristics such as cultural background or social connections (Kagolo, 2017). Accordingly, employers are likely to, evaluate additional ‘signals’, such as field of study, type of institution or program level in potential candidates for vacant positions(Mugasha, 2011). It is for this reason that most families in Uganda, prefer to send their children to privately owned schools which are highly rated in terms of educational standards while, for low income families their children mainly go to government owned schools whose educational standards in most cases do not match the privately owned schools. For the poor families in Eastern region who cannot afford to send their children to school, the option is to stay
at home and engage in different activities some of which generate income to supplement on the family expenditure. This has been highly evident in Namiyingo and Bugiri districts in Busoga Region which rank highly in child labor especially in mining of stones and sand. Kaliro, Buyende and Mayuge also rank highly with over 33% children engaged in the growing of sugarcane. This has accelerated educational inequalities between the rich and the poor (Waiswa & Kiberu, 2015). Research in Eastern Uganda indicates that in poor families girls lag behind boys by 20% in enrolment at secondary level and the gap widens further at tertiary and university levels where cost and gender become important factors in determining access to education (Naturinda, 2013). Girls have also remained strongly disadvantaged in education mainly in Eastern region compared to other regions like central and western region (Okurut, 2016).

The high rate of poor performances in secondary schools was observed in rural areas mainly in the Eastern Uganda. With the 2017 UCE examinations already finished, it has been noticed with poor performances of last year’s worst ranked districts in Uganda (Kween, Bulambuli, Bukwo, Kaliro, Luuka, Iganga, Buyende, Bugiri, Bududa, Namutumba). Apart from Kween, Bulambuli and Bukwo, the rest are in Busoga sub-region. Let’s take a review to some of the reasons to have been the cause of the poor performance in the schools of these districts as periodically indicated in special reports:

- "The pupils report for first term and only return in the third term, to sit for Uganda Certificate Examinations (UCE).”. They had gone to earn money from sugarcane plantations. In Busoga, some farmers abandon food production for sugarcane growing, but the recent high UCE failure rate is evidence that pupils are also abandoning school to work as casual laborers in sugarcane plantations.

- Ms Jessica Alupo, blamed the poor performance on sugar plantations and fishing around Busoga region which lure children out of school into employment.

- Ms Alupo attributed the large discrepancy in rural-urban performance to the increased absenteeism of both teachers and pupils in rural schools and lack of facilities.

- The minister also cited other reasons such as – poor supervision of school teachers, parents allowing their children to engage in commercial activities like fishing and sugarcane growing during class time and a raging epidemic of jiggers in Busoga.

- Some pupils performed poorly because their parents failed to provide them with lunch or scholastic items like pens and books,” George Tigawalana, the Iganga district inspector of schools, said.

- Pupils in Kamuli district are either involved in rice growing or fishing, instead of attending classes, according to Joseph Musoke, the district education officer. Out of a total of 110,101 pupils who sat for UCE last year, Kamuli registered 580 first grades, while 1,956 students failed, while 341 registered, but did not sit the examinations.

- Teachers and parents force children to sit for exams after being out of school the whole year. You cannot expect miracles from such children,” says Musoke.

- He faults some parents who marry off their daughters while they are still at school. “Girls usually fail to sit for UCE because they are married off by their parents, while others get pregnant.” However, he adds that the low number of teachers is also to blame.

- Lydia Chekwel, the Kween district’s Woman Member of Parliament, notes that most of the schools are under UCE and that most of the pupils who passed were from private schools. Chekwel says teachers in UCE schools do not reside at the schools. “They, therefore, report to work late and leave earlier than they should because they walk long distances back home. So when will they ever cover the syllabus?”

- These schools follow the policy that no pupil should repeat under UCE, but in some cases, the pupils are too weak,” says Chekwel.
A broader approach, could help in better understanding of the ways in which education systems relate to the production of inequality in complex and contradictory ways. Educational research is needed to address these needs to ask questions on the governance, coordination and management of the education sector as well as its content, teaching and outcomes in Eastern art of Uganda which has showed consistent decline in performance whereby its prominent schools like Busoga Mwiri College has lost a first slot in the best performing schools in Uganda (Kagolo, 2017).

Methodology
The study was conducted using a cross section research design which was comparative in nature. It was also desirable to use the design because it allowed reaching out the various category of respondents once in a shorter period of time. The study was conducted using mixed methods approach. The study targeted 4874 students in secondary schools in Mukono and Iganga Districts representing Central and Eastern Regions Respectively (MOES Statistic, 2017). 4874 students formed sampling framework, and 357 were determined using Morgan and Krejcie (1970). In this study, primary data were mainly collected through interviews and structured questionnaires. Key informants included, 15 parents of respondents, 18 former students of the schools where respondents were still students, 26 class teachers and 9 head teachers from the selected schools, 4 district local leaders giving a total of 72 key informants. Ten (10) secondary schools were sampled from Mukono district in central Uganda, and Iganga in Eastern Uganda, with each district being represented by five (5) secondary schools. Out of the schools selected, 40% were private, while 60% were government owned. Purposive sampling was used to select all the study participants, both respondents and key informants. Simple random sampling was used in determining students who participated in the study and questionnaire guide administered to generate their opinion. Document review was also used in collecting data used in the third. Data were collected by the third author with the assistance of trained research assistants. Thematic analysis of qualitative data was done by identifying common themes based on the objectives of the study, while quantitative data were analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS).

Results
We begin by presenting the views and responses of all participants from selected schools in both central and Eastern Uganda regarding UCE performance. Most of the findings are presented in a qualitative form, while others are in a quantitative form as percentages. Demographic characteristics of the current student respondents and the findings helped to explain the differences in the regional educational inequalities and the quality of life.

Trend Analysis Of UCE Performance
It was established from documents reviewed on how Eastern Uganda has been performing in UCE in comparison to other regions in Uganda. Table 1 below has more details.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Region</td>
<td>12.1%</td>
<td>9.8%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>14.1%</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>15.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Region</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Region</td>
<td>10.13%</td>
<td>10.8%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
<td>13.5%</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>12.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Region</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Further, it was established that schools in Eastern Uganda were found to have more students in class, totaling up to 199 students (56%) as compared to those in central Uganda with 159 (44%). In the study girls were 148 (41%) and boys 210 (59%), and the ratio of boys to girls was relatively higher in all the schools. The average age for students was 17 years, and majority of the students commuted to school while others resided at school. Only
11% of the students had ever attempted to drop out of school, majority of them being from Iganga in Eastern region. The major reasons for dropping out or attempting to do so include lack of school fees, scholastic materials, looking after siblings and forced marriages, among others. Such factors were also identified to be associated with school drop-out in South Africa (Novelli, 2016). With regard to parents’ or guardians’ level of education, 43% of the students noted that their parents/guardians had attained secondary education. In Italy, people who have attained good education and from better families have an advantage over those who do not have such opportunities and as a result get good employment opportunities and send their children to good schools where they acquire better skills thus minimizing social inequality in a way (Strassburg & Russel, 2010).

Table 2.1 Attendance Rates by Quintile of the per capita Expenditure Distribution Uganda 2002 and 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quintile</th>
<th>6 - 12 years</th>
<th>6 - 8 years</th>
<th>9 - 12 years</th>
<th>13-18 years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Total</td>
<td>66.5</td>
<td>64.2</td>
<td>68.7</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>50.2</td>
<td>45.7</td>
<td>53.9</td>
<td>37.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>65.4</td>
<td>50.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>68.5</td>
<td>66.5</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>54.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>73.7</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>76.3</td>
<td>65.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>84.2</td>
<td>83.1</td>
<td>85.5</td>
<td>79.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2015 Total | 88.1 | 88.4 | 87.7 | 80.7 | 81.4 | 80.1 | 93.6 | 93.5 | 93.7 |
| 1 | 78.8 | 78.9 | 78.8 | 67.1 | 68.1 | 66.2 | 87.7 | 86.7 | 88.7 |
| 2 | 85.8 | 86.0 | 85.5 | 76.0 | 75.5 | 76.5 | 94.1 | 95.1 | 93.1 |
| 3 | 89.7 | 90.1 | 89.3 | 81.9 | 82.1 | 81.7 | 95.8 | 95.9 | 95.7 |
| 4 | 93.0 | 93.3 | 92.7 | 89.6 | 91.2 | 88.0 | 95.5 | 95.0 | 96.1 |
| 5 | 94.5 | 94.7 | 94.3 | 92.9 | 93.7 | 92.1 | 95.6 | 95.4 | 95.9 |

*All figures are percentages of respective age group.

Source: Computations from UIHS 2002 and UNHS 2015/2016 data

Our empirical analysis is based on the 2002 and 2015 nationally representative household surveys combined with two community surveys for the same years. From the original datasets we retain a sample 16,607 individuals who were between 6 and 18 years old in 2002, and 14, 984 individuals of the same age group in 2015. In addition to the household/individual level information, we also merge the two surveys with a community level questionnaire that contains extra information about the level of development of the community that can be used as controls in our model. For example, we will use existence of primary and secondary (either public or private) school in the community and the average of fees paid in the community as controls later on in our analysis of correlation of fees paid and school attendance.

---

*The sampling frame is based on a two-stage sampling design and relies on information from the most recent Census. Enumeration areas (EA) are selected at the first stage and households are randomly drawn from each selected EA. The 2002 UIHS was conducted between March 2002 and March 2003 by the Statistics Unit of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning within the context of the Social Dimensions of Adjustment (SDA) project supported by the World Bank and the United Nations Development Program (UNDP). It covers 10 thousand households and 50 thousand individuals. The 2015 UNHS is the latest one available and was carried out by the Uganda Bureau of Statistics (UBOS) between May 2015 and April 2016 with financial support from the World Bank and the UK Department for International Development (DFID). It contains information for 7.5 thousand households and 43 thousand individuals. The data are organized in five modules: Socioeconomic, Agriculture, Community, Price, and a Qualitative module designed to provide information for a deeper understanding of the issues covered in the quantitative modules.*
### Table 2.2 School Attendance and Reasons for Non-Attendance by Region Uganda 2002 and 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Uganda</th>
<th>Rural</th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Center</th>
<th>East</th>
<th>North</th>
<th>West</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>2002</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>School attendance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-12 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>66.5</td>
<td>64.6</td>
<td>82.2</td>
<td>78.8</td>
<td>67.1</td>
<td>51.6</td>
<td>65.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-8 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>55.6</td>
<td>52.7</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td>72.2</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>37.7</td>
<td>55.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-12 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>76.8</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>85.1</td>
<td>85.0</td>
<td>80.3</td>
<td>65.1</td>
<td>73.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-18 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>43.6</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>38.5</td>
<td>45.1</td>
<td>50.8</td>
<td>42.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-18 year olds in secondary school (%)</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>29.0</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reasons for never attending/dropping out</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calamity in family, pregnancy, disabled</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of interest</td>
<td>49.2</td>
<td>49.5</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>50.3</td>
<td>48.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to work</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of attendance</td>
<td>42.1</td>
<td>42.0</td>
<td>43.5</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>36.1</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport/distance</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor quality of school</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of individuals (6-18 years)</td>
<td>16,607</td>
<td>11,027</td>
<td>5,580</td>
<td>4,427</td>
<td>4,172</td>
<td>4,089</td>
<td>3,919</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2015</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>School attendance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-12 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>88.1</td>
<td>87.4</td>
<td>92.1</td>
<td>92.7</td>
<td>89.7</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td>88.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-8 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>80.7</td>
<td>79.5</td>
<td>89.2</td>
<td>89.4</td>
<td>81.5</td>
<td>67.7</td>
<td>81.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-12 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>93.6</td>
<td>93.6</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>95.0</td>
<td>96.2</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>93.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-18 year olds in primary school (%)</td>
<td>57.1</td>
<td>61.2</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>45.1</td>
<td>62.4</td>
<td>64.9</td>
<td>60.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-18 year olds in secondary school (%)</td>
<td>21.9</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>31.7</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>18.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orphans (%)</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children with one alive parent (%)</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reasons for Never Attending/ Dropping out</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calamity in family, pregnancy, disabled</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of interest</td>
<td>56.3</td>
<td>58.8</td>
<td>26.9</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>73.7</td>
<td>57.0</td>
<td>57.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need to work</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of attendance</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>44.7</td>
<td>36.1</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport/distance</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor quality of school</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orphaned/displaced</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of individuals (6-18 years)</td>
<td>14,984</td>
<td>11,895</td>
<td>3,089</td>
<td>3,975</td>
<td>4,087</td>
<td>3,238</td>
<td>3,684</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Computations from UIHS 2002 and UNHS 2015/2006 data

* Percentages for reasons for non-attendance refer to children 6-12 years old
about 50 percent compared to 84 percent for the richest. A similar gap is observed for the other age groups as well. The data also reveal a gender bias for all age groups and income levels. Attendance rates are consistently higher for boys than for girls.

Comparing 2002 attendance rates with 2015 reveals a significant increase in overall attendance among primary school age children (6-12 years old) and that of the poor. At the bottom quintile, attendance rate has increased by more than 28 percentage points (from 50.2 percent in 2002 to 78.8 percent in 2015). However, the gap between the bottom and the top quintile does not seem to be narrowing. The gender difference in attendance seems to have disappeared in 2015. As noted in the introduction, one of the education policy objectives in Uganda is to get students to enroll at the right age. The age of enrollment is indeed a key determinant of dropout rates. Focusing now on the 6-8-year age group, we note that they have the lowest attendance rates both in 2002 and 2015 compared with the 9-12-year age group. However, the enrolment rate seems to have gone up significantly, jumping from 37 percent in 2002 to about 81 percent in 2015. Attendance rates for secondary school age children (13-18 years old) did also increase between 2002 and 2015. The increase, however, does not seem as dramatic as for the case of primary school age children. While there was a gap between boys and girls in 2002, this seems to have disappeared in 2015. Overall, the enrolment rate for girls is somewhat higher than that of boys (23.5 percent versus 20.4 percent).

Table 2.2 presents information on attendance and reasons for non-attendance by region. There is a bias in favor of urban residents both for the 6-12-year and the 13-18-year age groups. For the primary school age group this bias has shrunk significantly between 2002 and 2015. The difference between enrolment rate for urban children and that of rural children decreased from about 18 percent in 2002 to about 5 percent in 2015. For the secondary school age children, this difference remained at about 20 percent\textsuperscript{170}. Looking at the regional distribution of attendance, we note that for both years, the Central Region has the highest attendance rates for all age groups while the Northern Region has the lowest.

The information about the reasons for non-attendance or dropping out reveals two key determinants of this outcome: lack of interest and the cost of attendance. However, the importance of cost as a reason for not attending school has significantly declined. The overall percentage of children non-attending school for cost-related reasons decreased from 42 percent in 2002 to about 13 percent in 2015. The urban-rural comparison shows that the level of this constraint has not changed in the urban areas and has not declined much for the Central Region (going from about 46 percent in 2002 to about 36 percent in 2015). Lack of interest remains a severe constraint to attendance. The overall score for this factor increased from 49 percent in 2002 to 56 percent in 2015. Looking at the regional distribution we note that it decreased only for the Central Region, moving from 45 percent in 2002 to 30 percent in 2015.

These observed trends in enrolment suggest that the UPE policy may have induced a dramatic increase in primary school attendance, but (as noted earlier) may have also led to a decline in the quality of education. For policy analysis it is important to ascertain that this is not due to some diffuse change in the overall socioeconomic environment. We need to determine the extent to which the outcome can be attributable to the policy shift.

\textsuperscript{170} These observations are consistent with those made by Deininger (2003) when comparing the situation in 2002 with that prevailing in 1999. He observes a reduction of the urban bias in access to primary education and no change in the bias for access to secondary education.
Family Factors Affecting UCE Performance in Eastern Region

Over 86% of the respondents and key informants in both central and Eastern Uganda alluded to the fact that the family economic status is responsible for educational differences in terms of attainment and completion. In this regard, lack of school fees was identified as the key factor responsible for dropout rates in Eastern region schools. The number of family members who depend on the family head to provide for their necessities was also identified as an impediment to attaining quality educational. Over 82% of the respondents identified this factor by stating that the more the family members, the more family expenditures are divided among many competing demands, leaving less for quality education. This factor was more common in Iganga where families are relatively larger compared to those in Mukono. The education level of the family head was also a key catalyst to educational inequality, and it was noted that the family head made most of the decisions regarding who should go to which school, and the quality of support given to the student in terms of scholastic materials. Research indicates that family factors have an immense significance on educational inequality as one’s family background and socio-economic status can be a means to predict educational success or failure of achieving or completing quality education.

Environmental and Cultural Factors Affecting UCE Performance in Eastern Region

Social class inequalities in different schools, was also identified to bring about educational inequality, as stated by 81% of respondents from both regions. One key informant from Iganga, agreed with the respondents, and gave the following response:

*Here student leaders are given special privileges, for example any function outside school, is only attended by leaders.*

Findings state that chances of children going to school in the Democratic Republic of Congo are heavily influenced by whether they live in a conflict zone, and whether they are rich or poor. Both respondents and key informants (81%) indicated that government support and involvement in school increases its achievement and performance. In Mukono, 73% of the key informants reported to have been supervised by the District Education Officer or any other member from the ministry as compared to only 41% in Iganga who reported to have been supervised by government authorities. Moreover, private schools were more highly monitored and supervised by both ministry staff and communities compared to government schools.

Other factors related to educational inequalities included gender, ethnic and social cultural factors, and these were reported to have been experienced by students mostly in Iganga. Respondents reported gender based educational inequality to be at 60%, however, key informants denied existence of any form of gender educational discrimination, as one of them stated:

*In our school girls are more than boys but equal treatment is provided to all irrespective of their gender. This contradicts what one respondent in Mukono said: ...girls are discouraged from taking on science subjects like Physics and Mathematics and instead encouraged to do art subjects especially Fine Art, Literature and History.*

Overall it was found that gender inequalities are catalyzed by traditional beliefs and socialization at the family level where girls are brought up to do most of the domestic chores in the home which may even affect their time for learning. According to gender role socialization, children acquire the gender stereotypes and norms prevalent within families and educational institutions in the course of developing a gender identity. Parents and educators may have gender biased perceptions of children’s abilities and performance, for example that boys have a better grasp on technical questions or mathematics. Such agrees with similar findings, in other countries where 14% of the women (7-16 years old) had never been to school.

One key informant gave this response:
In some communities people still consider education to be for boys and not girls. So, if there is not enough money, the boys will go to school first and the girls will sit and wait until when the parents get money or end up getting married, thus contributing to the differences in performance between boys and girls and also increased early marriage for girls.

A study by UNESCO, indicates that in Congo among the poor families in Katanga region, 44% of the girls, had never been to school, compared with 17% of boys in the same region. However, contrary to this, research indicates that gender inequality in western societies has recently started to reverse; in particular, girls are overtaking boys in all stages of the educational career.

The Eastern regions have Beta of 0.563, implying a unit increase in educational inequality will decrease economic status by 56% thereby reducing the quality of life. Accordingly, inequality in education achievement and earning inequality are correlated, within the United States and across countries. Majority of key informants in the study agreed that, there is a high level of educational inequality in most schools in form of economic status. Students from poor families generally felt that they were not treated the same way as those from rich and moderate families. One respondent from Iganga said that:

*I was insulted by a classmate that we are poor and I am always sent back home for school fees and simple things like brooms and toilet papers. I felt so bad and I didn’t want to study in the same school with the student who insulted me.*

Additionally, over 86% of the respondents said that rich students have better scholastic materials such as textbooks as compared to their counter parts from less privileged families, and as such, perform better at school. Research findings state that students from poor families are likely to perform poorly compared to those from rich families. In Europe, parents from upper social classes take advantage of the best educational options to make the transition to the labor market with better rewarded credentials. Interviews with key informants from both regions, found out that even when a student misses some days to attend school because he or she has been sent back home due to school fees, such a student may not compete favorably with one who has not missed school at all.

A key informant in Iganga said:

*Because of income problems, feeding at school are also challenging since the fees is fixed and the prices of food keep fluctuating. Even the Parents’ Teachers’ Association fund is inadequate and the differences in income levels limit children from low income families from progressing on to upper classes.*

The poor afford lowest performing schools and achieve poorest outcome and poverty is strongly associated with low attainment. Therefore, education has not transformed the life of the poor and disadvantaged but has only brought about some modest improvement in some families.

On the other hand, in Iganga findings revealed that some parents engage their children in domestic chores such as rearing of domestic animals, which leaves them no time to attend school while, in Mukono, the study found out that children near fishing areas usually drop out of school and opt to engage in fishing so as to get quick money. Overall, the dropout rate was found higher in Eastern Uganda than in central Uganda. According to 68% of the respondents, the quality of education and the type of school attended determine the job one does and thus impact on the quality of life, which implies that there is a positive correlation between the school attended and the job one does. Results from other studies indicate that parents who are financially well off, take their children to good (normally private) schools that offer quality education and as such, give students better chances of finding more employment opportunities.
Quality of life depends on economic ability, therefore, children of the poor receive inferior education and consequently, are condemned to lesser professions and lower employment status [9,20]. Educational inequality in Iganga was found to be higher compared to Mukono, and this greatly affects the quality of life of the student after school. At primary level, achievement rates and completion rates are lower in the Eastern region of Uganda as compared to the central region. Key informants indicated that in Eastern Uganda, not many students take on science subjects which may give them opportunities to compete favorably for highly skilled jobs such as doctors, and engineers which are also related to attainment of a higher quality of life and increased income.

Majority of respondents (77%) indicated that the quality of education and the level attained determine the social class of an individual and this can be explained by the fact that some highly rated schools have strong associations that even extend beyond school life thereby increasing social networks and thus improvement in social capital. In Italy, similar findings cite the importance of social-networks in providing a wide range of opportunities for finding employment. A key informant from Iganga reported: If someone went to a poor school, they are likely to continue associating with a class of poor people and even the social network will be of people from a poor class compared to those from highly rated schools with no inequalities and a wider net-work. Educational inequality was further found to have an impact on the self-esteem of students who experienced it as revealed by a key informant from Mukono: In case of young girls, they are easily deceived by men and they have no choice but to accept and the cycle will continue. This is mostly common in village schools where the girls do not have assertive skills.

According to the study findings, more schools in Mukono as compared to those from Iganga had well established old student’s associations which help students from their former schools extend their interactions and networks beyond different places resulting into higher social capital. This has not only benefited the members through connecting them to employment opportunities, but also helped in pooling of funds that have helped them engaged in small-scale businesses for improved standards of living. Old student’s associations in Iganga are still small and some schools did not have such associations, thus it was somehow difficult to track former students of those schools. The findings are in agreement with earlier studies which indicate that the education system reproduces the class system.

**School Based Factors Affecting UCE Performance in Eastern Region**

Contributing significantly to student performance are, preschool education, and the availability of reading textbooks among others. In the current study, both respondents and key informants stated that a number of school based factors such as a good infrastructure in form of laboratories, improved and well stocked libraries tend to motivate and enable students to read more and comprehend what has been taught in class better than their counterparts who lack such facilities. In South Africa, indicators of quality of education and organizational capacity available to perform effective change management functions have been identified. Schools are classified into high-functioning, low-functioning, and non-functioning institutions, and research concludes that schools that are either low or non-functioning, have a low performance of the learners. Furthermore, in South Africa, where the infrastructure and other facilities are lacking, educational inequalities are likely to increase. In relation to this factor, facilities such as laboratories, libraries and washrooms, among others, were found responsible for educational inequalities in Iganga despite having good classroom and administration blocks. The study further revealed that in the exams of (2014), 15% of the students who sat for Ordinary Level exams (O-Level) got U-Grade compared to only 6% in Mukono.
While on the other hand, findings also indicated that at Senior Six, (A-Level) about 3% of those who sat in (2014) in Iganga got no principal pass compared to only 1% in Mukono, giving a mean of 11 and 5 in relation to performance for Iganga and Mukono, respectively. One key informant also observed that availability of teachers improves student performance as well and as such, teachers need to reside near the school premises such that students find it easier to consult whenever necessary. He gave this response: In our school, only five teachers stay within the school and the majority rent outside. This limits the time available for students to consult with their teachers since most teachers disappear immediately after teaching. A student who consults a teacher outside classroom time tend to comprehend better what they have been taught in class. Schools that lack facilities such as reading materials produce students with poor reading habits and culture and this affects their quality of education. About 86% of the study respondents also affirmed that the differences in class sizes are also responsible for the educational inequalities in secondary schools. According to findings from the study, schools with inadequate numbers of teachers perform poorly compared to those that have adequate numbers. This leads to incomplete syllabus coverage as one teacher in Iganga noted: You cannot expect a student who has not finished the syllabus to compete favorably with one who has covered the whole syllabus and even has done some revision with the guidance of the teachers.

Another school based factor identified regarding educational inequality was motivation and payment of the teaching and non- teaching staff. Much as it is expected that teachers in, government owned schools are to be paid uniform salaries, the study found big deviations in this. Teachers in Iganga based government schools were found to earn less than their counterparts in Mukono. It was also revealed that government has contributed to these differences in teacher remuneration by paying science teachers relatively higher than arts teachers. Key informants also stated that many people believe that science subjects are better taught in the central region due to better infrastructure and facilities, and as such, some parents from the Eastern region who can afford, prefer to take their children to study in the central thus leading to differences in performances between Eastern and central Uganda. Individual school administration policies and management of the school, was also related to educational inequality as stated by a key informant: If the school is not properly managed, it leads to some form of educational inequalities and more specifically if the founders of the school or directors lack knowledge on proper management of an educational institution.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

The study aimed at comparing inequality in schools in the central and Eastern regions of Uganda which were represented by Mukono and Iganga respectively. Findings revealed that schools in Eastern Uganda have more students as compared to those in the central region. This attributed this to inadequate allocation schools in the Eastern region that made students to have no option but ought to fix themselves in the few schools. This factor generated inconvenience circumstances for those accessing schools over distance as compared to the central region with better infrastructure. This further means that few schools in the Eastern region have to accommodate larger population of students and the bigger the class size, the bigger the teacher-student ratio which limits participation of students, especially the academically weak ones. As the study revealed that schools that are nearer to the central government structures such as those in the central region are highly supported by the government, and this opportunity gives them a chance to identify bottlenecks in school management and performance, thus prompting practical and immediate actions than those schools that are far and hardly monitored thus improving the quality of education in those schools nearer to the central government.

Family economic status as a factor associated with education inequality featured in both regions. Generally, Uganda is a low income country and the standard of living of most families is still low. In the central region, the
standard of living is high and this has been made worse by increasing urbanization, high population growth, and increased food insecurity. In the Eastern region, the situation is no different for urban based families, and for rural based families, unstable incomes from agriculture and the prolonged rebel war that disrupted family life in that part of the country for many years left many families in poverty. Moreover, the type of families in Eastern region is still dominated by the extended family structure which is much bigger compared to those in the central which are dominated by a nuclear family. The government policy of promoting science based subjects has also favored urban based schools especially those in the central region thus increasing inequality in upcountry areas which may not have certain privileges.

Even those schools in the Eastern region that attempt to offer science subjects, still fall short of the required standards by the regulating bodies both local and international. Regarding gender based educational inequality, the study found out that the boy-child is given more priority when it comes to education opportunities and although this was more prevalent in the north, it is believed that as the central region is composed of residents from different parts of Uganda some families living in the central region who still cherish their cultural norms, such as investing in the boy-child to carry on the family name and legacy and care for their parents when they age. Some parents also state that it may not be productive to educate a girl who will grow up and get married and leave the home. This therefore justifies the reason for some form of gender-based educational inequality in the central region, contributed to increased school drop-out rates, as well as early marriage for the girl-child. Moreover, Parents are also known in some cases to decide for their children the subject combinations to be studied especially at advanced level (A Level), a practice that has widened educational inequalities related to gender, and has also made children to opt for subject combinations especially sciences that are not their choices, leading to biases and thus poor educational performance. Although the government has put in place a system known as the quota system whereby students who perform very well from every district in the country, and currently Uganda has more than 101 districts, is supposed to receive free university education, students from the central region-based schools and more so boys still dominate admission to public universities because of better performance in science subjects which are highly promoted by the government. This gives boys an advantage over girls thus creating some form of gender-based inequality.

In both central and Eastern region, there is some form of child labor, however, it is more prevalent in the Eastern region and this could be due to the fact that many children lost their parents have entered into sugarcane production and the HIV pandemic living many children as orphans who have to fend for themselves and pay for their education. Teachers from the central region are believed to be more equipped to teach students and more up to date with information as a result of a better environment where they easily access information through different sources such as the internet, a privilege which may not apply to teachers in the Eastern region but also better remunerated which motivates them to work harder leading to better student performance. This factor is not only common in secondary schools, but even in tertiary institutions including universities especially public universities where sit down strikes due to poor payment are a common occurrence.

Well motivated staff tend to concentrate on their work as compared to poorly motivated ones who may even go out during school hours to do part-time jobs so as to ‘make ends meet’. On-sport checking in many government owned schools has caught teachers unaware doing other activities such as farming and other income generating activities during school hours, and such teachers have been expelled from teaching. Moreover, in the short run, educational inequality in the Eastern region is likely to continue for some time as the situation of recent has been worsened by the influx of refugees fleeing the war in South Sudan. Over one million refugees have entered the country since the beginning of this year 2017 and the number keeps on growing as time goes by.
Government of Uganda sector wide policies greatly support total inclusion of non-nationals especially the refugees to share the country’s education and health care, thus increasing the crave for educational resources. This remains a big threat to desired students’ academic performance. It has been reported that refugees are attending same schools with students from the host country and the teachers in these schools are reported to be overwhelmed by the numbers of students. This may not a direct case for schools in Eastern Uganda though such schools would be affected by National Education resource allocation as government takes consideration for the increased population in the refugees’ affected areas. Educational inequalities have a negative impact on people’s quality of life after school which also affects productivity and development of the country as majority of these people are in the productive age group and expected to contribute to the economy of the country.

In conclusion, the study found both the central and Eastern regions of Uganda to have a number of similar factors that bring about educational inequality in schools, although most of them are more prominent in the Eastern region. While previous studies consistently indicated a wider discrepancy in school performance, this study revealed that a number of factors leading to educational inequality in both regions are similar as a result of urbanization which is widely spreading in many parts of the country although they are more prevalent in the Eastern region. The factors in the Eastern region could be attributed to the prolonged rebel war which affected that part of the country for a long time and destroyed the infrastructure. However, efforts are being made to improve the quality of education in other parts of the country and this is seen in a way that both government and privately owned universities have been opened in other parts of the country and the infrastructure such as roads and communication networks are being worked on. Meanwhile, if the political situation in the neighboring countries such as South Sudan improve, and some of the government weak policies are addressed, it is hoped that with time, educational inequality across Uganda and more so in the Eastern region will cease to be, leading to higher school performance and improved quality of life.

**Recommendations**

Government of Uganda together with other Education Agencies should fast track and implements the policy of establishing and resourcing secondary schools in each of the Parishes. This will effectively alleviate the challenge of distance that have negatively affected students’ attendance specifically in Eastern Region.

The parents stereotype belief of considering boys’ children as first priority in supporting school education should be discourage. Community policing and enforcement of laws that encourage regular attendance to both boys and girls need to be considered. This can be done by putting in place strong monitoring mechanism for the parents to ensure adherence.

There is need to strengthen imitative to improved students’ health not only those that are related to HIV and AIDS. Regular school programs that are related to practice of good health need to be revamped. School health assembly need to be routine endeavors and the subject curriculum should integrate personal health and hygiene to accommodate students’ health needs.

The teacher motivation strategies need to be upheld. Government should review and appreciate the role of Parents’ Teachers’ Association and support the structure as means to provision of additional financial support to teachers inform incentives and allowances. This would be done to encourage teachers to undertake extra load in supporting the students in their academic pursuits.
There is need to review funding modalities in terms of grants from Government and Education partners to cater for additional number of students arising from related factors like influx of refugees. The capitation grants for such schools with increased number of students need to be revised upwards from time to time.

References
UNEB Statistics (2010). Annual Surveys. The author
External Quality Assurance Mechanisms and the Quality of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education: A Systematic Review of Literature

Bonny Magezi¹, David Onen² & Joseph Kimoga³
¹, ², ³East African School of Higher Education Studies and Development, College of Education and External Studies, Makerere University
Corresponding Author’s email: magezibonny1234@gmail.com

Abstract
The significance of quality higher education is no longer debatable. In this paper, the authors present a systematic review of literature on the efficacy and challenges of applying External Quality Assurance (EQA) mechanisms in higher education. The review was instigated by limited research in this field in recent years. In this study, desk study method was used to select, review and analyze published articles in good journals drawn from Google web, Education Resource Information Centre (ERIC), JSTOR, and Google Scholar. In addition, some theses and dissertations were also identified and reviewed from the Abstracts International Database (AID). A total of 69 research articles were selected for analysis. Study findings revealed an increase in the number of studies on EQA mechanisms during the last six year. Secondly, the review revealed that these EQA mechanisms were most effective in enhancing the quality of teaching and learning (20%), ensuring of public accountability (15%), raising of student competence (11%), and improvement in quality of management and administration (9.6%). Weak international and national accrediting agencies (3.4%) as well as limited skilled manpower (2%) were among the core challenges reportedly facing the use of EQA mechanisms in higher education. Furthermore, prevailing gaps in the use of EQA mechanisms in higher education and future research areas in this field have also been highlighted in the paper.

Keywords: Efficacy, Challenges, External Quality Assurance, Mechanisms, Higher Education

Introduction
World over, both internal and external quality assurance mechanisms have been employed for years by governments and Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) themselves to regulate the conduct and quality of higher education (Bornmann, Mittag & Daniel, 2006; Carr, Hamilton & Meade, 2005). However, the effectiveness and efficiency of these quality assurance mechanisms have often varied from place to place, institution to institution, and with time as well. These variations have been attributed to several factors - including the challenges that are faced in applying the different QA mechanisms. In this paper, the authors have presented a systematic review of literature on the effectiveness and challenges of external quality assurance (EQA) mechanisms and the quality of teaching and learning in higher education. The review has been prompted by the little research carried out in this field in recent years.

Relevant Literature
Historically, the practice of quality assurance in higher education is as old as higher education itself. According to Charles (2007), “even though the mediaeval universities had no libraries, laboratories, museums… their commitment to maintain standards of institutional quality and accountability” (p.3) was unquestionable. Therefore, quality assurance mechanisms such as program review, evaluation, and assessment which they initiated to regulate institutional quality have remained in use up to today. In addition, more recent QA mechanisms have been instituted to ensure robust quality of teaching and learning in institutions of higher education. Unfortunately, the effectiveness and efficiency of many of these quality assurance methods, at times, have remained wanting; thus, the necessitating a review of this kind.

Several scholars have already investigated the issue of quality assurance in higher education. Some of these studies looked at how EQA mechanisms have been used to improve the quality of teaching and learning in HEIs
(e.g. Martin & Stella, 2007; Shuiyun, 2016). Others have examined how both institutional improvements in general can be triggered by both internal and external quality assurance mechanisms (e.g. Lui, 2015). Nonetheless, many of these studies were conducted in the context of developed countries. In this review, emphasis was placed in reviewing works that were conducted in both developed and less developed countries for the purpose of comparing the effectiveness of EQA mechanisms in the different contexts.

The review of literature - specifically on the effectiveness of EQA mechanisms to assure the quality of teaching and learning – has often revealed interesting findings. For instance, though different EQA mechanisms have been found to improve the quality of teaching and learning, Cheng (2010) discovered that academics generally dislike any kind of external audits that are carried out in their institutions – instead, they prefer institutional autonomy. However, though institutions would prefer autonomy in regulating their own quality, governments have found many HEIs to have weaknesses in regulating their own quality of teaching and learning; thus, the preference for using EQA mechanisms. In addition, governments often come in to regulate the quality of teaching and learning in HEIs as result of defending national interest; and at times, they do so because they are the big funders of higher education. The case of the US Federal governments is a good example. The scholars who looked at the impact of EQA mechanisms on higher education in other parts of the world even reported more or less similar findings. But, the results of these works had not be coalesce together under a single review; thus, the genesis of this literature review. The authors believed that this review of literature on the efficacy and challenges of applying EQA mechanisms in higher education can be a useful suggestion for both best practices and areas to invest in future research and development. In the present study, 127 research articles examining the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education published from 1998 up to 2018 were identified and analyzed to fill this need.

**The Purpose of the Study**

Various literature reviews have been done on quality assurance in higher education institutions. In most of the cases, the researchers focused on reviewing studies on, for examples: the impact of QA on learning efficiency in higher education (e.g. Rios, 2015; Shuiyun, 2016), the impact of QA on higher education in general (e.g. Lui, 2015), and the effectiveness of QA systems in institutions of higher education (e.g. Anaam, Alhammadi, Othman, Kwaïrân, & Awadh, 2009). But studies on EQA mechanisms and how they impact on the quality of teaching and learning in higher education institutions have not been common. To fill this knowledge gap in literature, various published studies from 1998 to 2018 were obtained, selected, reviewed, and analyzed from Google web, Education Resource Information Centre (ERIC), JSTOR, and Google Scholar. The current review is mainly focused on analyzing the efficacy and challenges of applying EQA mechanisms in ensuring the quality of teaching and learning in higher education. The review was done basing on the following specific research questions:

**RQ1:** What is the distribution over time of the studies published in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?

**RQ2:** What are the commonly used EQA mechanisms reported in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?

**RQ3:** How effective are the EQA mechanisms indicated in the studies published in the past two decades in journals indexed by selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?
RQ4: What challenges are faced in using EQA mechanisms indicated in the studies published in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?

Method
The Manuscript Selection Process
In this study, various methods were used by the researchers to select several articles from important journals drawn from Google web, Education Resource Information Centre (ERIC), JSTOR, and Google Scholar regarding the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning. In addition, a few theses and dissertations were also identified and reviewed from the Abstracts International Database (AID). This selection was done with the use of advanced search process where terms like ‘EQA in higher education’ or ‘quality of teaching and learning in HE’ were employed. At the beginning, over 127 articles were reviewed; but with the use of some inclusion and exclusion criteria, only 69 articles were finally found relevant. The researchers thus analyzed and coded all selected articles basing on the research questions RQ1 to RQ3 using the content scrutiny technique of data analysis.

The Data Coding and Analysis Process
The researchers analyzed and coded all the articles basing on the different research questions. For RQ1, the researchers looked for the distribution of articles published over time in the selected data-bases that examined the efficacy of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education. For RQ2, the researchers analyzed the common EQA mechanisms that were reported in articles indexed in selected data-bases which examined the efficacy of using EQA mechanisms in higher education. In this process, the researchers considered the type of EQA mechanisms, the publication year, and the common EQA mechanisms. To determine the effectiveness and challenges of EQA mechanisms, RQ3 and RQ4 were analyzed by reviewing all the results/findings, discussion, and conclusion section from the read 69 articles. Thereafter, code-words such as e (for effectiveness) and c (for challenges) were used to differentiate between the effectiveness and challenges of EQA mechanisms, respectively. Overall, the research data were analyzed with the use of the content analysis technique.

3. Results and Discussion
RQ1: What is the distribution over time of the studies published in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?

The results showing the number of published articles that reported on the use of different EQA mechanisms for regulating the quality of teaching and learning are presented in Figure 1.
Fig 1. Number of Articles Published by Year

First, Figure 1 shows that the number of studies that looked at the different EQA mechanisms steadily increased from 2008 up to 2018. This might have happened as result of what Lui, Tan and Meng (2015) observed that by 1980s, most countries had peaked their interest in higher education quality – thereby compelling them to put in place measures on how to improve their quality of teaching and learning. For that matter, the use of EQA mechanisms was seen as a solution to the problem of declining quality of teaching and learning in HEIs. Second, the results in Figure 1 also indicate that research on EQA mechanisms published in the selected data-bases steadily increased from 7 percent in 2008 to 11 percent by 2018. This could have been due to the increase in the demand for quality higher education, world over. In addition, the use of EQA mechanisms has also dramatically increased during the last 10 years. This might mean that similar levels of interest in researching in EQA mechanisms may continue after 2018 - especially in developing countries where quality assurance agencies are still younger - but whose applicability are rapidly increasing.

RQ2: What are the commonly used EQA mechanisms reported in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?

The second objective of this review was to establish the most commonly used EQA mechanisms reported in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases. The results on RQ2 are presented in Figure 2.
According to the results, accreditation (27%) is the most commonly reported EQA mechanism used in ensuring the quality of teaching and learning in higher education. This was followed by quality audits (22%), institutional assessment (13%), and accountability (8%). The least commonly used EQA mechanisms reported in the published articles were: supervision (7%) and standard checking (7%), quality improvement (6%); and finally, professional certification (6%). These results showed that there are several mechanisms that can be used for regulating the quality of teaching and learning in higher education. However, the results indicate that more studies have been carried out on some EQA mechanisms than others; thus, pointing out the areas for further research in future.

**RQ3:** How effective are the EQA mechanisms indicated in the studies published in the past two decades in journals indexed by selected data-bases that examined the efficacy and challenges of using EQA mechanisms to ensure the quality of teaching and learning in higher education?

The third objective of this review was to establish the effectiveness of the EQA mechanisms as reported in the published articles that were reviewed. The results for RQ3 are presented in Table 1.

Table 1. The effectiveness of EQA mechanisms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inductive Categories</th>
<th>Sub-categories</th>
<th>(f)</th>
<th>Sample Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EQAMs</td>
<td>Enhancing quality of education in HEIs</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Demirel,2016; Rios,2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enhancing quality of teaching and learning in HEIs</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Guangli &amp; Zhou,2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enhances public accountability</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Guangli &amp; Zhou,2016; Rios,2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improves student’s competency through professional certification</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Sywelem &amp; Witte, 2009; Garfolo &amp; L’Huillier, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality management and administration in HEIs</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Ramirez, 2013; Anaam et al., 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enhances Planning and Resource allocation</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Basira et al., 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improves quality of the programs</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Gama &amp; Vega, 2017; Singh, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quality working environment</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Demirel, 2016; Tam, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Saves time through the use of ICT</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Eaton, 2012; Gama &amp; Vega, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Accelerates countries productivity</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Sywelem &amp; Witte, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transforms HEIs through international accreditation</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Harvey, 2007; Basira et al., 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in Table 1 indicate the effectiveness of different EQA mechanisms in higher education. A total of 29 studies out of the 69 reviewed articles reported that EQA mechanisms are effective in enhancing the quality of
higher education in general. However, 23 articles indicated that EQA enhances the quality of teaching and learning, while 19 articles reported that EQA improves on public accountability in HEIs. In addition, 16 studies reported that EQA mechanisms effectively enhance student’s competency through professional certification, whereas 14 studies indicated that EQA mechanisms are effective in enhancing the quality of management and administration in higher education. Besides, 11 studies indicated that EQA effectively enhances planning and resource allocation, while eight studies indicated that EQA effectively improves on the quality of programs offered in HEIs, and five studies indicated that EQA enhances the quality of working environment. Finally, the results in Table 1 show that four studies indicated that the use of EQA mechanisms saves time by using ICT; while four studies indicated that it accelerates a country’s productivity; and lastly, three studies indicated that EQA mechanisms can effectively transform HEIs through international accreditation. Again, these results indicate that different EQA mechanisms have different effectiveness in higher education. However, the effectiveness of EQA mechanisms on certain variables in higher education have not yet been fully established; thereby, indicating areas for further research in future.

**RQ3**: What challenges are faced in using EQA mechanisms in higher education indicated in the studies published in the past two decades in journals indexed in selected data-bases?

Finally, this review was aimed at establishing the challenges that are faced in using EQA mechanisms in higher education. The results on RQ4 are presented in Table 2.

**Table 2: Challenges faced in using EQA Mechanisms in Higher Education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>Sample Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Institutional autonomy</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Thi Pham, 2018; Eaton &amp; Judith, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of international accrediting agencies</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Rios, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ineffective quality assurance agencies</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Jeanek et al, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited infrastructure and facilities</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Lui &amp; Yu, 2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate information system</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Hart et al, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of skilled manpower</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Jeanek et al, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inconsistent curricula in HEI’s</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Jeanek, 2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in Table 2 show the number of studies that have reported on the challenges that are faced in using the different EQA mechanisms in higher education. Lack of institutional autonomy was the most reported challenge faced (e.g. Thi Pham, 2018; Eaton & Judith, 2010). This was followed by lack of credible international accrediting agencies (Rios, 2015), ineffective quality assurance agencies (Jeanek et al., 2018), and limited infrastructure facilities (Lui & Yu, 2014). In addition, there were problems of lack of skilled manpower (Jeanek et al., 2018), inadequate information system (Hart, et al., 2017), and inconsistent curriculum (Jeanek, et al., 2018). These results therefore point out the challenges that must be addressed if the EQA mechanisms have to be effective in enhancing the quality of teaching and learning in higher education.

**Conclusion**

Based on the reviewed studies, it can concluded that scholars contradict each other on the effectiveness and challenges of EQA mechanisms in higher education. For example, while some studies state that EQA mechanisms transform HEIs through international accreditation (e.g. Harvey, 2007), others report that, there is lack of international accrediting agencies (e.g. Jeanek et al. 2018). Similarly, the top most challenge in EQA mechanisms was reported as lack of institutional autonomy in HEIs. However, we believe that this challenge is relatively minor and that they should not significantly prohibit the use of EQA mechanisms in HEIs. Therefore,
we note that EQA mechanisms offer a variety of advantages that range from improving the quality of higher education, enhancing the quality of teaching and learning as well as accountability in HEIs, among others. Future researchers should use and analyze other relevant data-bases; for examples: Sage, Emerald, Tylor & Francis, and Elsevier in order to broaden our understanding of the effectiveness of EQA mechanisms in HEIs. In addition, more research should be focused on understanding the use of EQA mechanisms in improving the overall quality of higher education. Finally, regarding the effectiveness of EQA agencies, attempts should be made to investigate the factors that inhibit their effectiveness in the context of developing nations.

**Limitation of the Study**

Various criteria were used to select research articles in the reviewed studies whereby studies only published in Google Scholar, ERIC, and JSTOR were selected and reviewed. This was because it was impossible to review studies in other data-bases which were costly to access. In this systematic review, only the document-type of articles were selected and reviewed. In these sense, it is recommended for the future researchers to use and analyze other relevant data-bases like Sage, Emerald, and Elsevier. This will broaden our understanding of the effectiveness of EQA mechanisms in HEIs.

**Reference**


Assessment of the Working Environment on Teachers’ Performance in Uganda

George Mukose & Proscovia Namubiru Ssentamu
Uganda Management Institute
Corresponding E-Mail: gomuse12@gmail.com

Abstract
The primary school level forms the basic foundation of the education system in Uganda, yet teachers operate in a pathetic working environment that affects their performance. This paper looks at three dimensions of the working environment namely: housing, communication and electricity. The main objective is to assess how the working environment affects the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda. To critically assess this phenomenon, the following objectives guided this study: to establish how housing affects the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda, to find out how communication affects the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda and to investigate the extent to which the availability of electricity influences the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda. The writer adopted the explanatory research design and made use of both primary and secondary data which was analyzed through content analysis. The study found that the environment under which teachers operate is pathetic, hence, poor performance.

Key words: Working Environment, Universal Primary Education, Teachers and Teachers’ Performance

Introduction
Once highly respectable and coveted, teaching has been relegated to the least desired professions, the world over. Teaching used to be a high social function which compelled society to confer upon it a great status. Today, it appears that although teaching is the most important profession, it is least recognised in a social sense and the worst paid (Jan, 2015). Jan argues that teaching is among the least remunerated yet more demanding job. To make it worse, majority of the primary schools are located in remote areas with no access to favourable social amenities like communication, transport, clean water, housing and accommodation. The division within the ranks of the teaching profession undermines their bargaining power and collective articulation of interests rendering them vulnerable to least recognition by governments, hence, low pay. Jacques Barzun argues that teaching is not a lost art, but the regard for it is a lost tradition (Douglas, King and Balls, 2011). Despite heavy investment in the sector, the quality of education continues to deteriorate due poor performance of teachers resulting from the unfavourable environment under which they operate. This study intends to assess the influence of working conditions on teachers’ performance in primary schools in Uganda.

Statement of the Problem
Primary school teachers in Uganda operate under pathetic conditions. Most of the schools are located in remote areas with 2,997, 2,461 and 1,221 rural, peri-urban and urban respectively (Education Statistical Abstract, 2015). Access to clean water, housing, electricity, medical facilities communication and transport is a big challenge. Buhai, Cottini and Nielsen (2008), assert that improving the general work environment in labour policy debates is a major focus throughout the industrialized countries. In Uganda, priority is given to infrastructure rather than education that has direct impact on the needs of the people. The total national education expenditure increased from 0.9 percent of GDP in 2001 to 2.1 percent of GDP in 2009 (Global Partnerships in Education, 2014). Despite the increasing budget allocations for the education sector over the years, there has not been significant improvement in the working environment of primary school teachers in Uganda. For instance, there were 26,926 permanent houses with a deficit of 80,896 units and 44.7% of primary schools are 20 km and above from the DEOs office (Education Abstract, 2014). This means that the majority of teachers are not accommodated at the schools hence have to walk long distances. Access to electricity in rural areas, where 84 per cent of the population
lives, is only 5 to 7 percent, and the situation is the same for the schools located in these areas (Stockmayer et al 2016). The implication here is that the majority of teachers do not have access to electricity which makes it difficult for them to prepare adequately for their work, hence poor performance. If this situation is not averted, the teachers will remain disgruntled and will continue to perform poorly, consequently affecting the quality of education in Uganda.

The purpose of this study is to assess how the working environment affects the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda. To critically assess this phenomenon, the following objectives guided this study: to establish how housing affects the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda, to find out how transport and communication affect the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda and to investigate the extent to which the availability of electricity influences the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda.

Basing on the above objectives, the following questions were used: How does housing affect the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda? How does communication affect the performance of teachers in Uganda? How does the availability of electricity influence the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda? The research findings will greatly influence policy makers to redirect government programs like School Facilities Grant (SFG) to remote and hard-to-reach areas. It will stimulate the School Management Committees (SMCs) and the local communities to play a significant role in mobilizing resources in order to improve the working environment of their teachers for better performance.


**Theoretical and Conceptual Review**

This study is underpinned by Herzberg’s theory, sometimes referred to as the dual or two-factor theory. The theory was propounded by an American psychologist known as Frederick Herzberg in the 1950s, who theorized that job satisfaction and job dissatisfaction act independently of each other. He set out to determine the effect of attitude on motivation by asking his respondents about what they felt good or bad about their jobs. His findings have had great influence on both practical and theoretical influence on attitudes towards administration. Herzberg concluded that job satisfaction and job dissatisfaction are not opposites, meaning that adding factors of satisfaction will not eliminate dissatisfaction and at the same time finding solutions to job dissatisfaction does not create job satisfaction.

This theory states that there are factors that cause job satisfaction and those that cause job dissatisfaction at work places. In other words, factors that cause job satisfaction are completely different from those which cause job dissatisfaction. Those connected with job dissatisfaction are referred to as 'hygiene factors’ while the ones associated with satisfaction are called ‘job enrichment’ factors. According to Herzberg, the work that one considers to be more significant leads to job satisfaction (Nakhate, 2016). Job satisfaction factors include: growth, recognition, work itself, achievement and advancement, among others. On the other hand, factors
associated with dissatisfaction include: status, relation with workmates and supervisors, salary, supervision, company policies and security. In essence, if managers want to motivate employees, they need to first do things that annoy them at the work place and ensure fair treatment and respect for all. Thereafter, managers need to devise means of providing opportunities for growth with their ranks and encourage employee achievement and rewarding it wherever it is found.

The validity of Herzberg’s theory of motivation was empirically tested by using data obtained from foodservice soldiers and logistics officers serving in the Korean Army foodservice operation (Hyun, 2009). The Theory is supported by considerable empirical data and is included in other research that is supportive of the original hypothesis. It recognizes that motivation comes from within the individual as opposed to external factors. The theory provides practical solutions to organizational problems. Among the key assumptions of the theory are: a strong correlation between job satisfaction and productivity, and absence of relationship between job satisfaction and dissatisfaction. This means that eliminating causes of dissatisfaction does not necessarily mean that satisfaction will be created.

The theory applies to this study in that it seeks answers to questions like “what motivates people to work?”, “what do employees want in their jobs?”, “why do employees behave the way they do?”, and “how can employers improve the conditions of their employees to perform better?”. According to the authors of this paper, if a teacher has access to social amenities like housing, electricity, transport and communication, he/she will be motivated to perform better. The major argument is that teachers are able to plan, do research and prepare instructional materials if social amenities are in place. When this is done, teachers’ competences are improved, hence good performance. Bojadziev (2006), argues that motivation, is the intensity of desire to accomplish goals, perform tasks and achieve outcomes both for the individual and the organisation. Employees want good working relationships, they need to be talked to and need recognition and status. Arising out of the effort of the Uganda National Teachers’ Union (2017) and the outcomes thereof, it is evident that teachers are not recognized, when they are talked to they are told lies, hence diminishing their status. Kwasi and Amaoko (2011), assert that managers all over the world are compelled to motivate their employees in order to get the best out of them and to stay competitive. This is not the case for teachers because their working environment, for example in Uganda continues to deteriorate every year. Despite the fact that teachers’ pay has been revised upwards, it does not necessarily occur that this will improve their performance without addressing the hygiene factors.

Herzberg’s theory is criticized because it does not take into account the fact that when things are going on well within an organization, employees tend to look at the things they enjoy about their jobs yet when the reserve is true, the blame goes to the factors external to the organization. Another criticism of the theory is that it does not consider individual personalities to motivation and it assumes that there is a relationship between job satisfaction and productivity. However, the current research did not cover productivity. This assumption does not hold practical relevance because different people perceive things differently and will be motivated differently. On the other hand, the theory does not provide a motivational value for each motivator. The theory’s reliability is uncertain because it depends on raters who may not analyse the responses correctly, however, despite its limitations, the Herzberg’s two-factor theory suits and adequately informs this study.

According to Olukunle (2015), working environment refers to the setting, situations, conditions and circumstances under which people operate. This study conceptualises this variable in terms of access to social amenities, specifically housing, electricity, transport and communication. Performance is what an organization hires one to do and to do it well (Campbell et al, 1993, p. 19). This variable has three dimensions namely:
knowledge and competence, creation of a conducive learning environment and, ability to motivate and involve learners.

A Review of Related Literature

This section is divided into two major aspects, namely: working environment and teachers’ performance. Working environment is reviewed under three dimensions: housing, electricity and transport/communication. The dimensions under Teachers’ performance are: knowledge and Competence, creation of a conducive learning environment and, motivation and participation of learners.

Working Environment

In order to enable employees, perform according to expectation, managers need to give attention to the working environment and make comfortable. This will not only allow your employees to perform well but also grow the organization (Rizwan et. al, 2016). This principle cuts across all organizations whether private or public. Indeed, Crocher, et. al., (2013), assert that the International Labour Organisation (ILO) identified working environment and productivity as an area of critical importance. Chandrasekar (2011), agrees with them and complements that workplace environment impacts employee morale, productivity and engagements both positively and negatively. The literature review does not reveal much research done that shows the complexity of the relationship between working environment and performance.

This study considers housing, electricity, transport and communication as the basic facilities that enhance the performance of primary school teachers. Kumar (2015) asserts that access to social amenities enables the household to save forgone hours spent to arrange when these are not available in the day to day life. This is true because inspection reports (2016, 2017, 2018), reveal that many teachers do not plan adequately for classroom instruction in terms of schemes of work, lesson preparation which greatly affects their performance. The Uganda Education Statistics Abstract (2014) indicates that 2, 716 representing about 44% of the primary schools are located in the rural areas which, by far and large, do not have access to social amenities. We argue that poor communities pay more in absolute and relative terms and are denied the real subsidy which result into inequalities. This argument is well exemplified in the previously released primary leaving examination results which showed rural areas like Amuratar, Kamuli, Buyende among the worst ten performing districts in Uganda (UNEB Report, 2018).

Studies on students’ housing consistently reveal that higher institutions of learning are able to attract from different nationalities and backgrounds to pursue higher education (Kolawole and Boluwatife, 2016, Nimako & Bondinuba, 2013, Aluko, 2011,). If housing can play an influential role in students’ performance, then how much more can the same factor influence the performance of teachers who are at the center of academic excellence? In their study on the state of education in Nigeria, Meindinyo & Ikurite (2017), recommend that management of schools should try and provide housing to teachers within the school premises. Although the recommendation of the above authors is plausible and appropriate, the strategy proposed has not worked in Uganda. In instances where parents fail to contribute to the feeding of their children, it becomes very difficult for them to provide housing for the teachers. The role of providing teachers housing should be the responsibility of government especially in this era of Universal Primary Education. In his study on school facilities in South Central Region of Botswana, Mpho (2013), contends that accommodation is an issue that cannot be overlooked as it impacts on teachers’ performance and relations as they are made to share two-bed roomed houses. If sharing housing can affect the performance of teachers’, the case in Uganda is worse off because even what to share is not available. Most schools lack housing and where there is, it is uninhabitable (Lowe, 2006), therefore, teachers
either resort to hiring or commuting from their homes resulting into late coming and absenteeism, hence, poor performance (Uwezo Report, 2016). Teachers role in the provision of quality education need not be over emphasized, however, research has continually depicted them as the cause of the deteriorating quality due to a number of reasons including absenteeism (Sumra, 2001; Carr-Hill and Ndaličhako, 2005). Apparently, the missing link is relating absenteeism to lack of housing as well as poor transport and communication.

The major source of illumination for the majority of primary school teachers in Uganda is day-lighting, which source was used since time immemorial. Lisa (2002), argues that reduction in work absenteeism and better students’ health were associated with increases in day-lighting. However, this argument works on assumption that a worker is available during day which is different for the case of teachers who should prepare, preferably during the night ready to work during day. Use of modern methods of ICT equipment for both preparation and delivery of lessons is greatly hampered by lack of electricity in rural areas. Ekaslan and Effie (2011), assert that e-learning has advantages that transcend time and location constraints thereby increasing learner motivation, acquisition of skills, and enhances teacher training in the most cost effective way. However, they did not bring out the most important aspect of teacher performance in relation to the availability of electricity in classrooms and teachers’ residences. The absence of electricity for lighting in schools greatly reduces the teachers’ planning prospects which in turn affect their performance.

Transport and communication are critical in determining the performance of teachers. Nadeem, et. al (2011), contend that poor socio-economic condition of the area where the school is situated decreases teachers’ motivation, hence affecting performance. The missing link in this study is relating the school location to the means of transport and communication network especially in the rural areas. When he conducted a study on teacher incentives in Malawi, Kadzamira (2006), found out that teacher absenteeism was on the increase with 19.2 % in the rural areas, attributing it to the location of the schools. Like the case in Malawi, many teachers in Uganda are either absent or come late for duty due to long distances and poor means of transport. On the other hand, Umansky & Vegas (2007), assert that school-based management reforms reduced teacher absenteeism and increased the teacher working hours, however he does not relate it to the means of transport and communication, which is the pre-occupation of this study. In this 21st century, mobile communication is a motivating factor that influences performance of teachers. Rural areas where most schools are located have poor network and many teachers have challenges in communicating with their families and relatives. Rau, Gao, & Wu, (2006), assert that communication technology is supposed to be effective in encouraging interaction and improving learning. The point of departure from this argument is failure to relate the idea to the performance of teachers. Kubey, Lavin, & Barrows, (2006), in their study on internet use and collegiate found out that college students’ academic performance was affected due to use of internet. Although, teachers may be prone to misuse by chatting on face or WhatsApp, there is no link to performance of teachers.

The preliminary conclusion from the literature reviewed indicate that lack of access to social amenities, like housing, electricity, transport and communication constitute the major poor working environment which affect the performance of primary school teachers in various geographical contexts. However, the authors are interested in finding out whether this is also true in Uganda.

**Teachers’ Performance**

Proposals to use teachers’ performance incentives as the basis for school reforms has recently attracted considerable support from researchers and policy makers and the main message is that the best way to improve students’ performance is by instituting teachers’ performance initiatives (Lavy, 2001). This assertion is in the
right direction in that there is no way students’ performance can improve when the main actors who handle them are demotivated. It implies that if one wants his/her baby to feed well, one should ensure that he/she adequately provides for the baby sitter otherwise, the baby will be malnourished. The success of educational institutions depends on teachers; therefore, teachers’ performance is a fundamental concern (Khan et al., 2010).

Teachers’ competence is based on the knowledge of subject matter and how that knowledge is transmitted to the learners. Magano and Sembrano (2008) while studying the role of teacher efficacy and characteristics of teaching effectiveness argued that teachers’ general performance in teaching is influenced by several external and internal factors. The term competence has connotation of knowledge, skills and values that teachers must have in order to be successful. Birtschy, Kunzli and Meret, (2013), describe competences in the following ways: learning to know, learning to do, learning to live and learning to be. Looking at the competences from the learning point of view makes it even more difficult for a teacher who operates under poor working environment to get to that level. To develop knowledge and competences, teachers need an environment free of stress to allow them time for devotion to their professional preoccupation.

A conducive learning environment is a platform in school premises devoid of physical intimidation and emotional frustration which allows for free exchange of ideas (Hein, Koka & Hagger, 2015). According to Wilen et al. (2004), mutual respect is an indispensable ingredient in the recipe of learning. This means that both the teacher and learners must respect one another with a feeling of trust, safety and collaboration in the teaching learning process. In regard to this study, the classroom and the immediate surroundings form the learning environment. Inside the classroom, what constitutes a conducive learning environment may include: good relationship between the teacher and the learners, cleanliness, sitting arrangement, and display of instructional materials, among others. In his article “Classroom Environment Research: Progress and Possibilities”, Dorman (2002), asserts that students learning is significantly determined by a quality classroom environment. In Uganda, where infrastructure is characterized by dilapidated buildings and in some cases, no buildings at all, teachers’ performance is at stake worsened by lack of access to social amenities and housing. Although the two factors may seem distant, it becomes very difficult for one without electricity or good accommodation, for that matter, to devote time to creating a conducive learning environment.

Despite the importance assigned to participation in classroom, it has been repeatedly reported that most students remain passive in class (Mustapha, Rahman & Yunus, 2010). Tatar (2005) contends that active classroom participation plays an important role in the success of education and students’ personal development. The role of teachers in this respect needs not to be over-emphasized. This depends on so many factors both external and internal, however, the personal character and pedagogical know how, on part of the teacher, is very critical. On the contrary, many studies have consistently shown other factors including environment, communication, class size and students’ emotions, (Monks & Schmidt, 2010, Fassinger, 2002, Howard and Baird, 2000). In the regard to this study, the author acknowledges the findings of other studies, however, the working environment in terms of access to social amenities as well as housing and accommodation play a great role in giving the teacher comfort and ample time to prepare for tasks.

In conclusion, the literature review does not indicate a clear relationship between working environment and teachers’ performance. However, it is anticipated that when teachers have access to social amenities, their performance in terms of knowledge and competences, creation of conducive learning environment as well as motivation and involvement of learners is easily realized, hence, this study.
Methodology

An explanatory study design was used to provide the answers to the basic questions surrounding the phenomenon (Bhatacherjee, 2012). It was also descriptive because the phenomenon in the working environment and its impact on teachers’ performance are known and the author described them more clearly by offering a profile of the factors (Sekaran, 2003). The study was conducted in Kamuli because it is representative of up country districts with hard-to-reach schools. Besides, according to the NAPE Report (2017), Kamuli is one of the worst performing in the achievement of learners in early grade reading. A total of 139 respondents were selected from 17 schools (17 chairpersons of School Management Committees, 17 head teachers, 51 classroom teachers and 51 learners). One school was identified per sub county (15) and one per each division of Kamuli Municipal Council. Other respondents interviewed included The Director, Basic and Secondary Education, the Commissioner Preprimary and Primary Education as well as the district Inspector of schools. The former and the Chairpersons of School Management Committees (SMC) and head teachers were identified by use of purposive sampling (Krejcie and Morgan, 1970) while the teachers and learners were identified by use of proportionate stratified random sampling (Sekaran, 2003). 3 teachers and 3 learners were per school from the 3 strata of lower, middle and upper primary. Primary data was obtained through conducting interviews and focus-group discussions. Secondary data was collected by use of documentary review in terms of reports, statistical abstracts as well as authors’ observations and experiences earned over time both in the education sector.

According to Hussey (1997), specific data collection methods are bound up with the different methods of investigation and the kind of study at stake. The authors employed primary and secondary sources of data as well as their experiences in the field of study. Qualitative data analysis was used to describe the trends in patterns that exist between the information gathered (Amin, 2005). The researchers employed the qualitative approach in order to explain how the working environment impacts on the performance of primary school teachers. Documentary review was conducted by looking at what other scholars have written as well as use of records at the Ministry of Education and Sports. Being an employee of the Uganda Ministry of Education and the Sports, one of the researcher took advantage of personal experience and observations made during the entire period of service at village, district and national levels.

Key Findings and Discussions

The purpose of this study was to assess the impact of the working environment on teachers’ performance. Findings from interviews, focused group discussions, review of literature and observations are presented and discussed under two headings: working environment and teachers’ performance.

Working Environment

Findings from interviews, literature review and observations indicate that poor working environment is a major factor affecting the performance of primary school teachers in Uganda. According to Chandrasekar (2011), the workplace environment impacts employee morale, productivity and engagement both negatively and positively. This is true because if the workplace environment is good, it means that performance will be good and the reverse of this is true. If one wants his/her cow to produce a high yield of diary, then he/she has to ensure that the cow is well looked after. The working environment for primary school teachers in Kamuli district is characterized by either dilapidated or no buildings, poor housing, transport and communication as well as lack of electricity. If one wants his/her employees to perform as required, he/she has to provide a little attention to make the environment more comfortable, it will not only help your employee to perform well but also grow the organization (Rizwan et. al., 2016).
Housing

In terms of housing, there were a total of 39,479 teacher house stock 26,926 of which were permanent (Statistical Abstract, 2014). This means that a total of 12,553 houses are temporary structures. The issue of temporary structures in itself is a demotivator since many of these houses are not fit for human habitation. Nwankwo (1982), argues that the problem of what to do makes teachers work hard for the interest of the school and in their own interest. Writing about motivation, Meindinyo and Ikurite (2017), assert that effective motivation demands that, on one hand the teachers be engineered to devote themselves to achieving educational objectives, on the other hand, the individual teacher’s goal and demands be met. This is because, for instance, if teachers’ accommodation needs are not met; late coming absenteeism and missing of lessons would be prevalent. This means that the performance of the teachers will be so low. Effective teaching involves planning, creation of a conducive learning environment and involvement of learners during the teaching learning processes. Shanthakumary (2012) found out that there is a strong relationship between motivation and achievement. It means that if the working environment is favourable teachers can be motivated to work hard and improve their performance.

Uwezo Uganda, (2012), indicates that one out of ten teachers was absent, visits to the schools by the researcher showed a much worse situation. Out of the ten schools visited with a total of 117 teachers, 47 teachers were absent from duty representing 40.1% of the absentees. In one of the schools, half of the teachers were absent. In response to the challenges that cause absenteeism, 34 teachers indicated lack of housing and means of transport. Where there is no accommodation at school, teachers walk long distances resulting in late coming or absenteeism. Although the commissioner pre-primary and primary education outlined efforts by government to improve the working conditions which included housing, the majority of teachers are not accommodated at schools. The Education Abstract (2013), shows that there were 42,114 structures for teachers’ accommodation with a deficit of 89,659. This exemplifies the magnitude of housing challenge in primary education which can explain the poor performance country wide. Asked about the housing situation in Kamuli, the District inspector of schools alluded to the fact that it is still a big challenge in Kamuli because the SFG allocation per year is small yet a unit accommodates a maximum of 4 teachers. In essence, if teachers are not accommodated at schools and they lack transport, it becomes very difficult for them to adequately prepare for duty, hence, poor performance.

Findings from interviews revealed the complexity teachers face working in schools without accommodation. One of the head teachers confessed that administering teachers who reside at their homes is very difficult especially when it comes to punctuality. 5 out of the 17 schools had no accommodation for teachers. Asked what SMCs are doing to alleviate the problem, 15 out the 17 chairpersons said it is very difficult to mobilise resources from parents because they expect government to put up infrastructure. In his study on the roles and functions of SMCs, Kumar (2015) assert that education without the active participation of the community is a one-sided activity. However, the director basic and secondary education emphasized that any activity that involves increase in the cost of education is against government’s intention to relieve parents of burden of fees.

Electricity

In terms of electrification, 84% of the primary schools are not connected to the grid, hence, have no access to hydro-electric power (Education Abstract, 2013). This situation does not allow the teachers to do a lot of reading and research to improve on their and competences. This kind of work environment means that a teacher has to rely on day lighting or use of candles which does not only affect the planning but also the health of the teachers, hence, poor performance.
Out of 1,512 schools in Busoga region, where Kamuli District is located, only 220 were connected to the national grid, and 84% of the entire schools in Uganda fall under the same category (Education Abstract, 2013). None of the 17 schools visited in Kamuli had electricity. Teachers who were found without schemes of work and lesson plans cited lack of electricity and long distances as being the cause for their failure. What is very interesting is that Busoga region has a hydro-electric power station but rural electrification to serve the remote schools is nonexistent. When asked about the source of lighting used in preparation for teaching, teachers said that they basically do it during day and use candles at night. 69 (80.73%) teachers out 117 did not have lesson plans and interaction with them during the interviews indicated that lack of lighting affected their preparation. During the interviews, 9 out 17 head teachers showed reservation in demanding lessons plans and schemes of work from teachers. The Director, Basic and Secondary Education explained that government is making efforts to give solar panels to schools; however, extending this service to teachers’ houses is still a big challenge due to inadequate resources.

Transport and Communication

Out of the 117 teachers in the 17 schools sampled, 7 had motor cycles, 36 had bicycles and the rest were going to school on foot. Besides, the road network is poor and it was difficult to use motor-cycles and bicycles especially during the rainy seasons. Interviews with head teachers indicated that there was a big challenge with management of teachers especially with attendance and late coming. Out of the total number of 47 (54.99%) teachers who were absent, whereabouts of 21 (24.57%), were not known by the head teachers. This raised the concern about communication in terms of network connectivity. Although 108 (92.3%) teachers had mobile phones, network connectivity was a major challenge. Out of the ten schools visited, none had access to effective MTN and Celtel networks. Use of phones was limited to calls since there was no evidence of using them in lesson preparation. Teachers who live far from their homes expressed concern about anxiety to hear from their family members. This forced some of them to leave school early and come late in the week.

In summary, the findings reveal that lack of adequate housing, electricity, poor transport and communication are major contributors to poor performance of primary school teachers in Kamuli district and likely factors in Uganda in general.

Conclusions

Basing on the findings in regard to the above questions, the following conclusions and recommendations are made. A poor working environment is a stress factor which robs employees of the comfort and enjoyment of their jobs limiting the time for concentration, hence, poor performance. Anandasayananna and Subramanian (2013), assert that teachers under stress cannot perform well and that when job satisfaction is decreased, they show behaviours like absenteeism and violence at work places. The study found that lack of housing for teachers in Kamuli is the major cause of absenteeism and late coming. It was also found out that long distances traversed by teachers affect the lesson preparation and other related routines like marking of pupils books, remedial lessons and co-curricular activities among others. It was also discovered that head teachers fail to obtain information about any teacher in case of failure to attend school. Therefore, it can be concluded that provision of housing to teachers within the school premises mitigates absenteeism and facilitates punctuality, hence, improved performance.

Interviews with teachers and observations and review of records revealed lack of preparation in terms of lessons and schemes of work. Teachers indicated lack reliable lighting the major cause of their undoing since most of them relied on lamps and candles. The percentage of teachers found without lesson plans stood at 80.73%. A
teacher who is prepared is well on his /her to a successful instructional experience and their commitment to this should be facilitated by provision of utilities like electricity, among others. The study therefore, concluded the lack of electricity is one the major contributors to poor performance. Findings of this study indicate that teachers who reside a distance away from their schools had challenges in attendance to their duties. Basic means of transport, for instance, bicycles and motor-cycles can greatly improve on the punctuality of teachers. It was also found out that means of communication in terms of mobile telephones contribute to the improvement of teachers’ performance. In case of failure to attend, a teacher is able to communicate so that arrangements can be made to stand in for him/her. It is concluded that lack of transport and poor communication leads to absenteeism, late coming and failure to deliver lesson, hence, poor performance.

Arising out of the findings, the following recommendations are suggested: (1) Since most primary schools are located in rural areas, the School Facilities Grant (SFG) should be focused and prioritized housing units for the hard-to-reach areas. It is also recommended that chief Administrative Officers together with District Education Officers explore the possibility of posting teachers within the vicinity of their home areas, since it has become increasingly difficult to give hard-to-reach allowances. (2) The study recommends that Ministry of Education and Sports includes the solar component on housing units under the School Facilities Grant. It is also recommended that the SMCs together with PTAs mobilise the communities to provide alternative means better lighting equipment like lamps and steamers or pressure lamps. (3) The study recommends that government revises and implements the hard-to-reach allowances. Government should extend alternative loan facilities through teachers SACCOs for teacher to acquire bicycles of motor-cycles. In a nutshell, it is imperative that policy makers and management bodies ensure provision of access to basic social amenities like housing, electricity, transport and communication in order to improve teachers’ performance.

References
Anadasayanan S. and Subramanian V.A (2013), “Effect of Stress on Teachers Performance with Special Reference to Jaffna District Schools” A Paper Presented at the International Conference, University of Sairam

Carr-Hill R. and Ndalichako J. (2005), Tanzania Education Sector Situation Analysis Dar as Salaam, Economic and Social Research Foundation.


Role of Universities in Human Capital Development, Policy Development and Management

Gabriel Juma Okumu & Prof. Simmy M. Marwa, PhD
Dedan Kimathi University of Technology

Corresponding E-mail: gjuma@publicservice.go.ke / smmarwa@gmail.com

Abstract
This paper reports on a section of primary data analyzed from a study that evaluated Human Capital Development (HCD) and economic growth in Kenya. The study examined the role played by HCD in the economic development of Kenya between 2002 and 2014 by interrogating the development models adopted by South Korea and Singapore as a benchmark to determine the gaps in the model adopted by Kenya. The paper therefore interrogates the role of Universities in Human Capital Development in Kenya and identifies areas of improvement for Kenya’s education system. Primary data was collected using structured questionnaire. The questionnaires were administered using the drop and pick method and the 61.6% response rate was found to be satisfactory. Findings indicated that knowledge is a significant factor for economic development in the 21st century. Findings further revealed that university education plays a great and important role in a country’s economic growth by providing highly competent and well-trained workforce for industrialization and modernization. Findings further revealed that universities play an important role of supporting research, facilitating innovation and job creation. A framework on the role of universities in Human Capital Development is developed and appropriate policy and managerial recommendations for improving the role of Universities in HCD and policy development are discussed. The paper recommends that more resources be invested to enable universities conduct meaningful research. The paper further calls for strengthening of university-industry linkages.

Key words: Human Capital Development, Human Capital, Skilled Manpower, Economic Growth, University Education

Introduction

The view that education is a capital good is engrained in the concept of human capital that confers high premium to human skills as a factor of production in the process of development. Education is regarded by most scholars as a core component of Human Capital Development and a tool for transforming the society. The notion that tertiary education played an insignificant role in promoting poverty alleviation made some scholars to regard primary and secondary education as contributing to economic development because of the high rate of return on investment. Further, the 2000 Dakar summit on “Education for All” rooted for primary education as a driver of several social welfare while ignoring university education (Odhiambo, 2018). Consequently, many governments in Africa and donors gave priority to funding primary and secondary education while ignoring available empirical evidence that university education influences economic growth and poverty eradication. While some scholars have found tertiary education to significantly contribute to economic growth by enhancing individual ability to be technologically innovative (Omondi, 2010); others such as Uetela (2017) hold the view that investment in university education places a heavy the burden on African countries. Therefore, according to the former, investment in university education leads to economic growth. As such, universities are believed to play an important role in human capital development, policy development and management.

Statement of the Problem

Researchers, the world over, are divided on the role of university education in economic growth. While some attribute a direct linkage between university education and economic development, others are skeptical of such a direct correlation. In Kenya, the discourse on the role of university education in human capital development has continued for a while. There has been a lot of debate on the role of university education in economic growth
and poverty eradication. This view is supported by Odhiambo (2010) who avers that the contribution of university education to a country’s development is a debate that has attracted growing attention in recent years. While some studies hold the view that higher education promotes economic growth, others conclude that the relationship is weak. In support of this, Kruss et al. (2015) argues that university education has not been a priority for global policy and research funding in recent years. Further, like many other developing countries, Kenya has not reaped the full potential that comes with education because unemployment, which stands at 40%, remains the country’s most persistent challenge (Kinoti, 2016; McEnrue, 2011; Omolo, 2012). Odhiambo (2011) attribute the high unemployment rate to the universities producing graduates who are ill-equipped and therefore unable to effectively compete in the global economy. The mismatch between university programmes and the labour market remains a serious issue for policy makers and society. The paper therefore examined the role of universities in human capital development, policy development and economic growth in Kenya. The paper aims to spark further discussion on the contribution of university education to human capital development and economic growth in Kenya.

**Literature Review**

**Human Capital Development**

Various scholars such as Adelakun (2011), Akinbode (2011), Asaju, Kajang & Anyio (2013) and Ayanda & Sani (2010) have singled out Human capital as the most significant source of growth in productivity and economic growth. They attribute quality education to be the main factor for forming and developing the human capital (Tanzharikova, 2012). On the other hand, Olugbenga & Omulera (2014) maintain that the notion of education as a capital good is rooted in the concept of human capital. According to them, Human Capital Development attaches a high premium to human skills as a factor of production in the development process. They therefore vouch for establishment of institutions that permit and encourage that participation. They conclude that without adequate human capital development there can be no significant economic growth in any country. Thus, large education gaps portend negative consequences (World Bank, 2010).

Similarly, Olaseni & Alade (2012) argue that qualitative education remains the vehicle for national transformation in human history and that no nation has ever risen above her investment in education. This view is further supported by Tanzharikova (2012) who identifies human capital as the most productive and capable of providing modern competitive advantage. According to him, higher education serves as a basis for formation of innovative human resources oriented to intellectual, hi-technology, productive and creative activities. This is because education not only provides the knowledge, abilities and skills but also generates conditions for obtaining competitive advantage and other externalities. However, qualified human capital remains scarce in Sub-Saharan Africa compared to the continent’s development needs (Kagondu, 2015). The lack of qualified human capital has hindered growth and undermined the foundation for sustainable development.

Human capital development is therefore an important requirement for a country’s socio-economic transformation (Denison, 1962; Shultz, 1961). Research has established that investment in education is central to economic growth (Becker, 1979; Denison, 1962; Nafukho et al., 2004) and that the rate of economic growth is associated with accumulation of human capital. In support of this, Carnoy (2006) as cited in Kagondu, (2015) avers that sustainable economic growth depends on the “high-end” of higher education (university education) to generate the necessary human capital and research.
Kenya’s Vision 2030 recognizes that an educated and well trained labour force is essential for the country’s socio-economic development. The Vision seeks to turn the country into a knowledge-led economy where creation, adaptation and use of knowledge remain critical factors for rapid economic growth (GOK, 2007 as cited in Kagondu, 2015). The Vision further emphasizes the contribution of university education to the developmental aspirations of the country (Chege, 2015). For the Vision to be realized the country will need to have a highly skilled workforce (Wakiaga, 2015 as cited in The Standard, Friday 29th May 2015).

**Human Capital Theory**

The concept of Human Capital Theory has dominated the economics, policy and public understanding of relations between education and work since the 1960s, (Marginson, 2017). The theory was first used by the classical economists like Alfred Marshal and Adam Smith. Other proponents of this theory include Schultz (1961), Becker (1964) and Denison (1962). According to them, human capital is the stock of economically productive human capabilities, which is molded by combining innate abilities with investments in human beings. Additionally, organizations such as the World Bank, Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), United Nations, European Union; and countries like United States, United Kingdom, Japan, and Singapore (Spring, 1998) also support the theory.

According to the theory, education and training raises workers’ productivity by imparting useful knowledge, skills and competencies. The theory further views schooling and training as investment in skills and competencies; and rests on the assumption that formal education is highly instrumental and necessary to improve the productive capacity of a population (Adelakun, 2011). The theory therefore considers investment in human beings as the most valuable of all capital as it creates in the labour force the skill-base, which is indispensable for economic growth. Nzokurum & Awah (2017) identify the investment to include expenditures on education, on-the-job-training, health and nutrition.

The theory therefore advocates for a continuous increase in the amount of investment in human capital through education and singles out education and training as being significant to participation in the new global economic order (Marginson, 2017; Nzokurum & Awah, 2017; Woodhall, 1997). Becker (1964) supports this view by arguing that training is an important component of human capital investment and that employment rates increase with the level of training (Becker, 1964).

Human Capital theorists believe that there is a positive correlation between education and earning power of workers (Dae-bong, 2009). Further, proponents of the theory such as Adelakun (2011), Becker (1964, 1994), Mincer (1974) and Owuze (2014) hold the view that education raises the marginal productivity of workers by imparting knowledge, skills and competencies leading to the organization’s competitive advantage. They conclude that an educated population is a productive population. Therefore, the expectation of return on investment guides individual’s decision on education and training (Dunford et al., 2001) and increased expenditure in education is believed to lead to improved economic productivity and economic growth. In support of this view, Diane (2004) argues that the theory considers human knowledge, skills, and abilities as production tools and education as a capital investment decision. Modern economists concur that in the new global economy, education and health care are significant if a country is to improve her human capital and increase economic output (Almendarez, 2013). The study adopted the Human Capital Theory Model as developed by Swanson.
University Education in South Korea and Singapore

The Korean government has pursued a policy for excellence in higher education. The government recognizes that university education is a critical component for creating a strong human capital base as well as an efficient national innovation system (Jeong-Kyu, 2011). Consequently, through the “Brain Korea 21” (BK 21) project elite research universities were established. The project, funded by the government, aimed at generating internationally competitive research universities and graduate programmes while enhancing regional-industry based universities (Kang, 2015). Leveraging on skilled graduates from these universities enabled the government of South Korea tap the potential of science and technology for its remarkable growth, making it the only country in the world that has transformed from a recipient of international aid to a donor country (https://www.konzacity.go.ke).

Similarly, in Singapore, the government has identified university education as an important component for sustainable national and economic development. Therefore, the government recognizes research, innovation and enterprise as the cornerstone of the country’s national strategy to develop a knowledge-based, innovation driven economy and society. The government has therefore developed the Research, Innovation and Enterprise (RIE) 2020 Framework that aspires to transform Singapore into a Smart Nation. Continued investment in research and innovation has made Singapore develop a strong scientific base (Prime Minister’s Office, 2016). This position is supported by Lee & Gopinathan (2008) who opine that knowledge based economy thrives on innovation and enterprise. The government therefore has adopted a binary system of higher education comprising of universities and polytechnics. In addition, the government, through the policy of purposive specialization, encouraged establishment of specialized universities. Through this policy, public universities concentrate their efforts and resources on maximizing the potential of their strengths and specialist discipline (Lee & Gopinathan, 2008).

University Education in Kenya

According to Olugbenga & Omolera (2014) higher education plays an important and increasing role in the development of human capital of a nation and therefore a precondition for production of highly competent experts. Since independence in 1963, university education in Kenya has witnessed exponential growth with public and private universities growing side by side (Otieno, 2013). From one national public university, the University of Nairobi established in 1970, one constituent college, Kenyatta University college established in 1972, and a single private university, United States International University, established in 1970; the university system has grown exponentially both in numbers and student enrolment. According to the Commission for University Education Kenya had a total of 74 universities as at November 2017. Of these, 31 were accredited public universities, 6 constituent colleges, 18 private chartered universities, 5 private constituent colleges and 14 universities that were operating with Letters of Interim Authority. However, this increased demand has not been matched with increased provision of resources and funding from the Government leading to a decline in quality over the last two decades (Odhiambo, 2018).

The Kenya Vision 2030 emphasizes the importance of universities in producing knowledge that is relevant to the industry, dissemination of knowledge and provision of technical support to industry (GOK, 2007; Otieno, 2013). Further, Otieno (2013) observes that many universities in Africa continue to struggle under the heavy burden of underfunding forcing these institutions to seek alternative means to finance their recurrent expenditures. Increased enrollment coupled with reduced funding from the state has led to a strain on the physical facilities including buildings, laboratories and libraries.
Methodology

The research was guided by a mixture of positivist and interpretivist research philosophy. Structured questionnaires and interview guide were used to collect primary data. The target population were the Human Resource Directors and other line/technical managers falling within policy makers and top management cadre staff in the civil service of Kenya. Stratified and simple random sampling techniques were adopted to realize the desired representation from all the groups of the population. Stratification was done by cadre and institution to ensure that both cadres, job groups and all institutions are proportionately represented in the sample. The study adopted stratified sampling technique because of the heterogeneity of the population given that the officers served in different institutions and at various cadres. The researcher also used purposive sampling techniques. The sample size guide developed by Krejcie & Morgan (1970) was applied to determine the sample size. It recommended a total sample size of 341 against the total target population of 3000 at 95% confidence level. Proportionately, this gave a sample size of 60 for top management and policy makers and 281 for management cadre.

Results and Discussions

Role of Universities in Human Capital Development

Findings established that education and training forms the backbone of HCD in a country. As such, universities are believed to play a significant role in HCD. Table 1.1 shows the rating of the various roles played by universities in HCD in Kenya.

Table 1.1: Suggested roles of Universities in HCD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Suggested role in HCD</th>
<th>No. of Responses</th>
<th>(Percentage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Building Human Capital</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>35.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training work force to equip with technical and vocational skills</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>26.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge impartation</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>21.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conducting research</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spur entrepreneurship</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurture talent and innovation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support STEM</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>123</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Majority (35.77%) of the respondents indicated that the main role of universities is to build human capital. Training the workforce and equipping them with technical and vocational skills was proposed by 26.83% of the respondents. This finding is supported by Jovan, et al. (2015) who argue that the core business for universities is the development of autonomous production and diffusion of public knowledge through research, teaching and innovation. The finding is further supported by Jones, et al. (2005) and Otieno (2013) who identify the two primary functions of universities in a knowledge based economy to be conducting research and training highly qualified personnel to meet the needs of the labour market. Additionally, the finding is supported by Hatakenaka, (2004) who argue that university education all over the world is not only valued for its link to economic development but also regarded as a major contributor to a country’s economic growth.

The institutions are also expected to spur entrepreneurship, nurture talent and innovation as well as support STEM as proposed by 4.07% and 1.63% of the respondents respectively. In support of this finding, Javan et al. (2015) opine that universities play an important role of facilitating innovation by providing space and investing equipment and facilities that are open to or shared with the local innovation community. This initiative enables
them to effectively accommodate the needs of the local innovation community. The finding is further supported by Muresan & Gogu (2010) who consider universities as active promoters of an innovation culture at regional and international level.

This finding is in tandem with findings by Marwa (2016) who opine that the key contribution of universities includes HCD; supporting research, innovation and job creation through nurturing start-ups; moving new ideas into the market place and securing seed money for new businesses; knowledge transfer and revitalizing communities through various corporate social responsibilities and initiatives. In support of this position, a study by Rockefeller Institute of Government (2010) in the USA singled out universities to be the ideal location for connecting knowledge creators with knowledge commercializers. The study further indicated that university education prepared the country’s workforce for the demands of economic change. In addition, El-Jardali et al. (2018) and Breznitz et al. (2012) identifies another emerging role of universities as fostering partnership with governments, engaging in projects with local communities and undertaking community outreach programmes to achieve societal impact.

Policy makers interviewed held similar views. They observed that university education served as an important enabler in attainment of Education for All (EFA), a global commitment geared towards ensuring that all children and the youth have access to quality education. This finding is further supported by Otieno (2013) who opine that universities contribute towards fostering lifelong learning. This finding therefore supports the exponential expansion of university education in Kenya in the last 10 years, from an enrollment of about 80,000 students in 2007 to 539,749 students in 2015 (Mukhwana, et al., 2016).

Additionally, Policy makers indicated that university education plays a significant role in the development, diffusion and dissemination of knowledge and expertise of the human skills that are necessary for development initiatives needed for sustainable societies and greener economies. This view is supported by Mhlanga (2008) who identifies another traditional role of university to be generation and dissemination of high-quality knowledge that contributes to the development of society.

In support of this finding, Bhowik et al. (2017) and El-Jardali et al. (2018) opine that universities, besides providing an invaluable source of expertise in research, also have a key role in educating the public and other sectors on the SDGs. This is because education and research are explicitly recognized in several SDGs and universities have a direct role in addressing them. The SDGs provide a unique opportunity for higher education institutions to demonstrate their willingness and capability of playing active and meaningful role in the development of their respective countries. However, Filho (2011) argues that awareness about sustainability is still confined to small circles of universities with slightly over 600 universities worldwide having committed themselves towards sustainability by signing international agreements and conventions. He attributes this to lack of institutional interest, limited resources or staff involvement.

The accumulation of fundamental knowledge and cross-fertilization of ideas across disciplines was identified as another role played by universities in HCD. This role makes academic researchers be well-placed to anticipate future trends and the dynamics of technological development. Additionally, universities are large employers, providing thousands of jobs in their locality and thereby creating opportunities for prosperity by contributing to regional growth, infrastructure development, investment and overall community well-being (Jovan et al., 2015).
Research has been identified as a core activity for universities and central to post-graduate training. The research output forms the basis for realization of National Development Goals. Investment in research and development is the fuel for innovation, and innovation drives economic growth. The more a country adequately funds R&D, the greater the dividends the country stands to reap in the future as learnt from the experiences in Singapore and South Korea. Heavy investment in research and development was a critical facilitator of human resource development in Korea’s industrialization. In support of this view, an overwhelming majority of respondents (100%) and majority of the policy makers interviewed felt that investment in research and development contributes significantly to economic growth of a country.

The research activities in universities represent an important bridge between universities and socio-economic environment. This calls for close cooperation between academia, business actors and industry. Universities should lay more emphasis on conducting applied research because private enterprises benefit from knowledge generated through applied research. Related to research is establishment of incubation centres and Industrial and Technology Parks (ITP). Industrial Technology Parks create environments that foster collaboration and innovation thereby creating a framework for vertical growth of small firms. They also provide a location in which government, private sector and universities cooperate and help economies catch up with more technologically advanced societies. Universities similarly support STEM which is critical to economic prosperity and global competitiveness.

In Kenya some universities have established incubation centres. A good example is the C4D Lab which is a research and development start-up incubation hub at the University of Nairobi. The lab aims at contributing towards building the Silicon Savannah. Similarly, the Chandaria Business Innovation and Incubation Centre (Chandaria-BIIC) in Kenyatta University supports new and innovative ideas from Kenyans. The centre aims to promote a culture of innovation among Kenyan youth and provide solutions to challenges facing various industries by blending applied research and training with innovation and entrepreneurship. Additionally, Strathmore University’s IlabAfrica and Ibizafrica Incubation centre fosters an environment for Kenyan entrepreneurs to develop, nurture, and exchange innovative ideas. The centre also provides mentorship and services to startup companies such as seed capital, legal advice, financial expertise, relevant training and relevant physical resources.

To further give credence to the above finding, the Government of Kenya has partnered with the Government of South Korea to establish a graduate only university at Konza Technopolis. The Kenya Advanced Institute of Science & Technology (Kenya- KAIST) is modeled after the Korean Advanced Institute of Science & Technology (Korea- KAIST). The Kenya-KAIST institute was conceived to benchmark the development experience from the Republic of South Korea and is designed to be a research focused university that fosters elite human resources in science and technology needed by the nation (https://www.konzacity.go.ke).

Policy makers further indicated that universities play an important role of informing and supporting evidence-based policy-making through offering consultancy services to governments and community. Thus, they are at the forefront of co-production approach to public policy. This view is supported by Jovan et al. (2015) who argue that universities work with practitioners and the public to identify research informed solutions that improve the efficiency and effectiveness of public service delivery. This finding is further supported by Lee & Gopinathan (2008) who argue that in Singapore, universities earned additional income from providing consultancy services to government institutions. Policy makers further argued that setting up robust and fair
legal and political institutions called for advanced knowledge and decision-making skills produced by the universities. Additionally, Jovan et al. (2015) opine that universities all over the world engage in a wide range of knowledge exchange activities, such as long-term collaborative research programmes, consultancy, and bespoke training.

Despite the critical role played by R&D in HCD, findings revealed that there was weak collaboration between Kenya’s public organizations and universities to promote research. Majority, (85.44%) of the respondents indicated that Kenya had lagged Singapore and South Korea in R&D. Policy makers further indicated that research output in Kenya remains quite low compared to other countries in Africa, such as South Africa. This finding is supported by Mohamedbhai (2011) who argue that research output from African universities is very low. He attributes this to lack of research experienced faculty; brain drain; heavy teaching load; moonlighting by faculty; insufficient multi-disciplinary research essential for solving development challenges; and lack of resources such as Information and Communication Technology (ICT) infrastructure and well-equipped laboratories. Additionally, he argues that most faculty undertake research for personal gain, with the aim of publishing in internationally refereed journals for promotion purposes and that in some cases the selected topic is usually not appropriate to national development. Further, he opines that in cases where the research is externally funded, the topic selected is sometimes not directly relevant to national development.

This finding is further supported by Ooro (2009) who argued that even though research remains the greatest contributor to the development of humanity, minimal importance was attached to research in Africa’s higher education compared to developed countries. The finding is in tandem with GOK, 2010 Report which indicates that the country faces significant challenges and weaknesses in funding research, technology and innovation sector. The finding is also supported by NEPAD (2010) Report which indicates that funding of research and innovation remains a major challenge for most African countries and universities. Ecuru, (2008) and Kiamba (2004) conclude that inadequate domestic funding for research has led to low research productivity across the sector. Figure 1.1 illustrates the role of universities in HCD.
Figure 1.1: Framework on Role of Universities in Human Capital Development

Figure 1.1 illustrates the various roles of universities. University education is the main source of knowledge in today’s information age. Universities are responsible for knowledge production, dissemination and absorption.
by any society. Through teaching and knowledge transfer universities increase the productive capacity of an individual and nation resulting in skills development and talent management. Another key role of university is to conduct research and empower graduates to be job creators. Research universities are viewed as a necessary condition to bring about innovation-based economic development of regions. They are therefore expected to spearhead knowledge acquisition in science, mathematics and engineering and be predispositioned towards problem solving and working with industry.

Additionally, providing support and investment in STEM is also a critical role played by universities. STEM courses have been singled out by various scholars as critical to economic prosperity and global competitiveness (Adero, 2016; Chetty, 2012). Fiddis, (2018) in an Article in the CEO Magazine has observed that prioritizing STEM education builds new jobs, creates growth and drives innovation. On STEM, policy makers interviewed stressed that acquisition of skills and competencies in science, technology and innovation is the gateway for economic development, wealth creation and sustainable development. However, study by Mukhwana et al. (2017) revealed that Kenya is not producing adequate human resource in STEM. According to them, the current graduation rate in STEM programmes stood at only 13% leading to an acute shortage of manpower in the engineering and medical fields.

Despite the critical role played by universities discussed above, policy makers interviewed indicated that over the years the education sector had not been in tandem with changes, aspirations and needs of a developing country due to the mismatch between training and market needs for the 21st century. They further indicated that employers in Kenya were citing inadequately skilled workforce as a major constraint to business. The view held by the policy makers is supported by various researchers such as Harvey & Green (2004); Mugo (2013); Mwirigi (2011); Nesoba (2010); Rintari (2015); Wambua (2014); Wawire & Nafukho (2006); and Weligamage & Siengthai (2003) who contend that higher education systems in Africa and Kenya does not produce graduates with requisite skills needed by employers.

Policy makers further pointed out that more and more research without utilization of findings and implementation of research recommendations rendered the whole process futile. This finding is supported by Mungai (1988) who acknowledged the limited utilization of research results for national development in Kenya. Similarly, Ngome (2003) disparaged the poor dissemination of research findings in Africa and Kenya in particular, due to the absence of research journals. Further, Mukhwana et al. (2017) observes that several higher learning institutions emphasize more on basic research, which is largely academic and does not benefit the end user, than applied research.

**Policy Recommendations**

**Strengthen the Role of Universities Human Capital Development**

It is recommended that the role of universities in building human capital be strengthened. This recommendation resonates with the findings by the international research consortium which affirmed that universities provide a platform for organizations to apply new technology and to educate and develop the workforce thus contributing to growth of local economies (Eun, 2012).
It is further recommended that the Commission for University Education (CUE) puts in place policies to discourage universities from offering certificate and diploma programmes. These should be left to other middle level training institutions. It is also recommended that CUE undertakes rationalization of programmes in universities to avoid duplication and ensure that universities only introduce programmes for which they have adequate funding while those programmes that do not attract students be reviewed and discontinued. Replication of programmes leads to duplication of funding and resources thus increasing the cost of education. Additionally, fragmentation of courses into thin disciplines should be avoided. This recommendation is in consonance with recommendation by Mukhwana, et al. (2016).

To address the perennial disconnect between the education sector and the labour market, the government has moved to enhance youth employability by addressing the skills mismatch between education and labour market needs by establishing the Office of Career Services (OCS) in public universities to empower students make the right career choices (People Daily, 22nd June 2018) and thereby act as a bridge between industry and academia. It is recommended that such offices be opened in all the public and private universities. This would go a long way in solving the disconnect between education and the labour market.

**Increase investment in research and development and implement findings**

Science and Technology is one of the major catalysts and a major pillar of the Kenya Vision 2030 (GOK, 2007). To bolster the Science, Technology and Innovation (ST&I) sector, the government developed the ST&I policy and enacted the Science, Technology and Innovation Act, 2013 to streamline the management of the ST&I sector in the country.

The STI Act, 2013 provide for the establishment of the National Commission for Science, Technology and Innovation (NACOSTI), the National Research Fund (NRF) and the Kenya National Innovation Agency (KENIA) to facilitate better coordination and governance of the ST&I sector (GOK, 2013). KENIA has an opportunity to establish technological innovation advisory and prospecting centers in each of the 47 county governments as it has an express mandate to devolve its services to the County level. The advancement in ICT, laying of fibre optic, establishment of dedicated government agencies such as the ICT Authority and construction of Konza Technopolis promises to further put Kenya on the global map as a leading centre of excellence in ST&I and knowledge-based economy. Despite this, the study recommends for harmonization of functions for institutions dealing with research (NACOSTI, KENIA and NRF) to avoid duplication of functions. The government should also invest more resources in science, technology and applied research to achieve sustained economic growth.

Additionally, it is recommended that a research culture be nurtured and allowed to flourish in the education sector and proper records on government’s investment in research and development be kept. This will go a long way in keeping in check the contribution of research and development towards economic growth of the country. It is also recommended that universities strive to increase their research grant portfolios by attracting increased funding from the government, private sector, development partners and international organization. Further, it is recommended that universities should prioritize research when developing strategic plans and create a central research office that will be responsible for coordinating, promoting, facilitating and managing research.

**Emphasize on investment in STEM courses**

The prevailing situation where humanity programmes dominate the total student enrolment in the universities and sucking huge national resources is holding back the achievement of Vision 2030, a case true for several
countries in Africa (Nakayiwa, 2016; Ochuodho, 2016; Sam-Amoah et al., 2016; Shibru et al., 2016; Valeta et al., 2016). However, improving STEM education in Kenya is a critical step in embedding ST&I in the country’s education and production systems. The study recommends that the capacity of education institutions to provide STEM education be enhanced. This can be realized through introducing and repackaging STEM in university programmes, investing in modern infrastructure to support STEM, providing modern equipment and qualified staff and setting affirmative gender actions for STEM programmes. Adoption of these strategies will help bridge the gap of scientists, engineers and other professionals in the scientific fields by developing their technological, pedagogical and content knowledge.

**Strengthen Collaboration Linkages between Education and the Industry**

The study recommends for close collaboration between universities and industry regarding provision of relevant practical skills for industrialization. The universities should allow middle level colleges to access their facilities for practical training of students and vice-versa. This recommendation is supported by UNESCO (1996) which proposed the need to forge closer linkage between training and the labour market.

In addition, universities should create avenues for technology and skills transfer by entering into joint ventures with the private sector where both exploit strengths in business innovation, research, and technology development, production and market access respectively. By supporting such ventures universities will boost the long-term potential of the economy to remain competitive and thrive globally. According to KIPPRA (2018), such partnerships have the potential of nurturing start-ups or spin off companies thus elevating the profile of higher education sector. Jovan et al. (2015) concludes that businesses that engage with universities on innovation report a better performance on product range, market share and product quality than those that do not.

**Managerial Recommendations**

For the country to develop a mass of skilled professionals, scientists, managers and technicians, university managers should strengthen linkages between the universities, the industry and other institutions of higher learning. In addition, they should revamp the training curricula for STEM courses and increase intake of students for these courses while reducing enrolment in social sciences and humanities.

University managers should strengthen ties and facilitate closer relations with alumni because of the strong potential for alumni to contribute towards the growth and development of universities. This can be achieved through establishment of an office of “Alumni Relations”, investment of time and money in ensuring a vibrant online community for the alumni. A strong alumni association can contribute towards various developmental activities and be a source of placement opportunities for students. Alumni can also play an active role of mentoring students in various fields of expertise, form a huge talent pool for career guidance, offer internship opportunities for trainees and reduce the financial burden of underprivileged students. Additionally, Alumni can be a reference in meeting the needs of graduates in obtaining work in selected fields and proposing practical solutions to the challenges facing the institution. Leveraging the alumni community creates a win-win situation for both the institution and alumni.

**Conclusion**

The role of higher education in human capital development should not be under-estimated. Universities play an important and prominent role in capacity building and knowledge creation of any nation. They therefore are core assets of an economy and instrumental in improving the production capacity of any country. They are uniquely placed to lead the cross-sectoral implementation of the SDGs and remain a critical part of the thriving national
innovation system required for sustainable growth in any country. Through research university education contribute to the advancement of the society. Universities therefore need to embrace their changing roles and their unique position of influence because the quality of graduates from universities helps determine literacy levels of the entire society. Countries should therefore aspire to create innovative universities by integrating research, teaching, extension and commercialization of research findings. University managers should ensure that the education provided is of high quality, meets the skills demand needs of the economy and develops the whole person who is productive to the society. This paper concludes that the core mandate of universities is to conduct research, create new knowledge, especially with regard to science and technology. The paper further advocates that university education, being a “public good,” should benefit from state support because continuous investment in university education is essential for development as it accelerates technological diffusion, decrease knowledge gaps and help in poverty reduction.

References


Dae-bong, K. (2009). Human capital and its Measurement, the 3rd OECD World Forum on
Statistics, Knowledge and Policy. Charting Progress, Building Visions, Improving life, Busan Korea

Denison, E.F. (1962). The Sources of Economic Growth in the United States and the
Alternatives before us. New York: Committee for Economic Development.

Journal of Thought, 39(1), 119-130.

View of the Firm, CAHRS (Working Paper Series 01-03). Ithaca, NY: Cornell University, School of
Industrial and Labour Relations, Centre for Advanced Human Resource Studies.

SDGs: rising to the global challenge through institutionalizing partnerships with governments and
communities. Health Research Policy and Systems 16, 38


Filho, W., L. (2011). About the Role of University and Their Contribution to Sustainable

Harcourt, Brace and Jovanovich.


Printer.


Jeong-Kyu, L. (2001). Korean Experience and Achievement in Higher Education. The SNU
Journal of Education Research, 11, ISSN 1225-5335, 1-23.

Nations: The changing role of higher education. Toronto, University of Toronto Press.


World Class Universities. International Education Studies Journal, 8(7). ISSN 1913-9020. Canadian
Centre of Science and Education.

Kiamba, C. 2004. The experience of privately sponsored studentship and other income

Kinoti, M. (2016, May 6). Looking forward to employment? Here’s the reality check!”. Daily
Nation.


Mungai, C. (2015, March 19). Students give it their best, but in the end, employers find they are still not good enough. *Mail Guardian Africa*.


Regulatory and Policy Contradictions and how they Debase Educational Attainment; an investigation into the Experiences from Universal Primary Education implementation in Uganda

Higenyi Wahitu, PhD
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
This paper investigates the provisions of the Education Act (2008), educational policies, and whether or not, they are enablers or disablers of Universal Primary Education (UPE) implementation in Uganda. In particular, the study focuses on the following provisions; free primary education, school meals, volunteerism strategy, thematic curriculum, Language of Instruction (LOI), automatic promotion, and synthesis of stakeholder roles in education attainment. In order to investigate the implementation of the provisions of the Education Act, and education policies, and the possible influence on UPE attainment, the researcher underpinned the study in a constructionist paradigm enabling the use of interviews, observation and documentary analysis in a multi-case study design. Whereas, the provisions of the Act and the education policies were meant to enhance UPE attainment, in terms of; Access, Quality and Equity, the results seem to suggest mixed findings. The study concludes that government should address the conflict policies if UPE is to be fully attained.

Key words: Thematic Curriculum, Language of Instruction (LOI), Automatic Promotion, Universal Primary Education

Introduction
Uganda like many other countries embraced Universal Primary Education or Education for All (The South African Schools Act, 1996; Education Act, 2008, No Child Left Behind, 2001). This was based on the pillars of increasing Access, enhancing Quality and Equity especially among the underprivileged. Overall, UPE would create a critical mass of human capital needed for the development and competitiveness on international standards. To enhance UPE implementation, government enacted the Education Act, 2008 and developed education polices as key guides. This study, as such investigates the implementation of the Act, and the attendant education policies, with a view of unearthing the possible linkage with UPE attainment. In particular, it focusses on the analysis of policy provisions, legal and practice enhancement or challenges in the implementation of UPE.

Methodology
The study was underpinned in the belief that knowledge is co-constructed and interpreted in the eyes of the researcher and participants (Creswell, 2013). As such, the researcher interviewed 16 participants representing members of School Management Committees (SMCs). They were drawn from four regions of Uganda including; West Nile, Central, Northern and Eastern; with a view of enhancing a wider understanding of the impact of Education Act, 2008 and other education policy provisions on UPE implementation. The sample purposely included; two educator members (head teacher and teachers’ representative) and non-educator members (chairperson and parents’ representative). My analyses; which guided the presentation and discussion below is anchored in the earlier silences in the literature reviewed for my doctoral thesis.

Presentation of Findings and Discussion
Though not meant for strict ‘thematization’ of the presentation, the discussion below attempts to follow the highlighted areas of policy contradictions as emphasized in the introduction.

Free Primary Education
The Education Act (2008) emphasises that UPE shall be free and government would provide for all school necessities. However, the findings of the study indicate that government was not able to provide for all necessities, necessitating new sources and support. As acknowledged by Acam, Kikafunda, Malde, Wange-Theon and Egal (2012), accomplishments in education efforts in terms of access were apparent, though cases of
under-achievement, including poor quality, the inadequacy or unavailability of textbooks, parents’ reluctance to contribute to formal education, poor infrastructure and lack of meals, were evident. As such, high dropout rates and widened disparities rather than solve the inequality it sought to address were reported, since some communities were more cooperative in mobilizing additional funding and richer. In addition, findings indicate that SMCs did not adequately meet the financial activities role, partly as a result of the government not taking into consideration factors such as the capacity of the SMC members, the attitudes of the community and the general poverty levels while devolving fiscal power amidst promises of providing free education.

Willems (2017) is of the view that, whereas parents were natural alternative funders of their children’s education, having them supplement funding to schools would amount to them making double payment since they would have contributed through taxes and, as such, would seem over-burdened. Further challenges relating to fiscal decentralisation to school level, concerns budgeting in schools situated in communities with low-income members that were negatively affected and this would lead to inadequacy of scholastic facilities. The researcher tends to agree with the finding with regard to challenges in resourcing by advancing that the very first mistake the government could have made was giving false hope for free primary education. In addition, since much of the community seemed not to appreciate education, requiring them to pay creates for them an excuse for keeping their children at home, which increases the dropout rate. Low resourcing means poor quality education and parents with resources will choose to take their children to better public or even private schools.

Whereas, it was thought that devolving fiscal power to SMCs would enable them to resource school activities, as already observed, in the above discussion, the findings indicate challenges where at the extreme of the continuum, SMCs were not involved in the budgeting and were only informed by the head teacher to sign as a requirement by the higher authorities. This finding is similar to Mbugua and Rarieya’s (2014) in a study in Kenya where budget estimates existed in schools but school governors rarely debated them or they were developed by few members. Therefore, as Dimmock (2013) admits, it is not possible to claim that increased decision-making over allocated resources necessarily increased productivity in the form of learning outcomes. There was, therefore, a demonstrated need for financial management skills by SMC members for the schools they were responsible for to avoid financial fiascos (Othman, Embi, Aris, Choo & Ismail, 2016).

The caveats identified in other works regarding SMCs’ financial activities role included over-dependence on the central government, late releases, poor contribution from parents and total lack of budgeting (Bagarette, 2011; McGuinn & Manna, 2011). The fixed per-learner-per-term block grant approach used in Indonesia, which is similar to Uganda’s, was not only inflexible and, as such, would not afford the opportunity to use the funds where they are most needed, but the funding was also not adequate for the school expenditure (MoES, 2008; Sumintono, 2009; Vernez et al., 2012). Conversely, Lai and Cheng (2011) report greater flexibility in the way schools locally managed budgets in England. The probable reason for the difference in autonomy in the use of funds could be the level of community financial accountability. To compound the challenges associated with financing primary education, Winardi (2017) following a study in Indonesia, reveals that gaps existed in resourcing and budgeting. What seems clear though, as accentuated by Council (2012) and Benevot (2016), is that quality in education cannot be achieved without the provision of adequate resources. Sometimes the government has made wasteful decisions by providing small portions of funds to schools, which rarely impact on education delivery.
Provision of Children’s Meals
According to the Education Act (2008), whereas the Government of Uganda was to provide fees and other development support to schools, such as the construction of buildings and the provision of textbooks; parents were expected to provide feeding and uniforms for their children. Findings indicate that most parents were unable to provide meals to children due to factors like poverty and misinterpretation of UPE as being wholly free and as such not willing to contribute. At the extreme of the continuum, there were instances of children being reported to be ill yet it was as a result of hunger due to lack of meals at school and insufficient meals at home. In addition to pupils not having meals at school, the teachers were equally affected since they were expected to eat from the children’s meals. The inability of the government to provide meals connotes poverty, negligence and the presupposition that parents would naturally provide meals to pupils and teachers (Onderi & Makori, 2013). The lack of meals at school would negatively influence the quality of learning and teaching in addition to poor time management if teachers and pupils had to go out of the school compound for lunch. Emphasizing the importance of meals, the OECD (2016) reports that learners provided with school meals were seen to learn more effectively than in schools without feeding programmes. In tandem with the OECD finding, participants in this study reported a higher school attendance during the mangoes and food harvest seasons.

Volunteerism Strategy
It is noteworthy that the participants interviewed also reported cases of members not being committed to doing voluntary work, which may mean dissatisfaction over the lack of facilitation. As such, the expected level of SMC accountability may be compromised. Although interview responses seem to indicate that SMCs are not remunerated, the Education Act (2008) provides for the remuneration of members or for allowances to be paid to them. The possible reason for not remunerating SMC members though provided for in the Act could be general poverty in the communities or deliberate neglect by the head teachers in order to discourage the members from carrying out their roles. The provision or non-provision of allowances to SMC members may be a possible driver of the disparity in the level of commitment among members that ultimately affects access and quality of UPE delivery. Indeed, in some places, there are reports of less concern by SMC members on mobilisation of children to join school and stay in school, in addition to not monitoring school activities such as teacher attendance.

Thorough vigilance in monitoring was demonstrated among most SMCs, there were weaknesses that impeded obtaining the right information to effect changes, such as differing data collection tools or the lack thereof. There were reports of lack of commitment due to inability to reimburse members when they showed up to monitor since members of the governing bodies were not paid workers (Education Act, 2008; James et al, 2011; Mncube, 2009; Xaba, 2011; Onderi & Makori, 2012). Whereas most members of the SMCs expressed a high sense of volunteerism, at the extreme of the continuum, findings indicate that some SMC members expressed the lack of motivation due to non-payment for the work they did; and as such they would rather spend their time fending for their families. Such attitudes would lead to further disparities in terms of monitoring results and ultimate UPE accountability.

Stakeholder Roles
In Uganda, the SMCs draw representatives from various constituencies. The representatives include five members nominated by the foundation body (in most cases the church) among whom is elected the chairperson, a local council representative, the sub-county representative, a parents’ representative, old boys/girls’ representative, teachers’ representative and the head teacher as the secretary (Prinsen & Titeca, 2008; MoES, 2008; Education Act, 2008; Suzuki, 2010). The selection of SMC members from different constituencies was
premised on the assumption that all major stakeholders would have a clear understanding of managing schools (Tsotetsi et al., 2008) and exercise such responsibilities (School Management Committee Handbook, 2009).

Gonzalez, Jackson and Jackson (2017) point out that the involvement of parents in school governance would harness parents’ involvement in decision processes that affect their children and education as a whole. Whereas, the parents are the natural partners in education delivery through organs such as Parent-Teacher Associations (PTAs), findings indicate that parents did not attend meetings and instead they would send the older children to attend on their behalf. In addition, mainly women attended meetings leaving out the men who were considered to be funders and better decision makers in the society strata. This had the negative effect of none contribution of funds for school projects, non-monitoring of school activities which were considered to be the sole responsibility of the school administration and delayed decision making. The other negative contribution of parents was that those who knew the value of education would choose to take their children to other better performing schools; leaving parents who didn’t contribute leading to further disparity in the quality of education. Parents further acted as a stabbing blow to education attainment through engagement of school going children in domestic work that hampered children from attending classes, especially during the seasons for planting and harvesting. On the positive side, parents were reported to be training pupils in traditional folk songs, music and dance, and would advise children to stay in school especially the girl child.

In addition to the parents as key stakeholders, the importance of the church in fostering education is a world phenomenon and as such cannot be ignored. In most cases the church was crucial in electing members of the foundation body to be representatives on the school governance body (Pansiri, 2008). Such elections were meant to influence the curriculum and monitor the religious ethos (Education Act, 2008). In addition, they would determine admission of pupils and personnel matters such as; appointment of staff, postings and transfers (West, Mattei & Roberts, 2011; Committee, 2013; Jeffs, 2017; Jansen, 2017). Findings in the current study indicated that the motives for church support for education included; financial, and fostering the ethos of the religion. As such, there were reports of restriction at recruitment and deployment as a result of difference in religions. Reporting a case in Zambia, Falconer-Stout, Kalimaposo and Simuyaba (2014) report of church mobilisation efforts of the community to provide land and materials such as bricks for the construction of a school. Taysum and Abery (2017) report further educational support where the church provided bursaries to learners in church founded schools.

Whereas the central government devolved the governance responsibility to SMCs, the study found that there were challenges with the competency of most of the members. The guidelines to SMCs acknowledge that though some members may be illiterate, they would contribute to UPE management. One possible reason for entrusting illiterate persons with the education role was that the community could not raise the number of educated members to constitute SMCs, pointing to general illiteracy levels in the country. As such, the literature points to members of SMCs not being aware of what was expected of them, as lacking confidence and not being able to exercise their powers, and to their effectiveness differing from one context to the other (Dayaram, 2008; Brown & Duku, 2008; Mncube, 2009; Lunenburg, 2010; Xaba, 2011; Bagarette, 2011; Vernez, 2012; Onderi & Makori, 2013; Othman, 2017). Such members were, thus, dominated by principals and the educated members. Inadequate capacity risks effective ownership and may derail accountability. Explicitly, capacity training is important since schools are more autonomous (OECD, 2016) and, as such, are expected to take appropriate decisions without all the time referring to higher management tiers. Willems (2017) adds that there is need for skills acquisition if school boards are to effectively participate and their decisions are to be respected as robust and legitimate. The researcher agrees that the government had good intentions of interesting the site-level community in the
management of the school, though their capacity for effective mandate handling seemed wanting. However, the community took part in the roles with commitment and compensated for their capacity needs through delegating responsibilities according to capability and through lending support to SMCs by bringing on board members from neighbouring schools to be members of SMCs but the fear was connivance of the educated headteachers that would lead to elite capture.

Conversely, SGBs in developed countries tended to have more educated, wealthier and professional or retired persons (James, Brammer, Connolly, Fertig, Jamea & Jonnes, 2010; Lunenburg & Ornstein, 2012) and, as such, were operating effectively. This view seems to be a counterpoint to Young and Young’s (2017) finding that the decisions passed by SGBs were rarely debated and in most cases meetings rotated around the presentation of information by the principal. Young (2012) explains further that formalities such as strict adherence to the agenda and the dominance of meetings by privileged voices hampered the functioning of SGBs (Committee, 2013; Maricle, 2014). As such, building capacity in decision-making, financial management and planning was essential, and so was the appropriate knowledge prior to taking up office and during tenure (Bush & Glover, n.d.). Being better educated had its own drawbacks, such as lacking time for school activities, especially since it was not gainful. The divergence between James et al.’s (2010) and Young’s (2012) findings, despite the fact that both studies took place in England, could be as a result of the different samples and scope of their studies.

**Thematic Curriculum**

A curriculum is a set of all planned activities to enable the learner acquire and develop desired knowledge, skills and attitudes aimed at adapting and harnessing the environment (Abiero, 2010). Abiero (2010) supports the need for a curriculum by indicating that in Kenya, curriculum development aimed at providing for the development of a child’s mental capabilities and physical growth. In the Ugandan context, the thematic curriculum is believed to contribute to such processes while promising improved education quality by increasing the achievement levels of pupils in literacy, numeracy and life skills. The year 2000 curriculum was found to be overloaded, emphasized the acquisition of facts in various subjects, and the teaching and learning was narrowed to recall and lower cognitive skills. As such, pupils failed to develop early literacy thereby performing poorly in all curriculum subjects (Read & Enyutu, 2005). The introduction of thematic curriculum in the lower primary would enable; an integrated learning model underpinned by the idea of using a theme to teach across all activity areas; providing for pupils to independently learn as they interact with the environment; and pupils actively participating in the learning process (NCDC, 2006).

The researcher finds that, whereas the thematic curriculum seemed to be well intended, it seemed to have been hurriedly implemented, without the development of adequate capacity and envisaging the need for stakeholder buy-in thereby SMC members decrying its implementation. Findings indicated that Head teachers were hastily taught with the hope that they would cascade to the teachers and the school governing body (Altinyelken, 2010). In addition, often than not, whereas it emphasized themes, the Transition Curriculum from primary four and upper primary looked at subjects of English Language, Mathematics, Integrated Science, and Social Studies that informed the primary leaving examinations. This had the effect of not taking thematic curriculum important since it was meant for only the lower classes that did not inform PLE.

Altinyelken (2010) based on a field study, in which he investigated the implementation of thematic curriculum in Uganda from the perspectives of teachers, expresses that although the majority of teachers were enthusiastic about the new curriculum, their implementation efforts were constrained by a multitude of challenges. The findings raise questions with regard to the appropriateness of the thematic curriculum initiative to the structural
realities of Ugandan classrooms (Altinyelken, 2010). Given the number of pupils in the classrooms, it was difficult to use participatory methods for the learners to discover for themselves. As such resonating the widening held view that those who are concerned with policy making and enacting the relevant legislation hardly ever pay attention to the implementation stage. Indeed, the challenges seemed to be inherent in the policy borrowing by the government, which did not consider how the curriculum requirements would be implemented in the schools in Uganda.

The report further points out that the overall performance of students at primary level had not significantly improved, and that literacy levels in English and in local languages were unacceptably low, especially outside urban areas (Altinyelken, 2010). Furthermore, although the new curriculum encourages the use of teaching and learning materials, such as wall charts, flash cards and sentence cards, these were also supplied to schools in limited amounts (NCDC, 2006). To emphasise the challenges associated with acquisition of learning materials, head teachers and teachers noted that school budgets were constrained and in most cases provision of materials depended on teacher initiatives. The other challenge was that, all learning materials used in the first three years of primary education would be provided in the child’s own language or a language familiar to the child since thematic curriculum favored local language of the institution. In addition, all written tests that were to be used for assessment purposes would be administered in the local language except for the assessment of English language competence. The problems of translation to multiple languages were apparent.

Studies suggest that pre-service teacher education in Uganda has not provided sufficient support to teachers for the development of key skills especially for lower primary teaching. Therefore, teacher education skills like teaching mathematics, listening comprehension, reading, writing, and speaking are wanting. Moreover, the teacher education curriculum is often criticized for providing theoretical knowledge, focusing on subjects and giving very little practical pedagogical approach. As such, the teacher education inadequately prepares teachers to teach thematic curriculum. Furthermore, it was observed that in many schools across the country, often the least qualified teachers were allocated to lower primary classes. This may be explained by the education system that emphasises grades at PLE and as such allocate the most qualified and experienced teachers to upper primary (Read and Enyutu, 2005).

The introduction of continuous assessment seemed to be the most challenging issue that concerned teachers about thematic curriculum. Teachers commented that they learned little about assessment, so they did not know how to carry out continuous assessment in practice. Furthermore, large class sizes were considered as a serious impediment to carrying out continuous assessment. This new assessment system requires teachers to observe and follow each student on a daily basis, and record their progress over a variety of competencies. This expectation was considered unrealistic as it was considered beyond the capacity of a single teacher to follow up to 70 students on daily basis. As a result, continuous assessment was hardly done. The purpose of such assessment is considered to be diagnostic and remedial. It is assumed that frequent assessment would facilitate appropriate feedback and corrective action on the part of teachers. For instance, it would enable teachers to identify individual problems and provide adequate help so that the child would catch up with the rest of the class. Likewise, high achievers can be identified and given more challenging tasks to stimulate their learning (NCDC, 2006).

**Automatic Promotion**

The Act further provides for automatic promotion from one grade to the other with the exception of the end of cycle class. Like elsewhere, the policy on automatic promotion in Uganda has created a divide among education
stakeholders along those in favour and those against (Okurut, 2015). Those against automatic promotion hold that since it eliminates competition, the teachers and students alike see no reason for working hard hence lowering teaching and learning outcomes and negatively affects the overall quality of education (Koppensteiner, 2014; Chohan & Qadir, 2011). Koppensteiner (2014), sharing experiences of Brazil, emphasises that even under the postulation that automatic promotion would release school resources that would be allocated to higher grades, this amounts to underestimating the true negative impact of the disincentive created by automatic promotion. Therefore, grade retention is viewed as leading to mastery and improved cognitive learning outcomes (Brophy, 2006). However, this is only possible if learning strategies of differentiated and individualized instruction, progress monitoring, formative assessment, feedback, corrective procedures, and instructional alignment are in place to minimize achievement gaps (Zimmerman & Dibenedetto, 2008). Nalova (2016) sharing experiences of automatic promotion policy implementation in Cameroon points out that the process was not accompanied by support mechanisms especially the teachers’ support. As such, teachers generally had a negative perception of automatic promotion, and they did not provide for remedial classes for the weak learners outside the official school schedule. The proponents have argued that grade repetition is a waste of scarce resources and may not substantively raise educational outcomes (OECD, 2015). They go on to suggest other means of reducing class repetition such as: addressing learning gaps during the school year; limiting repetition to subject failed, and ensuring targeted support.

The findings in this study as regards automatic promotion implementation was a mixed bag; indicating SMCs that supported the policy and implemented, and the other set of SMCs that were not sure of what to implement, those that selectively implemented for the lower classes and changed to grade repetition in the higher grades, and those that continued with repetition. These revelations point to the possible lack of close supervision by the ministry responsible for education, inspectors of schools at the district level, in addition to improper policy implementation mapping. In a review of how the automatic promotion policy was being implemented, Kayemba (2010) established that in most of the schools studied, cases of pupils repeating classes were common in spite of the assurance of automatic promotion under the UPE policy. The claim by most of the SMC members was that the policy makes pupils pay limited attention to their studies since they are not worried about being made to repeat a class. In schools were the policy was being implemented, SMC members expressed that it would be a sure way to poor grades at primary leaving examinations.

Language of Instruction
Whereas, the provisions of the Education Act support the use of local language as media of instruction especially in lower classes with a view of enhancing comprehension, the findings seem to suggest different outcomes. The findings reveal that while pupils seem to acquire knowledge literacy more easily, the SMC members criticised the policy, arguing that the use of the local language negatively influenced the performance of pupils in Primary Leaving Examinations (PLE) since examinations are written in the English language (Tsotetsi, Van Wyk & Lemmer, 2008; Benson, 2013; UNESCO, 2014; National Curriculum Development Centre [NCDC], 2015). The probable reason for SMCs to decry local area language use as recommended for Primary One to Primary Three was the challenge of transition to communicating in English, which is the language for the final examinations. Sharing experiences from South Africa (Heugh, 2006) points out that there was implicit assumption that local area language was inferior and suitable only for low level classes (the Foundation Phase Grade R-3), after which English ought to be the language of teaching and learning. This is unlike, a UNESCO report of (2014), which embraces a bilingual approach – through teaching in a child’s mother tongue throughout the primary level and English as a second language aimed at improving performance in all subjects. Kruger (2016) following a study in South Africa, arguments how issues of multilingualism, power differentials between languages affected the
use and how it was affected by the translation of children’s books in South Africa. As such, evidence shows that, there has been a general shift towards English (Kruger, 2016). The increasing practical move to monolingualism (English) in the official and public sphere, in addition to the effects of globalisation, which in overt and subtle ways continue to link proficiency in English to status, mobility, power and wealth, militate against learners choosing local indigenous languages as media of instruction (Desai, 2001; Heugh, 2006; Plüddemann, 2006; Webb, 2003).

A study by Sabates, Westbrook and Hernandez-Fernandez (2015) shows that adopting Kiswahili as the LOI in primary schools in Tanzania – which is a success story – had two advantages: the first was that Kiswahili was seen as a panacea for multilingualism; the second was that for many learners, Kiswahili was their mother tongue or the indigenous language commonly spoken in their area. What is less clear is what this might mean in contexts of high multilingualism, such as the urban areas of Uganda (Penny, Ward, Read & Bines, 2008; Alexander, 2010; Plüddemann, 2016). The other challenge with regard to LOI was that in almost every class, teachers interfaced with children with special needs, which required specialised sign language. The inclusive education approach seemed not to adequately cater for physically challenged children in relation to the adequacy of trained sign language teachers. Whether sign language would constitute a mother tongue in the case of the deaf is still an issue for debate (Reagan, 2008).

In the Ugandan context, the implementation of LOI was left to the SMCs to decide (Education Act, 2008). This had two effects – especially in the rural areas with a homogeneous language, it was implemented; while in private and urban schools, there was no preference for English language causing disparities in comprehension. This resonates De Klerk (2002) finding which points to the lack of enforceable clauses in the SASA (1996) for promoting multilingualism, and instead leaves the decisions about language of instruction to parents, schools, and learners. This opened the door to non-uniformity of decisions to implement local language use in lower grades that in the end disadvantage learners. As such, Howie, Venter, Van Staden, and Van Gelder (2007) found out, that more than 80% of South African learners study in English especially from Grade 4 onwards, despite the language-in-education policy.

Heugh (2006) further, points out that the lack of teaching and learning materials, and indeed exams, in the local languages which, leaves no option for school governing bodies but to choose English as a medium of teaching and learning for their children. The lack of such materials (and increasing efforts to fill this lack, also by means of translation) is a complex issue. However, even from this overtly supportive position for English use, there is the final insurmountable problem that positive attitudes towards English in South Africa are almost invariably accompanied by extremely low reported proficiency rates. In 2007, the shockingly poor reading abilities of South African primary-school learners were outlined by the (Progress in International Reading Study) [PIRLS] report, 2007 (Blaine, 2007). This may mean that learners with the possible exception of first-language speakers of English are not getting the opportunity to develop sophisticated literacy skills in any language.

**Conclusion**

The implementation of Universal Primary Education in Uganda seems to have been in a hurry as demonstrated by the insurmountable number of regulations and policies that were meant to support its implementation. It is therefore attendant to government to correct the policy dilemma for purposes of attainment of Access, Equity and Quality of the UPE program.
References


Altinyelken, H.K. (2010). Curriculum change in Uganda: Teacher perspectives on the new thematic curriculum. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2009.03.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2009.03.004)


Committee, E. (2013). Education Committee The Role of School Governing Bodies, III.


MoES. (2008). *Guidelines on policy, planning, roles and responsibilities of stakeholders in the implementation of universal primary education (UPE) for district and urban councils*.


National Curriculum Development Centre [NCDC]. 2015


School Management Committee Handbook, 2009


The No Child Left Behind Act of 2001.” Washington, DC:
The South African Schools Act (Republic of South Africa, 1996)


When Teachers’ Behaviours Fail Pupils: The Tragedy of the Innocents in UPE Schools in Uganda

Michael Galukande Kiganda & Willington Guma-Baguma
Uganda Management Institute
E-Mail: mpgalukande@umi.ac.ug / kigandamichael2000@yahoo.com

Abstract
This paper presents findings from the study that analysed the impact of teachers’ behaviours to pupils’ performance in Universal Primary Education (UPE) programme schools in Uganda taking Jinja Municipal Council as a case study. The study was informed by persistent reports pointing to low performance in UPE schools and the hypothesis that teachers contributed to these declining trends. This was a descriptive cross sectional research that was based on three objectives that analysed whether teachers’ discretion; teachers’ autonomy; and teachers’ coping skills contributed to the declining performance in government aided primary schools. The study adopted a mixed quantitative-qualitative-explanatory sequencing approach whereof 218 questionnaires were administered followed by 15 purposive interviews. The study found that; there was a positive significant relationship between teachers’ attitudes and teachers’ coping skills. Allowing much room for discretion, autonomy, and coping mechanisms creates space for teachers to engage in personal engagements at the expense of the pupils. The paper recommends a UPE policy review processes that should in as much as possible include consultations from the teachers who are implementing the programme as a positive approach to minimizing negative teacher behaviours.

Key words: Teachers’ Behaviours, discretion, autonomy, coping mechanisms, Universal Primary Education

Introduction
The Universal Primary Education (UPE) policy as implemented in several developing countries including Uganda has generated several debates critiquing the policy design and implementation approaches despite massive government and donor investments in the programme. Having originated as part of the recommendations of the 1990 Education for All World Conference that sat in Jomtien- Thailand; UPE programme was introduced in Uganda in 1997 as a presidential declaration targeting four children per family (Bategeka, 2005) and started by attracting a huge enrollment of 3.1 million pupils. However, during the course of its implementation, several studies such as those of (UWEZO; Mafabi & Mbabali, 2017;) have discovered several implementation challenges particularly, high drop-out rates and low academic performance that is attributed to pathetic learner stagnations. Several UPE graduates have been reported in many parts of the country as unable to even effectively read nor write! This blame game has been part and parcel of the UPE policy and key stakeholders continues to accuse one another about not doing enough in the UPE implementation process. Despite the implementation rate-race game, several stakeholders continue to tirelessly work together for better results. In Uganda, these key UPE implementation stakeholders include the Ministry of Education and Sports, the District Education Committees (DECs), the School Management Committees (SMCs), and of course the teachers who are the primary implementers of the UPE policy (Bategeka, 2005). This study took keen interest in the later, the teachers, and assessed the effect of their (teachers) behaviors on the effective implementation of the UPE policy in selected primary schools in Jinja Municipal Council, Eastern Uganda, one of the municipalities with the highest UPE enrollments yet experiencing lowest pupil completion and pass rates in the country. The teacher: pupil ratio at the national level has at for a long time stagnated at 49:1 (Mafabi & Mbaaali, 2017) making teachers as key implementation actors in the UPE programme and the focus of this study. This paper presents the findings from that above assessment study and is presented in the sub themes of the introduction, study background, problem statement, reviewed literature, methods used, findings, discussions, conclusions and recommendations.
Literature

Teacher Behavior and Implementation of UPE Policy
Barber and Moursheed, 2007, urged that teacher behavior is an indispensable factor in primary schools since teachers highly influence the quality of student achievements. In a survey of the factors influencing learner outcomes, Hattie (2009), suggests that quality of teachers’ behavior contributes significantly on the impacts on the learning of pupils, more that even the quality of the educational curriculum, teaching methods, school building and role of parents. The arguments of May and Winter, (2009), that indeed it is the attitudes and understandings of these street level bureaucrats, the teachers, that finally determine policy implementation. The idea is supported by Boote (2006), who further urges that whenever the policy implementers encounter stress-full environment, they may not consider gathering the needed resources in learning to be worth their time and effort. Teachers who usually work in difficult environments, such as limited resources, may abandon ideals and adopt behaviours which enable them to manage pupils. In some circumstances of uncertainty in resource utilization, Hill, (1997) urges that teachers may face great pressure of inadequate time in relation to limitless need that also contributes to behaviours changes. Putting all the above together, it has been observed that teachers often reject and ignore UPE policy implementation guidelines that they find too tasking and perceive to be not working in their localized school environments. These include failure to follow strictly the schemes of work as required by the professional ethics. Therefore, implementation environment together with economic conditions, and public opinions, may definitely be affecting implementation UPE programme in Uganda.

The other behaviour related factors in the implementation of the UPE programme is the teachers’ understanding, practices, and skills, rather than the state of the UPE schools. Besides the conventional UPE implementation challenges of implementation, gender imbalance in primary schools may also threaten UPE implementation (Republic of Uganda, 2015). Makinde (2005), also mentions of social-economic problems such as corruption and loss of patriotism as contributing factors to the UPE policy implementation in developing countries.

Teachers in primary schools in Uganda also work amidst limited resources and hence fail to provide effective instructional to pupils. Other limitations are evidenced in the scarcity of scholastic materials used in school programmes as influencing teachers’ implementation behaviours. In analyzing teachers’ behaviours, this study concentrated on three behavioral aspects:

- Discretion
- Autonomy
- Coping mechanisms

Teachers’ Discretion
Davis as cited by (Hill, 1997) explained discretion of a public officer as a situation where the effective limits on power leave the officer with the freedom to make choices among possible courses of action and inaction without consultations from senior of policy. Discretion in this study, also involved the extent of freedom of teachers exercise in specific school contexts (Evan, 2010). Teacher discretion was further categorized in four parameters namely:

- judicial discretion;
- social discretion,
- economical discretion; and
- political discretion
Judicial discretion of the teacher happens when the teacher has the freedom to alter and interplay the rules, guidelines and other UPE policy requirements to suit local school contexts. As Hupe (2013), points out that judicial discretion enables the teachers to exercise quasi-judicial powers to review certain aspects of the UPE policy to suit to personal or local school contexts.

Economic discretion, of teachers happens when there is freedom to priorities the collection and expenditure of public funds as collected from the school to suit local requirements that may not have been specifically provided for by the UPE grant. On the side of the teachers, this involves collection of unauthorized school fees from the pupils to pay for some expenditures that are not approved such as staff and pupils’.

Social discretion of the teachers happens when the teachers choose the communities to interact with as part of the school community both within and outside the school boundaries. Such communities may include religious, co-curricular and cultural communities. Pupils are always advised by their teachers to belong to social communities that are preferred by particular teachers and this denies pupils with powers to decide on their own social interactions.

Political discretion focuses on questions of legitimacy of the decisions taken at the school in line with the guidelines of the UPE programme. The study of political influences on policy discretion suggests that there is a tendency to diverge from national policy goals if local opinion seemed to endorse it (May & Winter, 2009). Many schools where found to exercise political discretion in following time tables, scheming, and also following the national schools calendar as given by the Ministry of Education and Sports.

Brodkin (2011) argues that teacher discretion involves more than either a simple response- to preference or response- to-incentives at a work place. Teachers gain discretion and are able to decide what should be implemented under the UPE programme and how to do it amidst the resources available. Sometimes, as Gerston (2004), asserts some schools even after successfully implementing one aspect of the UPE policy may fail in their efforts to implement another aspect of the same policy because of the form of complex processes that may contradict individual interest. Therefore, teachers enjoy considerable amount of discretion when performing their duties and they develop routines that help them deal with work related pressures (Lipsky, 1980).

Indeed, teacher discretion is very significant in the realizing pupil success in any primary school. Discretion gives the teacher the powers and rights to decide their own judgments at work. Teachers generally work in a pre-determined setting and are not guided by rules and regulations both professionally and employees ethically (Hupe, 2013). The conduct of teaching and other educational activities such as assessment, extra-curricular activities to pupils are thus restricted to teacher autonomy and discretion. Hence, this study hypothesizes that teacher discretion significantly affects the implementation of UPE.

Teachers’ Autonomy
Teacher autonomy formed the second behavioral aspect of teachers in this study. Three dimensions of autonomy were investigated: namely, bureaucratic rationality; moral judgment and professional treatment. As Hill (2005) points out that professionals such as street-level bureaucrats are able to develop special claim to autonomy and analyzed professional autonomy. In this way, professional treatment agitates for the use of specialist skills and the moral judgment for the sake of fairness and independence. Therefore, it may not necessarily be the strict UPE policy guidelines and regulations that influence teachers’ behaviors but as Maynard-Moody and Musheno, (2003), state, it is their moral judgements through their daily personal interactions with pupils.
Whereas it was urged in the Republic of Uganda, (2015), that academic excellence of pupils in lower grades is determined by qualifications and skills of the teachers, Kelly as cited by Riccuci, (2005:18) urge that sometimes judgments about justice are highly significant factors in how teachers might implement the UPE programme by orchestrating “outcomes that are compatible with their visions of justice. On the other hand, some teachers may also be motivated by ethics of service (particularly the Teachers’ Code of Conduct) which would seem to be undermined if their activities were rigidly controlled by the UPE policy. This tends to be the situation for most teachers who provide knowledge to learners however, as can be noted not all teachers act professionally which may in the long run affect any successful implementation of a policy hence an area of interest for the study. It is also emphasized in Republic of Uganda, (2015), that teachers are change agents as they make best of their teaching skills to change learners. Therefore, Hill, (2003), states that building teachers’ capacity of and giving them more information about the UPE policy may shape policy outcomes.

Weimer and Vining (2005) discusses the logic of policy as being useful in UPE policy implementation. The argument is that if UPE policy was a chain of hypotheses to basic education to all Ugandan children, then, they would fail because of lack of access, equity and relevancy. Therefore, introduction of UPE to ensure access, equity and relevancy for all school going age children of (6+years) would mean that all Ugandans will attain basic level of education that will enhance literacy and numerous skills. Finally, Makinde (2005) states that although much has been studied concerning of teachers’ autonomy, scholars have only written about how much control teachers exercise in their classrooms environment. The roles that include lesson planning, selecting approved textbooks and related scholastic materials, following the syllabus, evaluating and grading pupils, maintaining discipline of pupils, or even giving out homework, teacher autonomy has not been assessed as significant factor in the implementation of the UPE programme called for studies to test the hypothesis.

**Teachers Coping Mechanisms**

Hudson, (1989), described coping mechanisms are the behaviors teachers develop in difficult and ambiguous work environments. These may include perpetuating delay; modifying objectives to match their ability and classifying pupils according to their academic performances. Coping mechanisms may also be informing of reducing demand for teaching work load, and rationing teaching to suit local conditions. Teacher coping mechanisms may come about as a result occupational stresses like personal lives, job dissatisfaction, and inability to perform effectively in the classroom (Chenevey et al., 2008, Jennings & Greenburg, 2009; Theiman & Kitchel, 2012). Sometimes teachers may control their demand by pupils by making the staffrooms less accessible and by enforcing strict rules about school uniform to pupils.

For a long time, the carrier of teaching has been associate with students with low grades. I this was true, then there are obvious consequences of stress, and other behavioral aspects to the well-being of teacher which includes an increased teacher burnout (Croom, 2003). Yoon, (2002) cited negative consequences in teacher pupil relationships and a decrease in teacher retention. The subsequent failure to cope up with such stress definitely endangers teachers’ abilities to over-score and increases gaps in the implementation of the UPE policy.

Batley and Mcloughlin, (2015), urge that a fundamental reason for public policy failures is tagged to the failure to understand personal traits of policy implementers. However, the personal character traits and bureaucratic interests of the public servants involved in the implementation of government policies and programmes cannot be easily be traced. Such that while scraping off school fees enhanced access to primary schools, it did not fit with the available infrastructures. In the process, enrollment surged resulting in squeezed classroom (Omwami
& Keller, 2010). The situation necessitated the adoption of coping mechanisms and the use of discretion to implement UPE policy. Teachers thus made conscious decisions to utilize these methods to cope with the stresses of implementing the UPE policy. In some cases, favoritism, stereotyping and rationalization was accorded to some pupils. It is thus the dilemmas that teachers went through that forced them to adopt means of coping with challenges of the job and strategies they adopted of rationing resources, screening and pupil favouritism were necessary consequences of scarcity (Wong, 2007).

Methodology

The study was carried out in Jinja Municipal Council in Eastern Uganda in the period May to August 2018 and considered the eight years (2010-2018) in the implementation of the UPE programme. The study adopted a descriptive-cross sectional survey design that permitted an in-depth study of fundamental themes. This was further adopted an explanatory mixed approach in which quantitative data was further explained by and qualitative findings. A population of four hundred twenty-two (422) respondents that included education officials, head-teachers and class room teachers were targeted and the sample of 218 respondents was as determined by Krejcie and Morgan (1970) Sampling Table. The study methodology employed the questionnaire survey, interviews and document reviews and subsequent research instruments.

Findings

Overall, the study objective was to assess how teacher behaviours affected the implementation of the UPE programme in Uganda. The specific objectives of the study were to investigate in Teachers’ discretion, autonomy and coping mechanisms as they affected the implementation of the UPE programme in Jinja Municipal Council schools. Study findings are hence presented below in the broad theme of Teacher behaviour and in specific findings on Teacher Discretion, Teacher Autonomy, and Teacher Coping Mechanisms.

Teacher Behavior and Implementation of UPE

Teacher’s behaviour has a bearing on the implementation of UPE, the research in this section sought to establish the different teacher behaviours that affected the implementation of UPE and the extent to which it affected UPE policy implementation. The Likert scale of 1-5 and standard deviations were used to analyse data for this specific section. Teacher behaviour was measured in the dimensions of Judicial, Economic, and Social Discretion.

As to whether judicial discretion affected implementation of UPE, respondents were required to explain whether teachers abided and understood their roles and responsibilities in implementing the UPE programme. The tabulation revealed a mean of 3.452 and a standard deviation of 1.33. As to whether teachers followed and understood UPE implementation policy guidelines; The tabulation revealed a mean of 3.094 and a standard deviation of 1.35. Asked whether teachers simplified their work by following daily routine; results reveal a mean of 2.789 and a standard deviation of 0.80. And tasked whether teachers adhered to tight policy guidelines in UPE implementation, the tabulation revealed a mean of 4.026 and a standard deviation of 1.46.

For economic discretion, and specifically as to whether teachers were equipped with learning materials each day; tabulation revealed a mean of 3.842 and a standard deviation of 1.48. Even though, data from the questionnaires teachers are equipped with learning materials each day but during the interview one respondent said:
Funds got are not enough to handle the requirements, teachers’ demands are not fully satisfied due to limited resources, and the accommodation is bad. By enrolment the teachers are affected, 300 books a day it is stressful.

As to whether teachers’ divergent interests were fully controlled by the administration; the tabulation revealed a mean of 3.842 and a standard deviation of 0.70. Tasked to whether teachers work under limited economic support had bearing on the implementation of UPE; the tabulation revealed a mean of 3.784 and a standard deviation of 0.79.

In order to investigate social discretion affects the implementation of UPE, respondents were tasked whether teachers designed and implemented programs that engaged parents in school and class activities and the tabulation revealed a mean of 3.657 and a standard deviation of 1.10. As to whether teachers were always well prepared to engage learners in all learning activities; results indicated a mean of 4.315 and a standard deviation of 1.36. And when the respondents were tasked to state whether teachers were willing to free up time when implementing the UPE policy; findings reveal a mean of 3.789 and a standard deviation of 1.52.

Lastly on political discretion the investigated whether political discretion impacted on the implementation of UPE. First as to whether teachers participated in the UPE policy formation process; majority of the respondents with a mean of 3.684 and a standard deviation of 1.056 were in agreement. Respondents were further asked whether teachers were informed about the legal statutes of the UPE policy, findings revealed that majority of the respondents 83.7% with a mean of 3.700 and a standard deviation of 1.058 agreed. Lastly, as to whether teachers’ in the implementation of UPE observed also the political interests; here majority of the respondents 71.1% with a mean of 3.868 and a standard deviation of 0.73 agreed with the statement.

**Teacher Discretion and Implementation of UPE programme**

To calculate the hypothesis that Teachers’ discretion significantly affected the implementation of the UPE programme, Pearson’s correlation coefficient was used and the results are illustrated in Table 1.

**Table 1: Correlation Matrix for Teacher’s Discretion and the implementation of UPE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher’s discretion</th>
<th>Implementation of UPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.468**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of UPE</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.468**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**

**Source: Researcher, (2018)**

N=190

From Table 1, results reveal that the correlation coefficient is at 0.468(**) and its significance level 0.000. the implication is that teachers’ discretion does influence the implementation of UPE programme. This is proved by a positive significant relationship between teacher’s discretion and the implementation of UPE in Jinja Municipal Council.
Teachers’ Autonomy and Implementation of UPE
To investigate teachers’ autonomy in the implementation of the UPE programme, the hypothesis Teachers autonomy significantly affects the implementation of UPE was calculated using Pearson correlation coefficient and the results of the hypothesis are given Table 2.

Table 2: Correlation matrix for teacher’s autonomy and the implementation of UPE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher’s autonomy</th>
<th>Implementation of UPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher’s autonomy</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.161**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of UPE</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.161**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Source: Primary data 2018 N=190

Table 2 show the correlation coefficient at 0.161(***) and its significance level of 0.009. This means that teacher’s autonomy does influence the implementation of UPE programme. Accordingly, there was a positive but weak significant relationship between teacher’s autonomy and the implementation of UPE. Further, a regression analysis was conducted to determine the strength of the relationship between teacher’s autonomy and the implementation of UPE. Results are shown in the Table 3.

Table 3: Regression Analysis for Teachers’ Autonomy and the implementation of UPE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted Square</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.223(a)</td>
<td>.555</td>
<td>.435</td>
<td>1.0340</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A Predictors: (Constant), teacher’s autonomy

Source: Researcher, (2018)
The coefficient of determination (Adjusted R square) value was 0.435; implying that teacher’s autonomy accounted for only 43.5% of the implementation of UPE. From all the results, the alternate hypothesis as earlier stated that teacher’s autonomy significantly affects the implementation of UPE schools is therefore upheld.

Teachers’ Coping Mechanism and implementation of UPE
The 3rd objective of the study was tested by the hypothesis that Teachers coping mechanism has a significant effect on the implementation of UPE. The hypothesis was tested using the Pearson correlation coefficient and the results are shown in Table 4.
Table 4: Correlation Matrix for Teacher’s Coping Mechanism and the implementation of UPE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Coping Mechanism</th>
<th>Implementation of UPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.994**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coping Mechanism</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.994**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of UPE</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

**Source:** Researcher, 2018

Table 4 shows results of the correlation coefficient is 0.994(**) and its significance level of 0.009. Results mean that teacher’s coping mechanisms influence the implementation of UPE. Accordingly, there is a positive significant relationship between teacher’s coping mechanism and the implementation of UPE.

**Discussion**

**Teachers’ Behavior and Implementation of Universal Primary Education**

Overall, findings showed that teachers’ behaviors do influence the implementation of UPE programme. The study further established that teachers’ judicial, economic, social and political discretions all affect the implementation of UPE. In order for teachers’ discretion to have positive contribution to the implementation of UPE, teachers ought to abide by their core roles and responsibilities. The study findings are in agreement with Brodkin (2011) who recommended that teacher discretion should involve more than either simple responses- to preference or to responses to incentives at school. Thus, teachers’ discretion is centered on making appropriate decisions to implement the UPE programme amidst resources available.

The study further discovered that for successful implementation of the UPE programme, teachers should be aware of the policy guidelines. Similar assertions were discovered by Hupe (2013) that pointed out that judicial view pointed out the interplay between rules and discretion, economical views drawing attention to issues about control over policy agents in contexts of divergent interests and the transaction costs involved. Similarly, social viewpoints at processes of social interaction exist within borders of organizations and finally the political focuses on problems of legitimacy.

**Teachers’ Autonomy and the Implementation of Universal Primary Education**

On the objective of teachers’ autonomy, the study revealed that indeed it had bearing on the implementation of UPE programme. Teachers’ rationality, professional treatment and moral judgment were key influential factors. The study further established that teachers necessarily need to exercise professionalism and judgmental skills independently for successfully implementation of UPE. Similar findings were discovered by Weimer and Vining (2005) when they opined that the logics of policy are important aspects of policy implementation. Similarly, and as Makinde (2005), opined, teachers need to should be fully empowered to implement the UPE programme so as to avoid serious social-economic problems like corruption that have contributed to the failure of many policies in developing countries.
Objective 3 of the study was investigated with the hypothesis: Teachers coping mechanism has a significant effect on the implementation of UPE. The study established that teachers’ coping mechanisms greatly impact the implementation of UPE. The study identified several factors associated with teacher stress that necessitated devising coping mechanisms. They included the negative effects of teacher-pupil relationship that endangers their ability to complete the assignments thereby creating implementation gaps. The findings were in agreement with earlier studies by Chenever et al; (2008); Jennings and Greenburg, (2019); AND Theirman ad Kitchel, (2012), all of which concluded that teacher occupational stress impacts on personal lives, job satisfaction and their eventually class room performance that ignites tendencies to devise coping mechanisms in the implementation of their duties. The overall failure to copy up will such occupational stress endangers teacher abilities to perform as expected and hence gaps in the expected implementation of the UPE policy.

Conclusion
The overall conclusion from the study was that teachers behaviours were greatly responsible for the tragedy of low performance in UPE schools in Jinja Municipal Council. Innocent souls where victimized by teachers’ discretion, autonomy, and coping mechanisms in the difficult and challenging situations encountered in the implementing the UPE programme. The specific conclusions of the study were the following conclusions:

Teachers’ Behavior and the implementation of UPE
The study concluded that teachers’ behaviors have a positive and significant effect on the implementation of Universal Primary Education in Jinja Municipal Council. The study further established that teachers’ discretion behavior as per as judicial, economic, social and political discretions had greatly affected the implementation of the UPE programme.

Teachers’ Autonomy and the implementation of UPE programme
As far as teacher autonomy, the study concluded that, bureaucratic rationality, professional treatment and moral judgment as the guiding elements in exercising teacher autonomy, did impact on the implementation of UPE in Jinja Municipal Council. It was concluded also that several teachers in the UPE programme continued to exercise independent professional and judgmental skills, were able to exercise their specialized talents and always made informed decision about what they taught to pupils and hence tried to ensure proper implementation of the UPE program in Jinja Municipal Council.

Teachers’ Coping Mechanisms and the implementation of UPE programme
Lastly, as for the 3rd objective, the study concluded that teachers’ coping mechanisms affected the implementation of UPE in Jinja Municipal Council. In order for teachers’ coping mechanisms to influence implementation of UPE, teachers were protected from being psychologically harmed by the UPE policy; teachers were also protected from the political stress in the implementation of the UPE policy.

Recommendations
The paper makes the following recommendations:
Teachers should strictly adhere to the UPE implementation guidelines to minimize discretion tendencies and to ensure that the UPE policy goals are achieved. Since the UPE programme has become of age, refresher training for new teachers should be carried out on the policy goals and implementation guidelines of the programme.

UPE teachers should be protected from undue political interferences during the policy implementation as this shall reduce the hostility they face with other stakeholders. However, a more cordial relationship between teachers and pupils should be encouraged to successful implementation of UPE programme.

References


Maynard-Moody, S. & Musheno, M (2003); Teachers and Cops: Stories from Front lines of Public service, Ann Arbour, The University of Michigan


Teacher Support Systems and Quality of Pedagogical Practices in Public Secondary Schools in Uganda

Paul Netalisile Malunda
Uganda Management Institute
E-mail: pmalunda@umi.ac.ug

Abstract
This study explored the extent to which teacher support systems influence the quality of pedagogical practices in public secondary schools in Uganda. It specifically examined the extent to which supervision and evaluation of teachers explain variations in quality of pedagogical practices. It was triggered by the persistent criticisms about the deteriorating quality of teaching and learning in public secondary schools in the country. A descriptive cross-sectional survey research design was used to conduct the study. Data were collected from 76 head teachers and 934 teachers drawn from 95 public secondary schools and six officials from the Uganda’s Ministry of Education and Sports (MoES) using survey, interview, observation, and document analysis methods. Data collected from teachers was analyzed using descriptive statistical analysis and ordered logistic regression, while content analysis was used to analyze qualitative data collected from lesson observations, document analysis, head teachers and ministry officials. The study findings revealed that: first, teacher supervision (Odds ratio =1.89; p=0.000<0.05) and teacher evaluation (Odds ratio =1.54; p=0.000<0.05) have statistically significant influence on the quality of pedagogical practices in public secondary schools in Uganda. Second, the study established that teacher supervision was based majorly on fault-finding, schools lack appropriate teacher evaluation tools, and Third, the study established that school administrators in attempt to ensure quality of teaching and learning, used a “monitoring tool” to supervise teacher punctuality and attendance, used previous national examination results to evaluate teacher performance and encouraged peer coaching. The study recommends that in order to enhance the quality of pedagogical practices, the Ministry of Education and Sports should (i) build the capacity of the schools to provide effective teacher support supervision; (ii) develop standard formative evaluation tools that can be used for continuous teacher evaluation as well as train head teachers on how to effectively appraise their staff.

Keywords: Teacher Supervision, Teacher Evaluation and Quality of Pedagogical Practices

Introduction
Public education is one of the primary duties of the state and over the last two decades, the Uganda Government has invested heavily in improving access to and quality of education. The government recognizes the fact that education is a powerful tool for transformation of society and plays a key role in a country’s sustainable development and its competitiveness within the global society. Although access at both primary and secondary levels of education appears to have been achieved, quality remains a big challenge (The Education and Sports Sector Annual Performance Report (ESAPR), 2016/17; National Development Plan 2010/11-2014/15). According to the Directorate of Education Standards (DES) report (MoES, 2017b), this challenge is explained by low quality pedagogical practices at the primary and secondary levels. The pedagogical practices in these schools are at variance with the expectation of the government and the curriculum planners. Teachers do not conform to the classroom standards set by the Directorate of Education Standards and National Curriculum Development Centre (CURASSE, 2007).

Historically, Uganda’s education system was one of the best on the African continent in the sixties and early seventies (Government of Uganda, 1992). Teaching focused on developing learners’ competencies and students were taught in a way that fostered higher order thinking skills. Graduates at different levels of education were equipped with adequate skills tailored to the job market. The wars and civil strife during the seventies and eighties led to the neglect of educational institutions and erosion in the quality of education at all levels (Uganda Government, 1992). The quality of teaching suffered because several teachers fled the country while the morale
of those teachers that remained declined. In order to re-establish the quality of education and as a strategy of accelerating development, government introduced and implemented major reforms in education in line with the Education White Paper (MoES, 2009). The reforms included implementation of Universal Primary and Secondary Education among others. Universal Secondary Education has expanded access to secondary education for many Ugandans, including some of the vulnerable poor who would not have even attended secondary school. Despite the reforms, many students completing the secondary cycle are not able to speak and write good English given the fact that they are taught, and assessed in English (Uganda National Examination Board [UNEB], 2018). There are also indications that all is not well with the quality of teaching at secondary school level, despite the increase in the numbers of first and second grades in the national examinations. Some of the indications include; increasing examinations malpractices, the rising levels of rote learning, holiday coaching of most of the students, examination-oriented teaching and part-time teaching by several teachers.

Theoretically, the study anchored on the Plan-Do-Check-Act (PDCA) model of quality enhancement that popularised by the quality guru, Edwards Deming. According to the model, a continuous feedback loop is essential in order to analyze, measure, and identify sources of variation from customer requirements so as to take action for continual quality improvement (Deming, 1986). As a result, the model emphasizes and demonstrates that any improvement programmes must always start with careful planning. This, the model adds, must result in effective action, and move on again to careful planning in a continuous cycle. Oakland (1993) refers to this pattern of quality improvement where the completion of one cycle continues with the beginning of the next - Deming’s never ending quality cycle. The PDCA cycle is illustrated as follows:

![PDCA Cycle Diagram](image)

**Figure 1: The PDCA Cycle**

Source: Deming (1993, p. 134)

According to Figure 1, the PDCA cycle goes through four phases. Phase 1, Plan – it involves establishing the objectives and processes required to deliver results in agreement with the expected output. Phase 2, Do – it involves executing the plan or effecting the processes and making the product. Phase 3, Check – it involves studying the actual results and comparing them against the expected results. Finally, Phase 4, Act – it involves using the results to improve further what is being done. According to Phillips, Balan and Manko (2014), the PDCA model is relevant in ensuring quality improvement in different aspects of education, including the quality of pedagogical practices. The researchers agree with this observation. Thus, in this study, the model was opted for because the researchers also concurred with Ayeni (2011) who hypothesised that to ensure continuous improvement in the quality of education, the teaching and learning activities need to be regularly evaluated against the set objectives and standards, and corrective actions need to be taken to produce the desired changes with regard to efficiency, quality, and satisfaction. As a result, it was believed that the quality of pedagogical
practices in secondary schools in Uganda would be improved through the process of collecting data for evaluation purposes; making classroom observations, evaluating the teaching practices, analysing data to determine areas that need to be improved, and providing relevant professional development for teachers following the PDCA cycle.

The study focused on two main concepts: Teacher support systems and quality of pedagogical practices. According to Elfers, Stritikus, Calaff, Soo Von Esch, Lucero, Knapp, and Plecki (2009), support systems in a school system refer to a set of intentional and differentiated efforts which are focused on the continuous improvement of student and teacher learning. These are programmes, services and activities designed to marginally assist and facilitate the achievement of instructional goals and objectives in a school system. Examples of such programmes, services and activities include teacher supervision, teacher evaluation (appraisal) and teacher professional development. These mechanisms are deliberately designed to support teachers in gaining the knowledge and competencies they need to implement services that result in positive outcomes for learners by the Ministry of Education and Sports or schools in which the teachers operate. The systems are meant to enhance performance of teachers in the delivery of quality education services (MOES, 2017). In this study, attention was paid to formal and informal support systems at both national and school levels focusing on teacher supervision, teacher evaluation and teacher professional development in Uganda.

Quality of pedagogical practices was used to mean the teaching strategies that enhance learning and focus on the quality of the learning outcomes (Kahsay, 2012). Quality of pedagogical practices was defined in this study as the teaching practices that conform to the guidelines issued by the Ministry of Education. Teachers in Uganda are expected to adhere to the National Curriculum Development Centre (NCDC) and the Directorate of Education Standards (DES) guidelines while executing their duties in the teaching and learning process. Teachers are expected to prepare and plan for lessons by making schemes of work, lesson plans and lesson notes. During the teaching process, teachers are expected to employ a range of appropriate methods to meet lesson objectives, use real life examples to explain concepts, nurture a positive relationship with students, give, and build on homework.

Contextually, this study was undertaken in public secondary schools Uganda. It was prompted by the fact that despite Government’s initiatives to improve the quality of education in Uganda, the quality of pedagogical practices at secondary school level remains poor (MoES, 2017). The poor quality of pedagogical practices has been manifested in diverse ways. For instance, there have been reportedly poor scheming and lesson planning by teachers; more use of teacher-centred rather than learner-centred pedagogies; and dominant application of theoretical rather practical approaches to the teaching of sciences (UNEB, 2018; MoES, 2017; Uganda National Council for Science and Technology Report [UNCST], 2012). Furthermore, assessments of students have been geared towards passing national examinations while other objectives of the curriculum such as promotion of moral values, practical skills and participation in social and cultural activities have been ignored, and many such practices that modern day educationalists consider undesirable. In fact, the decline in the conformance to guidelines laid down by NCDC by teachers in secondary schools has been attributed to the weak teacher supervision and evaluation systems (MoES, 2017). Kagolo (2014) earlier revealed that the evaluations of teachers in public secondary schools in Uganda have been badly conducted with very appalling feedback being given to the teachers. This kind of scenario, Teacher Initiative in Sub-Saharan Africa (TISSA) advised in their 2013 report to be urgently addressed if the quality of Uganda’s education system is to improve (MoES, 2017). Nagel (2003), in fact, counseled that neglecting the quality of pedagogical practices could have serious repercussions on the country’s quality of education in general and its development. Therefore, the study investigated the extent to which teacher support systems explained quality of pedagogical practices in public
secondary schools in Uganda since Government and specifically the extent to which supervision and evaluation of teachers explain quality of pedagogical practices in public secondary schools.

**Literature Review**

A number of studies in relation to teacher supervision and quality of pedagogical practices have in the past been conducted (Sule, Ameh & Egbai, 2015; Usman, 2015; Veloo, Komuji & Khalid, 2013). For example, in a study on the relationship between supervision and the roles teachers play in ensuring effectiveness that was conducted in secondary schools in Nigeria by Sule, Ameh and Egbai (2015) revealed that teacher supervision through classroom observations positively contributed to teacher effectiveness in a school. Similarly, Veloo, Komuji and Khalid (2013) in their study about the effect of clinical supervision on the teaching performance of secondary school teachers in Malaysia, relatedly established that formal observations significantly contributed to improved teacher preparation, lesson development, learner assessment and classroom control. However, several literature (e.g. Tesfaw & Hofman, 2014; Campbell, 2013; Milanowski, 2011; Marshall, 2009; Holland, 2004) argue that formal classroom observations have little effect on teaching practices. These scholars meanwhile advocate for more frequent, short, unannounced, informal classroom observations by school authorities to motivate teachers to adopt effective pedagogical practices. They contend that informal classroom observations actually provide a better picture of the teacher’s competence and his or her pedagogical practices than the formal observations. Zepeda (2010) on the other hand asserts that classroom observations can only positively influence teacher effectiveness when supervisors focus on strengthening the relationship between themselves and teachers by holding coaching discussions one-on-one after the observations but not on fault-finding. In congruence with Zepeda’s assertion on the approach of giving feedback, findings in a study on the impact of instructional supervision on students’ academic performance by Usman (2015) revealed that the manner in which supervisors give feedback to supervisees, significantly impacts on the teachers’ pedagogical practices and performance in classroom settings. Although these studies indicated that classroom observations impacted on the teachers, pedagogical practices, the studies were majorly conducted in the context of developed countries. This study was conducted to fill the contextual gap.

With regard to portfolio supervision, findings of several studies reveal that portfolio supervision significantly explains teacher effectiveness in the classroom (e.g. Peretomode, 2001; Sule et al., 2015; Usman, 2015). A study conducted on the impact of instructional supervision on academic performance of secondary school students in Nasarawa State, Nigeria by Usman (2015) for instance revealed the existence of a significant positive relationship between portfolio supervision and teacher performance. Similarly, findings of Sule et al. (2015) and Peretomode (2001) also exposed the presence of a positive relationship between portfolio supervision and teacher effectiveness. However, unlike Usman (2015) who took into consideration the review of lesson plans, lesson notes, students’ notes and teachers’ record keeping as important ingredients of portfolio supervision, Sule et al. and Peretomode concentrated their focus only on the review of the teachers’ lesson notes. Orenaiya (2014) and Musaazi (2006) meanwhile counsel that it is imperative for supervisors to review teaching artefacts that include among others: schemes of work, lesson plans, teachers’ notes and students’ work to establish relatedness, completeness of task and syllabus coverage. However, Zepeda (2010) thinks that what to include in the supervised portfolio should be based on the purpose of the supervision. Bird (1990) as cited by Zepeda (2010) emphasizes that to improve students’ learning, portfolio artefacts should focus on teaching tasks of planning and preparation, teaching in class and student evaluations.

In regard to teacher evaluation and quality of pedagogical practices, finding of some of the previous studies revealed a strong relationship between teacher evaluation and the quality of teaching and learning in schools.
Milanowski (2011) and Marshall (2009) for example established that formative evaluation through regular classroom observations, review of classroom artefacts, and checking of learners’ note books by school administrators lead to improved quality of teaching and learning. Findings of a related study by Pappy (2012) concur with Milanowski and Marshall, however, the study emphasised linking results of the formative teacher evaluation to teacher professional growth and development for enhanced quality of pedagogy. Kalule (2014) in a study carried out in three rural districts of Uganda asserts that for formative evaluation to be effective, the appraisers should have the competence to appraise. Kalule (2014) established that head teachers who are expected to conduct formative teacher evaluation lacked the required training and skills need for the job.

In relation to summative evaluation, Mpokosa and Ndaruhtse (2008) assert that this type of evaluation significantly influence the quality of pedagogical practices. On the other hand, Mielke and Frontier (2012) are of the view that summative evaluations do not support teacher professional growth since the judgmental nature of the evaluation impacts negatively on the self-esteem of the teachers. In fact, they suggest that an evaluation system that allows teachers to appraise themselves and suggest areas for professional development is better than the one carried out at the end of the activity. Tanya (2013) further reiterates that summative evaluation contributes to the deterioration of collegial relationships, feelings of mistrust, fear, nervousness, and tension during the time of appraisal. Therefore, such kind of appraisal can be harmful to the staff that are praised if it is not appropriated conducted. Musaazi (2006) like Tanya advises that summative evaluations should be conducted in a cordial and collaborative manner in order to enhance quality of pedagogical practices. However, this does not seem to be the case in most secondary schools in Uganda. A report from the Ministry of Education and Sports (MoES, 2013a) shows that summative teacher evaluations in Uganda are irregular and inconsistent. In fact, the Education and Sports Sector Annual Performance Report (ESAPR) of 2013 (MoES, 2013a) indicated that several schools had not conducted annual teacher appraisals for the previous two years. Donaldson and Peske (2010) in their study of schools in the USA attributed failure of the school administrators to conduct regular teacher performance appraisals and provide quality feedback to lack of time. They observed that few school administrators had evaluation systems, competencies and skills to effectively appraise and provide quality feedback on the appraisals that could inform professional growth. This may partly explain the Uganda’s scenario. In addition, the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) report (2013) also observes that summative teacher evaluation in the OECD countries influence career and remuneration, and endorsements for under performance. However, in Uganda, teacher performance appraisal contributes only 20 percent in the criteria considered for promoting staff and does not have a direct influence on teacher salaries. This de-link between results of performance appraisal and professional growth and remuneration renders teacher appraisal ineffective in the country.

Methodology
The study adopted a descriptive cross-sectional survey research design. The target population was comprised of teachers, head teachers and officials from the Directorate of Education Standards (DES). The study sample consisted of 934 teachers selected through multi-stage sampling technique, 95 head teachers, and two officials from DES who were purposively selected. Data were collected using three different data collection methods, namely: survey, interview and observation methods. Three different instruments were also used to collect data. First, a questionnaire whose items were adopted and modified from the teaching and learning assessment instrument of DES comprised of three sections: A, B and C was used to collect data from the teachers. Section A of the questionnaire had six questions pertaining to respondents’ background information. Section B included 12 items that sough teachers’ opinion on supervision. Section C was composed of seven questions aimed at finding out the respondents’ opinions pertaining to teacher evaluation; and section D had 15 items aimed at
collecting respondents’ opinions on quality of pedagogical practices in public secondary schools. The items in sections B, C and D were measured on a 5-point Likert scale with the following categories: Strongly Agree (5), Agree (4), Non-committal (3), Disagree (2) and Strongly Disagree (1). The questionnaire was preferred in this case because the respondents were many but they could all read and write. This helped to save time and costs during the study. Second, to elicit the opinions of DES inspectors and head teachers of the selected schools on the contribution of teacher supervision and teacher evaluation to the quality of pedagogical practices, the interview method and its corresponding interview guide were used. The interview method was opted for because it enabled further probing of the issues that were being investigated. Third, the researchers used the observation method to collect data. An observation check-list was adopted from DES’s teaching and learning quality instrument and used to conduct the observations. This method made it possible to triangulate the information obtained through the use of the other two methods described above. Overall, the instruments used were pre-tested before the actual data collection was carried out. Descriptive and inferential statistical methods were used to analyze quantitative data. Specifically, the logistic regression model was used to establish the extent to which teacher support systems influence the quality of pedagogical practices. The tests of significance were performed at the probability level of p< 0.05. Qualitative data were on the other hand analyzed using content analysis method. In the next section, the researchers present the findings of the study.

**Results**
First, the researchers present herein the background characteristics of the respondents in order to portray that data were collected from an authentic group of subjects. The results are presented in Table 1.

### Table 1: Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Less than 20 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20 - 40 years</td>
<td>664</td>
<td>71.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40 years and above</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>28.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>644</td>
<td>69.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>31.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>22.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelors</td>
<td>577</td>
<td>61.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post-graduate</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of years in the school</td>
<td>Less than 3 years</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>18.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 to 10 years</td>
<td>554</td>
<td>59.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 years above</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>21.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in Table 1 show that majority (71.1%) of the teachers were aged between 20 and 40 years, demonstrating that majority were young and energetic to effectively discharge instructional tasks. Results also suggest a gender disparity in employment of teachers in public secondary schools with more male teachers (69.0%) employed compared to their female counterparts (31.0%). The results also show that the majority (83%) of the teachers had the requisite qualification (at least a diploma) to teach at secondary school level, demonstrating that the teachers in the system have the necessary qualifications to offer quality teaching. In relation to numbers of years spent in the schools, findings in Table 1 show that majority (81.3 %) of the teachers had spent more than three years in the sampled schools while 18.7 per cent had spent less than three years, indicating that teachers had long standing cognate experience in serving as teachers.

**Teacher Supervision**: The study sought views on teacher supervision in public secondary schools from teachers, head teachers. This sub-section presents the analysis of descriptive results of the teachers’ views on teacher supervision using frequencies and percentages, ordered logistical regression results and results of qualitative
data on teacher supervision from head teachers. Table 2 below presents the frequency and percentage distribution of teachers’ views on teacher supervision.

Table 2: Distribution of Teachers’ Views on Supervision in Public Secondary Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Supervision</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Noncommittal</th>
<th>Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The head teacher reviews schemes of work at the beginning of the term.</td>
<td>162 (17.3%)</td>
<td>29 (3.1%)</td>
<td>743 (79.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The head teacher regularly observes classroom teaching.</td>
<td>401 (42.9%)</td>
<td>74 (7.9%)</td>
<td>459 (49.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The head teacher notifies me before he/she observes me.</td>
<td>578 (61.9%)</td>
<td>63 (6.7%)</td>
<td>293 (31.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The head teacher discusses with me how to improve on areas of my weakness after observing my teaching.</td>
<td>467 (50%)</td>
<td>63 (6.7%)</td>
<td>40 (43.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The heads of department review schemes of work and lesson Plans</td>
<td>100 (10.7%)</td>
<td>27 (2.9%)</td>
<td>807 (86.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The heads of department monitor the setting and marking of tests/exams</td>
<td>122 (13.2%)</td>
<td>27 (2.9%)</td>
<td>812 (86.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Heads of Department supervise the teaching process.</td>
<td>300 (32.1%)</td>
<td>60 (6.4%)</td>
<td>574 (61.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I plan with my HoD for the lesson observation.</td>
<td>482 (51.6%)</td>
<td>78 (8.4%)</td>
<td>374 (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I hold discussions with my HoD after the classroom observation.</td>
<td>484 (51.8%)</td>
<td>61 (6.5%)</td>
<td>389 (41.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our school is inspected by officials from the Ministry of Education.</td>
<td>394 (42.2%)</td>
<td>28 (3%)</td>
<td>512 (54.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspectors from the Ministry of Education supervise the way I teach in class whenever they visit the school.</td>
<td>594 (63.6%)</td>
<td>108 (11.6%)</td>
<td>232 (24.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I get feedback whenever MoES officials supervise me.</td>
<td>639 (68.4%)</td>
<td>93 (10%)</td>
<td>202 (21.6%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in Table 2 show that there was an effort to conduct portfolio supervision by head teachers and heads of department in public secondary schools. Findings indicate that 79.6% of the respondents agreed that head teachers reviewed their schemes of work at the beginning of every term and similarly 86.4% respondents agreed that heads of department reviewed their schemes of work and lesson plans. There is significant evidence that heads of department supervise the setting and marking of tests and examinations. Results also suggest that lesson observations are mostly conducted by subject heads of department probably because they have an in-depth understanding of the subject areas and head teachers were more involved in regular short visits to classrooms (49.2%). Results further demonstrate that less than 50% of the teachers whose lessons were observed ever got feedback from the supervisors. Whenever classroom observations were carried out, supervisors hardly notified teachers about the classroom observations or even held discussions with the teachers after the observations.

Analysis of interview data revealed that head teachers of non-USE schools did not see the necessity of conducting classroom observations unless when students or parents complained about the quality of teaching of a particular teacher. When one head teacher of a non-USE school in Buganda region was asked how often he carried out classroom observation, she had this to say:

...the teachers posted to this school know exactly what is expected of them as per the posting instructions; and since they are all university graduates, they should be able to learn
the culture of quality teaching that they have found here. I do not think it is really necessary to
go and sit in their classes to observe how they teach. Maybe when students or their parents
complain....

Yet, findings from interview with head teachers of USE schools revealed that classroom observations
were more pronounced in these schools because teachers taught in several schools or were engaged in other
income-generating activities. One head teacher of a USE school in the Elgon sub-region for instance had this to
say during an interview:

...our teachers earn only government salary; we do not pay monthly allowances like
our colleagues in the Non-USE schools because we are not supported by parents through the
Parents Teachers’ Associations (PTA). And because of this, our teachers teach in several
private schools to raise extra income and many times miss teaching learners in their “mother”
schools. As a head teacher, I have to closely monitor the teachers by walking around the school
and conducting regular lesson observations in order to ensure that my students are taught well.

**Teacher evaluation:** The study also sought views on teacher evaluation in public secondary schools from
teachers and head teachers. This sub-section presents the analysis of descriptive results of the teachers’ views
on teacher evaluation using frequencies and percentages, ordered logistical regression results and results of
qualitative data on teacher evaluation from head teachers. Table 3 below presents the frequency and percentage
distribution of teachers’ views on teacher evaluation.

Table 3: Distribution of teachers’ views on evaluation in public secondary schools in Uganda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Evaluation</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Non-committal</th>
<th>Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The head of department assesses the way I teach</td>
<td>369 (39.5%)</td>
<td>51 (5.5%)</td>
<td>514 (55%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I agree with my Head of Department on the teaching and learning targets at the beginning of every term.</td>
<td>391 (41.8%)</td>
<td>37 (3.9%)</td>
<td>507 (54.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluations by Heads of Department are based on the targets set and agreed upon at the beginning of the term.</td>
<td>391 (41.8%)</td>
<td>51 (5.5%)</td>
<td>492 (52.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My head teacher annually appraises me.</td>
<td>148 (15.8%)</td>
<td>57 (6.1%)</td>
<td>729 (78.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The head teacher discusses with me the results of the annual appraisal.</td>
<td>277 (29.7%)</td>
<td>67 (7.1%)</td>
<td>590 (63.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal of my work is fair assessment of my performance as a teacher in this school.</td>
<td>359 (38.4%)</td>
<td>66 (7.1%)</td>
<td>509 (54.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal of my performance has a great impact on the way I teach in the classroom.</td>
<td>306 (32.8%)</td>
<td>77 (8.2%)</td>
<td>551 (59.0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results in Table 3 indicate that slightly over 50 percent of the teachers agreed with their subject heads at the
beginning of the academic term on the teaching and learning targets and were appraised basing on these targets.
Although 78 percent of the teachers agreed that they were annually appraised by the head teachers, a lower
percentage (63.2%) indicated that head teachers discussed with them the results of the appraisals. This implied
that several teachers did not participate in setting performance targets and some head teachers did not give
feedback on the appraisals undertaken.
Information from the interviews demonstrated that public secondary schools did not have a systematic approach of evaluating teachers. Most schools evaluated teachers basing on the students’ performance reflected in UNEB examination results. The teachers whom the students performed well in their subjects were rated as good performers and recognized with prizes! Furthermore, information from the head teachers demonstrated that annual performance appraisal of teachers in the majority of the selected secondary schools was not frequent despite it being a requirement by the Ministry of Public Service. The inconsistency in the annual appraisal of teachers was more pronounced in the Universal Secondary Education (USE) schools than non-USE schools. Only 32 percent of the interviewed USE school head teachers had conducted the appraisals the previous year. Further analysis revealed that 42 percent of the head teachers in the Elgon and 38 percent head teachers in West Nile sub-regions had not appraised their teachers for the previous two years.

Findings showed that some head teachers lacked the competency to effectively appraise the teachers. Head teachers in the districts of Bulambuli, Manafwa and Ntungamo acknowledged failure to determine the key performance indicators and targets that would be used to appraise teachers. According to one head teacher, “the design of the appraisal form was general for all civil servants and tailoring the format to teacher appraisal was our big challenge”. Some head teachers from West Nile Sub-region confessed that they invited “senior head teachers from neighboring schools towards the end of the year to help in the appraisal of their teachers. However, some of those head teachers were unwilling to help junior ones.” This means that lack of evaluation skills amongst head teachers could be responsible for the irregular teacher evaluation in secondary schools in Uganda.

**Quality of Pedagogical Practices: The study as well sought** the teachers’ and head teachers’ perceptions on the quality of pedagogical practices in public secondary schools. Furthermore, evidence of quality of pedagogy was sought from documents was analyzed and presented in this sub-section

**Table 4: Distribution of Teachers’ Views on Quality of Pedagogical Practices in Public Secondary Schools in Uganda**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality of Pedagogical Practices</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Non-committal</th>
<th>Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I make a scheme of work at the beginning of every term to make my teaching better.</td>
<td>154 (16.5%)</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
<td>778 (83.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using a lesson plan during teaching is a waste of time.</td>
<td>367 (39.3%)</td>
<td>40 (4.3%)</td>
<td>527 (56.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I always prepare class exercises for students before the lessons.</td>
<td>257 (27.5%)</td>
<td>17 (1.8%)</td>
<td>660 (70.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I assess the student's prior knowledge and skills at the start of a lesson.</td>
<td>82 (8.8%)</td>
<td>16 (1.7%)</td>
<td>836 (89.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use a variety of teaching methods to improve the quality of teaching.</td>
<td>325 (34.8%)</td>
<td>5 (5%)</td>
<td>604 (64.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I use clear and purposeful questions during lessons.</td>
<td>89 (9.5%)</td>
<td>12 (1.3%)</td>
<td>833 (89.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I give class exercises while teaching to make my teaching easy.</td>
<td>401 (42.9%)</td>
<td>21 (2.2%)</td>
<td>512 (54.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students learn best by finding solutions to problems on their own.</td>
<td>281 (30.1%)</td>
<td>35 (3.7%)</td>
<td>618 (66.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I always mark the class exercises while in class to help me teach better.</td>
<td>388 (41.5%)</td>
<td>32 (3.4%)</td>
<td>514 (55.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I regularly give homework at the end of each lesson.</td>
<td>89 (9.5%)</td>
<td>27 (2.9%)</td>
<td>818 (87.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement</td>
<td>Yes (%)</td>
<td>No (%)</td>
<td>Not sure (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I usually go through marked homework exercises with the students at the start of the lesson.</td>
<td>353 (37.8%)</td>
<td>53 (5.7%)</td>
<td>528 (56.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I give at least two tests in my subject per term.</td>
<td>260 (27.8%)</td>
<td>31 (3.3%)</td>
<td>643 (68.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I return marked scripts in time before the next test.</td>
<td>134 (14.3%)</td>
<td>22 (2.4%)</td>
<td>778 (83.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I make corrections when I return marked scripts to students.</td>
<td>111 (11.9%)</td>
<td>19 (2.0%)</td>
<td>804 (86.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I find explaining concepts clearly to learners using real life examples a challenge.</td>
<td>374 (40%)</td>
<td>35 (3.7%)</td>
<td>525 (56.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I give remedial lessons to correct students areas of weakness</td>
<td>361 (38.7%)</td>
<td>54 (5.8%)</td>
<td>519 (55.5%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results in Table 4 show that whereas 83.3 percent of the teachers agreed that they made schemes of work at the beginning of every term, 56.4 percent perceived making lesson plans a waste of time and 70.7 percent indicated that they prepared class exercises before their lessons. Other than making lesson plans, results indicate that there is an effort made by teachers to prepare for lessons notes. Concerning the teaching and learning process, 89.5 percent of the teachers indicated that they assessed the students’ prior knowledge and skills at the beginning of the lesson and 64.7 percent agreed that they used a variety of teaching methods to improve the quality of teaching. Results also indicate that 54.8 percent of the teachers gave class exercises while teaching. The majority (56.2%) of the teachers indicated that they had challenges with explaining concepts using real life examples. Regarding evaluation of students, 55.0 percent of the teachers marked class exercises. Whereas 87.6 percent of the respondents agreed that they gave homework, only 56.5 percent agreed that they revised marked homework with the students. While 68.8 percent of the teachers gave at least two tests in the subjects they taught per academic term, 83.3 percent returned marked scripts before giving the next test. The majority (86.1%) of the respondents agreed that they made corrections whenever they returned marked scripts. These results show that teachers put more emphasis on marking tests other than the class exercises and homework.

Despite a general pattern of teachers indicating that they were conforming to the set standard, majority (60.6%) of the respondents indicated that were not satisfied with the performance of their schools, and also interview with the head teachers, lesson observation, and document review results demonstrated otherwise. This cast doubt on the teachers’ positive responses to items on quality of pedagogical practices. Could it have been that teachers feared to give negative responses to items that examined their conformance to professional standards? Further analysis of data was conducted using ordered logistic regression analysis to establish the variability in the overall quality of pedagogical practices accounted for by factors of quality of pedagogical practices and demographic characteristics.

During document analysis, it was discovered that although schemes of work were made at every beginning of the term, most schemes of work lacked evidence of planning for teaching or learning aids and use of learner-based methods of teaching. Scrutiny of the schemes of work revealed that most teachers did not refer to the NCDC guidelines that emphasised learner-based approaches of teaching and practical teaching of science subjects. In fact, with regard to making lesson plans, analysis of interview data revealed that teachers perceived making lesson plans as a waste of time; hence, many of them relied mainly on lesson notes and text books in order to teach. As one head teacher observed, “teachers only make lesson plans during their teaching practice and when they expect inspectors from DES. To them, making lesson plans only wastes their time. It is an unfortunate practice - but one that we have learnt to cope with”.

With regard to using a variety of teaching methods and specifically learner-based methods of teaching, the head teachers explained that teachers often find it difficult to go by the NCDC guidelines because they would
not be able to complete the syllabi in time for the national examinations. Results of the lesson observation showed that of the 106 lessons that were observed, only 36 (33.9\%) of the teachers varied methods of teaching, and of these, 31 (86\%) were science or mathematics teachers. One head teacher from West Nile sub-region described the situation as:

Teachers shun learner-based methods of teaching because these methods consume a lot of time. The teachers cannot complete the syllabi if they are to follow the NCDC guidelines. However, mathematics and science teachers, to a certain extent, use learner-based methods of teaching since these subjects are practical in nature.

These meant that the teachers’ pedagogical practices were skewed towards doing what could be considered undesirable; thus ineffective practices.

**Verification of the Hypotheses**

The data collected from teachers was subjected to ordered logistic multiple regression to test the following null hypotheses;

i) Teacher supervision does not in any way explain variations in the quality of pedagogical practices

ii) Teacher evaluation does not in any way explain variations in the quality of pedagogical practices

Results of the multiple regression analysis are presented in Table 5 below.

### Table 5 Multiple Regression Results on Teacher Support Systems and Quality of Pedagogical Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality of Pedagogical practices</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>95% conf. interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher supervision</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>1.495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher evaluation</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>1.225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-region</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.946</td>
<td>-0.153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School status</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.481</td>
<td>-0.272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>0.161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>-0.08</td>
<td>0.669</td>
<td>-0.453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>-0.05</td>
<td>0.702</td>
<td>-0.288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education level</td>
<td>-0.45</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>-0.771</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration</td>
<td>-0.36</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>-0.604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject type</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.071</td>
<td>-0.030</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pseudo $R^2 = 0.5047$, Number of obs = 934, LR $\chi^2 (10) = 890.10$, Prob. $> \chi^2 = 0.0000$

Results in table 5 show that all the 934 observations were used in the analysis. The likelihood ratio chi-square of 890.10 with a p-value of 0.000 indicated that the model as a whole was statistically significant compared to the null model with no predictors. Pseudo $R^2 = 0.5047$ means that the explanatory variables in the model explained 50.5\% variability in the overall quality of pedagogical practices. In the model, teacher supervision, teacher evaluation, age, highest level of education and the number of years a teacher taught in the school were found to be statistically significant at 5\% level of significance. The null hypotheses that teacher supervision does not in any way explain quality of pedagogical practices, and teacher evaluation does not in any way explain quality of pedagogical practices is rejected. The results mean that with the other explanatory variables held constant in the model, quality of pedagogical practices would significantly improve with increased teacher
supervision and evaluation. Other variables in the model that included sub-regions, school status (USE/non-USE), gender and category of subject taught did not significantly explain variations in the quality of pedagogical practices. Teacher supervision with the highest coefficient of 1.89 significantly explained variation in quality of pedagogical practices most in public secondary schools.

**Discussion of Results**

The research findings indicate that both teacher supervision and teacher evaluation significantly explain variations in the quality of pedagogical practices. The findings are consistent with earlier studies (Sule, Ameh & Egbai, 2015; Veloo, Komujji & Khalid, 2013; Peretomode, 2001). Also in agreement with Usman’s findings in Nigerian schools, findings of the study demonstrate that teacher supervision significantly contributes to teachers’ conformance to teaching standards. The findings were however in contrast to the findings of Wilcox (1995) and Kogan and Maden (1999) which revealed that instructional supervision generally brings about little improvement in the quality of teaching and learning within schools.

Despite the significant contribution of teacher supervision to conformance to standards, results indicate that teacher supervision in public secondary schools faces a number of challenges. The Directorate of Education Standards that is responsible for monitoring and evaluating quality of teaching and learning at national level lacks an adequate work force and logistical support to effectively supervise the teaching and learning process. The head teachers as affirmed in the Education and Sports Sector Annual Performance Report (ESAPR) (FY 2013/14) focus on fault-finding and criticizing teachers rather than helping teachers to improve on their teaching competencies (MoES, 2017). For effective instructional supervision, supervisors are expected to monitor the teaching and learning process, and give feedback to teachers on their performance in the classroom through pointing out errors or commending the teachers for good work done (Mulkeen, 2010).

The study discovered that the head teachers found use of the “monitoring tool” an effective instructional supervision method because it kept them well informed about the teachers’ practices in the classroom. The form is designed to monitor teacher attendance, punctuality, teaching and time on task. However, this form had shortfalls because the class monitors only ticked the column of lesson taught or not taught, other columns of arrival and departure time were rarely ticked which made determining teachers’ time on task difficult. This form would be more effective if teachers were signing their time in and out of the classroom. Supervision of schemes of work appears to be conducted as a ritual to comply with the Ministry of Education policy. Supervisors hardly check for whether the preparation of the schemes of work is in adherence to NCDC guidelines. The guidelines emphasize planning for teaching aids, clearly spelling out objectives for teaching specific topics and indicating a variety of teaching methods. Findings also demonstrated that head teachers and subject heads rarely checked students’ notes to determine relatedness of what was being taught with what was planned in the schemes of work. Monitoring the relatedness of students’ notes to the schemes of work and coverage of instruction form a basis of purposeful guidance and support to teachers’ classroom teaching (Orenaiya, 2014).

In regard to teacher evaluation, findings are in agreement with findings of previous studies (Phillips, Balan & Manko, 2014; Orenaiye et al, (2014) that revealed a positive correlation between teacher evaluation and quality of pedagogical practices. However, several public secondary schools in Uganda do not have a system of continuous evaluation of teachers’ output as indicated in the ESAP report of 2013/14 (MoES, 2013). There is, in fact, no evidence of formative evaluation systems that focused on classroom activities or specifically pedagogical practices such as teacher preparation, the teaching and learning process, and assessment of learners.
on a continuous basis. Lack of such systems is detrimental to teacher professional development and quality of teaching (Papay, 2012). Finding of this study also demonstrated that teacher performance was gauged by the students’ performance reflected in UNEB examination results. Use of national examination results may not measure teachers’ conformance to standard pedagogical practices. The study further established that in the few schools where formative evaluations were conducted, the approach was not for the purpose of continuous professional development, but rather for punishing individuals with poor performance. For example, the head teachers’ transfer of teachers to lower classes after establishing their low performance levels without addressing the areas that needed to be improved could be interpreted as punitive by the affected teachers. The OECD (2013) assert that feedback that is oriented towards judging and control of teachers rather than professional growth and development cannot improve quality of pedagogical practices Teacher evaluation systems should be used to help teachers to know how they are teaching and how they can improve on their teaching (Mpokosa & Ndaruhatse, 2008).

Conclusion and Recommendations
Quality of pedagogical practices is significantly anchored on teacher support systems; yet the formative evaluation systems are barely in place and summative teacher evaluation is irregular in public secondary schools in Uganda. Head teachers of several public secondary schools lack the competence in teacher performance appraisal. To improve quality of pedagogical practices in public secondary schools, head teachers and subject heads of department should continuously supervise and evaluate teacher performance in the classroom and provide constructive feedback for professional growth and development that will lead to improved quality of pedagogical practice. This implies that if quality of pedagogical practices is to improve, the Ministry of Education should put in place training programmes for all the newly appointed head teachers specifically in teacher performance appraisal and providing necessary support in the area of instructional supervision and effective use the appraisal tools. The Ministry should further develop a standard formative teacher evaluation tool for all secondary schools in Uganda for the continuous assessment of teachers’ performance. The “monitoring tool” is an efficient approach of instructional supervision, however the administrators together with the teachers need to train student how best to manage these form.

References
The effects of Guided Play using the 6 Brick Duplo Block on the development of aspects of Visual Perception in Pre-literate 5-7-year-old children in selected Schools in Kenya and South Africa

Sarah Jemutai

Abstract
This study investigated the possible effects that the use of guided play using the 6 Brick Duplo Block approach might have in terms of the development of aspects of visual perception in pre-literate 5-7-year-old children. An explanatory sequential mixed-method design was employed. Seventy-seven Grade R learners in two schools, one in the Republic of South Africa and the other in the Republic of Kenya, comprised the purposive convenience sample. Quantitative pre- and post-intervention data were generated using the Visual Perception Abilities Test (VPAT) and analysed using Excel functions to generate descriptive and inferential statistics. The pre-test mean score in the Kenyan school was statistically and practically significantly lower than the South African pre-test mean score. This difference was attributed to the amount and type of play that took place in the natural settings of these schools prior to the intervention and the nature and amount of play material available in each. The largest improvements from the pre- to post-tests occurred in the South African and Kenyan experimental groups and the difference between them dropped from the 99% level of confidence in the pre-test to the 95% level of confidence in the post-test. These findings suggest that using the 6 Brick Duplo Block approach may accelerate the development of aspects of visual discrimination in pre-literate 5-7-year-old children and that the approach may be most effective when used with children who have had little previous exposure to guided play at school. Qualitative data were obtained through open-ended classroom observations and semi-structured teacher interviews with the experimental group class teachers. Classroom observation revealed that the learners were enthusiastic about the guided play and the semi-structured interviews revealed that they realise the importance of using guided play for developing the visual skills necessary for reading, writing and numeracy. The overall findings of this study suggest that the development of aspects of visual perception were accelerated in the study sample of pre-literate Grade R learners when their teachers facilitated guided play using the 6 Brick Duplo Block approach. Recommendations are made that curriculum developers, early childhood advisors and teachers should be made aware of the potential of using guided play and reconsider the Piaget’s stages of cognitive development to design appropriate instructional materials that promote learners’ visual perceptual growth and development.

Key words: Learners’ Visual, Cognitive Development, Classroom Observation, Instructional Materials

Introduction

A crucial aspect of child development is the development of perceptual skills during the early-learning years. Visual perception, which plays a fundamental role in determining a young learner’s ability to successfully complete written and numeric tasks (Clutten, 2009), is the brain’s ability to organize and interpret what is seen (Deiner, 2005). Visual perception brings meaning to what the eyes see and plays a fundamental role in a learner’s ability to learn, read and spell; in other words it facilitates the accomplishment of written and numeric tasks vital for academic competence (Schieman & Rouse, 2006; Scheiman & Gallaway, 2006).

Children, whether playing informally or functioning within an academic environment, have a tendency to learn through the regular use of their eyes (Atherton & Gates, 2007; Gentile, 2005). Only 20-30% of learners learn more effectively through auditory channel compared to at least 40% who learn more effectively when presented with visual information (Schneck, 2005). One of the ways of acquiring visuol perceptual abilities is through play where the primary learning channel is vision (Sattler & Evans, 2002). Although a great deal of research has been done on play internationally (Whitebread & O’Sullivan, 2012), not a great deal has been done in African settings (Hewes, 2006). Similarly, the research on play and visual perception that has been done in Africa has been done in South Africa with literate children; little to nothing has been done with children in the crucial early learning
years before formal schooling (Brey, 2017). These observations underpin the exploratory research that was undertaken and described in this study.

**Children and Play**

Play is a child’s ‘work’ that helps thinking, doing and feelings to flourish (Hewes, 2006). It is an activity where everything becomes possible and freedom of imagination takes precedence (Elkonin, 2005). It is an instinctive, flexible, malleable, natural and creative process which instinctively leads to a well-developed imagination (Tsao, 2008; Wardle, 2006). Through play children get the opportunity to assimilate reality into their experience and hence make it part of their own lives (Elkonin, 2005). Play develops in children in a predictable pattern which is linked to their intellectual, emotional, social and physical aspects of development (Whitebread & O’Sullivan, 2012; Kalliala, 2006; Bennett, 1997).

Piaget, Montessori and Vygotsky agree on the important relationship between play and cognitive development (Mielonen & Paterson, 2009). Piaget (1964) notes that understanding children’s stages of development is important if one is to facilitate play that helps them to fully realize the potential of their physical and mental capabilities. Teachers and adults, who often help define the boundaries of their children’s play, need to know the developmental stage that the children are at if they are to transform random play into activities that are vital for their development (Edwards, 2000; Piaget, 1962). Vygotsky agrees that play has an important role in facilitating cognitive development in that children not only put in practice what they know, but in the process of play they get to learn new things from each other and from their surrounding (Mielonen & Paterson, 2009).

Piaget also asserts that young children develop meaning through interacting with their environment, particularly in his pre- and concrete operational” cognitive development stages (Mielonen & Paterson, 2009). At these stages children develop the ability to retrace their thinking through a phenomenon he termed as “reversibility” (Mooney, 2000 p.78). Through reversibility children develop the ability to solve higher scale problems and to begin thinking abstractly (Mooney, 2000). Such notions place play as a strategic niche in children’s cognitive development.

One form of play is guided block play. Blocks have been used by children for playing for centuries. John Locke introduced alphabet blocks as early as 1693 (Hewitt, 2001). In the mid-1900s Caroline Pratt (1948) introduced unit blocks, which have been used uninterruptedly in the United States of America to teach mathematics to date. In the early 1900s, Maria Montessori noted the importance of block building in terms of cognitive and intellectual achievement (Whitebread & O’Sullivan, 2012). Montessori, whose theories have influenced the way many ECD programmes are structured (Mooney, 2002), emphasises that children develop literacy skills through play. In turn, literacy skills are dependent visuospatial abilities (Schieman & Rouse, 2006; Scheiman & Gallaway, 2006).

While mechanisms to develop children’s visual perceptual abilities have not yet been clearly defined, what is known is that when playing children develop important basic brain functions (Nath & Szücs, 2014). One such function is visual perceptual ability. As there is little data on the development of visual perceptual abilities in pre-literate children in African contexts, this study set out to explore the effects of using a guided block play intervention on the development of the three basic visuospatial abilities, namely visual discrimination, visual memory and visual sequential memory, all of which are essential aspects for enhancing literacy and mathematical capabilities (Clutten, 2009).
Six Brick Duplo Block Approach

The 6 Brick Duplo Blocks are manipulatives that can be used by young children specifically for play, they are easy to handle and less likely to be swallowed. They come in different colours that attract children. 6 Bricks assist children with numerous developmental skills. They are simple and not frustrating to play with because of the clutch power in them. They are specifically six in number because the average range of vision in a child is at a range of 6 Bricks required for problem solving and lateral thinking skills. The approach used with the 6 Bricks activities take short time with simple exercises designed to wake up the brain and get the child moving, thinking and remembering. They are not intended to be a curriculum, but they do support all areas of development in the curriculum (Hutcheson, Frank & Smith, 2014)

The 6 Bricks concept is designed to excite and motivate young children in the classroom to attain the skills, knowledge and attitudes necessary for success in later life. In order to grasp concepts, children must be given time to manipulate concrete tools. They need opportunities to use their whole body to explore and aid their development of ideas, curiosity and imagination. Every child has a set of six 2x4 stud bricks, one of each colour, on the desk or readily available throughout each school day. The teacher can then easily facilitate any activity at any time. Repetition brings about better organization of the brain and the secret of the success of these activities lies in their regular repetition which will enable children to consolidate new knowledge. In play, children develop their most important basic brain function - the ability to control their own behavior in order to reach a goal. The 6 Bricks activities give plenty of opportunity for the child to practice and improve self-control, which is fundamental to all other learning in life. 6 Bricks activities develop sensory, speech & language, cognitive, motor, social and emotional skills in the young child because of the activities that are fun and inspire laughter and love for learning (Hutcheson et al., 2014)

By using the 6 Brick Duplo Block Guided Play Approach on the preschoolers, overall Visual Perception performance of preschoolers will be seen directly reflected on their academic outcomes. The Duplo Blocks are used to construct a series of structures and by making different shapes using different colours, so as to give preschoolers the ability to reconstruct what has been previously demonstrated by the instructor. By doing so, sharpen their visual perception which is critical in their academic performance (Hutcheson et al., 2014)

6 Brick Duplo Blocks lend preschoolers underlying benefits that past researchers and literature have illustrated about block play. Being most practiced and popular among groups of children between three and eight years of age (Nespeca, 2012), constructive play is any type of activity where the children make or rather build things out of the building blocks. They therefore construct big things from the small pieces they have.

Research Design and Methods

In the following section the study design is outlined, the setting and sample is described, the intervention explained, the data collection and analysis discussed and ethical issues around the study explained.

Design

This study utilised a quasi-experimental design with pre-post-testing of experimental and comparison groups. The design is quasi-experimental and not truly experimental as the experimental and comparison groupings were not randomly chosen (existing classes were used) and the numbers were relatively small. Quantitative data were generated via pre-post-tests of the participating children in the three aspects of visual perception namely; visual discrimination, visual memory, and visual sequential memory. Grade R children (5-7 years old) in one South African and one Kenyan school were chosen to serve as both purposive and convenience samples. Sampling was
purposive in that the two schools that were chosen are both broadly representative of urban Grade R classes in South Africa and Kenya. The fact that the schools are in South Africa and Kenya was not done in order to make comparisons in terms of countries, but was a convenient way of sampling. The convenience aspect came about as the first author studied in South Africa, but, after doing the initial field work in South Africa, went back to Kenya. However, after purposively identifying a conveniently situated school in Kenya that was similar in terms of socio-economic grouping, class and school size, language, etc., it became apparent that the school in Kenya was different in one aspect, mainly that there was a dearth of play resources in the Kenyan school. This difference was taken into account as a variable when considering the results of the research.

As noted, there were two Grade R classes in each of the South African and Kenyan schools chosen. In Kenya this level of schooling is not called ‘Grade R’, but is equivalent to Grade R in South Africa. One class in each school constituted the experimental group and their teacher received ‘treatment’ (an intervention based on guided play using the 6 Brick Duplo Block approach), while the other provided a comparison group that had not received the ‘treatment’. The teachers in each school decided who would be the ‘experimental’ teacher and who would be the ‘comparison’ teacher on the understanding that enough material (Duplo blocks and teachers guide files) would be supplied by the researchers and that the ‘comparison teacher would have equal access to support from the researchers once the experimental stage of the intervention process (training of ‘experimental’ teachers, pre-post testing of the children, and the teaching intervention over six months) was complete.

The intervention included providing the experimental group teachers with training and sufficient sets of 6 Brick Duplo Blocks to allow all of the children in their classes to participate in the pre-designed Duplo Blocks activities individually over six months. 6 Brick Duplo Block activities that were identified and selected by the researchers as having the potential to promote visual discrimination, visual memory and visual sequential memory were used for the intervention.

In order for the researchers to be able to confirm that the intervention took place as planned the teachers filled in a record sheet each time they engaged their learner with 6 Brick activities. The information on the record included the date, activity name, number of bricks used, whether the learners completed the activities or not, whether the teacher felt that the children had understood the activity (fully, partially or not at all) and whether they had enjoyed it (five-point Likert scale). There was also space for any additional comment that the teacher might like to make. Classroom observations were made as to how the teachers and learners engaged in the activities (a minimum of five visits per experimental class) and the teachers were interviewed individually on completion of the intervention and testing phase of the study in their schools in South Africa and Kenya.

The visual, discrimination, visual memory and visual sequential memory abilities of the children in both the experimental and comparison classes were tested using the Visual Perception Aspects Test (VPAT) immediately prior to the intervention. The same test was used as a post-test immediately after the intervention. As the test is psychological test carried out on a one-on-one basis with the tester guiding the pre-literate children through the process five final year Psychology students at the Nelson Mandela University were recruited on a voluntary basis to carry out the visuospatial abilities testing in the South African school where the study was conducted. Guidance in terms of their selection was provided by a Professor in the Psychology Department at the Nelson Mandela University and, after final selection, they were made conversant with the Visual Perception Aspects Test testing procedures. These processes were repeated in Kenya with final year Psychology students and a Psychology Professor from Moi University.
Sample and Setting

As noted above, two classes of pre-school children in two schools (one school in South Africa having a comparison and experimental class and the other school in Kenya also with comparison and experimental classes) participated in the study. This empirical investigation’s sampling frame focused on government schools of almost similar size and representing an urban population where second-language learners are taught in English (a reasonably common situation in both countries). The schools were also chosen because of links with teachers who were part of previous research studies and who prepared to be part of the process. The participating children ranged between the ages of 5-7 years. This age group was chosen because research suggests that, taking into account verbal and non-verbal intelligence, visuospatial ability may be a unique underlying mechanism which can be used to account for differences in higher order academic performance at this age (Mayer, Sodian, Koerber, & Schwippert, 2014). The sample size was approximately 80 learners, i.e. 40 learners from each school with approximately 20 children in each class.

Research Intervention

Permission was granted by Care for Education and Hands on Technologies group to choose and implement ‘6 Bricks’ activities from the resources they provide. After personally carrying out the over 100 activities available, thirty were chosen as activities that required and were suitable for developing the skills of Visual Discrimination (VD), Visual Memory (VM), and Visual Sequential Memory (VSM).

After choosing the activities from the Care for Education and Hands on Technologies booklet they were photocopied in colour and put in the same order in five different files; one each for the four teachers and one for the researcher. The files contained: activities on the different aspects in the order VD, VM and VSM, record of completed activities, completed record sheets containing the date, activity name, number of blocks used, whether the learners completed the activity, learners’ enjoyment of activity and a section was left blank for comments. The comparison group teachers only received their files, blocks and training once the intervention period and data generation were completed.

Training of the experimental teachers was done by the researcher over two half-day sessions. Workshops were conducted individually with the two experimental teachers in order to develop their understanding of the ‘6 Bricks’ approach and how to implement it in their classes. During these workshops they experienced first-hand some of the activities they would conduct with their learners and how they should complete a ‘teacher record sheet’ after each activity. After the workshops, the teachers were provided with enough sets of ‘6 Bricks’ for each of their learners to have their own set of ‘6 Bricks’, a file containing the ‘6 Bricks’ play activities that they were expected to cover over the duration of the intervention, and pages of teacher record sheets to be filled in after each activity. Not only were the teachers trained and guided in terms of how play should be facilitated when using the 6 Bricks approach, they were also given insight as to the possible relationships between guided play and the development of visual perception.

The experimental and comparison teacher (the ones who did not receive training or the 6 Brick Duplo Blocks) in each school worked independently from one another. The children in the experimental classes each received a set of 6 Brick Duplo blocks, one of each colour, which they kept on their desk readily available throughout each school day so that the teachers could easily facilitate play at any given time that they felt appropriate.

The second phase of the intervention was a four month period when the children’s visual perceptual abilities were pre-post tested before and after the experimental group teachers implemented the intervention with their
learners. The pre-post-tests used were the first three sections of the Visual Perception Aspects Tests (VPAT). These sections dealt with the visual perception aspects of visual discrimination, visual memory and visual sequential memory.

The teachers facilitated the 6 Brick activities as set out in their files. Four ten-minute activities were to be carried out separately on four days of each week. The order of the activities each week was an activity that aimed at developing visual discrimination, followed on consecutive days by activities which aimed at promoting visual memory and visual sequential memory respectively. The fourth day of the week was reserved for teachers to repeat any activity that they believed was not well understood by the children. Open ended classroom observations were done by the researcher in the course of the intervention period in order to observe how the teachers facilitated guided play and how they maintained their guided play records in the files. The experimental group teachers were interviewed individually after the intervention and the classroom observation field notes were interrogated in order to help explain the quantitative data findings. These teacher interviews, conducted after the post-tests were administered to all the learners in both experimental and comparison groups, were audio and video recorded.

**Data Generation**

The Visual Perceptual Aspect Test (VPAT), developed by Sylvia Clutten in South Africa in 2009, was used to measure visuospatial skills in this study. The validity and reliability of this test was the core of Clutten’s research and, as it was shown to be both reliable and valid in the South African context, no measures of validity or reliability were deemed necessary. Clutten (2009) identified nine aspects of visual perception, the development of which she considers essential for the effective processing of visual information and learning, as well as academic performance and competency of learners. These nine visual perceptual aspects are; visual discrimination, visual form constancy, visual memory, visual sequential memory, visual spatial-relationships, position-in-space, visual closure, visual figure-ground, visual analysis and synthesis. Only the first three aspects of visual perception were considered in this study.

Each subtest, namely a test of one of the aspects of visual perception, comprises 16 items which are made up of shapes, forms or designs arranged from easy to more complex forms. Each form is presented in a stand-alone box. The child is instructed to observe the form and then instructed to choose an answer from a multiple-choice selection of forms or designs. Every successful response is awarded one mark and the marks are added to provide a total raw score for that specific subtest. If the respondent answers three consecutive questions unsuccessfully, the tester moves on to the next subtest. Only the first three of the above aspects of visual perception are considered in this study. An example of a question in the test, namely one on visual discrimination (VD), is illustrated in Figure 1. There were also visual perceptual aspect tests which used toy shapes (squares, triangles, stars, etc.) which had to be identified in 2D on paper.

![Example of an item from the Visual Discrimination (VD) subtest of the Visual Perceptual Aspects Test (Clutten, 2009).](image-url)
Each test was administered as a pencil-and-paper test under the individual guidance of the psychology students and the researcher. This process took approximately 20-30 minutes per child tested. As at least five children could be tested at a time by the five testers and the researcher, the entire group per school (experimental and control) could be tested during the course of one school day during class time. Testing took place in a nearby room which was provided for the purpose by the schools. These rooms had sufficient small tables and chairs to enable testing in an environment that was not crowded. The children were drawn from their classrooms in batches of five or six, depending on the number of testers available, and escorted to and from the testing venue. Pencils were provided to mark the selected shape and patterns on the test paper. The children put a mark on the selected answer on the test booklet and the researcher and the psychology students recorded the children’s answers selected on a separate answer sheet each time during the testing session (pre- and post-test). This ‘double recording’ was done to try to keep to a minimum any ambiguities that may have occurred in the children’s responses on their test sheets. The testers answer sheets and the children’s test booklets were inspected to check for errors and omissions. These data were recorded in a spread sheet according to the three aspects of visual perception on which the study focused namely visual discrimination, visual memory and visual sequential memory and the variables provided by the biographical data obtained on the test booklets. The biographical data were filled in by the teacher and included variables such as an identifying number (to enable matched pairs pre-post testing), gender, age, whether the children wore glasses or not, experimental or control group, pre- or post-test, and country. A code book using numbers was recorded in the spread sheet to explain the recorded results per code to enable statistical analysis.

After pre-testing the two schools then followed a four-month intervention period during which the experimental class teacher guided the children to play with the 6 Bricks. Open-ended observations were made during visits to the schools. Open-ended observations and field notes were taken on at least five occasions in the experimental group classes during the intervention period when the experimental teachers gave advance warning that they were going to implement the strategy at a specific time. After the post-testing exercise was completed by both the experimental and comparison groups of children, semi-structured interviews were held with the experimental group teachers. The interventions in South Africa and Kenya could not be done simultaneously and therefore they overlapped to a degree to allow travel arrangements. The South African group started and ended the intervention earlier than the Kenyan group, but the testing and interventions in both countries were completed between the months of May and October in 2016.

**Data Analysis**

The quantitative data from the VPAT testing was subjected to statistical analysis to generate descriptive statistics such as sums (totals), counts, averages (means) and standard deviations. Even though the sample was small (n=77), the data were distributed sufficiently to use parametric statistics. As the data generated were matched pairs, and since t-Tests are least subject to the effects of small data sets (Carlberg, 2011), this test was chosen to investigate whether there were any statistically significant differences between group scores and between changes in mean scores in the groups of children tested. As the samples were relatively small a 90% level of confidence (p≤0.1) was selected as the indicator of significant difference between groups. This level of confidence is considered to be very low in statistical terms but has been used by some social scientists in the past depending on the nature of their study and was considered to be appropriate for this small scale, master’s degree level, study (Carlberg, 2011). Where higher levels of confidence were attained, these were considered to be bonus findings.
Ethical Issues

Prior to data collection, the schools in South Africa and Kenya were visited to discuss the aims, research design and methodology of the study with the school principals and Grade R teachers. The teachers volunteered to take part in the study and were assured that their responses would only be used for the purposes of this research. The teachers who participated in the intervention and the semi-structured interviews signed written consent forms, as did the parents of the Grade R learners from the two schools. The participants’ anonymity was kept throughout the study. Ethics approval of this particular study was provided by the Faculty of Education Research, Technology and Innovation Ethics Committee and the Human Ethics Committee at the Nelson Mandela University as an addendum to an umbrella study conducted under ethics number H14-EDU-ERE-014.

Results

Quantitative data were obtained from the Visual Perception Aspect test (VPAT) results of 77 pre-school children from two Grade-R classes in a school in the Republic of South Africa (n= 38) and two classes of pre-school learners (n=39) from a school considered to be acceptably equivalent in Kenya. One class in each school served as an experimental group and the other as a comparison group. In each case only matched pairs of pre-post data were used. In other words only the data generated by children who completed both the pre- and post-tests were used. The number of matched-pair children in each class in South Africa and Kenya is presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Number of participants in the South African and Kenyan Schools Experimental and Comparison Groups (RSA n=38; Kenya n=39)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Experimental</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the data were normally distributed and generated as matched pairs, and since t-Tests are least subject to the effects of small data sets even if the data are not distributed normally (Carlberg, 2011), this test was chosen to investigate whether the apparent differences suggested by the descriptive statistics were statistically significant. This choice was supported further by the fact that the standard deviations (σ) of each group were not dissimilar (Table 2).

Table 2: South African and Kenyan Pre-test numbers of Participants, Mean Scores and Standard Deviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-test</th>
<th>RSA Comparison</th>
<th>RSA Experimental</th>
<th>Kenya Comparison</th>
<th>Kenya Experimental</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean score</td>
<td>25.35</td>
<td>28.06</td>
<td>18.05</td>
<td>19.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>σ</td>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>7.62</td>
<td>6.86</td>
<td>6.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A comparison of the pre- and post-test mean scores revealed that there were statistically significant differences between the South African and Kenyan scores with the South African groups achieving statistically significantly better in both cases. Application of a t-test to the data revealed that the pre-test mean scores of the children in the Kenyan schools were lower at a statistically significantly difference at the 99% level of confidence. However, the level of confidence at which this statement can be made dropped from the 99% level of confidence (p≤0.01) in terms of the pre-test data to the 95% level of confidence (p≤0.05) for the post-test data (Table 3).
Table 3: Comparison of the Kenyan and South African Groups Mean Scores in the Visual Perception Aspect (VPAT) pre and Post-tests with t-test probability value (p)

| Test  | Kenya |  | South Africa |  |
|-------|-------|----------------|----------------|
|       | n     | Mean       | σ     | n     | Mean       | σ     | p≤0.01*  |       |
| Pre-  | 39    | 18.8       | 6.3969| 38    | 26.6       | 6.5033|       |
| Post- | 39    | 23.9       | 6.2386| 38    | 29.4       | 5.0172|       |

*= statistically significant at the 99% level of confidence; **= statistically significant at the 95% level of confidence.

All of the groups (experimental and comparison groups in both schools) mean scores improved from pre-to post-testing with both the South African groups attaining higher scores on their VPAT pre-test scores than the Kenyan groups post-test scores. A closer look at the change in mean scores reveals that the greatest changes in mean scores took place in the experimental groups both in South Africa and Kenya, namely changes of 3.78 and 6.68 respectively (Figure 2). It is, however, interesting to note that the change in mean score in the Kenyan comparison group was almost as large as the change in mean score in the South African experimental group (Figure 2) and, as noted earlier, the level of confidence dropped from the 99% level of confidence (p≤0.01) in terms of the differences in the pre-test data to the 95% level of confidence (p≤0.05) for the post-test data (Table 3).

![Change in mean scores from pre- to post-test](image)

Figure 2: Change in Mean scores in the Comparison and Experimental groups in the South African and Kenyan Groups

The gains in mean scores in terms of visual perception in the comparison groups is not unexpected as at this age there is normally grown in terms of this ability (Tsai et al., 2008). The question is to whether there any real difference between the changes in the pre-post-test mean scores (δx) between the experimental and control groups in Kenya and South Africa. This question can be answered using inferential statistics that include t-tests for statistical significance and Cohen’s d as an indicator of practical significance (Table 4).
Table 4: Comparison of Mean Score changes between the Experimental and Control Groups in Kenya and South Africa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Control</th>
<th>Experimental</th>
<th>p value</th>
<th>Cohen’s d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>δx</td>
<td>σ</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>6.913</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSA</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>5.558</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***= statistically significant at the 90% level of confidence

As noted earlier, the samples were relatively small and therefore a 90% level of confidence (p≤0.1) was selected as the indicator of significant difference between groups. While, as noted above, this level of confidence is generally considered to be low in statistical terms (Carlberg, 2011), it has been used by social scientists depending on the nature of their research, and was considered to be appropriate for this study. Using this indicator of confidence, the inferential statistics reveal that there is a difference between the change in mean scores of the Kenyan experimental and control groups while, in the South African school, although the change appeared large (see Figure 2) there is no statistically significant difference between the changes in mean score in the experimental and control groups (Table 4).

Classroom observations revealed that the teachers were able to implement the 6 Brick strategy as required and that the children participated actively and with enthusiasm. The teacher record sheet revealed that both experimental class teachers had completed most of the activities expected of them. The semi-structured interviews revealed that the teachers had enjoyed facilitating the activities and that their learners had participated actively. The teachers noted that the children had enjoyed the intervention and that they believed that the activities had improved their visuospatial abilities (this observation is highly subjective, but supported the quantitative findings). The qualitative data also supported the quantitative findings that the children who had previously had little to no manipulatives and guided play time at school responded most positively to the intervention.

Discussion

The quantitative data generated in this study suggest that use of the 6 Bricks Duplo Block strategy does accelerate the development of pre-literate learners’ visual discrimination, visual memory, and visual sequential memory abilities. These findings are in accordance with in Piaget’s theory of child development which involves changes in cognitive process and abilities. Such changes are not attained passively, but through actively playing a role in learning about the world around them (Piaget, 1953). During Piaget’s preoperational stage children aged two to seven years old begin to think symbolically and learn to use words and pictures to represent objects. During this stage they begin to use symbols, which are dependent on visual perception. The children who took part in this study were in Piaget’s preoperational stage of development (ages 2-7), a stage where play is closely linked to cognitive and intellectual achievement (Whitebread & O’Sullivan 2012; Piaget, 1962).

The claim that the use of block play in the manner that it was carried out in this study accelerates the development of pre-literate learners’ visual discrimination, visual memory, and visual sequential memory abilities is sustained by the accompanying qualitative data which revealed that the teachers were able to implement the strategy successfully, the children exhibited a high level of engagement and children enjoyed the activities, and that the teachers perceptions that their learners visuospatial abilities improved after engaging in the intervention. This
link is warranted within theoretical notions of the development of visuospatial skills, and backed by findings of similar work with young literate children (Brey, 2017). It is also backed by Piaget’s conception that the external construction of physical artifacts is a powerful means to achieve internal construction of understanding through the effect of play.

Both the quantitative and qualitative data generated suggest that the strategy was most effective in classes where the teachers had previously provided their children with little to no guided play and had little access to play materials. As noted earlier, the Kenyan school data indicated a greater improvement compared to the data generated in the South African school, namely there was with a higher mean score increase in the Kenyan classes than in the South African ones. Comparing the two schools during the open ended classroom observation, it was clear that the availability of play resources was inadequate in the Kenyan school. As such, it can be inferred that the provision of sets of 6 Bricks in their classes was a factor in terms of an improvement in visual perception after the intervention. This statement resonates with Kellerman and Arterbery’s (2006) belief that play is accompanied by the development of routine visual functions, which enables learners to carry out their daily life activities, hence the proposition that the daily routine of a child should be one in which the child is surrounded by a multitude of visual stimuli, preferably those that presented dynamically and result in active engagement, as was the case with the guided block play approach used in this study.

As teachers and adults are often required to help define the boundaries of their children’s play, it is important that they know the developmental stage that the children are at if they are to transform random play into activities at an early age to help the development of cognitive abilities (Edwards, 2000; Mielonen & Paterson, 2009; Vygotsky, 1978; Piaget, 1962). In terms of pre-literate and newly literate young children this is the preoperational stage where they begin to engage in symbolic play and learn to manipulate symbols. At this stage children are able to retrace their thinking through reversibility which enables them to develop the ability to begin thinking abstractly (Mooney, 2000). In order to think abstractly children need to have developed the appropriate level of visuospatial ability as opposed to mere sensory association (Kellerman & Arterberry, 2006).

The claim that guided play using the block play approach used in this study accelerates the development of three basic visuospatial abilities in pre-literate children is important as the development of these visuospatial skills have been shown to be very important in the acquisition of literacy and numeracy skills (Clutten, 2009). As such, the findings of this study, though limited in scope and range, should make a contribution to understandings of the means to, and necessity of, advancing visuospatial skills in preparation for the development of literacy and numeracy in young children. It also provides evidence that these skills can be measured in pre-literate children using a test that was developed and validated for African conditions, namely the Visual Perceptual Aspect Test.

References


Hutcheson, B. Frank, N & Smith, L. (2014). *Back to basics with 6 bricks.* Johannesburg: Care for Education.


An Analysis of Educational Standards, Quality and Equity in Uganda

Vincent Operemo
Department of Strategic Planning, National Planning Authority
E-mail: vincent.operemo@npa.go.ug

Abstract
Although Uganda aspires to provide access to equitable quality education in an efficient and effective manner, concerns over its quality and equity are widespread. The Dakar Framework for Action declared that access to quality and equitable education is a right of every child. This article undertakes a review of Uganda’s key education parameters in order to establish the progress made towards providing quality education. The education targets provided in Uganda Vision 2040, Education Sector Development Plan and the international frameworks like Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and Africa Agenda 2063 provided the yardstick for assessment across all levels. Whereas progress has been made in expanding access across all levels, quality and equity concerns continue to linger. Access to Pre-primary education is only 15.6%, literacy, numeracy, survival and transition levels are low and primary teacher absenteeism is currently estimated at 20-30%. In addition, participation at tertiary level is only 6.1% below the Sub-Saharan African and global averages of 10% and 26% respectively. Tertiary education has unduly benefitted students from wealthiest households and overall enrollment remains disproportionately male and metropolitan hence reinforcing social inequality. African universities also compare poorly in global rankings. The study presents an analysis of education in Uganda in terms of policy framework, financing and key outcomes related to access, quality and equity at all levels. It then attempts a comparative analysis of Uganda’s education with sub-Saharan African countries as well as globally in order to identify key policy concerns that need to be addressed and recommendations.

Key Words: Educational Standards, Quality Education, Access to Education, Education Equity

Introduction
Education is universally acknowledged in a vast body of literature as an essential element in the process of national development (Psacharopoulos, 1985; UNESCO, 2005; Komakech, 2017a). According to Komakech (2017a) education is the yardstick for every country’s political and social-economic development. It acts as a basis of reducing poverty and inequality by enabling the use of new technologies, creating and spreading knowledge. Although the right to education has been reaffirmed on many occasions since the Universal Declaration of Human Rights was proclaimed in 1948, many international instruments are silent about the qualitative dimension of learning until 2000 when the United Nations’ Millennium Declaration stated that all children should be able to complete a full course of primary schooling by 2015 but makes no specific reference to its quality. It therefore became common among countries to guarantee all children the right to education focus on access with limited attention to quality (World Bank, 2017). Yet quality determines how much and how well children learn and the extent to which their education translates into a range of personal, social and developmental benefits. Goal 6 of the Dakar Framework for Action emphasizes the need to improve all aspects of the quality of education. Yet, as this report highlights, 50% primary pupils in Uganda leave school without mastering a minimum set of cognitive and non-cognitive skills. Today, with a greater understanding of the function that education has in society and in the nation as a whole, the world is striving to deliver quality education at all levels.

Good quality education is increasingly recognized as an important ingredient for economic growth and as instrumental in the attainment of other development objectives. People who have received quality education can not only fulfill their potential, but also contribute to their communities. This is consistent with Komakech (2017)
who revealed that education holds the key to transformational national development hence no society is optimally functional until it is properly educated. Quality education is of critical importance and very demanding in the 21st century, where countries are confronted with new economic, social and cultural challenges in which knowledge, skills, values and attitudes will play a central role. With the tremendous growth in school enrolments throughout the world, earlier priority to educational expansion and access is now being replaced by plans and policies calling for a higher quality of schooling. Concern with improving the quality education in schools has started receiving the highest priority in almost all countries throughout the world. This concern has become universal in both developed and developing countries, in those that have achieved total access as well as in those still striving for access (Reddy, 2007). Both the World Declaration on Education for All (1990) and the Dakar Framework for Action (2000) recognize quality as a most important condition for achieving Education for All.

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the Africa Agenda 2063 advocate for leaving no one behind require that quality and equity at the heart of service delivery. In the domain of education, SDG 4 calls on all countries “ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all” (United Nations, 2015). Target 4.5 is most explicit in its focus on equity and its determination to “eliminate gender disparities in education and ensure equal access to all levels of education and vocational training for the vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, indigenous peoples and children in vulnerable situations” (United Nations, 2015). Target 4.5 commits all UN Member States to addressing all forms of exclusion and inequalities in access, participation and learning outcomes, from early childhood to old age. The EFA global monitoring report of 2006, by stressing the importance of quality, noted that a child denied the right to quality primary education is not only deprived, but also disadvantaged for life – unable to cope with situations requiring reading, writing and arithmetic- unless given access to educational opportunities later, in adolescence or adulthood.

A number of reports indicated that in the effort to guarantee access to education in Uganda has been complicated by many problems which affect the quality of education provided (World Bank, 2007). Some of the notable problems include; inadequate funding, teacher turnover, teacher and students’ absenteeism, teachers’ strikes, and competence issues among teachers as observed by Komakech (2017b). Likewise, the problem of quality and equity has become a serious concern in Uganda (NPA, 2018). In terms of quality, there is very little difference between trained and untrained teachers in teaching (Komakech, 2017b). Private schools employ more untrained teachers as compared to public schools but they register better performance in national examinations. Komakech noted that, of the 1.8% students who passed the quiz on the sum of series, no teacher passed. This implies most of the teachers do not have competencies to teach and they lack content and ability to interpret concepts. On the other hand, only 15.6% of children aged 3-5 have access to pre-primary education. - At the heart of the problem is the fact that expansion of the system has not necessarily translated into increased opportunity especially at higher education levels where the gross enrollment is currently at 6.1% (UNDP, 2017) implying a high dropout rate across the entire education system.

Acknowledging the important role of education in national development, this study was designed to examine barriers to delivery of quality education in Uganda. To pursue this objective, the study analyzed the major educational problems in Uganda’s education system that threaten its quality. The aim is to examine the major educational problems that significantly influence the delivery of quality education to citizens. An attempt is also made to examine the implications of the findings to achieve the NDP and SDG goals. The present paper also puts forward some recommendations relevant to the findings of the study.
Literature Review

Despite a growing consensus about the importance of quality, there is much less agreement on what the concept means in practice (EFA Report, 2006). Many definitions of quality in education exist, testifying to the complexity and multifaceted nature of the concept (World Bank, 1995). The terms efficiency, effectiveness, equity and quality have often been used synonymously (Adams, 1993). Pfeffer and Coote (1991) consider quality as having varied meanings and connotations and therefore refer to quality as ‘slippery concept’. Quality education is not a static concept but that quality and standards are in fact relative matters, relative to the particular time and place and to particular learners and their circumstances (UNESCO, 2005). Common ground is also found in the broadly shared objectives that tend to underpin debates about quality: respect for individual rights, improved equity of access and of outcome and increased relevance to everyday life. Human rights legislation emphasizes access to education and equality of learning outcomes. This reflects a belief that all children can develop basic cognitive skills, given the right learning environment, and that if some do not it is at least partly due to education system deficiencies. Analyses confirm that poverty, rural residence and gender discrimination remain the strongest inverse correlates of school attendance and performance and that poor instruction is a significant source of this inequality.

The Dakar Framework for Action (UNESCO, 2000) declared that access to quality education was the right of every child. It stated need to: “Improve all aspects of the quality of education to achieve recognized and measurable learning outcomes for all - especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills” (Dakar Framework for Action, Article 7, World Education Forum, 2000). Its expanded definition of quality set out the desirable characteristics of: Learners (healthy, motivated students); Processes (competent teachers); Content (relevant curricula); and, Systems (good governance and equitable resource allocation) (UNESCO, 2005). In any education system, ensuring access, equity and inclusiveness is fundamental. With the presence of private providers, a comprehensive regulatory regime is essential in order to supervise and regulate the education system. The regulatory regime or body must also address the delivery of academic programmes to ensure quality and relevance. Enforcement of regulatory provisions require strong political will, as involvement of both the public and private sectors may require significant financial and physical investments by governments and investors.

In Uganda, despite good progress made in increasing access across the education system, low quality remains the main challenge. Recent trends on virtually all the quality indicators are below the desired levels compared to other Sub Saharan African Countries states. Low quality is demonstrated by low learning achievement. Literacy and numeracy proficiency at P.6 averaged 51.9% and 52.6% in 2016 respectively (MoES, 2016). In addition, the efficiency levels are low with survival rate to P.7 at 33%, Repetition at 10.19% (2014) and teacher absenteeism is estimated at 20-30% (ESSAPR 2015; Komakech, 2017b), transition rate to S.1 and S.5 averaging 63% and 38% respectively in 2016. There is a persistent problem of “ghosts” (i.e. “ghost” schools, teachers, & learners), which is responsible for substantial leakage of about UGX 50 billion (2.17% of the overall sector budget and 3.5% of the primary sub-sector budget (ESSAPR, 2015). School inspection, monitoring and support supervision is inadequate and there is poor management of primary schools.

There is no doubt that the quality of education determines the quality of human resources of a country. One of the major objectives of providing education is to produce a qualified, skilled and globally competent workforce for the labour market of business and industry, which is a critical factor to national growth and development (Obadara & Alaka, 2013). Recent developments such as increasing student enrolments; reduced state funding for public higher education; increasing number of private providers; internationalization cross border education
have also influenced national education policy. As part of the efforts to ensure quality education in Uganda, the National Council for Higher Education (NCHE) has been particular about ensuring accreditation of academic programmes in Universities in order to produce graduates who are relevant to the economy, the Directorate of Education Standards issued Basic Minimum Requirements for schools to ensure quality standards, the National Curriculum Development Centre ensures appropriate curriculum is developed and taught in schools.

Methodology

This study aimed at examining barriers to delivery of quality education in Uganda. To pursue this objective, the study analyzed the major educational problems in Uganda’s education system that threaten its quality. A triangulated approach involving document analysis to glean empirical evidence was utilized. Data generated from document analysis was subjected to a content review to derive a summary report guided by the subject in question. It also involved a review of the key education parameters across the Sub Saharan African States for regional compatibility.

Findings

The study findings arising from a literature reviewed of education in Uganda are summarized by level beginning with pre-primary, primary, secondary and higher education in the following sections.

Pre-Primary Education

UNICEF (2006) notes that children who attend pre-school tend to stay longer in school and perform better than those who don’t. In Uganda only 15.6% of children aged 3-5 access pre-primary education lower than the Sub-Saharan African average of 20% and the global average of 50%. The sub-sector is characterized by poor quality, absence of a clear policy and regulatory framework, inadequately trained care givers due to lack of training institutions and high cost of provision since it is largely private sector driven. Access to pre-primary remains a privileged option for children coming from the richest households and from urban areas. The demand for pre-primary education is generally low as indicated in figure I below.

![Figure I: Pre-Primary Enrolment Trends 2003 - 2015](image)

*Source: Constructed using data from EMIS/UBOS*

From figure I above, despite the observable increase in enrollment, the current figure 15.6% is below the sub-Saharan Africa average of 20% and much less than the global average of 50%.
Primary Education
Largely considered the first level of education in Uganda, primary education has registered significant progress attributed to the adoption of Universal Primary Education (UPE) in 1997 demonstrated by the rapid expansion in primary school enrolment from 2.8 million in 1996 to the current 8,800,000; teachers recruited from 74,000 in 1995 to the current 200,000, classrooms constructed increased from 68,000 in 2000 to the current 151,239; Pupil Teacher Ratio improved from 57:1 in 2010 to 54:1 in 2017 (EMIS, 2017). The success of UPE led to adoption of successor programmes namely the Universal Secondary Education (USE) in 2007 and Universal Post O’Level Education and Training (UPOLET) in 2012 to absorb the increasing primary education graduates. Figure II below shows the trends in primary school enrollment from 2002 to 2015.

![Figure II: Primary Education Enrolment Trends 2002 - 2015](image)

Source: Constructed using data from MoES and UBOS

From figure II, above, it can be observed that gender parity has been in primary education. The positive trend has maintained an averaging over 8 million pupils although the completion rate is only 32%. The above successes notwithstanding, primary education faces challenges especially with regards to quality demonstrated by low learning achievements, low proficiency levels as well as low literacy and numeracy levels as illustrated below:

Low Learning Achievements
The proficiency rate of P.6 pupils in literacy and numeracy is 51.9% and 52.6% (EMIS, 2018) respectively. In addition, 60% of pupils who complete primary school are unable to attain minimum reading scores while only 33% attain minimum standards in mathematics. A study by the ministry of education of P.2 Competence in literacy in 60 districts found out that reading was not achieved and the other competences were partially achieved with interpretation and writing competences not any better. The best performed competence was listening with a percentage score of 67.8% as presented in figure III below.
Learners were also assessed with P.1 and P.2 questions and it was established that there were partial performances in Primary 2 and Primary 1 with scores of 51% and 52% respectively which implies that children are promoted to the next class when they have acquired nearly only 50% of the required competences. Hence learners lose out on the content and eventually get into the upper classes without fully learning the basic competences.

**Inadequate Qualified Teachers**

Teachers play a pivotal role in improving the quality of education. Inadequacy of qualified teachers has a direct effect on student performance. In 2014, total enrolment in government aided schools stood at 7,124,124, the number of teachers on government payroll 131,310 implying a Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR) of 54:1 against the NDP target of 45:1 - a gap of 27,003 (EMIS, 2016). High PTRs lead to higher dropout rates and have a negative effect on learning achievement. There is however, an ironical situation of Urban and semi-urban areas having surplus of teachers while rural areas often have one or two teachers managing huge classes and other school-related responsibilities (NPA, 2018).

**Inadequate School Facilities**

The growth in enrolment has not been matched by provision of the requisite instructional materials resulting to high Pupil Classroom Ratio (PCR) and high PTRS. In 2014, the PCR for government aided schools was 69:1. In 2001 the PTR in government aided schools was 98:1 while in privately run schools it 58:1 (EMIS, 2014). This has since improved to 54:1 which is still below the target of 45:1 while PTR in privately owned schools is 32:1 (EMIS, 2014). Figure IV below indicates the PTR and PCR trends from 2001–2015.
Limited Access to Pre-primary Education

With only 15.6% of children aged 3-5 attending pre-primary education, majority of children join primary education unprepared. Evidence indicates that children who attend pre-school tend to stay longer in school and perform better than those who don’t (UNICEF, 2006). There is therefore a positive correlation between access to pre-primary education and the quality of primary education. These children are the ones who mainly repeat or dropout of primary school (particularly during the transition from P.1 to P.2 and from P.6 to P.7. Improving access to pre-primary education is therefore, a strategy for enhancing the efficiency of primary education.

High Pupil Dropout and Absenteeism

Retention is a challenge that affects the poor, rural and female pupils more than any others. In Uganda, survival rates (a measure of the survival a particular cohort across the primary cycle), are very low, currently estimated at 33% lower than Kenya and Nigeria at 80% and 83% respectively. In addition, pupil absenteeism is a significant problem to quality teaching and learning. Although dropouts occur across the primary school cycle, the highest rates occur during transition from P.1 to P.2 and from P.6 to P.7. Figure V below shows the P.5 and P.7 survival and completion rates.

Source: Constructed using data from MoES and UBOS

Figure VI above indicates that both the pupil classroom ratios and pupil teacher ratios are higher especially in government aided schools compared to the private schools.
Figure V, indicates a primary school completion rate of 33%, lower than the Eastern and Southern African average of 50%.

The reasons for dropping out of school in Uganda are similar to those of other sub-Saharan African countries as indicated in figure VI below.

Figure VI, shows that cost, quality, and long distances to schools as key determinants of drop out. Costs can be both direct or indirect, in rural areas for instance opportunity costs associated with sending children to school include doing chores, tending cattle, digging, or looking after siblings.

**Teacher Absenteeism**

Absenteeism among teachers and Head teachers has a direct bearing on pupils’ performance and poses a serious problem to the efficiency of primary education system. Evidence from the Ministry of Education indicates that on average head teachers are estimated to be absent for at least 3 days a week. It further indicates that rampant teacher absenteeism estimated at 20-30% (EMIS, 2017; Komakech, 2017b), primary teachers for instance are estimated to be absent for at least 2 days a week on average, implying that 20-30% of the wage bill is spent on undelivered services.
**Ineffective Teacher Deployment/Utilization**

Besides the issue of shortage of qualified teachers is the poor utilization of teaching staff as determined by teacher deployment and the teacher time on task. The coherence co-efficient of primary school teacher deployment in Uganda is estimated at 0.65, implying that 35% of primary school teachers in Uganda are randomly distributed to school rather than basing distribution on PTR. There are many cases where districts and schools with similar pupil enrolment have different number of teachers. Uneven deployment of teachers was actually one of the reasons that led to the decentralization of teacher management and recruitment under District Service Commissions (DSCs). However, most recently created Districts do not have functional DSCs which affects recruitment of additional teachers.

**Inadequate Inspection, Monitoring and Support Supervision**

School inspection monitoring and support supervision when properly undertaken have a positive effect on school performance. It is however inadequately carried out in primary schools due to resource constraints particularly limited staff at national and district levels, limited financial resources and overlapping mandates between national and district inspectorates. The Education Management Information System (EMIS) is only limited to the collection of basic education statistics such enrolment and teachers’ numbers rather big data as was originally conceptualized.

**Limited Community Participation**

There is a growing interest to improve the quality of education by enhancing community participation instead (Mansuri and Rao 2012, Stiglitz 2002). The argument is that communities can contribute to improved service delivery because they can better observe its quality and have a direct incentive to improve it. Although communities are expected to take keen interest then in terms of monitoring school activities and participating in their development, community participation has drastically declined since the launch of UPE. Rural communities have abdicated this responsibility to Government on account of a misconception that being a publicly funded program, only government is responsible for its implementation and outcomes.

**Inadequate Budgetary Resources**

Despite observable nominal increases in Education Sector allocations, it is often outpaced by inflation rates and the annual enrolment rates. The sector allocations have actually been declining in real terms. An analysis of the primary education expenditure as a share of the Education Sector budget and as a share of the GDP indicates a steady decline. The sub-sector share of the education sector budget has been declining from 69.30% in 2002, 60% in 2006; 58% in 2013, and currently at about 57%. The primary education budget as a share of GDP first declined from 2.23% in 2002, 2% in 2013 and increased to the current 3.3% as indicated in Figure VII below.
Furthermore, the wage bill has remained relatively stagnant meaning that massive recruitment of teachers cannot be done despite the existence of staffing gaps. The efforts to enhance teachers’ salaries exacerbate the problem thereby creating little impact. This is because teachers’ salaries are affected by negative developments in the money and commodity markets as well as the relatively static wage-budget.

Secondary Education
Despite the progress made in increasing access to secondary education, a number of challenges still persist as illustrated below:

**Low Survival and Transition Rates**
Although Uganda strives to ensure equitable access to quality education in an efficient and effective manner at all levels, the efficiency at secondary level is low. Even with the increase in number of children qualifying for secondary education, the existing policies are not adequately aiding their progression to subsequent levels. Transition to S.1 and S.5 stand at 68% and 39% respectively (MoES, 2018). In addition, the survival rates are very low, currently estimated at 38%. Figure VIII below shows the survival and transition rates from 2002-2015.

*Figure VIII: Secondary School Completion and Transition Rates*

Source: constructed using data from MoES/UBOS

Figure VIII shows that transition rates to S.1 have stagnated at an average of 66% between 2007 and 2015; transition to S.5 has also stagnated at an average 37% over the same period.
**High Teacher Absenteeism**
Teacher absenteeism continues to be a challenge to the efficiency and quality of secondary education. Teacher absenteeism has a negative impact on learning achievement because low attendance rates of teachers reduce effective contact time which is a key determinant of quality education. One of the main reasons advanced for high teacher absenteeism is low teacher motivation which is attributed to factors that include lack of teachers’ houses and career development opportunities as well as the perceived low salary. Teacher absenteeism in rural areas is rampant to the extent that they are out of station for 2-3 implying wages are paid to non-executed tasks. In the process, valuable learning time is lost thereby affecting students’ performance at the end of the term or during their final examinations. Furthermore, teachers’ time on task is very low due to prevalent absenteeism. Low teachers’ contact time contributes to the low-quality education of secondary education. Currently, on average the student teacher ratio stands at an average of 21:1 while the student classroom ratio is at 50:1, a clear indicator of inefficiency in teacher allocation and utilization. Figure IX below shows the student teacher ratio and the student classroom ratio 2003 – 2015.

![Figure IX: Student Teacher and Student Classroom Ratios](image)

Source: constructed using data from MoES and UBOS

**Inadequacy of Teaching and Learning Facilities**
Despite having fewer students per class compared to primary schools, secondary schools are faced with challenges of inadequate and poorly built schools/classrooms, laboratories, desks, which in turn negatively affects their learning and comprehension. This results to some children completing the secondary school cycle without attaining the requisite competencies. Consequently, proficiency levels are low in core subjects like mathematics and sciences. This has led to low pass rates and low performance levels as indicated below.

![Figure X: UCE Performance Index, Pass Rate & Completion Rate](image)

Source: constructed using data from MoES and UBOS 2017
**Limited Funding**

Budget cuts have created resource constraints for most USE schools in Uganda (MoES, 2017). Less funding means smaller staff, fewer resources and a lower number of services for students (World Bank, 2018). While some argue that throwing more money at the education problems won’t make them go away (World Bank, 2018), others assert that lack of funding caused many of the problems in the first place (MoES, 2014). The escalating demand for secondary education increases the pressure on national budgets in an already constrained financial environment. Significantly increasing access to secondary education requires new financial resources (NRM Party Manifesto, 2016).

**Limited Community/ Parental Involvement**

Family factors also play a role in teaching and learning. There are ways parents can become involved and support their child’s education at the same time, but teachers don’t always get that level from parents. Unfortunately, community participation in educational school activities in Uganda has drastically declined since the internationalization of education. Rural areas have particularly have abdicated this responsibility to Government on account of a misconception that being a publicly funded program, only government is responsible for its implementation and outcomes. However, evidence from several studies in Uganda suggests that low community participation is one of the major impediments to the realization of quality primary education in the country and needs to be addressed as a matter of priority (NPA, 2015).

**Tertiary Education**

Uganda now explicitly acknowledges higher education as an important driver of socioeconomic transformation (Uganda Vision, 2040). The current HE system is therefore a result of many reforms that has seen the higher education landscape change from being initially characterized by publicly funded national universities to a combination of public and private. Private universities now constitute about 80% of universities in Uganda. Following the liberalization of the education sector, Makerere University in 1992 began admitting fee-paying students to attend classes as well as scholarship students, thus introducing cost-sharing to the country’s public sector universities. Given the limited number of Universities in the country coupled with the growing demand for University education, problems of access, equity and standards emerged. Although privatization resulted in a greater access it has also dented the quality of education provided, some universities have been found to admit unqualified students, operate with expired licenses, have inadequate facilities and inadequate qualified staff. A number of private universities are under threat of being closed by the National Council for Higher Education (NCHE) due to this anomaly. The key issues in Uganda’s HE system are analyzed below.

**Increasing demand for higher education**

The demand for HE continues to increase due to increasing number of secondary school graduates and the working-class seeking opportunities to pursue higher education. However, economic difficulties and increased competition for limited public funds have reduced state capacity to continue expanding higher education. Since 2000/1 academic year, only about 6% of registered UACE candidates who meet minimum university entry requirements get admitted on Government sponsorship to public universities. It is this surplus of qualified students that created market for privatization of university education in public and private universities in Uganda. Figure XI below shows the trend in tertiary enrolment 2002 – 2014.
From figure XI above, it can be observed that the enrolment in higher education institutions (public and private) has significantly grown from 79,857 in 2002 to 169,476 in 2009 and to 249,049 in 2014. However, there a general feeling that privatization has resulted to uncontrolled expansion and erosion of educational standards due to a weak regulatory framework.

Quality problems still persist in Uganda’s HE system despite several initiatives to improve quality such as the promotion of quality assurance systems in public and private institutions across the five East African Community Members States. Quality in African universities compares poorly at global level. The best five African universities: University of Cape Town; University of the Witwatersrand; University of KwaZulu-Natal; Stellenbosch University; and, Makerere University are rated globally at 114, 197, 336, 341, and 503 respectively (WUR, 2019). Each institution was evaluated based on its research performance and its ratings by members of the academic community around the world and in the region (World Report, 2019). A key consequence of underdeveloped higher education institutions is also high rates of migration of talent out of Africa in pursuit of training and research opportunities abroad.

**Low and Inequitable Access**
Uganda’s gross tertiary enrolment ratio is 6.1%, (UNDP 2017) lower than the Sub-Saharan Africa average of about 10%, Latin America 44%, or global average of 26%. Although better than Central African Republic, Malawi, Chad and Niger with enrolments rates of 2% or less. In addition, women are underrepresented in HE, in particular in the science and technology fields resonating with Darvas et al (2017) argument that access to tertiary education in Sub-Saharan Africa has unduly benefitted students from wealthiest households and overall enrollment remains disproportionately male, and metropolitan hence reinforcing social inequality. Darvas et al (2017) further noted that students from households whose income is within the highest 20% of the population dominate enrolment in universities and other tertiary institutions across Sub-Saharan Africa to the extent that on average, between 1998 and 2012, tertiary enrolment for students from the bottom 80% of households by income increased by 3.1% as compared to 8% for students from the highest 20% of households.

**Limited Research Output**
Poor research output continues to be a problem among African universities. It was estimated that Africa, which has 15% of the world’s population in 2014, produced only 1% of the world’s research publications and 0.1% of global patents mainly from South Africa and Nigeria. In addition, the output of PhD graduates was noted to be very low. Over the same period, it was reported that South Africa produced fewer doctorates than a single university in Brazil, although the two countries have comparable economies. An important reason for this was
the dramatic increase in student enrolment, which made teaching by far the prominent activity at the expense of research. The acute shortage of PhD-qualified academic staff to undertake and supervise research was another major inhibiting factor. Lack of funds for research was also an important obstacle. Many departments do not have more than 1 or 2 senior professors; many close to the retirement age. This prevents departments and universities from being able to provide relevant higher education training and establishing vibrant research environments.

Vanishing distinction between Universities and Non-University Tertiary Institutions
Lately, the traditional sharp division between universities and non-university tertiary institutions such as the polytechnics and business education colleges has become increasingly blurred. Ugandan universities have not only upgraded traditionally non-university courses into degrees, but have also introduced a plethora of short-cycle diploma and certificate courses, exclusively for full-cost tuition-paying students. This has led to reduction in artisan and other critical skills as people rush for more university education more than the practical oriented BTVET courses.

The contradiction of Unemployed Graduates and a Lack of Skilled Workforce
Many African countries face shortages of human resources and capacity within science, technology, engineering, and mathematics as well as agriculture and health disciplines (International Institute for Water and Environmental Engineering 2013; Montenegro and Patrinos 2012; World Bank 2007). There is a paradox of increasing graduates amidst rising graduate unemployment as graduates are unable to tap into the growing economies due to: poor quality of training and inadequacy of attributes and competencies required by employers.

Inadequate Infrastructure
The physical facilities of all public universities that offer most of the places to students are grossly inadequate and/or in a complete state of disrepair. Their libraries are bereft of leading international journals and new books while the quality and quantity of teachers have declined. Most of them also lack information and communication technologies.

Limited Funding
Ddumba (2013), noted that resources available to HE in Uganda are inadequate to enable effective delivery of quality teaching and learning. Consequently, the quality of teaching and research has been affected and staff and students’ welfare continue to decline. at continental level, few African countries invested 1% of their GDP on research and development as recommended by the African Union in 2006. Academic disruptions due to strikes by staff and/or students arising from a number of factors including poor administrative leadership and lack of resources are other challenges confronting African higher education (ACE Report, 2016).

Discussion
The over-all findings of this study suggest that education in Uganda continues to grapple with quality and equity problems. Although enrolment has been progress increasing across all levels of education, recent trends on virtually all quality indicators are below the desired levels compared to the rest of Sub Saharan Africa and to the world in general. Low quality is demonstrated by low learning achievement (school outcomes); literacy and numeracy proficiency at P.6 are less than desirable averaging 51.9% (51.6%boys and 52.2%girls) and 52.6% (56.1%boys & 48.2girls) in 2016 respectively. At Secondary Level, the proficiency levels are far below average. Proficiency in biology at S.2 by 2016 stood at an average of 20.5% (boys26.9% and 13.4% girls), while proficiency in mathematics at S.2 stood at an average of 41.5% (48.7%boys and 33.2%girls) over the same
period. In addition, the teaching and learning materials are often outstripped by the increasing enrolments. This has resulted into high: pupil teacher ratios, pupil textbook ratios, and pupil/student classroom ratios. In 2016 for instance, the pupil classroom ratio in public and private schools averaged 55:1 (29:1 private and 70:1 public) while at secondary level the student textbook ration averaged 28:1. Although gender parity has been achieved at primary level, when it comes to secondary, universities and other tertiary institutions, enrollment tends to be biased towards male and urban based students. The gap even widens further when it comes to science disciplines.

It therefore becomes clear that the government efforts to reform education have mainly been skewed towards increasing access especially through the adoption of Universal Primary Education (UPE) in 1997 and Universal Secondary Education (USE) in 2007 which have so far been the most fundamental and far reaching programmes. The UPE made an immediate impact on primary school enrolment level from 2.8 million in 1996 (EMIS) to 8,840,589 (EMIS, 2017).

It is therefore imperative that interventions to address education quality challenges at all levels should focus on critical areas that include: teachers’ development, management and motivation; strengthening the inspection by centralizing the inspection function and making it independent; reconstitute the staffing establishment for the inspectorate departments at the district and national levels depending in the number of schools; full implementation of the scheme of service at primary school level with a view to improving inspection at school level; provide teachers’ accommodation starting with hard-to-reach and hard-to-stay areas to reduce absenteeism and increase motivation and retention; institutionalize school feeding programmes; improve school management and strengthening community participation.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Despite the good progress made in expanding access to primary education parameters are not promising. Recent trends on virtually all quality indicators are below the desired levels. The quality of education is low demonstrated by low learning achievement, literacy and numeracy levels. Uganda needs an education paradigm shift. It is time to look beyond counting the number of children sitting in classrooms and start to focus on learning. Teacher recruitment, training, funding and support systems need to be overhauled to deliver quality education. The allocation of financial resources and teachers to schools should be geared towards the improvement of standards and equalization of learning outcomes. The critical task of building effective national learning assessment systems cannot be neglected. To realize the NDPII goal of strengthening Uganda’s Competitiveness for Sustainable Wealth Creation, Employment and Inclusive Growth, more has to be done to reach the marginalized children. Providing meals and hygienic facilities to keep children especially girls in school can help to mitigate the effects of poverty. So can early childhood programs and targeted support to marginalized regions.

Uganda’s poor balance of trade has been due exports of largely unprocessed and semi-processed commodities with limited value addition. Reversing this trend requires entry into higher value-added areas of production and international trade where quality education is a sine qua non for its success. In general, transformation of the Ugandan economy cannot be built on a weak education system. And it will not generate the 5 million additional jobs needed for young people joining the labor force over the next decade if those systems are not fixed.

Social and economic conditions also have an effect on education. Household poverty forces many children out of school and into employment. Gender roles have made girls to leave school to handle domestic chores like collecting water or caring for their siblings.
Parental illiteracy is another preschool barrier to learning. Majority of Uganda’s children especially from rural areas come from illiterate home environments. Lacking the early reading, language and numeracy skills that can provide a platform for learning, they struggle to make the transition to school – and their parents struggle to provide support with homework.

References


EFA Global Monitoring Report, *Education for All, The Quality Imperative, 2005*


An Investigation into the Teachers Perceptions of Performance Appraisal Systems in Public Secondary Schools: A Case Study of Schools in Lilongwe City, Malawi

Alexander Kazombo-Mwale
Staff Development Institute, Malawi

Abstract

New Public Management (NPM) has oriented modern governments towards results, management by objectives and performance management which have led to the introduction of the performance appraisal as an effective tool for managing performance in the public sector in Malawi. This study investigates the perceptions of teachers in order to understand the implementation of the performance management policy and unearth valuable information on how to consolidate NPM in the African public sector. The main findings are that the policy has major problems including: lack of ownership for the policy; inability to utilise intrinsic and extrinsic rewards; poor leadership exhibited by policy holders and heads of department. In addition, the individualistic nature of performance appraisals is welcomed because it ensures social loafers are identified. However, the culture of collectivism in Malawi has still provided an opportunity for appraisals to be abused.

Key words: New Public Management, Performance Management Policy, Teachers Perceptions

Introduction

Like most modern governments that are implementing New Public Management, the Malawi government introduced the performance management policy (2008). The Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MoEST) committed to this policy in its National Education Sector Implementation Plan (2009) by introducing performance appraisals. These appraisals are conducted by head teachers, heads of departments and inspectors in order to assess teachers for promotions (Kadzamira, 2006). The framers of the policy and the National Education Sector Plan (2009) believed that their recommendations would be followed as planned. However, this may not be the case because implementation of performance management reforms has always had difficulties in African countries such as Malawi. In testament to that, the findings in the Malawi Governments Public Service Reform Commission report (2014) discovered that there is laxity in the delivery of public services due to a performance system that is not robust, result oriented and linked to individual work plans that are related to organisational performance targets that are derived from the national development plan.

Performance appraisals are meant to foster career development, improve quality of teaching and learning and motivate employees. However, Matsuda (2004:1) observed that in Malawi’s education sector, career paths for teachers are not firmly established which makes teachers feel disillusioned with performance management systems. Lawler (2003) in Lawler et al (2012) argued that tying rewards to appraisal systems was likely to lead to a more successful performance management system. There, therefore, exists an apparent need to investigate the current performance appraisal systems available in public schools and assess whether they yield the desired results.

Earlier Attempts at Performance Management in the Malawian Public Sector

The introduction of democracy in 1994 brought about civil service reforms in Malawi aimed at improving efficiency in Malawi. This was due to a number of varying reasons that included globalisation; a new political system; and inefficiencies in the administrative system. The major performance management measure for individual performance, which was eventually introduced in the year 2000, was performance based contracts. Performance based contracts increased efficiency in the public service to some degree. However, this tool was
restricted to senior managers only which left the public education centres, including secondary schools, with no formal performance management systems.

**Criticism of Performance Appraisals**
The performance appraisal system has its fair share of criticism that needs to be taken into consideration when designing a performance appraisal policy. These criticisms are on a global perspective and, according to Lawler et al (2012) and Atkinson and Shaw (2006), they include:

- **One-sided analysis** - Critics such as Culbert (2010) argue that appraisals are a one way process which seems to stem from a descriptive view of what actually happens when appraisals are in practice. The prescriptive view, (Daley, 1992 and Roberts, 2003), states that performance appraisals are supposed to be participatory whereby rules and objectives to be measured can be set by both employer and employee.

- **Narrow focus of objectives** - Nickols (1997) also argues that performance appraisals actually erode performance because employees focus on only the objectives that they have identified will provide them with a good appraisal report. This can be detrimental to other areas of good performance that become overlooked.

- **Cultural complexities** - Atkinson and Shaw (2006) argue that appraisal systems have no evidential effectiveness because of operational complexities arising especially in a cross cultural context. Most appraisal systems used in Africa and indeed the whole world are based on business prescriptions that do not consider the diversity in organisations rather they are based on single cultures such as the United Kingdom, United States or China (Scott and Einstein, 2001).

**Performance Appraisals and Rewards**
In a show of interdependence, performance appraisals are said to have worked in cases where they have been linked to a reward (Lawler et al, 2012) and when there has been a level of contribution from both managers and employees about how the appraisal is designed (Cintron and Flaniken, 2011). Lower power distance cultures are more likely to benefit from this as they may involve employees in the identification of criterion to be used in rewards. Malawi, though a collectivist culture, is highly hierarchical thus has a high power distance (Hofstede centre, 2014). This means that the rewards set by management may not be as highly valued by the employees.

**Performance Appraisal Methods**
Aggarwal and Thakur (2013) identified two types of measures in performance appraisals and they are: objective measures and subjective measures. Decenzo and Robbins (1998) in Jafari et al (2009) further classified the appraisal methods into three approaches of measurement: absolute standards; relative standards; and objectives. The objective method is used across the world and is the current system used in Malawi’s public service. It is an ideal system because it allows employees to be part of the standard setting and allows management to clearly identify whether performance has taken place through periodic reviews of the objectives.

There are many types of performance appraisal techniques that are used and they all have advantages and disadvantages. A particular organisational context may be suitable for some techniques that another organisation may not be comfortable with. This is important to note because the use of performance appraisals in Malawi involves all government ministries that have different contexts.

The key areas covered in the study are related to:

A. Teachers understanding of the performance appraisal system
B. The link between the performance appraisal and reward
C. Employee’s attitudes towards change
D. Impact of the appraisal system on employee motivation
E. Strategies for improving performance appraisal systems

Study Area
Malawi is a landlocked country in Southeast Africa surrounded by Mozambique, Zambia, and Tanzania. This study was conducted at four secondary schools located in Lilongwe City. Two co-educational schools and two single sex schools were selected based on the argument by many scholars that single sex schools are related to higher cognitive performance of students (Mbilizi, 2008; Park et al, 2014). This provided an opportunity to understand how teacher performance is managed in single sex schools as opposed to co-educational schools.

Methodology

Data Collection and Analysis
The study used a semi-structured interview to collect primary data. Interviews were conducted with teachers and Heads of Departments (HODs) in order to accurately compare perceptions of these two groups. Six respondents per school were interviewed, three teachers and three members of management. The teachers were selected using a stratified random sampling. In this study teachers were stratified according to their departments: humanities; languages; and sciences. This mode of sampling enabled the study to analyse different attitudes of teachers based on the subjects they teach. Studies on secondary school teachers’ attitudes (Hallam and Ireson, 2011) have revealed that teacher’s attitudes may differ depending on the subject that they teach. The study used journals and other government documents, as secondary data, to complement the data collected from interviews. This study utilises the narrative analysis to analyse interviewee’s explanations which were presented in a story form. It also utilised the method of agreement to identify the critical variables for the effective implementation of appraisals.

Findings

Awareness of the Policy
All respondents expressed the awareness of the introduction of performance appraisals in secondary schools through the NESP (2009) as proposed by the DPSM (2008). The researcher was presented with government circulars on the same. However, none of the respondents expressed knowledge of any sensitization sessions conducted to familiarise teachers and management in schools about the use of performance appraisals. Management and staff also expressed knowledge of the performance appraisal upon the implementation of the policy in their respective schools and not before it. All the respondents reported the year 2013 as the year the performance appraisal was rolled out in their schools, meaning that teachers and management were not aware of the policy for almost four years, since 2009.

New Recruits
In implementing the performance appraisals teachers and HODs acknowledged that management and the MoEST are not doing enough to ensure that new members of staff are aware of the policy. This is because, since its inception at their respective schools, new recruits have not been asked to fill in appraisal forms or briefed of the policy.

Implementation of the Performance Appraisal
The respondent’s views on how the MoEST was implementing the policy expressed a lack of clarity on how the MoEST was actually implementing the policy. One respondent attributed to the fact that the ministry provided
forms for appraisals as a way of implementing the policy while most of the respondents expressed ignorance in how the appraisal is being implemented by the MoEST. Those in management explained that as an HOD, their role was to explain the aims of the performance appraisal to staff and conduct periodic reviews. However, the consensus among teachers and HODs was that the grading of teachers and periodic reviews do not happen. For some schools such reviews were said to have occurred at the beginning of the appraisal system but no longer happen:

**Teachers’ Roles in Implementation**

When asked to elaborate on their roles in the implementation of the performance appraisal, teachers provided a variety of answers that include:

- “*My role is to prepare lesson plans, schemes, exercises, prepare examinations, and give feedback to the parents through school reports.*” (Respondent 2)
- “*I have to teach. In teaching I have to stick to the objectives of the appraisals as agreed and work hand in hand with the HOD*” (Respondent 6)
- “*My role is to make sure that students are performing in class and in examinations. I should be effective in whatever I am doing. I am required to fill in forms and hand them in to the Head teacher.*” (Respondent 9)
- “*I guess it is their role, my role is only to teach and assess the students. The appraisal is beyond my authority.*” (Respondent 13)

The above responses show that to some extent, teachers perceive their roles differently.

**Reactions to the Appraisal**

When the performance appraisals were introduced in the respective schools the reaction appeared mixed to negative. Issues that came out were:

- Staff do not like the performance appraisals
- The policy was forced on their schools thus led to lack of ownership of the policy
- Performance appraisals are too involving in terms of filling out the forms
- They are going to be used for fault finding
- They will be useless as they will not be used for rewards

However, one HOD and two teachers stated that the performance appraisal had brought about a spirit of seriousness among the teachers.

**Cultural Complexities and the Performance Appraisal**

The respondents unanimously agreed that the Malawian culture was indeed communal and at the same time possessing a high power distance.

**Communal Culture: Participation and Feedback**

The respondents stated that the characteristics of a communal culture, namely participation and feedback, were not in practice among the schools. This is because the prescriptive one on one interaction between the supervisor and supervised never happens.
High Power Distance Culture and Decision Making
The teachers agreed unanimously that the high-powered culture in their communities had penetrated the school environment with decisions about various issues at the school being made by those in authority without the consultation of junior staff. The majority of HODs contradicted this view and opined that issues of importance in their respective schools were discussed with inclusiveness with junior members of staff before decisions were made. The HODs, however, admitted issues of performance did not involve consultations with the HODs, sometimes, making the final decision on a teacher’s performance without consulting them.

Performance Appraisals and Rewards
Apart from one of the single sex schools, the consensus among HODs and teachers was that there are no rewards related to the performance appraisals. In the majority of responses from the same single sex school, the respondents displayed an acknowledgement of both monetary and developmental rewards being exhibited at their school. The heads of departments and teachers at this school however acknowledged that salary adjustments based on appraisals had not occurred yet because the policy was relatively new but were optimistic that this would be enforced in the near future.

Types of Rewards
The consensus among respondents was that there is a need to focus on intrinsic rewards that focus on personal development through upgrading courses and other forms of training. The view is that this would ensure development needs of particular teachers at that time are met and that efficiency in teacher and HOD performance is improved.

Factors for Poor Implementation
The consensus among all the schools is that the performance appraisal policy is poorly implemented. The respondents identified a number of reasons for this view which include:

- Top down approach to policy development and implementation, whereby the school management and staff were forced to adopt a policy introduced by government using ideas suggested by development partners.
  “…Maybe the orders came from Capitol Hill or from international donors. Maybe it’s just that idea that one size fits all, where development partners just tell African countries what to do…”
  (Respondent 13)
- The MoEST doesn’t conduct follow ups on the policy
  “The implementers were in a hurry because they gave us forms to fill but there is not much follow up which means that they are useless. No one knows what is going on now…”
  (Respondent 9)
- The policy is said to have been characterised by a lack of information.
  “…There isn’t enough information on it, in terms of why and what it aims to accomplish. It is basically a rushed programme.” (Respondent 6)

Solutions to the Challenges Mentioned
The major themes provided revolve around follow ups, sensitization and consultation.
“The ministry should be coming to visit schools in order for the staff to understand how serious they are with their implementations otherwise no one will be interested with implementing the policy”
(Respondent 2)

“The ministry should teach people about the programme and should teach people on how to define their objectives. It is a new programme and government needs to spend time to convince people to accept it”
(Respondent 6)

“Policy makers should consult fully with the people on the grassroots such as the teachers...”
(Respondent 13)

Discussion
The data provided has revealed that there is a state of partial or non-implementation of the policy as well as a negative perception towards how the policy is being implemented. This is obviously against government’s aims of improving performance management in the civil service in general and the teaching service specifically. Although being aware of the performance appraisal policy, the teachers are not aware of how the performance appraisal is aligned to the organisational strategies which is one the key factors for a performance appraisal, according to Cascio (2010). This has to a lead to a lack of acceptability, another key factor mentioned by Cascio (2010). This is because policy makers in the Department of Public Service Management clearly failed to adequately involve those in the teaching service in the formulation and implementation of the performance appraisal policy.

The information about performance appraisals was passed through government circulars and head teachers. According to the data, the use of these informational tools was not effective as the information was not adequate to influence a change in behaviour. According to Hood and Margetts (2006) governments have four tools in policy and they are:

- Nodality - the factor of being at the centre of social and information networks
- Authority – The possession of legal or official power to demand or prohibit
- Treasure – the possession of money or exchangeable goods can influence change
- Organisation – the stock of people, land, buildings, materials, and equipment that is somehow arranged.

Escher et al (2006) argue that the greater the nodality of a government, the more likely it can use dissemination of information alone to change societal behaviour. The collected data reveals that the Malawi government’s nodality is poor because tools such as surveys and public information campaigns were not used to adequately promote the policy of appraisals. This would have given government all the necessary information to formulate and implement policies easier. Instead the government insisted on using the authority tool by demanding adherence to a new policy that had no support from the implementers.

The performance appraisal is individualistic in nature which is the opposite of the collective culture in Malawi. This has been a welcome aspect to the working environment of teachers because it ensures that social loafers and undeserving employees are identified. However, the realisation that the culture is strongly collectivist, has led to perceptions that persons in positions of authority are likely to ignore performance appraisals as tools for measuring performance, as they would rather support individuals in their social grouping. This reveals the extent of work that is needed to eradicate the collectivist and nepotistic culture from the work place. The data also revealed a strong perception against policies imported from the donor community and other international
agencies. Teachers feel that policies originating from foreign sources will find it difficult to work in the Malawian set up. This should alert the policy maker that the implementers already have negative perceptions before policies are made and need to ensure that these negative perceptions are encountered. The data has revealed that the management style is high power distance. Atkinson and Shaw (2006) stated that high power distance cultures are more likely to be critical of performance appraisals. The data revealed that HODs did not involve appraised teachers in the formulation of criteria for assessment results. The reasons were mainly because the HODs felt that it was time wasting and that they knew better. This shows a high power distance nature that is in contrast with the qualities of involvement needed for performance appraisals. This has developed an adversarial relationship between teachers and HODs as well as management and the MoEST. Such mentality also requires a strong use of the nodality tool in order to change the adversarial nature of relationships in the work place. The aim should be a change to a low power distance culture in order to ensure full participation that can lead to a successful performance appraisal system. This will, among many things, make it more difficult for one-sided analysis to take place.

The data collected revealed that there were no clear links between performance appraisals and rewards even though the performance management policy for the Malawi civil service by the DPSM (2008) clearly stipulates that promotions will be based upon a review of performance appraisals. The fact that 20,000 teachers in Malawi were promoted based on years of service in 2019 (Nyasatimes, 2019), serves to further prove that performance appraisals are not used for their intended purpose. This correlates with the expectancy theory that states that people act in such a way that they expect rewards and avoid penalties. Apart from the lack of rewards, the data has revealed that even when there is no adherence to the performance appraisals in the MoEST, no penalty is given to any of the implementers. This may stem from the fear that the ministry is not able to provide adequate rewards so would rather also not punish its employees. The data has also highlighted the need to focus on total rewards, as explained by Kaplan (2007), referring to everything an employee values in their employment from benefits and compensation to development and a working environment. The teachers interviewed prioritised educational and skills development as the most important reward. The development of this reward is a challenge as evidenced by recent government circulars that include the June 2013 circular warning, that it shall only grant study leaves to teachers who will study languages, mathematics and sciences (Nation Online, 2013). This directive lacks support for teachers seeking skills in other areas such as humanities and administration. Apart from that, the clear direction of the courses allowed to study also means that the reward of a promotion into administrative roles for teachers who have served for a lengthy period of time and gained experience needed in such roles is not being planned for. The data revealed that teachers felt that policies enforced on them were made by people who do not really understand the grass root level environment. The restriction of courses is therefore detrimental to the future acquisition of policy makers and administrators familiar to the teaching environment.

Monitoring is an essential part of evidence based policy making. It involves established objective evidence, which improves the relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of policy decisions (National Collaborating Centre for Methods and Tools, 2011). However, the data has revealed that there have been no follow ups since the commencement of the performance appraisals. The performance management policy is therefore a policy that cannot be proven to be effective.

Leaders are not providing a conducive environment for policies to succeed. This may be caused by the lack of involvement that has led to a lack of enthusiasm for the policy. However, leaders at a school level need to be part of the enculturation process as part of their duties as leaders (Portin et al, 2006). Leaders are required to creatively establish the required rewards at an institutional level and relate the rewards to the performance
appraisals. Judging by the teachers perceptions, the leaders at the ministry level clearly also offered no guidance and motivation to support the policy. Their role is the most important because it is the most exemplary. Although the lack of follow ups and implementation may be affected by poor resources, managers have an obligation to budget, organize and solve problems (Bohoris and Vorria, 2007). The implementation of public sector reforms in Malawi is a positive move to reflect government seriousness on performance management but the data collected has clearly proved Olaopa’s (2010) view that there is a problem with the culture of execution in the African public service.

Conclusion

In order to try to address the challenges faced by performance management policies, policy makers need to ensure consultations of stakeholders are fully utilized and results made publicly available through media such as television, radio and newspapers. This will avoid claims of non-consultation once a policy is implemented. Policy makers need to also fully engage in sensitization campaigns that will ensure implementers accept the policy as theirs and are competent enough to implement the policy. Finally, there is a need for competent monitoring and evaluation frameworks for the policy and to ensure they are implemented.

References


Developing and Testing the Validity and Reliability of an Instrument on the Predictors in Leech's (2012) Model on Becoming a Knowledgeable and Skilled Researcher in the Context of Makerere University

Olive Lunyolo, Fred E. K. Bakkabulindi *, Hilary M. Tusiime
1 East African School of Higher Education Studies and Development (EASHESD),
1 College of Education and External Studies (CEES), Makerere University (Mak)
* Corresponding author: Email address fekb@cees.mak.ac.ug

Abstract
Leech (2012) came up with a model that postulates four predictors of an individual's ability to become a knowledgeable and skilled researcher. The four predictors are individual resources; program of study; micro environment; and macro environment. However, Leech did not come up with an instrument on these predictors. Thus in this study, we sought (i) To develop an instrument on the predictors; (ii) To establish the extent to which each predictor construct was valid and reliable; (iii) To establish whether the predictor constructs were independent; and (iv) To test the validity of the factor structure of our instrument. In terms of methodology, for our first objective, we carried out an interpretive study in the form of a literature review. For our remaining three objectives, we carried out a positivist study involving a sample of 149 (past and continuing) doctoral students in Makerere University who responded to a self-administered questionnaire on our instrument. Our positivist analysis involved the use of Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) and Cronbach alpha for our second objective; Pearson’s Linear Correlation (PLC) for our third objective; and Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA) for our fourth and last objective. Hence using literature review, we developed an instrument with items for each predictor construct that we adapted from already made instruments. We hence used CFA to establish that every construct of each predictor in our instrument was valid. However, PLC suggested that the constructs of each predictor were highly inter-related. Finally, using EFA, we established that while the factor structures of the first and last predictors were questionable, the factor structures of the other two predictors were valid. Hence we make a call to researchers to use our instrument, at least those parts that are valid, as they refine the other parts that are inadequate.

Key words: Construct, Cronbach alpha, Factor Analysis, Instrument Development, Leech's Model, Makerere University, Predictor, Skilled Researcher

Introduction
Leech (2012) proposed a model of educating knowledgeable and skilled researchers as shown in Figure 1. At the centre of the model is a knowledgeable and skilled researcher. Leech postulated four predictors of an individual’s ability to become a knowledgeable and skilled researcher, namely: individual resources; program of study; micro environment; and macro environment. Leech contended that the individual - such as a doctoral student - has resources namely knowledge, personality, thinking style, motivation and intelligence which shape his/her journey to becoming a knowledgeable and skilled researcher. The individual is subjected to a program which according to Leech, has a curriculum to which the student is subjected; the standards expected from the individual; and the instruction or how this curriculum is passed on and assessed. According to Leech, the way the program is structured for example by clearly spelling out what is expected of a doctoral student, how the program is taught and assessed play a big role in determining whether the individual becomes a knowledgeable and successful researcher.

Leech (2012) further postulates that the individual is also influenced by the micro environment that he/she studies in. Leech takes the micro environment to be the immediate setting of a learner, and according to her, includes the department in which the individual/student is studying; the location of the department (e.g., whether urban or rural); the advisors/mentors/supervisors of the student; other faculty than the advisors/mentors/supervisors; and the peers of the student. Leech (2012) further postulates that the individual is
also influenced by the macro environment that he/she is studying in. Leech defines the macro environment as the social cultural and institutional context of the student, which she operationalises as the culture of graduate education of say the university in which a student is studying and the culture of the discipline the student is pursuing. Leech postulates that the more favourable each of the four predictors is, the easier will it be for the student to transit into a knowledgeable and skilled researcher.

![Diagram](Image)

**Figure 1 Leech’s Model on Educating Knowledgeable and Skilled Researchers**
(Source: Leech, 2012, p. 32, Figure 5)

However, despite suggesting the predictors, we have not seen evidence to suggest that she developed an instrument on the same. Our study thus sought to close this gap by developing the instrument and testing it for validity and reliability. Hence our first objective in the paper is to come up with an instrument on the predictors suggested by Leech (2012), as per Figure 1. Secondly, we seek to establish the validity and reliability of each construct under each predictor in our instrument. Thirdly we shall test whether the constructs under each predictor in our instrument are independent. Lastly, we shall test the validity of the factor structure of our instrument.

**Interpretive Study**

**Method of the Interpretive Study**

The methodology we used in our paper was suggested by MacKenzie, Podsakoff and Podsakoff (2011) in their paper titled, "Construct measurement and validation procedures in... behavioral research." Therein they assert that, "the first stage of scale development and validation process involves defining the conceptual domain of the construct" (p. 298). This was reasonably done by Leech (2012) as we have outlined earlier in the paper. MacKenzie et al. advise that, "once the focal construct has been conceptually defined, the next step... is to generate a set of items that fully represents the conceptual domain of the construct" (p. 304). Hence our first objective was to develop an instrument based on the predictors suggested by Leech (2012). MacKenzie et al.
(2011) further advise that, these items may come from a variety of sources..., including reviews of the literature, deduction from the theoretical definition of the construct, previous theoretical and empirical research on the focal construct, suggestions from experts in the field, interviews or focus groups discussions with representatives of the population(s) to which the focal construct is expected to generalise, and an examination of other measures of the construct that already exist (p. 304). Hence, to achieve this objective, we reviewed literature on instruments on the constructs of the respective predictors suggested by Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1). We sourced for scholars that had developed and tested for validity and reliability, instruments on the constructs which are similar to some of the constructs in Leech's model. We sourced for the literature from journals such as the International Journal of Doctoral Studies (IJDS) and other documents from data bases such as: Dissertation Abstracts, Elton Bryson Stephen’s Company host (EBSCOhost), Education Resources Information Centre/Clearing House (ERIC), Journal Storage (JSTOR), Psychological Information (PsycINFO), Psychological Literature (PsycLIT), Science Direct, Social Science Citation.

Results of the Interpretive Study

Instruments on Individual Resources. Guided by Leech's model (Figure 1), we operationalised individual resources (IR) as motivation (M) to learn, personality (P), thinking style (TS), and self-efficacy (SE). We came across resources on, or suggesting instruments on Motivation (e.g., Chumbley, Haynes & Stofer, 2015); on Personality (e.g., Myer's Personality Type Indicator Inventory cited in Kabugo, 2010; Schiniederjans & Kim, 2005); on Thinking Style (e.g., Black & McCoach, 2008); and Self Efficacy (e.g., Broadbent, 2016; Chesnut, Siwatu, Young & Tong, 2015; Gelso, Mallinckrodt & Judge, 1996; Kerrigan & Hayes, 2016; Perepiczka, Chandler & Becerra, 2011). However, for space limitations, we shall only review the three (Black & McCoach, 2008; Chumbley et al., 2015; Schiniederjans & Kim, 2005) from which we sourced for our own instrument (see Table 1).

Black and McCoach (2008) examined the psychometric properties of the Thinking Styles Inventory (TSI; Sternberg & Wagner, 1992). They administered the TSI each of whose 104 items had been scaled using the seven-point Likert, to 789 "students in grades 9-12 in four high schools in Connecticut" (p. 190) in the United States. They used confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) "to compare the adequacy and fit of competing hypothesised structural models and... exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to examine further the data structure" (p. 190). They hence reduced the 104 items to 32 items under five factors/dimensions/subscales, each with a number of items and reliability as follows: Liberal/progressive (9 items; $\alpha = 0.863$); External (6 items; $\alpha = 0.832$); Hierarchic (6 items; $\alpha = 0.767$); Judicial (5 items; $\alpha = 0.729$); and Legislative/self-reliant (6 items; $\alpha = 0.778$). The high reliabilities suggested that their new measure was reasonable.

Chumbley et al. (2015) carried out a study to determine how what they referred to as, "secondary agriculture students" (p. 107) conceptualised their motivation to learn agriscience. As part of the study, they used what they termed, a modified version of the Science Motivation Questionnaire II (SMQ II; Glynn, Brickman, Armstrong & Taasoobshirazi, 2011). The 25-item SMQ II included five constructs, namely intrinsic motivation (IM); self determination (SD); self efficacy (SE); career motivation (CM); and grade motivation (GM). All the items in the SMQ II were scaled using the five-point Likert scale. When they administered the SMQ II to 518 respondents, the constructs scored the following reliabilities: IM (0.89); SD (0.88); SE (0.83); CM (0.92); and GM (0.81). All these Cronbach's alpha coefficients above 0.7 (Mackenzie et al., 2011) meant that overall the SMQ II was a reliable instrument.

Schiniederjans and Kim (2005) studied the "relationship between student personality characteristics and their achievement scores" (p. 205). To tap the personality characteristics, they used the Wonderlic Personality
Characteristics Inventory (PCI; Wonderlic, 2004). The PCI measures the so-called "Big Five personality characteristics" (p. 211), namely conscientiousness (C; 4 items); openness to experience (OE; 8 items); emotional stability (ES; 4 items); extraversion (E; 8 items); and agreeableness (A; 7 items). All the items in the PCI were based on an index score ranging from 0% (for a low degree of a certain personality) to 100% (for a high degree of the personality). When they administered the PCI to 260 undergraduate students in a Management Information System (MIS) class at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln, "the Cronbach's alpha coefficients... were all above... 0.80" (p. 212). Hence overall the PCI was a reliable instrument.

Instruments on the Program of Study. Guided by Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1), we operationalised the program of study (PS) as the standards (S) and curriculum (C) of the program. We came across resources on or suggesting instruments on the Program of Study (e.g., Bierer, Fishleder, Dannefer, Farrow & Hull, 2004; Bista & Cox, 2014; Hadre & Hackett, 2015; Leech & Haugh, 2015; Roberts, Gentry & Townsend, 2011; Ruth, 2000; Waugh, 1998). However, for space limitations, we shall only review the two (Roberts et al., 2011; Waugh, 1998) from which we sourced for our own instrument (see Table 1).

Roberts et al. (2011) sought to understand how the students on a doctoral program in Higher Education Administration (HEA) perceived the quality of, and how satisfied they were with, the program. On the positivist side of their study, they used an instrument tapping four constructs, namely satisfaction with academic advising/supervision (SAA; 9 items); satisfaction with the preparation to achieve educational and career goals (SPAECG; 7 items); satisfaction with the commitment of the program to academic excellence (SCPAE; 9 items); and satisfaction with the preparation to conduct research in a college/university setting (SPCR; 6 items). All the items in the instrument were scaled using the five-point Likert scale. When they administered the instrument to 34 students "who had completed at least two semesters of coursework" (p. 6), the four constructs recorded the following reliabilities: SAA (0.897); SPAECG (0.940); SCPAE (0.890); and SPCR (0.932). They conclusively observed that, "since all of these reliabilities were greater than 0.700, the instrument was considered to produce reliable scores" (p. 7). It is worth noting that the construct SAA is the equivalent of supervision (Sup) as per Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1).

Waugh (1998) revised the Course Experience Questionnaire (CEQ; Johnson, 1997), that according to him, was then being used annually by universities in Australia to assess the perception of graduate students of their programs. The original CEQ had five subscales/constructs, namely good teaching (GT; 6 items); clear goals (CG; 4 items); good assessment (GA; 4 items); reasonable workload (RW; 4 items); and generic skills (GS; 6 items). Waugh modified the CEQ by adding to it a sixth subscale/construct of support and resources (SR; 6 items). Waugh used an "ordered response format (not Likert scale) covering unit (subjects) that they used in the study. Hence he subjected his modified CEQ to 404 third year students that he had conveniently sampled from an Australian university. Finally, using the Rasch Measurement Model (Briggs & Wilson, 2003; Rasch, 1980/1960), he reported that, his "scale had good psychometric properties" (Abstract).

Instruments on the Micro Environment. Guided by Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1), we operationalised the micro environment (MiE) as the culture of the department on graduate education (CDE), the supervisor/advisor/mentor (Sup), other faculty (OF) and peers (Pe). We came across resources (e.g., Barnes, Chard, Wolfe, Stassen & Williams, 2011; Baptista, 2011; Bell-Ellison & Dedrick, 2008; Berk, Berg, Mortimer, Walton-Moss & Yeo, 2005; Chen & Lo, 2012; Chesnut et al., 2015; Flora, 2017; Gray & Crosta, 2019; Johnston, Sampson, Comer & Brogt, 2016; Lee, 2018; Mainhard, van der Rijst, van Tardtijk & Wubbels, 2018; Phillips & Pugh, 2010; Royal & Gonzalez, 2016; Wisker & Robinson, 2016) on or suggesting instruments on those constructs particularly the Supervisor/Advisor/Mentor (Sup). However, for space limitations, we shall only
review the five (Barnes et al., 2011; Berk et al., 2005; Chen & Lo, 2012; Chesnut et al., 2015; Johnston et al., 2016) from which we sourced for our own instrument (see Table 1).

Barnes et al. (2011) examined the psychometric properties of the Graduate Student Advising Survey (GSAS; Office of Academic Planning and Assessment [OAPE]/Student Assessment, Research & Evaluation [SAREO], nd, cited in Barnes et al., 2011). The GSAS consisted of 46 items that addressed six subscales/constructs, namely the criteria for selecting the advisor (CSA; 8 items); functions of the advisor (FA; 16 items); satisfaction with the advisor (SA; 7 items); perception of the departmental climate (PDC; 6 items); time to degree (TTD; 4 items); and peer influence (PI; 5 items). They used several "rating scale response options" (p. 4) in the instrument. These included, "agree/disagree, not a reason/minor reason/major reason, satisfied/not satisfied, helpful/not helpful, most of the time/none of them options" (p. 4). All the items in the instrument were scaled using the Likert scale. They administered the GSAS to 2,373 "degree-seeking graduate students at a research-extensive public university in the Northeast" (p. 4) of the US, who had enrolled the spring semester of 2006. They hence computed the "reliability of the separation values" (RSV) for each of the six subscales/constructs using the Bayesian index (Briggs & Wilson, 2003). Hence the respective six factors/dimensions/subscales/constructs attained the following reliabilities: CSA (0.71); FA (0.85); SA (0.83); PDC (0.73); TTD (0.79); and PI (0.76). They concluded that, "these values are... within an acceptable range for the survey intended to ascertain opinions and perceptions" (p. 7). It is worth noting PDC is the equivalent of the culture of the department on graduate education (CDE) as per Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1). PI is the equivalent of peer influence (Pe) as per Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1).

Berk et al. (2005) among other objectives built "a scale that measures the effectiveness of... [the mentorship/advising/supervision] relationship in terms of specific outcomes that a mentee could evaluate" (p. 67). Using a review of conceptual literature, they developed the Mentorship Effectiveness Scale (MES), "a 12-item six-point agree-disagree-format Likert-type rating scale, which evaluates 12 behavioral characteristics of the mentor" (p. 66). Without giving specifics, they indicated that they had "spent more than a year reviewing and constructing" the MES and addressing its "psychometric issues" (p. 68). Luckily, we came across a study (Chesnut et al, 2015) that among other tools had used Berk et al.'s (2005) MES. Chesnut et al. examined the relationship between graduate students' research environment, course/program experience, and self-efficacy beliefs. They hence among others used the MES to measure the "perceptions of the effectiveness of research mentors" (p. 404). When they administered the MES to 160 "graduate students enrolled in the College of Education situated in a large university in the Southwestern region of the United States" (p. 403), they conclusively noted that the, "scores on this measure were reliable as estimated by Cronbach's alpha of 0.97 " (p. 405).

Chen and Lo (2012) developed and assessed the psychometric properties of the Nursing Student Satisfaction Scale (NSSS) for evaluating students' satisfaction with their nursing programs. They thus came up with an instrument with 27 items, falling under three constructs as follows: Curriculum and teaching (CT; 13 items); professional social interaction (PSI; 9 items); environment (E; 5 items). After administering the instrument to 138 respondents, they used confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) and exploratory factor analysis (EFA), the three constructs scored the following reliabilities: CT (0.93); PSI (0.89); and E (0.96). They hence revealed that these factors provided a valid and reliable measure for nursing students' satisfaction.

Johnston et al. (2016) used a "locally developed survey instruments to elicit feedback" (p. 185). They used a "tailor-made institution-based survey instruments to gather data that can [sic] be used to effect meaningful and timely change in the postgraduate research experience" (p.186). They hence used the University of Canterbury...
Postgraduate Experience Questionnaire (UCPEQ; Sampson, Johnston, Comer & Brogt, 2016), which had five constructs, namely: Research skills (RS; 8 items); access to resources (AR; 7 items); research culture (RC; 7 items); goals and expectations (GE; 6 items); experiences with supervision (EWS; 15 items). Unfortunately, they did not report about the reliabilities of the constructs and other psychometric measures.

Instruments on the Macro Environment. Guided by Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1), we operationalised the macro environment (MaE) as the culture of the college on graduate education (CUGE), the culture of the discipline (CD) and collaboration/networking (CN). We came across resources on or suggesting instruments on these constructs including many that we have already cited. However, for space limitations, we shall only review the two (Hadre & Hackett, 2015; Nerad, 2012) from which we sourced for our own instrument (see Table 1).

Hardré and Hackett (2015) "examined... graduate students' perceptions of what graduate school experiences should and did include" (p. 57). They investigated, "how a diverse group of university graduate students and recent graduates defined the graduate experience" (p. 59). They hence used an instrument which they had developed earlier (see Hadre & Hackett, 2014a, b both cited in Hadre & Hackett, 2015), which had three constructs, namely: perceptions of the ideal or expected graduate experience (PIGE; 32 items); perceptions of the actual graduate experience (PAGE; 32 items); and satisfaction with the graduate experience (SGE; 12 items). They then administered their instrument on a total of 1,629 respondents (1,430 current Masters and doctoral students and 199 recently graduate alumni) from "a large public university in the United States" (p. 60). Hence the three constructs recorded the following reliabilities: PIGE (0.97); PAGE (0.98); and SGE (0.90), signalling a very reliable instrument.

We related the constructs of the culture of the discipline (CD) and collaboration/networking (CN) to the new phenomenon of globalisation or internationalisation! There is a growing body of authors who argue that because the world is becoming a global village, courtesy of ICT, doctoral studies should train a student to embrace the international or global context (e.g., see Bogle, 2010, 2014; Nerad, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2015; Philips & Pugh, 2010). In particular, Nerad (2012) observes that, "not only does research operate on the basis of its trans-disciplinary application but the process involves multiple actors" (p. 60). Nerad names the multiple actors as including universities, industry, business and governments. Nerad continues to contend that, "new... PhDs are now expected... to be competent writers, speakers, managers, and team members who can communicate research goals and results effectively inside and outside the university" (p. 60). Nerad goes on to point out that,

Communication across vast regions, spurred by technological innovation, has become easier, faster, and more widespread. As a result, scholarly networks are flourishing and are supported by governmental agencies... and by international parties such as... the World Bank.... Researchers [hence] need to learn to work in international teams (p. 61).

Nerad (2012) further stresses this point by suggesting that, "the next generation of researchers will need competencies that are pertinent to effective collaboration in international teams dedicated to solving societal problems in multinational settings" (p. 63). Our Instrument. From the literature cited in this section, we developed a self-administered questionnaire (SAQ) (Appendix) on the predictors in Leech's (2012) model. Apart from background items (sex, age in years, year when the PhD was/will be received, college/faculty, type of student whether Ugandan or foreign, and sponsor) on the respondents, as suggested in Table 1, our SAQ had the four predictors in the model (Figure 1), namely individual resources (IR); program of study (PS); the micro-environment (MiE); and the macro-environment (MaE). The number of items per construct, and their reliability are given in Table 1. We scaled the 55 items using a five point Likert scale ranging from 1 (which stood for the
worst case scenario such as 'strongly disagree') to 5 (which stood for the best case scenario such as 'strongly agree'). Thus we fulfilled our first objective in the paper.

Table 1: Variables in the Instrument

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Predictor</th>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Number of Items Adapted</th>
<th>Source Instrument, Number of Items in it, and their Reliability (α Value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individual Resources (IR)</td>
<td>Motivation (M)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Chumbley et al. (2015), 5 items (α = 0.89)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Personality (P)</td>
<td>5 (1, 3, &amp; 1 adapted from the respectively sections)</td>
<td>Wonderlic (2004 cited in Schniederjans &amp; Kim, 2005), 4 items on Conscientiousness (α = 0.87), 8 items on openness to experience (α = 0.83), 3 items on emotional stability (α = 0.86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thinking styles (TS)</td>
<td>5 (1, 2, 1, &amp; 1 adapted from the respectively sections)</td>
<td>Black &amp; McCoach (2008), 9 items on the liberal/progressive factor (α = 0.863), 6 items on the external factor (α = 0.832), 6 items on the hierarchical factor (α = 0.767), 5 items on the judicial factor (α = 0.729)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program of Study (PS)</td>
<td>Self efficacy (SE)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Chumbley et al. (2015), 5 items (α = 0.83)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Standards (S)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Waugh (1998), 4 items (α = 0.876)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Curriculum (C)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Roberts et al. (2011), 7 items (α = 0.94)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micro Environment (MiE)</td>
<td>Culture of the department on graduate education (CDE)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Johnston et al. (2016), 7* items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Supervisor (Sup)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Berk et al. (2005), 12 items (α = 0.97**)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other Faculty (OF)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Chen &amp; Lo (2012), 9 items (α = 0.93)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peers (Pe)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Barnes et al. (2011), 5 items (α = 0.76)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macro Environment (MaE)</td>
<td>Culture of the college on graduate education (CGE)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hadre &amp; Hackett (2015), 32 items (α = 0.97)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Culture of Discipline (CD)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nerad (2012), 3* items from literature review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Collaboration/networking (CN)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Nerad (2012) 4* items from literature review</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* No reliability (α value) reported
** Reported in Chesnut et al. (2015, p. 405)

**Positivist Study**

**Methods of the Positivist Study**

Our second objective in this paper was to establish the validity and reliability of each construct under a given predictor in our instrument on the predictors in Leech's (2012) model as given earlier (Figure 1). Thirdly we intended to test whether the constructs under each predictor in our instrument were independent. We based these two objectives on the advice by MacKenzie et al. (2011) to the effect that, "once the construct has been carefully defined, it is important to step back and evaluate whether there are multiple sub-dimensions of the focal construct and how they relate to the focal construct and to each other." (p. 300). Then lastly we wished to check the validity of the factor structure of our instrument. To achieve these three objectives, we carried out a positivist study involving a sample of 149 (past and present) doctoral students in Makerere University (https://www.mak.ac.ug) who responded to our self-administered questionnaire (SAQ) on our instrument.
Our respondents were either current doctoral students or those who had graduated in the ten-year window before the study, that is, after 2009. In terms of results (Table 2), our typical respondent was a male (61.7%); aged less than 40 (45.4%); still on his/her doctoral program (68.8%); from the College of Education and External Studies (CEES) (26.4%); a Ugandan (91.2%); and on scholarship (60.1%). Our analysis involved using confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) and Cronbach alpha for our second objective; Pearson’s linear correlation (PLC) for our third objective; and exploratory factor analysis (EFA) for our forth objective.

**Table 2: Descriptive Characteristics of the Respondents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>61.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>38.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age to the nearest whole year</td>
<td>Less than 40</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>45.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40 but below 50</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>41.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50 but below 60</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60 and above</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year when received/may receive PhD</td>
<td>2009 but before 2014</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2014 but before 2019</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2019 onwards</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>68.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College of study when doing the PhD</td>
<td>CAES</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEDAT</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEES</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>26.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CHS</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CHUSS</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COBAMS</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COCIS</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CONAS</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MUBS</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationality</td>
<td>Ugandan</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>91.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sponsor</td>
<td>Self sponsored</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>39.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On scholarship</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>60.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CAES = College of Agricultural & Environmental Sciences; CEDAT = College of Engineering, Design & Art; CEES = College of Education & External Studies; CHS = College of Health Sciences; CHUSS = College of Humanities & Social Sciences; COBAMS = College of Business & Management Sciences; COCIS = College of Computing & Information Sciences; CONAS = College of Natural Sciences; MUBS = Makerere University Business School.

**Results of Positivist Study**

Validities and Reliabilities of the Constructs in Our Instrument. Our second objective in this paper was to establish the validity and reliability of each construct under a given predictor in our instrument on the four predictors in Leech’s (2012) model as given earlier (Figure 1). The four predictors were individual resources (IR); program of study (PS); the micro environment (MiE); and the macro environment (MaE). To achieve this objective, we used confirmatory factor analysis (CFA) and Cronbach alpha ($\alpha$). During factor analysis, we
followed the Kaiser criterion or norm, whereby we considered factors with eigenvalues greater than one as significant (Castello & Osborne, 2005). For a given factor loading, we used 0.5 (MacKenzie et al., 2011) as a minimum for high loadings. We regarded the final $\alpha$ above 0.7 (MacKenzie et al., 2011) as the benchmark for a cluster of items being a reliable joint measure of a given construct. We present the results in the subsequent subsections particularly the tables (Tables 2 through 6).

Validity and Reliability of the Constructs of Individual Resources. The first predictor variable, Individual Resources (IR) had constructs of motivation (M), personality (P), thinking styles (TS), and self-efficacy (SE). The respective parts of Table 3 suggest the items of each of the four constructs were reduced to one factor. The respective factors had the eigenvalues of 2.788, 2.566, 2.279 and 2.257, accounted for 55.761%, 51.124%, 45.575% and 75.241% respectively of the joint variation in the items of each respective construct. The fact that all the items of each respective construct loaded highly on the factor for the construct, suggested that the items of each construct were jointly valid measures of the construct. The respective high reliabilities ($\alpha = 0.800, 0.733, 0.700 & 0.833$), suggested that the items of each construct were also jointly reliable measures of the construct.

Table 3: Loadings and Cronbach Alpha on the Predictor Constructs of Individual Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Item*</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
<th>Alpha ((\alpha))</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>M1</td>
<td>I found/find doctoral studies interesting.</td>
<td>0.773</td>
<td>0.800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M2</td>
<td>I enjoy(ed) my doctoral studies.</td>
<td>0.758</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M3</td>
<td>I found/find doctoral studies relevant to my life.</td>
<td>0.712</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M4</td>
<td>I was or I am curious about discoveries in my doctoral studies.</td>
<td>0.687</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M5</td>
<td>Doctoral studies makes (made) my life meaningful.</td>
<td>0.799</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eigenvalue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.788</td>
<td>55.761</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personality</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>I was/I am hardworking when given a task in my doctoral studies</td>
<td>0.685</td>
<td>0.733</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P2</td>
<td>I was/am imaginative in the way I work(ed) on my doctoral project</td>
<td>0.772</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P3</td>
<td>I like(d) being original in my doctoral work</td>
<td>0.784</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P4</td>
<td>I like(d) having a broad mind on the way I approach(ed) issues in my doctoral studies</td>
<td>0.761</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P5</td>
<td>I could/can handle stress in my doctoral studies</td>
<td>0.545</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eigenvalue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.556</td>
<td>51.124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking</td>
<td>TS1</td>
<td>When faced with a problem in my doctoral studies, I prefer(ed) to try new strategies or methods to solve it.</td>
<td>0.629</td>
<td>0.700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Styles</td>
<td>TS2</td>
<td>I like(d) doctoral projects in which I could/can work together with others.</td>
<td>0.717</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In my doctoral studies when making a decision, I tried/try to take the opinions of others into account.

I like(d) to set priorities for the things I need(ed) to do in my doctoral studies before I start(ed) doing them.

I enjoy(ed) work that involved/involves analyzing, grading, or comparing things in my doctoral studies.

Eigenvalue 2.279
% variation explained 45.575

SE1 I was/I am able to do well in my doctoral studies. 0.812 0.833
SE2 I (have) gained the knowledge required of me as a doctoral student in my doctoral studies. 0.899
SE3 I (have) gained the skills required of me as a doctoral student in my doctoral studies. 0.889

Eigenvalue 2.257
% variation explained 75.241

* All items for predictor constructs were valid

Validity and Reliability of the Constructs of Program of Study. The second predictor, Program of Study (PS) had two constructs, namely standards (S) and curriculum (C). The respective parts of Table 4 suggest the items of each of the two constructs were reduced to one factor. The respective two factors had the eigenvalues of 1.576 and 1.858, and accounted for 78.789% and 61.935% respectively of the joint variation in the items of each respective construct. The fact that the items of each respective construct loaded highly on the factor for the construct, suggested that the items of each construct were jointly valid measures of the construct. The respective reliabilities (α = 0.730 & 0.674), suggested that the items of the first construct (S) were jointly more reliable measures of the construct, than those of C. In fact for C, the reliability was slightly below the benchmark of 0.7 (MacKenzie et al., 2011) although it was acceptable given that the number of items (three) was very small.

### Table 4: Loadings and Cronbach Alpha for Items of Predictor Constructs of Program of Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
<th>Alpha (α)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>I knew/know the standard of work required of me in my doctoral program</td>
<td>0.888</td>
<td>0.730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>I had/have a clear idea of where I was/ am going and what was/is expected of me in my doctoral program.</td>
<td>0.888</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eigenvaule</td>
<td>1.576</td>
<td>78.789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>The doctoral program provided/ PROVIDES opportunities to gain teaching experience.</td>
<td>0.727</td>
<td>0.674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>The doctoral program prepared/is preparing me to write academically and professionally.</td>
<td>0.816</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The doctoral program allowed all students to share ideas and learn together with other students.

Validity and Reliability of the Constructs of Micro Environment (MiE). The third predictor, the Micro Environment had four constructs, namely culture of the department on graduate education (CDE), the supervisor (Sup), other faculty (OF), and peers (Pe). The respective parts of Table 5 suggest the items of each of the four constructs were reduced to one factor. The respective factors had the eigenvalues of 3.162, 4.774, 2.371 and 2.359, and accounted for 63.236%, 68.197%, 79.035% and 47.173% respectively of the joint variation in the items of each respective construct. The fact that the items of each respective construct loaded highly on the factor for the construct, suggested that the items of each construct were jointly valid measures of the construct. The respective high reliabilities ($\alpha = 0.851, 0.915, 0.863 & 0.718$), suggested that the items of each construct were jointly reliable measures of the construct.

Table 5: Loadings and Cronbach Alpha on Items of Predictor Constructs of Micro Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item*</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
<th>Alpha ($\alpha$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CDE1</td>
<td>My Department provided/provides me with sufficient access to computing facilities.</td>
<td>0.834</td>
<td>0.851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDE2</td>
<td>The library facilities and services in my Department were/are sufficient for me to carry out my research.</td>
<td>0.851</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDE3</td>
<td>In my Department, I had/have sufficient access to financial support for my research activities.</td>
<td>0.716</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDE4</td>
<td>My Department was/is a suitable workplace for me to conduct my doctoral research and write it up.</td>
<td>0.853</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDE5</td>
<td>I had/have appropriate level of support from technical and administrative staff in my department when needed.</td>
<td>0.709</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup1</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors demonstrate(d) professional integrity</td>
<td>0.820</td>
<td>0.915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup2</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors demonstrate(d) content expertise in my area of need.</td>
<td>0.800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup3</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors provide(d) constructive and useful critiques of my work.</td>
<td>0.888</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup4</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors were/are helpful in providing me direction and guidance on professional issues (e.g., networking).</td>
<td>0.873</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup5</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors suggest(ed) resources which were/are appropriate for me in my doctoral program.</td>
<td>0.843</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup6</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors challenge(d) me to extend my abilities (e.g., risk taking, trying a new professional activity, and drafting a section of an article).</td>
<td>0.821</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup7</td>
<td>I receive(d) timely feedback from my doctoral supervisors</td>
<td>0.725</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eigenvaule</td>
<td>% variation explained</td>
<td>4.774</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Faculty</td>
<td>OF1</td>
<td>I was/am respected by other faculty in my Department.</td>
<td>0.863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OF2</td>
<td>I had/have positive professional interactions with other faculty in my Department.</td>
<td>0.891</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OF3</td>
<td>Other faculty in my Department encouraged/encourage my learning.</td>
<td>0.913</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eigenvaule</td>
<td>% variation explained</td>
<td>79.03</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peers</td>
<td>Pe1</td>
<td>Doctoral students in my program never compete(d) with one another for faculty time and attention.</td>
<td>0.718</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pe2</td>
<td>Experienced doctoral students in my program mentor(ed) me as a new student.</td>
<td>0.626</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pe3</td>
<td>Students in my doctoral program never complain(ed) of being exploited by the faculty.</td>
<td>0.692</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pe4</td>
<td>Students in my doctoral program had/ have an active role in program decisions that affect(ed) us.</td>
<td>0.712</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pe5</td>
<td>Students in my doctoral program freely share(d) information with each other about how to get through the program.</td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eigenvaule</td>
<td>% variation explained</td>
<td>2.359</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>47.173</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* All items on predictor constructs on micro environment were valid

Validity and Reliability of the Predictor Constructs of the Macro Environment. The fourth and last predictor, namely the Macro Environment (MaE) had three constructs, namely the culture of the college on graduate education (CGE), the culture of the discipline (CD), and collaboration/networking (CN). The respective parts of Table 6 suggest the items of each of the three constructs were reduced to one factor. The respective factors had the eigenvalues of 3.326, 1.766 and 2.748, and accounted for 55.431%, 88.31% and 68.710% respectively of the joint variation in the items of each respective construct. The fact that the items of each respective construct loaded highly on the factor for the construct, suggested that the items of each construct were jointly valid measures of the construct. The respective high reliabilities ($\alpha = 0.829, 0.868 & 0.847$), suggested that the items of each construct were jointly reliable measures of the construct.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Culture of the College on Graduate Education</th>
<th>Component 1</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
<th>Alpha (α)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CGE1</td>
<td>0.652</td>
<td>My College solicit(ing) for support from the University to support our doctoral program.</td>
<td>0.652</td>
<td>0.829</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE2</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td>My College provided/provides an environment for me to study and grow intellectually.</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE3</td>
<td>0.822</td>
<td>My College provided/provides opportunities to increase scholarly understanding.</td>
<td>0.822</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE4</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td>My College made/makes arrangement for us to have good communication between faculty and doctoral students.</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE5</td>
<td>0.709</td>
<td>My College provided/provides solid, theoretical and research grounding.</td>
<td>0.709</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE6</td>
<td>0.640</td>
<td>My College ensure (d) that as their doctoral student, I succeed(ed) in my doctoral program.</td>
<td>0.640</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Eigenvaule                                 | 3.326       | % variation explained 55.431%                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 55.431%        |            |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Culture of the Discipline</th>
<th>Component 1</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
<th>Alpha (α)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CD1</td>
<td>0.940</td>
<td>Trans-disciplinarity (researchers from different disciplines working on related projects) is encouraged in my discipline.</td>
<td>0.940</td>
<td>0.868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD2</td>
<td>0.940</td>
<td>Multi-disciplinarity (many researchers from different disciplines working on same project) is encouraged in my discipline.</td>
<td>0.940</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Eigenvaule                                 | 1.766       | % variation explained 88.31                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 88.31          |            |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collaboration/Networking</th>
<th>Component 1</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
<th>Alpha (α)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CN1</td>
<td>0.811</td>
<td>I participate(d) in national academic meetings (i.e., national conferences, workshops and seminars) as a doctoral student.</td>
<td>0.811</td>
<td>0.847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN2</td>
<td>0.830</td>
<td>I participate(d) in international academic meetings (i.e., international conferences) as a doctoral student.</td>
<td>0.830</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN3</td>
<td>0.811</td>
<td>I collaborate(d)/network(ed) at national level (e.g. in joint research projects) during my doctoral program.</td>
<td>0.811</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN4</td>
<td>0.863</td>
<td>I collaborate(d)/network(ed) at an international level (e.g. in joint research projects) during my doctoral program.</td>
<td>0.863</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Eigenvaule                                 | 2.748       | % variation explained 68.710                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 68.710         |            |

* All items on predictor constructs of the macro environment were valid
Correlations among the Constructs in Our Instrument. Our third objective in the study was to test whether the constructs of the respective four predictors in our suggested instrument, were independent.

Correlations among the Constructs of Individual Resources. The first predictor, Individual Resources (IR) had constructs of motivation (M), personality (P), thinking style (TS) and self-efficacy (SE). We computed an average index for the valid items of each respective construct (from parts of Table 3), and then correlated the indexes using Pearson's linear correlation (PLC). The correlation matrix (Table 7) suggests that all the four constructs were significantly inter-related.

Table 7: Inter-correlations of the Constructs of Individual Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>M</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>TS</th>
<th>SE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.633**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>0.485**</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.617**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS</td>
<td>0.377**</td>
<td>0.496**</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.474**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

M = Motivation; P = Personality; TS = Thinking style; SE = Self efficacy

Correlations among the Constructs of Program of Study. The second predictor, namely the Program of Study (PS) had only two constructs of standard (S) and curriculum (C). We computed an average index for the valid items of each respective construct (from parts of Table 4), and then correlated the indexes using Pearson's linear correlation (PLC). We got a correlation (r = 0.333, p < 0.01) suggesting that the two constructs were significantly inter-related.

Correlations among the Constructs of the Micro Environment. The third predictor, that is, the Micro Environment (MiE) had four constructs of culture of the department on graduate education (CDE), the supervisor (Sup), other faculty (OF) and peers (Pe). We computed an average index for the valid items of each respective construct (from parts of Table 5), and then correlated the indexes using Pearson's linear correlation (PLC). The correlation matrix (Table 8) suggests that all the four constructs were significantly inter-related.

Table 8: Inter-correlations of the Constructs of the Micro Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CDE</th>
<th>Sup</th>
<th>OF</th>
<th>Pe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CDE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup</td>
<td>0.396**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OF</td>
<td>0.430**</td>
<td>0.384**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pe</td>
<td>0.525**</td>
<td>0.303**</td>
<td>0.260**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

CDE = Culture of the department on graduate education; Sup = Supervisor (Sup); OF = Other faculty; Pe = Peers

Correlations among the Constructs of the Macro Environment. The last predictor, the Macro Environment (MaE) had four constructs, namely the culture of the college on graduate education (CGE), the culture of the discipline (CD) and collaboration/networking (CN). We computed an average index for the valid items of each respective construct (from parts of Table 6), and then correlated the indexes using Pearson's linear correlation (PLC). The correlation matrix (Table 9) suggests that all the four constructs were significantly inter-related.
Table 9: Inter-correlations of the Constructs of the Macro Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CGE</th>
<th>CD</th>
<th>CN</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CGE</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.480*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD</td>
<td>0.480*</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.590*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN</td>
<td>0.318*</td>
<td>0.590*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

CGE = Culture of the college on graduate education; CD = Culture of discipline; CN = Collaboration/Networking

Validity of the Factor Structure of our Instrument. The fourth objective in our study was to check whether the factor structure of our instrument on the predictors suggested by Leech's (2012) model was valid. In other words we wanted to check whether the respective constructs under each predictor were valid measures of the predictor.

Validity of the Factor Structure of Individual Resources. The first predictor, Individual Resources (IR) had four constructs, namely motivation (M), personality (P), thinking styles (TS), and self-efficacy (SE). We used exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to achieve this objective, confident that our sample size (149) was above the "minimum sample size range from 100 to 500...." (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310). Also our ratio of the number of respondents to the number items (149:18 or 8.3:1) was on the higher side of the "scale range from 3:1 to 10:1" (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310). Using EFA, we reduced the 18 items on constructs under the first predictor (IR, Table 3) into as many factors. However, Table 10 suggests that only five factors were significant since they had eigenvalues (ranging from a maximum of 6.59 to a minimum of 1.01) that exceeded 1.00. These factors explained from 36.5% (maximum) to 5.6% (minimum) respectively of the joint variation in the 18 items. The items with high factor loadings (of at least 0.5) are given in Table 10 after a Varimax rotation, "by far the most common choice" (Castello & Osborne, 2005, pp. 3, 7). However, Table 10 suggests that of the five significant factors, the last three were "weak and unstable" (Castello & Osborne, 2005, p. 5) given that each had less than three highly loading items. Hence, only the first two factors were the significant factors/dimensions of the first predictor in our instrument. This two-factor scenario did not tally with our earlier suggested four-factor structure of the predictor. The first and most significant factor had seven highly loading items dominated by four items of the construct of Personality (P1-P4) as against three items of the construct of Motivation (M3-M5). This implied that the two constructs were not distinct. The second and less significant factor as per Table 10 was made up of the three items (SE1-SE3) of the construct of Self Efficacy.

Table 10: Factors on Individual Resources, their Eigenvalues, % Variance explained and Highly Loading Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Eigenvalue</th>
<th>% Variance</th>
<th>Highly Loading Items (loading in brackets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1*</td>
<td>6.59</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>M3 (0.524); M4 (0.601); M5 (0.634); P1 (0.673); P2 (0.610); P3 (0.599); P4 (0.574)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2*</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>SE (0.718); SE (0.854); SE3 (0.841)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>P5 (0.830); TS3 (0.666)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>TS1 (0.747); TS2 (0.725)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>M1 (0.826); M2 (0.761)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant Factors
Validity of the Factor Structure of Program of Study. The second predictor, the Program of Study (PS) had only two constructs, namely standards (S) and curriculum (C). We used exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to achieve this objective, confident because our sample size (149) was above the "minimum sample size range from 100 to 500..." (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310); and the ratio of our number of respondents to the number items (149:5 or 29.8:1) was way above the "scale range from 3:1 to 10:1" (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310). Using EFA, we reduced the five items on constructs under the second predictor (PS, Table 4) into as many factors. However, Table 11 suggests that only the first two factors were significant since they are the only ones that had eigenvalues (of 2.32 & 1.16) that exceeded 1.00. The factors explained over 46% and over 23% respectively of the joint variation in the five items. The items with high factor loadings (of at least 0.5) are given in Table 11 after a Varimax rotation. The question in our study was: Was two-factor structure of the second predictor in our suggested instrument discernible in Table 11? The answer was a perfect Yes. The first and most significant factor had only the three items (C1-C3) of the construct of Curriculum (C), while the second factor had only the two items (S1 & S2) of the construct of Standards (S).

Table 11: Factors on Program of Study, their Eigenvalues, % Variance explained and Highly Loading Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Eigenvalue</th>
<th>% Variance</th>
<th>Highly Loading Items (loading in brackets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1*</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>C1 (0.677); C2 (0.801); C3 (0.845)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2*</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>S1 (0.846); S2 (0.899)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant Factors

Validity of the Factor Structure of the Micro Environment. The third predictor, the Micro Environment (MiE) had four constructs, namely the culture of the department on graduate education (CDE), the supervisor (Sup), other faculty (OF), and peers (Pe). We used exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to achieve this objective, given that our sample size (149) was above the "minimum sample size range from 100 to 500..." (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310); and the ratio of our number of respondents to the number items (149:20 or 7.5:1) was within the "scale range from 3:1 to 10:1" (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310). Hence using EFA, we reduced the 20 items on constructs under the third predictor (MiE, Tables 3) into as many factors. However, Table 12 suggests that only five factors were significant since they had eigenvalues (from a maximum of 7.16 to a minimum of 1.13) that exceeded 1.00. These factors explained from 35.8% (maximum) to 5.6% (minimum) respectively of the joint variation in the 20 items. The items with high factor loadings (of at least 0.5) are given in Table 12 after a Varimax rotation. However, Table 12 suggests that of the five significant factors, the last or fifth one was "weak and unstable" (Castello & Osborne, 2005, p. 5) given that it had less than three highly loading items. Hence, only the first four factors were the significant factors/dimensions of the third predictor in our instrument. This tallied with our suggested four-factor structure of the predictor. The first and most significant factor had all the seven items of the construct of Supervision (Sup1-Sup7) highly loading on it. The second factor had all the five items of the construct of the Culture of the Department on Graduate Education (CDE-CDE5) highly loading on it. The third factor had all the three items of the construct of Other Faculty (OF1-OF3) highly loading on it. The fourth factor had only three (Pe1-Pe3) of the five items of the construct of Peers, highly loading on it.

Table 12: Factors on the Micro Environment, their Eigenvalues, % Variance explained and Highly Loading Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Eigenvalue</th>
<th>% Variance</th>
<th>Highly Loading Items (loading in brackets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1*</td>
<td>7.16</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>Sup1 (0.859); Sup2 (0.776); Sup3 (0.883); Sup4 (0.859); Sup5 (0.776); Sup6 (0.783); Sup7 (0.676)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Validity of the Factor Structure of the Macro Environment. The fourth predictor, the Macro Environment (MaE) had three constructs, namely the culture of the college on graduate education (CGE), the culture of the discipline (CD), and collaboration/networking (CN). We used exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to achieve this objective, since our sample size (149) was above the "minimum sample size range from 100 to 500..." (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310); and the ratio of our number of respondents to the number items (149:12 or 12.4:1) was way above the "scale range from 3:1 to 10:1" (MacKenzie et al., 2011, p. 310). Using EFA, we reduced the 12 items on constructs under the third predictor (MaE, Table 6) into as many factors. However, Table 13 suggests that only two factors were significant since they had eigenvalues (4.77 & 2.25) that exceeded 1.00. These factors explained from 39.8% and 18.8% respectively of the joint variation in the 12 items. The items with high factor loadings (of at least 0.5) are given in Table 13 after a Varimax rotation. The question in our study was: Was three-factor structure of the fourth predictor in our suggested instrument discernible in Table 13? The answer was No! Only two factors were evident. The first and most important factor had the two items of the construct of the Culture of the Discipline (CD1 & CD2) together with those on the construct of collaboration/networking (CN1-CN4) jointly loading highly on it, suggesting that the two constructs (CD & CN) were not distinct. The second and less important factor had all the six items of the construct of culture of the college on graduate education (CGE-CGE6) highly loading on it.

Table 13: Factors on the Macro Environment, their Eigenvalues, % Variance explained and Highly Loading Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Eigenvalue</th>
<th>% Variance</th>
<th>Highly Loading Items (loading in brackets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1*</td>
<td>4.77</td>
<td>39.8</td>
<td>CD1 (0.664); CD2 (0.679); CN1 (0.747); CN2 (0.798); CN3 (0.760); CN4 (0.840)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2*</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>CGE (0.590); CGE (0.753); CGE3 (0.744); CGE4 (0.790); CGE5 (0.741); CGE6 (0.650)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant Factors

Discussion

The first objective in our study was to come up with an instrument on predictors in Leech's model (Figure 1). Hence using literature, we developed an instrument with the four predictors in the model (Figure 1), namely individual resources (IR); program of study (PS); the micro environment (MiE); and the macro environment (MaE). The first predictor (IR) had four constructs, namely motivation (M; 5 items); personality (P; 5 items); thinking style (TS; 5 items); and self-efficacy (SE; 3 items). The second predictor (PS) had two constructs, namely standards (S; 2 items); and curriculum (C; 3 items) of the program. The third predictor (MiE) had four constructs, namely the culture of the department on graduate education (CDE; 5 items); the supervisor (Sup; 7 items); other faculty (OF; 3 items); and peers (Pe; 5 items). The fourth predictor (MaE) had three pertinent constructs, namely the culture of the college on graduate education (CGE; 6 items); the culture of the discipline (CD; 2 items); and collaboration/networking (CN; 4 items). Altogether the instrument contained 55 items, adapted from respectable sources as we illustrated earlier (Table 1). While we made all effort to get the most pertinent sources, we cannot rule out having not got the best given that we did a narrative review and not a
systematic one (Cronin, Ryan & Coughlan, 2008). While in the traditional narrative review, we considered relatively few resources/papers, in a systematic review our intention would have been “to provide as complete a list as possible of all the published... studies” (Cronin et al., 2008, p. 39) relating to general and operational definitions of, and instruments on, the constructs under each predictor. In brief, we are saying that our narrative review may not have brought out all the important instruments on the constructs!

Our second objective was to establish the validity and reliability of all the constructs under each predictor in our instrument. Using confirmatory factor analysis (CFA), we showed that all the items under each construct of all the predictors were valid items. The fact that CFA did not suggest that any item be dropped from our suggested 55 items, suggests that our proposal on the number of items on the constructs was commendable. Also given that respondents are more receptive to shorter instruments, our suggested instrument with fewer items on each construct was advantageous over our source instruments (see Table 1) with more items on each of the constructs.

Our third objective in the study was to test whether the constructs under each predictor were independent. The results of correlation analyses (Table 7; r(S, C) = 0.333; Tables 8-9) suggested that the constructs under each predictor were highly inter-related. This implies that the constructs under each predictor did not measure different things. It also implies that if we are to carry out a regression using the constructs under a given predictor as explanatory variables, we would not have to include all of them, least we suffer multi-collinearity (Sweet & Grace-Martin, 2003)! The constructs being correlated also suggests that they are not mutually exclusive. In other words, for example, if we consider the constructs under the first predictor, Individual Resources (IR), a doctoral student who is highly motivated (M) may be of a certain personality (P), thinking style (TS) and self efficacy (SE). In other words, these four constructs being correlated is not surprising. It is even expected.

In our fourth and last objective in the study, we verified the validity of the factor structure of each respective predictor in our suggested instrument on Leech's (2012) model. Using exploratory factor analysis (EFA), we showed that while the factor structures of the first and fourth predictors (Individual resources, IR & Macro Environment, MaE in Tables 10 & 13) were questionable, the factor structures of the other two predictors (Program of Study, PS & Micro Environment, MiE in Tables 11 & 12) were valid. This suggests that our instrument is reasonable for use by other researchers in some respects although it calls for refinement in other aspects.

Conclusion

We have addressed all our four objectives in our study. In other words, we have developed an instrument on the predictors in Leech's (2012) model (Figure 1) and tested if for validity and reliability. Our study is significant in that it has pioneered the effort in this regard. Its significance notwithstanding, our study had limitations that future researchers should address. We based the achievement of our first objective on a review of literature. But unfortunately we did a narrative literature review whose process was less rigorous than that of the more ideal systematic literature review. In other words, our narrative review may not have helped us to come up with the best source documents for our instrument! This is food for thought for future researchers. We based the achievement of our remaining three objectives on a positivist study of 149 past and continuing doctoral students in Makerere University. The adequacy of our sample size may be questioned. Also the representativeness of our sample from one university (Makerere) in a developing country (Uganda) can be questioned. Future researchers may think of studies with bigger samples, in other universities and even in other countries.
Reference


https://www.mak.ac.ug


Myer's Personality Type Indicator Inventory. Retrieved from http://www.personalitypathways.com


Office of Academic Planning and Assessment [OAPE]/Student Assessment, Research & Evaluation (SAREO) (nd.). *Graduate Student Advising Survey (GSAS)*. Unpublished manual, University of Massachusetts, Amherst.


## Appendix

**Self-administered Questionnaire used in the Study**

### Section A  
**Background Variables (BV)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BV1</th>
<th>Your sex:</th>
<th>1. Male</th>
<th>2. Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BV2</td>
<td>Your age to the nearest whole year:</td>
<td>1. Less than 40</td>
<td>2. 40 but below 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BV3</td>
<td>Year when you received/may receive your PhD:</td>
<td>1. 2009 but before 2014; 2. 2015 but before 2019 3. 2019 to date</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BV4</td>
<td>Your college of study when doing your PhD at Makerere</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BV5</td>
<td>Your nationality:</td>
<td>1. Ugandan</td>
<td>2. International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BV6</td>
<td>Your sponsor during your PhD program at Makerere University:</td>
<td>1. Self sponsored</td>
<td>2. On scholarship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section B  
**Individual Resources (IR)**

Rate the following items on your motivation, personality, thinking style and self-efficacy as a doctoral student, using a rating scale of:

1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Undecided; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>M</th>
<th>Motivation (5/5 items adapted from Chumbley et al., 2015)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M1</td>
<td>I found/find doctoral studies interesting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M2</td>
<td>I enjoy(ed) my doctoral studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M3</td>
<td>I found/find doctoral studies relevant to my life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M4</td>
<td>I was or I am curious about discoveries in my doctoral studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M5</td>
<td>Doctoral studies makes (made) my life meaningful.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P</th>
<th>Personality (5/15 items adapted from Schniederjans &amp; Kim, 2005)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P1</td>
<td>I was/I am hardworking when given a task in my doctoral studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P2</td>
<td>I was/am imaginative in the way I work(ed) on my doctoral project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>I like(d) being original in my doctoral work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>I like(d) having a broad mind on the way I approach(ed) issues in my doctoral studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P5</td>
<td>I could/can handle stress in my doctoral studies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TS</th>
<th>Thinking Style (5/26 items adapted from Black &amp; McCoach, 2008)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TS1</td>
<td>When faced with a problem in my doctoral studies, I prefer(ed) to try new strategies or methods to solve it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS2</td>
<td>I like(d) doctoral projects in which I could/can work together with others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS3</td>
<td>In my doctoral studies when making a decision, I tried/try to take the opinions of others into account.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS4</td>
<td>I like(d) to set priorities for the things I need(ed) to do in my doctoral studies before I start(ed) doing them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS5</td>
<td>I enjoy(ed) work that involved/involves analyzing, grading, or comparing things in my doctoral studies.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SE</th>
<th>Self efficacy (3/5 items adapted from Chumbley et al., 2015)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SE1</td>
<td>I was/I am able to do well in my doctoral studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE2</td>
<td>I (have) gained the knowledge required of me as a doctoral student in my doctoral studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE3</td>
<td>I (have) gained the skills required of me as a doctoral student in my doctoral studies.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Section C                Program of Study (PS)

Rate the following items on the curriculum and standards of your doctoral program using a rating scale of: 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Undecided; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Curriculum (3/7 items adapted from Roberts et al., 2011)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>The doctoral program provided/provides opportunities to gain teaching experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>The doctoral program prepared/is preparing me to write academically and professionally.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>The doctoral program allowed/allows me to share ideas and learn together with other students.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Standards (2/4 items adapted from Waugh, 1998)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S1</td>
<td>I knew/know the standard of work required of me in my doctoral program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2</td>
<td>I had/have a clear idea of where I was/ am going and what was/is expected of me in my doctoral program.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section D                Micro Environment (MiE)

Rate the kind of support you receive(d) as a doctoral student from your department, supervisor, other faculty and peers using a rating scale of: 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Undecided; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Culture of the Department on graduate education (5/7 items adapted from Johnston et al., 2016)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CD1</td>
<td>My Department provided/provides me with sufficient access to computing facilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD2</td>
<td>The library facilities and services in my Department were/are sufficient for me to carry out my research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD3</td>
<td>In my Department, I had/have sufficient access to financial support for my research activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD4</td>
<td>My Department was/is a suitable workplace for me to conduct my doctoral research and write it up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD5</td>
<td>I had/have appropriate level of support from technical and administrative staff in my Department when needed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Supervisor (7/12 items adapted from Berk et al., 2005)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sup1</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors demonstrate(d) professional integrity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup2</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors demonstrate(d) content expertise in my area of need.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup3</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors provide(d) constructive and useful critiques of my work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup4</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors were/are helpful in providing me direction and guidance on professional issues (e.g., networking).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup5</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors suggest(ed) resources which were/are appropriate for me in my doctoral program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup6</td>
<td>My doctoral supervisors challenge(d) me to extend my abilities (e.g., risk taking, trying a new professional activity, and drafting a section of an article).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sup7</td>
<td>I receive(d) timely feedback from my doctoral supervisors.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Other Faculty (3/9 items adapted from Chen &amp; Lo, 2012)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OF1</td>
<td>I was/ am respected by other faculty in my Department.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OF2</td>
<td>I had/ have positive professional interactions with other faculty in my Department.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OF3</td>
<td>Other faculty in my Department encouraged/encourage my learning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Pe               Peers (5/5 items adapted from Barnes et al., 2011)
**Pe1** Doctoral students in my program never compete(d) with one another for faculty time and attention.

**Pe2** Experienced doctoral students in my program mentor(ed) me as a new student.

**Pe3** Students in my doctoral program never complain(ed) of being exploited by the faculty.

**Pe4** Students in my doctoral program had/have an active role in program decisions that affect(ed) us.

**Pe5** Students in my doctoral program freely share(d) information with each other about how to get through the program.

---

**Section E** *Macro Environment (MaE)*

Rate the culture of your college on graduate education, the culture of your discipline and how much you engaged in collaboration/networking as a doctoral student using a rating scale of: 1 = Strongly disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Undecided; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly agree.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CGE</th>
<th>Culture of College on Graduate Education (6/32 items adapted from Hadre &amp; Hackett, 2015)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CGE1</td>
<td>My College solicit(ed) for support from the University to support our doctoral program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE2</td>
<td>My College provided/provides an environment for me to study and grow intellectually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE3</td>
<td>My College provided/provides opportunities to increase scholarly understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE4</td>
<td>My College made/makes arrangement for us to have good communication between faculty and doctoral students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE5</td>
<td>My College provided/provides solid, theoretical and research grounding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE6</td>
<td>My College ensure(d) that as their doctoral student, I succeed(ed) in my doctoral program.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CD</th>
<th>Culture of the Discipline (two items developed based on literature from Nerad, 2012)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CD1</td>
<td>Trans-disciplinarity (researchers from different disciplines working on related projects) is encouraged in my discipline.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD2</td>
<td>Multi-disciplinarity (many researchers from different disciplines working on same project) is encouraged in my discipline.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CN</th>
<th>Collaboration/Networking (four items developed based on literature from Nerad, 2012)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CN1</td>
<td>I participate(d) in national academic meetings (i.e., national conferences, workshops and seminars) as a doctoral student.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN2</td>
<td>I participate(d) in international academic meetings (i.e., international conferences) as a doctoral student.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN3</td>
<td>I collaborate(d)/network(ed) at national level (e.g., in joint research projects) during my doctoral program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CN4</td>
<td>I collaborate(d)/network(ed) at an international level (e.g., in joint research projects) during my doctoral program.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Directional Leadership Style and Staff Motivation in Private Universities in Uganda: a case of Kampala International University

Chrisostom Oketch¹ & Gerald K. Karyeija²  
¹Kabale University  
²Uganda Management Institute

Abstract  
This study was conducted to establish the effect of directive leadership style on staff motivation at Kampala International University. The study was guided by two specific objectives: (i) to examine the effect of directive leadership style on initiation of effort among staff of Kampala International University, and (ii) to examine the effect of directive leadership style on persistence of behavior among staff of Kampala International University. The study hypothesized that (i) “directive leadership style has no significant effect on initiation of effort among staff in private universities in Uganda” and (ii) “directive leadership style has no significant effect on persistence of behavior among staff in private universities in Uganda”. The study adopted a case study design to collect data from a sample of 111 respondents with the aid of self–administered questionnaires. Research findings indicated that whereas supervisor’s instructions accommodates innovativeness by giving employees guidelines on how to execute their tasks, they do not exactly tell employees what to do, they do not appropriately schedule work to be done, they do not set key performance indicators and that directive leadership style is not sufficient in enabling employees persevere during times of hardship let alone failing to strike an adequate work-life-balance. The study concludes that though directive leadership style has significant and positive effect to initiation of effort and persistence of behavior among staff, little has been done to fully operationalize it. It is recommended that managers should use the style in letting employees have a sense of direction, schedule for them tasks, and above all, set key performance indicators upon which to appraise staff.

Keywords: Directive Leadership Style, Staff Motivation, Private Universities

Introduction

In the modern business environment where organizations are confronted with stiff competition, the need to have managers who exhibit appropriate leadership style that can allow employees accomplish their tasks with ease becomes very inevitable. As a result, every organization has a responsibility of getting the best out of their workforce and in this respect, leadership plays such a critical role since it is the key to directing workers towards the performance of certain behavior desired as being beneficial to the organization’s goal accomplishment (Chaleff, 1995). In addition, for leadership to be capable of enhancing organizational goal accomplishment, it is important that the style applied is congruent to the motivational needs of their subordinates (Argyris, 1976; Maslow, 1954).

Directive leadership style allows employees to understand the expectations of management through the administration of particular instructions to subordinates with a bid that they will adhere to specific operating procedures (Mullins, 2005). This style of leadership is considered autocratic in that it tends to manipulate, persuade, subordinates to performance of specific action towards task accomplishment and as such, the communication is effective only by the use of coercion. However, by its authoritative nature, it may exclude subordinates from taking part in the day to day decision making of the organization. Directive leadership style is considered appropriate in a fast paced employment environment where subordinates are required to take quick decisions to guide their day to day operations. Managers who apply directive leadership style always motivate their workers through instilling confidence in their capacities to take appropriate action whenever required – making workers develop comfort with the leader’s exposure in
organizational processes and as a result, get motivated and productive towards helping the organization achieve their set goals and objectives (Bass, 1990).

**Problem Statement**
Appropriate leadership style is believed to motivate staff members and as a result, enhance their dedication and psychological commitment to the organization by creating conducive environments that make employees work at their most efficient levels of production (Steinmetz, 2000). Apparently, leadership behaviors in Kampala International University seem to take more of directive style so as to create a work atmosphere of employee engagement as well as a defined chain of command. However, whereas directive leadership style is appropriate to management of staff at Kampala International University, it is not sufficient enough to trigger intrinsic and extrinsic motivation among staff as a result of feelings of being pushed. As a result, motivation of staff remains a big concern evidenced from high turnover rates that has a negative bearing on the quality of education given to students. Therefore, if this situation is not addressed, many graduates from the university will remain unemployed as a result of lacking appropriate skills required by the labour market. It is against this background that this study sought to explore the effect of directive leadership style on staff motivation so as to come up with the most favorable style capable of providing a conducive work environment.

**General Objective**
The study examined the effect of directive leadership style on staff motivation in Kampala International University.

**Specific Objectives**
1. To examine the effect of directive leadership style on initiation of effort among staff of Kampala International University
2. To examine the effect of directive leadership style on persistence of behavior among staff of Kampala International University.

**Hypotheses**
1. Directive leadership style has no significant effect on initiation of effort among staff in Private Universities in Uganda.
2. Directive leadership style has no significant effect on persistence of behavior among staff in Private Universities in Uganda.

**Literature Review**

**Directive Leadership Style and Staff Motivation**
According to Fiedler (1995) and Sagie (1997), directive leadership provides employees with a benchmark upon which to take appropriate decisions and directions with a view that their views and opinions are guided by leaders along those lines of behavior capable of enabling the organization attain set goals and objectives. In their analysis, Cruz, Henningson and Smith, (1999) point out that managers who give directives to their followers put less emphasis on their involvement in day to day decision making with a view of minimizing the time spent in making up their minds. As such, organizational employees rely on the leader’s views and opinions on how best initially set desired ends can be accomplished with much ease and precision and this affect the way such subordinates are motivated to work (Euwema, Wendt & Van Emmerik, 2007).
Directive leadership also lets employees/followers to appreciate their supervisor’s expectations and this enables them exercise their full potential along the prioritized areas of the organization since these become the agreed upon standard operating procedures. As such their performance levels are also expected to be beefed up as a result of exhibiting appropriate behavior within the social setting (Iranejad, 2008). Whichever style is adopted by the leader, they have to determine how employees are to be aroused for production. A leader thus, has an option of manipulating their situation in order to ensure job-satisfaction which is key to the motivation of employees (Mumbe, 1995). Therefore, leaders cannot separate themselves from feelings of their employees and this should be reflected in their styles.

According to Adair (2005), directive leadership style is conducive where immediate and quick decisions have to be made. Under this situation, the leader begets the full power and authority to influence the behavior of subordinates at the workplace. As such, the leader’s opinions and guidelines are taken wholly heartedly as the standing order of operation within the organization implying that followers do not have a choice but to act within the accepted moral and performance rules and regulations. This is because such leaders are viewed and perceived to be unquestionable by their followers since they take up all managerial roles and functions in the organization right from inception of ideas, their implementation as well as termination.

Directive leadership style further makes it possible for the supervisors to be taken seriously whilst letting organizational employees know the dos and don’ts of the entity. Despite of the above, the directive leadership style is considered to be destructive to employees (Hoel & Salin, 2003). As such, organizations that rely on one person to make all decisions for the others to follow may be in a delicate situation given that they can mislead their followers towards performing actions detrimental to accomplishing desired ends. This view has been shared and echoed by other scholars such as Probst and Raisch (2005) who attribute the collapse and failure of most organizations to relying on directive leadership style since they do not allow their followers to think beyond the environment in which they find themselves since they are tied to act within the predetermined paths and this affects staff motivation to work.

House and Howell (1992) observe that autocratic leadership concentrates on control and coercion and the leader rarely makes organizational decisions on the premise of shared ideas across the team members. Such individual control of decisions in most cases may not serve the general interest of the organization with its team members apart from serving those of the directive leader who may end up pursuing their own self-directed and selfish interests. Such a leadership style therefore does not serve the overall purpose of the organization given that they suffocate the views and opinions of their followers who could be suggesting very innovative and practical solutions on how best tasks and activities could be best performed in the most efficient and effective ways possible of buying staff psychological commitment and contract to the organization as a measure of motivation. Heneman and Gresham (1999) argue that directive leadership style has the dilemma of allowing all organizational decision making to a central authority. The problem here is that the leader usurps all powers and vests them with him/herself and leaves the other organizational members dependent on his/her choices. This is because such leaders do not accommodate the views and opinions of their subordinates whether positive or not. This may end up demotivating such employees who feel their innovative ideas cannot be tolerated by the so-called one man decision making pot. They further observe that though the style allows quick decision making, it does not accommodate the involvement and consultation with employees. This is because they strongly believe that they are better positioned to give wisdom and counsel and the rest have to take their ideas as the gospel truth without fear or favor and this to a great extent leads to low morale among employees.
Dawson (2002) state that though directive leadership style may have great results in the short run, its use of excessive powers and authority make it unpopular since it will affect productivity in the long run and hence, cause feelings of resentment among employees. Therefore, it cannot be taken as a good alternative to the other leadership styles applicable in democratic organizational settings.

Ittner (2002) agrees with Dawson (2002) on the premise that directive leadership style serves to promote a one man decision making authority that does not accommodate the different initiatives proposed by the subordinates. Besides, they also observe that the style of leadership may promote exploitation of employees since they are not allowed to voice and echo their needs and aspirations in clearly spelt communication channels.

Anyango (2015) conducted a study on the effect of leadership styles on employee performance and established that authoritative leadership style is insignificant to employee performance and therefore, negatively related to employee motivation to work. As such managers who rely on using authoritative style of leadership fail the organization from achieving her set goals and objectives because it does not make employees enterprising enough so as to exert a great deal of effort towards performing behaviors critical to meeting an entity’s strategic desired ends. However, Kawooya (2010) in a similar study conducted in Kampala District Council established that authoritative leadership style has a positive relationship with employee performance.

Most of the studies reviewed relate to the current study given that they strongly contend that leader behavior have a significant bearing on staff motivation. This study takes similar direction but focusing more on how leader behavior affects employee motivation in an education setting different from the context of the above authors. Empirical findings revealed a positive and significant effect between directive leadership style and staff motivation in Kampala International University.

### Conceptual Framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent Variable</th>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Directive Leadership</td>
<td>Staff Motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Giving Instructions</td>
<td>• Effort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Scheduling tasks</td>
<td>• Initiation of Effort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Setting guidelines</td>
<td>• Behavior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Persistence of Behavior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 1: Conceptual Framework depicting the nexus between Directive Leadership Style and Staff Motivation**

*Source: Researcher developed using ideas of House (1971) and Fiedler (1967)*

Figure 1 depicts the relationship between directive leadership style and staff motivation in private universities in Uganda. The independent variable is measured in terms of (giving instructions, scheduling tasks, & setting guidelines) conceptualized to have a significant effect on staff motivation measured in terms of (initiation of effort and persistence of behavior). From the afore going, the study hypothesizes that once managers set the pace by showing employees what they are expected to undertake, their effort and behavior to work takes a positive course and vise-versa.

### Methodology
The study used a case design in collecting data from respondents who consisted of academic and administrative staff. The design enabled the investigation contemporary phenomena in the area of management (leadership styles and staff motivation) thereby enabling the respondents to describe real phenomenon of the problem under investigation. From a population of 173, 120 respondents were chosen using Slovens Formula to participate in the study through answering a self-administered questionnaire. However, One Hundred Eleven (111) questionnaires were retrieved by the researcher.

In ensuring validity and reliability, the research instrument was subjected to review by content experts who rated them for wording, relevancy, and omissions, from where a content validity index of (CVI = .914 and .823) made the instrument to be declared reasonably content validity (Amin, 2005). Reliability was ensured through pre-testing and Cronbach Alpha reliability statistics of (.882 & .853) was computed and hence rendering the instrument reliable and consistent (Cronbach & Shevelson, 2004) as illustrated on Table 1 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Showing Validity and Reliability Test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive leadership style</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data obtained from questionnaires was edited, coded and responses entered into computer using Statistical Program for Social Sciences (SPSS) software from where frequencies, percentages, means, correlations and regression analysis tests were computed as presented below.

**Study Results**

**Objective 1: Effect of directive leadership style on initiation of effort among staff in Kampala International University**

The first objective of the study examined the effect of directive leadership style on staff initiation of effort in Kampala International University. The objective was measured using Eight (8) items and respondents were requested to rate their opinion on a likert scale ranging from 1= Strongly Disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; to 5 = Strongly Agree. Their responses were edited, coded and analyzed as summarized in Table 2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Descriptive results for directive leadership style and initiation of effort among staff in Kampala International University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Initiation of Effort Statements</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your managers tell you what to do and this motivates you to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The instructions by your leaders accommodates innovativeness in executing your assigned duties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your leaders schedule your work responsibilities and this boosts your energy to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You are given specific guidelines on how to do work and this induces your motivation to work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Your work environment enables you become a good team player

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your relationship with your supervisors enables you execute your responsibilities at work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Your managers set key performance indicators which induces your motivation to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors ensure that employees follow set rules and regulations and this boosts your motivation to work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 above presents findings on the effect of directive leadership style and initiation of effort among staff in Kampala International University. Accordingly, respondents agreed that instructions by their leaders accommodates innovativeness in executing their assigned duties (Mean = 3.918), they are given specific guidelines on how to do work and this induces their motivation to work (Mean = 3.612), supervisors ensure that employees follow set rules and regulations and this boosts their motivation to work (Mean = 3.549). In addition, they disagreed about managers telling them what to do and this motivates them to work (Mean = 2.221), their leaders schedule their work responsibilities and this boosts their energy to work (Mean = 2.344), their work environment enables them become good team players (Mean = 2.387), their relationship with their supervisors enables them execute their responsibilities at work (Mean = 2.110), their managers setting key performance indicators which induces their motivation to work (Mean = 2.435). These findings indicate that whereas supervisor’s instructions accommodates innovativeness by giving employees guidelines on how to execute their tasks, they do not exactly tell employees what to do, they do not appropriately schedule work to be done and above all, they do not set key performance indicators which is a key basis for evaluating employee performance. As a result, employees are left to do as they wish and those who are not able to think outside the box are left frustrated and hence not motivated to work since they lack a sense of direction.

**Hypothesis One Testing**

From the first objective, it was hypothesized that “directive leadership style has no significant effect on initiation of effort among staff in private universities in Uganda.” To test the null hypothesis, a correlation analysis test was computed with the use of PLCC significant statistics and below is the results presented in Table 3.

**Table 3: Pearson Correlation results between Directive Leadership Style and Initiation of effort among staff (Level of significance = 0.05)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Directive leadership style</th>
<th>Staff initiation of effort</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Directive Leadership Style</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Staff Initiation of Effort</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.298**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed). p ≤ 0.05

Source: Primary data, 2016
Results in Table 3 above indicate a positive and significant effect between directive leadership style and initiation of effort among staff (r = .298; p = .002) at the 0.05 significance level. Thus, staff initiation of effort is affected by the leader’s ability to tell employees what to do, set performance indicators, schedule work and ensure employees follow set rules and regulations.

Regression Analysis

So as to establish the extent to which directive leadership style affects staff initiation of effort, a regression test was conducted and results are presented in table 4 below.

Table 4: Regression Analysis results between Directive Leadership Style and Staff Initiation of effort

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.298</td>
<td>.189</td>
<td>.180</td>
<td>.51221</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Directive Leadership
b. Dependent Variable: Staff Initiation of Effort

The Coefficient of determination (Adjusted R Square) value is .180 indicating that directive leadership style explains 18% variation in staff initiation of effort at Kampala International University. The researcher further carried out a regression Coefficient statistics on directive leadership style and staff initiation of effort as presented in table 5 below.

Table 5: Regression Analysis Coefficient on Directive Leadership Style and Staff Initiation of effort

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1(Constant)</td>
<td>3.366</td>
<td>.252</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: staff initiation of effort

Source: Primary Data, 2016

Table suggests a positive and significant effect between directive leadership style and staff initiation of effort (t = 13.370; Sig. = .000). Table 5 further suggests that directive leadership style is a good predictor variable of staff initiation of effort (β = .298; Sig. = .002) implying that for every increase in value of directive leadership style by .298, staff initiation of effort increases by one unit and vice versa. This indicates that directive leadership style significantly affect staff initiation of effort. Hence, the null hypothesis of no significant effect between directive leadership style and staff initiation of effort is rejected leading to acceptance of the alternative hypothesis to the effect that “there is a significant and positive effect between directive leadership style and staff initiation of effort in private universities in Uganda”.

1000 |
Objective 2: Effect of Directive Leadership Style on Staff Persistence of Behavior in Kampala International University

The second objective of the study examined the effect of directive leadership style on staff persistence of behavior in Kampala International University. The objective was measured using Seven (7) items where respondents were requested to rate their opinion on a likert scale ranging from 1= Strongly Disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; to 5 = Strongly Agree. Their responses were edited, coded and analyzed as summarized in Table 6:

Table 6: Descriptive results for directive leadership style and staff persistence of behavior in Kampala International University

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Persistence of behavior Statements</th>
<th>(%)</th>
<th>(%)</th>
<th>(%)</th>
<th>(%)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std Dev.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Your supervisor push you to work no matter what happens</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>52.3</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>4.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your supervisor’s leadership style enable you to always persevere during times of hardships at work</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>22.7</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>1.964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The leadership style in place make you like your work</td>
<td>40.3</td>
<td>24.4</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2.306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The work policies put in place make you happy with your work environment</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>2.583</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your managers style enable you to work to your best abilities</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>49.5</td>
<td>4.243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your management’s style in the organization allow you devote all your time to your work</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>34.2</td>
<td>4.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The management style in place enables you to strike a balance between work and family obligations</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>2.446</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary Data, 2016

Table 6 presents respondents rating of the effect of directive leadership style on staff persistence of behavior in Kampala International University. Respondents agreed that their supervisor push them to work no matter what happens (Mean = 4.018), their managers style enable them to work to their best abilities (Mean = 4.243), and management’s style in the organization allow them devote all their time to their work (Mean = 4.018). In addition, they disagreed about their supervisor’s leadership style enabling them to always persevere during times of hardships at work (Mean = 1.964), the leadership style in place make them like their work (Mean = 2.306), work policies put in place make them happy with their work environment (Mean = 2.583), management style in place enables them to strike a balance between work and family obligations (Mean = 2.446). These findings indicate that whereas directive leadership style enables the institution make employees devote their time to work, it is not sufficient enough in enabling employees persevere during times of hardship let alone failing to strike an adequate work-life-balance. As a result, employees adhere to the instructions of their managers without necessarily performing acts that would portray their motivation to work.

Hypothesis Two Testing
From the second objective, it was hypothesized that “directive leadership style has no significant effect on staff persistence of behavior in private universities in Uganda.” To test the null hypothesis, a correlation analysis test was computed with the aid of PLCC significant statistics, and below are the results in Table 7.

**Table 7: Pearson Correlation results between Directive Leadership Style and Staff Persistence of Behavior**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Directive Leadership Style</th>
<th>Staff Persistence of Behaviour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Directive Leadership Style</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation 1</td>
<td>.320**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Staff Persistence of Behavior</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation .320**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**

*p < 0.05

**Source: Primary data, 2016**

Results in Table 7 above indicate a positive and significant effect between directive leadership style and staff persistence of behavior (r = .320; p = .001) at the 0.05 significance level. Thus, staff persistence of behavior is affected by the leader’s ability to make employees like their work and be able to strike a work life balance whilst following set rules and regulations.

**Regression Analysis**

So as to establish the extent to which directive leadership style affects staff persistence of behavior, a regression test was conducted and results are presented in table 8 below.

**Table 8: Regression Analysis results between Directive Leadership Style and Staff Persistence of Behavior**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Summary</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>320a</td>
<td>.169</td>
<td>.160</td>
<td>.53450</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Directive Leadership
b. Dependent Variable: Staff persistence of behavior

The Coefficient of determination (Adjusted R Square) value is .160 indicating that directive leadership style explains 16% variation in staff persistence of behavior in Kampala International University. The researcher further carried out a regression Coefficient statistics on directive leadership style and staff persistence of behavior as presented in table 9 below.
Table 9: Regression Analysis Coefficient on Directive Leadership Style and Staff Persistence of Behavior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Constant)</td>
<td>3.018</td>
<td>.263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directive leadership</td>
<td>.259</td>
<td>.073</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: staff persistence of behavior

Source: Primary Data, 2016

Table 9 suggests a positive and significant effect between directive leadership style and staff persistence of behavior (t = 11.490; Sig. = .000). Table 9 further suggests that directive leadership style is a good predictor variable of staff persistence of behavior (β = .320; Sig. = .001) implying that for every increase in value of directive leadership style by .320, staff persistence of behavior increases by one unit and vice versa. This indicates that directive leadership style significantly affect staff persistence of behaviour. Hence, the null hypothesis of no significant effect between directive leadership style and staff persistence of behavior is rejected leading to acceptance of the alternative hypothesis to the effect that “there is a significant and positive effect between directive leadership style and staff persistence of behavior in private universities in Uganda”.

Discussion

Research findings revealed that managers of Kampala International University give employees instructions that guides them on how to execute their tasks. This is a good initiative on the part of management given that they avail staff members the dos and don’ts to follow in task accomplishment. The guidelines given to staff help in keeping them on track and therefore not deviating from the acceptable norms. The finding conforms to Irannejad, (2008) study who established that directive leadership lets subordinates know what is expected of them through administration of clear guidelines, and making sure they know the rules and procedures to get the work done.

It was also revealed from research findings that supervisors of Kampala International University do not exactly tell employees what to do in specific points in time. This is a worrying situation from a leadership point of view given that good leaders know the way, show the way and even where there’s no way, they make a way. Therefore, the failure on the part of supervisors to show and create a way implies employees are left to do as they so wish and this brings in a state of laissez faire where every employee does otherwise. This by all stands gives a signal of failure to manage employees in the institution – a situation that breed discontent among staff.

It was also revealed that there’s no appropriate scheduling of work to be done by staff in the institution. This gives a signal that work is done without a clear direction in terms of what will be done first and what will follow thereafter. This also points a weakness on the part of managers who fail to break down work to be performed by their subordinates.

Another critical finding of the study revealed that there is no clear key performance indicators set for the employees as a tool of evaluating their performance. This point to the fact that there are no targets set for employees to be accomplished within a specified period of time. This in a way does not call for the maximum commitment of employees into their current responsibilities since there are no standards set for their appraisal.
This is contrary to public institutions that encourage staff to set their own targets together with their supervisors as a basis for their future appraisal and evaluation.

**Conclusions**

Directive leadership style has a positive and significant effect on staff initiation of effort in Kampala International University. However, little has been done with regard to telling employees what to do in specific points in time let alone the failure of supervisors to schedule work for their employees. Once the above are fixed, directive leadership style becomes a good predictor variable of staff initiation of effort as a measure of motivation. Secondly, directive leadership style has a positive and significant effect on persistence of behavior among staff in Kampala International University. However, little effort is undertaken by supervisors in setting for their staff key performance indicators that forms a basis for staff appraisal. Therefore, if this anomaly is rectified, directive leadership becomes a good predictor of persistence of behavior among staff in private universities.

**Recommendations**

Management of private universities in Uganda should take the lead in communicating to their staff management expectation of them. This should be done by continuous scheduling of tasks for staff across the different departments so that work to be performed is known in advance by staff. This will allow the accomplishment of critical activities and in turn boost staff morale since they are able to make timely contributions in needed areas. To achieve this, supervisors and Heads of Departments should take the lead in creating work breakdown structure and the same communicated to all in a timely and effective manner.

Management of private universities in Uganda should consider setting for their employees Key Performance Areas/ Indicators upon which they are appraised periodically as a mechanism of establishing whether their actions and behavior are directed towards a common goal. This will help communicate to staff what exactly is expected of them in the employment contract. This task should be taken up by the academic affairs department in liaison with the Human Resource Department to develop clear and achievable targets which are communicated to staff in their employment contract. It is expected that this will in turn boost employee motivation since they know what is expected of them and therefore, derive feelings of job satisfaction out of accomplishments made.
References

Heneman R. L. and Gresham M. T. (1999). The effects of changes in the nature of work on compensation. Ohio State University, USA.
Curriculum and the Human Capital Gap in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Comparison of North-South Approaches between Uganda and Finland

Wabwire Julius (PhD Candidate)
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
Mwalimu Julius Nyerere once said, “Education is not a way to escape poverty - it is a way of fighting it.” The authors wish to urge that curriculum can offer a path ways for social, economic and cultural development of Southern Countries if they can serious review and reform their education curriculums. Through comparing the North-South paradigm, approaches and practice to curriculum; contrasts and miliralties point to serious gaps in the development and administration of education curriculums. The authors observed a refractive curriculum whose design is parallel to national development aspirations; where both education outcomes and development outcomes refract away from symbiotic dependency. They propose a solution to diffraction and parallelism of both curriculum and national development, lies in co-linearity and symbiotising curriculum through an integrated - broad, long term, continuous reforms of all curriculums from pre-primary, primary and both lower and upper secondary through vocational sing all aspects of formal and informal curriculum.

Key word: Curriculum, Development Outcomes

Introduction
President Julius Nyerere once said that “Education is not a way to escape poverty but it is a way of fighting it”. That education is not benefiting the Ugandan economy maximally, but is also detrimental to the learners’ and wasteful to the investors in education is a widely held and pronounced belief among politicians, economists, sociologist, scholars and researchers. Despite the official lamentations and posturings for an urgent need of an appropriate corrective curriculum, it’s baffling to observe the persistence of the colonial oriented curriculum reigning extensively in Uganda’s education system after 56 years of independence.

Post-colonial Uganda inherited and adopted all administrative systems left behind by the British government which continue to promote and maintain a colonial hegemony over Uganda’s intellectual capacity. Chisholm et al observed the colonial strong holds over shadowing both the imaginary and real lives of people in African societies. Traces of evidence of colonial hegemony mapped all over Uganda’s education system through the curricular journey from primary to University education. “International development institutions have been criticized for outlining an educational agenda which promotes western culture (McMillan, 2007)”.

The neo colonial strategy of ‘development administration’, was used to introduce the philosophy of developmentalism as a means of buffering new African states from falling into the communist arm pits. Through development administration the former colonialist were keen at building development administration capacities of colonies, by creating and promoting institutions of action like the Institute of Public Administration (IPA presently UMI), to copycat administrating procedures and procedures of running government. Other were development oriented universities, national planning councils, national curriculum development centres, (NCDC) and development oriented training and education among others (Otenyo and Lind, 2006).

171 An educated Ugandan serves the Bureaucracy, the political elite, and is not bothered about the citizen welfare and development.
Curriculum has a cardinal role in building “capacity” (human capital/resources) in the private and public sectors, which constitute the methods, systems and activities (technologies or the know-hows) though which development strategies which incorporate policies, projects and programs are conducted to achieve specific development goals. A country’s curriculum policies do play a big role the establishment and sustaining innovations and creating human capital (GII172, 2018). Egan, (1978) posited that “in all human societies, children are inducted into specific modes of creating and crafting sense of their experiences and the environment about them, and also into a set of norms, knowledge, and skills which the society requires for its continuance” a relevant phenomenon absent in Uganda’s curricular system. Otenyo and Linda, (2006) asserted that peoples’ capacities to develop have to include the will of the people, (self-determination to transform the present state of life to an assumed better state) and their preparedness as individuals to engage in risk taking adventures’. It is this willing and preparedness capacities which curriculum must aim to accumulate and to productively affect the economy, politics, culture, education, agriculture etc.

The purpose of this article is to undertake a comparative assessment of the relevancy of Uganda’s curriculum visa Vis the Finish curriculum in national development. And to examine the question of “the various sense making experiences the Ugandan curriculum exposes to the learners in the quest of capacitating them for national development? Are the curricula norms, knowledge, and skills the right ones for Uganda?

Methodology

This was a comparative study of the role of curriculum to national development of both Uganda and Finland through reviewing literature. This study is underpinned by the global (globalization of education) and the Ecological approach to comparative public administration theories. All over the world, education is intriguing and of interest to a wide community of stakeholders in the public sphere including policy makers, researchers and funders; through engaging in international comparative studies of student achievement out of concern about the competitiveness of human capital on the world labour market and the degree of adaptive capacity of nationals to rapidly changing societies.

Accordingly, Marume, Jubenkanda, and Namusi (2013, 2014) affirm that ‘an ecological approach studies the dynamics of interface between administrative systems and their environment consisting of political, social, cultural and economic dimensions’. It contends that administrative systems are among the different sub-systems of society which influence and in turn, are also influenced by them. Thus curriculum as a system that must influence and be influenced by other factors must be called into question. Hence, the comparative perspective has the effect of “delineating ways curriculum is administered, as well as permitting researchers to “see a wider range of administrative actions, and identify various problems, and, simultaneously, improve our understanding of the shortcomings and limitations of our own curriculum context”.

This study will make some general, critical remarks about development curriculum centered approach, as it pertains to the Ugandan education system. Montero-Sieburth, (1992) recognised the existence of a growing body of literature in developed countries as well as noting the limitations of such an approach in learning and capacity building. Montero (1992), urges that curriculum should be viewed as an aspect of an entire educational process that works in conjunction with various factors and not in isolation, which paradigm resonates with the comparative ecological framework employed in this study.

172 Global Innovation Index
Literature Review

Curriculum Perspectives

Egan, (1978) traces the origin of the meaning of the term curriculum to mean "a running," "a race," "a course," and its meaning as "a career." A race has a beginning mark and end mark. Prior to Egan, during the Julian era, Cicero the Roman Philosopher in his epigram: "Exiguum nobis vitae curriculum natura circumscriptit, immensum gloriae"173. Describes curriculum to refer to the temporal space in which we live; to the confines within which things may happen; to the container, as opposed to the contents. Much later again, in his seventh antiquities1 (sunt exercitationes ingenii, haec curricula mentis174), Cicero referred curriculum to mean the content of what he was studying. However, as of today the term has lost any lingering meaning to simply mean what is contained or content (Egan, 1978). However, Egan (1978), posed some rhetorical questions about the ‘race’, or ‘course of running’ to expand the epistemological conceptualization which influence current theory and practice about curriculum. Among which the following dominate both theoretical and practical approaches: how it should be like; and how long it should be? And what obstacles are there? What kinds of things does it contain?

Apostles of the Idiots

An early trace of the question of methodology in curriculum appeared in France, during the middle and latter part of the eighteenth century. The school of the deaf-mutes at Paris which was under the inspiration of Pinel, is credited with the most advanced demonstration about the intellectual and social ideas on curriculum and learning. Pinel’s assertions that deaf-mutes are capable of being trained to communicate and become functioning members of society was a radical departure from tradition understanding of curriculum. Pinel urged and believed that insanity is treatable and manageable, hence individuals with mental problems are just patients and should not be kept as entertaining inmates of a human zoo. Based on the nature of his subjects and task; Pinel critical curriculum question was not what should be taught, but how could he teach-what; or the methods and procedures that could best be used to educate his charges?

The question of content was more or less taken as given (Egan, 1978)”. Just like Pinel centuries ago, the researcher differs with Egan’s approach in trying to answer a variety of question in trying to address the curriculum question in Uganda today, in the context of the current information age. Emphasis on the contained is no longer the issue as the same curriculum contents are the same both in Finland and Uganda. But rather the question is how come that the same curriculum enable a finish learner to manufacture items when the Ugandan learner is completely unable.

For a long time questions about the container and the contained have remained un answered but instead have ignited heated debates to be categorised as not so important, but have left the question of the ‘method’ to dominate and skew the debate. This indeed is the case elsewhere, but, Uganda as a country and nation is lagging behind in the epistemological, ontological and axiological curriculum debate in relation to its social, economic, political and cultural developmental needs. This lack of serious attempt at defining the container, the contained and the how questions in relation to its context, resulting getting a row deal out of the development curriculum, (New vision, Vol 18 January 2019) by both the country and the learners at individual levels.

173 Nature has confined our lives within a short space, but that for our glory is infinite] (Pro Rabirio 1o. 30)
174 These are the spurs of my intellect, the course of my mind runs on
Chisholm & Leyendecker, (2008) observed that countries like Uganda are stuck with the traditional behaviourist models of curriculum, which are not grounded on the worth and value of development; or inquiry-based teaching but they are lacking practical applications of knowledge & skills (science) to real life; which elements are greatly missing from teachers’ pedagogical approaches, which render teaching and learning to be majorly ‘theoretical’ and of limited value. Numerous scholars have hasten to add that even the assessment approaches of learning outcomes examination driven and led, which focuses on knowledge recall and memorization instead of learning and understanding”. Recent PLE results (UNEB, 2018) have reignited the debate and criticism of the assessment of learning outcomes in Uganda. Social commentators and opinion leaders are questioning the effectiveness of 7-4-2 model of learning in primary, secondary and higher studies in just 2.5 hours or 3 hours and aggregating the entire learning with labels of “First”, “Second”, “Third” and : Fourth” grades. The current assessment system overshows a child’s real educational achievements and helps to undermine their self-esteem and worthiness blurring the bigger picture of learning (facebook.com/herbert.turyatunga, 2019). Calls for instructing and teaching to build abilities and capacities of children are growing with signs of disappointment with the current curriculum.

Just like in any other developing country, there is a particular need for a greater sensitivity to and a more systematic analysis and synthesis of the total context of curriculum. Chisholm et al (2008) asserted that since the beginning of the 90’s there has been attempts to reform education curriculum in sub Saharan African but with no meaningful outcomes to the learners and state. An attempt at lessening the significance of examinations and increasing continuous assessment through learner centered pedagogies is still eluding the class room practices in Uganda. At the recently released primary leaving exams 2018 (UNEB, 2018) popular calls to eliminate PLE exams have been heard in various media, in preference of vocational curriculum. Curriculum reforms across all levels in Uganda, have attained content re-arrangement and introduction of thematic curriculum, while the Universities are perfecting the art of a re-baptising of programmes with fancy course names while maintaining the chalk and black board strategy; adaptation and uniformalising the semester system as the major curriculum reforms (Chisholm et al, 2008).

McMillan (2007), avers that with in a country, localities vary interms of cultures, languages, traditions, and economic systems, thereby creating a need to localize curriculum to be in consonance with the economic, political and social environmental context. For instance cattle breeding and animal health curriculum should dominate the learners’ curriculum in Karamoja region while coffee and banana farming must needs form the basis of Curriculum in central region. Contrary to curriculum contents of rice growing in the prairies which even lacks the how content. Albeit Uganda’s education curriculum has a tendency of alienating learners from the local context. This has exacerbated not only un-employment but also rendered many youths un employable.

McMillan, (2007) urges that curriculum needs to be tailored to the communal context ‘to ensure that children have the best education possible that focuses on the specifics of the area in which they reside’. This should be the ideal and the normative rather than the positivist tendency ruining the Ugandan human capital. UBOS’ (2017), analysis of labour under–use and unemployment in Uganda, depicts incompatible curriculum outcomes realised and the occupation mismatch of skills as some of the causal factors responsible for high un employable rates among graduate learners. Uganda’s learners are accused of seeking for employment instead of creating employment; a phenomenon brought about by the very curriculum which like the colonial approach prepared people to be replica of what they see and does not prepare them to independently and creatively solve problems. Curriculum should be designed with the ability to guide learners’ in comprehending their culture, economic and social life, and the political surrounds (Astiz, et al., 2002) and be able to manipulate it to benefit them.
The Finish Approach to Curriculum

The Finish education system which had maintained an unequal class system, underwent an overhaul four decades ago to become the celebrated global model (Aho, Erkki; Pitkanen, Kari; Sahlberg, Pasi, 2006). Aha et al (2006), posits that “Finnish educators and policymakers were able to reform everything from curriculum and textbooks to salaries and administration of education to teacher training. On the world map of education relevancy and quality of education rankings by PISA\textsuperscript{175}, Finland has been ranked number one in achieving quality education outcomes for its learners because it has integrated its basic and higher education in national development strategies (Pundy, Bailey and Cloete, 2010).

At various levels of learning in Finish education system-especially the preschool which is an equivalent of nursery or kindergarten in Uganda’s context; comprehensive basic level which is primary education in the case of Uganda; general or vocational high school which represents secondary education; university level or vocational higher education, and graduate or polytechnical university. Finland puts much emphasis and attention at the comprehensive basic education or the formative curriculum for a child’s holistic development. But in the Finish curriculum the stages begins with the 1st year of elementary school and continues through the 3rd year of middle school or lower secondary education; which is 9 years of schooling. The Finish elementary schooling begins when the child turns 7 years unlike Uganda which is at 6 years following 1 and 3 years of preschool education respectively. The children who participate in the programme for International students assessment (PISA) test; are nearly 100% enrolled in grade 8 or most commonly in grade 9, which corresponds with the last year of basic or comprehensive education. According to the OECD report, for almost a decade, (2000-2009) Finish students were ranked best in PISA reading, mathematics, and science; which has attracted international attention to examine the Finish curriculum. Despite the significant contribution of the Finish curriculum to its national development (Pundy, 2010); its constantly reviewed and reformed to suit to national developmental needs. Very recently a new curriculum is being drafted to conform to a new laws setting national goals. In contract to the Ugandan situation, curriculum is distinct from its ecological considerations and as assigned to academic issues, managed with rigidity by various stakeholders who resist any attempt at reviewing and reforming it. In 2018, the O-level curriculum which was meant to harmonise sciences and reduced on the number subjects from 21 to a minimum of 13 was furious resisted sending the designers back to the drawing board.

Similarities and differences in Curriculum

Impartation and acquisition of basic knowledge through an appropriate education and science based on sound curriculum can lay the foundation for inventive and innovative minds. Because Finland has a good education system with well-designed curriculum it facilitates the adoption and infusion of innovativeness in its students. It’s important to note that the indicators for assessing an effective curricular are people’s levels of innovativeness and the number of intangible assets like patents that support economic development. Those phenomenon are greatly missing in the Uganda context, since the levels of investment in science and technology; education and human capital can hardly lead to invention, innovation and creativity. According to the Global Innovation Index (GII-2018); Finland ranks 7th in terms of Knowledge and technology outputs pillar.

\textsuperscript{175} Programme for International student Assessment (PISA). The PISA test is applied in random samples every three years in the same areas or fields, but in each application there are more questions or items in one of the three areas or fields. In 2000 the area of concentration was reading; in 2003, mathematics; and in 2006, science.
Table 10: A comparison between Uganda and Finland on the Innovation scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Global Innovative Index</th>
<th>Innovation Input Index</th>
<th>Innovation Outputs Index</th>
<th>Innovation Efficiency Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>103rd</td>
<td>98th</td>
<td>111st</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>7th</td>
<td>5th</td>
<td>8th</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source:

The two countries belong to the polar opposites of low and high income economies. The information in the table 1 relate to the degree at which a both countries translate education in innovation. The range is wide between Finland and Uganda in developing and harnessing innovation capacity. Uganda’s curricular system lags several degrees behind in developing creative, inventiveness and innovativeness related to its economy. Innovation has a role in strengthening advances in new technologies, and a greater focus on knowledge creation and use (OECD, 2007).

Global innovation Index, (GII, 2018) asserts that among other factors, education is critical in sharpening and increasing human capital accumulation which is responsible for economic growth through the application of science and innovation. It is important for Southern policy makers in education to start paying increased attention to curriculum outcomes and impacts in the economy, through examining the role of curriculum as well as align the theory and practical understanding geared towards making learners successfully productive.

According to Ropo & Välijärvi (2010), Finland is administering a decentralized education system, where municipalities, schools, and teachers have a significant autonomy. Four decades ago the Finish state had ‘broad government control over schools through an intricate school inspection system in which the school curriculum, dictated by national school authorities, was followed by teachers with specific instructions to follow on everything and to use including text books authorized by the state’ (Ropo and Välijärvi, 2010). Like Finland of yester years, Uganda’s education system and curriculum are highly centralised with a dual education system that selects students for either an academic track or vocational education) track at the end of Primary, secondary and upper secondary levels with detailed strict curriculum (Ropo and Välijärvi, 2010). Uganda’s curriculums are not only insensitive to state aspirations, and nationality contexts has a draconian approach and experience for the learners. Uganda’s education system is fiscally and administratively under strict control by state institutions in terms of curriculum development centre - CDC design, examination assessments and financing and pedagogy. It’s common practice for Ugandan students to go through a curriculum for mere acquisition of academic papers with no interest in the qualification.

**Autonomous Curriculum**

Finland has a decentralized and autonomous schooling system where teachers do enjoy pedagogy freedom thus synergised Finish education with a curriculum based on standards to work towards, rather than standards tied to accountability and demands (Aho et al. 2006, p. 9 and 12; Ropo and Välijärvi 2010). In this case the details of implementing curriculum are a preserve left to localities, schools, and teachers. Secondly the teaching staff is professional and is highly trained and trusted by their superiors and communities to do the right things. And thirdly, Finland is manning an impartial education system in which the schools and teachers efforts are focused on assisting the students who are in need of pedagogical assistance or learning support”. Although Finland’s...
spending on education is less compared to its European neighbors, it boosts of good education outcomes which support a more innovative economy; because it embarrassed structural shifts in the way curriculum is designed, developed and delivered, from routine methods and techniques to an individualized learning, and from focusing on providing curriculum content customizing choice; from administering resources into education towards devolving responsibilities and enabling outcomes, from talking about equity to delivery equity.

**Discussion**

Finland uses a ‘Process’ approach to curriculum whereas Uganda uses a ‘Product’ approach to curriculum implementation. The Finish orientation recognises the contribution and uniqueness of ecological contexts as opposed to the rigid Ugandan curricular of one size fits all product. According to Irmeli Halinen (2014), a curriculum is just a guideline or framework which provides the teacher with a leeway to innovate and creatively decide how to implement it. “This school of thought, recognises the teacher’s independence and freedom of expression of opinions and viewpoints in a responsible and committed manner. Through observing the local situation, and devising implementable solutions in line with the national framework. Furthermore, when teachers write the school curriculum, they attempt to address what each student needs. In the end, the school curriculum is the teachers’ curriculum. In Uganda Schools have the end product with them and can in a fixed timeline deliver a year’s curriculum unchanged in a rigid fashion.

For example:

“In a Physics lesson about the Levers, Pulley, Effort, Load and Fulcrum a teacher will stick to text books pictorials and would rather not take students by the road side where road construction is taking place for practical explanation and observations”.

The product approach to curriculum is alienating many potential scientists; and renders curriculum to be irrelevancy and of no practical application to local challenges.

Uganda and indeed the rest of Africa is grappling with the challenge of educating learners using a dysfunction curriculums, ran an undefined race of no destination, with no defined medals for grabs to the winners. A dysfunctional and irrelevant curriculums have the power to make their products dysfunctional and irrelevant. Students graduated from many Ugandan schools, colleges and Universities find themselves in situations where they can’t apply an iota of their acquired knowledge, skills, experiences and practices to a thing of meaningful benefit to them. All experiences, skills and knowledge gotten is acquired for use by others (employers) but not for individual student or family which paid costs of acquiring that education. This was the colonial curriculum which prepared graduates for clerical works in offices or for displaced and departed Europeans at Independence. The current curriculum is a strong and significant causal factor of economic under development and unemployment among the youths in Uganda. As to why the system should be churning out unwanted products for which the market is saturated, where billions of Shillings have been invested despite the Institutions of curriculum watching unbothered remains a big question. Uganda produces (coffee, cotton, vanilla) what it does not consume and it educates what it does not need. In primary the curriculum teaches the geography of Argentina and North America and forgets to teach about elementary nutrition which is pertinent maternal and child survival which can easily be linked to small income generating enterprises (food kiosks) where a majority of lesser educated women and men are employed.

The World Bank, (2005) criticizes the Uganda’s education curriculum as severely abstract and alien to social and economic needs; driven by high-stakes competitive public examinations; which were introduced by the British colonial powers; and that still hold the key to further ones education and access and to coveted university
education and elite professional jobs. The outcome of this has been 30% annual dropout rate in primary education and an over 70% dropout at the entry to secondary education (Ministry of Education and sports statistics, 2017). Examinations are used to distribute opportunities for further education and as a condition for accessing labor markets. They are a powerful tool for distributing wealth, increasing and decreasing inequality, creating gender parity and access to economic development.

Uganda experiences a huge waste of human capital in sticking with a dysfunctional curriculum. A curriculum that glorifies cram work and reproducing knowledge as was delivered word per word, and punishes creativity and deviation from the norm. A curriculum where the less educated are more productive while the more educated become less and less productive as you climb up the academic ladder. The less educate become farmers, artisans, traders and entrepreneurs while the educated go to work for them.

Vocational curriculum has been demonized and used as a sanction against students exhibiting signs of less intellectual capabilities. The two track curriculum at completion of primary and secondary levels; one for academic and the other for vocational studies has contributed to maintenance of the colonial dual state and elitist divide. The academic track graduate theorists with no hands practical knowledge and experience, while the vocational graduates practically skilled and experienced individuals with no theoretical concepts. While in Finland, “curriculum knowledge is selected, organized, and sequenced with important implications for methodology and pedagogy (world B, 2005). Current trend combine both academic and vocational curriculum in a unified system and limiting separation and segmentation as the case is in Uganda.

The two countries are on polar ends of curriculum development for educating their learners. Even when curriculum has to be legislated the approach the process from two direct paradigm shifts. The Ugandan view is oriented from one of “top-down,” from legislation to the teaching-learning process. While in Finland they begin with teaching-learning, and instead of letting the legislation to determine the curriculum. This is a contrast in paradigm from “top down” to “bottom-up” in the two countries.

According to some discussions with primary and secondary school officials in Kampala and Mpigi districts curriculum in is nationally imposed by the National Curriculum Development Center (CDC) with exception of the University curriculums which are developed by respective universities and approved by NCDC basing on market needs.

Uganda is marred in a quagmire of political, economic, social and institutional problems, relating to failing agriculture system, mounting un employment, corruption and miss and bad governance, miss allocation of resources. In essence, there is a greater need for a Meta-cognitive abilities and skills through curriculum that helps its children to learn to think and learn to learn.

In World Bank publication of their title- Expanding Opportunities and Building Competencies for Young People: A New Agenda for Secondary Education (2005 P.80).

Meta cognitive skills emphasises abilities to:-

- Integrate formal and informal learning, declarative knowledge (“knowing that”), and procedural knowledge (know-how)
- Access, select, and evaluate knowledge in an information-soaked world
- Develop and apply forms of intelligence beyond strictly cognitive processes
- Work and learn effectively and in teams
- Face, transform, and peacefully resolve conflict, which involves participatory and active citizenship skills
✓ Create, transpose, and transfer knowledge
✓ Deal with ambiguous situations, unpredictable problems, and unforeseeable circumstances
✓ Cope with multiple careers by learning how to locate oneself in a job market and to choose and fashion the relevant education and training.

Due to globalism, competition in the labor market and rapid changes in economic dynamics is making it imperative for graduates of a particular curriculum to have creative, imaginative, cleverness, inventiveness and innovative ingenuity, with a flexible character, expecting to change career paths several times in the course of their working lives.

In Uganda, the current curriculum is highly formal and greatly neglects the informal elements which are significant interms of opportunities and being successful at work. The products of a Ugandan curriculum tend to be highly informed and knowledgeable but completely lack abilities to sort and utilise the various acquired skills and knowledge into work situations. An peep into the corporate world\textsuperscript{179}; reveals foreign managerial dominance by Kenyans, South Africa, Indians and Europeans; a pointer to chronic lack of organisational capacities and abilities to man large scale institutions which are the vehicles for capital accumulation and economic development. “The need to build metacognitive and creative capital is reflected in the growing predominance of interactive teaching methods and active learning, case-based training, simulations, and team projects”.

**High Stakes Assessment/ Exams**
The learning basis of progressing in education in Uganda is on termly and final class examinations at the end of each year graded as fail, repeat, and promoted recommended by the class teacher. However, it is the exit examination at primary seven; senior four; and senior six that are usually the biggest huddles, causing stress to learners and anxiety among the public and political spheres. Just like in other countries it is the main source of social discontent and dissatisfaction is felt most. In fact, these stages are riddled with absence of transparent and fair assessment practices favoring learners in affluent schools of middle social status, alienating rural wretched of the earth. Cheating at exams is very common, where results of 3,500 PLE and 4,500 O-level results (Monitor: Jan 17 2019; Feb 7\textsuperscript{th} 2019) over examination mal-practices; of which the secondary school–leaving examination is always a key element, is probably the number one corruption trigger in education in Uganda (Noah and Eckstein 2001). This phenomenon goes against the UN philosophy of “leaving no one behind” (SDG 1, 2015) by leaving tens of thousands stranded with no hope for further education or alternative pathways to acquire skills. Uganda needs a symbiotic curriculum which can address it challenges and which inturn can address the curriculum gap existent. A curriculum which trains an agriculturist who has never and will never step on the farm, a forest profession who never visited a forest, a fisheries officer who can’t form and manage a fish farm for himself but desire to be employed by somebody.

Curriculum is long life journey. As an individual is born he/she begins to experience an informal curriculum. He/she enters schools to experience a formal curriculum, which should mirror the informal curriculum since at the end of the schooling years on returns to spend life in an informal curriculum. Uganda’s education curriculum is a refractive curriculum as the educational outcomes appear refracted from reality or intended reality.

**The Theory of Refraction**

The theory of refraction explains the mechanisms of the current Ugandan curriculum. “Refraction is the bending of a wave (education outcomes) when it enters a medium (learner) where its speed (desired skills, creativeness,

\textsuperscript{179} UMEME, MTN, Stanbic Bank, CNOOC, TULL OIL, etc.
entrepreneurship, application of knowledge, intuition etc.) is different. The refraction of light (curriculum content & pedagogy) when it passes from a fast medium (teacher) to a slow medium (learner) bends the light ray (perceived content in the way presented) toward the normal (leaves the learner skill less or can’t apply knowledge one’s environment) to the boundary between the two media (learner and the teacher are the same: both know the similar things). The amount of bending depends on the indices (experience and ecology learning) of refraction of the two media and is described quantitatively by Snell’s Law”:

\[
\text{Snell’s Law} \quad n_A \sin \theta_A = n_B \sin \theta_B
\]

Basing on the theory of refraction, its can urged that our education out comes (Human liability instead of Human capital) are bent as a result of curriculum, ending up with skill less instead of skilled people, un-creative instead of creative minds, non-imaginative instead of imaginative

**Conclusion**

Offering a static neo-colonial development curriculums is not helping to solve Uganda’s social, economic political and culture challenges. Curriculum and the country’s development aspirations must not be parallel but co-linear and symbiotic in design and implementation. Parallelism of the two is diffracting both development outcomes and education outcomes away from each other. Due to a refractive curriculum Uganda is producing a lot of human liabilities instead of human capital. Education which leads to human development turns out to be of lesser value and utility (liability) to the economy, and in turn the economy provides no employment opportunities and can’t support further development of human capital by offering an arena for creative capital development.

Recent human labour flight to the Europe, Middle-East and other parts of the world is no longer the draining of brains urged about in the Sixties and Eighties but rather a flight human liabilities to lessen the economic, political and social pressures exerted on the African states. Thus the wasting of would be human capital for development. Hence, the solution to diffraction and parallelism of both curriculum and national development, lies in co-linearity and symbiotising curriculum through an integrated – broad, long term, continuous reforms of all curriculums from pre-primary, primary and both lower and upper secondary through vocationalising all aspects of formal and informal curriculum.

**References**


Rewards Management Strategies for Academic Staff to address strikes in Public Universities in Uganda
Acomo E., Okello R., Seninde R., Namukasa J.F, Nshakira A. & Maria K. Baiifaijo
Uganda Management Institute

Abstract
Public universities in Uganda have experienced numerous strikes by both academic and nonteaching staff. The strikes greatly affect the quality of service delivery in these higher institutions of learning. This is reflected in Ugandan university rankings in Africa and the world. The outstanding reason advanced for the many union strikes is inadequate financial reward as well as delayed payment of staff salaries. Despite the several interventions that have been made by the line ministry and the President of the Republic of Uganda in as far as financial remuneration is concerned, strikes occur. Many scholars and the public have voiced their concerns that financial reward alone may not solve the problems of strikes among the academic staff. Therefore, the aim of this study was to propose a total reward management strategy(ies) (both the intrinsic and extrinsic) that if implemented may handle the problem of strikes in public universities in Uganda. The qualitative study was exploratory and involved interview of fourteen academic and university management staffs purposively sampled from four public universities in Uganda. Additionally, three line officials from the ministry of education were also interviewed. The seventeen interviews were transcribed by the researches and thematic analysis done. Findings include extrinsic and intrinsic rewards such as insurance schemes like health insurance, research grants, grants for publication, performance recognitions, membership of social clubs, show respect for staff, inhouse allowances, promotions, and collaborating with academic professionals among others. These findings relate to Maslow’s Hierarchy of needs theory and social exchange theory, as opposed to popular belief that academic staff in public universities in Uganda strike for salary rise. This formed basis for proposing strategies for total rewards management to include fairness in conducting elections to elective positions in universities, improved management of monetary incentives, improved management of incentives and or other benefits, enhancement of salaries to equal the other universities in the region, improving structure and methods of management, improved policies and their implementation, improved engagement of academic staff participation in university decision making, and improving workplace environment to handle strikes by academic staff of public universities in Uganda. Further works will explore suitable blend of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards and their implementation approaches to ensure optimal results are obtainable when deployed.

Keywords: Rewards, Management, Academic staff, Strikes, Public Universities

Introduction
Higher Education Institutions (HEI) in Uganda is of two categories, namely, degree-awarding institutions (Universities) and non-degree awarding institutions (Uganda’s MoES, 2019). They are further categorized into public and private institutions of learning. While public institutions are established by an Act of parliament; private institutions are chartered or licensed (Uganda’s MoES, 2019). There are nine public universities in Uganda including Makerere University, Kyambogo Mbarara University of Science and Technology, Lira University, Muni University, Gulu University, Kabale University, and Soroti University and Busitema University.

Education is a basic ingredient for human development and is necessary to drive national development and prosper societies (Akaareem & Hossain, 2016). In order to achieve growth and development, the training should prepare citizens ‘fit for purpose’ (Uganda’s MoES, 2019). It is a responsibility of governments to ensure quality education is provided to its citizens. This could be through regulations and monitoring or direct engagement in running the school system. Higher Education Institutions (HEI) are major stakeholders in the training/education
system. HEI in Uganda is anchored on both national policy and international frameworks, one of it is the sustainable development goals. However, the sustainable development goals can only be achieved when we are able to hire labor with the required skills, retain them and have a stable workplace environment without regular strikes or labor actions.

It has been argued that the consequence of academic staff’s strike is detrimental to nation-building (Mayanja, 2007). This is irrespective of whether they put down their tools and paralyze the university or stop stretching their imagination and thinking creatively in the form of a passive strike. Many explanations have been extended about the reason for industrial action by academic staff in universities. They include the need for salary raise to reach the wage-bill, improved remuneration, over-load, and hostile workplace environment (Lindsay Kramer, 2019). Sometimes, the consequence of the strikes has been negative. For example, the government of Uganda decided to abolish or reduce some of the staff allowances and introduced the concept of cost-sharing in 1989 following a strike by academic staff of Makerere University for a pay rise (Kajubi 1991 as reported by (Magara, 2009). In their attempt to end the strikes, the government of Uganda continues to focus only on pay-rise, however, the increase of salary (or promise thereof) aimed at handling the immediate problem of the strike, have continued without indication of a sustainable strategy for the source of funds (Magara, 2009). Studies have shown that strikes (both in government and non-governmental institutions) can be reasonably reduced or eliminated by appropriate use of both intrinsic and extrinsic rewards system.

According to Martochio as cited in (Mabaso & Dlamini, 2018), extrinsic rewards comprises of monetary and nonmonetary rewards. This should come as a result of services rendered which can be skills, time and efforts spent in a work, on the other hand, intrinsic compensation entails employees’ psychological mindsets which come as a result of performing the job. From the global perspectives, financial remuneration seems to be the key rewards strategy of motivating staff and has highly contributed to leveraging the number of strikes that happens in public universities. Implying that academic staff is more motivated by high pay. A worldwide reflection on financial rewards of academic staff show that in Europe, the average salary levels both in academia and the private sector are directly proportional to the level of education (INOMICS, 2018), the higher the qualification and relevant experience, the higher the average salary.

A most noticeable jump in average salary levels can be observed in North America and in Western Europe, where senior-level salaries maybe around 50 percent higher than mid-level salaries. Whereas the highest salary for highly qualified and experienced academic staff in the US was USD 172,150-95,940. United Kingdom was paying USD 126.630 – 50.180. However, universities in Africa struggle to meet the expectations of the academic staff. Only recently, the University of Cape Town has revised the pay structure to be implemented for the period of 1 January to 31 December 2019, where lecturers were to be paid 683,358, Senior Lecturers 834,707, Associate Professors 1002,002 and Professors 1237,822 (UCT and AU, 2018). They hoped this would help the university attract, retain, and motivate staff in this university. In a similar way, the salary structure for academic staffs in public universities in Uganda have been revised as follows: Professors UGX 9,150,286; Associate Professors UGX 8,586,786; Senior Lecturer UGX 7,725,507; Lecturers UGX 7,013,324; Assistant Lecturers UGX 5,237,649; and Teaching Assistants, UGX 4,606,134 (Uganda’s Ministry of Public Service, 2019).

It can be argued that efforts to meet the financial expectations alone are inadequate to satisfy academic staff and thereby yield a lasting positive impact. Therefore, other strategies to stop strike include clearing salary arrears, timely payment of salaries, among others have been attempted. Thus, it can be argued that besides dissatisfaction over the rate of pay, academic staff is disgruntled over other issues like delayed payments, workload, workplace conditions, etc. These issues among others, trigger strikes in public universities in Uganda. The strikes have a
negative bearing on the performance of academic staff and therefore core functions of the universities. The core activities of academic staff including training/teaching, assessment, research, outreaches, and mentorship require constant engagement with students and community to support learning experiences, mentorship, research, and generating and transferring knowledge to society among others (Mabaso & Dlamini, 2018). However, these are being hampered by the regular strikes.

To restore stability, efforts should be made on exploring other avenues to satisfy staff and attract good performance from them. Rewards have been proposed as motivators that improve employee performance at work. The flourishing firm always pays attention to make its employees more satisfied and enhanced its performance by rewarding them (Nisar, Riasat, & Aslam, 2016). For any organization, employees feel valued and respected when rewarded appropriately (Wasiu & Adebajo, 2014). In fact, Wasiu & Adebajo, (2014) complements the above position by arguing that rewarding employees in the contemporary human resource market are critical. The market situation is competitive and therefore organizations should view rewarding employees as ideal. In addition, organizations can quickly achieve their set goals and objectives when rewards are given employees duly (Obicci, 2015).

Nisar, Riasat, & Aslam, (2016) says that employee’s satisfaction is reliant on their mentality or perception, thinking, and feeling towards their job, this is intrinsic motivation. This is probably why the focus has shifted to total rewards, a term that represents everything the employee takes away from his or her relationship with an employer (Manas & Graham, 2003). Most organizations only focus on extrinsic motivation, however, there is a need to explore the contribution of both extrinsic and intrinsic rewards to employee motivation and performance on the job. Meyer & Nujjoo, (2012) argue that it is important to reveal which reward strategies are most closely linked to employee motivation and affective commitment. That this can help guide the choice of suitable rewards management strategies.

In order to turnaround the status quo of strikes in Uganda, attempts must be made to curve this vice. A number of approaches have been used the world over to handle industrial action including pay rise, strike preparation, hiring replacement workers, union-busting, and lockout (Lindsay Kramer, 2019; Lumen Boundless Business, n.d.) among others. Some of these approaches may be applicable to higher education institutions. However, in the past, the government of Uganda has implemented with little or no success the pay rise strategy. Therefore, the aim of this study was to explore the reward management strategies that exist for public universities in Uganda, identify factors that affect their implementation and propose reward management strategy (both the intrinsic and extrinsic) that may provide a lasting solution to the strike problem in public universities in Uganda. The study attempted to answer three specific research questions:

- What is the reason for strikes by academic staff in public universities?
- What strategies have been used to solve the strike problem?
- What reward management strategies are suitable to prevent further/future strikes by academic staff of public universities in Uganda?

Methods

This was an exploratory study to understand motivators for a strike by academic staff of public universities in Uganda and identify strategies to end such strikes. A qualitative approach was preferred since it is a market research method that focusses on obtaining data through open-ended questions and conversational communication (Radu, 2019). Out of the nine public universities in Uganda, the research purposively chose four
public universities, namely, Gulu University, Kyambogo University, Makerere University, and Uganda Management Institute. Gulu, Kyambogo and Makerere were chosen on grounds that they are among the oldest universities in Uganda and have produced prominent leaders of the joint academic staff association, the body mandated by the staff to lead them. Uganda Management Institute (UMI) was included on the basis that they have never participated in the strike and therefore views of their staff and management would inform the study on applicable strategies to end the strikes. Secondly, UMI presents the option of doing a comparative study of those who strike and why, versus those who do not strike.

Qualitative data was collected to describe life experiences and to give them meaning, to gain insight, explore the depths, richness, and complexity inherent in the phenomenon (Flick, 2013). Seventeen respondents were interviewed, transcribed and included in the analysis.

**Literature Review on Motivators of Strikes and Rewards Strategies**

In this section we explored drivers of employees strike and used theories of motivation to explain how proper rewards management can influence the strikes.

** Strikes as a means to better work-conditions for employees**

A strike is just one form of industrial action. Employee *strike* is when workers refuse to work for the employer for a duration of time. This may be a result of a unanimous decision by the workers union. Often times union strike sparks sympathy strike where others strike to show solidarity with the group seeking changes to their working conditions (Lindsay Kramer, 2019). There is *action short of a strike* where workers take action such as working to rule, go-slow, sick-outs, overtime bans or callout bans (Lindsay Kramer, 2019). Strikes are aimed to seek redress of the employees’ plight and gradients and the employees have got to deal with it.

Over time, governments and organizations have had to handle strikes that arise form staff/employee dissatisfaction with management, work processes, conditions of service, and terms of employment among others. Among other measures that have been used to handle strikes are a pay rise, strike preparation like redeployment to meet the needs of reduced staff, taking out strike insurance prior to an anticipated strike, hiring replacement workers, union busting, and lockout (Lindsay Kramer, 2019; Lumen Boundless Business, n.d.). Some of these strategies are temporary and used to avoid the complete disruption of the activities. *Union busting* involves firing union members who are striking. A *Lock-out* is a form of work stoppage in which an employer refuses to allow employees to work. All these measures are strategies to end or avoid strikes are limited, tend to be temporal and often times the strikes are a repeat. Therefore, in the case of strikes by academic staff of universities, better reward management strategies (a whole round approach) need to be explored.

**Proper rewards management as a lasting solution to strikes**

Reward management refers to the strategies, policies, and processes that are required to ensure that the contribution of people in an organization is recognized by both non-financial and financial means (Armstrong & Murlis, 2007). Organizations use rewards to attract and keep employees (Obicci, 2015). Furthermore, Korir & Kipkebut, (2016) argue that reward management in an organization is an indispensable element in motivating employees to perform better and therefore, aims to develop and operate rewards systems which lead to improved employee motivation and organizational commitment.
Other studies have used Herzberg Two-Factor Theory and Social Exchange Theory to inform their work on the performance of academic and non-academic staff in universities (Korir & Kipkebut, 2016; Smerek, R.E & Peterson, M, 2007). From Herzberg Two-Factor Theory, whereas hygienic factors such as company policies, quality of supervision, employees and human relations, personal life, pay rate, and job security and working conditions are extrinsic in nature, motivators are intrinsic in nature and include praise and recognition (Korir & Kipkebut, 2016). Similarly, social exchange theory perceives an employment relationship as consisting of social or economic exchanges. While social exchange employees argue that employees will trade their efforts for the promise of rewards in the future, an economic exchange involves the exchange of relatively concrete, often economic benefits for work performance. It is evident that though employers are obliged by law to provide suitable monetary rewards to their staff, various studies show that rewards exceed monetary boundaries (Meyer & Nujjoo, 2012).

In fact, several reward categorizations have been proposed (Chen, Ford, & Farris, 1999; Malhotra, Budhwar, & Prowse, 2007; Meyer & Nujjoo, 2012; Weatherly, 2002). Korir & Kipkebut, (2016) argue that employees who are dissatisfied with their financial and non-financial rewards are likely to reciprocate with negative work attitudes, while those who perceive their rewards as satisfactory are likely to reciprocate with positive work attitudes. Examples of negative work attitudes in the case of public universities in Uganda include missing classes, low research outputs, late marking and submission of examination marks, and absence of duty. The rational response to dissatisfaction has also led to industrial action (strikes) in an attempt to improve the status quo. This is in line with one core elements of social exchange theory that claims individuals will behave in a given way if they believe behaving in that way will give more rewards (behavior is predicted by the notion of rationality).

**Categories of Rewards**

Most authors categorize rewards into extrinsic and intrinsic rewards (Chen et al., 1999; Porter & Lawler, 1968; Weatherly, 2002). Other categories include monetary and nonmonetary rewards; and, collective and individual rewards (Chen et al., 1999). However, this study adopts the mainstream categorization of extrinsic and intrinsic rewards.

1. **Extrinsic rewards**: Extrinsic rewards are tangible benefits obtained as a result of doing the job (Porter & Lawler, 1968). These tangible objects are monetary as well as some non-monetary rewards (Weatherly, 2002). Examples include pay, bonuses, promotions, awards, formal recognitions and fringe benefits including travel (Weatherly, 2002). These types of rewards have gain importance over intrinsic rewards. In fact, Saari, (2012) claims that most schools use extrinsic rewards to reward both teachers and students. However, he argues that extrinsic rewards undermine intrinsic rewards, especially in schools. That this far, intrinsic motivation has presented important practical implications in schools including providing benefit to learning, creativity persistence, hedonic and Eudaimonic wellbeing.

2. **Intrinsic rewards**: Intrinsic rewards refer to the satisfaction of the employee, derived from doing the job (Porter & Lawler, 1968). Intrinsic rewards represent everything the employee takes away from his or her relationship with an employer (Manas & Graham, 2003). These are noncash rewards that employees’ performances are highly built on (Manas & Graham, 2003). The noncash rewards define the opportunity to grow and develop, learning of new things and the search for an environment where people are valued and appreciated for the work done for an organization (Manas & Graham, 2003).
A study by Chen et al., (1999) on reward strategies of R&D organizations. These are organizations engaged in research for development, which is one of the core functions of the academic staff of a university. Therefore, the study of similar rewards and or motivations apply to academic staff. Chen et al., (1999) identified the following rewards to apply to researchers:

Table 11. Extrinsic and Intrinsic Rewards for R&D (Chen et al., 1999)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extrinsic rewards</th>
<th>Intrinsic rewards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Permanent merit increase in base salary</td>
<td>Publishing in a technical journal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent salary increase based on individual skills</td>
<td>Receiving a patent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual bonus based on individual performance</td>
<td>Presenting work at a professional meeting or internal seminars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-time stock award for individual achievement</td>
<td>Promotion on the technical ladder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-time cash award for individual achievement</td>
<td>Promotion on the management ladder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement recognized in newsletters, magazines, etc</td>
<td>Annual group bonus based on team performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognition event for high achievers</td>
<td>Cash award for team performance at project completion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small value non-cash award (e.g., dinner for two, tickets)</td>
<td>Cash bonus based on company profits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photo or plaque in public location to acknowledge the achievement</td>
<td>Stock option</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Better lab or office facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Becoming a corporate fellow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Having the freedom to pursue one’s own idea</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The employee who is motivated intrinsically works for his or her own satisfaction and may also value challenging work that he or she treats to be meaningful to the organization. Nisar, Riasat, & Aslam, (2016) argues that employee’s satisfaction is reliant on their mentality or perception, thinking and feeling towards their job which means the kind of perceived treatment determines an employee’s satisfaction towards the job. University lecturers are not exceptional, they need internal satisfaction derived from their job. Therefore, the kind of treatment, affiliation, respect to the teaching profession influences how they are regarded or self-belief when transferring knowledge to the learners. If a teacher believes that his or her work is of great impact, then he or she will love the profession, and whoever loves their job would not wish to spend time striking as is the case in public universities in Uganda. The government needs to appreciate the role of intrinsic motivations and create other suitable ways to reward the employees in addition to monetary incentives.

This study adopted Mabaso & Dlamini, (2018) proposal for total rewards. Total rewards are the use of both intrinsic and extrinsic rewards which is one of the tools for enforcing organizational commitment and reducing strikes in schools (Mabaso & Dlamini, 2018; Tsede & Kutin, 2013). For many years, the government of Uganda
used salary increments and bonuses as a reward system to universities, but strikes have persisted. Therefore, it is important for the government of Uganda to use total rewards to reduce the problem of recurrent strikes by academic staff of public universities. A total reward management strategy to stop strikes in public universities in Uganda can be developed from existing rewards management strategies. Choice of the correct types of rewards can thus provide a competitive advantage (Meyer & Nujjoo, 2012).

Findings and Discussion

Analysis of qualitative data collected form 17 respondents from four public universities in Uganda. This includes nine senior academic staff and eight top management staff, who should have served their respective universities for at least five years. In order to triangulate data source, published work on public universities in Uganda was also used. Data analysis show the following about cause of strikes in public universities in Uganda, how the strikes have been managed by government and or university management, and appropriate reward strategies to prevent future reoccurrence of such strikes.

Cause of strikes in public universities in Uganda

In response to the question of what are the major causes of the strikes by academic staff of public universities, the study identified reasons listed in Table 12.

Table 12. Cause of strikes by Academic Staff of Public Universities in Uganda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cause of strike</th>
<th>No. of times</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Low salaries</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Delay in payments</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The disparity in the salary scale</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Lack of appropriate incentives</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Unfulfilled promises by government and or university management</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Inappropriate management style</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Lack of conducive workplace environment</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Inappropriate policies and or their implementation</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Victimization of colleagues e.g., suspension union leaders</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Low salaries – demand for increased salaries/living wage bill was the motivation of the 1986 strike by academic staff of Makerere University. The focus of the strike was to attain a living wage previously promised by the Government to all public servants (Magara, 2009). Another author, Lindsay Kramer (2019) alludes the fact that stagnant salaries and poor benefits are among the reasons for strikes by employees in organizations and government. As opposed to popular belief, low pay or need for salary rise mentioned was mentioned only 2/29 times as a reason for strikes by academic staff of public universities. The problem of low pay may continue to cause problems for universities especially when lecturers begin to compare their salary scale to others in the region, like Kenyan public universities.

2. Delay in payments – academic staff of public universities has faced the problem of unexplained delays in the payment of some of the allowances and gratuity, not forgetting unpredictable delays in salary payments. The demands for the overdue payments is among the cause of the strikes in public universities. As was stated by a respondent, “I operate on limited finances, and so government should be able to honor payment schedules to avoid causing financial stress to people like us who don’t steal government money”.
3. **The disparity in salary scale** – unequal pay of staff across public universities of staff of the same rank and with similar qualifications also cased strikes. In this regard, the Equal Opportunity Commission report (Equal Opportunity Commission, 2017) confirms the existence of salary disparity in the Uganda public service and recommends harmonization for example salaries of academic staff across all public universities in Uganda.

4. **Lack of appropriate incentives** – many respondents argued that incentives given to academic staff are not commensurate to their qualifications, tasks and or workload. It received the highest mention, i.e., 6/29 times. In his paper on the 1986 strikes at Makerere university on the issues of workload, Mayanja (2007) suggested that unless there were real incentives, the academic staff would not carry this additional load. In fact, one respondent alluded to this by saying “the monetary incentives academic staff receives does not befit their status”. Another author also motioned that salary and hour violations as another reason advanced for many strikes (Lindsay Kramer, 2019).

5. **Unfulfilled promises by government and or university management** – one respondent said this about the unfulfilled pledge by government to increase the salary of professors to fifteen million Uganda shillings by the year 2020, that “it is like government is bent on undermining efforts of academic staff and frustrating them out of their jobs in order to pave way for obedient academicians”. In fact, the unmet promises may be due to a lack of sustainable strategy for the source of funds (Magara, 2009).

6. **Inappropriate management style** – Many instances, management have remained negative, adamant and indifferent to the plight and pleas of employees (Lindsay Kramer, 2019) leaving them with the only limited choice to strike. Failure by the university management to acknowledge employees’ needs has been identified as another cause of trike (Lindsay Kramer, 2019). The culture at workplace should not be segregative, hostile as observed by one of the respondents:

> “other people’s requisition for facilitation are easily approved, while for some of us, you will not get it. I have served this university for the last six years but never received a dime for conference travel. By the way, I have had papers accepted and invitations to present at global conferences. Each time the say there are no funds for staff to attend conferences, only to be surprised that a colleague (some snitch) has been given travel funds within the same period of time. Attempts to raise complain is met with the aggressive and victimizing reaction by the bosses”.

This kind of segregative treatment motivates other academic staff to participate in any form of a strike called by the academic staff union as a way to get back to the university management.

7. **Lack of conducive workplace environment** – many of the respondents from the four institutions of higher learning indicated that they have poor workplace facilities like toilets, offices and or laboratory. This contravenes the suggest by (Chen et al., 1999) for better office or lab facilities for researchers.

8. **Inappropriate policies and or their implementations** – respondents complained about clarity and differential implementation of policy regarding staff welfare, growth, and professional development. Some claimed that the strikes are most times in response to some unbearable policies.

9. **Victimization of colleagues** – unfair treatment and or suspension of colleagues, especially those who are union leaders have contributed to strikes by the rest of the academic staff members. In a show of solidarity, the rest of staff members always demand for unconditional reinstatement of their leaders or representatives.

In summary, respondents identified other reasons for strike 26/29 times. This contradicts the popular belief that the major cause of strike in public universities in Uganda is simply demanding for a salary rise. Therefore, we argue that government and university management may need to approach the strike problem with openness to include both financial and non-financial solutions.
Strategies used to manage strikes in public universities in Uganda

A number of strategies/approaches have been used to handle strikes in public universities in Uganda (see Table 13). Meanwhile, some of the approaches are proactive, others are reactive.

Table 13. Strategies used to manage strikes in public universities in Uganda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategies used to handle academic staff strikes in public universities</th>
<th>No. of times</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The promises are fulfilled</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Dialogue (e.g., round table talks, negotiation with academic staff union leaders)</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Equitable salary structure</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Temporal closure of the University</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Legal redress</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Fear of negative consequences to individual staff</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Among the identified approaches are;

1. *Fulfill the promises* – strikes that are called to hasten government to fulfill their promise to academic staff have been ended by evidence that the promise will be fulfilled. In fact, “if these promises were fulfilled then staff would not strike. unfortunately, most promises remain unfulfilled. For example, you look at the presidents promise to enhance professors’ salaries to 15 million have remained unfulfilled. To remind him, we had to strike”. As reported by (URN, n.d.) reports that Gulu University staff under their umbrella staff association (GUSA) and the national union of an educational institution (NUEI) on August 1, 2019, went on strike due to failure of the government fulfilling their promise of university lecturer’s salary enhancement.

2. *Dialogue* – between academic staff union leaders and government. According to responded 04, regular dialogue between academic staff unions and the government would prevent strikes, to him, however, this strategy is being utilized effectively, in that, there is the absence of regular communication between government and a staff representative. To affirm on the respondents’ statement, the Ugandan Daily monitor of August 1st reported what Dr. Grace Lubaala, the chairperson of forum for academic staff in public universities had to say on a dialogue that the association expected to have with the government, “we have written to the ministry of education over four letters and they have promised to meet us soon over our money. We are still waiting for that meeting with the minister of education for negotiations” (Mukhaye & Kasozi, 2019). This shows that leaders of the academic staff unions have always discussed with government the plight and worries for academic staff in a bid to resolve the strikes. However, they are frustrated by delayed response from government or inability to act on the teacher's concerns and as a result, end up striking.

3. *Equitable salary structure* – This is the payment of salaries in regard to one’s level of education, experience, and expertise. Already the government is streamlining payments in order to ensure equitable payment as evidenced by the institutionalization of the Equal Opportunity Commission (2017). Accordingly, the government proposed uniform pay structure for academic staff across all public universities. If this was implemented on time, equitable pay would reduce strikes, however, in most cases, these scales and agreements are either not implement or delayed leading strikes.

4. *Temporal closure of the University* – According to a respondent, closures of universities is one way being used in managing strikes; “each time there is a serious strike we expect a temporal closure. That is when we take undeserved rest off-duty”. In this arrangement, a university is temporarily closed in an eruption of
strikes by lecturers, then, letter reopened when the situation has calmed down after dialogue and agreement between government and lecturers. Although this is tentative, it destabilizes both staff and students. However, it wastes time and does not reflect on the good image of a public institution.

5. **Legal redress** - At times strikes over university management decisions and style have been resolved through courts of law. A case in point was when the academic staff of Kyambogo university 2006/07 council policy on restructuring staff, appointments, salaries and benefits to courts of law (Akodo & Moya, 2009). The ruling was in favor of the academic staff.

6. **Fear of negative consequences to individual staff** – According to a respondent, “the fear of retribution from university management have kept some members working even when the staff union calls for a strike”. Uncertainty (such as employment on a contractual basis, part-time staff, terms of payment being hourly for work done, etc) about the status of one’s employment can be used a mechanism to discourage staff from striking. Other possible threats may include indirectly ordering striking staff to resume work or risk losing their positions and employment. In fact, Respondent 06 agrees with this when he said that contractual agreements have been of great influence in stopping strikes since the contract is renewable based on performance, lectures regulate their behavior for a contract extension.

**The Gap and Recommendation on how to Manage the Strikes**

Out of the identified strategies, the only fulfillment of government salary rise and harmonization of academic staff salary (equitable salary) structure relates to rewards as a means of handling strikes in public universities. However, these are only individual monetary, an example of extrinsic rewards as per Chen et al., (1999) categorization. This kind or rewards system falls short of total rewards as recommended by Mabaso & Dlamini (2018) where the focus is on a balance between extrinsic and intrinsic rewards. This is probably the reason strikes reoccur in public universities.

As opposed to the common belief that academic staff of public universities strikes over salaries, and so monetary rewards are sufficient; it is interesting to note that respondents argued for different ways and rewards strategies. They identified the following as way that may be used to handle strikes in public universities in Uganda: Fairness in conducting elective positions in Universities, improved management of monetary incentives, improved management of incentives / other benefits, enhancement of salaries to equal other universities in the region, improving structure and methods of management, improved policies /policy implementation, improved engagement of academic staff participation in decision making, and improving workplace environment. On rewards that may discourage staff from participating in strikes, the respondents identified insurance schemes like health insurance, research grants, grants for publication, performance recognitions, membership of social clubs, show respect for staff, inhouse allowances, and promotions.

Just as it was argued by Magara, (2009), the promise for better pay for academic staff can only handle the immediate problem of the strike but may remain unfulfilled because of continued lack of sustainable strategy for the source of funds. Thus, it is insufficient for the government of Uganda and the university management to rely only on monetary solutions but explore other rewards strategies in a bid to permanently handle the issue of strikes in public universities in Uganda. Therefore, the study recommends the total rewards strategy to address the problem of strikes in public universities in Uganda. As depicted in see Figure 1, rather than rely on extrinsic rewards as results show, the line ministry needs to strike a balance between intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. The tradeoff between the positive and the negative effects of rewards may vary across different reward types, therefore proper balance is required (Chen et al., 1999).
Figure 9. The Proposed Total Rewards Strategy to Handle Strikes in Public Universities in Uganda

Empirical evidence shows that academic staff of public universities recommend the use of insurance schemes, membership in social clubs, direct respect from management, and payment of in-house allowances in addition to the other extrinsic rewards identified for research and development organizations by Chen et al., (1999). Proper management of the identified rewards (i.e., rewards management strategies) in a university setting will result in total rewards. This presents government and university management with the opportunity to handle and possibly end potential future strikes. However, they must be chosen appropriately otherwise any misbalance may result in tension and strife among staff causing some of them to resign their duties and disengage from their core duties at the university. Thus, the appropriate tradeoff between extrinsic and intrinsic rewards will prepare committed staff who would not wish to participate in strikes.

Conclusion

The realization that strikes by academic staff of public universities in Uganda is recurrent, this study explored the causes and proposed how government and university management can handle the strikes. As opposed to popular belief that academic staff in public universities strike over low salaries, the study reveals that actually there are other major causes that are non-financial. Therefore, the study recommends that a lasting solution can be achieved by adopting a total rewards approach, i.e., a proper blend of both extrinsic and intrinsic rewards. That proper management of the rewards system will discourage possible future strikes by academic staff of public universities. However, suitable tradeoff extrinsic and intrinsic rewards vary by needs of the time. Further works will explore a suitable blend of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards and their implementation approaches to ensure optimal results are obtainable when deployed.

Acknowledgment
The researchers acknowledge the professional guidance and participation of Alunyu A E (a Ph.D. student at Makerere University and Lecturer at Busitema University) in the analysis of qualitative data presented in this study.

References


Plagiarism in Master of Education Studies at Selected East African Universities

Zainabu Ramadhan

Abstract
Plagiarism is a form of academic misconduct and is a problematic phenomenon which affects academia globally. Even though the origins of the concept of plagiarism can be traced back throughout history, the term has come to carry many varying implications. This may affect the ways in which plagiarism is understood, detected and prosecuted by the parties it involves, such as students, academics and in policies. Despite its origin in Western tradition, this form of academic malpractice is prominent in African universities. In its most basic definition as theft of intellectual property, plagiarism is intertwined intricately with ownership of knowledge, which is culturally specific. This study situates itself within the context of three African universities, namely Moi University (Kenya), Makerere University (Uganda) and the University of Dar es Salaam (Tanzania), and aims to explore Plagiarism in Master of Education Studies at Selected East African Universities. More specifically, this study focuses on Master of Education students’ perceptions of plagiarism, the supervisors’ role in preventing and detecting such malpractice and the institutional disciplinary practices in place. This study analyses the possible reasons for the continuous occurrence of plagiarism at these institutions and aims to explore the potential of further strategies to prevent the various forms of malpractice. This research is a qualitative study and uses the constructivist paradigm. The research design is a multiple case study because the data collected originates from the contexts of the three selected universities. The data generation was conducted through triangulation of personal interviews with the students, lecturers and policy-makers as well as through focus group discussions with students and document analysis. Three methods of sampling were employed. The student participants were selected through convenient sampling, the supervisors were chosen through purposive sampling and snowballing was used to identify policy-makers. The data analysis was conducted thematically. In discussing the methodology and findings, Vygotsky’s Socio-cultural theory (1978) was employed thus showing that plagiarism is regarded as a perceptions since what is taken as plagiarism to others is not, therefore, for the existence of effective institutional policies on plagiarism, there should be a common definition and frequent revision on the issues related to plagiarism such as types, forms, and consequences and this should be done by all stakeholders like students, supervisors, policy-makers and employers.

Key words: Plagiarism, Academic Integrity, Institutional Policies, Socio-Cultural Theory

Introduction
Plagiarism is not only an offence committed by students but can also be a form of malpractice rooted in institutions themselves. Several studies confirm that students plagiarise almost everywhere globally; and plagiarism as form of academic misconduct is seriously condemned by academics, researchers and experts as “an unacceptable form of misbehaviour and a violation against other researchers” (Heitman & Litewka, 2011, p. 8). This claim appears problematic as plagiarism by public figures, like Maureen Dowd, Nada Beziz, Lloyd Brown, Kaavya Viswanathar, and Jayson Bair among others have hit headline news internationally (Baty, 2000). Unfortunately, the problem of plagiarism by students in East Africa is a growing (Paldy, 1996) even though traditional African societies condemn any form of cheating; a dishonest person is regarded a thief and falsifier/charlatan, and a hypocrite; and any academic dishonesty is punished by most universities, in order “to promote [their] academic integrity” (Maxel, 2013, p.138). Nevertheless, a study by Maxel (2013) shows that plagiarism in East African universities in terms of students’ work is perceived to be widespread and ongoing despite the presence of institutional policy documents that governs plagiarism. In a study carried out in 2012 among students in three East African universities, a third of the 475 students admitted to have engaged in plagiarism (Mohamedbhai, 2016).
Based on the evidence of plagiarism in East African universities, it can be suggested that these institutions have to reorganise the way they carry out their research if they are to meet the international standards of research by upholding academic integrity. Similarly, based on the literature discussed above, it may be concluded that mechanisms for discouraging and prohibiting plagiarism have been put in place in developed countries. Only small percentages have been reported in places like Wisconsin (6%), Maryland (9.4%) and Northeast University (10.0%). According to Maxel (2013), this has not been the case in East Africa.

As noted earlier, only a few studies have been done that have focused specifically on plagiarism in the East African region (Maxel, 2013). This study therefore aims to contribute knowledge towards the limited sources on plagiarism in East African universities. This is done by conducting research on institutional policies and practices relevant to plagiarism in East Africa; specifically the strategies which can be put in place to reduce plagiarism in Master’s studies in selected East African universities.

The Literature Review

The literature discusses the following:

The Origin of Plagiarism

Randall (2001, p. 15) comments on the long history of plagiarism by stating that “despite shifts in norms, plagiarism is a very old and continuous phenomenon” It is bound up with notions of copyright. The Latin word *plagiarius* originated from the Greek word *plagion* meaning kidnapper of children or slaves. The word was first used by the Roman author Martial in his epigram in order to accuse the one (author), who was stealing his poems. This happened in the first century AD and, thereafter, the word was not used until thirteen centuries later.

A Definition of Plagiarism

Plagiarism is defined in different ways, depending on many circumstances such as the forms, the types, the communities and context. Weber-Wulff (2014) points out that there are some commonly agreed-upon definitions of the word plagiarism. However, he further highlights that there are also definitions which focus on different aspects of plagiarism. In their research Sentleng and King (2012) agrees that there is no defined definition of the concept plagiarism. Furthermore, as stated by Jameson (1993), the definition of plagiarism is subject to the content, the writer’s situation, and people’s expectations, the intention of the writer, or the type and the subtype of the work.

Types of Plagiarism

The use of other persons’ work, whether intentional or unintentional, published or unpublished without appreciating the author is termed as plagiarism (Pecorari (2003, p. 318). According to Strayer University iCampus (2010a) plagiarism includes “omitting a citation or citing inaccurately, paraphrasing by only changing the sentence structure of the original text, or by changing the sentence structure, but not the words; and by putting quotation marks around only a part of a quotation”. Rajeev (2012) categorises plagiarism as full, partial, minimalistic and mosaic.

Forms of Plagiarism

Due to long term challenges of plagiarism in scientific studies, plagiarism has been labelled as “patch-writing” (Davies & Howard, 2016, pp. 591-606), “transgressive inter-textuality” (Chandrasoma et al, 2004, pp. 171-193) and “poor paraphrasing or poor textual borrowing” (Pecorari, 2003, p. 317). According to Onuoha et al. (2013),
plagiarism occurs in the following forms: copying sections without acknowledging the source of the information; copying an entire source and purporting to be the individual’s original work; paper-buying or project or thesis write-ups from a service bureau or other students and also self-plagiarism (Singh & Ramenyi, 2016).

Perceptions of Plagiarism
McCabe et al. (2012) assert that students do not regard plagiarism as a crime since there is no serious punishment given to those who plagiarise and the benefits of their action are usually greater than the disciplinary consequences following plagiarism. With respect to the ideological values of academic integrity, some critical international students went so far as to say that plagiarism is yet “another form of Western ′superiority′ being exercised over other cultures” (Kutieleh & Adiningrum, 2011, p. 93). While this argument may come across as an untenable attempt to justify a wrongdoing, it also urges us to think more critically about cultural sensitivity regarding plagiarism and the values behind the concept. This research has gone deeper by looking at what Master’s student’s view as plagiarism from different perspectives.

Consequences of Plagiarism
Occurrences of plagiarism are situational and they involve a range of varied outcomes (Yadav et al, 2016). Where there is no appropriate understanding of academic and ethical values, or the use of these, there are breaches of academic conventions. These breaches result in consequences that affect not only the students, but also the institution and society as a whole. In light of this, Power (2009, p. 643) states that when students engage in plagiarism, they “present a problem for all educators” by being suspended or expelled, withdrawal of certificates and losing a job. Plagiarism also leads degradation of institution reputation (Yadav et al., 2016).

Strategies to Combat Plagiarism
Several authors (Weber-Wulff, 2014) points out that in order to reduce plagiarism, prevention measures must primarily include the detection as well as remedial and disciplinary actions. On the other hand, Pecorari and Petric (2014, p. 287) recommend “educating students explicitly about plagiarism […] teaching the use of sources and referencing in greater depth”. This would be a promising strategy to combat plagiarism. In a similar manner, Insley (2011, p. 2) suggests that the use of preventive measures should include the lecturers managing academic malpractices by using approaches that encourage and motivate the students to uphold academic integrity. Harris (2017) suggests that manual detection should look at clues, such as writing going off-topic, unusual formatting, citation styles, references or quotations, acronyms, anomalies of diction and style, as well as obvious indications of copying. Chuda et al. (2012, p. 27) recommend the use of software to cope with the vast amount of material at hand, Hawkins et al. (2013) suggest that content safeguard should be allowed to justify the ownership of the materials and this should be renewed and Maxel (2013) suggests the establishment of detailed policies on academic integrity as well as the provision of adequate education on plagiarism. Gecer and Tosun (2015), technical solutions like Safe Assign or Turnitin.com are short-term remedies for academic misconduct that diminish the temptation.

Technology and Plagiarism in Higher Education
Despite increasing university sanctions and social pressure to act responsibly and morally, plagiarism and academic dishonesty in post-secondary institutions are on the rise (Powell, 2012). Maxel (2013, p. 141) notes that the internet and use of computers have assisted in accessing written materials across the world which, in
turn, has enabled increased copy and pasting. Hence, Jones (2011, p. 142) asserts that high-technology has brought with it clever methods of cheating.

Institutional Policies on Plagiarism

Most of the higher education institution policies on plagiarism consider plagiarism as an unethical act (Grigg, 2010). Generally speaking, higher education institution policies lack clear specifications as to who should be responsible in cases of plagiarism and how exactly these policies should be implemented. Building on that argument, Jones (2011) suggests that policies should apply the devotion of the code of conduct on plagiarism, collusion or fabrication, so that moral values in academia and in the job sector are enhanced. According to Grigg (2010), for any institution to deal with plagiarism successfully, it should clearly include and define the following aspects in their policies: the definition, types of plagiarism, strategies to prevent plagiarism and clear and fair penalties imposed (Grigg, 2010)

Methodology

This research is situated within a constructivist paradigm, the qualitative research approach and the multiple case study design. The participants for this study are seven Master’s students selected by convenience sampling, two supervisors selected by purposive sampling, and one policy-maker snow-ball sampling methods from the three universities. The total sample size is twenty-seven participants. Qualitative data-generation methods that best address the guiding questions in this study include interviews, focus-group discussions and documentary analysis. Data analysis is done thematically. The interviews and focus-group discussions are tape recorded and transcribed an institutional policies downloaded in a soft copy. The coding of transcribe data is done by the use of themes and sub-themes of the information. The coded transcribed data is then converted to Microsoft word; and then uploaded in excel spreadsheet to show the various categories.

Presentation of the Data

The data is presented thematically, starting with the analysis of institutional policy documents. For the interviews, the raw data collected from the students was presented first, followed by the supervisors’ and the policy-makers, respectively. The themes ranged from the definition of the term plagiarism, forms of plagiarism, perceptions of plagiarism, institutional policies on plagiarism, strategies put in place to methods of combatting plagiarism an additional strategies from participants.

Definition of Plagiarism

All the institutions had their own definition of the term plagiarism, except institution UA, which did not offer any explicit definition of plagiarism. One institution noted that plagiarism refers to representing words of another as one’s own’ while another institution stated that it is presenting work, ideas or the creations of others as if they are yours. UB and UC had definitions that have a common meaning, for example:

“Plagiarism is representing the words of another, as one’s own in any academic exercise” (UB).

The participants seemed to be knowledgeable about the term plagiarism. Most of them stated that it is ‘an act’ of not acknowledging. Some students added that it is not only using someone else’s written words; but that these were also spoken without any alteration. In their definition, plagiarism was understood as using written work as it is, lifting ideas/words/talked/read and ideas, written, or verbal without acknowledging the author. Another student participant defined plagiarism as using one’s own ideas without acknowledging the source. For example:
Plagiarism is the act of taking one’s materials and using them without acknowledging that they are one’s own (STIUC).

**Forms of Plagiarism**

From the documents it became obvious that when supervisors publish work they have supervised when and examiners publish work that they examined without written consent from the student, this constitutes a form of plagiarism. Another institution document states that plagiarism occurs when one fails to cite the references and submits work done by another. Another institution’s documents did not state that they consider as plagiarism in their institutions.

“supervisors publishing work that they supervise without the student’s written consent; and examiners publishing work that they examine” UA.

“failure to cite references and submitting work done by another, whether a commercial or non-commercial enterprise, including websites, as one’s own work” UB.

The participants categorized plagiarism as copy-pasting. Other student participants perceived plagiarism as copying from the internet, textbooks, colleagues or the lecturer’s work, working on a topic that has already been done, an sloppy referencing/improper citation.

**Motivating factors to plagiarize**

Participants said that they plagiarise because they are ignorant of what plagiarism is. They have no knowledge on the issues concerning plagiarism.

**Perceptions of plagiarism**

As for the institutions, one institution perceived plagiarism as an act that is not acceptable; but other institutions failed to make any clear statements on this matter.

“Plagiarism in not accepted” (UA)

(UB) and (UC) not stated

Participants perceive plagiarism differently. Some termed it as a shortcut to the field of writing. Some people dislike to work hard and they want to do things that are accomplished. One participant maintained that plagiarism is good practice and unavoidable.

“Occasionally, I look at plagiarism as a shortcut that people do not really want to think much... (STIUA).

I would like to state that plagiarism is not such a bad thing. We are living in a world where we depend on each other for knowledge... (STUB).

**Consequences of Plagiarism**

All institutions expect their students to adhere to the university rules and regulations, as stipulated in their institutional policy documents. This regulation governing academic integrity has also led to various penalties and punishment aimed at those who break the institutional policies. The universities have specified punishments for the breaking of the rules on academic integrity. For example;

Plagiarized work shall lead to discontinuation and withdrawal of certificate if already awarded (UA).
All participants showed awareness of consequences of plagiarism. Mostly, it affected their course assessment through partial or total loss of marks and time wastage, especially when the punishment was redoing the work.

**Institutional Policies**

The documents were available in the institutions libraries, policy-makers offices and also online. In university C, the policies were everywhere in the institution, especially on the notice boards and in strategic positions. Some participant explained that they had never seen the documents and that they had just been informed of the policies that had been put in place.

**Strategies for Combatting Plagiarism**

**University A:** The role of the student was not stated but the roles of the supervisors were to check the thesis at the proposal stage. The role of the policy-makers was to check whether the thesis has been submitted to anti-plagiarism software. Example;

**University B:** Is clear in stating the role of each participant in the institution in curbing plagiarism. The students are to recognise and uphold the policy of academic integrity. The supervisors are to explain to the students what constitutes plagiarism and the policy-makers are expected to become familiar with the policies on academic integrity and to take lead.

**University C:** It is not clearly stated what the roles of each participant are in curbing plagiarism. One of the participant suggested that one should read a lot, write these ideas down and work hard on the ideas and suggestion, in order to develop a new and improved idea.

The strategies stated in the institutional policies in most universities were not implemented to prevent plagiarism. The use of Turnitin was mentioned but participants had never encountered it. The institutional policy documents indicated that plagiarism could be minimised by measures, such as seminars, first-years’ orientation programmes and even the compulsory signing of a plagiarism declaration thought the participants had no idea on this. The participants contributed their knowledge of and practices used against plagiarism. However, this was not based on any institutional-policy documents.

**Additional Suggested Strategies**

Participants suggested additional strategies. Though the strategies are being used in other institutions as per the literature. Among them are Training students on citation and acknowledgment, Early introduction to education on plagiarism, Set up a series of full examinable courses on plagiarism; and these could be integrated into the curriculum.

**Discussion**

What is the nature of the institutional policies and practices relevant to plagiarism in selected East-African universities?

**Definition**

In the institutional policy documents, the university ‘UA’ has no eligible definition; while ‘UB’ and ‘UC’ have definitions, which are different from those given by the students. From the above results, there is no uniform definition of the term plagiarism; and this was also supported by Sentleng and King (2012). From the information
found in the institutional policy documents on definition and plagiarism, which of the UA lacks definition; this contradicts Colin (2007), who said that all higher education institutions should make sure that their definitions are known to their students. Inadequate understanding of the concept is depicted from the participant’s definition; since there is not a single concept. This was also reported in studies by Orim (2014) who found in their respective studies that students perceived plagiarism relate to many different concepts.

There is discrepancy in the way East African universities see information and respond to the basic issues of academic integrity; since they lack these key elements in their institutional documents. The lack of sufficient literature in institutional policy guidelines on plagiarism as an academic misconduct tells us just how plagiarism in this sector is looked down upon.

**Forms of Plagiarism**

The various forms of plagiarism in the institutional policy documents are not adequately presented. This shows that actually what is in the intuitional policy documents regarded as forms of plagiarism is not known to the participants.

**Consequences**

The participants claimed that the penalties are not uniform as some are punishable and others not punishable. Institutional policies were not specific when it comes to punishments. This concurs with the study done by Bretag et al. (2011), which states that academic integrity policies do not define the different types of academic integrity breaches, or their associated outcomes and penalties. This revealed that plagiarism had so many consequences; and those supervisors who fail to detect plagiarism should provide an explanation by in writing, according to institutional policy in another university, plagiarism could lead to resignation from the job and not being promoted. Students were also aware of the consequences as suggested by Henderson, Whitelaw, and Jose (2014). From the findings in this research it is clear that some institutions are lacking the information on the punishable measures; while other institutions have shallow information on what is considered as consequences of plagiarism as seen in the works of Hall and Berardino (2006).

**Availability of Institutional Policy Documents**

From my findings, the universities were well equipped with institutional policies. In UC the policies on plagiarism were everywhere on the notice boards and walls of the institutions. Lecturers in UC were trained on how to use Turnitin and were yet to train students. Every work in UC was to be submitted with a similarity index report. The policy makers made sure that rules and regulations were available everywhere in the compound to increase awareness. This is a clear indication that institutional policies are available in the institution but they are not made available to the students and supervisors. Also the supervisors and students seems to be ignorant in wanting to know what the institutional policies contains on academic integrity.

**Strategies**

From this information, we find that the strategies identified by the participants are considerably different from what is found in the institutional-policy documents. This is a clear indication that the strategies found in the documents are not familiar to the participants. As a result, the relevant people do not benefit from them sufficiently. The institutional policy documents in East African universities examined in this study fail to address the basic information relating to definition, types of breaches or their associated outcomes and penalties. In
relation to this, Bretag et al. (2011) suggest that the institutional policies should address various elements of academic integrity, such as access, approach, responsiveness, details and support. In as much as the university has policies governing institutions on academic integrity, especially on plagiarism, the universities should revisit the policies and the implementation thereof. Jamieson (2016) suggests that the world is changing, especially in terms of technological progress. Therefore, a rigorous and more holistic institutional approach to the adoption of such policies is necessary.

Conclusion

Plagiarism in academic institutions is a complicated issue that calls for serious discussion in order to solve this problem once and for all (Thurmond, 2010). Furthermore, the world is changing and people must also change, in order to be on a par with the changing world. Consequently, the institutions should review their policies on plagiarism so that the problem is solved at a time when it emerges in a different version. And they should state their reasons for what would have contributed to that. In East-African universities, plagiarism is growing very fast – despite the presence of institutional policies that have been put in place to curb it. From the above discussion it is clear that there is a short come in addressing plagiarism in higher institutions. In this study, the students’ basic comprehension of plagiarism failed to provide a detailed explanation on plagiarism as stated by the institutional policy. The institutional policy documents also failed to address the basic issues that pertains plagiarism. The participants showed an awareness of the term, but they were confused in understanding the term. The participants, especially the students, should be made to understand what forms of plagiarism lead to a given punishment and how to mitigate it. Thus for the existence of effective institutional polices on plagiarism, there should be frequent revision on the issues related to plagiarism by students, supervisors and policy-makers. The following are the key recommendations:

- Inconsistency in stating the information and response on the basic issues of academic integrity in East-African universities was observed. In addition, there is less literature on plagiarism as an academic misconduct in the institutional policy documents. And this shows clearly how the concept is underestimated since the key elements are not presented. Increased awareness of plagiarism among students, lecturers and the university as a whole could result in a revision of the institutional policies that would recognize plagiarism as a vital issue in learning and development.

- Lack of well-defined definition is institutional policy documents shows that there should be a change in policy and practice in institutional policy in order for it to match other institutions (Henderson et al., 2014).

- The answers given by the participants on forms plagiarism were also very different from what is stated in institutional-policy documents. This shows that actually what is in the intuitional policy documents is not known to the participants as a form of plagiarism. From this information, it is clear that the institutional policy documents did not have a clear definition of plagiarism.

- Findings about the penalties indicated that the participants’ views were unanimous. Most of the penalties stated by the participants were found in the institutional-policy documents. Although some of the penalties, such as awarding zero – and then resetting for exams –, were not in the institutional policy documents at all. Policy makers and institutional policies claimed the use of antiplagiarism software when dealing with plagiarism. There was hardly any use of digital software for deterring plagiarism – except in university C which had just introduced anti-plagiarism software by the time the research was being undertaken.
The institution policies documents are very important documents and should be very detailed so that the learner understands every concept clearly. Details on plagiarism should be stated clearly, starting with what is meant by plagiarism and how to control and punish. The policies also should be available everywhere in institution compound so that learners are reminded now and then.

Limitations of the study

i. The participants included only the members of a given university in the selected countries in East Africa. This limited the results.

ii. In UB, getting participants was not easy as the lecturers were on strike.

iii. There was the possibility of the participants not being honest especially in UC.

References


Active Teaching and Learning Practices: Enhancing Students Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in Arua District

Acridi Emmanuel Bileti
Kyambogo University
E-mail: emmabileti@rocketmail.com

Abstract
Enhancing students’ academic performance in secondary schools becomes pathetic when inappropriate teaching methods, techniques and instructional resources are used. The purpose of this paper is to examine the degree to which ATL methods, techniques and instructional resources were used to enhance students’ academic performance at secondary schools in Arua district. It further examines the influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance. It was hypothesized that there was no significant influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. A sample of 122 was drawn comprising of head teachers, deputy head teachers, directors of study, subject teachers and students from eight secondary schools. A mixed methods approach was adopted, using questionnaire and focus group discussions. The study revealed that the degree to which ATL methods were used to enhance students’ academic performance at Secondary schools in Arua district was moderate at mean of 3.10 (62%), ATL techniques was very high at Mean 4.39 (88%) and ATL Instructional resources was high at Mean 3.84 (77%). The influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance was positive with r – value .634 and Coefficient of Determination (r²) at .401 meaning that ATL practices had influenced students’ academic performance by 40.1% by the study period leaving 59.9% influenced by other factors. The null hypothesis which stated that there was no significant influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was rejected because the P-value of 0.000 was found to be less than the significance level of 0.01. Teachers and other stakeholders should always be innovative in the use of ATL methods, instructional resources and techniques to enhance students’ academic performance.

Keywords: Active Teaching and Learning, Students’ Academic Performance, Secondary Schools

Introduction
The practice of Active Teaching and Learning (ATL) for enhancing students’ academic performance is a new concept in many parts of the world though its origin can be traced way back to 18th century in European and American schools. Enhancing students’ academic performance in secondary schools is at the centre of all learning interventions and becomes pathetic when inappropriate teaching methods, techniques and instructional resources are used especially in secondary schools. In sub-Saharan Africa critical thinking through ATL was not encouraged in colonial schools, the graduates of these institutions were keenly aware of the injustices inflicted upon their schooling system and the content of it. By the early 1980s, many countries in Africa adopted structural adjustment reforms aimed at restructuring their curriculum and schooling, this resulted in an increased emphasis on quality education and efficiency manifested in revised curricula and methods of teaching. The Dakar Framework specifically advocated for use of “active learning techniques” and “a relevant curriculum that builds upon the knowledge and experience of the teachers and learners” (UNESCO, 2000). The high degree of inspiration by international development organizations meant that global educational trends toward the adoption of ATL had been noted and adopted by many African policymakers and planners. Some of the most common features of ATL that one finds in current policy include, attention to the child as an active learner; learning through problem posing and inquiry; locally-relevant curricula, at least in Secondary schools; diversified and formative assessments; and teacher reflection to improve practice (UNICEF, 2016). Despite these examples of curricular and organizational change, it appears that to date policy has changed more than practice when it comes to teachers actually utilizing ATL practices especially in most parts of Africa; lecturing and drilling being
common teaching methods in schools hence grossly affecting students’ academic performance at secondary schools in Uganda.

The study focused on two key concepts, namely: Active teaching and learning (ATL) and students’ academic performance. According to BTC (2014) ATL is a practice that places the student at the center of the teaching and learning process. It focuses on students’ needs, abilities, backgrounds, and interests with the teacher serving primarily as a guide and facilitator for learning. The approach marks a significant shift from teacher-centered pedagogy, where students take a more passive role as teachers transmit knowledge that students learn primarily through rote memorization. According to Freeman, (2014) ATL is a practice in which teacher involves students in the learning process more directly than in other methods. Specifically ATL dimensions studied were methods, techniques and instructional materials. The second concept was students’ academic performance. According to the Macmillan English Dictionary of Advanced learners, students’ academic performance refers to the process of students using knowledge as distinguished from merely possessing it. According to Bonwell and Eison (1991) students can improve their academic performance by adopt a positive mental attitude, improving their note-taking and essay-writing skills. In this study, the concept students’ academic performance was looked at as a process that describes how well a student performs by means of having impressive test scores, literacy, numeracy, extracurricular accomplishments and leadership roles.

This paper was directed by the constructivism theory of learning initiated by Jean Piaget, John Dewy, Bruner, and Vygotsky in 19th century. The theory is based on the belief that learning occurs as learners are actively involved in the process. Learners are the makers of meaning and knowledge. The theory postulates that, knowledge is not external to the knower and awaiting discovery by him or her; rather, knowledge “is created through a process of new information interacting with the prior knowledge and experiences of learners (Vavrus, Bartlett, & Salema, 2013). This philosophy of knowledge suggests that teachers should create the conditions for students to discover and actively construct knowledge and to develop the higher-order thinking skills of analysis and synthesis through inquiry-oriented lessons in the classroom (Frances, Mathew, & Bartlett, 2011) Lessons should encourage students to draw upon, connect, and analyze their prior knowledge and experiences through self-discovery and interaction with other students and with the teacher (Frances, Mathew, & Bartlett, 2011).

Contextually, this study was situated in Arua district which is located in north western Uganda at the vanguard of two countries namely, South Sudan and Democratic Republic of Congo. The district has 52 secondary schools and most of them have received complaints in the recent past from stakeholders such as Ministry of Education and Sports, Members of Parliament, Board of Governors, Parents, journalists, teachers and students over the deteriorating quality of education (Yikii, 2018). Anguparu (2018) observed declining levels of students’ academic performance in U.C.E and U.A.C.E, low levels of critical thinking, writing and numeracy skills. Teaching and learning in the district had for long been characterized by rote methods and techniques which were teacher centred. In 2014, ATL was introduced by MoES and TIET at National Teachers’ Colleges and later to several secondary schools to change learning approach. The investigator agreed with Ozitiru (2018) who reasoned that if the use of rote methods are not overturned through promoting the use of newly introduced ATL methods, techniques and tools at secondary schools in Arua district, then the efforts by all stakeholders to improve students’ academic performance would remain in danger; thus, the need for this investigation.

**Problem Statement**

Enhancing students’ academic performance through appropriate teaching practices in secondary schools is at the centre of all learning interventions globally. However, efforts to enhance students’ academic performance has
been pathetic in many secondary schools in Arua district. There are several recorded cases of declining levels of student’s examination grades, mental abilities, curiosity, and problem solving skills (Aseru, 2016). Nearly, 85% of schools in Arua district recorded decline in students’ academic performance over the last five years, mostly attributed to inappropriate choice of teaching aids and methods by teachers (Anguparu, 2014). While there have been several research conducted on students’ academic performance in Uganda (Kadondi, 2014; Aiko, 2010; Kisembo, 2013) there is still scanty information on how ATL Methods enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. Some studies have tried to relate teaching techniques to students’ academic performance (Drani, 2018; Ejiku, 2018; Munduru, 2015) however, none of them clearly explained the degree to which different ATL techniques are used to enhance students’ academic performance. In order to improve students’ academic performance we need to use appropriate instructional resources and tools. Few investigations like that of (Drani, 2017) tried to find out instructional resources that can be used to improve students’ academic performance in secondary schools. This findings however, fall short of establishing the degree of to which ATL practices are used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. The persistent degeneration in students’ academic performance in secondary schools at Arua district if not addressed from holistic manner being proposed in this study, will result into a broader spheres of pathetic students’ academic performance as it will spill to all education subdivisions in the country.

**Study objectives**

This study explored the degree to which ATL practices were used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. Specifically, the study was to examine the degree to which (i) ATL Methods; (ii) ATL Techniques; and (iii) ATL Instructional resources were used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district.

**Research questions**

i. What is the degree to which ATL methods are used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district?

ii. What is the degree to which ATL techniques are used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district?

iii. What is the degree to which ATL instructional resources are used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district?

iv. What is the influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district?

**Hypothesis**

There is no significant influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district.

**Literature Review**

**ATL Methods**

Drani (2018) established that decline in students’ academic performance was due to teachers’ reluctance to use ATL methods in several secondary schools. According to Anguparu (2018) ATL methods such as problem based learning requires the teacher a lot of time to plan and prepare. If not well planned, the methods can mislead the learners and divert the teaching and learning process from the learning objectives hence resulting into low student performance. Fontana (1995) established that low levels in use of ATL methods like problem based learning, learning stations and Project based learning were major contributions in the low levels of academic
performance of students in secondary schools. According to BTC (2014) key ATL methods recommended for secondary schools are as follows:

*Learning station* also called “corners” or “activity centres” are specific areas in a classroom where learners rotate from station to station to complete an educational task using different approaches. A debriefing session follows after to discuss what was learned at the different learning stations. During this session, learners can also answer questions and explore next steps. A classroom learning station is a designated place in a classroom where learners complete an educational task. This could be at a computer, where learners are asked to investigate a topic (e.g. through an online search assignment). This could be a table where historical objects are on display for examination. This could be a boom box where learners listen to music from a particular time period. Learning stations are purposefully designed to include the most effective strategies for increasing learning opportunities for all learners, encourage active participation, collaboration, and opportunities for extended reading, writing and speaking.

*Learning contract* is an agreement, written collaboratively between a learner and a teacher that details what is to be learned, how it will be learnt, and how that learning will be verified. It sometimes involves the learner’s parents. Learning contracts allow learners to decide what they wish to strive for, which activities they will engage in, and how they will demonstrate that they have satisfactorily completed their studies. They also permit the teacher to take advantage of the motivation within individual learners. The use of learning contracts allows the learner to structure his or her learning and to be an active participant in the process of education. A learning contract provides a useful mechanism for reassuring both parties about whether a planned piece of work will meet the requirements of a course or module.

*Problem-based learning* is a method that challenges learners to learn by solving problems presented in the form of case studies and simulations. This method enables learners to be self-directed and to acquire lifelong learning skills. It produces critical thinkers and problem solvers as learners integrate knowledge and skills from a number of disciplines. It motivates learners to find and use appropriate learning resources.

*Project based learning* was looked at as a method that refers to learners designing, planning, and carrying out an extended project that produces a publicly exhibited output such as a product, publication, presentation or service. Project-based learning involves publicly exhibited final product. Well-designed projects ask learners to tackle problems and issues important to people beyond the classroom (Walker & Leary, 2009).

**ATL Techniques**

Leo (2010) established that low levels of teaching techniques among teachers grossly affect students’ academic performance at all levels. According to Barge (2010) academic performance of students is dependent on many factors including the choice of teaching techniques. According to BTC, (2014) students’ academic performance is affected mainly by techniques used by teachers. Key ATL techniques that could improve academic performance in schools are as follows:

*Story telling* entails learners hearing stories, putting themselves in place of the characters and tell and re-tell stories. Stories are helpful in providing a clear understanding of abstract ideas such as honour, wisdom and courage.

*Simulation* is the creation of a realistic environment using a real life situations or occupational experiences. It is the presentation of a problem, event, situation or object as it appears in real life. Simulation can take many forms including role-play, models and games. It involves learners acting out a situation as it happens in reality. The learners will be able to express their feelings, perceptions, actions and experiences in the learning process.
Demonstration is a specific type of presentation and a technique of teaching by example rather than simply explaining, it is a visual practical presentation of a concept, process or skill showing how something works or is performed. The learners perform a demonstration to ascertain learning.

Group work is a technique in which all participants are collectively involved in a shared process of constructing knowledge and applying skills. It is a collaborative and participatory learner-centred approach. It stimulates in-depth learners’ knowledge and skills such as teamwork, critical thinking, interpersonal communication and peer teaching. Typically, a group consists of around 5-10 learners, though in large classrooms, group work can be organized for as many as 15-20 learners. Whether you use a small or large group in a teaching/learning situation depends on the nature of the assignment, the size of the class and available space. Group work motivates learners to think creatively and teaches them how to discuss and reach consensus.

Brainstorming is a technique to generate ideas and thoughts. It does not have the purpose to find a solution for a specific problem, but to gather a list of spontaneous ideas from learners. Different brainstorming techniques can be applied to facilitate the process of gathering and organizing ideas.

For all these techniques, learners are given a specific task on a given topic and to share their ideas at various levels. Every learner should feel free to say whatever comes to mind, any ideas or comments, no matter how unsophisticated or inappropriate without being criticized.

Presentation is a technique in which content is delivered through oral, visual and audiovisual channels that allow teacher-learner interaction. Presentations can be done by teachers or learners to support delivery of a specific message, actively involving learners in knowledge construction.

ATL Instructional Resources

UNESCO (2011) revealed that teachers under utilize instructional materials which impact on learners performance negatively in schools. Teachers are hesitant in engaging learners in the usage of various instructional resources in many secondary schools in Arua district henceforth reducing students academic performance (Anguparu, 2014). According to BTC (2014) instructional resources that can improve students academic performance are as follows:

Charts which are graphical representations of data, in form of symbols, such as bars in a bar chart, lines in a line chart, or slices in a pie chart. Charts are often used to ease understanding and relationships between parts of the data. They are used in a wide variety of fields, and can be created by hand (often on graph paper) or by computer using a charting application. Four of the most common charts are histograms, pie charts, bar charts and line charts.

Maps are symbolic depiction highlighting relationships between elements of some space, such as objects, regions, and themes. Many maps are static two-dimensional, geometrically accurate (or approximately accurate) representations of three-dimensional space. Although most commonly used to depict geographical information, maps may represent any space, real or imagined, without regard to context or scale; e.g. brain mapping and extraterrestrial mapping.

Diagrams are two-dimensional geometric (can be three-dimensional also) symbolic representations of information according to some visualization technique. A popular diagram is the Venn diagram that shows all possible logical relations between a finite collections of sets and illustrates simple set relationships. Also a Mind Map is a widely used diagram. A mind map is a diagram used to visually organize information. A mind map is often created around a single concept, drawn as an image in the center of a blank landscape page, to
which associated representations of ideas such as images, words and parts of words are added. Major ideas are connected directly to the central concept, and other ideas branch out from those.

*Flashcards* are sets of cards bearing information, like words or numbers, on either or both sides, used in classroom drills or in private study. One writes a question on a card and an answer overleaf. Flashcards can bear vocabulary, historical dates, formulas or any subject matter that can be learned via a question and answer format.

*Quiz* is a form of mind game in which the learners (as individuals or in teams) attempt to answer questions correctly. Quizzes are usually scored in points and many quizzes are designed to determine a winner from a group of participants. In an educational context, a quiz is usually a form of a student assessment, but often has fewer questions of lesser difficulty and requires less time for completion than a test. Quizzes are widely used as a learning drill to aid memorization by way of spaced repetition, enable knowledge retention and support active participation of learners by question and answer, these kind of practice and drill exercises can complement deep learning and understanding.

In summary, The researcher identified gaps in the usage of ATL Methods, techniques and instructional resources in enhancing students’ academic performance at secondary schools in Arua district requiring further investigation; hence the need for this investigation.

**Methodology and Procedure**

This paper adopted pragmatists’ mixed method research approach to explore ATL practices and students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. The study employed specifically the concurrent triangulation mixed method research design; this is where only one data collection phase was used during which quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis are conducted separately yet concurrently to help provide well validated and verified findings (Oso & Onen, 2009).

Quantitative, non-experimental, and descriptive cross sectional survey was mainly used where a detailed investigation into characteristics of individuals as expressed at a particular point in time was carried; numerical data was collected on beliefs, attitudes, opinions, practices and perceptions related to ATL practices and students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district.

Qualitative transcendental phenomenological research design was adopted. This involves studying commonality of a lived experience within a particular group and its fundamental goal is to arrive at a description of the nature of the particular phenomenon typically through interviews (Cresswell, 2013). This design helped the researcher gain first-hand knowledge about what participants experienced through broad and open-ended inquiry, in-depth understanding of ATL practices and students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. Transcendental phenomenological design is flexible and allows more freedom during the interview to explore essences of others’ experiences (Mariwilda, 2015). The researcher is cautious of the weaknesses of this design which includes difficulty in ensuring pure bracketing leading to interference in the interpretation of the data; it does not produce generalizable data. On a practical note, it is important to consider the possible difficulties of participants expressing themselves. The subjectivity of the data leads to difficulties in establishing reliability and validity of approaches and information. It is difficult to detect or to prevent researcher induced bias (Lichtman, 2006). According to Abuga (2014) the use of mixed research method design is recommended since it significantly helps to provide comprehensive and detailed explanation of the phenomena under study.

**Target Population, Population Size, Sample Size and Sampling Techniques**

The target population for this study comprised of head teachers, deputy head teachers, directors of study, teachers from Enabel partner secondary schools (Muni Girls, Okufura and Arua secondary) in addition to Arua Public, Mvara secondary, Modern Secondary school Ocko, Vurra Secondary, Oluko Secondary and Ushindi secondary
schools. The sample size was 122 respondents at determined using Morgan’s table 99% confidence level and 0.5% margin of error.

**Table 1: Showing Target Population, Population Size, Sample Size and Sampling Techniques**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target Population (Category)</th>
<th>Population size</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
<th>Sampling technique</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Head teachers</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>Purposive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputy head teachers</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>Purposive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directors of Study</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>Purposive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>Simple random</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student leaders</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Simple random</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>122</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Developed for the study by the researcher with information from Krejie & Morgan (1970)*

**Data collection Instruments**

Self-administered questionnaire was used as the main instrument designed in the 5 point Likert scale as reflected in table 2 below. The use of questionnaire enabled a lot of data collected over a short period of time and was relatively cost effective.

**Table 2: showing the Mean Ranges of Likert Scale**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Mean Range</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Very high</td>
<td>4.20 - 5.00</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>3.40 - 4.19</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>2.60 - 3.39</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>1.80 - 2.59</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very low</td>
<td>1.00 - 1.79</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Adopted from Renis Likert (1932)*

Focus Group Discussion Guide was used to gather information from student leaders and teachers from the target population. This instrument involved randomly and carefully selected participants who freely shared their experiences and practices on ATL Practices and students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua. The researcher guided the discussion by constructing controlling questions and documented information from the groups.

**Validity and Reliability tests of the Data Collection instrument**

Validity of the instrument was established. Validity refers to the appropriateness, meaningfulness and usefulness of any inferences, and it is the extent to which conclusion or measurement is well founded and corresponds accurately to the real world (Ns subuga & Katamba, 2013). Validity is important because it helps to determine what type of tests to use, and help to make sure researchers are using methods that are not only ethical and cost effective but also methods that truly measure the idea in question. Three professional raters were used to determine the Content Validity Index of the questionnaire. Where the first rater considered 17 statements on the questionnaire to be valid out of 20 statements giving a CVI of (17/20) =0.85. The second rater considered 18 statements valid out of 20 statements giving a CVI of (18/20) =0.90. The third rater considered 18 statements valid out of 20 giving a CVI of (18/20) =0.90. The validity of the questionnaire for this study was then determined by adding up the individual CVI from the raters, divided by the number of raters,
(0.85+0.90+0.90)/3= \textbf{0.88} (see table 3). This made the instruments to be considered valid as recommended by Amin (as cited by Amviko, 2017).

Reliability of the instruments was determined. Nsubuga & Katamba (2013) defines reliability as the consistency of scores or answers provided by an instrument. To establish the reliability of the instruments for this study, pre-testing was done from 4 secondary schools at Maracha district and participants were selected using purposive and simple random sampling techniques and questionnaires were administered to them. Following this, Alpha coefficient (Cronbach’s Alpha) method was used to analyze and determine the reliability of the items on the questionnaire. The reliability of coefficient for the questionnaire scored 0.910 which made the questionnaire to be considered reliable because it was above the recommended minimum score of 0.7 (Cronbach, 1984).

Findings and Discussion

Background Information on Respondents

Respondents background information was captured as shown as presented here in Table 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>86</td>
<td></td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highest education level</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post Graduate</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age bracket</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 – 35 years</td>
<td>68</td>
<td></td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 – 53 years</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 53 years</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>120</td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data (2018)

In Table 5 above, majority 86 (72%) of the respondents were males as compared to females who were 28 (28%) of the 120 respondents in the study. This means that most of the information provided in this study had more of male opinions. It also revealed that the males were more committed towards the study as compared to females. On the otherhand, 34 (28%) of the respondents had Post Graduate Diploma, those who had Bachelor’s degree were 51 (43%) and 35 (29%) of the respondents had other qualifications. The result revealed that majority of the respondents were respondents who were highly educated and this made them to give relevant information concerning the study. The results indicate that majority 68 (57%) respondents were in the age bracket of 18 – 35 years. 35 (29%) of the respondents were in the age bracket of 36 -53 years and 17 (14%) of the respondents were in the age bracket of 53 years above. This means that the researcher dealt with mature respondents hence an opportunity to get reliable opinions on the study.

Research Question 1: What is the degree to which ATL Methods are used to enhance Students’ Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in Arua district?
The degree to which ATL Methods are used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning stations</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>.95</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract based learning</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem based learning</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project based learning</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grand Mean and Standard Deviation**  
Mean 3.10 Std. Deviation 0.87 Moderate

N= 120, Source: Primary data (2018)

Legend 9:1.00 – 1.79 = Very Low, 1.80 – 2.59 = Low, 2.60 – 3.39 = Moderate, 3.40 – 4.19 = High and 4.20 – 5.00 = Very High

In respect to the table above, the general degree to which ATL methods were used to enhance academic performance of students in secondary schools in Arua district was depicted to be moderate with Mean 3.10 (62%) at 0.87 standard deviation. In detail, the degree at which learning station was used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was high with Mean 3.71(74%) at .95 standard deviation alongside contract based learning with Mean 3.71(74%) at .48 standard deviation, Problem based learning was moderate with Mean 3.00 (60%) at .81 standard deviation; Project based learning was low with Mean 2.00 (40%) at 1.29 standard deviation.

During Focus Group Discussion several respondents expressed that the use of ATL Methods to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua had been moderate. This study result meant that teachers and other shareholders need to work extra hard and strengthen the use of ATL Methods especially project based learning to significantly enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district.

**Research Question 2: What is the degree to which ATL Techniques are used to Enhance Students’ Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in Arua district?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technique</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Story telling</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simulation and role play/dramatization</td>
<td>4.56</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Think pair and share</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhibition</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstration</td>
<td>4.86</td>
<td>.37</td>
<td>Very High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group work</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brainstorming</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation and discussion</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grand Mean and Standard Deviation**  
Mean 4.39 Std. Deviation 0.65 Very High

N= 120, Source: Primary data (2018)

Legend 9:1.00 – 1.79 = Very Low, 1.80 – 2.59 = Low, 2.60 – 3.39 = Moderate, 3.40 – 4.19 = High and 4.20 – 5.00 = Very High

In respect to the table above, the general degree to which ATL techniques were used to enhance academic performance of students in secondary schools in Arua district was shown to be very high with Mean 4.39 (88%) at 0.65 standard deviation. Specifically, the use of storytelling to enhance students’ academic performance in
secondary schools in Arua district was very highly with Mean 4.43 (89%) at .78 standard deviation alongside simulation, role play/dramatization with Mean 4.56 (91%) at .53 standard deviation, think pair and share at Mean 4.58 (92%) at .53 standard deviation, exhibition with Mean 4.43 (89%) at .53 standard deviation and demonstration at Mean 4.86 (97%) at .37 standard deviation. It was further revealed that the use of group work to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was high with Mean 4.14 (83 %) at 1.21 standard deviation together with brainstorming with Mean 4.00 (80%) at .57 standard deviation, presentations and discussion at Mean 4.14 (83 %) at .69 standard deviation.

During Focus Group Discussion several respondents expressed that use of ATL techniques to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua had been very high. This study result meant that the degree to which ATL techniques were used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was overwhelming over the last five years. Therefore, teachers are encouraged to maintain the usage of the ATL techniques in a bid to improve students’ academic performance further.

**Research Question 3: What is the degree to which ATL Instructional resources are used to enhance Students’ Academic Performance in Secondary Schools in Arua district?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The degree to which ATL Instructional Materials are used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Charts and maps</td>
<td>4.29</td>
<td>.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagrams</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet and social media</td>
<td>4.29</td>
<td>.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Portfolio</td>
<td>4.28</td>
<td>.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flash cards</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Images / pictures</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quiz</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>1.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment Rubrics</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grand Mean and Standard Deviation</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.84</strong></td>
<td><strong>0.78</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N= 120, Source: Primary data (2018)

Legend 9: 1.00 – 1.79 = Very Low, 1.80 – 2.59 = Low, 2.60 – 3.39 = Moderate, 3.40 – 4.19 = High and 4.20 – 5.00 = Very High

In respect to the table above, the general degree to which ATL instructional resources are used to enhance academic performance of students in secondary schools in Arua district was portrayed to be high with Mean 3.84 (77%) at .87 standard deviation. In detail, the degree at which charts and maps were used to enhance students’ academic performance was very high with Mean 4.29 at .48 standard deviation alongside diagrams with Mean 4.71(94%) at .48 standard deviation, internet and social media with Mean 4.29 (86%) at .48 standard deviation and student portfolio with Mean 4.28 (86%) at .48 standard deviation. While flash cards had highly enhanced students’ academic performance with Mean 3.71(74%) at .75 standard deviation, besides Images/pictures with Mean 3.44 (69%) at .97 standard deviation. Quiz with Mean 3.00 (60%) at 1.29 standard deviation and assessment rubrics with Mean 3.00 (60%) at 1.00 standard deviation had moderately been used to enhance academic performance of students in secondary schools in Arua district.

During Focus Group Discussion several respondents expressed that ATL instructional resources had been highly used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua. This study result meant that the degree to which ATL instructional resources were used to enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was high over the last five years. Therefore, the use of instructional resources such as
charts and maps, diagrams, internet and social media, student portfolio should be encouraged at secondary schools in Arua district while more efforts should be on the use of flash cards, images/pictures, Quiz and Assessment Rubrics.

**The influence of ATL practices on Students’ Academic Performance at Secondary Schools in Arua district.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>r²</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.634a</td>
<td>.401</td>
<td>.400</td>
<td>.70147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), ATL Methods, ATL Techniques, ATL Instructional resources

Source: Primary Data (2018)

The Regression coefficient (r) indicates in general the influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance at secondary schools in Arua district was positive as shown by the r – value of .634 at 0.05 level of significance; r² was calculated to be .401 meaning that ATL practices had influenced students’ academic performance at secondary schools in Arua district by 40.1% over the study period leaving 59.9% been contributed by other factors which still needs to be researched on. However, an examination of the degree to which each of the variables of ATL practices influenced students’ academic performance at secondary schools in Arua district showed that ATL Methods was topmost with Beta value of 0.407 (41%) at .000 significance followed by ATL techniques at Beta value of 0.388 (39%) at .000 significance and ATL Instructional resources with Beta value of 0.375 (38%) at .000 significance (see table 10 below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 (Constant)</td>
<td>2.439</td>
<td>.455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATL Methods</td>
<td>.390</td>
<td>.074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATL Techniques</td>
<td>.380</td>
<td>.103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATL Instructional Resources</td>
<td>.372</td>
<td>.083</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent variable: students’ academic performance

Source: Primary date (2018)

**Testing Study Hypothesis**

This study hypothesized that there was no significant influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. To test the null hypothesis, the study generated a Pearson correlation analysis (see table below)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ATL Practices</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>r²</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.416**</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.173</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**.** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Source: Primary Data (2018)
From the generated Pearson correlation analysis the null hypothesis which stated that there was no significant influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was rejected because the P-value of 0.000 was found to be less than the significance level of 0.01. Therefore, an alternative hypothesis that there was significant influence of ATL practices on students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district was adopted. This meant that ATL practices are influential and significantly enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district.

**Conclusion and Recommendation**

In line with the findings of the study and the resulting discussions, the use of ATL Practices (Methods, techniques and instructional resources) are significantly influential in enhancing students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district. It is recommended that teachers and other stakeholders should always be prudent, innovative and use ATL methods, instructional resources and techniques to further enhance students’ academic performance in secondary schools in Arua district.

**References**


Economic Commission for Africa, ARFSD. (2018). Background paper on the subtheme “Strengthening the means of implementation and the partnership for sustainable development”.


MOH. (2015). The Uganda National Tuberculosis Prevalence Survey. MOH.


National Planning Authority (NPA). (2016). REVIEW REPORT ON UGANDA’S READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE 2030 AGENDA.


Professionalization in Higher Education through Entrepreneurship Teaching

Lema Catherine Forje*
Higher Institute of Commerce and Management (HICM)
The University of Bamenda (UBa)
E-mail: lc_forje@yahoo.co.uk

Abstract
For some time, considerable concern has been paid to the professionalization of higher education. Professionalising higher education is trying to build a bridge between theory and practice. First of all, it is important to know and understand that academics cannot be professionalised. So, what we need to do is to come up with some innovative teaching method that can allow for a marriage between theory and practice. Here lies the focus and objectives of this paper. Data for the study is based on books and interviews with business people, university management and entrepreneurship students. A total of 225 interviewees were conducted among; 100 undergraduates management students, 61 MBA students, 14 EMBA students and 50 business people. Frequency distribution table was used to analyse the data collected. The result suggests that not all areas of education can be professionalised. - In conclusion, activities such as self-paced design projects of taking students outside the lecture halls or classrooms either for practical work or discussions under a more relax and perhaps more conducive, attractive and enabling environments need to be adopted.

Key Words: Professionalization, Higher Education, Entrepreneurship Training, Teaching Environments, Practical Work, Creativity, Innovation

Introduction

Professionalising higher education reiterates the need to make education more practical and tied to commercial culture. To achieve the objective of marrying knowledge to practice we need to promote entrepreneurial spirits in tertiary education. According to Lema Forje (2010), entrepreneurship knowledge cuts across all walks of life and disciplines, but unfortunately, whenever the word ‘entrepreneurship’ is mentioned, people only immediately think of small business creation. Entrepreneurship is not only limited to small business creation. It is also a social as well as an economic activity, and goes far beyond small business creation. Small business creation is only a practical illustration of its importance. The four pillars of business administration: accounting/finance, management, marketing and organisation are conspicuously present in all areas of success, and there is no work that can be done without these concepts featuring in it. It is on the bases of this that entrepreneurship seems to be an appropriate linchpin approach to the professionalization of education in general. When students are taught to be accountable, manage, market and organise themselves, professionalism is expressed. Academics cannot be professionalised, but certain elements can be brought into teaching that can ease the understanding of a subject.

Professionalising university education by introducing entrepreneurship teaching in the classroom empowers everybody with the ability to think critically, work consciously and be committed in whatever work one is doing. Being an administrator is professional, it is all about thinking creatively and generating ideas that can improve and ease the work of students and other citizens in a society. Professionalising higher education should aim at producing a society that can according to Kirby (2003) not only cope with change, but can anticipate and initiate it. Entrepreneurial thinking focuses on generating ideas that can positively encourage creativity. It is creative thinking that can generate solutions to the problems of establishments, industries and organisations. To achieve this, universities need to invest, create structures and put in place equipments as well as create an enabling atmosphere that motivates freedom of thoughts and action. In sending students out for internship, universities are only focused on sending them to business organisation; this is underestimating the power of entrepreneurship,
and limiting it to business only. For example, while in school a group of us did internship for nine months in a university’s admission and record office. This enhanced my ability to keep records and be accountable for what I do. According to Keith and Rick (2005), the first characteristic of successful entrepreneurs is that they generate many business ideas and other ideas that serve to improve situations, and this is in line with Schumpeter’s idea of creative destruction. It is also a trait that is useful to every organisation. Fruitful ideas move a country forward; economically, socially, culturally and educationally. An investigation of the properties of entrepreneurship is important in order to know how to incorporate it in teaching.

A World Bank Policy study (1989) revealed that higher education’s contribution to development in Africa is being threatened; firstly, it produces too many graduates of programs of dubious quality; secondly, the quality of outputs in many countries show signs of doubtful fundamental effectiveness; thirdly, the cost of higher education is needlessly high; fourthly, the pattern of financing higher education is socially inequitable and economically inefficient. Reacting to the third (point above) it is important to note that the cost of higher education in many African countries is very low, Cameroon for example, students pay $100 US dollars as fees for a year. The problem is not that of high fees, but that the privatisation and professionalization of higher education was hurriedly done without due consideration of the manpower and structures available. While it is important that the youths should have access to education, it is equally vital that the quality of education especially at the higher level is maintained to meet with global knowledge standard of excellence and further knowledge creation. Geuna and Rossi (2015) show how the university and economy provides a concise critical survey of how universities teaching, research, and technology transfer activities contributes to economic growth, while cautioning decision-makers not to rely over much on popular statistical indicators of that performance. With privatisation, many higher education institutions, universities came up, some of them having programmes haphazardly prepared, no teachers, no conducive structure and environment for teaching and learning. Many schools were observed to have deplorable structures, lecturers overloaded with teaching. It is possible to find a lecturer teaching 360 hours per academic year. How efficient can the lecturer be? Some are teaching in five different schools in one semester. This among others is the source of poor quality output in higher education. Concerning professionalization, focus is on creating small businesses, ignoring other areas that education accounts for and requires.

Theory provides a bridge behind and in front of education. This is to say that theoretical concepts within a discipline enables understanding between those who studied the subject before us and those who are yet to study after us and provides guidelines on how to further research within a discipline. It also allows for flexibility. Where interest is focused heavily on professionalization, theory suffers and quality of education reduces. Thomas et.al. (2002) argue that professionalization simplifies detailed planning but adds rigidity. He goes on to say that the strong service orientation of most organisations tends to encourage the development of static professional norms and attitudes. To achieve professionalization and also maintain theory, national educational policies need to adopt strategies that enable students to practice what they learn in the classrooms as well. Entrepreneurial centres where students can go and practice their interest, hobbies and other recreational activities of their interest are needed. There are of course disciplines that are professionally orientated, (medicine, and law and business administration.) these disciplines first of all start with the theoretical concepts grounding students in the discipline. Although professional institutions must continue to exist, an educational system that enables people to think creatively, imagine and engage in beneficiary activities is worth embarking on. Entrepreneurship education emphasises flexibility and creative thinking in all areas.
The Professionalization Nexus

On talking about professionalization of higher education, emphasis seems only to be laid on, students going on internship. In Cameroon for example, it was observed that besides medical, science students, students of the teaching profession, law students, business students and other professional institutions, those outside such institutions benefit very little. This is attributed to the following reasons:

- The companies where these students go for internship are in many cases foreign companies who are not in the country to train people because of high cost, since this internship are very often not paid for. They might not have made provision for taking people on internship.

- The companies receive no payment for training and monitoring the students, and will not be able to cover the cost of mistakes made by the interns during their internship period. This reduces the interns to lifting files from one table to the other, or restricted to activities that hinder access to indebt research about the company. Thus, professionalization of higher education calls for many redefined policy measures. Lessons can be learned from other countries, Sweden for example, where some of the students who do internship end up being employed by the companies, as the companies trained them well as future successors. This enhanced public-private sector intercourse as well as it promotes employment and improves quality of livelihood.

The professionalization of education in Africa is not only to start from higher education. It needs to start from the primary schools, even nursery homes where children at this level tend to be very inquisitive and as such creative and committed. All what they need is orientation, encouragement and motivation. In the former West Cameroon, (Anglophone Cameroon), Primary Schools owned farms and practiced gardening, handwork, and these were taken seriously and encouraged. Produces from school farms and handwork were sold to the public and parents (Forje 2009). With these exercises, both parents and teachers worked together to orientate the children right at that tender age to develop entrepreneurial spirit. Such orientation enables children to exhibit their potentials and fall in love with whatever activity they develop interest in. The practices may or may not be income generating, but engages children and reduces crime rates in the society. Children learn to generate business ideas and identify opportunities that could be exploited as future path to career and employment opportunities. As children are oriented towards activities in the private sector, they develop entrepreneurial mindset opened to many creative endeavours.

The Cameroon government is trying to reinvent the school system practised in West Cameroon, by encouraging practices such as agriculture and handicrafts in schools. Doing this should not be in the form of an addendum; it should form part of the curriculum and becomes a weekly practice in schools both at primary and secondary level where children are still learning general subjects. Teachers of such activities should encourage the children by working together with them. Many at times, children shy away from certain subjects in school, simply because it is seen as ends for failures.

“A farmer told his story on how he interacted with a tourist who visited Cameroon. The farmer thought that only government civil servants could go on such tourist trips, especially out of their countries. He was surprise and amazed that a farmer could undertake such pleasure trip, and as such was convinced that farming too is a profession and well respected as other white collar jobs”.

There are a number of strategic issues that run through the literature on teaching entrepreneurship as a subject. The first is coming up with a clear concept called, “the theory of entrepreneurship” which is not possible because entrepreneurship has to do with creative thinking and creative arts. There are usually many interpretation of one success or failure story of entrepreneurship. In some cases, entrepreneurship is seen from the perspective of a
creative process. Scanning through the literature on entrepreneurship, we find alertness, goal oriented and commitment (Suna Lowe et al 2017) as well as an enabling environment, partnership between the state, society and the private sector. Cameroon seems to be lacking behind in a harmonious relationship; public-private sector interface.

**Review of Literature**

Kirby (2003) citing Schumpeter, states, the principal goals of an entrepreneurial venture is profitability and growth and the business is characterised by innovative strategic practices. Brockhaus and horwitz (1986) support the argument that there is no generic definition of the entrepreneur, Kuratko and Hodgetts (2001) suggest that although no single definition of entrepreneur exists research is providing an increasingly sharper focus on the subject. Professionals are those with skills in the coordination and leadership of specialists. More so, professionals are subject to special rules relating to the particular profession. The professional man in business has a powerful base of independence. It is this independence that we are trying to impart in the students of higher education. Today’s management recruitment does have the more rational and less frustrating ambition of a life of ever widening responsibility and choices. The prospect for a managerial career today is more adventurous than it ever was (Igor H. Ansoff 1981 pp137). In another view, John Child (1969 pp 68) states that the professional employee, such as the industrial scientist, the engineer or the company lawyer has typically internalised a clearly defined set of norms which relate to his/her conduct. A professional tends to be strongly committed to his/her work and which he/she has attested technical competence to carry out. From this perspective, entrepreneurship becomes a neutral subject that cuts across all disciplines, empowering people to do their work diligently and be committed. It should not only be tied to small business creation. It is true that by creating businesses, employment is created, and entrepreneurship knowledge has to also enable employees of the business to work effectively and efficiently to sustain the business. According to Jerome and Perreault, Jr. (1988 4th ed.), professionals provide special services that support the operation of an enterprise which can be a hospital, government administration, home management etc.

The number (and definition) of entrepreneurs vary across countries, depending among other things” unique economic, cultural and social situation” (Suna Lowe et al op.cit). Lessem (1986) argues that no individual displays in equal degree, the full range of entrepreneurial attributes. This of course is obvious because individuals have different talents. Wickham (1998) on his part suggests that entrepreneurship is about creating and managing vision and communicating that vision to other people. The two views intertwined simply because there is no one source to entrepreneurial activities as to where reference can be made. This suggests therefore that the foundation of any theoretical approach must be based on, the level of the economic development, culture and the social structure of the country in question. Innovation can, and should take place, but should be based on these three elements in a society (see Forje 2015). There is also the idea that entrepreneurs are born with particular characteristics traits. This is partially true, but cannot be the whole story. Entrepreneurship can be learned, the most important thing is to identify the various elements that form the character of an entrepreneur and look for ways on how to exploit them. It is very complex, but needs to be done. Something usually gets people to develop traits. Take for example, the “Bamilekes” ethnic group in the French speaking Cameroon, their quest for independence instilled in them the traits of business (passion for small business creation). The determination to succeed and be independent constitutes an element in the entrepreneurial character. Determination and commitment characterise the start of entrepreneurial activities, while interaction with the environment is a source of opportunities.
Examining the Kirznerian alertness to opportunities that exist in and out of our societies we see that opportunities are almost always there due to constant changes in the society and its environment constructs. The capability approach to knowledge acquisition emphasizes social and tacit nature of knowledge. It goes on to suggest team work and the fact that some knowledge acquired through team work can neither be transmitted nor made explicit (Frederic E. Sautet 2006). This suggests the complex nature of entrepreneurship. Since entrepreneurial practices have no direct source, entrepreneurship can mostly be taught through the identification of as many of the factors that influence entrepreneurial practices.

Teaching students to become good employees requires a framework that is constantly fitted with information. Chia (1996) suggests that, a deliberate educational strategy is required. Students need to be oriented to think critically and constructively about happenings in the society and the resources therein. Factors which influence the start of entrepreneurial activities need to be emphasised. Table 1; suggest a view based on alertness as suggested by (Kirzner 1979).

**Table 1. Opportunity Alertness and Business Creation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual or Student</th>
<th>Happening in the Society and around the World</th>
<th>Opportunities</th>
<th>Critical Thinking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alertness</td>
<td>- Structure &amp; Resource Base.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Entrepreneurial Capabilities,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Social System</td>
<td></td>
<td>Creativity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Cultural System</td>
<td></td>
<td>New creation, or Innovation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Occasional Happenings, e.g. System change, Political Upheavals, Sudden economic change etc.</td>
<td>Opportunities</td>
<td>Tolerance to Uncertainty and total commitment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Lema Catherine Forje*

Being alert of the above basic structure in the society will enable potential entrepreneurs to have a good dialogue with policy makers on how to create a conducive environment for entrepreneurial activities to grow. Ferreiva and Fayelle et.al (2018) focusing on the knowledge economics, outline the importance of understanding the role that entrepreneurial universities play through collaboration with policy makers. The authors go further to evaluate how universities can engage communities, while also balancing stakeholder considerations, and explore how universities should manage the future in order to integrate into the global society effectively. There is a wide variety of approaches to entrepreneurship. Seen from the perspective that; the term entrepreneurship is often equated with new venture creation and small business management. Gibb (1996) asserts that opportunity alertness and factors likely to influence the start of businesses need to be emphasised in the teaching of entrepreneurship. Table 1 suggests that once an individual or students understand what entrepreneurial practices is all about, knowledge of the society and the resources available therein, the social and cultural systems, occasional changes within these factors are likely to open up business opportunities. Tony J. Watson in Kevin Mole with Monder Ram (2012), argue that we should evaluate scientific knowledge not in terms of how
accurately it tells us what the case in the world is, but instead, in terms of how well it informs human actions in the world. In line with this argument, Table 1 suggests the factors that can encourage creativity of any sort. Using entrepreneurs in entrepreneurship teaching is to induce self-reliance and move people away from being dependent. Students should be encouraged to visit entrepreneurial expos such as the Entrepreneurial Promo 2019 that took place in Yaoundé Cameroon and brought entrepreneurs from many nations. Such activities instils in the students entrepreneurial spirit.

James D. Harts (2018) looks at the impact of entrepreneurship education being maximised when multidisciplinary approaches are used. Harts offers a dynamic and robust series of tools for education to create their own hyper-involved classroom regardless of their discipline to prepare students to impact the real world. This suggests that entrepreneurship teaching is based on a trial and error, where every factor is deemed likely to create an entrepreneurial venture should be examined. For example, it is important to devoid higher educational and its professionalization ideas from political party interferences.

Neck et al (2014) advocate teaching entrepreneurship using a portfolio of practices, including empathy, creation, experimentation, and reflection. Together, these practices help students develop the competency to think and act entrepreneurially in order to create, research and exploit opportunities of various kinds in a continuously changing and uncertain world. Therefore, in planning and teaching lessons, lecturers also get requisite information on the society’s needs, conditions and developmental possibilities. We live in a digital age. This is impacting seriously on the economy and our ways of life. Zorn, Haywood and Glachant (2018) show how higher education sector is moving online. To add to this, before in the universities in Cameroon, student’s results were published manually, now it is published online. This is also part of professionalism. However, Zorn and Glchant op.cit. question how digital disruption is seen in other sectors of relevance for both academics and management in higher education. To what extent we are seizing the opportunities that an online transition could offer, and how this could impact our way of life and the economy.

Ferreira et. al. (2018) expands the issue on teaching entrepreneurship in universities from the perspectives of inter-disciplinary practise, university management roles and policy matters. Fayolle, Kariv and Matlay (2019) bridge the persistent research and practice gaps in entrepreneurship education theory and practice as well as its relationship to main stakeholders. According to Michael P. Todaro (1982 pp 289), human resource constitute the ultimate bases. Capital and natural resources are passive factors. Human beings are the active agents; they exploit natural resources and give added values to these resources. With this knowledge in mind, it therefore suggests that exploitation requires different types of skills thus, it is important that teaching be made to incorporate skills needed for such exploitation, and such an approach is entrepreneurial. Charles Mathias and Eric Liguori (ed.) (2018) on their part examines past practices, current thinking and future insights into the over expanding world of entrepreneurship education. Fayolle Alain (2018) notes that entrepreneurship education has received renewed impetus by the advent of experiential learning and student entrepreneurship. It is therefore imperative that entrepreneurship education research makes a contribution to our understanding about the direction and effectiveness of entrepreneurship education. The question to ask here is how is this contribution to be made?

Kariv Dafna et al (2019) aim to bridge persistent research and practitioner gaps in entrepreneurship education theory and practice, as well as its relationship to main stakeholders. This is what the myriad of theories is trying to do. Entrepreneurship is not only for the creation of small businesses According to Tuntufye (2013), good quality and relevant education at higher education will lead to the production and availability of employable
graduates and professionals..., in all walks of life. Entrepreneurship can be exercised in public administration or in any activity undertaken by man (see Lema Forje 2010). From the above discussion, this paper bases its teaching approach on table 1. And in the perspective of Neck et al (2014) advocating that teaching entrepreneurship requires using a portfolio of practices. What experience can African countries draw from other countries? Morgan et.al. (2017) discuss how in China education has developed in the way it has, and how it is likely to develop in future in a country that continues to grow in global importance and interest.

Method

This study draws data from observation of happenings in the society, theoretical views, and interview with 100 undergraduate management/entrepreneurship students, 61 MBA students, 14 EMBA students and 50 independent business people. The EMBA students have worked for more than two years and are still working in different enterprises. Among the MBA students, 20 had worked for private companies, 21 were government workers, and 20 had their own businesses. For the EMBA students, 5 were government workers and 9 are working for private companies. The 50 business people were drawn from the two English speaking regions of Cameroon. Crucial data included ideas that prompted them to start their own businesses; new innovative ideas gathered in the cause of operating the business; how they will want entrepreneurship to be taught in order to impart the spirit of creativity into the students. In this light, the only question was; in your opinion, how should entrepreneurship be taught? The variables of using: storytelling/proverbs, use of internship, and classroom teaching were adopted. Interviewees were also asked to express their views on what they find necessary to be put in place to facilitate such teaching.

Questionnaires were served and the interviewees were advised to express themselves freely, and this was done in three days using head count. See table 2. In putting up the table, the variable “classroom teaching” being theoretical was recommended arguing that there must be theory before practical. Concentration was on the two variables based on stories/proverbs including games and internship. Frequency distribution table was used to ascertain the importance of each teaching method suggested by the interviewees.

Table 2. Views presented by Interviewees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of interviewees 225 and views obtained</th>
<th>Undergraduates Students (100)</th>
<th>MBA Students (61)</th>
<th>EMBA Students (14)</th>
<th>Business People (50)</th>
<th>Total 225 Views %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stories/proverbs and games</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>199 (88.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>167 (74.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom teaching</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>198 (88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Infrastructures</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>210 (93.3)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A percentage relative frequency is calculated as follows:

\[
\text{Percentage relative frequency} = \frac{f}{\sum f} \times 100
\]

Where

\[
f = \text{the frequency}
\]
∑ =the sum of

Type equation here.

From the interview result, we find that 88.4% of the opinion given falls positively for using a variety of approaches such as, (storytelling, proverbs and games) to teach entrepreneurship which is in line with Neck et al (2014) suggestion of teaching entrepreneurship using a portfolio of practices. Proverbs and storytelling impart into students indigenous knowledge which forms the basis of critical thinking and idea generation. According to Tuntufye (2013) op cit. indigenous knowledge is different from the body of knowledge produced by institutions and universities…local knowledge, folk knowledge, traditional wisdom forms the information base of a society. In view of this, the creation of an entrepreneurial centre where students can spend time and test their ideas and even recount some of the proverbs and stories received from their parents and other elderly people in the society is another means of professionalising students. Proverbs are loaded with meanings that go beyond the world of activities, and set souls searching creatively and entrepreneurially (see Lema Catherine Forje 2010).

Reflecting on the school syllabus of the Anglophone Cameroon before the referendum creating the unitary government in 1972, primary schools’ time tables had provisions for storytelling, proverbs and games. In developed countries, children are exposed to investment decision right from nursery schools through the use of Monopoly and Chess games etc. Take a country like Sweden for example; majority of children from about ten years old can at least decide whether to invest in buying a house or a hotel using knowledge gathered from playing monopoly and other games that encourage creative thinking in different direction of life and socio-economic activities. Harts (2018) discusses how classroom exercises engage students in all aspects of the entrepreneurial process and challenges students to master new ways of entrepreneurial thinking and acting. This highlights the importance of human capital in meeting the goals of development. When leaders invest in the creation of knowledge through universal education and skills development, innovation and economic growth will follow (Lee et. al. 2018). Susan de Janasz and Crossman (2018) echo the same message on engaging and enhancing knowledge and skills in a wide range of breathing life into human resources management.

In primary schools in Cameroon, “the once upon a time” type stories brought about soul searching. People imagine themselves in another world and in another form through creative thinking which encouraged children to develop the spirit of entrepreneurial thinking. While playing a game, people concentrate and it leads to a strategic, innovative and thinking mode that enables the discovery of new visions about the world and what to make use of. Such a centre existed in the then Victoria, now Limbe in South-West Cameroon, near the centenary stadium where primary school teachers were assigned to guide pupils during handicraft classes.

Concerning structures, an entrepreneurship centre is needed, wherein students can go to during their free time to put into practice whatever idea they have. Concerning creative thinking, the students bemoan the fact that they think critically in their language (mothers tongue), and translating it into English or French loses some of its meanings. Having an entrepreneurship centre would enable students to put into practice their ideas with no translation. According to Tuntufye and Phindile (2013), language is a cultural value, a source of identity and more broadly, it is the self-consciousness of a given people. In view of this, it is important to encourage and orientate students to explain things in their mother tongue. Struggling to translate an idea conceived by students into a foreign language creates the “idea drain” notion.

Proverbs according to the result provokes as well as kick start creative thinking. Proverbs are embedded with meanings that entrepreneurial activities can spring up from. It enables soul searching. When a person gets frustrated, not knowing what to do, one proverb can ignite a thinking mode that opens a new path to a world of opportunities. Take for example, a Cameroon proverb, “You have a tong in your hand and fire is burning you”
(see Lema Catherine Forje 2010) is often directed to university graduates who have the knowledge and instead of creating something to do; they hang the corridors of government offices looking for jobs which may never come. A proverb such as this provokes critical thinking that eventually leads to the discovery of an opportunity or opportunities. There is no road map for opportunity identification. Sometimes it comes as lightening and if not taken advantage off, it can be lost forever. This is why attributes such as those outlined but not limited to those in Table 1 could be presented in the classroom to alert the students on the opportunities that can spring out from a society.

**Internship- The Heritage**

Many arguments surrounded internship practices. Seen from the interview result, the idea of using internship as a means of teaching entrepreneurship scored 74.4%. According to the students, internship out of disciplines like medicine, nursing, teaching, engineering, and other professionalised, bodies did not benefit students much. Business administration studies being an entrepreneurial base study provided some benefit to students from the administrative point but the problem is that companies are not ready to let out or employ students in areas that might lead students to discover their business strategies and other secrets. So, the interns are limited to administrative and none production activities. However, it puts them within the frame of working life as regards to: time management and discipline. Internship as practiced in Cameroon does not provide students with appropriate and much practical knowledge. There is always the complained of time wasting, extra cost increment and heavy taxes. In their opinion, such complains inhibit the organisations concerned from giving the students the training they need. However, certain recommendations were made, such as negotiation for payments according to the students.

Classroom teaching scored 88%. The interviewees very well understood that although by definition there is no theory that can be said to be “the theory of entrepreneurship”, there must be directives on how to go about opportunity identification. Also, academics cannot be professionalised. It is left for individual universities to research into the factors that can best influence and motivate students to be entrepreneurial and be committed in all walks of life.

Lack of infrastructure made for entrepreneurial take off in many African societies is endemic. This can be seen by the percentage of views assigned by students. Such infrastructure problem is also an impediment for professionalization. Lack of infrastructure, couple by shortage of lecturers of entrepreneurship impedes the professionalization process. Universities should be allowed to collect school fees that can be effectively and efficiently managed to provide for required infrastructures. The provision of infrastructure should not only be left in the hands of the government alone. Communities should be encouraged to put up buildings (hostels) in universities. Levitt et. Al (2019) looks at public-private partnership development that allows government to procure long term infrastructure services from private providers. Hodge and Greve (2019) looking at today’s economic turbulence, public, private partnership (PPP) fills the gap between infrastructure needs as available financing widens government and business. Both must seek new ways to make contemporary PPP approach work for the good of society.

University/private sector partnership should be encouraged and intensified for the growth of internship and development of society. It requires looking into policy problems and policy designs, as outlined by Peters (2018). Sweden provides a good example of public-private sector interface in internship activities. Internship also initiate the student to the realities of the working world, it is a form of combining theory and practice and
building a spirit of entrepreneurial skills in students from different perspective. The success of internship and the professionalization of higher education call for a harmonious interplay between the state, and society and the private sector. Steiner in Khamsi and Draxler Alexandra (2018) show the effects of public funding of private entities by examining the ways in which they affect the quality, and equity of services. Case studies from developing and developed countries illustrate the variety of ways in which private actors expand their involvement in education as a business and the impact this brings.

**Conclusion and Recommendation**

The research makes contributions to theory, teaching and public policy. It develops the understanding of entrepreneurship as an imperative tool that builds and sustains knowledge in all walks of life. Teaching without the comprehension of what professionalization means, is pouring water on a ducks back. Although entrepreneurship is the corner stone of professionalization it cannot be taught like other subjects having theoretical base, its teaching can be made to follow a pattern of life in the society which people already have an idea of. This will motivate and encourage learning. Learning from best practices and what works should be at the back of the mind. Notwithstanding, people need to understand the importance of entrepreneurship in a society as the corner stone of sustainable development and, can only come about through entrepreneurial education on how to exploit and use resources in a proper way.

Michael P. Todaro (1982), states that, providing the kind of training and education that would promote literacy, numeracy, and basic skills while encouraging classical education are required. Entrepreneurial approach to teaching enables the introduction of students to three occupational subgroups of rural areas-farmers and farm workers, persons engaged in nonfarm rural enterprises, as suggested by Michael P. Todaro (1982) and companies as well as public employees.

Entrepreneurial centres should be created in universities, proverbs and storytelling that constitute the foundation of society thinking needs to be included in school syllabus.

- An entrepreneurship centre that enables and encourages students to practice their ideas and discover their talents needs to be put in place.
- Communities should be sensitised and encourage to put up buildings, and infrastructural problem would be solved.
- The role of entrepreneurship in a university should be emphasised.
- Policies that can remedy economic imbalances and incentives distortion need to be put in place.

The road ahead for African countries is getting in and getting on with professionalised higher education system focusing to build a capable human capital and knowledge system for creative and productive activities. The success of internship and the professionalization of higher education call for a harmonious interplay between the state, society and the private sector.

**References**


Kariv Dafna, Harry Matlay and Alain Fayolle (2019). The Role and Impact of Entrepreneurship Education. Methods, Teachers and Innovative Programmes. Edward Elgar Publishing UK.


Accelerating Commercialization of Higher Learning Institutions in Tanzania by Establishment of the University of Dar Es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centre (UDIEC)

Bavo B. Nyichomba & Cuthbert Kimambo
College of Engineering and Technology
University of Dar es Salaam, P. O. Box 35131 Dar es Salaam, Tanzania
Email: nyichomba@udsm.ac.tz and kimambo@udsm.ac.tz

Abstract
The University of Dar es Salaam (UDSM) being the oldest higher learning institution in Tanzania has at its disposal talented human resources in diverse fields of study but their impact on Tanzania’s industrialization has not been adequately felt. This is partly due to poor uptakes of research outputs from the University by industry and the general public and in part due to lack of practical entrepreneurship skills of graduates and staff from UDSM to establish firms from their areas of specialization. In this context the UDSM has taken an initiative to establish the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centre (UDIEC). The establishment of UDIEC is an attempt to address previous challenges between knowledge generation, research and application. In addition, it addresses challenges related to imparting practical entrepreneurship skills to students, academic staff and SMEs in the country for the formation of new start-ups and increased competitiveness of existing companies. UDIEC, therefore, seeks to realize University-wide strengths and comparative advantages by making cross-cutting services like business, legal and management skills available to all university units including science and engineering. This is in line with UDSM 2061 vision, which among other things, aims at maintaining its lead position in knowledge creation and sharing. The anticipated outputs from the centre include; creation and consolidation of the country-wide knowledge space; creation and expansion of innovation space and capacity building space. The Centre shall operate as an independent entity with a Director under the Deputy Vice Chancellor – Research. The Centre’s Director will have a reporting function to the DVC and Senate Research and Knowledge Exchange Committee (SRKEC). Furthermore, the Centre will be led by a Board that will comprise the private sector, the University and other respective stakeholders including the Government. It is envisaged that the administrative expenses of UDIEC will be covered through OC budget allocations as is the case for other UDSM units and R&D support can be carried by researchers applying for funds through competitive proposals to external donors or COSTECH.

Key Words: New Start-Ups, Competitiveness, Knowledge Space, Innovation Space, Capacity Building Space

Introduction
Given the recent macroeconomic stability and structural reforms in Tanzania, sustained economic growth will heavily depend on the country’s capacity to innovate - that is, the capacity to produce a wider array of products, processes and services, accelerate the pace for technological change and integrate the global economy (World Bank, 2006). This requires the use of knowledge created from Higher Education Learning Institutions (HEIs) such as the University of Dar es Salaam to contribute significantly to the creation of new economic activities (URT, 2013). Research conducted by HEIs increases the body of theoretical knowledge as well as its application to practical problems and may sometimes lead to innovations if well supported.

Although the University of Dar es Salaam (UDSM) has been in existence for more than 50 years, the impact from its research and innovation in terms of products, processes and services has not been felt in the development of the local industry and the community (Temu, 2011, Temu et al., 2012). This is because researchers/developers or graduates from HEIs have not been able to develop Intellectual Properties (IPs) worth being licensed or patented so as to bring about financial benefits into the country. Furthermore, there have been poor uptakes of research outputs from the University to the industry despite a number of technologies developed by the University through the then Institute of Production Innovation (IPI) from 1979 to 2001 as well as through the Technology Development and Transfer Centre (TDTC) which replaced IPI in 2001 (Nyichomba 2009, 2010;
Kaunde et al., 2001). The above is also accentuated by weak linkages between University units such as University of Dar es Salaam Entrepreneurship Centre (UDEC), University Computing Centre (UCC), Technology Development and Transfer Centre (TDTC), and Central Science Workshop (CSW) that are involved in outreach activities as well as weak linkages between these units and the industry. At national level, higher education institutions and dedicated Research and Development (R&D) institutions funded by the government or development partners are engaged mostly on sponsor-driven than demand driven projects needed by the industry. Thus, the country continues to import products from abroad due to low technologies in place cementing its colonial era legacy of exporting natural resources with minimal value additions coupled with the ever increasing unemployment (UNCTAD, 2011).

In order to address the gaps between research and application on one hand, and to reform and reposition units with similar functions in the new UDSM structure aimed at increasing their effectiveness, it was important to link all the said units through a single unit at the University level namely the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centre (UDSM, 2011). Thus, the consolidation of non-teaching functions like: consultancy; continuing education; innovation and commercialization; promotional and community services under the Directorate of Knowledge Exchange provides convenience to internal and external clients as one-stop-centre for outreach activities. UDIEC, therefore, seeks to realize university-wide synergies and strengths by making the cross-cutting services like business, legal, social and management skills available to science and engineering based units. The restructuring is in line with UDSM 2061 vision, which among other things, aims at maintaining its lead position in knowledge creation and sharing. Therefore the establishment of UDIEC aims at forming a high-level national entity to undertake innovation and commercialization in a wide range of disciplines.

**Main Objective**

The main objective is to establish a University level unit that will assist to translate knowledge and innovations developed by UDSM outreach units, R&D Institutions, SMEs and the University as a whole to contribute into socio-economic development of the country.

**Specific Objectives**

(a) To utilize the knowledge, technologies and innovations created by colleges/institutes/schools at the University of Dar es Salaam and other research institutions in the country to contribute significantly to the creation of new economic activities such as; oil and gas products and services.

(b) To put in place mechanisms that allow academic staff, graduates and individuals to commercialize innovations including establishing spin off companies and hence creation of employment as well as economic growth.

(c) To establish a proper licensing system including an Intellectual Property Rights (IPR) regime that would assist the promotion of effective commercialization and innovations, which would then encourage and reward innovations and development by R&D institutions.

(d) To identify new markets, creating new enterprises based on priority areas that could bring impact to socio-economic development of the country including diversifying of rural economies.

(e) To attract investment into innovation and commercialization of research results by creating funding mechanisms (Product Development Fund) while increasing the scope and size of risk capital in the country.

(f) To collaborate with various experts in innovation and technology transfer world-wide to nurture innovation, entrepreneurship, research proposal writing, intellectual property rights and technology evaluation.
In this case, the Centre has therefore to be visible at UDSM, nation-and international-wide and it will focus on few core sectors which have impact in promoting socio-economic development of the country. Further to that, The Centre shall work closely with private and public institutions to promote knowledge exchange matters. It shall facilitate practical exploitation of high-level manpower thus moving towards third generation universities (3GUs), whereby apart from traditional outputs of students and publications, Universities shall also produce tangible products to the society and offload their research results to the industry.

Situation Analysis
This Section summarises the main factors that affect the performance of UDSM units involved in outreach programmes to support the technological innovations and commercialization activities aimed for socio-economic development of the country. The Section goes further to elaborate factors at national and regional level that hinder developing new products, processes and services from higher learning and R&D institutions that are responsible for economic growth of the country.

Institutional Level

(a) Weak Coordination System within UDSM Outreach Units

Although a number of UDSM units such as Centre for Continuing Education (CCE), UDEC, TDTC and UCC, are involved in the provision of outreach programmes, there exists weak linkages between these units in supporting the outreach activities. Most of the businesses established under these units such as the incubator programmes under UDEC and TDTC, respectively, did not flourish. In addition, there has not been a unified approach for identification and marketing of the innovation and technology transfer potential of the University apart from participation in trade fairs. Experiences from other countries (e.g. Malaysia and India) have shown that most renowned research results emerged from cross-disciplinary collaboration or multi-cultural perspectives that require more than one skill to realistically solve problems. (Nikundiwe et al., 2006).

(b) Weak Funding Supporting System of the Outreach System at the University

Funding of the Tanzania research system is very low as the large majority of the available funds are spent on salaries (personal emoluments) which account for over 80 per cent of the total budget allocation leaving a very slim margin for capital expenses related to research and operational expenses. The Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology (COSTECH) has adequate funds to support competitive R&D financing, training of researchers and development of public research infrastructural base.

Apart from depending entirely on the fund provided by the Government, the Commission has also been able to attract funding from other sources including Tanzania Sweden Netherlands Research Projects (TASENE), Swedish International Development Agency (Sida), South Africa, Human Development Innovation Fund (HDIF), etc. Furthermore, the Commission in collaboration with the UK’s Department of International Development (DFID) received a grant amounting to 30 million pounds for research, innovation and human development in the country. However, to date there have been few efforts by different Colleges/Schools/Institutes within UDSM that have been involved in writing strong multi-disciplinary research proposals to take advantage of such funds.

National Level

Weak Linkage between Productive Sectors, Research and Academia
A key feature of Tanzania’s institutional landscape is the weak links and poor positive feedback between and among institutions, including the higher learning institutions, COSTECH, research institutes and the private sector (Diyamett et al., 2011). More importantly, there are no incentives for different institutions to work together. Also, there exist few mechanisms to encourage communication and collaboration between academia, COSTECH and industry. This could also be the reason for the poor up-take of research outputs from the higher education institutions or even sponsoring of R&D at these institutions by the private sector (Diyamett, 2013) or COSTECH working closely with higher learning and R&D institutions on issues of technology incubation. To this end, the Government-Industry-Academia linkages suffer from the same generic factors as in other countries including lack of incentives for companies that undertake R&D (Rod, 2013) and lack of venture capital system to support the start up business in the Country.

Low Capacity to Handle Innovation, Technology Development and Transfer

Despite the bottlenecks in the country’s R&D system, there are success stories with regard to the achievements made by different institutions. Over the years there have been moderate achievements made in some institutions such as Centre for Agriculture Mechanisation and Rural Technology (CAMARTEC), TIRDO, TEMDO, TATC, and TDTC. However, these institutions are yet to show evidence or to prove their innovative outputs. The expected achievements by these institutions are hampered or delayed, in part, by limited Science and Technology (S&T) personnel, lack of comprehensive national R&D and S&T policies and strategies, as well as inadequate financial resource allocation. Part of the wider problem may have been the little inter-linkage and networking among them. Another anticipated problem could have been related to inadequate coordination, but the establishment of COSTECH addressed that issue. Unfortunately, COSTECH has often encountered the “independent posture” of R&D institutions arising from provisions within their own legal status.

Regional Level

Weak Regional Research and Innovation Capacity and Capability

Research and innovation are key factors that will help the EAC to move towards smart, sustainable, inclusive growth, and along the way to tackle its pressing societal challenges. However, in EAC partner states, only a limited number of large enterprises have their own in-house research and development capabilities. For product and process development, and other research related activities, large enterprises in the region rely on foreign research institutes/universities. This is a major limitation, as enterprises need to work with local institutions in developing R&D activities, thereby strengthening local capacity and capability. Similarly, production in agriculture, textile and mining industries imports more than 90% of their inputs due to weak supplier networking in most of the East African Partner States.

Vision, Mission And Strategic Objectives

Vision
The Vision for the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Center (UDIEC) is: “To be a leading Centre in Africa for enabling Entrepreneurship and Innovation”

Mission
The mission of the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centre (UDIEC) is: “To facilitate entrepreneurship and demand-driven innovation through practice-oriented training, quality education, business counselling and incubation to students, staff, MSMEs and other stakeholders”
Strategic Objectives
In pursuit of the stated institutional vision, UDIEC will be guided by the Strategic Objectives, which are based on the above-prioritised critical strategic issues for the period 2016/17 - 2020/21 and are in line with UDSM Corporate Strategic Plan 2015-2013 objectives and the national industrialisation agenda:

(a) **Strategic Objective 1:** Practice-oriented training and quality education in Entrepreneurship and Innovation established
(b) **Strategic Objective 2:** UDIEC – Private Sector – Government collaboration established.
(c) **Strategic Objective 3:** Incubation programme established
(d) **Strategic Objective 4:** Business counselling programme established
(e) **Strategic Objective 5:** Knowledge management system established

Services to be offered by the Centre

Commercialization of UDSM Research Results
The Centre will act as an enabler to facilitate the pre-commercialization process which includes activities such as innovation/technology evaluation and screening by industry partners, providing innovation fund for commercialization or last-mile prototyping, as well as assisting researchers in securing funds for prototype development from the Government, private sector, NGO’s, or development partners (Amstrong, 2002). The Centre shall therefore facilitate spin-off from Colleges/Institutes/Schools of UDSM and other R&D institutions in form of start-up firms. Entrepreneurs shall be made to share resources and experiences, learn from one another, exchange contacts and establish collaborative business relationships. Another aspect will be the informal cross-fertilization of ideas and advice among tenants.

Industrial Parks, Agri-parks and Clusters
Industrial Parks and clusters are natural outcomes of incubators where technology-based enterprises with organic links to Universities are allowed to thrive and excel. Their close links or proximity to University ensures convenient access to a pool of consultants, students and research/testing facilities, which would otherwise be unaffordable for start-up companies. It is envisaged that the Innovation Centre shall be able to host at least 3 industrial parks and 3 agri-parks in different regions of Tanzania.

Promotion of Grass-root Innovators
Apart from researchers and innovators from tertiary institutions, Tanzania has many grass-root innovators who have only primary or secondary level education but have developed stunning prototypes or exhibited remarkable talent in socio-economic circles. Many of these young innovators occasionally send their innovations to COSTECH, which refers them to UDSM for improvement or the Tanzania Awards for Scientific and Technical Achievement (TASTA) award evaluation. The Innovation Centre in collaboration with COSTECH will devise ways of identifying and developing such talents through scholarships, short-term training, and incubation.

Supporting of “Viwanda-Darasa”/Teaching Industries
If the unused Government building assets and seed funds are forthcoming, the Centre can host about 1,000 SMEs per annum through Viwanda Darasa incubation programs of science- and technology-based start-ups. Assuming
a 50% success rate (Baldwin and Gellatly, 2003), about 500 young graduate ‘industrialists and entrepreneurs’ can be ‘produced’ annually. The knowledge-based SMEs have high multiplier effect in employment generation for University graduates which brings about job creators rather than job seekers. Each of the 500 start-up enterprises above is expected to hire about 30 people directly and 180 indirectly thus giving a total of 105,000 employment opportunities per year.

**Other Services**

Other services that shall be provided by the Centre include:

(i) Assisting researchers in innovation-driven university-industry collaboration; including joint ventures and networking that potentially result in technology licensing and new start-up enterprises.

(ii) Creating various IP portfolios through IP mining and strategically managing all UDSM intellectual properties by providing advisory and assistance to researchers (Shemdoe 2003a, WIPO 1999).

(iii) Providing Business support services including: (i) business planning, management and counselling; (ii) advertising and marketing; (iii) financial advisory; (iv) management training including entrepreneurship training and services; (v) management advisory; (vi) networking; (vii) secretarial, and (viii) post incubation support.

(iv) Collaborating with various experts in innovation and technology transfer world-wide to nurture innovation, entrepreneurship, research proposal writing, intellectual property rights and technology evaluation through various initiatives and renowned entities in innovation and technology transfer.

(v) Encouraging direct technology transfers (TT) from other countries, or adoption and adaptation of technologies or practices proven elsewhere. This is a path taken by many countries like Japan and China where western technologies were adopted then moulded to suit local requirements like culture, taste and socio-economic preferences.

**Anticipated Outputs**

The successful establishment of UDIEC should lead to three key outputs

**Creation and Consolidation of the Country-wide Knowledge Space**

The academia and industry linkages will be strengthened through the establishment of the research and innovation agenda, and ensuring that:

(i) The academia has the capacity to generate knowledge;

(ii) The private sector/industry has the reciprocal absorptive capacity of knowledge generated by the academia and from other sources. This requires the academia, the private sector, and the Government to work together to improve conditions for knowledge transfer and utilization: and

(iii) Strengthening linkages to other regional centres and global networks.

**Creation and Expansion of Innovation Space**

Country-wide, innovation growth and development will be expanded so as to attract public and private venture capital including business advice, technical assistance and financing to start-ups, business and industry clusters. This space is essential for translation of innovations into goods and services, an element that has been seen as missing in the country and other East African partner states.

**Capacity Building Space**

This space will include:
Technology and innovation capabilities of the academia and small and medium enterprises to facilitate structural transformations as well as proposal writing, incubator management and IPR management strengthened. This will be achieved through collaboration with various experts in innovation and technology transfer world-wide.

Internship opportunities for students: University students can be exposed early to entrepreneurship via industry-targeted research that has the potential of financially benefitting the students.

Management and Organizational Structure of the Centre

Operational Mode for the Centre

Commercialization is a multi-stage process that involves different players (Figure 5-1) including consumers, researchers, product developers, industry and government agencies. At University level it will involve two steps as outlined below.

The first step shall involve initial research activities undertaken by academic Departments such as simulation, model building and lab-scale prototypes linked to student projects, Masters and PhD theses. This can be accomplished using research facilities available in Departments to develop ideas up to prototype or proven research results stage.

The second step will be undertaken at the Innovation Centre where proven research results are refined, scaled-up and commercialized.

A conceptual framework for innovation giving a holistic interplay of the various actors and activities is shown in Figure 5-2 and consists of six main stages as follows.

Stage 1: Ideas, innovations and technologies are received from clients, collaborators, HEI and R&D institutions participating in enterprise development.

Stage 2: The ideas and innovations are then evaluated by respective Departments before being subjected to basic and applied research for further development.
Stage 3: Based on research findings, potential innovations are evaluated to identify those which qualify for IPR protection, further development and commercialization.

Stage 4: Potential research results/technologies are further evaluated and packaged ready for pre-commercialization.

Stage 5: Proven research results/technologies are either incubated and then licensed or directly licensed for full commercialization in the market place.

Stage 6: The revenue generated from selling products, services or processes will be ploughed back to the Centre.
Figure 5-2: Proposed Flowchart for the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation and Entrepreneurship Centre

Figure 5-3 shows the proposed organizational structure. The Centre shall operate as an independent entity with a Director under the Deputy Vice Chancellor – Research. The Centre’s Director will have a reporting function to the DVC and Senate Research and Knowledge Exchange Committee (SRKEC). Furthermore, the Centre will
be led by a Board that will comprise the private sector, the University and other respective stakeholders including the Government.

**Figure 5-3: The Organizational Structure for the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation Centre (UDIEC)**

**Operational Procedures**

a) Relationship between UDIEC and UDSM units
b) UDIEC shall liaise with Colleges/Schools/Institutes to create awareness and willingness for the various units and staff to collaborate with it, including teaching and learning of entrepreneurship and innovation courses in their units.

c) UDIEC will liaise with Colleges/Schools/Institutes availing research results that are ripe for commercialization.
d) UDIEC shall maintain close collaboration with Interdisciplinary units from Colleges/Schools/Institutes to avoid duplication of tasks and to fully utilize the resources available at UDSM. Thus, UDIEC is not expected to own workshop facilities or laboratories.

e) UDIEC - Government - Private Sector Relationship

UDIEC will collaborate with the industry and/or government organizations to utilize the expertise of students and staff at UDSM:

- **Knowledge Management**
  - UDIEC will acquire, store and disseminate information related to entrepreneurship and innovation
  - UDIEC will organize knowledge sharing forums and establish information sharing linkages among the stakeholders in the areas of entrepreneurship and innovation

**Resources**

**Human Resources**

The commercialization of research results is a serious undertaking involving outside parties who may commit significant resources in innovation projects. It is envisaged that Innovation Centres will work closely with relevant Departments to commercialize proven results. The two distinct commercialization steps (Figure 5-1) call for presence of committed researchers in academic departments and dedicated full-time support staff in Innovation Centres. Academic and technical staff with potential research output that needs to be commercialized has to be released from teaching and learning activities from college and schools. Availability of such staff will enhance efficiency and accountability of commercialization as well as brokering of technologies. This will also enhance interaction with SMEs and industries at large.

The principal investigator (PI) and co-researchers from academic Departments can work at Innovation Centres in an internal sabbatical to oversee commercialization of innovations emanating from their research work. Furthermore, the Centre shall promote scholarly networks whereby interns, research fellows and visiting scholars from local and international institutions shall be invited.

**Physical Resources**

**Equipment and Facilities**

In order to ensure optimal utilization of resources, the IEUs are expected to share resources with academic departments especially for expensive equipment procured either for teaching and research purposes. At inception stage the Centres will be obliged to procure dedicated equipment required for production, testing and quality control. The TDTC and CSW for example need to replace the aging equipment (> 30 years) with state-of-the-art ones to match current needs. It is important to note that some Schools and Colleges like CoET have significant manufacturing and testing equipment which, are underutilized during student vacation, and can be put to useful innovation functions. It is estimated that the combined manufacturing equipment in all CoET departments such as: welding machines; drilling and milling machines; regular and CNC lathes.

**Building Infrastructure**

It is proposed that Directorate of Innovations of UDIEC be hosted either at CoET or specific block to be decided by the Management. The UDIEC could start with four pioneering units namely TDTC, CSW, UDEC and a CoHU innovation unit. The first three already exists and are accommodated in respective buildings and space can be found to accommodate the latter. Because in many aspects the UDIEC has a national focus, with a mission to pioneer innovations leading to industrialization, the University should seek government support for buildings to establish more IEUs inside and outside the University premises. For example the University could request the
Government to hand over the un-privatized building assets left-over from privatization of public companies like: Sungura Textile and Urafiki Textile Mills in Dar es Salaam; General Tyre in Arusha; Kilimanjaro Machine Tools in Moshi; Mwanza Textile in Mwanza and several other public properties in Morogoro industrial complex. With minor modifications the buildings, hitherto left idle, can provide multi-tenant space to incubate young graduates through model industries (Viwanda Darasa) program which will boost agricultural productivity through value addition of local crops like coffee, cashew, or cotton grown in respective regions.

**Financial Resources**

Apart from salaries and minor research operating expenses, the government does not make special OC allocations for R&D activities. Usually researchers apply for funds through competitive proposals to external donors or COSTECH for R&D support. It is envisaged that the administrative expenses of UDIEC will be covered through OC budget allocations as is the case for other UDSM units. However the expenses for prototyping, scaling-up and commercialization activities to be undertaken by IEUs are expected to come from **research results dissemination components**, which are built in research proposals. Further to that, the initial activities such as: salaries of core support staff; modification of offices; office equipment, stationery and furniture; and travel expenses, should be financed through seed-funds from OC government subventions. Important to note is that UDIEC needs ‘a ring fenced budget if its wants to achieve its Vision and Mission.

**Conclusion**

1. The establishment of the University of Dar es Salaam Innovation Centre (UDIEC) is aimed at assisting graduates and academic staff from UDSM and other R&D institutions in commercialization of their research results into wider array of products, processes and services thus accelerating the pace for economic growth and integration in the global market.
2. Through UDIEC, Higher Education Learning Institutions such as UDSM, DIT, MUST, UDOM and SUA, as well as other R&D institutions in the country will be able to contribute significantly to the creation of new economic activities such as oil and gas products and services, identifying of new markets, creating new enterprises based on the country’s priority areas, and diversifying of rural economies.
3. Capacity and capability of academia and SME to innovate, transfer technology, writing competitive research proposal, evaluation of technologies as well as managing intellectual property rights will be strengthened through the incubator that shall be established under the Centre.
4. The Centre will be able to transform micro small and medium enterprises into viable and sustainable business entities capable of contributing to the growth of 40 % GDP by 2030 from the current 10% as stated in the EAC Development Strategy (2011/12 – 2015/16) through established linkages with large enterprises, public procurements and increased knowledge transfer.
5. The Centre shall be able to advise the government on the right policy on innovation, procurement regime and industrialization for the country’s economic prosperity.

**Acknowledgements**

The Authors would like to thank UDSM Team which included Prof. T Lyimo (CONAS), Dr. Goodluck Charles (UDBS), Dr. Raphael (TDTC) for their efforts during the development of the UDIEC proposal and related documents. Also, special thanks should go to UNIDO for supporting the development of UDIEC as well as to Mr. Rommert Schram (UNIDO Consultant) for having guided the UDSM Team during the development of the UDIEC Strategic Plan.

**References**


OECD (2002). *Reviews of Innovation Policy in South Africa*


UNCTAD (2011). The International Dimension of Industrial Policy: Opportunities and Challenges from the new Global Environment
URT (1996). Science and Technology Policy, Ministry of Higher Education Science and Technology, United Republic of Tanzania
World Bank (2006): Fostering Innovation, Productivity and Technological Change: Tanzania in Knowledge Economy